

Page 1	Page 3
<p>1 Wednesday, 12 September 2018</p> <p>2 (10.00 am)</p> <p>3 EVIDENCE FROM KOWLOON MOTOR BUS CO (1933) LTD</p> <p>4 AND LONG WIN BUS CO LTD: DR NORMAN LEUNG, DR JOHN CHAN</p> <p>5 MR ROGER LEE, MR GODWIN SO, MR LEUNG KIN WANG,</p> <p>6 MR PATRICK PANG, MR JAMES WONG</p> <p>7 (simultaneous interpretation was used where indicated)</p> <p>8 Examination by MR PETER DUNCAN (continued)</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Good morning, Dr Leung, gentlemen.</p> <p>10 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Good morning, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: Mr Duncan.</p> <p>12 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>13 Good morning, Dr Leung and gentlemen. Could I first</p> <p>14 acknowledge receipt of a considerable amount of material</p> <p>15 from the company since the last day of the hearing.</p> <p>16 Thank you for providing the committee with that</p> <p>17 information.</p> <p>18 At the end of Day 14, I was asking you questions</p> <p>19 about the possible engagement of collision-alert and</p> <p>20 lane-keeping devices, and through Mr Leung we were</p> <p>21 informed that the company was undertaking research with</p> <p>22 Queen's University in Belfast, that had commenced last</p> <p>23 autumn, which is now about a year ago. Also, we were</p> <p>24 informed that in the market, you will be watching out</p> <p>25 for whatever third-party products might be available.</p>	<p>1 It is difficult because in Hong Kong, for long-haul</p> <p>2 trips and short-haul trips, especially during peak</p> <p>3 hours, the bus captain will have to move his head very</p> <p>4 frequently, so it will be difficult to be precise. He</p> <p>5 has to liaise with passengers and he has to watch out</p> <p>6 for the road conditions.</p> <p>7 So, to tackle the problem of fatigue, it will be</p> <p>8 difficult to get a third-party product. Currently, for</p> <p>9 Queen's University from Belfast, we are now tackling</p> <p>10 a number of points. First of all, a driver, for no</p> <p>11 particular reason, tries to change lanes, we would like</p> <p>12 to alert him. We would also like to alert him if he is</p> <p>13 keeping too close to the preceding vehicle. So we are</p> <p>14 carrying out technological research.</p> <p>15 For the Japanese product, later in the year, we will</p> <p>16 have the chance to try it again. The Australian product</p> <p>17 is being tried. Then, for Mobileye, we did try it but</p> <p>18 for the time being it is not suitable for us.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: You are conflating a number of different devices</p> <p>20 there, are you not? Mobileye 6, for example, has</p> <p>21 a forward-looking anti-collision device. It picks up</p> <p>22 the speed limits, because it reads speed limits. But</p> <p>23 you are talking about an anti-dozing device as well.</p> <p>24 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Yes, basically, they are</p> <p>25 two different products. For Mobileye or the two</p>
Page 2	Page 4
<p>1 The committee has been made aware that there are</p> <p>2 devices of that nature available under the trade name of</p> <p>3 Mobileye, and I would like to ask the company whether</p> <p>4 you are aware of those sorts of devices.</p> <p>5 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Yes, we were.</p> <p>6 MR PETER DUNCAN: Have you considered the engagement of</p> <p>7 those devices?</p> <p>8 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Yes, we will.</p> <p>9 MR PETER DUNCAN: Have you not done so as yet?</p> <p>10 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) In year 2014, we did</p> <p>11 try it out with Mobileye. In 2014, we had a similar</p> <p>12 trial scheme with Mobileye, but then the result wasn't</p> <p>13 that satisfactory, but of course technology does</p> <p>14 progress and in fact we have started to liaise with them</p> <p>15 again.</p> <p>16 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) If I may add to that. As</p> <p>17 of today, we have already got something from Australia,</p> <p>18 and in fact we have something similar to Mobileye</p> <p>19 device, so that when a bus captain is driving, if he is</p> <p>20 to sort of doze off, then we will alert him. So we are</p> <p>21 carrying out a trial, and in fact at the same time we</p> <p>22 have also got help from Japan. For the past two years,</p> <p>23 we are looking for something similar, so that when the</p> <p>24 signs of fatigue are detected from the driver, then we</p> <p>25 can try to do something to help them.</p>	<p>1 products being experimented by us, we are trying to</p> <p>2 check the facial expression of the bus captain or his</p> <p>3 visual -- his eyes, so as to alert him, so as to wake</p> <p>4 him up. Then there is a sensor on board. Then it</p> <p>5 measures the distance between the bus and the preceding</p> <p>6 vehicle, and it is aware of the speed of the vehicle.</p> <p>7 We have the braking distance, that is, at</p> <p>8 a particular speed, you need to have a reasonable</p> <p>9 distance from the preceding vehicle to brake in time.</p> <p>10 So, if we know that it is very close to the preceding</p> <p>11 vehicle, and if the speed is such that it is not</p> <p>12 rational, then it is about something else, so it is</p> <p>13 entirely a different product.</p> <p>14 We are having a trial of both kinds of products.</p> <p>15 MR PETER DUNCAN: Just so that we don't get confused by any</p> <p>16 sort of conflation, can we just, for the moment, keep to</p> <p>17 the collision-alert and the lane-keeping device, and</p> <p>18 then I will ask some questions about the anti-dozing</p> <p>19 device in a moment.</p> <p>20 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Yes.</p> <p>21 MR PETER DUNCAN: So, with regard to the collision-alert and</p> <p>22 lane-keeping devices, I understood you to say a few</p> <p>23 moments ago that you have re-engaged the possibility of</p> <p>24 the Mobileye device; is that correct?</p> <p>25 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) We will make</p>

Page 5	Page 7
<p>1 reference. In particular, I understand that the other 2 operators are also trying this out. So we will try to 3 look at the results of their pilot schemes. On top of 4 our work with Queen's University, we have an open 5 attitude as to the functions, the current functions, of 6 Mobileye, although the previous experience was that it 7 wasn't quite suitable, but I'm sure we can look at it 8 again.</p> <p>9 MR PETER DUNCAN: Right. Have you started yet to go back to 10 Mobileye?</p> <p>11 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Not yet.</p> <p>12 MR PETER DUNCAN: Is it your intention to do so?</p> <p>13 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) For the time being, it is 14 a matter of reading the literature. We haven't yet 15 started any dialogue with Mobileye. This is because 16 there are similar products in the market, and maybe they 17 are better. So we are looking at a few other products 18 and we are also carrying out our own research.</p> <p>19 MR PETER DUNCAN: Right. Have you commenced any sort of 20 engagement with any supplier of collision-alert and 21 lane-keeping devices?</p> <p>22 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Indeed. An Australian 23 company, we are now trying their Australian product. 24 For a Japanese company, we have had direct dialogue with 25 them, and they are developing a particular device. And</p>	<p>1 he looked at the operation on board. We also sent one 2 of our engineers to Northern Ireland. I think he has 3 already started to study the matter together with them. 4 I think soon, in a month or two, the university's 5 researcher will also come to Hong Kong to base 6 themselves here, so as to look at the road conditions. 7 On my part, in the next month or two, I am going to go 8 to Queen's University to have a look of the update.</p> <p>9 MR PETER DUNCAN: When do you expect the research will be 10 completed?</p> <p>11 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) I think we only have 12 a tentative timetable. Summer of next year. But 13 of course it depends on the progress.</p> <p>14 MR PETER DUNCAN: At this stage of the research, are you 15 able to provide the committee with any indication as to 16 what outcome you would expect?</p> <p>17 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) I need to go back to check 18 the progress. Of course the outcome can be shared with 19 the committee.</p> <p>20 MR PETER DUNCAN: Yes. My question really is: is the 21 research at the moment such that you are hopeful or 22 expecting of a particular outcome?</p> <p>23 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Well, I think, in our 24 documents, we have already told you about the nature of 25 the product ADAS. I think it's in the paper, in the</p>
<p>1 on our own, we are also having an anti-collision device. 2 It is different from Mobileye's product and it is being 3 carried out in Northern Ireland.</p> <p>4 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you. Are you prepared to provide 5 the name of the Australian company?</p> <p>6 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Yes.</p> <p>7 MR PETER DUNCAN: What is it?</p> <p>8 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Guardian.</p> <p>9 MR PETER DUNCAN: And are you prepared to provide the name 10 of the Japanese company?</p> <p>11 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Denso.</p> <p>12 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: Could you repeat that?</p> <p>14 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Denso. It's called 15 Denso.</p> <p>16 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you. Perhaps you could spell that 17 for the committee.</p> <p>18 DR JOHN CHAN: D-E-N-S-O.</p> <p>19 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you. Going back to the research 20 with Queen's University, this, as you told us on the 21 last occasion, started about a year ago. What is the 22 stage that has been reached with that research?</p> <p>23 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) First of all, the 24 professor, if I recall -- if I recall, the professor 25 from Queen's University came to visit KMB last month and</p>	<p>1 documents.</p> <p>2 MR PETER DUNCAN: Are you optimistic that this research will 3 result in an effective collision-alert and lane-keeping 4 device? Are you optimistic or are you not optimistic?</p> <p>5 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Well, the most that I can 6 say is as follows. For Queen's University, I think for 7 their mechanical faculty, I think it is such that few 8 other universities are interested in carrying out 9 double-decker buses related research, so it is quite 10 unique. Then, in the UK, they are in the UK, so it 11 would be good for them to look at it from an European 12 perspective.</p> <p>13 I think we can claim ourselves to be a very large 14 bus company. Of course, I have high expectations of 15 them.</p> <p>16 MR PETER DUNCAN: Let us move then from the collision-alert 17 and lane-keeping device, and move to the anti-dozing 18 device, if I might call it that, or the driver 19 monitoring device, in respect of which you have already 20 made certain remarks this morning.</p> <p>21 In this respect, can I first take you back to one of 22 the files, KMB-1, and ask you to go to page 115.</p> <p>23 Now, at page 115, you will find the penultimate page 24 of the report that the company provided to the transport 25 authorities following the Tai Po accident.</p>
Page 6	Page 8

Page 9	Page 11
<p>1 CHAIRMAN: The investigation report?</p> <p>2 MR PETER DUNCAN: The investigation report, that's indeed</p> <p>3 it, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>4 At page 115, paragraph 47, you will see the heading,</p> <p>5 "Drowsiness of bus captain":</p> <p>6 "KMB is conducting a trial with a supplier on</p> <p>7 monitoring drowsiness of bus captains while they are</p> <p>8 driving. The trial test will detect the level of</p> <p>9 alertness of a driver to give an early warning of the</p> <p>10 driver experiencing a 'microsleep'. If the trial</p> <p>11 results are satisfactory, such system will be installed</p> <p>12 in KMB buses."</p> <p>13 If I could also just ask you to leave that open but</p> <p>14 also have in front of you one of the recommendations of</p> <p>15 the working group. We will find that at TD-1, page 406.</p> <p>16 If I can just read into the record this</p> <p>17 recommendation of the working group:</p> <p>18 "Driver monitoring device -- such device monitors</p> <p>19 the bus captain's behaviour on-board and alerts him/her</p> <p>20 if it detects a lack of attention or drowsiness. When</p> <p>21 the system detects potential unsafe behaviours such as</p> <p>22 'looking aside', 'dozing', 'drowsiness' or 'bad</p> <p>23 posture', the system will give visual warning and voice</p> <p>24 alert. Such device is available in the market, and</p> <p>25 trial of using it in franchised buses to assess its</p>	<p>1 five sensory organs. I know it and I have been told by</p> <p>2 the depots that since it is an Australian product, and</p> <p>3 the Australian company also shared our opinion, that is</p> <p>4 sometimes, say for example, if the bus captain tilts his</p> <p>5 head to look at passengers, then the facial detection</p> <p>6 may be lost, and then it will lead to the vibration.</p> <p>7 We understand this point, but all in all, my</p> <p>8 understanding and the feedback of the employees are both</p> <p>9 positive. So, for this trial, we are going to extend it</p> <p>10 so as to engage more bus captains to carry on with the</p> <p>11 trial.</p> <p>12 Thank you, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>13 MR PETER DUNCAN: When do you expect the trial will be</p> <p>14 completed?</p> <p>15 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) In mid-August -- well,</p> <p>16 at the end of June, we trial tested with the first batch</p> <p>17 of bus captains and then we tested with the second batch</p> <p>18 of captains. We already prepared a questionnaire to</p> <p>19 gauge the reactions of captains, and by the end of this</p> <p>20 month we will decide whether we will conduct more tests</p> <p>21 at different depots, and then we will look to implement</p> <p>22 it by phases.</p> <p>23 MR PETER DUNCAN: Do I infer from what you have said that</p> <p>24 the likelihood is that this device will be implemented?</p> <p>25 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) According to results of</p>
<p>Page 10</p> <p>1 applicability and effectiveness is recommended."</p> <p>2 Now, could I ask this: with regard to paragraph 47</p> <p>3 of the investigation report, who was the supplier with</p> <p>4 whom this trial was being conducted? Are you able to</p> <p>5 reveal that?</p> <p>6 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) The company name is</p> <p>7 Seeing Machines, and the name of the product is</p> <p>8 Guardian.</p> <p>9 MR PETER DUNCAN: Can you inform the committee with regard</p> <p>10 to the progress of that trial?</p> <p>11 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Mr Duncan, if I may talk</p> <p>12 about the process of the trial. Towards the end of June</p> <p>13 this year, the system of Guardian was installed on four</p> <p>14 buses from different depots. This is because we have</p> <p>15 got long-haul trips for different depots, two for</p> <p>16 Sha Tin Depot, one for Tuen Mun Depot, and also one from</p> <p>17 Long Win Bus.</p> <p>18 The initial trial results are such that it is</p> <p>19 effective, and we are able to detect, say for example,</p> <p>20 if the bus driver closes his eye longer than winking,</p> <p>21 and there is a voice alert, then the back of the seat</p> <p>22 will vibrate. I myself also tested it on two buses, one</p> <p>23 from Tuen Mun Depot, the other from Sha Tin Depot.</p> <p>24 Initially speaking, we believe that it is effective.</p> <p>25 However, this system is such that it will scan your</p>	<p>Page 12</p> <p>1 the tests so far, we find it positive.</p> <p>2 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) I would like to add</p> <p>3 something. Any device that can facilitate road safety</p> <p>4 is something we will try. We will move with the times</p> <p>5 and we would certainly make a start on this.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: This device, Guardian device, is one that is used</p> <p>7 in Singapore, is it not?</p> <p>8 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Chairman, I know that</p> <p>9 it's in use in Australia, but as far as I know, it is</p> <p>10 not deployed in Singapore.</p> <p>11 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Singapore has not properly</p> <p>12 started using it.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: Well, we can look at that, because it is</p> <p>14 certainly my memory that Singapore has been using it for</p> <p>15 some years.</p> <p>16 But also, this was the device that was recommended</p> <p>17 after the investigation into the Croydon or Sandilands</p> <p>18 tram accident, was it not? It was recommended to be</p> <p>19 installed and was installed after the investigation was</p> <p>20 concluded? Transport for London.</p> <p>21 Well, we have the report. We can make that</p> <p>22 available to you.</p> <p>23 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Two or three years ago, we</p> <p>24 were actively looking into this issue. For trains and</p> <p>25 big coaches the device was already deployed. For train</p>

Page 13	Page 15
<p>1 drivers, the captains, and also truck drivers, they</p> <p>2 might doze off and in many cities the device is in</p> <p>3 common use already. So, for metro or city buses, for</p> <p>4 long-haul routes, for example airport routes, I feel</p> <p>5 that this device has a key role to play and there are</p> <p>6 benefits.</p> <p>7 For busy areas or roads, since some captains would</p> <p>8 have to tilt their heads quite a lot to look at</p> <p>9 pedestrians and traffic lights, so we must be very</p> <p>10 careful not to cause nuisance to the captains. That's</p> <p>11 why, for the research in Northern Ireland and the work</p> <p>12 done by Denso in Japan, I think the Guardian system can</p> <p>13 be deployed in some routes. And, as we said, we should</p> <p>14 have different strategies or treatments for different</p> <p>15 routes.</p> <p>16 MR PETER DUNCAN: Why would the different routes have</p> <p>17 an impact on this?</p> <p>18 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) In busy urban roads, since</p> <p>19 the bus captains would likely move or tilt their heads</p> <p>20 quite a lot to assess the road conditions or traffic</p> <p>21 lights and there are a lot of bends, this would be very</p> <p>22 different from road sections that are straight. For</p> <p>23 example, for an airport route, the bus would often use</p> <p>24 the highway, and the bus captains are unlikely to tilt</p> <p>25 their heads quite as much. So the situation is</p>	<p>1 (b) subject to further assessment on the technical,</p> <p>2 operational and financial feasibility, consideration may</p> <p>3 be given to retrofitting all seats in the upper deck</p> <p>4 with seat belts on buses deployed for specific bus</p> <p>5 routes, ie long-haul routes which are operated via</p> <p>6 expressways with relatively fewer bus stops."</p> <p>7 So we see there those recommendations, and could</p> <p>8 I also ask you in this context to look again at the</p> <p>9 investigation report which was referred to earlier this</p> <p>10 morning, this time at page 114. If I quote from</p> <p>11 paragraph 40, under the heading, "Other measures to</p> <p>12 enhance bus safety", the report states as follows:</p> <p>13 "KMB has already requested its suppliers to install</p> <p>14 safety belts on all [buses] as a standard feature for</p> <p>15 new buses ordered after 5 March 2018. As for buses that</p> <p>16 are currently in service, where certain routes so</p> <p>17 require, safety belts will be installed on the upper</p> <p>18 deck of KMB buses phase by phase."</p> <p>19 So, if I understand things correctly, what has been</p> <p>20 said in the investigation report is consistent with the</p> <p>21 recommendations of the working group.</p> <p>22 Now, has the retrofitting of these seat belts yet</p> <p>23 commenced?</p> <p>24 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) To install safety belts on</p> <p>25 the upper deck, technically speaking, we would have to</p>
Page 14	Page 16
<p>1 different from cities that deploy big trucks or buses.</p> <p>2 MR PETER DUNCAN: I am going to move now from these</p> <p>3 anti-doing devices to the question of seat belts.</p> <p>4 Could I introduce this by referring you again to the</p> <p>5 investigation report -- sorry, first of all, to the</p> <p>6 recommendations of the working group. We will get this</p> <p>7 again at bundle TD-1, this time at page 407.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: These are the recommendations that were expressed</p> <p>9 in the paper made available to LegCo for discussion on</p> <p>10 25 July of this year; is that correct?</p> <p>11 MR PETER DUNCAN: That's correct, Mr Chairman. We see that</p> <p>12 reference on page 403.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>14 MR PETER DUNCAN: The section on seat belts starts at the</p> <p>15 bottom of page 407, and it runs through to page 410.</p> <p>16 If I could just bring your attention, please, to</p> <p>17 paragraph 16, which contains the recommendation and the</p> <p>18 proposed way forward. If I could quote from</p> <p>19 paragraph 16:</p> <p>20 "Having regard to the points mentioned in</p> <p>21 paragraphs 10 to 15 above, the working group has arrived</p> <p>22 at the following recommendations with a view to giving</p> <p>23 extra protection to seated passengers:</p> <p>24 (a) seat belts should be provided for all seats in</p> <p>25 future procurement of new bus; and</p>	<p>1 consider the issue of gravity. The government and</p> <p>2 ourselves -- well, the government has consulted us for</p> <p>3 certain information and our supplier conducting</p> <p>4 a technical assessment, and the progress has been</p> <p>5 positive so far. The safety belts are relatively heavy.</p> <p>6 If they are to be installed on the upper deck, the</p> <p>7 government would have to conduct tilt tests. If this is</p> <p>8 technically feasible, it won't be an issue to install</p> <p>9 them. Whereas for the two main suppliers, Volvo and</p> <p>10 ADL, the progress has been very positive, however we</p> <p>11 would still have to wait until the tilt tests are</p> <p>12 completed.</p> <p>13 MR PETER DUNCAN: Can you give the committee some idea as to</p> <p>14 the financial implications of the retrofitting of the</p> <p>15 seat belts?</p> <p>16 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) This is not cheap, or</p> <p>17 should I say, in the beginning of this year, a special</p> <p>18 committee of our company issued clear instructions. Our</p> <p>19 buses procured in 2019 and after would be fitted with</p> <p>20 safety belts. As for the retrofitting of safety belts,</p> <p>21 where possible, especially on long-haul routes, we would</p> <p>22 install safety belts on the upper deck. We do not want</p> <p>23 to see further accidents, so cost is not our main</p> <p>24 consideration. We have not considered the financial</p> <p>25 implications yet. Retrofitting of safety belts would</p>

Page 17	<p>1 cost about \$200,000 per bus.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: That is on the upper deck?</p> <p>3 MR ROGER LEE: (Nodded head).</p> <p>4 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Nodded head).</p> <p>5 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you. Approximately how many buses</p> <p>6 do you expect would be retrofitted, how many buses in</p> <p>7 your fleet?</p> <p>8 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) I think nearly 3,600</p> <p>9 long-haul buses.</p> <p>10 MR PETER DUNCAN: I'm trying to do the maths.</p> <p>11 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) I would like to add</p> <p>12 something. Currently, we have 4,200 to 4,300 buses.</p> <p>13 That is for KMB and Long Win Bus combined. Some buses</p> <p>14 are fully equipped with safety belts. For some others,</p> <p>15 as they will retire in the next years -- for buses that</p> <p>16 will retire in two or three years, they might not need</p> <p>17 to be retrofitted. For long-haul buses, I do not have</p> <p>18 the exact figure, but about one-third of our buses would</p> <p>19 go on long-haul routes, so that comes to about 1,000.</p> <p>20 MR PETER DUNCAN: Do I understand that the new buses will</p> <p>21 have seat belts --</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on, Mr Duncan -- earlier, Mr Lee,</p> <p>23 you said this involved retrofitting 3,600 long-haul</p> <p>24 buses. Are you now correcting that statement and in</p> <p>25 fact it involves 1,000?</p>	Page 19
Page 18	<p>1 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Yes.</p> <p>2 MR ROGER LEE: Yes.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>4 Yes, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>5 MR PETER DUNCAN: I'm just trying to do the mathematics.</p> <p>6 1,000 buses at \$200,000 per bus?</p> <p>7 DR JOHN CHAN: Yes.</p> <p>8 MR PETER DUNCAN: \$200 million?</p> <p>9 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Yes.</p> <p>10 MR PETER DUNCAN: Is the cost of that something that has</p> <p>11 been discussed with the government?</p> <p>12 MR ROGER LEE: No.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, Dr Leung --</p> <p>14 DR NORMAN LEUNG: May I just add. Recently I had a meeting</p> <p>15 with the government official and in fact I talked to him</p> <p>16 and requested the government whether they can offer any</p> <p>17 assistance to us in retrofitting these safety belts, and</p> <p>18 the response was quite positive, if I may put it this</p> <p>19 way.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Can you identify with whom you had these</p> <p>21 conversations?</p> <p>22 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Yes, Mr Chairman. Mr Joseph Lai,</p> <p>23 permanent secretary for transport, and his deputy,</p> <p>24 Mr Kevin Choi, deputy secretary for transport.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p>	Page 20
	<p>1 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>2 MR PETER DUNCAN: Has the company ever in the past</p> <p>3 approached the government with regard to some</p> <p>4 assistance, let's call it a subsidy, with regard to the</p> <p>5 need to, I'd like to say, modernise its fleet?</p> <p>6 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Never. Specifically this was the first</p> <p>7 time I talked to him about subsidy for retrofitting the</p> <p>8 seat belts.</p> <p>9 MR PETER DUNCAN: Now, do I understand correctly that the</p> <p>10 new buses will have seat belts upstairs and downstairs?</p> <p>11 MR ROGER LEE: Correct.</p> <p>12 MR PETER DUNCAN: Has the company given any consideration as</p> <p>13 to whether -- or does the company have any view as to</p> <p>14 whether the public will actually utilise the seat belts?</p> <p>15 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) We conducted a rough</p> <p>16 assessment on how the public would see safety belts.</p> <p>17 For short-haul routes safety belts are unlikely to be</p> <p>18 used, especially on the lower deck. For long-haul</p> <p>19 routes, safety belts would be more popular.</p> <p>20 But they are not hugely popular with passengers</p> <p>21 because it is somewhat a hassle to put them on. But, in</p> <p>22 our view, especially for long-haul routes, the trend is</p> <p>23 that safety belts would be more and more important. For</p> <p>24 passengers that want to have a nap on the bus, they can</p> <p>25 choose to put on safety belts. I hope more and more</p>	
	<p>1 passengers would use them in the future. At the moment,</p> <p>2 they are not very popular. But KMB should follow the</p> <p>3 trend. At the end of the day this is a safety device.</p> <p>4 MR PETER DUNCAN: Does the company have a view as to whether</p> <p>5 there should be any legislative backup for the use of</p> <p>6 seat belts, in other words to make it compulsory that</p> <p>7 persons utilise seat belts where they are provided?</p> <p>8 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) This is somewhat difficult</p> <p>9 because passengers can stand on buses in Hong Kong. So,</p> <p>10 by way of legislation, this is a challenge. And the</p> <p>11 second challenge is enforcement. Bus captains are often</p> <p>12 harassed these days. KMB has not set up any rules to</p> <p>13 enforce this, but we find it positive to allow</p> <p>14 passengers the choice of putting on safety belts.</p> <p>15 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you. I'm going to leave the subject</p> <p>16 of safety belts now.</p> <p>17 Can I move to something else, which I will introduce</p> <p>18 by asking you to turn up KMB-4.</p> <p>19 Can I ask you to turn, please, to page 1182 of the</p> <p>20 bundle, which is an extract from the annual report of</p> <p>21 the listed company, that's Transport International</p> <p>22 Holdings Ltd, for 2012. On that page, you will see the</p> <p>23 members of the board of directors, and in particular you</p> <p>24 will see the names of the independent non-executive</p> <p>25 directors.</p>	

Page 21	Page 23
<p>1 We can see those listed as Dr Leung and Dr Chan, 2 present this morning; Dr Eric Li Ka Cheung, 3 Mr Gordon Siu Kwing Chue, and Prof Liu Pak Wai. We see 4 the list of the independents. 5 If I could then ask you to go to KMB-5, at 6 page 1896. This is the list of the company directors, 7 as set out in the annual report for the year 2016. We 8 can see by reference to the asterisk the independents, 9 the independent non-executive directors. Again, the 10 name list: Dr Leung, Dr Chan, Dr Eric Li, Mr Siu and 11 Prof Liu. 12 I won't take you through each of the reports between 13 2012 and 2016, but you will, I think, confirm that there 14 were no changes in the independents during the course of 15 those years; is that correct? 16 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Correct, Mr Duncan. 17 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you. 18 Then if I could take you, please, to KMB-6 at 19 page 2108. This is a list of directors for the year 20 2017. We can see, at that page, 2108, that the 21 directors have changed, in that Mr Gordon Siu is no 22 longer an independent director. 23 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Correct, Mr Duncan. 24 MR PETER DUNCAN: And Mr Tsang Wai Hung has been appointed 25 as an independent non-executive director.</p>	<p>1 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Yes. Yes. 2 MR PETER DUNCAN: Does the company have any policy with 3 regard to how often the benefit of new ideas and 4 therefore new people as independent non-executive 5 directors might be appointed? Is there any particular 6 policy in that respect? 7 DR NORMAN LEUNG: We have a number of board committees, and 8 different directors serve on different committees, with 9 regard to their expertise, so to speak. That's why you 10 will see that Mr John Chan, for example, was formerly 11 the managing director of Kowloon Motor Bus and Long Win 12 Bus, and that's why he has been requested to serve on 13 the standing committee of the board, which is really the 14 executive committee of the board, and he also serves on 15 the nomination committee, and the remuneration committee 16 as well; whereas Prof Liu Pak Wai, for example, is 17 a very distinguished economist, he serves on the board 18 to offer strategic development of our bus company, just 19 to name them as an example, Mr Duncan. 20 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you, Dr Leung. 21 I want to now go back to a matter which was raised 22 at one of the previous hearings. I think it was 23 actually Day 13. This was the subject of real-time 24 monitoring. You recall this issue that arose on Day 13, 25 in particular when I raised with you, with the</p>
Page 22	Page 24
<p>1 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Correct, Mr Duncan. 2 MR PETER DUNCAN: Now, I'm going to ask a couple of 3 questions about the independent non-executive directors, 4 and please understand I am asking these questions with 5 the utmost respect to those who have served and continue 6 to serve as independent non-executive directors. 7 Firstly, is it a correct observation that none of 8 the independent non-executive directors have 9 a background of safety matters? 10 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Well, specifically safety matters -- well, 11 you can say that we know -- personally, I have been 12 involved with bus operation for a number of years. In 13 fact, I have been a director of KMB since year 2000, so 14 for 17 years. And of course we care about the new 15 buses, you know, for example, we have to upgrade our 16 buses with the latest model, with the latest, you know, 17 technology. And very often the new buses incorporate 18 what we call the safety features. So we spend money in 19 upgrading our buses, say from Euro IV and then to Euro V 20 and now to Euro VI. All this is buses with the latest 21 technology. 22 In that aspect, we ensure that the best available 23 buses are purchased by KMB and Long Win, in that aspect. 24 MR PETER DUNCAN: I think we are all aware of the fact that 25 new people bring new ideas to organisations.</p>	<p>1 representatives from KMB, the evidence that the 2 committee had heard from a Mr Alok Jain; do you remember 3 that issue coming up? 4 You will recall that Mr Jain's evidence -- I will 5 give everybody the reference just for the record; it's 6 Day 13 at page 41 -- but his evidence was to the effect 7 that in 2014 -- sorry, Day 13, page 41 is a summary of 8 his evidence, but as I put it to you, his evidence was 9 that in 2014, the company had considered a project which 10 had involved the real-time monitoring of driver 11 behaviour, but this project had been scrapped. 12 Do you remember that was the nature of the evidence 13 that I raised? Do you recall that? Do you recall my 14 raising that? 15 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Yes. 16 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you. And your response -- and this 17 was by Mr Leung -- if I understand it correctly, was 18 that the project to which Mr Jain had been referring was 19 a real-time operations management system, and that had 20 nothing to do with driving safety. Do you recall that 21 was what Mr Leung told us? 22 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) We were talking about 23 giving a real-time alert to the bus captain, 24 over-speeding or sudden acceleration or harsh braking. 25 MR PETER DUNCAN: Yes, and your recollection was that what</p>

Page 25	Page 27
<p>1 Mr Jain's project, if I could put it that way, entailed 2 was not that; it was, rather, a real-time operations 3 management system. Correct? 4 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Correct. 5 MR PETER DUNCAN: Again, just for the record, I will give 6 members the appropriate references in the transcript. 7 It's Day 13, page 41, lines 10 to 14, and then page 42 8 at line 23. 9 In the light of that apparent difference, the 10 chairman invited you to provide to the committee some of 11 the presentations which had been made during the course 12 of consideration of the project to which Mr Jain had 13 been referring. Amongst the material that the bus 14 company has provided since the last hearing have been 15 a number of presentations. Do you recall that those 16 presentations have been provided? 17 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) We have provided some 18 information to the committee, I believe. 19 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you. I just want to refer to some 20 of those presentations and raise some matters with you 21 in this context, if I may. 22 First of all, could you turn up KMB-11, please. 23 Could you go to page 4492, please. 24 Page 4492, you will see the cover of a particular 25 document, "The Kowloon Motor Bus Company (1933) Ltd,</p>	<p>1 headquarters and the individual drivers? 2 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) The one that we 3 developed subsequent to this did not have this feature. 4 MR PETER DUNCAN: Mr Jain's evidence I think was that this 5 was one of the aspects that was being considered, but it 6 was scrapped. So was real-time communication with the 7 drivers at least part of the consideration? 8 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Last time, our operations 9 director said it clearly. This function would involve 10 a central control centre, to remind bus captains over 11 the speed of the bus, and also the need to pause at some 12 bus stops so as to have a proper distance between buses. 13 Of course, in this course of action, there could be 14 communication with bus captains. But, as we said last 15 time, it would not be proper to distract the bus captain 16 while he is driving. Also, this function may take the 17 place of the function discharged by the dispatchers or 18 the management people at the bus termini. 19 So we did not think there would be the need to have 20 real-time verbal communication with bus captains while 21 they are on duty and it would be better to enhance the 22 functions discharged by the personnel, management 23 personnel, at the bus termini. 24 MR PETER DUNCAN: Yes. I'm not asking at the moment 25 questions with regard to the conclusion. All I'm asking</p>
Page 26	Page 28
<p>1 system specifications for real-time operations 2 management system (ROM)", and this is a document which 3 runs from page 4492, and it goes through to page 4530, 4 if I understand it correctly. 5 Now, at page 4493, we will see the table of contents 6 in this presentation. Part II is referred to as the 7 introduction and the scope of work. 8 If we then go to page 4495, we will see some of the 9 details with regard to the introduction and the scope of 10 work, and you have, under part II, item 1, 11 "Introduction" -- if I could bring your attention, 12 please, to item 1.4: 13 "The main functions of ROM are to assist dispatchers 14 from operations control centres and terminus supervisors 15 from bus termini to: 16 Manage bus departures and bus trips. 17 Handle special situations that cause disruptions to 18 bus services." 19 Then this is the one which I would bring your 20 particular attention to, 1.4.3: 21 "Communicate with drivers, via voice, text and sound 22 recordings for any information or special messages that 23 needs driver's attention and action." 24 So do I conclude from that that the system did 25 envisage real-time contact between the system at the bus</p>	<p>1 is whether, in the project that was being considered by 2 Mr Jain, which I understand to be part of this 3 presentation, there was, as part of that programme, 4 consideration as to whether there should be real-time 5 communication with drivers with regard to their 6 behaviour, including of course speed excesses. 7 So do I understand correctly from paragraph 1.4.3 8 that this was at least part of the project which was 9 being considered? Leave aside the conclusions. 10 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Well, it is put down here. 11 Of course, there was such consideration. It was back in 12 2013/2014. At that time, the view taken was that 13 something should be done centrally so that the real-time 14 operation management should be more comprehensive, so 15 that, by some means, the central controls should be able 16 to communicate with bus captains. 17 But we are now actually talking about the black box 18 and geo-fencing, and the alert would be given to bus 19 captains on board the bus and that would cover the 20 behaviour of the bus captain. We are at this stage now. 21 MR PETER DUNCAN: Yes. Thank you. If I could just, before 22 I leave this particular document, refer you to some 23 other passages which also seem to refer to this 24 real-time communication with drivers. I think you will 25 see at page 4497 -- you see under the heading,</p>

Page 29	Page 31
<p>1 "Functional requirements" a heading, "Operations control 2 centre system", and at 1.1.4: 3 "Allow dispatcher to draw a certain area on the map 4 so that buses within the boundary of the drawn area are: 5 a. Highlighted for sending text and voice 6 messages. 7 b. Used for speed calculation so that the average 8 speed of highlighted area are displayed." 9 If I could also bring your attention to the next 10 heading at page 4497, "Core system functions", that's 11 item 1.2, and then we have a subheading, "Operations 12 management", and at (a)(7), which you actually find on 13 the following page, 4498, we have this entry: 14 "Regulation of bus departures are done automatically 15 based on a set of rules with elements of the rules 16 configurable. The configurable items should include but 17 not limited to the followings". 18 Then item (iv) mentions "driver working guidelines". 19 So that would cover, would it not, the driving behaviour 20 of drivers; yes? 21 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Well, the regulation here 22 refers to the distance between the vehicles from 23 a safety perspective. 24 Allow me to say the following. On any one day, we 25 have at its peak over 3,000 buses running on the road at</p>	<p>1 distance between trains. This is not the same for 2 buses. 3 This is because we don't want to have the bunching 4 together of the buses. That's not desirable. Now, 5 of course, we have got something on mind to inform the 6 passengers about the arrival time, so it's not 7 safety-related. 8 CHAIRMAN: No, this is the efficient delivery of service, 9 nothing to do with safety. 10 MR ROGER LEE: Correct. Correct. 11 CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr Duncan. 12 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you, Mr Chairman. 13 Finally in this document, can I just bring your 14 attention to page 4501, and the heading, "Driver 15 communication system", under the overall heading of 16 "Functional requirements". At 2.1: 17 "A driver console will be installed on each bus. 18 The driver console will provide the following functions: 19 2.1.1 Display colour graphics and text data". 20 Then at item (c): 21 "Display real-time indicators showing driving 22 behaviour of the driver with information available from 23 the OBD. For abnormal driving behaviour, different beep 24 sounds shall be prompted to the driver. A global 25 parameter shall be provided to activate or deactivate</p>
Page 30	Page 32
<p>1 any one time, and they can be found all over Hong Kong, 2 including outlying islands, that is Lantau. If you have 3 a central control system to control all the 3,000 buses, 4 of course, if we want to have precise information about 5 them, it will mean it is quite a difficult task. 6 But here it is quite clear this is about the safe 7 distance from preceding or following vehicles. 8 MR PETER DUNCAN: If I could then refer you, please, to -- 9 CHAIRMAN: I'm sorry, could you elaborate what you mean by 10 "the safe distance"? Is this to do with the bunching of 11 buses? 12 MR ROGER LEE: Yes. 13 CHAIRMAN: That's nothing to do with safety, is it? 14 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Well, in fact, bus drivers 15 do not know how far he is away from the preceding bus, 16 so he will just be following his speed. For passengers, 17 buses departed at different times, but then roads get 18 congested and, as a result, the preceding bus and the 19 following bus will have a longer and longer headway. It 20 means that passengers would have to wait in such a way 21 that he has got a bunch of buses arriving. This is 22 quite similar to the case of train service, but then 23 trains have to stop at platforms. Many passengers would 24 have to board and alight, and so they would stop there 25 for a longer time, and you can more easily control the</p>	<p>1 this function." 2 So, at least for consideration, was there suggested 3 a real-time system whereby abnormal driving behaviour 4 would be detected and would be communicated to the 5 driver? 6 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Well, I think this is 7 what we call the on-board driver feedback device. We 8 are in the process of installing such a system. 9 Previously, the design was such that it would be 10 incorporated into the driver console, but today, in 11 fact, we have got a separate feedback device and the 12 real-time indicators are such that we have got lights as 13 well as audio alerts. That's for every bus. 14 MR PETER DUNCAN: Right. I'm going to move now to another 15 matter which came up at the last hearing -- this is on 16 Day 14 -- when the committee heard from the 17 representatives of the company that contrary to its 18 earlier intention, the company had decided not to 19 incorporate a tilt alarm in the buses. 20 Do you recall that evidence? 21 MR ROGER LEE: (Nodded head). 22 MR PETER DUNCAN: I will again give the committee 23 a reference to the transcript. It's Day 14 at pages 126 24 to 130. 25 If I understand Mr Leung's evidence correctly, the</p>



Page 33	Page 35
<p>1 reason for that was that neither ADL nor Volvo could 2 recommend a particular tilt angle. Is that a correct 3 recollection?</p> <p>4 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Correct.</p> <p>5 MR PETER DUNCAN: And if the angle was too narrow, it would 6 not be meaningful; it would mean nothing. And if, on 7 the other hand, the angle was too broad, it would be 8 dangerous. Is that a correct recollection of what was 9 said?</p> <p>10 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Yes.</p> <p>11 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>12 Now, I want to refer you to something which I was 13 alerted to only yesterday, and I'm not sure whether you 14 had a chance to look at it, but it's a document which we 15 can find at bundle MISC-2 at page 916.</p> <p>16 Have you had a chance of looking at this document 17 yet, Mr Leung?</p> <p>18 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Not yet.</p> <p>19 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you. In that case, I will perhaps 20 take you through it very slowly.</p> <p>21 It seems to be notes of a lecture or presentation 22 which was given at a seminar very recently -- sorry, 23 a long time ago -- 29 August 2008, and it is headed, 24 "Seminar on safety aspects of double deck buses in 25 Hong Kong", and the subheading is, "Regulatory (Safety)</p>	<p>1 test. In other words, the bus is static when it is 2 tested for tilting. If the bus can tilt at an angle 28 3 and it won't topple, then it means that it can meet the 4 test requirement, it can get the type approval, it can 5 be registered for running on our roads. That's my 6 understanding.</p> <p>7 MR PETER DUNCAN: I think the static test has been referred 8 to in previous documentation provided to the committee; 9 is that correct?</p> <p>10 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Correct.</p> <p>11 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>12 I am going to move now to the subject of journey 13 times and lead up to the issue of what are known as -- 14 what are described sometimes as "lost trips". I think 15 you know what I mean by that.</p> <p>16 Can I start by taking you to the evidence of one of 17 the representatives that we heard from one of the 18 unions, I think it was the Staff Rights Association of 19 KMB, Mr Li Kwok Wah. We will find that at the 20 transcript for Day 10, if I could take you to that, 21 please, at page 62.</p> <p>22 If I could just read you a passage from Mr Li's 23 evidence. He has been asked questions by Ms Wong for 24 the commission at line 14, and Ms Wong asks this: 25 "Mr Li, I would like to go to a specific topic on</p>
Page 34	Page 36
<p>1 Requirements of double-deck buses", and the presenter 2 appears to be a gentleman called Mr Steven Tse, 3 an engineer in the bus safety department of the Vehicle 4 Safety and Standards Division of the Transport 5 Department.</p> <p>6 This may be too much to ask, but do any of the 7 members from the company here this morning have any 8 recollection of attending such a seminar?</p> <p>9 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) I don't recall.</p> <p>10 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you. I go straight to the page in 11 which I am interested. It's page 936. I will simply go 12 to that and then give you the opportunity of reading 13 through the slides which precede it.</p> <p>14 At that page, there is this heading, "Tilt angle", 15 and on the left, "Regulatory requirement/directive", and 16 then on the right, "Tilt angle (DD bus)", which I infer 17 is double-decker bus, and the reference to 18 "United Nations -- Economic Commission for Europe, 19 28 degrees"; "EC -- European Union, 28 degrees"; and 20 "Hong Kong, 28 degrees".</p> <p>21 Does this mean anything to you, Mr Leung?</p> <p>22 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Well, for each 23 vehicle, in particular for double-decker buses, for them 24 to be allowed to run on the road, they have to meet this 25 test requirement, namely the tilt test. It is a static</p>	<p>1 scheduled trips and loss of time."</p> <p>2 And a few lines down: 3 "And the passage is at page 120." 4 At line 20: 5 "... you stated that: 6 '... with the continued loss of bus captains, and 7 the need [to] maintain the scheduled trips and avoid 8 cancelling scheduled trips, causing bus captains' 9 entitled rest time during work subject to the situation 10 of lost trips and the road traffic circumstances that 11 day. For many bus captains who would need to drive 12 various bus routes, in order to have more time for rest 13 during work, will try to complete the bus routes as soon 14 as possible depending on road traffic condition and 15 return to the bus terminals for rest.'</p> <p>16 Can you tell us or elaborate how the need to 17 maintain scheduled trips would affect bus captains' 18 entitled rest time?"</p> <p>19 Mr Li's answer is: 20 "The bus company, say, for example, there is one 21 hour of journey time, it would be compressed to 55 to 58 22 minutes. Bus captains have little rest time. If you 23 compress journey time even by a few minutes, that means 24 a loss of a few minutes of rest time." 25 Can I ask you this: if a journey does take longer</p>

Page 37	Page 39
<p>1 than the scheduled time, does that have a potential 2 effect on the driver's rest time?</p> <p>3 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Mr Duncan, my answer is 4 it may. It may. However, in each and every terminus, 5 we have got a terminus supervisor on duty. It is 6 exactly because of this the supervisor will make 7 corresponding adjustments, so that the bus captains, 8 though affected by the traffic congestion or owing to 9 other reasons come back late to the terminus, they would 10 still get rest time. So we will make arrangements.</p> <p>11 MR PETER DUNCAN: Are there circumstances such that 12 sometimes bus drivers do have to forfeit their rest 13 time?</p> <p>14 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Sometimes, this may 15 happen, but I just want to emphasise that for each bus 16 captain, when he returns to the terminus, he will 17 certainly have time. He will have a pre-scheduled rest 18 time. But then if this is being affected owing to one 19 reason or another, we will still give him a water break, 20 a toilet break -- he can have a sip of water, he can go 21 to the toilet -- before he commences the next revenue 22 trip to take on passengers.</p> <p>23 MR PETER DUNCAN: How does the company actually calculate 24 the length of time that is necessary for a particular 25 route?</p>	<p>1 time would be changes in the number of passengers. It 2 will have a direct bearing on the time taken. Say, for 3 example, more passengers boarding, more passengers 4 alighting. In other words, you have to stop at a bus 5 stop for a longer time. Then there may be road 6 diversions or we have to deroute a bus service. Say, 7 for example, the main route is the same but there are 8 slight changes to its side routes, then we have to 9 re-examine the journey time.</p> <p>10 MR PETER DUNCAN: I'd like to refer you, please, to the 11 evidence of Mr Kelvin Yeung, who gave assistance to the 12 tribunal on Day 11. He I think is a current depot 13 manager within KMB. We find his evidence on Day 11 at 14 page 94.</p> <p>15 In fact if I can take you by introducing the 16 question of him at page 93, line 19, again Ms Wong 17 asking the question. Ms Wong asks this of Mr Kelvin 18 Yeung:</p> <p>19 "And moving on to another topic, it is about lost 20 trips.</p> <p>21 We have heard evidence from your colleague, Ms Debby 22 Wong, that lost trips appear to be a frequent 23 occurrence, and it affects driving behaviour because of 24 the inaccurate estimation of scheduled journey time. 25 And also it would, in turn, affect the rest time period.</p>
Page 38	Page 40
<p>1 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) We do. When we draw up 2 the journey time for each route -- well, there are two 3 types. First of all, we have got existing bus routes. 4 We do have a mechanism, and it is subject to regular 5 reviews. So once every three months we will look at 6 each bus route. We have got 380-plus routes under KMB. 7 So, on a quarterly basis, we have to re-examine each and 8 every route once every three months.</p> <p>9 Then, secondly, in the light of special traffic 10 conditions, in the light of sudden changes of passenger 11 volume, and in the light of the increase or decrease of 12 express routes, and in the light of feedback from 13 frontline bus captains, inspectors and supervisors, we 14 also have ad hoc arrangements. We won't wait until the 15 next quarterly review. We will carry out a review of 16 the journey time instantly.</p> <p>17 MR PETER DUNCAN: What does the review entail?</p> <p>18 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Well, a number of 19 elements would affect the journey time. Say, for 20 example, changes in the traffic conditions. Say, for 21 example, in West Kowloon, in Jordan and Nathan Road, 22 traffic was congested because of the construction of the 23 XRL, and so we have to make adjustments about the 24 journey time.</p> <p>25 Then another factor that would prolong the journey</p>	<p>1 What is your view on this matter?"</p> <p>2 Mr Yeung responds as follows:</p> <p>3 "From my perspective, lost trip is due to various 4 reasons.</p> <p>5 First, we may lose a trip because of shortage of bus 6 captains, there may be traffic jam in Hong Kong, there 7 may be emergency situations, public events, 8 demonstrations, rallies, or special traffic 9 arrangements, inclement weather, and vehicles breaking 10 down on the road. All these contribute to the problem 11 of lost trips. But we try our best not to affect the 12 rest periods of bus captains, because we have a schedule 13 of journey time, we have provided that to the bus 14 captains, and about 96 per cent of these, or 90 per cent 15 of these trips allow bus captains to have sufficient 16 rest periods."</p> <p>17 Now, a lost trip, I assume that that means there is 18 a bus which is supposed to leave from A and arrive at B 19 but in fact, perhaps for one or more of these reasons, 20 it just doesn't happen.</p> <p>21 Could you give the committee some idea as to how 22 frequent this occurrence occurs?</p> <p>23 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) The Transport Department 24 assigns a value to all franchised bus operators. In 25 terms of the lost trip rate, in the context of our</p>

Page 41	Page 43
<p>1 schedule of service, the benchmark is no more than 2 3 per cent of the trips.</p> <p>3 MR PETER DUNCAN: I'm going to ask in that respect for you 4 to look at one of the Transport Department documents. 5 Again, we will need to go to TD-1 for this, at page 34. 6 At page 34, we have a document which was provided by 7 the transport authorities to the committee for the 8 purposes of this hearing. This document is headed, 9 "An overview of the regulatory and monitoring regime of 10 franchised bus[es]". You can see the purpose of the 11 paper, at page 34: "to give an overview of the 12 regulatory and monitoring regime under which the 13 government regulates the operation of franchised bus 14 services in Hong Kong." 15 Then there are a number of sections. The part 16 I would like to refer to at the moment can be found on 17 page 44, and it's paragraph (e). It's under the 18 heading, at page 41, of "Other measures and requirements 19 through exchange of letters and issuance of guidelines", 20 and there are a number of paragraphs -- (a), (b), (c), 21 (d) -- and we get to (e) on page 44. If I could read 22 that out quickly: 23 "In 2015, the Transport Department put forward 24 a revised sanction mechanism in respect of the bus lost 25 trips made by the franchised bus operators. The</p>	<p>1 deploying more standby bus drivers to fill up the 2 shortfall, to improve the lost trip situation. Given 3 the actions taken by the franchised bus operators, no 4 further penalty actions were imposed on them." 5 Just before I ask you a couple of questions on that, 6 could I ask you, please, to go through to page 117 of 7 the same bundle. 8 CHAIRMAN: Before you do that, Mr Duncan, the missing 9 appendix K, is that not at TD-2, page 291? 10 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you, Mr Chairman. I couldn't find 11 it. 12 CHAIRMAN: Don't let me divert you. It may not be directly 13 relevant. 14 MR PETER DUNCAN: I'm happy to go to that volume, if members 15 from the company can see that, at page 291. 16 Thank you, Mr Chairman. 17 Appendix K. 18 I think that is a general letter regarding the 19 subject, with respect to promulgating the revised 20 sanction mechanism. You will see that. 21 Thank you, Mr Chairman. 22 What I want to do before just asking you a couple of 23 questions on this topic is to take you through to 24 another of the Transport Department's papers, at 25 page 117, referred to as Transport Department paper 10,</p>
Page 42	Page 44
<p>1 mechanism sets out the procedures and steps on the 2 issuance of letters of different degrees of gravity 3 (including reminding letter, advisory letter, warning 4 letter and serious warning letter) depending on the 5 frequency, level of lost trips incurred and 6 rectification actions taken by the FB operators. The 7 warning letters will make way for initiating further 8 statutory sanctions under section 22 of the Public Bus 9 Services Ordinance, such as financial penalty, 10 revocation of operating right of a particular bus route 11 or of its franchise in the event that no apparent 12 improvement is made by the bus operator concerned 13 without providing any reasonable explanations. See 14 appendix K on a sample of TD's letter to FB operators on 15 the promulgation of revised sanction mechanism." 16 Unfortunately, I was unable to find appendix K, but 17 reading on: 18 "Since the implementation of the above mechanism in 19 2015, the Transport Department has been closely 20 monitoring the lost trip situation of the franchised bus 21 operators and sent reminding letters, advisory letters 22 and warning letter to franchised bus operators for 23 rectification action and making service improvement. 24 These ... operators provided explanations to the 25 Transport Department and took prompt actions, including</p>	<p>1 which is headed, "Operation of franchised bus service -- 2 route scheduling, fleet deployment and designation of 3 speed limit", and the purpose: 4 "This paper gives an account of the role of the 5 Transport Department in route scheduling, fleet 6 deployment and designation of speed limits on roads for 7 operation of franchised bus service." 8 Then if you go to page 122, you will see what's 9 described as a sample of the schedule of service of 10 a particular bus route. There's an example which is 11 described as the air-conditioned Kowloon urban route 12 no. 2. 13 Now, going back to the question of these possible 14 sanctions and letters, could you give the committee some 15 idea as to how many warning letters the company may have 16 received, say in the last six months? 17 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Mr Duncan, in the past six 18 months, the company did not receive warning letters due 19 to lost trips, but for particular routes we received 20 advisory letters or reminder letters. 21 MR PETER DUNCAN: What were the advisory or reminder letters 22 about? 23 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) For certain routes, for 24 example during certain hours, for example at night, the 25 letters would remind us that the lost trip rate was over</p>

Page 45	Page 47
<p>1 3 per cent, and the letter reminded us to make</p> <p>2 improvements and asked why these lost trips occurred.</p> <p>3 MR PETER DUNCAN: Has the company received any warning</p> <p>4 letters in the last 12 months?</p> <p>5 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) We did not receive any</p> <p>6 warning letters in the last 12 months.</p> <p>7 MR PETER DUNCAN: Is it necessary, from time to time, given</p> <p>8 the circumstances that might give rise to lost trips, to</p> <p>9 approach the department and ask for amendments to the</p> <p>10 schedule for a particular route?</p> <p>11 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Our company often</p> <p>12 contacts the Transport Department to report the specific</p> <p>13 issues we encounter on certain routes. When the TD</p> <p>14 calculates the lost trip rate, they would calculate it</p> <p>15 based on four time periods, namely the morning peak</p> <p>16 hours, morning non-peak hours, the evening peak hours</p> <p>17 and evening non-peak hours. Based on road and traffic</p> <p>18 conditions, including congestion and illegal parking, we</p> <p>19 would often reflect to TD requesting a review of the</p> <p>20 schedule of service, et cetera.</p> <p>21 MR PETER DUNCAN: Does the Transport Department often grant</p> <p>22 those review applications?</p> <p>23 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) I can only say that it</p> <p>24 is very difficult. We have a lot of low utilisation</p> <p>25 routes. Very often, due to change in passenger volume,</p>	<p>1 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) TD.</p> <p>2 MR PETER DUNCAN: Do you have a say in the formation of the</p> <p>3 guidelines?</p> <p>4 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) The guidelines were in</p> <p>5 place for a long time. They have proved effective. So</p> <p>6 this is about the execution of the guidelines and we</p> <p>7 agree with those guidelines.</p> <p>8 MR PETER DUNCAN: Could you supply the committee with a copy</p> <p>9 of the guidelines?</p> <p>10 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) I think the guidelines are</p> <p>11 already included in the bundles. I will tell you where</p> <p>12 they are during the break.</p> <p>13 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>15 MR PETER DUNCAN: Sorry, one more question. So the problem</p> <p>16 which seems to have been identified is not in the</p> <p>17 guidelines, it is in the way in which the guidelines are</p> <p>18 applied; that would be correct?</p> <p>19 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) I totally agree. The</p> <p>20 guidelines are very clear. But in terms of enforcement,</p> <p>21 I realise there is a lot of resistance, so I hope that</p> <p>22 resources can be invested on the significant or useful</p> <p>23 routes.</p> <p>24 Thank you.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Gentlemen, we will take a 20-minute break now,</p>
Page 46	Page 48
<p>1 for example due to railway developments, our service</p> <p>2 demand might drop. Very often, during the non-peak</p> <p>3 hours -- we have repeatedly made written requests as</p> <p>4 well as face-to-face requests that the TD would lower</p> <p>5 the frequency of service for non-peak hours. These</p> <p>6 applications are made based on certain guidelines, and</p> <p>7 according to the guidelines, we are entitled to certain</p> <p>8 journey reductions.</p> <p>9 Even if we fulfil the guideline requirements, to be</p> <p>10 very honest, if we need to increase our service</p> <p>11 frequency, the TD would often want us to get it done</p> <p>12 immediately, on the request of district personnel. But</p> <p>13 if we want to reduce our service, it is very difficult.</p> <p>14 Our manpower resources are limited, but at times we</p> <p>15 would have to invest our resources on low utilisation</p> <p>16 routes. I don't think this is a healthy development.</p> <p>17 Very often, we communicate with TD, but progress is</p> <p>18 relatively slow.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: So, although you have reduced usage, passengers,</p> <p>20 and you ask for a reduced service to be permitted, you</p> <p>21 don't get approval? And there are various forces</p> <p>22 involved in impeding your request?</p> <p>23 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Correct.</p> <p>24 MR PETER DUNCAN: Just one more question before we break</p> <p>25 Who issues these guidelines?</p>	<p>1 and if you can locate the reference, we would be</p> <p>2 grateful.</p> <p>3 20 minutes. Thank you.</p> <p>4 (11.38 am)</p> <p>5 (A short adjournment)</p> <p>6 (12.00 pm)</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>8 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>9 I think you were going to find a reference for us to</p> <p>10 those guidelines.</p> <p>11 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) We do have it. KMB</p> <p>12 Long Win Bus bundle 2, page 73, item (IV), "Frequency</p> <p>13 reduction". Yes, it has been turned up on the screen.</p> <p>14 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you very much.</p> <p>15 Just while we are on the subject of references,</p> <p>16 Mr Chairman raised the matter of the anti-dozing device</p> <p>17 being utilised in Singapore. If a reference is needed</p> <p>18 for that, it can be found at CTB-1 at page 63.</p> <p>19 I now wish to move on to the issue of toilet and</p> <p>20 rest facilities for bus captains. Can I commence this</p> <p>21 by taking you to the volume TD-1 at page 438, please.</p> <p>22 To introduce this particular page, we need to go</p> <p>23 back to page 427, which is a letter from the Transport</p> <p>24 Department to the committee of 20 July 2018, where the</p> <p>25 Transport Department has provided a number of answers to</p>

Page 49	Page 51
<p>1 questions raised by the committee.</p> <p>2 At 438, you will see question 28:</p> <p>3 "Provision of toilet and rest facilities at bus</p> <p>4 termini.</p> <p>5 Has the Transport Department issued any guidelines</p> <p>6 to franchised bus operators on provision of toilet and</p> <p>7 rest facilities at bus termini? If so, please let us</p> <p>8 have the details. If not, the underlying reasons for</p> <p>9 not doing so. Does the Transport Department assume</p> <p>10 an active role in facilitating the respective franchised</p> <p>11 bus operators to pursue with relevant departments for</p> <p>12 provision of the facilities?"</p> <p>13 I will go through quickly the response of the</p> <p>14 department to that question:</p> <p>15 "The Transport Department has all along encouraged</p> <p>16 the bus companies, being good employers, to provide</p> <p>17 suitable toilets and rest facilities at bus termini for</p> <p>18 their staff. When relevant departments/authorities</p> <p>19 consider and vet the applications for setting up these</p> <p>20 staff facilities, the TD has been providing appropriate</p> <p>21 coordination so as to facilitate early installation of</p> <p>22 such facilities.</p> <p>23 There are no specific guidelines issued to the</p> <p>24 franchised bus operators on the provision of toilets and</p> <p>25 rest facilities. It is because toilets and rest</p>	<p>1 the ... operators understand the procedural requirements</p> <p>2 with a view to smoothening the application process for</p> <p>3 timely provision of the facilities. The successful case</p> <p>4 of provision of a rest kiosk at the bus terminus on</p> <p>5 Ma Wan Road outside Shan Shui House of Shui Pin Wai</p> <p>6 Estate as mentioned in TD's paper 05 'Franchised bus</p> <p>7 captain -- working conditions and environment' is one of</p> <p>8 the good examples. Each department/authority may have</p> <p>9 its own statutory power and considerations in processing</p> <p>10 the FB's application for placement of toilets and rest</p> <p>11 facilities under their jurisdiction. That said, the</p> <p>12 Transport Department will continue to facilitate the</p> <p>13 franchised bus operators if necessary to actively cater</p> <p>14 for the needs of bus captains on provisions of toilets</p> <p>15 and rest facilities, and endeavour to provide the</p> <p>16 necessary assistance to the franchised bus operators in</p> <p>17 this respect."</p> <p>18 Then there was a second question that was asked by</p> <p>19 the committee:</p> <p>20 "Despite repeated and longstanding requests made by</p> <p>21 franchised bus operators, the committee was informed</p> <p>22 that some bus termini are still not provided with</p> <p>23 adequate toilet and rest facilities. Please identify</p> <p>24 these bus termini and whether they are major termini</p> <p>25 serving a number of bus routes and whether any of those</p>
Page 50	Page 52
<p>1 facilities are generally part of the basic facilities to</p> <p>2 be considered when new bus termini are designed.</p> <p>3 Requirements and comments from the franchised bus</p> <p>4 operators on toilets and rest facilities would be</p> <p>5 incorporated in the design of the bus termini as</p> <p>6 appropriate. At bus termini where toilets are not</p> <p>7 within reasonable walking distance, or rest facilities</p> <p>8 are not provided or insufficient, the franchised bus</p> <p>9 operators are active in applying for placement of these</p> <p>10 facilities to meet their latest operational needs. As</p> <p>11 at 31 March 2018, nearly all of the 295 bus termini over</p> <p>12 the territory are provided with toilets [within]</p> <p>13 a walking distance of 3 to 7 minutes, and about</p> <p>14 86 per cent of the bus termini (ie 255 bus termini) over</p> <p>15 the territory are provided with rest facilities in the</p> <p>16 form of regulator's kiosk/office or rest kiosk for bus</p> <p>17 captains. It is therefore considered not necessary to</p> <p>18 issue specific guidelines to the franchised bus</p> <p>19 operators on provision of toilet and rest facilities at</p> <p>20 bus termini.</p> <p>21 The Transport Department has been proactively</p> <p>22 liaising with the relevant departments/authorities as</p> <p>23 appropriate to resolve any difficulties encountered by</p> <p>24 the franchised bus operators in applying for the</p> <p>25 facilities, and to let the departments/authorities and</p>	<p>1 routes are manned by bus captains employed by Kowloon</p> <p>2 Motor Bus working on special shift who require adequate</p> <p>3 rest facilities to take rest break no less than 3</p> <p>4 consecutive hours. Please explain the constraints in</p> <p>5 providing such facilities, particularly the reasons for</p> <p>6 rejecting franchised bus companies' request for</p> <p>7 provision of such facilities by the relevant</p> <p>8 departments/authorities."</p> <p>9 The answer provided by the department was as</p> <p>10 follows:</p> <p>11 "As at 31 March 2018, nearly all of the 295 bus</p> <p>12 termini over the territory are provided with toilets</p> <p>13 with a walking distance of 3 to 7 minutes, and about</p> <p>14 86 per cent of the bus termini (ie 255 bus termini) over</p> <p>15 the territory are provided with rest facilities in the</p> <p>16 form of regulator's kiosk/office or rest kiosk for bus</p> <p>17 captains. Among the remaining 14 per cent of the bus</p> <p>18 termini without rest facilities, the franchised bus</p> <p>19 operators have not applied for provision of rest</p> <p>20 facilities at most, if not all of the bus termini.</p> <p>21 On the other side, the franchised bus operators may</p> <p>22 apply to relevant departments/authorities for</p> <p>23 additional/enlarged rest facilities at bus termini to</p> <p>24 meet their operational needs. A list of the bus termini</p> <p>25 with toilets and rest facilities, to our best knowledge,</p>

Page 53	Page 55
<p>1 that were requested by the ... operators and were 2 rejected in the past 3 years or under processing by 3 relevant departments/authorities is attached at annex 3 4 for reference. We are afraid that the Transport 5 Department does not have the information on the duty 6 shift records of individual bus captain on each bus 7 route which may be subject to changes from time to time 8 and hence the information as to whether any of those 9 routes operating at these bus termini were manned by bus 10 captains employed by KMB working on special shift. 11 As shown in annex 3, the major reasons for rejecting 12 the franchised bus operators' request for provision of 13 toilets and rest facilities by relevant 14 departments/authorities are mainly because of the 15 physical constraints at individual sites (eg the bus 16 terminus is located on a narrow sidewalk) or because of 17 the views expressed by the community in the 18 neighbourhood. As the proponent of the facilities, the 19 franchised bus operators would explore feasible 20 solutions to overcome the physical constraints and 21 address the concerns from the locals for setting up 22 toilets and rest facilities at those bus termini for bus 23 captains. The Transport Department would assist the 24 franchised bus operators in canvassing support from the 25 locals by conducting site visits/meetings with them to</p>	<p>1 the lack of the same. Then I will come back to the 2 Transport Department position. 3 My understanding is that KMB has four depots, as 4 they are called, and then a large number of termini; 5 would that be correct? 6 MR ROGER LEE: Yes. 7 MR PETER DUNCAN: So, if we look at KMB-1, at page 252, do 8 we see there the company's own map of depots and zones, 9 for the company's use, which sets out the locations, or 10 identifies, rather, the four depots that the company 11 has: one at Lai Chi Kok, the Kowloon Bay Depot, the 12 Tuen Mun Depot, and a Sha Tin Depot. 13 Just for the avoidance of any doubt, what exactly is 14 a depot? 15 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Within a depot, we have two 16 functions. First of all, every night, buses return to 17 the depot for maintenance, refuelling and cleansing. 18 Some maintenance and repair work is being carried out 19 there. 20 Another major function is as follows. Bus captains 21 get their duty rosters and bus captains take a rest 22 there. Bus captains go there every morning to get their 23 duty list. There are four. At Tuen Mun Depot, it has 24 the specific function of carrying out annual inspection 25 and maintenance, and then at another one, Sha Tin,</p>
Page 54	Page 56
<p>1 explore feasible solutions for erection of the rest 2 facilities in order to expedite the implementation plans 3 as and when necessary for the benefits of bus captains 4 and passengers." 5 Annex 3, we will have to go to another bundle for 6 that. It's to be found at TD-5 at page 1723. 7 You will see, at 1723, there is a heading, "List of 8 bus termini with toilets and rest facilities requested 9 by the franchised bus operators": 10 "(A) List of bus termini with toilets and rest 11 facilities requested by the franchised bus operators 12 under processing by the Transport Department. 13 (B) List of bus termini with toilets and rest 14 facilities listed by the franchised bus operators under 15 processing by the relevant departments/authorities. 16 (C) List of bus termini with toilets and rest 17 facilities rejected by the Transport Department and 18 relevant departments/authorities in the past 3 years." 19 Now, I will ask some questions later with regard to 20 some of the points that the Transport Department has 21 sought to make. It may well be that the company would 22 wish to respond, in any event, to some of those 23 assertions. But before I do that, before I come back to 24 the information provided by the department, I have some 25 questions of my own relating to the actual facilities or</p>	<p>1 training school. At Lai Chi Kok Depot, that's the 2 centre for dispatching to cater for special 3 circumstances, like a typhoon. For Kowloon Bay Depot, 4 that's our backup office. 5 MR PETER DUNCAN: So does each bus captain start his day by 6 going to a depot? 7 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Most of them are, but some 8 of them would just report to a terminus. Most of them 9 will go back to the depot to get his duty list for the 10 day. 11 MR PETER DUNCAN: Do I understand correctly -- you touched 12 on this a couple of moments ago, I believe -- that the 13 depots do provide toilet and resting facilities for the 14 captains? 15 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Certainly. Within 16 a depot -- well, in fact the depot is larger in size -- 17 we have got showering facilities, we have toilets. And 18 for each depot, we have got a clinic for bus captains 19 who are not feeling well; they will be given a quick 20 check before deciding whether they should resume their 21 duties. There are also rest facilities for bus 22 captains. 23 The chairman reminded me that in fact we have got 24 a barber's shop for bus captains to have a haircut. 25 CHAIRMAN: That's certainly true in Tuen Mun, but is that</p>

Page 57	Page 59
<p>1 true in all four of the depots?</p> <p>2 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) All four of them. All four</p> <p>3 of them. There is even a grocery shop so that they can</p> <p>4 buy basic groceries. The majority of the bus captains</p> <p>5 would regard the depot as a place that they have</p> <p>6 essential belongings.</p> <p>7 MR PETER DUNCAN: May I refer you, please, to file MISC-2 at</p> <p>8 page 902. You will see this is part of the document</p> <p>9 which is headed, on page 899, as a report on KMB's bus</p> <p>10 termini and the Tuen Mun Depot, visited by the chairman</p> <p>11 and members of the IRC staff on 3 August.</p> <p>12 There is reference at paragraph (E) on page 902 to</p> <p>13 the Tuen Mun Depot.</p> <p>14 If I could bring to your attention, please, just the</p> <p>15 second bullet point at the bottom of page 902: on the</p> <p>16 1st floor, there is "a recreation area with two table</p> <p>17 tennis tables, a water dispenser, a locker and a soft</p> <p>18 drink vending machine, a barber's shop; a convenience</p> <p>19 shop; a restroom with A/C, four tables, 16 chairs,</p> <p>20 a refrigerator, a microwave oven and a television; and</p> <p>21 a small dark room with couches, which permitted bus</p> <p>22 captains to sleep in a horizontal position. One bus</p> <p>23 captain was sleeping in that position".</p> <p>24 Then on the 2nd floor:</p> <p>25 "a clinic, male and female toilets, storage room</p>	<p>1 for 'special shifts'.</p> <p>2 The details are set out in the enclosed table."</p> <p>3 And so on. Then we see the table at pages 206, 207</p> <p>4 and through to 211.</p> <p>5 Before I ask some questions with regard to that</p> <p>6 schedule, this of course concerns termini which are used</p> <p>7 for the special shifts. Do I infer correctly that there</p> <p>8 are some termini which are not used for special shifts?</p> <p>9 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Yes, Mr Duncan. Some</p> <p>10 termini might not be used by captains on special shifts.</p> <p>11 MR PETER DUNCAN: Now, approximately how many of those would</p> <p>12 there be?</p> <p>13 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Perhaps I can provide</p> <p>14 a figure to reflect the situation.</p> <p>15 As for the number of termini with bus captains</p> <p>16 resting, this is something we have to look at or find</p> <p>17 out. Perhaps I can provide the number of captains on</p> <p>18 special shifts that would take rests at depots, how many</p> <p>19 would take a rest at termini and how many of them would</p> <p>20 take a rest back home.</p> <p>21 MR PETER DUNCAN: Yes. I probably haven't made myself</p> <p>22 clear, but this table would set out all the termini at</p> <p>23 which captains may be at when they commence their</p> <p>24 special or take their special shift and then have</p> <p>25 a rest.</p>
Page 58	Page 60
<p>1 (uniform) and offices."</p> <p>2 Then we're assisted by annex E, which we will find</p> <p>3 on page 912, and 913, which contain photographic images</p> <p>4 of what is being described there in those paragraphs.</p> <p>5 So that's the position with regard to depots.</p> <p>6 Turning to the issue of termini, how many termini</p> <p>7 does KMB have?</p> <p>8 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) 217.</p> <p>9 MR PETER DUNCAN: Can we go to KMB-1 at page 201, please.</p> <p>10 You will see, at this page, a letter from the</p> <p>11 committee dated 19 July 2018 to the company, and in the</p> <p>12 second paragraph it asks the company to provide</p> <p>13 information as to the location and address of the bus</p> <p>14 termini, and the bus depot responsible for that bus</p> <p>15 termini, at which KMB and Long Win bus captains working</p> <p>16 a "special shift", permitted under the guidelines,</p> <p>17 commence the minimum of a three-hour break which they</p> <p>18 are required to be afforded on such a shift, and the</p> <p>19 company is asked to describe in detail the resting and</p> <p>20 staff facilities available at the terminal.</p> <p>21 Then we can see the answer to that letter at</p> <p>22 page 205, a letter dated 26 July:</p> <p>23 "We refer to your letter ... dated 19 July ... by</p> <p>24 which you requested us to provide details of the resting</p> <p>25 and staff facilities available at bus termini that cater</p>	<p>1 MR PATRICK PANG: Yes.</p> <p>2 MR PETER DUNCAN: If I understand things correctly, there</p> <p>3 would be some termini that would fall under that</p> <p>4 category, they would not be used for resting in</p> <p>5 a special shift situation. Is that correct?</p> <p>6 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Perhaps I would put it</p> <p>7 this way. According to the timetable, some termini are</p> <p>8 not being used by bus captains on special shifts for</p> <p>9 resting. However, even if a terminus has resting</p> <p>10 facilities, operationally there might be different</p> <p>11 arrangements or deployments.</p> <p>12 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Mr Duncan, KMB has 217</p> <p>13 termini and at each terminus there are basic facilities.</p> <p>14 As for terminus facilities, the kiosk approved by the</p> <p>15 government is about 40 square feet in area, and these</p> <p>16 are needed by bus captains, even those not on special</p> <p>17 shifts. We do not make a distinction for those on</p> <p>18 special shifts.</p> <p>19 I have looked at all 217 termini. We are talking</p> <p>20 about kiosks of 40 square feet. This is not a place to</p> <p>21 sleep.</p> <p>22 MR PETER DUNCAN: Sorry, when you say you looked at all 217</p> <p>23 termini, did they cover termini used in a special shift</p> <p>24 situation and also termini not used in a special shift</p> <p>25 situation?</p>

Page 61	Page 63
<p>1 MR ROGER LEE: Yes.</p> <p>2 MR PETER DUNCAN: So that's the total number of termini,</p> <p>3 irrespective of the special duty situation?</p> <p>4 MR ROGER LEE: Right.</p> <p>5 MR PETER DUNCAN: If I understand your answer just a few</p> <p>6 moments ago correctly, when you're considering</p> <p>7 facilities you don't distinguish between the two?</p> <p>8 MR ROGER LEE: Right. (Via interpreter) Yes.</p> <p>9 MR PETER DUNCAN: I want you to go, please, to KMB-1 at</p> <p>10 page 206.</p> <p>11 We see, amongst other things, in this table, which</p> <p>12 of the termini rely on the use of a public toilet, as</p> <p>13 opposed to a chemical toilet, and as opposed to a KMB</p> <p>14 toilet.</p> <p>15 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Of the 217 termini, we have</p> <p>16 50 termini with purpose-built toilets, and we have</p> <p>17 66 termini with chemical toilets and about 100 would</p> <p>18 rely on surrounding facilities, including shopping</p> <p>19 malls. One terminus has no toilet facilities.</p> <p>20 MR PETER DUNCAN: Now, given -- the number of public</p> <p>21 toilets -- if I could ask about that -- according to the</p> <p>22 Transport Department document I showed you a few moments</p> <p>23 ago, these toilets might be three to seven minutes away</p> <p>24 from the terminus. Is that a correct reflection of the</p> <p>25 situation?</p>	<p>1 27 chemical toilets, in how many instances will the</p> <p>2 company be dependent upon public toilets?</p> <p>3 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) For these 100 termini, the</p> <p>4 situation is difficult because we have to rely on public</p> <p>5 toilets. Some public toilets are located in parks. Or</p> <p>6 let me put it this way: toilets are a complicated issue,</p> <p>7 because the applications for toilets require</p> <p>8 communication with government departments and district</p> <p>9 councillors and a lot of time is needed, and there is</p> <p>10 very little within our control on what we can do.</p> <p>11 MR PETER DUNCAN: Assuming you did have control of the</p> <p>12 situation, what would be the ideal outcome for the</p> <p>13 company?</p> <p>14 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Personally, I often visit</p> <p>15 the termini, and I want our captains and frontline staff</p> <p>16 to know that we are listening to their challenges.</p> <p>17 I think the main challenge today is not on toilets but</p> <p>18 on the rest kiosks. Last autumn, there was an incident,</p> <p>19 the rest kiosks are important to our staff. The</p> <p>20 locations and sizes of the kiosks are an important part</p> <p>21 of our work coming up for new termini in the future;</p> <p>22 more should be done in terms of facilities, and this</p> <p>23 should be our area of focus.</p> <p>24 MR PETER DUNCAN: We will come to the rest facilities in</p> <p>25 a moment, but assuming the way was much clearer than it</p>
Page 62	Page 64
<p>1 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) I have not paid visits</p> <p>2 myself, but many of them can be reached within ten</p> <p>3 minutes' walk. Some termini rely on shopping malls, and</p> <p>4 when the shopping malls are closed the captains might</p> <p>5 have to walk further. This is possible.</p> <p>6 MR PETER DUNCAN: Does the company consider that to be</p> <p>7 a satisfactory state of affairs?</p> <p>8 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) In the past year, we added</p> <p>9 26 new chemical toilets, and now there is only one</p> <p>10 terminus left. I think we are reaching a level that is</p> <p>11 acceptable. By captains one year ago, the situation</p> <p>12 might not be acceptable. For chemical toilets, since</p> <p>13 there is a lack of power supply, ventilation and other</p> <p>14 aspects might be worse than a complete toilet. But this</p> <p>15 is being improved upon and more will be done.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: When you say there is one terminus left, what do</p> <p>17 you mean exactly by that?</p> <p>18 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) That is a terminus in</p> <p>19 Yuen Long. So the situation is like what you heard</p> <p>20 a few days ago: the footpath is rather narrow, and</p> <p>21 district councillors do not find that location</p> <p>22 appropriate, so it is still under application, so we are</p> <p>23 yet to install chemical toilet in one of our termini,</p> <p>24 and that terminus is in Yuen Long, in Yuen Long Park.</p> <p>25 MR PETER DUNCAN: So, after the installation of those</p>	<p>1 appears to be at the moment, what outcome would you want</p> <p>2 with regard to the provision of toilet facilities other</p> <p>3 than not relying on public facilities?</p> <p>4 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) For our chemical toilets,</p> <p>5 very often power supply could not be connected in many</p> <p>6 of them. I once asked our engineering department to</p> <p>7 supply batteries and connect them to the toilets so that</p> <p>8 24-hour ventilation and lighting would be possible. So</p> <p>9 this was the first step we conducted.</p> <p>10 Next, for all venues with no power supply, we have</p> <p>11 installed solar panels on top of the chemical toilets,</p> <p>12 in order to enable lighting and ventilation for our bus</p> <p>13 captains. Within my ambit, we have done our best in</p> <p>14 terms of chemical toilets. As for facilities in</p> <p>15 shopping malls or parks, would we be allowed to install</p> <p>16 more chemical toilets? This is something we would try</p> <p>17 to do. But, as we said, there is involvement of</p> <p>18 government departments and district personnel, so there</p> <p>19 is some difficulty.</p> <p>20 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Mr Duncan, I would like</p> <p>21 to add something. I would like to thank you for raising</p> <p>22 this issue of toilets.</p> <p>23 The issue has bothered our captains. Sometimes, our</p> <p>24 bus captains are rejected when they want to visit</p> <p>25 toilets in shopping malls, and they might have to walk</p>



Page 65	Page 67
<p>1 eight or ten minutes to reach a toilet. Their rest time 2 might be jeopardised as a result, and this issue has 3 bothered our bus captains.</p> <p>4 I am quite surprised that some termini have no 5 toilets. Even we can add chemical toilets, but for new 6 termini, I am quite surprised that they have not 7 factored in a permanent toilet.</p> <p>8 Let me give you some examples. For example, the 9 West Kowloon XRL Station bus terminus. It's a sizeable 10 bus terminus but there is no toilet. For Hung Luen Road 11 in Hung Hom, there is a new terminus to replace the 12 Hung Hom Pier terminus. It is a public transport 13 interchange; again, there is no toilet, there is no rest 14 kiosk. For the Hong Kong-Macau-Zhuhai Bridge terminus, 15 as we see now, there will be no toilet.</p> <p>16 So again I would like to thank you for raising this 17 issue for these resting facilities, including toilets. 18 They should be included, or they should include the 19 basic facilities.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: So is the root cause of the problem a failure of 21 the planning system? How can you have new termini set 22 up with new routes and have no regime that requires that 23 suitable toilets be made available?</p> <p>24 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Thank you, Chairman. 25 I do not know whether this is a design failure. For</p>	<p>1 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Yes.</p> <p>2 MR PETER DUNCAN: Does it constitute an application for the 3 placement of a chemical toilet at the Allway Gardens bus 4 terminus?</p> <p>5 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Yes.</p> <p>6 MR PETER DUNCAN: If you go through, please, to page 199-10, 7 do you see a copy of a response from the Transport 8 Department in April 2016?</p> <p>9 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Yes, I see it.</p> <p>10 MR PETER DUNCAN: Does it say in the second paragraph: 11 "This department has circulated your proposal to all 12 relevant government departments for comments and sought 13 Tsuen Wan District Office's assistance to conduct local 14 consultation on the subject matter. I would like to 15 advise that strong objection from local resident's 16 representative to the placement of the proposed chemical 17 toilet at Allway Gardens bus terminus were received due 18 to hygiene concern and proximity of toilet facilities 19 nearby. The details of the reasons for objection are 20 listed in annex A for your reference, please.</p> <p>21 As such, we regret to inform you that the 22 application in relation to the placement of the chemical 23 toilet is not supported. You are advised to reconsider 24 the need and location of chemical toilet placement and 25 resubmit application, if necessary."</p>
<p>1 termini built in the past, there are permanent resting 2 facilities, including kiosks and toilets, but 3 surprisingly, for some new termini, there are no such 4 facilities.</p> <p>5 For new termini, apart from a lack of resting 6 facilities, there are design deficiencies as well. For 7 the West Kowloon Station and Hung Luen Road termini, 8 after they were commissioned, the Transport Department 9 invited the bus operators to conduct trials, but we 10 found that the designs do not suit certain models of 11 buses, and eventually wholesale modifications must be 12 made at the termini before our buses can use these 13 termini.</p> <p>14 For older termini, they weren't designed with 15 12-metre-long buses in mind. This is something we 16 understand. But for new termini, we are rather 17 surprised.</p> <p>18 MR PETER DUNCAN: Could I ask you, please, to turn up file 19 FE-1B, and go to page 199-7. Do you see there a letter 20 dated 21 January 2016, addressed to the Commissioner for 21 Transport from the company, under the heading, 22 "Application for placement of chemical toilet on/over 23 government land at Allway Gardens bus terminus, 24 Tsuen Wan, New Territories." 25 Do you see a copy of that letter?</p>	<p>1 Then, at page 199-13, there is another letter from 2 the company to the Commissioner for Transport, on this 3 occasion saying, in the second paragraph: 4 "Please note that the chemical toilet has been 5 upgraded with better design and ventilation." 6 Et cetera, et cetera; do you see that?</p> <p>7 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Yes.</p> <p>8 MR PETER DUNCAN: We understand that Allway Gardens has been 9 a bus station, bus terminus, for more than 20 years.</p> <p>10 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) That's correct.</p> <p>11 MR PETER DUNCAN: Then a further letter, which is dated 12 29 September 2017, at page 199-18, a resubmission of the 13 application.</p> <p>14 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Yes.</p> <p>15 MR PETER DUNCAN: Then finally, at 199-26, a letter from the 16 Transport Department of 29 September 2017, so almost two 17 years after the original application: 18 "With reference to your application for placement of 19 one chemical toilet ... I am pleased to inform you that 20 permission is hereby given ...", with attached 21 32 conditions pertaining to the installation of one 22 chemical toilet. 23 Is that the situation?</p> <p>24 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) That's correct.</p> <p>25 MR PETER DUNCAN: If I may make an observation. This seemed</p>
Page 66	Page 68

Page 69	Page 71
<p>1 to have taken a long time to achieve?</p> <p>2 MR ROGER LEE: Yes.</p> <p>3 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) That's correct.</p> <p>4 MR PETER DUNCAN: Is this a unique case or does this reflect</p> <p>5 the sort of situation that often occurs with regard to</p> <p>6 applications for chemical toilet installations?</p> <p>7 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) You can see that the date</p> <p>8 is September 2016. That's after the Lok Wah incident.</p> <p>9 During that period, within a short period of time, we</p> <p>10 secured approval for 26 chemical toilets to be placed.</p> <p>11 It was a very long process. As I have said, for another</p> <p>12 100 termini, we have to rely on nearby facilities such</p> <p>13 as parks and shopping malls. Much remains to be done.</p> <p>14 But we are talking about an application time of</p> <p>15 something couched in years.</p> <p>16 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) For this Allway Gardens</p> <p>17 example, I was also involved. Why did we put in the</p> <p>18 application in the first place? Well, as you observed,</p> <p>19 the termini has been around for many years. All the</p> <p>20 time, we had been relying on shopping malls. They allow</p> <p>21 bus captains to use it, and suddenly they said no, and</p> <p>22 our bus captains had to walk a long distance to use</p> <p>23 a toilet.</p> <p>24 Therefore, for the first time, we submitted</p> <p>25 an application on 21 January 2016, and there was</p>	<p>1 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) They went to toilets in the</p> <p>2 shopping malls.</p> <p>3 MR PETER DUNCAN: Would that not be recorded as "public</p> <p>4 toilet"?</p> <p>5 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Some are government public</p> <p>6 toilets that can be reached within ten minutes.</p> <p>7 MR PETER DUNCAN: When you've got a number of references</p> <p>8 here to public toilets, and there's a great number --</p> <p>9 about 100, I think you said -- some of those include</p> <p>10 shopping malls?</p> <p>11 MR ROGER LEE: Yes.</p> <p>12 MR PETER DUNCAN: So why are these blank, these seven? That</p> <p>13 implies they are not even available in shopping malls.</p> <p>14 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) It could be that they</p> <p>15 relied on toilets in shopping malls, but the shopping</p> <p>16 malls will close during certain hours and the toilets</p> <p>17 would be locked up during those hours. I would have to</p> <p>18 check and then I will come back later with an answer.</p> <p>19 MR PETER DUNCAN: So let's move from toilets to rest</p> <p>20 facilities. In this context, can I start by referring</p> <p>21 you to the evidence of one of the union representatives</p> <p>22 that the committee heard from, on Day 9, please, at</p> <p>23 page 50.</p> <p>24 This is the evidence of a Mr Chan Kwong Nung from</p> <p>25 Long Win Bus. He was one of the representatives from</p>
Page 70	Page 72
<p>1 correspondence, residents objected, the district</p> <p>2 councillor said no and the Transport Department said,</p> <p>3 "Sorry, the application is not accepted." Then, in</p> <p>4 September 2017, I went on a visit to the terminus. The</p> <p>5 I talked to the bus captains; the bus captains had</p> <p>6 strong views. Then I told my manager that we had to</p> <p>7 resubmit an application. And as Mr Lee has said, in the</p> <p>8 middle of 2017, at Lok Wah Estate, we wanted to place</p> <p>9 a kiosk there and it took years to get it approved.</p> <p>10 Then the pace quickened. As Mr Lee has said, we are</p> <p>11 talking about years in getting things done. Toilets</p> <p>12 have been a source of nuisance or trouble for bus</p> <p>13 captains for many years.</p> <p>14 MR PETER DUNCAN: If we could go back, please, to KMB-1 and</p> <p>15 the information that you provided to the commission with</p> <p>16 regard to staff facilities and toilets.</p> <p>17 It would seem, from analysis of these references,</p> <p>18 that there are some seven termini which do not appear to</p> <p>19 have any toilet facilities at all. If I look at</p> <p>20 page 208, the third and fourth on that page, Handsome</p> <p>21 Court and Sun Tuen Mun Centre, and then at page 209, the</p> <p>22 Central (Macau Ferry), the Cheung Sha Wan -- maybe</p> <p>23 that's just one, Cheung Sha Wan; Cho Yiu; and then,</p> <p>24 second from the bottom, the Kwai Tsing Central terminus.</p> <p>25 So how do your drivers get on at these termini?</p>	<p>1 the Motor Transport Workers General Union. He gave</p> <p>2 evidence on Day 9. I want to pick it up, if I could, at</p> <p>3 line 20 on page 50:</p> <p>4 "Mr Chan Kwong Nung: I'm from Long Win Bus, let me</p> <p>5 supplement."</p> <p>6 So he is supplementing a statement previously made.</p> <p>7 "For E33P" -- which as I understand it is one of the</p> <p>8 routes -- "in 2016, the route runs around the clock,</p> <p>9 there are about 60 trips. The terminus is at Siu Hong</p> <p>10 Station South. There are no rest facilities nor</p> <p>11 toilets.</p> <p>12 Originally, this route was already in operation, in</p> <p>13 2016 it became a full day route. Colleagues had to eat</p> <p>14 at the bus terminus, and to rest, at special space,</p> <p>15 location, we had to rest, but there was no rest kiosk.</p> <p>16 After repeated efforts, to have one, the result was</p> <p>17 the local community and the Transport Department had not</p> <p>18 approved it. So it has been close to two years we have</p> <p>19 been asking for a kiosk, but still, to no avail.</p> <p>20 We have not any notification as to when that can be</p> <p>21 done.</p> <p>22 Ms Maggie Wong: And about this E33P, was this</p> <p>23 request made in writing, about the rest kiosk?</p> <p>24 Mr Chan Kwong Nung: Yes.</p> <p>25 Ms Maggie Wong: When was that?</p>

Page 73	Page 75
<p>1 Mr Chan Kwong Nung: The trade union at our meeting 2 with the company raised that in 2015. The company has 3 been telling us that it is making applications with the 4 relevant authorities, and then in 2016 the district 5 council approved that the route should be a whole-day 6 route to serve the residents of Tuen Mun, and we were 7 saying that without a rest kiosk how can we improve the 8 quality of service? Our views were relayed to the 9 district council and the Transport Department. Even 10 today, we have not heard anything from the parties." 11 Just before I ask questions about that, could I also 12 take you back to MISC-2. This is the report of the 13 chairman's visit. This time, at page 899. 14 From page 899, could you go, please, through to 15 page 902, where the observation of the visits is as 16 follows: 17 "There was no rest facility at the bus terminus. 18 It was noted that a bus captain driving bus route 19 E33P could only take a nap inside the bus compartment 20 between two bus trips as there was no rest kiosk at this 21 open-air terminus. According to another bus captain 22 driving the same route, there was a locker stand at the 23 terminus, in which bottles of water were occasionally 24 placed. An Octopus card was available for access to the 25 toilets inside the Siu Hong Station, but it took at</p>	<p>1 government departments. 2 MR ROGER LEE: That's right. 3 MR PETER DUNCAN: Is it your experience that that is 4 effective in any way? 5 MR ROGER LEE: Personally, I think some departments -- we 6 may not need to contact some of these departments. 7 These facilities are temporary structures, and they ask 8 those departments which have to do with permanent 9 structures. So they ask all those departments dealing 10 with permanent structures. 11 Then the other point is about power supply. We need 12 to get the approval before the power company would 13 entertain an application for power supply. We have 14 failed to make any headway about these procedures. 15 I have asked CLP to expedite the process. You can well 16 imagine that certain things can certainly be done much 17 quicker. 18 MR PETER DUNCAN: So how long ago was it that you first made 19 an application for a kiosk and a toilet at this 20 particular venue? 21 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) I need to check, but it is 22 not a short while ago, not like in terms of months. It 23 may well be over a year. Even for power supply 24 application, it would at least take a few months. 25 MR PETER DUNCAN: So it hasn't been granted as yet?</p>
Page 74	Page 76
<p>1 least seven to eight minutes to go to the toilets in the 2 station and return." 3 Then at annex D we have some photos. That's 4 page 911. So we have photos of the terminus but no rest 5 facility; a locker stand; and then the toilets inside 6 the Siu Hong Station. 7 So you, I think, anticipate my question, which is: 8 how could a terminus be approved and be installed 9 without, apparently, any provision for either a toilet 10 or a rest facility? 11 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) I think, as the chairman 12 has said, this is a core problem. I don't have 13 an answer for you. The latest situation is that the 14 Transport Department has approved some facilities for 15 this terminus. Of course, there is still work to do, in 16 that we need to apply for power supply. This is the 17 procedure: we need to get the approval from the 18 government first, before we can apply for power supply, 19 and that takes time. 20 So the next step for us is to do our best to get 21 power connected to the rest facilities there. 22 MR PETER DUNCAN: Without going back to the Transport 23 Department's submission, I think you will understand the 24 tenor of what they say is that they will facilitate 25 these sorts of applications and liaise with other</p>	<p>1 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Not the power supply. 2 MR PETER DUNCAN: When do you expect all of the approvals 3 will have been obtained? 4 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Maybe after this meeting, 5 things will gather pace, but it is not very complicated. 6 We are talking about four to six months and nothing less 7 than that. 8 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) For the termini, we need 9 a lot of time to apply for the rest facilities, and 10 application for power supply equally takes a long time. 11 So our colleagues would ask why they could not use the 12 kiosks, but it's because we need to get the green light 13 from other departments, including the DSD, Drainage 14 Services Department, and some other formalities have to 15 be complied with first. 16 CHAIRMAN: Gentlemen, we have reached 1 o'clock. We will 17 take our lunch break now. We will resume this afternoon 18 at 2.30. Thank you. 19 (1.00 pm) 20 (The luncheon adjournment) 21 (2.30 pm) 22 CHAIRMAN: Good afternoon, gentlemen. 23 Yes, Mr Duncan. 24 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you, Mr Chairman. 25 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Sorry, Mr Duncan, prior</p>

Page 77	Page 79
<p>1 to the lunch break, we talked about the facilities at 2 the termini. Do you mind if I try to give you a reply 3 first? 4 Can we go to KMB Long Win Bus bundle 1(A), page 208. 5 CHAIRMAN: Yes. 6 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) First of all, in 7 relation to the third as well as the fourth one, 8 Handsome Court as well as Sun Tuen Mun Centre, we were 9 talking about special buses. There was only service in 10 the morning, and therefore we don't have toilets, and 11 bus captains do not take a rest there. 12 In addition, if you may go to page 209, Central 13 (Macau Ferry) -- sorry, but there is an omission here. 14 In fact, there is a public toilet. 15 (Chinese words not interpreted) -- 16 CHAIRMAN: Just a moment, please. So that's a mistake or 17 an omission? 18 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Correct. Sorry for the 19 mistake. 20 CHAIRMAN: That's the Shun Tak Centre, is it? 21 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Correct. You are right, 22 Mr Chairman. 23 CHAIRMAN: Yes? 24 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Further down, Cheung Sha 25 Wan, Kom Tsun Street South, we haven't got a chemical</p>	<p>1 please, to go to the second page of the report, that's 2 page 900. 3 I notice the reference in line 3 under paragraph 4 (B), the Sha Tin Railway Station bus terminus", that 5 this contained the new style rest kiosk with 6 an air-conditioner, an exhaust fan, five chairs, and 7 then the reference at the bottom of the page to the fact 8 that "on an average day, there can be more than 9 10 drivers resting at the terminus at the same time." 10 If I read the report correctly, this seems to be 11 a situation which is not peculiar to the Sha Tin Railway 12 Station bus terminus. So if you look at page 901, which 13 refers to the Luen Wo Hui bus terminus, we have in the 14 second bullet in the first paragraph reference to 15 a small restroom with three chairs; and then, in the 16 second paragraph on that page, the fourth bullet: 17 "on the day of the visit, there were around 6 or 7 18 drivers resting at the terminus during peak hours". 19 I think if we go then to page 903 for the Shan King 20 terminus, we have five chairs, although there is no 21 reference on this occasion to the number of drivers who 22 might be in that kiosk at any one time. 23 I think there are two points here. We heard that at 24 the depot, there's actually a dark room with facilities 25 which enable the bus captain to have a sleep in</p>
<p>1 toilet there, because we are looking at the chemical 2 toilet at Kom Tsun Street North, so the two termini 3 share one chemical toilet. 4 Then further down, second-last one, Kwai Shing 5 Central -- I'm sorry, again, there was a slip, and in 6 fact there is a KMB permanent toilet. 7 Then page 210, the last one, Yau Yat Chuen, for 8 Yau Yat Chuen we haven't actually got a bus terminus, 9 because route 203C goes to Tai Hang Tung. So there 10 isn't a toilet; there isn't a rest facility for bus 11 captains, as they don't rest there. 12 In addition, earlier on, some trade union 13 representatives talked about Long Win Bus E33P, in 14 particular Siu Hong South. Mr Duncan, you asked us when 15 we started to apply for the facility. For Siu Hong 16 South, it was August 2017 that we submitted our 17 application to the TD to ask for a rest kiosk as well as 18 chemical toilet. In July 2018, approval was given. 19 Currently, we are now applying for power supply. 20 Thank you, Mr Duncan. 21 Thank you, Mr Chairman. 22 MR PETER DUNCAN: Yes. Thank you, Mr Pang. 23 Can I ask you now to be at MISC-2, at page 899, 24 which, as we saw them this morning, is the report on the 25 visit to the bus termini, the depot, and ask you,</p>	<p>1 a horizontal position. That doesn't seem to be the case 2 for the kiosks at the termini. Do you believe that to 3 be a satisfactory situation? 4 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) This may happen. What 5 I want to emphasise is that for the so-called kiosks, 6 there are two sizes, one smaller, the other larger. If 7 we would like to place a couch which is horizontal, it 8 takes up certain space. In fact, we have been doing our 9 best, and depending on the usage, for certain termini, 10 bus captains may not use the facilities at that 11 particular terminus during the three-hour break, but 12 whenever possible and if permitted we will try to place 13 a larger kiosk. 14 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) If I may also add to the 15 answer. Within a depot, yes, indeed, there is something 16 for you to lie down. For a purposely built terminus, we 17 aren't actually talking about a chair, but then it is 18 a lower chair that allows the employees to take a rest 19 more comfortably. They may not be able to lie down on 20 something like a bed, but still it is quite 21 a comfortable facility. 22 As to the point you are making, the kiosk is of such 23 a size that it is only 40 square feet, we can only 24 accommodate five or six chairs, and we believe that 25 there is a need. Very soon, at larger termini, we are</p>

Page 81	Page 83
<p>1 going to have two types of chairs, one for you to sit 2 upright, the other for you to be more comfortable. We 3 are already working on this at many locations. 4 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Mr Duncan, this morning 5 during the hearing, I tried to provide some figures for 6 the committee. For us, the KMB, for bus captains doing 7 special shifts, what I want to say is that about 8 9 per cent of bus captains doing special shifts, that is 9 134 of them, they will take their rest at the four 10 depots. As Mr Lee has said, we do have horizontal beds. 11 So 134 of them would have their rest breaks at the 12 depots. For others taking their rest at the bus 13 termini, 17 per cent of them, in other words 262 of 14 them. Then for those who go home for the three-hour 15 rest break, in fact they account for 74 per cent of the 16 special shift bus captains, 1,117 of them. 74 per cent 17 of them can go home to take their rest. 18 So, relatively speaking, for us in KMB, we are in 19 a better position, because we have got differently 20 distributed depots, and bus captains can go home within 21 a short period of time so as to take their break. 22 Thank you, Mr Duncan. 23 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) If I may also add to the 24 answer. Of course, we have given you the figures. For 25 the rest facilities at the termini, we will continue to</p>	<p>1 necessarily the TD but in fact there is. 2 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) This is a size stipulated 3 by the government. So we have an open attitude towards 4 the size. It can certainly be bigger. 5 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Well, on many occasions, 6 we try to convert to another type of kiosk from type A. 7 CHAIRMAN: Which department of government stipulates 8 a maximum size of kiosk? 9 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) The Transport 10 Department. 11 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) The Transport Department. 12 CHAIRMAN: For how long has it stipulated these two sizes? 13 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Five years. 14 CHAIRMAN: Really? No longer than that? 15 MR ROGER LEE: I'd probably say at least five years. 16 CHAIRMAN: And have you asked to have bigger kiosks, perhaps 17 saying, "Look, we need somewhere for drivers to lie down 18 to sleep?" Have you asked the Transport Department? 19 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Usually we will ask for two 20 40 square foot kiosks. Usually, that's what we try to 21 do. Usually we only get one, we are only given 22 permission to do one. If we ask for a size which is 23 larger than 40, I'm afraid we have never tried. 24 CHAIRMAN: So you don't know what the answer might be? 25 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Correct.</p>
Page 82	Page 84
<p>1 work on them: better chairs, more comfortable chairs. 2 So they are not just for special shift bus captains. 3 Even for those doing straight duties, we will still try 4 to improve the facilities for them. 5 MR PETER DUNCAN: At the larger kiosks, is there room for 6 horizontal sleeping facilities? 7 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) I don't think they can 8 actually lie down in a horizontal position, but then we 9 have something like an armchair for them to recline. 10 Of course, I'm not talking about a bed that is 11 horizontal, but then it is like an armchair that they 12 can sit more comfortably. Soon we are going to provide 13 more and more chairs like this. 14 So we do have them, and we are working on them, and 15 as long as their size allows, we can provide more such 16 chairs. 17 CHAIRMAN: Has anyone stipulated the maximum size of 18 a kiosk? 19 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Every time when we apply 20 to the TD to install the kiosk, there is a size 21 restriction. I think we are already talking about the 22 best size within the current framework. 23 CHAIRMAN: Is that an indirect answer that the Transport 24 Department impose a limit on the size? 25 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Yes, indeed. Not</p>	<p>1 CHAIRMAN: But you infer from the fact that they refuse you 2 to have two 40-foot ones, that they would refuse 3 a 100 square foot kiosk; is that it? 4 MR ROGER LEE: (Nodded head). 5 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr Duncan. 6 MR PETER DUNCAN: The armchairs you refer to, are they 7 visible in any of the photos that are attached to the 8 report? 9 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) No, not shown in the 10 photographs, but then for many bus termini we do have 11 these kind of chairs. 12 MR PETER DUNCAN: The second point which arises from those 13 descriptions that I read is the fact that you may have, 14 say, three to five chairs, but at any one time there may 15 be seven to eight people having a rest. Is that 16 a satisfactory state of affairs? 17 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Of course, there is always 18 room for improvement. Personally speaking, I don't 19 think this is quite satisfactory. So, as I have said, 20 we have never stopped liaising with the government and 21 applying to the government. So, for the rest kiosk, it 22 isn't a problem that has been resolved; we are not 23 satisfied with the situation. 24 MR PETER DUNCAN: So, going back to, if I could, TD-1, where 25 we started this conversation this morning, at page 438,</p>

Page 85	Page 87
<p>1 where we saw the two questions of the department and 2 their responses. If I could bring your attention to 3 page 438, the second sentence of the first bullet: 4 "When relevant departments/authorities consider and 5 vet the applications for setting up these staff 6 facilities, the TD has been providing appropriate 7 coordination so as to facilitate early installation of 8 such facilities." 9 Is that in fact your experience of the situation? 10 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Yes, they do play the role 11 as a coordinator. For applications like this, there are 12 two major departments involved. Generally speaking, the 13 Transport Department will deal with cases other than the 14 Housing Department or the Housing Authority. For those 15 cases falling within the Housing Authority, the Housing 16 Authority will be the coordinator. So we are mainly 17 talking about two different authorities dealing with the 18 applications. 19 MR PETER DUNCAN: Does the Transport Department's 20 coordination result in the facilitation of early 21 installation of the facilities, in your experience? 22 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) As an operator, I would say 23 that they could have done more quickly. 24 MR PETER DUNCAN: The second bullet, third sentence: 25 "Requirements and comments from the FB operators on</p>	<p>1 informed. 2 MR PETER DUNCAN: So, when the Transport Department designs 3 a terminus on government land, do they incorporate in 4 the design the provision for a toilet and a rest 5 facility? 6 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) If they call it a bus 7 terminus, then terminus facilities should be 8 incorporated. But from what I see now, these facilities 9 are absent in some termini, so I cannot say or comment 10 on their standards. 11 MR PETER DUNCAN: Going down to page 439, the first bullet 12 on that page: 13 "The TD has been proactively liaising with the 14 relevant departments/authorities as appropriate to 15 resolve any difficulties encountered by the franchised 16 bus operators in applying for the facilities ..." 17 Is your experience that the Transport Department has 18 effectively resolved difficulties encountered by your 19 company? 20 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Mr Duncan, I would only say 21 that it can be done better. This bullet point is 22 actually very broad. There is no way for me to gauge 23 what is meant by "proactively". 24 Or let me put it this way. The TD does not object 25 in principle the installation of rest kiosks and</p>
Page 86	Page 88
<p>1 toilets and rest facilities would be incorporated in the 2 design of the bus termini as appropriate." 3 Is that the situation, in reality? 4 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Actually, it is very 5 difficult for me to give you either "yes" or "no". Some 6 would be known to us, but others, the information is not 7 known to us. So sorry, Mr Duncan, I cannot give you 8 a clear "yes" or "no". 9 MR PETER DUNCAN: Who's responsible for the design of a bus 10 terminus? 11 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) There are several types of 12 termini. Some termini are on government land or 13 government property. When they were built, the 14 government might not have decided which bus operators 15 would operate the routes there, and they seldom invited 16 the operators for comment. The TD would have their own 17 team of consultants to design the termini. So, over the 18 years, we were never consulted on where the toilets 19 should be installed. 20 MR PETER DUNCAN: So it is the Transport Department which 21 designs each bus terminus? 22 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) If it is on their land. 23 For termini on public transport interchanges, that might 24 have to do with the railway company, and we are unaware 25 of the property ownership situation, but we were never</p>	<p>1 chemical toilets at the termini, but whenever there is 2 district consultation, and it is also about whether 3 these facilities -- or whether there is space for these 4 facilities at the actual site. I feel that we have no 5 major differences with the TD and I see that they have 6 certain difficulties. 7 MR PETER DUNCAN: Page 440, the last sentence on that page: 8 "The Transport Department would assist the 9 franchised bus operators in canvassing support from the 10 locals by conducting site visits/meetings with them to 11 explore feasible solutions for erection of the rest 12 facilities in order to expedite the implementation plans 13 as and when necessary for the benefits of bus captains 14 and passengers." 15 Has the company experienced that sort of assistance? 16 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) When we file 17 an application, I know that the TD would communicate 18 with the district council as relevant for the example of 19 Allway Gardens in Tsuen Wan, the TD said that there was 20 opposition from the residents and they asked us to apply 21 on another site. So this is a common problem we run 22 into. 23 MR PETER DUNCAN: I now want to conclude by asking you 24 a series of clarification matters, or matters that have 25 already been the subject of the assistance you have</p>

Page 89	Page 91
<p>1 given the committee.</p> <p>2 First of all, with regard to the drivers actually</p> <p>3 coming to work to start their shifts -- now, do</p> <p>4 I understand correctly that, currently, drivers are not</p> <p>5 provided with any special transport to enable them to</p> <p>6 get to the start of their work? They have to use their</p> <p>7 own resources, their own devices, to get to work?</p> <p>8 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) We do provide crew bus</p> <p>9 service. The service is provided for morning shifts and</p> <p>10 the scope is pretty wide. We do not have any depot on</p> <p>11 Hong Kong Island, but we would provide crew bus service</p> <p>12 on Hong Kong Island every morning to take captains to</p> <p>13 work at their respective depots.</p> <p>14 MR PETER DUNCAN: Right. Can you provide just a little more</p> <p>15 detail about that so the committee knows the extent of</p> <p>16 that crew bus service?</p> <p>17 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) No problem. We do have</p> <p>18 routes for our crew bus, and the timetables, et cetera,</p> <p>19 we can provide them.</p> <p>20 For those on morning shifts, commuting is an issue,</p> <p>21 whereas for those on night shifts, the captains can</p> <p>22 often use the bus, and they can reach the depots they</p> <p>23 need.</p> <p>24 MR PETER DUNCAN: Can I ask you to go to KMB-12 at</p> <p>25 page 5010.</p>	<p>1 Day 14 at page 112 -- we were informed that drivers</p> <p>2 might be required to drive up to three routes in a day.</p> <p>3 Do you recall that evidence?</p> <p>4 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Yes, I remember.</p> <p>5 MR PETER DUNCAN: What would be the financial implications</p> <p>6 if that was reduced to two routes a day, or would there</p> <p>7 be financial implications?</p> <p>8 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Financially, I do not</p> <p>9 see any substantial difference, but in terms of</p> <p>10 operation, there might be some impacts. For the</p> <p>11 so-called interlining or the cap of number of routes at</p> <p>12 three per day, we are not the only company with such</p> <p>13 practice.</p> <p>14 As far as I know, all franchised bus operators in</p> <p>15 Hong Kong adopt this approach of interlining. In the</p> <p>16 last hearing, as Mr Lee said, we asked a British</p> <p>17 consultant to look at the maintenance and operation of</p> <p>18 our bus routes, and from my experience with those</p> <p>19 consultants, in other countries, sometimes more than</p> <p>20 three routes are included in the interlining.</p> <p>21 So, to answer your question, Mr Duncan, financially</p> <p>22 there is no substantial difference, but in terms of</p> <p>23 operation, you must understand that the passenger volume</p> <p>24 might be different every day and some bus captains might</p> <p>25 be on sick leave. If we allow them to drive no more</p>
Page 90	Page 92
<p>1 This is one of the documents that you supplied after</p> <p>2 the last hearing, and which provide statistics to which</p> <p>3 you referred in different context just a few moments</p> <p>4 ago.</p> <p>5 It shows the statistics regarding what proportion of</p> <p>6 the drivers will take their midday rest respectively at</p> <p>7 the depot or at the terminus or at home. I think the</p> <p>8 earlier point that you were making was the high</p> <p>9 proportion -- I think you mentioned about 70 per cent --</p> <p>10 who actually took their break by returning home.</p> <p>11 MR PATRICK PANG: Mmm.</p> <p>12 MR PETER DUNCAN: Is there any provision for transport</p> <p>13 assistance with regard to taking the drivers home or</p> <p>14 back from home to resume their duties?</p> <p>15 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) We have an inherent</p> <p>16 advantage, in which we have a high number of termini, so</p> <p>17 every bus captain who has completed training at our</p> <p>18 company would be deployed somewhere near where they</p> <p>19 live.</p> <p>20 So you can see that 74 per cent of the bus captains</p> <p>21 on special shifts are within walking distance of home,</p> <p>22 and very often they would just live next to the termini,</p> <p>23 so it is easy for them to go home.</p> <p>24 MR PETER DUNCAN: Now, during the hearing, on the last</p> <p>25 occasion -- if I could just give the members reference:</p>	<p>1 than three routes, there would be more operational</p> <p>2 flexibility and for each bus route, there would be bus</p> <p>3 route training, or else we would not deploy the</p> <p>4 captains.</p> <p>5 MR PETER DUNCAN: Are there any complaints from unions or</p> <p>6 drivers that driving three routes is too many?</p> <p>7 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) I did not hear major</p> <p>8 complaints, but for certain drivers there might be some</p> <p>9 complaints, if they have to drive two routes a day.</p> <p>10 I think there is a need not to drive more than three</p> <p>11 routes a day and this is a common practice.</p> <p>12 MR PETER DUNCAN: We have heard evidence with regard to what</p> <p>13 happens when a driver is required to drive on a new</p> <p>14 route. When he is required to try out a new route, does</p> <p>15 he have the assistance on board of another captain?</p> <p>16 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Captains must have</p> <p>17 received route training for all routes. If they are to</p> <p>18 drive a new route, they must receive route training at</p> <p>19 our training school.</p> <p>20 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) I think we are looking at</p> <p>21 two issues here. For bus captains trained at our Bus</p> <p>22 Captain Training School, at the beginning, the driver</p> <p>23 would be accompanied by another person on board; whereas</p> <p>24 for an experienced captain picking up a new route, the</p> <p>25 captain would receive training from the training school.</p>

Page 93	Page 95
<p>1 MR PETER DUNCAN: When he drives that new route for the 2 first time, does he have the assistance of another 3 driver on board?</p> <p>4 MR PATRICK PANG: Yes, buddy driver.</p> <p>5 MR PETER DUNCAN: Buddy driver, yes?</p> <p>6 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) It depends on the number of 7 years of experience for the bus captain. For 8 an experienced captain picking up a new line, that route 9 would not be completely new for him, so he can handle it 10 alone. For a new captain who has freshly graduated, we 11 would assign a buddy driver who is experienced, who 12 would give confidence to the new driver and provide the 13 information necessary.</p> <p>14 MR PETER DUNCAN: Dr Leung mentioned the proposal to 15 introduce a 20-point increment instead of the current 16 I think eight-point increment. Are you able to indicate 17 to the committee when it is likely that this will be 18 introduced?</p> <p>19 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) It was in effect from 20 1 September.</p> <p>21 MR PETER DUNCAN: It has already been introduced?</p> <p>22 MR GODWIN SO: Yes.</p> <p>23 DR NORMAN LEUNG: In fact, Mr Duncan, for your information, 24 with effect from 1 September, if a new recruit joins KMB 25 or Long Win as bus captain, he will be earning about</p>	<p>1 when captains are deployed, when they check in at the 2 terminus, we would remind them that they can only work 3 that day if they are healthy, and they are allowed to 4 apply for sick leave otherwise.</p> <p>5 MR PETER DUNCAN: What of the particular situation, though, 6 that during the course of driving a route a particular 7 driver falls ill? Is there any particular policy or 8 protocol or procedure that is required to be undertaken?</p> <p>9 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) If a bus captain feels 10 unwell during the course of driving a route, the captain 11 can pull over and call our inspector. We have 12 inspectors who make inspections, and the bus captain 13 simply has to pull over and our inspector would arrange 14 another bus so that the passengers can be transferred, 15 and then we would take the bus captain to a clinic. 16 This is our practice.</p> <p>17 MR PETER DUNCAN: KMB-12 again, if I may, this time at 18 page 5063. This again is some of the material that you 19 provided the committee with since the last hearing, and 20 it contains a description of the regular training for 21 new bus captains, page 5063, and then the regular 22 training for serving bus captains at page 5064.</p> <p>23 Does the company provide any training with regard to 24 fatigue management? And when I mention "fatigue 25 management", what I mean, if I can try and explain</p>
Page 94	Page 96
<p>1 \$23,000 a month, inclusive of the double pay at the end 2 of the year. That is a substantial increase over the 3 previous remuneration.</p> <p>4 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: You have provided us with this information in 6 a recent submission, have you not?</p> <p>7 DR NORMAN LEUNG: I think we are happy to make -- Godwin, 8 will be happy to submit to this committee a comparison; 9 all right? The remuneration package before 1 September 10 and after 1 September. Compare the daily rate of bus 11 captains and the monthly captains -- provide those 12 figures to this committee, please.</p> <p>13 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) We will provide it as soon 14 as possible.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Thank you.</p> <p>16 MR PETER DUNCAN: Does it sometimes happen that a driver 17 will fall ill during the course of his duties? Does 18 that sometimes happen?</p> <p>19 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Yes, it does happen.</p> <p>20 MR PETER DUNCAN: Does the company have any procedures or 21 protocols as to what should happen in that situation?</p> <p>22 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) First of all, in the 23 recruitment of captains, according to our agreement, if 24 a bus captain falls ill, he or she should apply for sick 25 leave, and we have our own clinic at each depot, and</p>	<p>1 this -- recognising fatigue, knowing what to do about 2 fatigue and knowing how better to take rest. That's 3 what I mean about "fatigue management". Is there 4 anything of that nature covered in the course of driver 5 training?</p> <p>6 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) As Mr So has said, when 7 they join the company, we will remind them that if they 8 are not well, they should see a doctor; they should not 9 drive.</p> <p>10 As for fatigue, we think this is covered by the 11 point on not being well.</p> <p>12 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) On fatigue management, the 13 company has done a few things. First of all, the 14 Transport Department has issued Guidelines on Working 15 Hours. If we comply with the guidelines, then at least 16 we can ensure that there is sufficient rest taken by the 17 bus captains. We also have a chapter in the training 18 manual that as a driver, they should manage their health 19 properly. When they discover that they are not feeling 20 well, they should inform the company and do not work in 21 that particular shift that they have been deployed to 22 work. There are also facilities at the depot -- at the 23 terminus.</p> <p>24 Every six hours, the bus captain has a coffee break, 25 and there is also a water break, a layover break and</p>



Page 97	Page 99
<p>1 toilet break, for them to take a rest, and that's for 2 the purpose of keeping them healthy. 3 MR PETER DUNCAN: So do I understand correctly from those 4 answers that there is nothing specifically aimed at 5 fatigue management; that these are general matters that 6 are covered during the course of the training? 7 MR GODWIN SO: No. 8 MR PETER DUNCAN: Now, we have heard a lot at the last 9 hearing that it was in early June this year that the 10 company first learned from the Transport Department that 11 digital road mapping was available in Hong Kong. Do you 12 remember that evidence at the last hearing? 13 (People nodding) 14 Has the company yet started to make use of the 15 digital road mapping? 16 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) We have talked to the 17 black box manufacturer. We are working on it. We hope 18 we can make good use of the map. We are doing it. 19 MR PETER DUNCAN: When do you expect to commence making use 20 of the digital mapping facility? 21 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) We are doing this under 22 a two-pronged approach. For ZF, there are two systems, 23 one based on digital map; the other is an approach based 24 on manual input of information and data. We are doing 25 both. We hope that in January next year or so, we can</p>	<p>1 black box and the digital map. We can reduce it from 2 ten to four days because of the technology. We have to 3 merge the two sets of data, and it will take four 4 instead of ten days. 5 If we can further integrate the digital map into the 6 black box, we can certainly reduce the time taken from 7 four days to something less. Maybe it can be reduced to 8 one or two days. We don't know yet. But next year, the 9 real time taken -- the time taken will be much 10 shortened. 11 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you, gentlemen. I have, personally, 12 no further questions, but the committee may have some 13 questions for you. 14 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Thank you, Chairman. 15 You spent a lot of time today talking about how to 16 improve the working conditions of all the bus captains. 17 Can you give us some description on the hiring successes 18 of bus captains so far, using say the last month versus 19 three months ago to six months ago? Are you having much 20 success hiring bus captains? 21 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) At present, on a weekly 22 basis, we can recruit 20 to 30 new bus captains. 23 Compared with what it was six months ago, we were only 24 able to recruit 10 to 15 bus captains. But it has to do 25 with the market. But, at the same time, the company has</p>
Page 98	Page 100
<p>1 try to provide some information on the black box. For 2 example, speeding, or a speed limit for that particular 3 road section. We hope to achieve this by January next 4 year. 5 MR PETER DUNCAN: At the hearing on Day 13 -- I will give 6 everybody the reference just for the record: it's 7 page 31 of line 12 -- the committee was informed that, 8 at that time, that's earlier this month, or last month, 9 in August, it took four days for the speeding report to 10 be generated. 11 Then, in answer to a question from Prof Lo, Mr Leung 12 agreed that if the driver tapped in using his ID, and 13 that record was put in the black box, the information 14 would be instantaneous; you wouldn't have to wait for 15 the four days. 16 So what is the current situation? Do we still have 17 to wait for the four days or is it instantaneously 18 available? 19 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Still four days now, 20 but we are working towards that particular direction. 21 MR PETER DUNCAN: When will you reach that direction? 22 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) We hope we can achieve 23 it as soon as possible. 24 MR PETER DUNCAN: What does that mean, a few weeks, a month? 25 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) We were talking about the</p>	<p>1 done certain things. First of all, pay and 2 remuneration. As our chairman has said, there was 3 an enhancement in March, and then in August there was 4 a pay increase. So altogether we are talking about 5 15 per cent increase in one year. With higher pay, we 6 can attract more bus captains. 7 Secondly, we were talking about the conditions, more 8 facilities for rest, and so on, and also in our 9 recruitment we have stepped up our efforts. We have 10 organised more open days and reaching out activities. 11 We would take the initiative to reach the target of 12 prospective bus captains so we can make up the shortage, 13 shortfall. 14 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) As for the target recruits, 15 and also we have to bear in mind different local 16 characteristics in different districts. For example, 17 Tuen Mun is very different from Lai Chi Kok, so we will 18 have to adopt a targeted approach. In Tuen Mun, we may 19 want to target more women. They might not be able to 20 work a full eight-hour day; they may only work half of 21 that. But we know that certain hours, they will be able 22 to work, and they don't want to have an assured working 23 shift designated. 24 So we will also look into child-care service so that 25 these bus captains can take care of their children when</p>

Page 101	Page 103
<p>1 they are off duty. Some of these people are in their 2 early 50s. They may have the driving licence; they may 3 not want to take up a full-time job.</p> <p>4 So we will have to look at the district 5 characteristics and the people in different districts.</p> <p>6 Also, we have gone to different districts, including 7 Lantau Island and Tung Chung, and we need to use some 8 new approaches.</p> <p>9 MEMBER AUYEUNG: A second question I may have is to follow 10 up on the question Mr Duncan asked earlier about the 11 design of the bus terminus.</p> <p>12 I get the impression from your feedback that it's 13 like you have no chance to ask for a toilet or whatever. 14 Is the arrangement all or nothing, either you do it or 15 you don't get the route? Is that how it works in the 16 system?</p> <p>17 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Not that the design of 18 every terminus is without a rest kiosk or any toilet. 19 Some termini would factor in this in the design, but 20 somehow, in some of the termini, these facilities are 21 not taken on board.</p> <p>22 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) I think Mr Auyeung was 23 asking about our role in the design of new termini. 24 Usually, the design of the new terminus is completed 25 before the award of new bus routes. So they would build</p>	<p>1 safety.</p> <p>2 In response to the agenda being sent out, you sent 3 your own shopping list of what you would like to 4 address, and can I invite you to go to that. It's at 5 KMB-12 at page 4939. I think the agenda had been sent 6 out on 13 March, so this was an immediate response, and 7 no doubt what you were doing was taking the opportunity 8 to put down matters that you had had difficulties with, 9 for them to be discussed. This was an opportunity for 10 you.</p> <p>11 Am I correct in that assumption?</p> <p>12 MR GODWIN SO: Yes.</p> <p>13 MR ROGER LEE: Yes.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: What you asked them to address was, first of all, 15 illegal parking and loading and unloading activities at 16 bus stops; traffic congestion is perhaps a broader 17 matter; but more specifically, bus captain assaults and 18 traffic black spots.</p> <p>19 Two of those matters are matters that we have 20 received evidence on from various parties: illegal 21 parking, particularly at bus stops, and assaults on bus 22 captains.</p> <p>23 The response from the Transport Department came in 24 the letter at page 4941, dated 26 March 2018. You will 25 see, in the second paragraph, reference is made to the</p>
Page 102	Page 104
<p>1 the termini first before they make a decision on which 2 operator, bus operator, should be granted the right to 3 run the routes.</p> <p>4 For example, in respect of the Hong 5 Kong-Zhuhai-Macau Bridge, they have been talking about 6 offering bus service for a long time, but they haven't 7 made a decision on who, which company, to run those 8 routes. So they have no way to ask us about our ideas 9 or proposals in the design. So they would complete the 10 hardware first, before finding an operator, because when 11 the design is done we don't know whether we will run 12 those routes.</p> <p>13 MEMBER AUYEUNG: You have no chance to go back and request 14 such facilities as a toilet?</p> <p>15 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) In respect of the Hong 16 Kong-Zhuhai-Macau Bridge, we did try that, but the 17 hardware is already completed so that's a difficult 18 point.</p> <p>19 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Thank you.</p> <p>20 Thank you, chairman.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: You have provided the committee with redacted 22 versions of the notes or the minutes of various minutes 23 that were held in several different parts of the working 24 group that was convened in March 2018 and addressed 25 training and the use of technological devices to enhance</p>	<p>1 limited time span of the working group and the need to 2 focus on submitting a review report on the outcome in 3 three months' time. Then the response to your request: 4 "As for the four subjects that you have raised, we 5 would handle them separately outside the working group." 6 The question I have for you is this. This is now 7 five months later. Have these matters, illegal parking 8 at bus stops and assaults on bus captains, been handled 9 at all?</p> <p>10 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Perhaps I can answer this. 11 At that time, the working group under the Transport 12 Department focused on safety belts on buses and the 13 training of bus drivers. After the two priority agenda 14 items were completed, we wrote to the Transport 15 Department, as you can see in page 4945, and we 16 reiterated the four subjects.</p> <p>17 Illegal parking, as we mentioned in earlier hearing, 18 Mr Pang told you that the company took the initiative to 19 liaise with the police in an attempt to do something 20 about this.</p> <p>21 As for traffic congestion, we all understand there 22 is very little we can do.</p> <p>23 The third one, harassment of bus captains, or bus 24 captain assault, we understand that the Transport 25 Department is conducting a campaign involving a number</p>

Page 105	Page 107
<p>1 of operators, railway operators and bus operators. This 2 is a publicity campaign on polite passengers. 3 And the fourth one, traffic black spots, we have 4 a fleet of 3,000 buses. We understand the road 5 conditions well. Some roads are uneven or the levelling 6 is not good, and also the marking may also affect -- may 7 cause traffic accidents. From time to time, we write to 8 the Transport Department. They have regional offices 9 responsible for road safety and design, road design. We 10 will relay the views collected from our bus captains and 11 our frontline people. 12 According to this letter, the department said the 13 matters would be dealt with outside the working group. 14 So we subsequently wrote to the Transport Department, 15 listing out all the 300 cases that we have gathered over 16 the period. 17 CHAIRMAN: Has anything at all been achieved about illegal 18 parking at bus stops in the five months since March? 19 Perhaps you can answer "yes" or "no", and then go on to 20 explain. 21 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) The simple answer is no. 22 There has been no substantial improvement. 23 CHAIRMAN: Has anything been achieved about the issue of 24 assaults on bus captains? 25 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) After the last hearing,</p>	<p>1 examining the system, regulatory system, the operation 2 of buses, as required by the Chief Executive in the 3 terms of reference. These are parallel, if you like, 4 enquiries into the same issue. 5 Can I ask you to go to page 4926. I'm just taking 6 this as an example. We are not dealing with a censor in 7 wartime, blacking out material that the enemy might get 8 hold of, are we? But when we come to the prosaic item 9 of "Installation of seat belts for all passenger seats", 10 page 4927, we've got half a page of black ink, and then 11 on the next page we've got another half-page of black 12 ink. 13 The more general question I would ask you is this: 14 on what basis have these minutes been redacted? What is 15 the logic behind it? 16 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Well, it involves the 17 remarks made by other bus companies, so, in the absence 18 of their consent, we have to redact the relevant parts. 19 CHAIRMAN: So that is the basis? You have just taken out 20 what other people have said? You are happy to tell us 21 what you have said but you have taken out what others 22 said? Is that it? 23 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Yes, you may say so. 24 CHAIRMAN: So what you have taken out is what Citybus have 25 had to say, what the Transport Department have had to</p>
Page 106	Page 108
<p>1 the police communicated with us, and we once again 2 provided detailed information about past bus captain 3 assault cases. So the information has been passed to 4 the police. 5 As I said last time, there was a case at Yau Yat 6 Chuen, four men twice pressed the emergency button on 7 the bus and the police took the initiative to talk to us 8 and also the police have contacted the bus captain 9 concerned. 10 CHAIRMAN: That's the total of the achievement, is it? 11 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) I think in respect of 12 illegal parking or traffic congestion, we cannot expect 13 much to be done within such a short period of time. 14 There's the so-called "polite passenger" campaign 15 organised by the Transport Department to promote mutual 16 trust and politeness, and I think this would help our 17 bus captains in the long run. 18 CHAIRMAN: The other matter I would like your help on, if 19 I can ask for it, is -- and I give you an example -- the 20 way in which the minutes have been redacted, the minutes 21 of the meetings of the working group. 22 Now, the working group has been addressing issues of 23 training, issues of safety-related technological 24 devices. Those are very much matters that this 25 committee is concerned with in discharging its duties in</p>	<p>1 say, is that it? 2 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) We haven't redacted 3 anything spoken by the Transport Department because we 4 have asked them about it. 5 CHAIRMAN: So it's Citybus? 6 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Yes, in my version of the 7 minutes, that's it. 8 CHAIRMAN: So did you ask Citybus if you could put in what 9 it is they said at these meetings? 10 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) I think it is better, more 11 appropriate, for the Transport Department to do this. 12 CHAIRMAN: So the answer to my question is you haven't asked 13 Citybus whether or not you can include what it is that 14 they had to say so that we would get a full version of 15 the minutes? You haven't even asked them? 16 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) After today, I will ask 17 them. If they give us the permission, we will give you 18 the full set. 19 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Sorry about that. The straight answer is 20 that, Mr Chairman, we have not asked Citybus and 21 New World First Bus for their consent to have the full 22 text presented before you. Sorry about that, 23 Mr Chairman. 24 CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Dr Leung, but, Mr So, you will now ask 25 Citybus. If Citybus decline, please tell us, because</p>

Page 109	Page 111
<p>1 then we will ask them ourselves, because we might be 2 able to save quite a lot of ink.</p> <p>3 One final question is this. You have told us about 4 four depots that Kowloon Motor Bus have: Tuen Mun, 5 Sha Tin, Lai Chi Kok and Kowloon Bay. Of those four 6 depots, are any or all of them owned by Kowloon Motor 7 Bus or its subsidiaries?</p> <p>8 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Well, among the four 9 depots, for Sha Tin Depot and Tuen Mun Depot, they are 10 owned by the KMB. We bought it at an auction. For 11 Kowloon Bay Depot, it has been granted to us under 12 private treaty grant. So we paid the premium for using 13 it as a depot. For Lai Chi Kok Depot, it is under the 14 arrangement of a short-term tenancy with the government.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: And, as to the meaning of "short-term", can you 16 give us some indication?</p> <p>17 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) This is true, for the KMB 18 Citybus and New World Bus, the government offers a site 19 under a short-term tenancy arrangement. It depends on 20 the duration. For Lai Chi Kok Depot, we have renewed 21 automatically every year. We have to pay a rent for the 22 use of it.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: So it's an annual renewal?</p> <p>24 MR ROGER LEE: (Nodded head).</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Thank you.</p>	<p>1 can spare some time and help us out as bus captains in 2 the short term.</p> <p>3 MR PETER DUNCAN: Have you seen any fruits from your 4 endeavours?</p> <p>5 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Indeed, there is. 6 Personally speaking, I think in terms of stability and 7 in terms of passenger interaction, I have a high level 8 of hope for the women bus captains. But of course we 9 have to get approval from the government to allow us to 10 set up a nursery within our depot before we can move on 11 to that.</p> <p>12 MR PETER DUNCAN: I think my question was a little more 13 specific. Has there been any increase, as yet, in the 14 number of applications by women?</p> <p>15 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Steady. Not really 16 an increase.</p> <p>17 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>18 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) But many people did ask us 19 about that.</p> <p>20 MR PETER DUNCAN: Yes. Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Mr Lee, I understand that there is a concluding 22 statement that you wish to make at the end of the 23 evidence. Or is Dr Leung going to make it?</p> <p>24 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Yes, Chairman and members of the 25 committee, I just want to say that we are grateful for</p>
Page 110	Page 112
<p>1 Mr Duncan, are there any matters arising from the 2 questions asked by the committee?</p> <p>3 MR PETER DUNCAN: Just one matter. If I may follow up the 4 issue of women drivers, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: Yes, please do.</p> <p>6 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>7 Previously, we were alerted or apprised of some of 8 the issues that surround women drivers, and a few 9 moments ago there was further information given with 10 regard to how to approach that topic.</p> <p>11 Has there been any appreciable increase in the 12 number of women applying for positions in recent times?</p> <p>13 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Well, for female bus 14 captains, it is slightly over 5 per cent as of now. 15 Of course, it depends on the local factors. In 16 Hong Kong, I think we have sort of half male and half 17 female in our population. So I see a huge potential 18 here.</p> <p>19 Just now, to follow up on Mr Auyeung's question, we 20 use Tuen Mun as an example, we hope that at Tuen Mun 21 Depot, we can do something about it, and the chairman 22 has also referred to the case in Sweden. I have also 23 noticed that in many European countries, they are 24 providing nurseries so that female drivers can drive. 25 They may not be working full-time for us, but still they</p>	<p>1 your time to receive representation from us. As I said 2 at the outset of the hearing we came before you with 3 a humble and receiving heart. We welcome any 4 recommendation that will safeguard bus safety for our 5 passengers. It has been a very educating experience to 6 us, and in particular to our management, and so with 7 that I ask our managing director, Mr Roger Lee, to say 8 a few words to wrap up our representation before you.</p> <p>9 Thank you very much, Chairman.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Dr Leung.</p> <p>11 Mr Lee?</p> <p>12 Closing statement by MR ROGER LEE</p> <p>13 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Mr Chairman and members, 14 I would like to thank everybody. We fully understand, 15 over the past period of time, that the public in 16 Hong Kong have high expectations in relation to bus 17 service.</p> <p>18 In our daily operation, there are many, many 19 challenges, in terms of recruitment of bus captains, 20 road congestion, and then there are many social changes, 21 and we have seen bus captains being assaulted. So in 22 fact it is a major challenge. But still we believe we 23 have to discharge our duty properly. We shall continue 24 to enhance our service.</p> <p>25 In particular, in relation to safety, I am sure</p>

<p>Page 113</p> <p>1 nobody from our team would give up our efforts.                  2 For the traffic accident in Tai Po Road in February                  3 this year, it was a huge blow to everybody in the KMB,                  4 both in the senior management as well as at the                  5 frontline. No words can describe how heart-breaking it                  6 was for us. Personally speaking, ever since, I have not                  7 been able to let it off. We won't allow the accident to                  8 happen again and we don't want this to happen again.                  9 This is one too many.                  10 Since the accident, we come to recognise that there                  11 are inadequacies in our work. We haven't stopped in                  12 making improvements.                  13 In the process of giving evidence, we come to                  14 realise that KMB must progress with the times. We have                  15 to do more in this regard to enhance our service. Say,                  16 for example, in terms of the use of technologies, we                  17 need to be comprehensive, and we have to aim at                  18 precision and we have to work more on our safety system,                  19 and we need to catch up with the times.                  20 Now I turn to the bus captains. The management of                  21 bus captains, the training of bus captains, are areas                  22 that we need to improve. And in terms of our                  23 facilities -- and in fact just now we have talked about                  24 the rest facilities as well as the toilets -- well, in                  25 fact we haven't stopped making improvements in such</p>	<p>Page 115</p> <p>1 INDEX                  2 PAGE                  3 EVIDENCE FROM KOWLOON MOTOR BUS CO (1933) LTD .....1                  4 AND LONG WIN BUS CO LTD: DR NORMAN                  5 LEUNG, DR JOHN CHAN, MR ROGER LEE,                  6 MR GODWIN SO, MR LEUNG KIN WANG,                  7 MR PATRICK PANG, MR JAMES WONG                  8 Examination by MR PETER DUNCAN (continued) .....1                  9 Closing statement by MR ROGER LEE .....112                  10                  11                  12                  13                  14                  15                  16                  17                  18                  19                  20                  21                  22                  23                  24                  25</p>
<p>Page 114</p> <p>1 areas. The KMB has been serving the Hong Kong citizens                  2 for 85 years as a bus company. Indeed, it is our duty                  3 to be fully dedicated in serving the public.                  4 Whatever that our passengers or staff need, it is                  5 our duty to meet their requirements, but at the same                  6 time it takes more than the KMB on its own to do the                  7 job. We need the support and coordination of the                  8 government departments, and then we can be effective in                  9 service enhancement.                  10 Finally, our team as a whole are most grateful to                  11 the committee for your past work as well as your work in                  12 the future.                  13 As our chairman has said in the opening remarks                  14 before you, with a humble heart and with the greatest                  15 sincerity, the KMB team will be open to different                  16 recommendations and suggestions.                  17 Thank you.                  18 CHAIRMAN: Dr Leung and Mr Lee and gentlemen, thank you for                  19 attending now for four days to assist us with your                  20 evidence. We are grateful for that, but these                  21 proceedings are now concluded. We have other evidence                  22 to take on Saturday, typhoon willing. Thank you for                  23 your attendance.                  24 (3.43 pm) (The hearing adjourned until 10.00 am                  25 on Saturday, 15 September 2018)</p>	