

Page 1

1 Saturday, 11 August 2018

2 (10.01 am)

3 EVIDENCE FROM KOWLOON MOTOR BUS CO (1933) LTD AND LONG WIN

4 BUS CO LTD: DR NORMAN LEUNG, DR JOHN CHAN, MR ROGER LEE, MR

5 GODWIN SO, MR LEUNG KIN WANG, MR PATRICK PANG, MR JAMES WONG

6 (simultaneous interpretation used only where indicated)

7 CHAIRMAN: Good morning, Dr Leung and gentlemen.

8 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Good morning, Mr Chairman.

9 CHAIRMAN: Mr Duncan.

10 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you, Mr Chairman.

11 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Before that, Mr Chairman, may I have a few

12 minutes, please.

13 CHAIRMAN: Yes.

14 Statement by DR NORMAN LEUNG

15 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Mr Chairman, after the hearing yesterday

16 we submitted to the committee further documents in

17 relation to the action plan for the speed limit on 29

18 bends.

19 If I may briefly refer to the summary of documents

20 submitted before the committee. First of all, I have to

21 say, Mr Chairman, you have asked a very fair and valid

22 question as to why the proposed plan -- the proposal

23 submitted by Mr Gary Wong was not acted upon by the

24 management. I had to agree that I have the same doubt,

25 you know, as to why it was not acted upon.

Page 2

1 If I may just refer to the summary of documents

2 submitted before the committee. On 31 July 2014, the

3 action plan -- it says that the action plan will be

4 submitted to operations director and managing director

5 for endorsement.

6 Then on 14 August 2014, an email was sent by Mr Gary

7 Wong to Mr Edmond Ho, stating that "For your approval,

8 please." Then on 15 August 2014, an email was sent by

9 Edmond Ho to Gary Wong, "Please ask the operations

10 director for formal approval after checking and

11 endorsement."

12 Then came 2 February 2015. There was an email sent

13 by Mr Gary Wong to all the general managers of the

14 depots, saying that "it is now the right time to

15 reconsider the implementation of the speed limits on

16 these identified bends."

17 And on 5 February, another email was sent by Gary

18 Wong to all the general managers of depots, "I will

19 submit them to operations director and operations and

20 planning director for final approval."

21 If I may refer the chairman to exhibit 5 of this

22 bundle.

23 CHAIRMAN: Yes, I have that.

24 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Thank you, Mr Chairman. This is

25 a circular sent by Mr Gary Wong to all the general

Page 3

1 managers and managers of the operations department as

2 well as other departments. It is stated in this memo:

3 "A meeting with [operations director] this morning

4 regarding the above captioned subject. We have a new

5 approach" -- and I repeat, "a new approach" -- "to

6 manage this issue and the actions are summarised as

7 follows:

8 (1) SSQD [namely his department] will prepare

9 a safety poster 'Safety driving through sharp bends' for

10 the month of April. Depots are required to place and

11 display the safety posters at prominent places inside

12 the depot areas and all [bus terminals] and [driving

13 instructors] are required to conduct safety briefings to

14 [bus captains] at all [bus terminals] as normal

15 practice;

16 (2) SSQD will prepare an internal notice which to be

17 issued by Traffic Department to enhance the safety

18 awareness among [bus captains] and to remind all [bus

19 captains] to watch a safety video by means of e-learning

20 (same approach for bus fire handling).

21 (3) SSQD will liaise with [Bus Captain Training

22 School] to post a safety video on staff website to

23 specify the general safety guidelines/precautions when

24 driving through sharp bends. The sharp bend

25 'Po Shun Road onto Tong Ming Street' will be selected as

Page 4

1 an example for the 30 second safety video. All [bus

2 captains] are required to log in or make use of other

3 means to watch the safety video and their names should

4 be captured/recorded.

5 (4) [Bus Captain Training School] to quote

6 Tseung Kwan O toppled over incident as a lesson learnt

7 for all new [bus captain] trainees and all other [bus

8 captains] through appropriate safe driving training."

9 At the end of the paragraph, it is stated:

10 "Please note that there is no need to issue the safe

11 speed limits cards" -- no need to issue the safe speed

12 limits cards -- "and the speed limits will not be

13 specified" -- will not be specified -- "in the safety

14 video and internal notice. It is expected that we will

15 start to take the above ... actions in April 2015.

16 I will keep you informed of the updated progress."

17 Mr Chairman, I just want to point out that all the

18 proposals set out in this memo have all been acted upon.

19 The management has taken action to implement all these

20 proposals.

21 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

22 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Thank you, Mr Chairman.

23 CHAIRMAN: Mr Duncan, have any steps been taken to paginate

24 this material? Because it's likely to be referred to,

25 and it would help if we were to paginate it.

Page 5	Page 7
<p>1 MR PETER DUNCAN: Mr Chairman, we will arrange for that</p> <p>2 These pages just arrived on my desk a few moments ago.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: I appreciate that. If somebody could perhaps</p> <p>4 start doing that, then we can write the numbers in</p> <p>5 ourselves.</p> <p>6 MR PETER DUNCAN: Certainly.</p> <p>7 Dr Leung and gentlemen, good morning. Thank you for</p> <p>8 your homework overnight and thank you for that</p> <p>9 explanation this morning.</p> <p>10 DR NORMAN LEUNG: I have to apologise on behalf of the</p> <p>11 management. So much time was spent on this topic</p> <p>12 yesterday. If our management had done their job better,</p> <p>13 you know, the whole thing could have been explained</p> <p>14 clearer yesterday. Please accept my apology.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: Yes, thank you for that gesture, Dr Leung.</p> <p>16 Examination by MR PETER DUNCAN (continued)</p> <p>17 MR PETER DUNCAN: Dr Leung, I just have a couple of</p> <p>18 questions arising from the material we received</p> <p>19 overnight.</p> <p>20 If you look at exhibit 1, this is the email from</p> <p>21 Gary Wong of February 2, 2015:</p> <p>22 "Following the clearance of protest areas in</p> <p>23 December 2014, it is the right time to reconsider the</p> <p>24 implementation of speed limits for the identified sharp</p> <p>25 bends/roundabouts."</p>	<p>1 because you told us previously that this was something</p> <p>2 that had been decided when Mr Edmond Ho was the managing</p> <p>3 director. That's not the case, is it, from the</p> <p>4 documents you have provided today?</p> <p>5 MR ROGER LEE: Can you just let me to get back to the office</p> <p>6 to find out more information?</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Thank you.</p> <p>8 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Chairman, perhaps if I may make a point of</p> <p>9 clarification, because I raised the same question with</p> <p>10 our management.</p> <p>11 It started with:</p> <p>12 "Following the clearance of protest areas in</p> <p>13 December 2014 ..."</p> <p>14 They were referring to the Occupy --</p> <p>15 MR PETER DUNCAN: Occupy Central, yes.</p> <p>16 If I could raise another matter, please, that we</p> <p>17 addressed yesterday. This is the matter of the</p> <p>18 exception reports that we were provided with yesterday.</p> <p>19 I am referring to two types of reports, one relating</p> <p>20 to speeding and the other relating to harsh braking and</p> <p>21 sudden acceleration which we saw yesterday. Just so</p> <p>22 there is no misunderstanding here, can we look first of</p> <p>23 all at KMB-9 at page 3993.</p> <p>24 You will recall that we spent some time on this</p> <p>25 document in the last couple of days. That's the first</p>
<p>Page 6</p> <p>1 So the word "reconsider" would suggest that this</p> <p>2 matter had already been the subject of consideration.</p> <p>3 We don't have any documentation with regard to what</p> <p>4 happened subsequent to the email of Mr Edmond Ho on</p> <p>5 15 August 2014, which sought formal approval from the</p> <p>6 operations director, Mr Eckford.</p> <p>7 Has the management been able to find any information</p> <p>8 as to what happened after August 2014 and before</p> <p>9 February of 2015 with regard to that request for formal</p> <p>10 approval?</p> <p>11 DR NORMAN LEUNG: We have to look up the file. The</p> <p>12 documents submitted before the committee are all we have</p> <p>13 got, the relevant material we have got, from our file.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: We understand that, but the question is very</p> <p>15 simple: where are the records of what was being</p> <p>16 considered between 14 August 2014 and 2 February 2015?</p> <p>17 Where are they?</p> <p>18 Mr Lee, perhaps you can help.</p> <p>19 MR ROGER LEE: I will try to help but I joined the company</p> <p>20 in January 2015.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Yes.</p> <p>22 MR ROGER LEE: And no doubt I will go back to the office and</p> <p>23 find out a bit more.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: Yes, but you weren't the managing director at the</p> <p>25 time this decision was taken on 13 February 2015,</p>	<p>Page 8</p> <p>1 type of report I'm referring to.</p> <p>2 And the second type of report is that which we can</p> <p>3 find at KMB-1 at page 362.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: What kind of report is that?</p> <p>5 MR PETER DUNCAN: This pertains to speed, and then also</p> <p>6 acceleration, and then also harsh braking.</p> <p>7 You will recall that sort of report?</p> <p>8 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) Yes.</p> <p>9 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>10 With regard to the accident in Tai Po on 10 February</p> <p>11 this year, can I ask this question: was the bus involved</p> <p>12 or the driver of that bus identified after the incident</p> <p>13 in any of these two types of reports generated for</p> <p>14 10 February?</p> <p>15 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) At that time, we did not</p> <p>16 identify the bus through these reports because, at that</p> <p>17 time, we looked at the specific incident and bus</p> <p>18 involved without having to wait for these reports.</p> <p>19 MR PETER DUNCAN: So were the reports ever produced for</p> <p>20 10 February?</p> <p>21 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) At that time, the focus</p> <p>22 was on the bus itself. I did not realise or pay</p> <p>23 attention to the occurrence of this bus in these</p> <p>24 reports.</p> <p>25 MR PETER DUNCAN: So this type of reports had never been</p>

Page 9	Page 11
<p>1 produced for 10 February?</p> <p>2 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) These reports are regular</p> <p>3 reports. In other words, for buses that contravene our</p> <p>4 guidelines, they would show up on these reports. So</p> <p>5 these are regular reports.</p> <p>6 For the Tai Po incident, it was an exceptional</p> <p>7 incident, which was why we looked at that bus</p> <p>8 specifically. I cannot recall whether the bus was</p> <p>9 covered in these reports.</p> <p>10 MR PETER DUNCAN: Could you undertake a check as to whether</p> <p>11 there were such reports issued for 10 February?</p> <p>12 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) Yes. I can check whether</p> <p>13 such reports appeared at that time.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: And having done so, will you provide them to the</p> <p>15 committee?</p> <p>16 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) If I am able to identify</p> <p>17 the records, of course I would provide them to the</p> <p>18 committee.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>20 MR PETER DUNCAN: Had the bus been travelling in excess of</p> <p>21 70 kilometres per hour -- had that bus been</p> <p>22 travelling -- would a report such as the two types we</p> <p>23 have seen automatically have been produced?</p> <p>24 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) First of all, for the</p> <p>25 table we see right now, the speed threshold was</p>	<p>1 already.</p> <p>2 MR PETER DUNCAN: I see. Thank you.</p> <p>3 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) It should be possible,</p> <p>4 but since the records or figures were from half a year</p> <p>5 ago, they were already archived in other systems, so we</p> <p>6 might need to identify the data involved. So we have to</p> <p>7 study the feasibility, but I believe it's possible.</p> <p>8 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>10 MR PETER DUNCAN: We moved, at the end of yesterday, to the</p> <p>11 matter of training. Before I resume with that, I just</p> <p>12 want to ask a few more questions about the issue of</p> <p>13 manpower shortage.</p> <p>14 As a comment, it would seem that given the likely</p> <p>15 effect of the new guidelines, the problem of the</p> <p>16 shortage of bus drivers is going to get worse rather</p> <p>17 than better. Is that a fair comment?</p> <p>18 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Yes, I agree, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>19 MR PETER DUNCAN: Has the company developed any recent</p> <p>20 initiatives with regard to how the situation might be</p> <p>21 improved?</p> <p>22 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) This is a diverse issue.</p> <p>23 First of all, something must be done on recruitment, and</p> <p>24 the company also needs to promote staff morale. In</p> <p>25 terms of the recruitment of bus captains, something must</p>
Page 10	Page 12
<p>1 75 kilometres per hour. If the bus succeeded 75kph, it</p> <p>2 should show up on this table.</p> <p>3 As for another, shorter table, it depends on the</p> <p>4 road speed limit at that time before we ascertain</p> <p>5 whether a bus was speeding. If there was speeding,</p> <p>6 again, it would show up on the report.</p> <p>7 MR PETER DUNCAN: If there was harsh braking or extreme</p> <p>8 acceleration, would that have automatically generated</p> <p>9 the second type of report?</p> <p>10 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) Yes.</p> <p>11 MR PETER DUNCAN: If those reports were not generated at</p> <p>12 that time, would the system today allow for the</p> <p>13 production of those reports?</p> <p>14 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) If there was harsh braking</p> <p>15 or sudden acceleration, there would be such record. If</p> <p>16 there was such occurrence, it would show up on the</p> <p>17 report. So if I am able to identify that report, I will</p> <p>18 share that with the committee.</p> <p>19 MR PETER DUNCAN: My question is a little different. If the</p> <p>20 report does not exist, can you produce a report today</p> <p>21 from what consists in the company's records, in its</p> <p>22 computers?</p> <p>23 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) I don't quite understand</p> <p>24 the question. If there was harsh braking or sudden</p> <p>25 acceleration, it should have shown up on the report</p>	<p>1 be done by way of remuneration. Our chairman mentioned</p> <p>2 some measures this Tuesday, and in terms of recruitment,</p> <p>3 in different districts and different types of roles, we</p> <p>4 hope to do something.</p> <p>5 These days, not many staff are prepared to stay in</p> <p>6 the job for a very long time, unlike in the past, so we</p> <p>7 suggest recruiting different types of people to our</p> <p>8 company. In terms of promoting a sense of belonging for</p> <p>9 staff, we have also done a lot. We would enhance depot</p> <p>10 facilities. We are providing different services and</p> <p>11 facilities such as resting areas and hairdressing</p> <p>12 service. We have also introduced gym rooms and</p> <p>13 ping-pong tables and at bus termini a lot has been done</p> <p>14 to enhance comfort for bus captains. So we have done</p> <p>15 quite a lot.</p> <p>16 In terms of lifestyle, we implemented recreation</p> <p>17 clubs, including football activities. Most bus captains</p> <p>18 are males, so we want to allow them to take part in</p> <p>19 various facilities or activities after work; for</p> <p>20 example, singing events. And at the instruction of the</p> <p>21 chairman, we also set up a scholarship. This way, we</p> <p>22 can do something for the children and kids of our bus</p> <p>23 captains or staff. So hopefully this can help us retain</p> <p>24 staff and attract new blood in the recruitment of bus</p> <p>25 captains. The work is certainly not easy. This is</p>

Page 13	Page 15
<p>1 something we would continue in light of the shortage.</p> <p>2 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Mr Duncan, our managing</p> <p>3 director, Mr Lee, talked about our work in terms of</p> <p>4 staff retention and recruitment. So in terms of</p> <p>5 software and bus operations, I would like to share what</p> <p>6 we have done to address the crew shortage.</p> <p>7 Mr Lee talked about hardware, including rest kiosks,</p> <p>8 et cetera, so I won't repeat what he said. Meanwhile,</p> <p>9 in terms of bus operations, we want to adopt a more</p> <p>10 people-based approach. This way, we can improve a sense</p> <p>11 of belonging for our bus captains and boost retention</p> <p>12 rates. We also took out a number of encouraging</p> <p>13 measures to facilitate the application of sick leave for</p> <p>14 bus captains, and we would also streamline our journey</p> <p>15 times or durations and hopefully we can provide for</p> <p>16 adequate journey time and resting time.</p> <p>17 In terms of application of leave, redeployment,</p> <p>18 application for rest days, et cetera, by bus captains,</p> <p>19 we hope to be adopting a people-based approach or</p> <p>20 people-oriented approach.</p> <p>21 And for applications for bus captains on</p> <p>22 redeployments, leave, et cetera, this is something we</p> <p>23 will deal with. In April, we conducted a questionnaire,</p> <p>24 to allow BCs to choose their preferred work</p> <p>25 arrangements. The need of each BC might be different.</p>	<p>1 a two-hour talk, to talk about road safety.</p> <p>2 So in June that was done and I believe that it was</p> <p>3 well received by our staff members.</p> <p>4 So we would like to enhance the frontline management</p> <p>5 so that we are able to provide assistance to our</p> <p>6 frontline bus captains. For bus captains, they face</p> <p>7 a lot of problems on a daily basis, like the traffic is</p> <p>8 getting more and more congested, the number of vehicles</p> <p>9 on the road is not in proportion to the sort of road</p> <p>10 network. More and more vehicles are illegally parked.</p> <p>11 More and more of them are illegally parked in bus bays</p> <p>12 or at bus stops. Then, as a result of traffic</p> <p>13 congestion, as a result of illegal parking, our bus</p> <p>14 captains find that they have to get a longer journey</p> <p>15 time, and what is worse is that the journey time is such</p> <p>16 that bus trips have been lost, and in fact our bus</p> <p>17 captains are facing huge pressure.</p> <p>18 Well, we have got verbal abuses, quarrels and</p> <p>19 sometimes physical abuses arise from such external</p> <p>20 factors.</p> <p>21 As to illegal parking, especially illegal parking at</p> <p>22 bus stops -- I hope you would understand that there are</p> <p>23 wheelchair-bound passengers and buses have to be stopped</p> <p>24 right at the bus stop before the wheelchair passenger</p> <p>25 can make use of the specific point along the kerb to</p>
<p>Page 14</p> <p>1 Some might work eight hours while others might want to</p> <p>2 work ten hours, and we would try our best to accommodate</p> <p>3 or facilitate their request.</p> <p>4 (Chinese words not interpreted) ... like they have</p> <p>5 been harassed and I have talked about my measures</p> <p>6 yesterday. We have also stepped up our training for</p> <p>7 frontline staff. In June, 200 operations officers and</p> <p>8 instructors at all levels have been trained for two days</p> <p>9 and altogether eight courses were arranged. During the</p> <p>10 training, what we were doing was to enhance ways to give</p> <p>11 support to frontline bus captains when they encountered</p> <p>12 difficulties.</p> <p>13 In addition -- Mr Chairman, well, a number of points</p> <p>14 here. A bus captain may get involved in a traffic</p> <p>15 accident. A bus captain may encounter what I said</p> <p>16 yesterday, incidents of abuse. So we have enhanced the</p> <p>17 ability of our operations officers and inspectors, so</p> <p>18 that they can arrive at the scene to help BCs to deal</p> <p>19 with a traffic accident.</p> <p>20 We tried to enhance our frontline capacity to</p> <p>21 provide appropriate assistance to the bus captains. Our</p> <p>22 company has also got dedicated people to deal with</p> <p>23 traffic accident investigation. We have also got the</p> <p>24 legal department. We have also got the Road Safety Unit</p> <p>25 from the Hong Kong Police Force to give us talks. It's</p>	<p>Page 16</p> <p>1 board the bus.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: Mr Duncan's question was not an open-ended</p> <p>3 enquiry into everything you might choose to tell us</p> <p>4 about what had been done. He was asking what</p> <p>5 initiatives have been taken.</p> <p>6 You have told us about stepped-up training. Is</p> <p>7 there anything else you want to describe?</p> <p>8 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) I just want to summarise</p> <p>9 and say that the bus captains face many difficulties and</p> <p>10 in fact we are trying to solve the problems one by one,</p> <p>11 gradually.</p> <p>12 As to the question of retention, Mr Chairman, I hope</p> <p>13 you will understand the pressure on the bus captains has</p> <p>14 a lot to do with retention and recruitment.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: You have told us repeatedly about what the</p> <p>16 pressures are. The question is what initiatives have</p> <p>17 been taken. You have probably told us all of the ones</p> <p>18 that exist.</p> <p>19 Mr Lee wants to say something.</p> <p>20 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Mr Pang was saying that</p> <p>21 while a bus captain is driving, even if the bus is</p> <p>22 stationary, say for example caught in traffic</p> <p>23 congestion, the bus captain suffers from a huge mental</p> <p>24 stress. Many bus captains have been complaining that it</p> <p>25 is hard for them to be trapped in a traffic jam, so it</p>

Page 17	<p>1 is a difficult job.</p> <p>2 Mr Pang is saying that we have been reminding being</p> <p>3 departments that traffic congestion is serious and the</p> <p>4 road conditions are bad. We hope that by raising this</p> <p>5 point, we are able to ease the traffic congestion and we</p> <p>6 hope that we can improve the road congestion. So such</p> <p>7 are our initiatives.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>9 Mr Duncan.</p> <p>10 MR PETER DUNCAN: To which government departments have those</p> <p>11 complaints been issued?</p> <p>12 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) You refer to the road</p> <p>13 conditions?</p> <p>14 MR PETER DUNCAN: Yes.</p> <p>15 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) A number of them.</p> <p>16 Of course, first of all, the police force. Say, for</p> <p>17 example, because of illegal parking and also the loading</p> <p>18 and unloading activities blocking our access to the bus</p> <p>19 stop and we can't park right at the bus stop and we are</p> <p>20 not able to get the wheelchair passengers on board.</p> <p>21 Other passengers also find it difficult to get on board.</p> <p>22 And you recall the incident in Central on</p> <p>23 Connaught Road.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: I think you are repeating yourself.</p> <p>25 MR PETER DUNCAN: So one is the police. What other</p>	Page 19	<p>1 faster.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: So it has been done, has it, but it could have</p> <p>3 been done quicker?</p> <p>4 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Sometimes we have to take</p> <p>5 our own efforts to do so.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: Has the problem of illegal parking at and around</p> <p>7 bus stops and elsewhere been solved?</p> <p>8 MR ROGER LEE: Not all of them, especially at night.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>10 Mr Duncan.</p> <p>11 MR PETER DUNCAN: Has the problem of traffic congestion been</p> <p>12 resolved?</p> <p>13 MR ROGER LEE: No.</p> <p>14 MR PATRICK PANG: No.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, what was the answer to that?</p> <p>16 MR ROGER LEE: No.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>18 MR PETER DUNCAN: What proportion of the company's bus</p> <p>19 drivers are women?</p> <p>20 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) 6 per cent, roughly.</p> <p>21 MR PETER DUNCAN: Does the company have any initiatives to</p> <p>22 attract more women to this position?</p> <p>23 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) We do, and we have been</p> <p>24 studying the matter. In particular, for the Tuen Mun</p> <p>25 Depot, we have been working harder on it because it is</p>
Page 18	<p>1 department?</p> <p>2 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) The other is the Transport</p> <p>3 Department.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: Anyone else?</p> <p>5 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Highways Department as</p> <p>6 well, because the conditions on the road may not be that</p> <p>7 satisfactory, and then the FHD, Food and Environmental</p> <p>8 Hygiene Department --</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: What conditions? Road surface or ...?</p> <p>10 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Uneven road surfaces or</p> <p>11 obstacles on the road.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Any other departments?</p> <p>13 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) The Food and</p> <p>14 Environmental Hygiene Department, FHD. The trees,</p> <p>15 especially in the rural area, after the rainy season,</p> <p>16 the branches are blocking or obstructing.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: Yes, so the trees need pruning, obstacles on the</p> <p>18 road, congestion and illegal parking, that's Police and</p> <p>19 Transport Department. Anybody else?</p> <p>20 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) I think basically those</p> <p>21 are the departments. Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: What's the overall response been from government?</p> <p>23 Perhaps Mr Lee can sum this up, shortly, if you can.</p> <p>24 Satisfactory or not?</p> <p>25 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Could have been quicker,</p>	Page 20	<p>1 a mainly residential area. During our recruitment</p> <p>2 exercise, of course we observe equal opportunities but</p> <p>3 still we want to attract more female candidates.</p> <p>4 We have considered whether we can have facilities to</p> <p>5 cater for the needs of the females. Say, for example,</p> <p>6 someone may be a housewife, and if we can have nursery</p> <p>7 facilities for childcare, if we can set up such</p> <p>8 a facility within our depot, I believe it will be</p> <p>9 helpful.</p> <p>10 But then, of course, land use is a restriction and</p> <p>11 we are not able to do that yet.</p> <p>12 MR PETER DUNCAN: Have these considerations led yet to any</p> <p>13 particular initiatives undertaken by the company to</p> <p>14 attract women?</p> <p>15 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) In addition, as far as the</p> <p>16 post or the job design is concerned, we have the</p> <p>17 so-called half-time bus captains. In other words, they</p> <p>18 work shorter hours or the number of days that they work</p> <p>19 in the week would be fewer, so as to cater for mothers</p> <p>20 who have to take care of their children.</p> <p>21 MR PETER DUNCAN: Has that resulted in any significant</p> <p>22 increase in the number of women who are employed?</p> <p>23 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Yes, it does help with the</p> <p>24 number of applicants. As I have said, we try as much as</p> <p>25 possible to provide separate toilet facilities at our</p>

Page 21	Page 23
<p>1 terminus. We will try as much as possible to have 2 different toilets for different sexes. 3 MR PETER DUNCAN: I want to ask that a slide be brought up 4 on the screen now which summarises the profits of KMB 5 and Long Win Bus in recent years, I think for the years 6 2011 to 2017. This has been gleaned from the reports in 7 the bundles. So if I could just explain this chart, the 8 top heading is "Profit for the years of 2011 to 2017 for 9 [Kowloon Motor Bus]", and the references you will see 10 across the top are all from the bundle KMB-6. 11 And the profits after taxation are shown across from 12 the year 2011 up until the year 2017. 13 We can see from this chart that losses were made in 14 the years 2012 and 2013. Do you see those losses 15 recorded as 51 million and 21 million respectively? 16 MR ROGER LEE: Yes. 17 MR GODWIN SO: Yes. 18 MR PETER DUNCAN: It would be fair to say that since 2013, 19 the profits of the company have increased quite 20 steadily; is that a fair comment? 21 MR ROGER LEE: Not fair comment. 22 DR NORMAN LEUNG: I agree, but there is a reason for that. 23 Mr Duncan, perhaps I can explain better the financial 24 position of the company by referring to KMB & Long Win-1 25 submissions, page 93, if I may have that, please.</p>	<p>1 That is important to note. 2 More importantly, I would like to point out that in 3 last year, 2017, our staff costs amounted to 4 \$3.6 billion, and this equals to roughly 60 per cent of 5 the total operating expenses. These staffing costs will 6 continue to rise from year to year because of the annual 7 pay increase exercise. So you will see that, in the 8 case of fuel costs, we have completely no control 9 whatsoever over such expenditure. So that's why I would 10 like to bring out to the attention of the committee that 11 I have been doing my level best to promote the wellbeing 12 of our staff. They are very important assets of the 13 company. We are here to serve people; we have to keep 14 them. 15 I would say that within my level best -- I will do 16 my level best to improve the wellbeing of our staff and 17 to care for their wellbeing, so hopefully we can recruit 18 new bus captains and to keep our serving bus captains in 19 the company. But on that point, I have to say that I am 20 painfully aware of the fact that we have been running 21 short of bus captains for a number of years, but we have 22 got to look at the larger issue, the market situation in 23 Hong Kong. But right now the unemployment rate of 24 Hong Kong is 2.8 per cent. This is virtually full 25 employment in Hong Kong. But there is nothing -- well,</p>
Page 22	Page 24
<p>1 Yes, Chairman. May I say that we have been, and 2 still are, labouring under very difficult position to 3 operate a franchised bus business. If I may refer to 4 this table, yes, Mr Duncan, you rightly pointed out that 5 in 2012 we made a loss of \$51 million, and in 2013 we 6 made a loss of \$21 million. 7 But when you say that, we had been making steady 8 profit from 2014 to 2017. 9 May I please point out one thing. Please look at 10 the profit of 2016. We made a profit of \$618 million. 11 But if you look -- if I may draw your attention to the 12 fuel costs. In 2012, the fuel cost was \$1.46 billion. 13 In the year 2013, the fuel cost was \$1.4 billion. Then 14 it comes down to \$1.2 billion in 2014, thereby giving us 15 a profit of \$197 million. 16 If you look closely at the profit of 2016, we made 17 a profit of \$618 million, but if you look at our savings 18 of the fuel costs, in that year we spent only 19 \$624 million on fuel costs. 20 So it tells us that while in 2016 there was 21 a marginal increase of our revenue, our profit was not 22 resulted from the rise in revenue but rather because of 23 the savings from the fuel costs. 24 The same applies to the year 2017. The amount of 25 profit equals to the amount of fuel costs we saved.</p>	<p>1 you know, we talked about imported labour -- there is 2 not too much we can do about it. But what I have been 3 trying to do, at least I have a strategy, to improve the 4 remuneration of our bus captains, in the hope that other 5 commercial drivers will come over to join our company, 6 and basically a movement of drivers from other transport 7 sector to KMB and Long Win. That's my strategy for 8 attracting bus captains. 9 I appreciate and fully recognise that it is 10 difficult to get new bloods, new recruits, into bus 11 captains, as explained by the management, because of the 12 working conditions, the abuse of our bus captains by 13 passengers, et cetera. 14 But I will continue to look after -- you have my 15 assurance that I will continue to do my level best to 16 promote the wellbeing of our staff, in the hope that the 17 bus captain shortage problem can be addressed. 18 Thank you, Mr Duncan. 19 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you, Dr Leung. 20 If I could just pick up one of the matters you 21 mentioned. You said a few moments ago that you have 22 a strategy to improve the remuneration of the bus 23 drivers. Are you able to disclose what that 24 strategy is? 25 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Basically, we are talking about the</p>

Page 25	Page 27
<p>1 remuneration of the bus captains. I did that, you know, 2 at the board meeting of December last year, to 3 incorporate the bonuses into the basic salary, and 4 I told you at the Tuesday hearing that there will be 5 further upgrades -- I will be expanding the grades of 6 the monthly bus captains, and also to expand their 7 annual increment from eight to twenty; I told that at 8 the hearing.</p> <p>9 But basically money, I'm talking about money, and 10 the working conditions of our bus captains. No efforts 11 will be spared in attracting, if I may say so, new 12 bloods to our staff force, I would say that.</p> <p>13 MR PETER DUNCAN: We will come to the starting salary of new 14 recruits later today, but in the light of what you have 15 told us about price of fuel and so forth, what scope is 16 there to increase the basic remuneration of your bus 17 captains, in order to attract more people to this 18 position?</p> <p>19 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Apart from -- well, let's say we want to 20 recruit a new bus captain. After the implementation of 21 all the initiatives that I mentioned, plus the annual 22 increment of pay in 2018 being implemented later in the 23 year, subject to agreement of the trade unions, I work 24 out that a new bus captain would be earning about 25 \$23,000 per month, roughly, for 10 hours of working.</p>	<p>1 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) We strive to hire young 2 drivers.</p> <p>3 MR PETER DUNCAN: I am particularly interested in the young 4 people.</p> <p>5 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Young people.</p> <p>6 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Yes. In terms of 7 recruitment channels, apart from the traditional medium 8 of newspapers, we have been using social media in order 9 to reach out to the younger generation.</p> <p>10 And in terms of benefits, there is something we can 11 do. As we said, we have recreation clubs which might be 12 appealing to younger people. We have sports activities 13 such as soccer, basketball, badminton, or singing 14 activities. As Mr Pang said, in terms of rostering, we 15 would try to cater for the young people and their 16 lifestyle, and at depots we have introduced recreation 17 facilities to appeal to young people.</p> <p>18 And in terms of shuttle service to depots, we have 19 expanded our service so that people who live far would 20 not be discouraged from joining the company. In terms 21 of promotion, we have been proactive and in the past 22 half a year we have organised multiple open days and 23 recruitment days, and we have sent outreach teams to our 24 depots in order to reach out to younger prospects. 25 So this is what we have been doing.</p>
Page 26	Page 28
<p>1 Working on a 10 hours basis, it would be about 23,000.</p> <p>2 MR PETER DUNCAN: That's 10 hours a day, six days a week?</p> <p>3 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Yes, six-day week, and as I say, in the 4 hope that perhaps some commercial drivers may consider 5 to join our company as well as new bloods might consider 6 joining our company.</p> <p>7 MR PETER DUNCAN: Has the company developed any particular 8 initiatives to attract young people to the position? We 9 saw the statistics yesterday and saw that the number of 10 young people is much less than the number of middle-aged 11 people.</p> <p>12 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Yes, we did. I will talk 13 about our HR initiatives. In terms of male bus 14 captains, and as Mr Leung said, the labour productivity 15 is limited, so in terms of remuneration -- well, many 16 staff, including frontline staff, would not only 17 consider salary; they would consider the working 18 conditions, and we have enhanced the arrangement of 19 family cards for staff, and family members of our staff 20 can take the bus for free, and we are creating an ideal 21 environment. As I said, the proportion of female 22 drivers is 5 to 6 per cent, whereas in Hong Kong the 23 proportion of males and females are comparable.</p> <p>24 In terms of what we will do, perhaps I will defer to 25 Mr So.</p>	<p>1 MR PETER DUNCAN: Have you noticed any improvement in regard 2 to young people?</p> <p>3 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) KMB has four depots and 4 when we open our depots, apart from -- well, we 5 encourage young people to bring their family members to 6 visit the depots so that the family members of our 7 captains can understand the working environment, and 8 this is rather appealing.</p> <p>9 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Mr Duncan, I have 10 something to add to what Mr So said.</p> <p>11 MR PETER DUNCAN: I am only interested in whether these 12 initiatives have actually resulted in any improvement. 13 Or is it too early to say?</p> <p>14 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) I can only say that we 15 are gradually achieving improvements. We do not want 16 our young captains to feel that they become captains 17 only because they are at a dead end or they have no 18 choice. In the last nine months, some captains have 19 been promoted to inspectors or operations officers. We 20 hope to motivate young people to join the bus trade. 21 This is something we want to do. 22 Thank you, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>23 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) In the past, captains were 24 seldom promoted to inspectors or to clerical grades, but 25 this is something we are trying to do.</p>

Page 29	Page 31
<p>1 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Basically we are saying that we have 2 accelerated promotion policy for the talented young men. 3 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you. 4 Is there a minimum age before you will engage a bus 5 captain? 6 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Can you repeat the 7 question, please? 8 MR PETER DUNCAN: Yes. Is there a minimum age which applies 9 to persons who can join your company as a bus captain? 10 Do they have to be 20 or 25 or 30? 11 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) So long as the applicant 12 holds a private vehicle licence for three years, they 13 will be considered. 14 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you. 15 Dr Leung, you touched, in one of your answers a few 16 moments ago, on the matter of fare increases. 17 When was the last fare increase approved by the 18 Administration? 19 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) 2014. 20 MR PETER DUNCAN: The committee has heard of the mechanism 21 by which fare increases are considered. Has the company 22 applied for any fare increase since 2014? 23 DR NORMAN LEUNG: No, we have not. Again, to explain our 24 position better, may I please refer to page 95 of this 25 same file.</p>	<p>1 content with the current formula? 2 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Sorry? 3 MR PETER DUNCAN: Are you happy with regard to the current 4 formula? 5 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Of course not. Why would I be happy? 6 Of course not. Mr Duncan, how can I be happy with such 7 a formula? 8 MR PETER DUNCAN: Do you have any particular suggestions as 9 to what formula should be applied? 10 DR NORMAN LEUNG: I think we have been talking to the 11 Transport Bureau for a number of years, and so far we 12 have achieved nothing. We just have to keep on talking 13 with them, to convince them that it is time for 14 a revision of the formula. 15 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) The biggest problem with 16 this formula is it is looking at what happened in the 17 past, and then on that basis you apply for a fare 18 adjustment. We talked about the staff costs as well as 19 the fuel costs, and they are about the future costs. 20 Say, for example, recently, the fuel prices have gone 21 up. In the past year or two, prices have come down. So 22 it's a matter of the time-lag and we are not able to 23 reflect the situation. 24 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Mr Chairman, I missed out one important 25 issue. The oil price is not included in this formula.</p>
Page 30	Page 32
<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Thank you. 2 DR NORMAN LEUNG: We have to apply for fare increase in 3 accordance with the formula as set out in 4 paragraph 33(vi). There is a formula stated there: 0.5 5 times increase in wage index plus 0.5 times increase in 6 Consumer Price Index minus 0.5 times productivity gain. 7 If the result of this formula equals to or exceeds 8 2 per cent, then we can apply to the government for 9 a fare increase. That's the trigger point for it. But 10 as in the last two years, because our profit -- also, 11 there was another cap -- if our profit reaches the level 12 of 9.7 per cent of our net asset value -- 13 DR JOHN CHAN: Net average fixed assets. 14 DR NORMAN LEUNG: -- net average fixed assets, we can't 15 apply for any increase. This is the case for 2016 and 16 2017, so we couldn't apply for any increase, according 17 to this formula. 18 So unlike our big brother, MTRC, they have 19 a formula, but the increase is automatic; they don't 20 have to apply for it. But in our case, we have to make 21 an application for fare increase, and more often than 22 not we never get the rate of increase that we apply for. 23 That's the situation. 24 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you. 25 The obvious question, Dr Leung, is this: are you</p>	<p>1 We know how much we spend on gas, but this is not 2 included in the formula. A very significant cost factor 3 of our operation is excluded from this formula. 4 CHAIRMAN: Fuel is not a part of Consumer Price Index? 5 DR JOHN CHAN: No. 6 MR PETER DUNCAN: Could you have in front of you, Dr Leung, 7 the file THB-2, and in particular page 23. 8 Perhaps if I go back to the commencement of the 9 document. It's actually at page 1. It is a document 10 issued by the Transport and Housing Bureau and it's 11 called, "Public Transport Strategy Study", dated June 12 2017. 13 Are you familiar with the fact that this report 14 exists? 15 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Yes. 16 MR PETER DUNCAN: Could you go, please, to page 23 of the 17 bundle. 18 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Yes. 19 MR PETER DUNCAN: Do you see a heading on that page, "(d) 20 Fare adjustment arrangement"? Do you see that? 21 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Yes. 22 MR PETER DUNCAN: And in paragraph 4.25, you will see the 23 formula which you have included in your submission at 24 page 95. Do you see that? 25 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Yes.</p>

Page 33	Page 35
<p>1 MR PETER DUNCAN: If I can take you over the page to 2 page 24, and bring your attention to paragraph 4.28: 3 "The aforesaid existing arrangement was put in place 4 in 2006 after consultation with the LegCo. The 5 arrangement was subsequently fine-tuned having regard to 6 the outcome of the review in 2009." 7 Then at 4.29: 8 "In this regard, the government has conducted 9 a review of the FAA. The initial findings indicate that 10 the arrangement should be kept intact, while the data 11 could be updated on two fronts". 12 Then you can see those fronts there described, "(a) 13 Productivity gain value" and then the "Passenger reward 14 arrangement". I think you will see in the "Passenger 15 reward arrangement" reference to the 9.7 per cent, which 16 I think you have touched on during the course of your 17 evidence this morning. 18 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Yes, the annual fixed assets, that's 19 right. 20 MR PETER DUNCAN: Yes. 21 Then at 4.30 we have this statement: 22 "The government has initiated discussion with the 23 franchised bus companies on the initial review outcome 24 and the details of the above two data updates. We will 25 announce the discussion outcome and expect to implement</p>	<p>1 to Executive Council. This has not happened. 2 If you look at what this says here, if we may go to 3 the next page. Yes, the sentence at the end of 4 paragraph 4.29, it says: 5 "The consultant recommended that the triggering 6 threshold of 9.7 per cent should be adjusted downwards 7 slightly ...", et cetera. 8 Just looking at that figure -- 9 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, where are you reading from? 10 DR NORMAN LEUNG: 25. 11 DR JOHN CHAN: 25, I think, paragraph 4.29 of the document. 12 CHAIRMAN: Yes, I have it, thank you. 13 DR JOHN CHAN: If the triggering threshold of 9.7 is 14 reduced, purely from a financial point of view that is 15 bad news for KMB. 16 MR PETER DUNCAN: So, as matters stand, from the perspective 17 of KMB, it does not appear that there is any imminent 18 likelihood of an improvement in the fare adjustment 19 process? Is that a fair summary of the situation? 20 DR JOHN CHAN: That's right. 21 MR PETER DUNCAN: So the comment that Dr Leung had with 22 regard to being the younger brother of the MTRC would 23 remain; is that fair? 24 DR NORMAN LEUNG: We are the poor little cousin! 25 MR PETER DUNCAN: Right. I now wish to return to training.</p>
Page 34	Page 36
<p>1 them in the first half of 2018 upon approval by the 2 Chief Executive-in-Council." 3 Have you heard anything from the government on this 4 matter? 5 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Not on -- basically, I have been 6 talking -- I have had discussion with the government, 7 you know, on the passenger reward arrangement, and we 8 haven't come to -- 9 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) May I supplement? 10 DR NORMAN LEUNG: No, no, no. Let me finish first. 11 I have been, you know, talking to the government. 12 I have had discussion with the government on this, on 13 the passenger reward arrangement, and no definitive 14 agreement has been reached between us. 15 MR PETER DUNCAN: There is reference to the fact that this 16 matter was going to be considered by the Executive 17 Council, and then an implementation in the first half of 18 2018. 19 Have you had any news in that respect? 20 DR NORMAN LEUNG: No, no implementation as of today. 21 MR PETER DUNCAN: If the recommendation which is described 22 at the top of page 25 is accepted, will that ease your 23 concerns with regard to the fare adjustment arrangement? 24 DR JOHN CHAN: Mr Duncan, we, as of today, have not been 25 told of the outcome of the review and of any submission</p>	<p>1 MEMBER LO: I just have a question on the cost structure. 2 You mentioned that the fuel cost is a big part of the 3 variation, fluctuation of your business. 4 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Yes. 5 MEMBER LO: Have you thought about a scheme to stabilise the 6 variation over time, over the years, maybe with the 7 government? 8 DR NORMAN LEUNG: The government will leave this matter to 9 KMB and us only, and in fact, at one time, in previous, 10 many -- some years ago, we discussed with the government 11 the possibility of having a surcharge, you know, for our 12 fares, arising from the increase, significant increase, 13 in fuel costs. It came to nothing because the 14 government would not agree to that. 15 Of course, we have considered all sorts of options 16 for cost-saving in this aspect, but we made a conscious 17 decision not to do any oil hedging. We find that it's 18 not advisable to hedge against oil -- you know, the gas 19 oil price, because we learned the unfortunate experience 20 of Cathay in that aspect. You know, they got 21 a substantial loss as a result of hedging. 22 So what we have done is to talk -- we have in fact 23 reached an agreement with the oil supplier. That's what 24 we are doing today. Then we have agreed that they will 25 supply gas oil to us, for a number of years, normally</p>

Page 37	Page 39
<p>1 for three years. Then we agree the capped price for the 2 gas oil.</p> <p>3 Currently, we have a capped price of US\$85 per 4 barrel. That's what we are doing now. If the gas oil 5 price goes up, goes beyond US\$85, we are still paying 6 \$85. But, on the other hand, if the gas oil price comes 7 down, say comes down to \$40, \$45, we don't have any 8 floor on the price and we just pay the market price --</p> <p>9 MR ROGER LEE: (Chinese words not interpreted).</p> <p>10 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Yes, the floor is US\$45.</p> <p>11 MR ROGER LEE: (Chinese words not interpreted).</p> <p>12 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Currently, we don't have such floor.</p> <p>13 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) We do not conduct hedging 14 against oil, because oil costs are a major cost 15 component. We agreed with the oil suppliers that the 16 cap is US\$85 per barrel, which is the crude oil cost 17 plus a margin, and we would have a spot rate and we 18 would add a premium on top. Of course I cannot disclose 19 the exact figure. It's meaningless to have a floor 20 price. Coming up, we will have a floor price of about 21 US\$45 and we have shifted the risk to the oil suppliers.</p> <p>22 And, like the chairman said, we are trying to come 23 up with our own way to protect ourselves against fuel 24 costs. Fuel once made up 20 per cent of our costs, 25 which was significant.</p>	<p>1 MR PETER DUNCAN: Will there be part-time captains who 2 perform for more than 18 hours a day -- will they be 3 recruited in the future?</p> <p>4 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) A week?</p> <p>5 MR PETER DUNCAN: 18 hours a week, yes.</p> <p>6 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Yes.</p> <p>7 MR PETER DUNCAN: And they will receive the same form of 8 training as any bus captain who is proposing to work on 9 a full-time basis?</p> <p>10 MR GODWIN SO: Yes.</p> <p>11 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>12 Now, we can read for ourselves the contents of the 13 new training programmes, as set out in items 3, 4, 5, 6 14 and 7.</p> <p>15 I just ask, with regard to item 7: 16 "The number of ... driving instructors should be 17 increased to a total of 110." 18 And in the action plan, it is stated that the 19 canned: 20 "The ... candidates would complete all training and 21 necessary exams before 30 June 2018... to form a cadre 22 of 81 [driving instructors]." 23 Has that been completed?</p> <p>24 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) This is already completed. 25 We have now a cadre of 89 DIs.</p>
Page 38	Page 40
<p>1 As for the toll charges, they are rather high. Most 2 people do not know that KMB is paying the full toll 3 charges, even for government tunnels.</p> <p>4 So these are crucial cost components which we are 5 monitoring.</p> <p>6 MR PETER DUNCAN: Back to the question of training, 7 gentlemen. Can I have you, please, at page 145 of 8 KMB-1.</p> <p>9 We are looking here at the action plan as of 10 10 April 2018, which was submitted to the Transport 11 Department on that date, and at paragraph 3 on page 145 12 through to paragraph 7 on page 147, we see the action 13 plan for training.</p> <p>14 If I could pick it up at item 3, the statement is 15 made there -- and this is the point we reached at the 16 end of yesterday's hearing -- that henceforth "all newly 17 recruited bus captain candidates should be subject to 18 the same standard of training".</p> <p>19 MR JAMES WONG: (Chinese words not interpreted).</p> <p>20 MR PETER DUNCAN: Whether they are full-time or part-time, 21 they will receive the same standard of training; is that 22 correct?</p> <p>23 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) Since that time, we no 24 longer recruited part-time captains, so we applied the 25 same standards to all.</p>	<p>1 MR PETER DUNCAN: I would like now to refer you to another 2 bundle, which is TD-1, at page 403.</p> <p>3 You should be looking at a document dated July 2018, 4 issued by the Transport and Housing Bureau and Transport 5 Department, for discussion in the Legislative Council on 6 25 July. Do you have that paper in front of you?</p> <p>7 MR JAMES WONG: (Via Interpreter) Yes, I see that.</p> <p>8 MR PETER DUNCAN: Now, in the portion on page 403 with 9 regard to the background, it refers to the setting up of 10 a working group following the accident on 10 February. 11 Do you see that?</p> <p>12 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) Yes, I see that.</p> <p>13 MR PETER DUNCAN: And we see that the scope of the work is 14 described in paragraphs (a) and (b)? And was one of the 15 scope of work described as the reviewing of the training 16 arrangements adopted by the franchised bus operators?</p> <p>17 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) Yes, that's described in 18 paragraph (b).</p> <p>19 MR PETER DUNCAN: At the bottom of the page, there is 20 a footnote which describes the composition of the 21 working group, to include the five franchised bus 22 operators, together with the bus manufacturers and 23 of course the representatives of the Transport 24 Department itself. 25 May I ask whether any of the gentlemen present were</p>

Page 41	Page 43
<p>1 members of this working group?</p> <p>2 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) For KMB and LWB, myself,</p> <p>3 Godwin So, Mr Leung Kin Wang, operations director, and</p> <p>4 Mr James Wong, the head of the training and quality</p> <p>5 assurance department, represented our company.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: Was there not also a subgroup dealing with</p> <p>7 technical matters?</p> <p>8 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Yes.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: And what was the KMB representation on the</p> <p>10 subgroup?</p> <p>11 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Technically speaking,</p> <p>12 myself and another engineer represented the company.</p> <p>13 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) For the relevant training,</p> <p>14 I attended the meeting.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: What was the name of the other engineer who</p> <p>16 attended the safety device subgroup?</p> <p>17 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Ivan Ho.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: And, Mr Wong, were you the only representative of</p> <p>19 the training group?</p> <p>20 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) Yes, I was the</p> <p>21 representative. I was the lone representative for the</p> <p>22 training subgroup.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>24 MR PETER DUNCAN: On page 403 --</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, before we move on, Mr Duncan, would you</p>	<p>1 franchised bus company representatives, or will they be</p> <p>2 reflected in the minutes that you are going to provide</p> <p>3 us?</p> <p>4 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Yes, their names are</p> <p>5 present on those minutes.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>7 Yes, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>8 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you, Chairman.</p> <p>9 CTB & NWFB-3, please, at page 588. Do you see</p> <p>10 a document headed, "Working group on enhancement of</p> <p>11 safety of franchised buses" dated 13 March?</p> <p>12 MR GODWIN SO: Yes.</p> <p>13 MR PETER DUNCAN: Is it followed by a document which is</p> <p>14 described as an annex, and the heading, "Working group</p> <p>15 on enhancement of safety of franchised buses"?</p> <p>16 MR GODWIN SO: Yes.</p> <p>17 MR PETER DUNCAN: If you go to page 590, do you see</p> <p>18 a heading, "Membership"?</p> <p>19 MR GODWIN SO: Yes.</p> <p>20 MR PETER DUNCAN: Does that assist with regard to those</p> <p>21 persons from the Transport Department who worked on the</p> <p>22 working group?</p> <p>23 MR GODWIN SO: Yes.</p> <p>24 MR PETER DUNCAN: Was it the same people at each meeting?</p> <p>25 MR GODWIN SO: Almost.</p>
<p>Page 42</p> <p>1 explore who the representatives of the Transport</p> <p>2 Department and the other franchised bus companies were?</p> <p>3 MR PETER DUNCAN: Certainly, Chairman.</p> <p>4 Who on the working group represented the Transport</p> <p>5 Department?</p> <p>6 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) In the past, TD was -- the</p> <p>7 group was chaired by Rachel Kwan, the Assistant</p> <p>8 Commissioner for Transport, and after she went on</p> <p>9 retirement leave Macella Lee, the Deputy Commissioner,</p> <p>10 chaired the group.</p> <p>11 MR PETER DUNCAN: Did the Transport Department have other</p> <p>12 representatives?</p> <p>13 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Yes, they had plenty.</p> <p>14 I cannot name each one of them. They had a senior</p> <p>15 transport officer, et cetera, and they were from a bus</p> <p>16 and railway unit as well as a road engineering unit, but</p> <p>17 I cannot remember all the names.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: Were minutes not produced of these meetings?</p> <p>19 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Yes.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Can you provide them to us?</p> <p>21 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Yes.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>23 MR PETER DUNCAN: I would ask you, please, to turn up one of</p> <p>24 the other bundles, CTB --</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Before we do that, can we pursue the other</p>	<p>Page 44</p> <p>1 MR PETER DUNCAN: Right. It would appear that this document</p> <p>2 does not include the names of any of the bus</p> <p>3 manufacturer representatives.</p> <p>4 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) For bus manufacturers, they</p> <p>5 attended the meeting of the technical subgroup. Here,</p> <p>6 this is about the main meeting; they did not attend.</p> <p>7 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>8 Did members of the Transport Department attend the</p> <p>9 subgroup meetings?</p> <p>10 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) Yes, within the subgroup,</p> <p>11 some of the Transport Department representatives and</p> <p>12 representatives from franchised bus operators, including</p> <p>13 myself, hold meetings together.</p> <p>14 MR PETER DUNCAN: Who chaired the subgroup?</p> <p>15 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) If I remember correctly,</p> <p>16 it should be Amy Tse.</p> <p>17 MR PETER DUNCAN: From the Transport Department?</p> <p>18 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) Correct. Yes, she is</p> <p>19 responsible for training.</p> <p>20 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) For the technical</p> <p>21 subgroup, a number of them were involved, David Tsang,</p> <p>22 once, and I think he retired and he was replaced by</p> <p>23 others, and at the last meeting it was chaired by</p> <p>24 Assistant Commissioner, a Mr Chan Ying Kit.</p> <p>25 MR PETER DUNCAN: I notice on page 403 of TD-1 that the</p>

Page 45	Page 47
<p>1 major bus manufacturers were invited to join the</p> <p>2 technical meetings. Did they actually attend the</p> <p>3 technical subgroup meetings?</p> <p>4 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Yes, they did.</p> <p>5 MR PETER DUNCAN: And which of the bus manufacturers named</p> <p>6 there -- Alexander Dennis, Volvo, and Regal-MAN -- which</p> <p>7 of those were represented at the subgroup meetings?</p> <p>8 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) For Alexander Dennis</p> <p>9 Ltd, it was represented by Andrew Boulton. Volvo, by</p> <p>10 Julia ...</p> <p>11 (In English) I forgot the first name. And</p> <p>12 Jacky Chan of Volvo.</p> <p>13 MR PETER DUNCAN: Julia for Volvo and Jacky Chan for?</p> <p>14 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Volvo.</p> <p>15 MR PETER DUNCAN: Two for Volvo?</p> <p>16 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Two for Volvo.</p> <p>17 MR PETER DUNCAN: And what about Regal-MAN?</p> <p>18 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Rex Wong for Regal.</p> <p>19 MR PETER DUNCAN: Are these all local representatives of</p> <p>20 those companies, or are they resident overseas?</p> <p>21 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Local resident engineers.</p> <p>22 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>23 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Julia Lu, L-U.</p> <p>24 MR PETER DUNCAN: The chairman asked whether minutes of the</p> <p>25 working group meetings were retained, were kept, and you</p>	<p>1 the document indicates, these are recommended measures.</p> <p>2 Does the company regard itself as being bound by these</p> <p>3 measures, or is the company going to regard these</p> <p>4 measures as recommendations only, as is stated in the</p> <p>5 paper?</p> <p>6 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) On page 413, which is</p> <p>7 annex A, there would be a target time frame for each</p> <p>8 recommendation, and this is for the trade's</p> <p>9 consideration. So these are technical bus features.</p> <p>10 In terms of the training of bus captains, there are</p> <p>11 practice notes which the trade has to comply with, and</p> <p>12 in the last paragraph of the practice note there is</p> <p>13 a requirement for a monitoring and audit system to be in</p> <p>14 place for each company, and they must ensure that the</p> <p>15 practice note is complied with and the matter must be</p> <p>16 reported to the board.</p> <p>17 MR PETER DUNCAN: So with regard to the technical matters,</p> <p>18 do I understand your answer to mean that you go through</p> <p>19 the trials and then make a determination as to what can</p> <p>20 be implemented?</p> <p>21 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) As far as engineering is</p> <p>22 concerned, a lot is ongoing. They are recommendations</p> <p>23 but from the perspective of the company, we will</p> <p>24 certainly try our best to enforce them vigorously.</p> <p>25 MR PETER DUNCAN: Without going into the detail of the</p>
Page 46	Page 48
<p>1 indicated yes and you are going to supply those.</p> <p>2 Were there minutes of the subgroup meetings kept?</p> <p>3 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: The minutes are distributed by the</p> <p>4 working group chairman and they sent the minutes to us.</p> <p>5 MR PETER DUNCAN: Do they include the minutes of the</p> <p>6 subgroup as well as the main working group?</p> <p>7 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Different meeting minutes, yes.</p> <p>8 MR PETER DUNCAN: When you provide the minutes, could you</p> <p>9 provide the minutes not just of the working group but</p> <p>10 also of the subgroup?</p> <p>11 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes.</p> <p>12 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: Mr Duncan, if the hiatus suggests that you have</p> <p>14 in mind a break, that is certainly welcome.</p> <p>15 We will take a 20-minute break, gentlemen. Thank</p> <p>16 you.</p> <p>17 (11.36 am)</p> <p>18 (A short adjournment)</p> <p>19 (11.58 am)</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>21 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>22 We were at page 403 of TD-1, the paper which briefed</p> <p>23 members of the Legislative Council on the recommended</p> <p>24 measures to further enhance safety of franchised buses.</p> <p>25 Could I ask this question. As the first sentence of</p>	<p>1 document yet, it is apparent from this document that if</p> <p>2 many of the recommendations are adopted, this will have</p> <p>3 quite an impact on the way in which bus captains are</p> <p>4 trained and also on how bus captains carry out their</p> <p>5 duties. Do you agree with that?</p> <p>6 MR GODWIN SO: Yes.</p> <p>7 MR PETER DUNCAN: We notice that neither the unions nor the</p> <p>8 bus captains were represented on the working group.</p> <p>9 What consultation has taken place with the bus captains</p> <p>10 and/or the trade unions during the period that this</p> <p>11 working group has operated?</p> <p>12 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Allow me to elaborate on</p> <p>13 this. For this working group, the Transport Department</p> <p>14 hasn't invited any trade unions. When the discussion</p> <p>15 reached the third meeting, as you know, then we got the</p> <p>16 guidelines for the training of bus captains. It was</p> <p>17 suggested that individual operators, according to our</p> <p>18 needs, should consult the trade unions.</p> <p>19 Now, for our company, that is KMB and LWB, read the</p> <p>20 guidelines. In fact, it is a matter of setting out all</p> <p>21 the practices among all the bus operators, and then the</p> <p>22 TD grouped them together and produced the practice note.</p> <p>23 For this practice note, our company is able to meet all</p> <p>24 the requirements, and in fact this is what we have been</p> <p>25 doing, and what we are doing. Therefore, we haven't</p>

Page 49	Page 51
<p>1 consulted our trade unions or our staff members again. 2 This is because they are already in place. Nothing new 3 there, as far as KMB is concerned. 4 MR PETER DUNCAN: What about the technology devices which 5 have been recommended; what consultation, if any, has 6 taken place with the trade unions with regard to those 7 matters? 8 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Again, as I have said, they 9 would defer to the bus companies to carry out the 10 consultation. We have to look at the broad suggestions 11 made. First of all, for newly acquired buses, there 12 should be seat belts. As of today, 44 of our buses in 13 the fleet are fitted with seat belts for all, and bus 14 captains have had the experience of driving such buses. 15 So it isn't something new. 16 Then, as to the second recommendation, it is said 17 that we should have real-time speeding alerts. Well, 18 two days ago, you know that we do have the real-time 19 alerts. We have got it already. 20 The TD is saying other than the 70km per hour, we 21 should also cover 50km per hour. I have covered that so 22 I don't want to repeat. 23 Then there should be another feature to alert bus 24 captains who are sort of falling asleep. We have got 25 four buses on a pilot basis. It is merely a matter of</p>	<p>1 been promulgated in July? 2 MR PETER DUNCAN: Indeed, that was the position, 3 Mr Chairman. 4 If you go to page 427, please. 5 CHAIRMAN: That gives us the date. 6 MR PETER DUNCAN: Yes. There is a letter from the Transport 7 Department dated 20 July, which provides an attachment, 8 and then you will see the attachment running from 9 page 428, and at page 435 there is reference, in the 10 first complete box, to the fact that the TD had recently 11 issued a practice note to franchised bus operators in 12 respect of the training for bus captains, et cetera. 13 What date did the Transport Department issue the 14 practice note to Kowloon Motor Bus? 15 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) 6 August. 16 (In English) Through a fax. 17 MR PETER DUNCAN: Had you received any practice note from 18 the Transport Department prior to 6 August? 19 MR GODWIN SO: Yes. 20 (Via interpreter) Well, for the practice note, it's 21 an output from the working group. On 25 July, they went 22 to the Transport Panel of LegCo, but they didn't have 23 that paper, as you can see. Then, on 6 August, we 24 received a fax, telling us that it would be formally 25 launched and we were expected to implement it.</p>
Page 50	Page 52
<p>1 reminding them. There won't be a record and we are not 2 going to resort to disciplinary actions. We want to ask 3 bus captains to try them and then they can tell us 4 whether such a device would be helpful to them. 5 Therefore, as far as the bus features are concerned, 6 the first one I have covered, we have the seat belt; 7 second, the drowsiness alert, we have got four on trial 8 to get views from the bus captains; and then the other 9 one, we have also got it in our company as well. 10 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you. 11 You have mentioned the practice note, and I wonder 12 if we could turn the practice note up. I believe it 13 would be at 470. 14 CHAIRMAN: This was provided on 9 August; am I correct? 15 MR PETER DUNCAN: Yes. If you look at page 463 of the 16 bundle, you will see a letter from the Transport 17 Department of 9 August, which was in response to 18 a letter from the committee of 23 July. 19 You will see at page 471 to 473 a practice note 20 which bears the date August of 2018. Do you see that? 21 So if you look at the practice note -- 22 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, which page is this, the practice note? 23 MR PETER DUNCAN: 471. 24 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. But we were told, were we not, by 25 a submission of the Transport Department, that this had</p>	<p>1 MR PETER DUNCAN: Yes. My question is whether before 2 6 August the Transport Department had issued a practice 3 note to Kowloon Motor Bus. 4 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Not a formal one. 5 CHAIRMAN: Were you issued an informal one? 6 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Please ask the question 7 again; I don't quite grasp the question. 8 CHAIRMAN: Well, the Transport Department are telling the 9 committee in a written submission that they have 10 recently issued a practice note to the franchised bus 11 operators and they told us that on 20 July, and then, 12 when they provide us with a practice note, it is dated 13 August, and you tell us that you've got one that's dated 14 6 August. Were you given any earlier version of the 15 practice note, one that is consistent with what the 16 Transport Department are telling us? 17 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) I can provide what I have 18 received, so we have attachments to a discussion paper 19 for meetings before that. 20 CHAIRMAN: What was the date that you received that practice 21 note? 22 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) 6 August. 23 CHAIRMAN: Nothing prior to that, in any form? 24 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Yes, there's an attachment 25 to a discussion paper of the working group's meeting.</p>

Page 53	Page 55
<p>1 CHAIRMAN: And what's the date of that document? 2 MR GODWIN SO: Mid or early July. 3 (Via interpreter) I can't recall the exact date. 4 CHAIRMAN: Do you have a copy of the document? 5 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Yes. 6 CHAIRMAN: Can you provide it to the committee? 7 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Yes. 8 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 9 Mr Duncan. 10 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you, Chairman. 11 Let's have a look at the practice note itself. 12 TD-1/470. We will be able to read for ourselves the 13 general content of the document, but one matter I would 14 like to bring to your attention, please, is paragraph 4 15 on page 471, and the minimum requirement. 16 The working group, with regard to the induction 17 course, has suggested a certain period of time for 18 classroom training and then a certain period of time for 19 behind-the-wheel road training, and the working group 20 has drawn a distinction between full-time and part-time 21 drivers. 22 What is the intent of the Kowloon Motor Bus Company 23 in the light of the earlier evidence on the action plan 24 that it's your intention in the future to treat all bus 25 drivers in the same way whether they be full-time or</p>	<p>1 I would like to leave training now and turn to 2 another matter. 3 Could you in this respect, please, turn up KMB-1 at 4 page 129. 5 The original documentation here is at page 128 to 6 129, and I'm working off the translation at 129-1. 7 This is a document headed, "Declaration". What is 8 the purpose and what is the use of this document? 9 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) In February or March, the 10 company set up an investigation committee in the 11 aftermath of the Tai Po accident, and the idea was that 12 we had to know more about our employees, in a process 13 known as "know our employees", and we wanted to find out 14 whether their other employments outside might affect 15 their work and whether our employees have significant 16 medical history which might affect their work, and also 17 whether they have been convicted of dangerous driving in 18 the past and also criminal conviction records. 19 And during recruitment, we would look at the 20 information submitted by the applicants when considering 21 whether they would be hired. 22 MR PETER DUNCAN: So, prior to the Tai Po accident, was 23 there any form such as this required to be set out when 24 a potential bus driver joined the company? 25 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) It wasn't that detailed but</p>
Page 54	Page 56
<p>1 whether they be part-time? 2 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) When this item was 3 discussed, the other FB operators were also present. As 4 far as training is concerned, different companies have 5 different arrangements and needs. Therefore, in the 6 light of the different circumstances of different 7 operators, the TD came up with the minimum requirement. 8 So you can see that the topic is called "minimum 9 requirement". In other words, for some companies, they 10 would still be engaging part-time bus captains, and 11 I clearly stated that for KMB, we have stopped 12 recruiting part-time bus captains, but then the TD has 13 to take into account the other operators when they drew 14 up the guidelines. That's why they have included this 15 point about part-time bus captains, but it doesn't apply 16 to KMB. 17 MR PETER DUNCAN: Does the company envisage any changes in 18 its training programme, as set out in the action plan 19 and in the other documentation provided to the 20 committee, as a result of this practice note? 21 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) No, no need to change or 22 revise. This is because we have made our suggestions 23 and the TD came up with this in the light of our 24 submission. 25 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you.</p>	<p>1 there was still similar work. For example, in terms of 2 dangerous driving, we would ask them to give their 3 records. For medical history, no declaration was 4 needed, but there would be a medical check upon 5 induction. 6 MR PETER DUNCAN: Did the form enter into the position of 7 what other employment a person was undertaking, the old 8 form? 9 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) No, not before. 10 MR PETER DUNCAN: Do you happen to still have a copy of the 11 old form which was in use? 12 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Yes, we can provide that. 13 CHAIRMAN: Please do. 14 MR PETER DUNCAN: Who was required to fill out this 15 declaration? 16 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) The applicant for the post 17 concerned. 18 MR PETER DUNCAN: So this form is signed upon the applicant 19 being engaged in employment; is that correct? 20 MR GODWIN SO: Yes. 21 MR PETER DUNCAN: On an ongoing basis, what checks does the 22 company undertake to understand what an employee might 23 be doing outside his working hours, both part-time 24 employees and full-time employees? 25 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) We rely on the candidates</p>

Page 57	Page 59
<p>1 to make their own declarations in good faith and they 2 would provide the information.</p> <p>3 MR PETER DUNCAN: So there's a check when a person commences 4 his employment. What, say, he's been working with the 5 company for five years or so: is there any ongoing 6 declaration such as this, or any other measure to 7 understand what, for example, a part-time driver might 8 be doing in other forms of employment?</p> <p>9 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Internally, we have a staff 10 handbook, and there is a requirement that if a staff 11 member engages in part-time work outside, it must be 12 declared.</p> <p>13 MR PETER DUNCAN: So it depends solely on what an employee 14 would choose to tell you; is that the situation?</p> <p>15 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Our staff are obliged. The 16 rules are there in the staff handbook and they must be 17 complied with.</p> <p>18 MR PETER DUNCAN: What measures are taken to audit and 19 enforce the rules which are in the handbook in this 20 respect?</p> <p>21 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) If the rules are not 22 followed, and if we find that a staff member engages in 23 work outside, there would be sanctions, and in the past 24 there were cases in which bus captains were dismissed 25 for this reason.</p>	<p>1 Mr Duncan, do you happen to know, just so we can have 2 a quick look at it?</p> <p>3 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) If I can find that, I would 4 provide the page number.</p> <p>5 MR PETER DUNCAN: I've got the annex number but not the 6 page number. It's annex 1a-iii-7, I think. Sorry, that 7 would be the outdoor operations staff handbook; is that 8 it?</p> <p>9 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) In bundle KMB-8, page 3072, 10 point 1. 11 (In English) In English version, 3042.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Yes, thank you. 13 This of course refers to full-time employees, does 14 it not?</p> <p>15 MR GODWIN SO: Yes.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: So is there a provision that applies to part-time 17 employees?</p> <p>18 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) As we said, our bus 19 captains who work 18 hours a week for four continuous 20 weeks would be considered full-time employees. That's 21 why they have to follow the requirement under 1.8.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: But prior to the Tai Po accident, when you were 23 recruiting part-time captains, was there a requirement 24 that they declare their employment elsewhere, if they 25 engaged in that after they had first been employed?</p>
Page 58	Page 60
<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Is there any checking mechanism, due diligence, 2 as it were?</p> <p>3 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) No.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>5 MR PETER DUNCAN: Do you have any initiatives to change this 6 situation whereby the company undertakes some sort of 7 checking system as to what other employment activities 8 an employee may be involved in?</p> <p>9 MR GODWIN SO: (Chinese words not interpreted).</p> <p>10 MR PETER DUNCAN: We requested yesterday --</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: We didn't get a translation of the answer.</p> <p>12 MR GODWIN SO: Yes, we will consider, actively consider.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>14 MR PETER DUNCAN: We did not receive last evening -- this is 15 by way of a reminder -- a copy of any employment 16 contract. Is that still to come?</p> <p>17 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Yes, we will provide that.</p> <p>18 MR PETER DUNCAN: I want to ask you to turn now, please, to 19 page 109.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Before you do that -- are you moving away from 21 this topic?</p> <p>22 MR PETER DUNCAN: Yes, I am.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: You mentioned the staff handbook, and certainly 24 I've seen the provision you're talking about. Do you 25 happen to know the reference for it in our bundles, or</p>	<p>1 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) No.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>3 MR PETER DUNCAN: What about the former employees who are 4 now allowed to work between 10 hours and 18 hours? Are 5 they regarded as full-time employees or are they 6 part-time employees?</p> <p>7 MR GODWIN SO: Full-time.</p> <p>8 MR PETER DUNCAN: So would they be aware of this, if they 9 read this provision? Full-time employees, et cetera, 10 et cetera, would they regard themselves as full-time 11 employees if they read this handbook?</p> <p>12 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) They were once our 13 employees, after they retired they were re-engaged, and 14 therefore they were aware of the provision 1.8.</p> <p>15 MR PETER DUNCAN: Do you have any intention to amend 1.8 to 16 reflect these new employment arrangements?</p> <p>17 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Yes.</p> <p>18 MR PETER DUNCAN: If I could take you back, please, to KMB-1 19 at page 109. We have here considerable detail with 20 regard to the remuneration of bus captains, and the 21 first thing I would bring to your attention with regard 22 to the monthly rates is the distinction between those 23 employed before 2004 and those employed after 2004. 24 Could you just amplify why there is this 25 distinction?</p>

Page 61	Page 63
<p>1 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) First of all, some history. 2 In 2003, Hong Kong's economy took a hit because of SARS, 3 and in 2003 the company did not recruit new bus captains 4 and the bus operations declined that year. After 2004, 5 we started hiring bus captains again. Based on the 6 market pay level at that time, we adjusted the 7 remuneration of new bus captains to reflect market 8 changes. 9 So, for monthly-rated captains, there were two 10 types. The first type, BCs employed before 2004, their 11 remuneration would not change, but for those employed 12 after 2004, based on the job market and economic 13 environment, we paid remuneration based on market 14 prices. So there are two types of BCs. 15 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you. 16 If we move down to item (E), the split shift duty 17 allowance, does this reflect an allowance paid in 18 respect of the split shifts which are now provided for 19 in the 2018 guidelines? 20 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) If you pause here, the 2018 21 guidelines are to be implemented in the first quarter of 22 2019. Currently, we are following the government 23 guidelines talking about 14 hours a day, out of which 24 11 hours for driving duties; in other words, three hours 25 for rest. Currently, we have got colleagues on split</p>	<p>1 a monthly-rated BC, and if he is on a split shift duty, 2 he will be on such a duty for the whole month. 3 MR PETER DUNCAN: So how many days in a month would you 4 expect a driver to work? Say, would it be 27 days out 5 of 30 or 31? 6 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) A rest day for every six 7 days. So assuming that we haven't got a public holiday, 8 then for a 30-day month he has to work 26 days. 9 MR PETER DUNCAN: And that would entitle him to \$1,951.50 in 10 addition? 11 MR GODWIN SO: Yes. 12 MR PETER DUNCAN: Right. Would you have drivers who work 13 split shifts for less than the whole month, say for five 14 days or for ten days? 15 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) It's possible. 16 MR PETER DUNCAN: So what sort of allowance would they 17 receive? Do they get the whole 1,951 or is there 18 a proportion? 19 MR GODWIN SO: Proportion. 20 MR PETER DUNCAN: Is that based on a daily proportion or 21 what? How is that calculated? 22 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Depending on the number of 23 days worked for that month and then for how many days he 24 has been doing split shift duty and then that would be 25 multiplied by the figure of 1,950-plus, and then that's</p>
Page 62	Page 64
<p>1 duties. When somebody is assigned split duties, he will 2 be drawing an allowance measuring \$1,950-plus. In 3 between, he has three hours' rest, and we cover that 4 period by using this allowance. 5 CHAIRMAN: So currently you are following the 2010 6 guidelines? 7 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Correct. 8 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 9 MR PETER DUNCAN: Do you envisage having split shift duties 10 once the new guidelines are implemented? 11 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) We will consider as to how 12 it will be revised. Since there will be the need to 13 consult the staff -- well, we will certainly consider, 14 but it is difficult to tell how it would be revised. 15 Yes, there will be. 16 MR PETER DUNCAN: There will be some split shifts? 17 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Yes. 18 MR PETER DUNCAN: And will that allowance be the same or 19 will that change? 20 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) We will consider 21 enhancement. 22 MR PETER DUNCAN: How is that calculated -- when you say 23 \$1,951.50 a month, a driver would not be on a split 24 shift for a whole month, would he? 25 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) No, because in the case of</p>	<p>1 the amount of his split shift duty allowance. 2 MR PETER DUNCAN: So approximately how much per day does 3 that amount to, approximately? 4 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Roughly \$70. 5 MR PETER DUNCAN: If we go over to page 111, we can see at 6 table 3 the daily-rated salary provisions, and we see 7 the split shift duty allowance here at item (H). That 8 is a sum of \$21.90, and I notice at (H) it's provided 9 for on an hourly basis. So if a person is on a split 10 shift for one hour, presumably he gets paid an extra 11 \$21.90; if he is on a split shift where he has a rest 12 time of three hours, presumably he gets \$60. Is that 13 the way it's calculated? 14 MR GODWIN SO: Yes. 15 MR PETER DUNCAN: So there is a difference in the treatment 16 between the monthly-rated and the daily-rated bus 17 drivers with regard to the split shift duty allowance; 18 is that correct? 19 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) You have to take a holistic 20 view. You can't just look at the split shift duty 21 allowance. For daily-rated BCs, they have a higher 22 basic salary. So it is right to say that there is 23 a difference, but then you have to look at the whole 24 picture. 25 MR PETER DUNCAN: In the event that the company utilises the</p>

Page 65	Page 67
<p>1 new guidelines and engages in split shift duties, will 2 this allowance also be reviewed, will this be a matter 3 of review? 4 MR GODWIN SO: Yes. 5 MR PETER DUNCAN: I wonder if we could turn up the new 6 guidelines, please. We find these in KMB-2 at page 61. 7 And in fact the previous guidelines, those currently 8 in force, are happily on the previous page, at page 60. 9 You can see the two together. 10 Currently, what is a typical shift as opposed to 11 a split shift, currently? 12 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) If I may talk about it 13 briefly. There are usually two types of shifts: first 14 of all, what we call the straight duty or the straight 15 shift. So maybe you work for eight hours or ten hours, 16 or it could be 12 hours. So I'm talking about the 17 working hours. 18 Then we have about 23 per cent of our BCs who are on 19 special duties, so the split duty that Mr Duncan 20 referred to, the working hours would not exceed 14. 21 MR PETER DUNCAN: So with regard to the new guidelines, are 22 you able to indicate to the committee whether there is 23 likely to be any material change to what you have just 24 described? 25 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Under the new</p>	<p>1 would never force any colleagues to take up any special 2 or split shift duties. All bus captains who are on such 3 split shift duties do so on a voluntary basis. 4 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) If I may add a point. The 5 dynamics are such that as far as KMB is concerned, we 6 cover a large catchment area. During the morning peak 7 hours, by 6 or 7 am in the morning, it is already the 8 start of the morning peak and the demand is huge, and 9 then the peak will come up again at about 6, 7 or 8. So 10 it's like two humps for the peak periods. Someone may 11 live in Tuen Mun. After the morning peak period, the 12 bus captain can go home and then come back for the 13 evening duties. So there is this geographical factor. 14 So some of them are like that, and that's the 15 minority, and they do have such a need. 16 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) All in all speaking, for 17 BCs on split shift duties, as Mr Lee has pointed out, we 18 need to cover the morning peak as well as the evening 19 peak. 20 KMB is in a unique position because we do cover 21 a large area, and we have got four main depots, and we 22 have also got satellite depots. For BCs on split shift 23 duties, well, indeed, they may go home to take a rest in 24 the middle of their shift, for those few hours involved. 25 MR PETER DUNCAN: Given the remuneration rates that we have</p>
<p>1 guidelines, for straight duties, the working hours will 2 not exceed 12, out of which the driving hours should not 3 exceed 10 hours. There isn't any obvious difference. 4 But then for the split duties, I think relatively 5 speaking the difference is greater. This is because, 6 according to the Transport Department's guidelines, for 7 the special duty, that is the split duty, the working 8 hours should still be no more than 14 hours. But then, 9 for the driving hours, the driving hours must not exceed 10 10 hours. 11 So, when compared with the current guidelines, for 12 the current guidelines, not exceeding 11; under the 13 revised guidelines, the driving hours would be one hour 14 short. 15 Then there is another feature. Under the new 16 guidelines, for the split duty BCs, the bus captains 17 must have a rest break of no less than three hours and 18 on a continuous basis. 19 So that's the main difference. 20 MR PETER DUNCAN: What are the dynamics? Are there persons 21 who want to work the split shifts as they are at the 22 moment, in order to earn more money, or is it 23 a situation where the company has to order drivers to 24 work those split shifts? 25 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) For our company, we</p>	<p>1 seen, will the new guidelines, if they are adopted, with 2 reduction in the maximum working hours and the 3 requirement for rest times -- will they result in some 4 of your drivers receiving less by way of remuneration? 5 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) To answer your question, 6 if we don't consider the remuneration -- in other words, 7 if the remuneration package is the same, if we simply 8 look at the driving hours -- it may be the case that 9 some BCs may have a reduced take-home pay. But then, as 10 Mr So has said, in fact we are actively considering 11 measures, in particular how we are able to enhance the 12 allowance covering the rest break, so that for BCs, 13 especially those on split shift duties, they have more 14 rest time but more -- they would not be suffering from 15 a reduction in their take-home pay. The management and 16 chairman asked us to consider this. 17 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Mr Duncan, the board has made a direction 18 to the management to the effect that in respect of the 19 split duty shift drivers, although they would be working 20 10 hours instead of 11 hours per day, their remuneration 21 should not be less favourable, let me put it that way. 22 MR PETER DUNCAN: Has that been communicated to the bus 23 captains? 24 DR NORMAN LEUNG: In fact, this is stated in our action plan 25 for the recommendation, and I think the management has</p>
Page 66	Page 68

Page 69	Page 71
<p>1 already talked to the trade unions.</p> <p>2 Perhaps Mr Pang can elaborate on that.</p> <p>3 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Mr Duncan, I touched</p> <p>4 base with representatives of staff unions, and the</p> <p>5 depots also convey such messages to the bus captains,</p> <p>6 that our management would actively look to optimise the</p> <p>7 remuneration package so that even with the new</p> <p>8 guidelines the take-home salaries of bus captains would</p> <p>9 not be less. So the captains are positive about this.</p> <p>10 DR NORMAN LEUNG: May I also add that if their working hours</p> <p>11 are reduced from 11 to 10, then we may also consider</p> <p>12 whether it is necessary to have 14 hours a day, when it</p> <p>13 can be changed from 14 hours to 13 hours. Although this</p> <p>14 is permitted by the Transport Department, to have 14</p> <p>15 working hours per day, we will review that, and our</p> <p>16 intention is to reduce the working hours from 14 to 13.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>18 Mr Duncan, am I correct in recalling that that is</p> <p>19 what we have been told in evidence that Citybus will be</p> <p>20 doing, that the split shift which they don't operate at</p> <p>21 the moment but which they will implement will only be</p> <p>22 a maximum of 13 hours?</p> <p>23 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Yes.</p> <p>24 MR PETER DUNCAN: I believe that is a correct recollection,</p> <p>25 Mr Chairman.</p>	<p>1 who begin their rest period at a bus station rather than</p> <p>2 a depot? I ask that question because the secretariat</p> <p>3 and I have visited bus stations and the Tuen Mun Bus</p> <p>4 Depot and we are aware of the difference in the</p> <p>5 facilities available.</p> <p>6 So the question is what proportion of bus captains</p> <p>7 working special shifts commence their period of rest at</p> <p>8 a bus station.</p> <p>9 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) We will come back and</p> <p>10 identify these figures. We do have such figures. They</p> <p>11 take their rest at three places: one, at home; two, at</p> <p>12 bus stations; and three, at bus depots.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>14 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>15 Page 180 of TD-1, please. You will see at this</p> <p>16 page an extract from the forward planning programme for</p> <p>17 the years 2018 to 2022, submitted by the company to the</p> <p>18 Transport Department. If I understand correctly, this</p> <p>19 is one of the requirements of the franchise, that such</p> <p>20 a programme be provided each year to the Transport</p> <p>21 Department, and I believe this is the latest one that is</p> <p>22 available. Is that correct?</p> <p>23 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) The latest forward planning</p> <p>24 programme was for 2019 to 2023, and it will be submitted</p> <p>25 on 17 August. It is ready for submission by early next</p>
Page 70	Page 72
<p>1 If I could just have that confirmed through the</p> <p>2 action plan, Dr Leung. If I can refer you, please, to</p> <p>3 KMB-1 at page 149. Is that reflected in item 12 on</p> <p>4 page 149?</p> <p>5 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Yes, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>6 DR NORMAN LEUNG: On the right-hand side.</p> <p>7 MR PETER DUNCAN: That is what is meant by that last</p> <p>8 paragraph; is that correct?</p> <p>9 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Exactly.</p> <p>10 MR PETER DUNCAN: Yes, thank you.</p> <p>11 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Thank you, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>12 MR PETER DUNCAN: I have just been handed a note,</p> <p>13 Mr Chairman, that that evidence from Citybus appears at</p> <p>14 Day 4 of the transcript, page 75, lines 1 to 6.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>16 MR PETER DUNCAN: Moving on, gentlemen, to page 180, please</p> <p>17 this time of TD-1.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: Before you do that, before you move on -- Mr Lee,</p> <p>19 you told us about the rest pattern of bus captains</p> <p>20 working split shift hours, where they take that longer</p> <p>21 period of rest. You said that a minority of them are</p> <p>22 able to go home.</p> <p>23 MR ROGER LEE: Yes.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: Can you help us with, in rough terms, the</p> <p>25 proportion of bus captains driving these split shifts</p>	<p>1 week. So this is the latest programme submitted.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: So when was this submitted, the one we are</p> <p>3 looking at?</p> <p>4 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) It was submitted in June</p> <p>5 2017.</p> <p>6 MR PETER DUNCAN: This portion of the forward planning</p> <p>7 programme concerns the matter of bus safety.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Before we move on, you are going to be submitting</p> <p>9 one on or by 17 August of this year; is that right?</p> <p>10 MR GODWIN SO: Yes.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: Would you please provide the relevant chapters of</p> <p>12 that report to the committee?</p> <p>13 MR GODWIN SO: Yes.</p> <p>14 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>15 If we look at bus safety -- it is referred to as</p> <p>16 clause 8 of the forward planning programme, and I wish</p> <p>17 to bring your attention, please, to paragraph 8.2, which</p> <p>18 is concerned with the analysis of bus accidents in the</p> <p>19 past two calendar years.</p> <p>20 If I could bring your attention in particular,</p> <p>21 please, to page 181, and the "Accident rate by bus</p> <p>22 captain age". Have you made the point in that paragraph</p> <p>23 that the results show that younger bus captains are more</p> <p>24 prone to higher accident rates, mainly due to the fact</p> <p>25 that these bus captains have relatively less bus driving</p>

Page 73	Page 75
<p>1 experience and they are more prone to accidents in their 2 first few months of service? Is that a point which is 3 made on page 181? 4 MR GODWIN SO: Yes. 5 MR PETER DUNCAN: Then if you turn the page to 182, is there 6 a similar point made in clause 8.2.4? 7 "The results of an analysis on accident rate by 8 experience in terms of years of service ... are shown in 9 figure 8.3. As mentioned above, the likelihood of 10 an accident occurring in the first year immediately 11 following recruitment is relatively higher." 12 CHAIRMAN: Is that what's stated there? 13 MR PETER DUNCAN: Is that what's stated? 14 MR GODWIN SO: Yes. 15 MR PETER DUNCAN: Are there any particular provisions made 16 to meet what seems to be this trend with regard to what 17 happens at the commencement of the career of a bus 18 captain? 19 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) I do not quite get what you 20 mean. 21 MR PETER DUNCAN: If I could give you something from my own 22 experience. When I was a young boy and travelled 23 regularly to school on a bus, the bus driver often had 24 a co-bus driver with him, sitting with him, giving him 25 tips and so forth. Is there any sort of provision like</p>	<p>1 days of work, and on the seventh and 16th day, the buddy 2 drivers would accompany these new bus drivers in their 3 driving duties. 4 For our part-time captains, again we would assign 5 buddy drivers, but for part-time captains recruited in 6 the past, they all held class 10 and class 17 licences, 7 in other words licences for buses and franchised buses. 8 So our buddy drivers would accompany them on their first 9 day of work. 10 Earlier this year, we introduced a buddy inspector 11 programme. For each new bus captain we would assign 12 a designated inspector who would liaise with the bus 13 captain and we also prepared cue cards, containing the 14 contacts of our inspectors as well as the phone numbers 15 of depot managers, assistant depot managers and 16 operations officers. 17 So apart from driving skills, our buddy inspectors 18 can provide holistic support, so you can consider them 19 mentors. If bus captains run into any questions or 20 doubts, they can approach the buddy inspector. That 21 way, we hope the new bus captains can familiarise 22 themselves in the job as soon as possible, and like 23 Mr So said, for all our new bus captains, after they are 24 on the job for three months, we would arrange a workshop 25 for them, and all depot managers, driving instructors</p>
<p>1 that within the company? 2 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Yes. We realise the 3 figures you pointed out. The new bus captains are often 4 younger, and in the initial period there would be 5 a buddy bus captain to accompany them, to reinforce 6 their confidence and familiarise the bus captains with 7 the roads, and so that they know how to deal with 8 passengers. At around the third month, there would be 9 a workshop for bus captains so that they can share their 10 experience as a bus captain. We hope that new bus 11 captains would be able to familiarise themselves with 12 the work environment and minimise occurrences of 13 accidents, or accident rates. 14 MR PETER DUNCAN: How long have these buddies been 15 operating? 16 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Mr Duncan, perhaps 17 I would briefly introduce these buddy drivers or buddy 18 inspectors and their work. 19 For all full-time bus captains and half-time bus 20 captains, for example, the housewives as mentioned by 21 Mr Duncan, they might work four hours a day and five or 22 six days a week, they are considered half-time drivers. 23 After the bus captains complete two phases of training 24 at our captain training school, we would assign buddy 25 drivers on a full-time basis for the first and second</p>	<p>1 and myself would attend the workshop to check with the 2 bus captains to identify the difficulties they 3 encountered in the first three months. 4 Then every time we would invite a very experienced 5 bus captain to share tips as to how to cope with the 6 daily work. So, for a new bus captain who has three 7 months' experience, he will certainly go through such 8 a process. 9 MR PETER DUNCAN: Yes. My question was: when did these 10 buddies first start operating? 11 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) For the concept of the 12 buddy driver, it was conceived in the year 2013 and it 13 has undergone enhancement all the time. 14 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you. 15 CHAIRMAN: Mr Duncan, if that's not inconvenient, we will 16 take our luncheon adjournment now. 17 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you, Chairman. 18 CHAIRMAN: Gentlemen, we will adjourn now and resume at 2.30 19 this afternoon. Thank you. 20 (1.01 pm) 21 (The luncheon adjournment) 22 (2.30 pm) 23 CHAIRMAN: Good afternoon, gentlemen. 24 Mr Duncan. 25 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p>
Page 74	Page 76

Page 77	Page 79
<p>1 Gentlemen, could I ask you please to be at page 180 2 of TD-1.</p> <p>3 Before the lunch break, I had taken you through to 4 page 182. Could you now please turn to page 183, where 5 we have analysis by the company of accidents by nature.</p> <p>6 If I could just ask you a few questions, please, 7 arising from table 8.1. We have the first column, 8 referring to "Passenger loss of balance"; percentage, 9 51.5 per cent.</p> <p>10 There is another heading further down the table, 11 "Injury to passenger inside bus". What is the 12 distinction between those two headings?</p> <p>13 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) For "passenger loss of 14 balance", it means the passenger doesn't hold the 15 handrail and he loses balance. And "injury to passenger 16 inside bus" means there is an accident and the passenger 17 is inside the bus, and the passenger is injured just 18 sitting there, not loss of balance, and he is injured 19 due to the accident.</p> <p>20 MR PETER DUNCAN: How would a passenger just sitting there 21 receive an injury? How does that happen?</p> <p>22 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Let's say there's 23 an accident, a collision, and the passenger is sitting 24 there inside the bus, and let's say the bus rolls over, 25 and then the sitting passenger is injured, so that would</p>	<p>1 the cause of those accidents?</p> <p>2 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) Passenger losing balance 3 can be due to a number of reasons. One of them might be 4 that the driver is not quite aware of the passenger 5 situation, whether he has already been standing there 6 properly or has taken a seat, or maybe the bus captain 7 is not driving the bus properly. We talked about 8 acceleration or harsh braking a few days ago, and that 9 can be another cause. Sometimes, after alighting a bus, 10 the passenger doesn't -- boarding the bus, rather, after 11 boarding the bus, the passenger doesn't hold the 12 handrail and when the driver has to take some evasive 13 action of driving, the passenger then loses his balance.</p> <p>14 MR PETER DUNCAN: The second item, "Head on/tail collision", 15 13.5 per cent --</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on, Mr Duncan -- when there is an 17 incident where a passenger loses balance and becomes 18 part of these statistics, over half of the injuries 19 involving buses, do you investigate the data available 20 to you as to deceleration and acceleration?</p> <p>21 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) In the case of a passenger 22 losing balance, we would investigate into whether there 23 is an acceleration or deceleration on the part of the 24 bus captain. So the short answer is yes. And also the 25 CCTV can also capture what happened on board the bus.</p>
<p>1 mean injury to passenger inside bus.</p> <p>2 MR PETER DUNCAN: I don't want to be picky but we have 3 a different percentage for a bus which rolls over, the 4 last heading. Would it not be covered under that?</p> <p>5 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) Maybe I can give you 6 another example. A passenger can still get injured 7 while sitting inside bus. For example, when the bus 8 brushes against some trees or tree branches and the 9 passenger is injured. So it's a different category from 10 the passenger loss of balance category.</p> <p>11 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Last month, there was 12 a case in Central, the bus was on the road and suddenly 13 the bottom of the bus deck was hit by protruding 14 concrete.</p> <p>15 MR PETER DUNCAN: So do I understand correctly that the 16 company has set out these categories and in the case of 17 an accident there will be a classification according to 18 the categories which are here listed?</p> <p>19 MR GODWIN SO: Yes.</p> <p>20 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>21 The passenger loss of balance, 51.5 per cent. At 22 8.2.7, there is a reference to the fact that more than 23 half of these cases were caused by bus braking in 24 traffic. Do you have any information for the committee 25 with regard to the other half or so of these cases as to</p>	<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Do you do the investigation -- let me ask the 2 question neutrally. What data do you use to investigate 3 deceleration or acceleration?</p> <p>4 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) As we have discussed, the 5 black box will record the relevant data, and we can have 6 access to such data on our server, and then we know 7 whether the bus captain suddenly accelerates or brakes, 8 decelerates the bus harshly.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Do you have statistics that are the result of 10 these investigations, for example the rate of 11 deceleration or acceleration?</p> <p>12 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) We don't have formal 13 statistics on this issue.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: Why not?</p> <p>15 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) If there is a case of this 16 nature, we would handle the irregular driving behaviour 17 of the bus captain, but no record is kept about the 18 analysis.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: But half of the injuries on your buses are caused 20 by this factor alone.</p> <p>21 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) I agree that records should 22 be kept, but it's in relation to 2015/2016, we cannot 23 provide any statistics for that period. But I will 24 check that if in the new system, we would see if we can 25 keep statistics about acceleration or deceleration in</p>
Page 78	Page 80

Page 81	Page 83
<p>1 respect of cases involving passengers losing balance. 2 CHAIRMAN: Are you doing that at the moment, 2018? 3 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) We can do it. 4 CHAIRMAN: But have you done it, past tense? 5 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) I don't know at this 6 moment. 7 CHAIRMAN: But you can do it? 8 MR GODWIN SO: Yes. 9 CHAIRMAN: Do you know how many passengers have been injured 10 by loss of balance so far this year, approximately? 11 MR GODWIN SO: 300. 12 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 13 Presumably, when you investigate the circumstances 14 in which a passenger has been injured through loss of 15 balance, you have available the data from the black box 16 which you can obtain on the server, but you also have 17 the data from your various cameras on the bus? 18 MR JAMES WONG: Correct. 19 CHAIRMAN: So by a combination of the technological devices 20 you have available, you can determine reasonably, 21 perhaps, whether or not the braking was justified? 22 MR JAMES WONG: Correct. 23 CHAIRMAN: Do you keep any statistics as to that? 24 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) As I said, we would 25 investigate into such cases, but the records, the data</p>	<p>1 to table 8.2, we have again the same "Accidents by 2 nature", but this time not percentages, actually the 3 number of accidents. 4 Now, the chairman asked with respect to "passenger 5 loss of balance" whether the number of passengers 6 affected is recorded, and my understanding is that you 7 said that so far, for 2018, the passenger loss of 8 balance number would be 350. Is that correct? 9 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) It's 300, approximately 10 300. I'm speaking from memory. 11 MR PETER DUNCAN: Approximately 300, yes, thank you. 12 Is it possible for you, from your records, to go 13 down the columns and indicate the numbers of persons 14 affected by each of these accidents? 15 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) We are talking about the 16 number of cases here, the data are not kept in this 17 table. 18 CHAIRMAN: No. Table 8.2 simply describes the number of 19 accidents. There might have been 1,000 passengers who 20 lost their balance; is that what you are saying? 21 MR GODWIN SO: I agree. I know what you mean. 22 (Via interpreter) Yes, I agree, but there is no 23 number for the passengers, but we can have the figures 24 for 2018. 25 CHAIRMAN: Both of the number of accidents, 300,</p>
Page 82	Page 84
<p>1 of the investigation, are not kept. 2 CHAIRMAN: You don't keep a simple statistic like 445 3 persons injured but the braking was justified in 300 4 cases? Nothing as simple as that? 5 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) Well, we have the data but 6 we don't transform such data into so-called statistics. 7 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Maybe I can supplement 8 here. All accidents will be looked into, and we would 9 categorise cases into whether the bus captains should be 10 held responsible or not, and whether the sudden braking 11 is justified by the traffic conditions. Of course we 12 can carry out more analysis. 13 CHAIRMAN: But presumably, when you do that, you must keep 14 statistics? 15 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) I believe the data are 16 there, but of course we can go back and do some analysis 17 to seek further improvement. 18 CHAIRMAN: Well, isn't it an important tool, to monitor the 19 behaviour of bus drivers, to know whether or not the 20 deceleration was harsh, and from your investigation it 21 was unnecessary? 22 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) I agree with you. 23 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr Duncan. 24 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you, Chairman. 25 Just leaving table 8.1 for a moment and going down</p>	<p>1 approximately, and you can then also provide us with the 2 number of passengers who lost their balance? 3 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Yes, I can do that. 4 CHAIRMAN: It might have been all of those standing up who 5 might have lost their balance? 6 MR GODWIN SO: Yes. 7 CHAIRMAN: Would you please provide us with that 8 information, for 2018? 9 MR ROGER LEE: Yes. 10 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Yes, we will do that. 11 MR PETER DUNCAN: Can you do that for each of the columns 12 thereunder? 13 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) I will try, but I may have 14 difficulty, because these have to do with 2015-2016, but 15 we can provide case numbers and also passenger numbers 16 for 2018 with regard to loss of balance accidents. 17 MR PETER DUNCAN: Yes. I'm only concerned about 2018. But 18 say -- you've got a heading there, "Bus 19 overturn/topple", there's just one accident -- can the 20 number of passengers injured by that be easily 21 ascertained? 22 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Yes. There is only one 23 case. Certainly we can look up the figures. 24 MR PETER DUNCAN: And likewise, hit a street object or a 25 vehicle or an animal, there are 27 accidents, is it</p>

Page 85	Page 87
<p>1 possible for you easily to retrieve the number of 2 persons injured by that?</p> <p>3 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Yes, we can do that.</p> <p>4 MR PETER DUNCAN: I would be grateful if that can be 5 supplied when you supply the records for 2018.</p> <p>6 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) Yes.</p> <p>7 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>8 Just going back to get a further understanding of 9 these charts, the second heading is "Head on/tail 10 collision". We have another heading further down the 11 chart, "Collision with other vehicle (rolling 12 back/forward/reversing)". What is the distinction 13 between those two? I notice the first one is 14 responsible for 13.5 per cent of accidents. What is the 15 distinction?</p> <p>16 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) For head-on/tail 17 collision, usually we look at static objects, and if 18 there is head-on/tail collision then we classify it as 19 this.</p> <p>20 The second collision column, very often it is 21 because we changed lanes and that leads to collision 22 between vehicles, and then we would classify it as 23 collision with other vehicles in lane-changing.</p> <p>24 MR PETER DUNCAN: So that's the distinction between the 25 second heading and the third heading?</p>	<p>1 least two of you, I think, and that's the subject of 2 illegal parking.</p> <p>3 The committee has heard not only from you but also 4 from previous witnesses that this is very much a safety 5 hazard, and I think this morning one of you gentlemen 6 assisted the committee by indicating what steps you had 7 taken with regard to this, in particular reports to 8 different government departments, but without any 9 apparent improvement in the situation.</p> <p>10 Could you look, please, at miscellaneous 11 bundle number 2, at page 644. In fact, I think the 12 document starts at page 643, and runs into page 644, and 13 with a translation at 644-1, which continues on 14 page 644-2.</p> <p>15 You will see this is a document received by the 16 committee from the persons from the Democratic Alliance, 17 and if I could turn to the second page of the 18 translation -- in fact, I think at the bottom of the 19 first page of the translation, 644-1, we have this 20 opinion expressed:</p> <p>21 "To eradicate illegal parking at bus stops, it must 22 be dealt with from its roots and by formulating suitable 23 policies, revising the outdated laws. The problem can 24 only be resolved by multipronged measures."</p> <p>25 It continues to say:</p>
Page 86	Page 88
<p>1 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) Correct.</p> <p>2 MR PETER DUNCAN: What about the heading further down, 3 "Collision with other vehicle (rolling 4 back/forward/reversing)"; what's the distinction with 5 that?</p> <p>6 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) Sometimes vehicles would 7 reverse and that leads to collision, then it would be 8 classified as this one.</p> <p>9 MR PETER DUNCAN: Going back up, "J/O collision" at 10 6 per cent and 48 incidents in 2016. What is a "J/O" 11 collision?</p> <p>12 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) This means junction, 13 junction collision.</p> <p>14 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you. And further down, "Entering 15 R/A collision"; what does that refer to?</p> <p>16 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) It's a roundabout, 17 entering roundabout collision.</p> <p>18 MR PETER DUNCAN: When you supply the statistics with regard 19 to 2018 with regard to the number of passengers 20 affected, could you also distinguish between persons 21 injured and fatalities?</p> <p>22 MR JAMES WONG: (Via interpreter) Yes.</p> <p>23 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>24 I wish to turn to another subject now, and that is 25 a matter which has been referred to this morning by at</p>	<p>1 "Suggestion 1: Following Singapore and installing 2 cameras on all bus fleets. Singapore has since 2008 3 installed cameras on buses and the cameras are installed 4 next to the driver's seats. When drivers discover cars 5 parking inside the bus stop, they can press the button 6 and record a video of 5-10 minutes. The bus companies 7 will then hand the recording to the police, thereafter 8 the police can review the recording and in around two 9 weeks' time the ticket will be sent to the car owner's 10 home. Each penalty ticket costs nearly [\$800], there is 11 additional charge of [\$5,000] and imprisonment of 3 12 months for late payment of penalty.</p> <p>13 For the first year, Singapore has recorded 2112 14 incidents of drivers driving into the bus lanes or bus 15 stops to pick up and drop off customers. For 2014, the 16 number of cases of driving into the bus lanes and 17 illegal parking has already reduced to 886, it has 18 successfully deterred most drivers not to stop at the 19 bus stops."</p> <p>20 Now, we have heard evidence already that the company 21 installs a camera which is I think directed towards the 22 driver's seat, and there is also a camera which is 23 a forward-looking camera, described I think in the 24 submissions as a surveillance camera.</p> <p>25 Could I ask, first of all, presently, are either of</p>

Page 89	Page 91
<p>1 those cameras used to record cars which are illegally 2 parked or vehicles which are illegally parked, at the 3 moment? 4 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Mr Duncan, my short 5 answer is no. However, if you would allow me, I can 6 supplement. 7 MR PETER DUNCAN: Please. 8 CHAIRMAN: Yes, please do. 9 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Regarding the recorded 10 clip being given to the police for the purpose of 11 prosecuting against illegal parking, in October/November 12 last year I started to do it, because I was responsible 13 for Lai Chi Kok Depot at that time, and it was a pilot 14 scheme that was agreed with the police, and we took that 15 approach in order to report cars that were illegally 16 parked at bus stops. 17 CHAIRMAN: So what did you do? 18 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) What we did was, I used 19 one trial location and that is in Tsim Sha Tsui, on 20 Canton Road, at bus terminus 271, we used that route 21 which travels from Lai Chi Kok Depot to Sha Tin Depot, 22 because at that terminus there was always illegal 23 parking, and also, at Canton Road, you call it the 24 luxury shop street, actually there is a high traffic 25 volume there, and at that time I was the general manager</p>	<p>1 regions, and the police is doing that now. 2 Therefore, Mr Duncan, my short answer is we do not 3 use our on-board CCTV for prosecution, but in our pilot 4 scheme, together with what the police are doing, and 5 also we can see that there is more prosecution and fines 6 being meted out for illegal parking at bus terminus. 7 Thank you. 8 CHAIRMAN: Why don't you use the on-board, rolling-all-day, 9 CCTV cameras? 10 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Well, we can do that, 11 but in that pilot scheme, it would be more convenient, 12 because our inspectors would be driving a patrol vehicle 13 to patrol the area, and if they use their mobile phones 14 it would be more convenient. 15 But of course, Chairman, if -- well, in the on-board 16 CCTV we can also do recording, we can do that. 17 CHAIRMAN: Presumably, it would be very simple to have 18 a button that would keep a log of the time at which 19 someone should view the CCTV? 20 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) You are correct, 21 Chairman. If we can reduce illegal parking, we will 22 certainly do that. 23 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr Duncan. 24 MR PETER DUNCAN: So I take it from the scheme that you have 25 described, this has brought some improvement to the</p>
Page 90	Page 92
<p>1 of Lai Chi Kok Depot and I had a meeting with the 2 police. 3 I myself wrote a standard statement, a statement, 4 and then I asked my frontline inspectors that if they 5 should see illegal parking, we should use our mobile 6 phones to record a footage which, together with 7 a standard pro forma -- well, we will just record the 8 date and time. The location is already known because 9 that is the only trial location, and we would give it to 10 the traffic section of Kowloon West of the police for 11 prosecution. 12 We found that it was very effective, because when 13 prosecutions started I could see that on some social 14 media there were reports of this and that if you park at 15 bus stops, you might be prosecuted. And on Canton Road, 16 very often there is illegal parking, we would call the 17 police, but when the police come the cars would have 18 gone, and then the police would go and then the cars 19 would come back. So it was only tackling the symptoms 20 but not the root of the problem. 21 Therefore, we used our own initiative. We joined 22 hands with the police and we found that it was 23 effective, and you can see that recently the police have 24 also carried out two pilot schemes, and now the pilot 25 scheme has been expanded to all five land-based police</p>	<p>1 illegal parking problem? 2 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) If we are talking about 3 the terminus of 271 at Canton Road, then I would say 4 a significant improvement has been made. 5 MR PETER DUNCAN: Just with regard to that terminus? 6 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Because the police have 7 just launched the scheme, the full scheme, we have to 8 monitor the effectiveness now. 9 But as of yesterday, on the whole, illegal parking 10 has not really been improved significantly. That's not 11 what we have seen. 12 MR PETER DUNCAN: Is there any correspondence between KMB 13 and the police with regard to the pilot scheme that you 14 have described? 15 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) We have some emails, and 16 also we use the so-called standard pro forma, the 17 statement, in respect of the terminus of 271 at 18 Canton Road. I can hand over the information to the 19 committee. 20 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you. 21 CHAIRMAN: Please do so. 22 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) We will do that. 23 CHAIRMAN: That's the emails, communication with the police, 24 and your standard form. 25 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) No problem.</p>

Page 93	Page 95
<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>2 MR PETER DUNCAN: Do I understand correctly from your</p> <p>3 evidence that you will pursue the possibility of the</p> <p>4 system which is described as being in use in Singapore?</p> <p>5 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) We do have an open mind.</p> <p>6 We agree that we should do that.</p> <p>7 MR PETER DUNCAN: Sorry, when you say you have an open mind,</p> <p>8 are you going to look into it or not?</p> <p>9 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Yes, yes, we will follow</p> <p>10 up. We will look into that.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: You are complaining on the one hand of having</p> <p>12 a problem. This is a beyond belief simple way of</p> <p>13 solving it, is it not?</p> <p>14 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Chairman, the pilot</p> <p>15 scheme we launched for Canton Road last year was carried</p> <p>16 out when there was no precedent of basing a prosecution</p> <p>17 on just video footage. That never happened before the</p> <p>18 trial scheme.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: There are lots of prosecutions that are based on</p> <p>20 the use of video, CCTV evidence, are there not?</p> <p>21 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Yesterday, Chairman, you</p> <p>22 said I had worked for the police, and I have also worked</p> <p>23 in the traffic section of the police. So in respect of</p> <p>24 illegal parking, in the past there was no prosecution</p> <p>25 based on video footage. There might be prosecution for</p>	<p>1 If I could direct your attention to line 2 on</p> <p>2 page 153, Ms Wong has brought the witness's attention to</p> <p>3 the fact that his union had expressed concerns about the</p> <p>4 use of 12.8-metre-long buses that have a rear wheel</p> <p>5 steering function in Hong Kong.</p> <p>6 At line 13, you will see that Mr Lam Kam Piu makes</p> <p>7 this statement:</p> <p>8 "Because for 12.8 [metre] buses in light of the road</p> <p>9 conditions in Hong Kong, because we have narrow roads,</p> <p>10 and heavy pedestrian flow ... there is a hazard using</p> <p>11 very long buses."</p> <p>12 At line 17, he says this:</p> <p>13 "As for 12.8 [metre] bus[s] with the rear axle</p> <p>14 steering function, when manoeuvring a bend of course it</p> <p>15 would be very good for the driver. But for other</p> <p>16 vehicles they may not know that the bus comes with this</p> <p>17 rear wheel steering function, and the Transport</p> <p>18 Department would issue something to let the driver know</p> <p>19 that it has the function, but other drivers may not</p> <p>20 know. So when the rear axle steers during a bend, when</p> <p>21 another vehicle approaches very closely the back of the</p> <p>22 bus, the wheel would actually go outside its own lane,</p> <p>23 causing danger to the vehicle next to it."</p> <p>24 And Mr Lam continues right through to the middle of</p> <p>25 page 155.</p>
Page 94	Page 96
<p>1 jumping a red light and things like that.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: That might be a limitation of the police force or</p> <p>3 the Department of Justice, but there is no barrier in</p> <p>4 law to using that evidence.</p> <p>5 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) I agree. Earlier this</p> <p>6 year, I learned from the press reports that the police</p> <p>7 had started to do this based on video clipping, to</p> <p>8 prosecute illegal parking vehicles, and I'm talking</p> <p>9 about stationary vehicles, not those vehicles in motion</p> <p>10 involved in speeding or jumping red light, et cetera.</p> <p>11 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Mr Pang, I think we should do it on our</p> <p>12 own, take our own action, and see how the police respond</p> <p>13 to our action.</p> <p>14 I think, Mr Chairman, that's the action I'm going to</p> <p>15 direct my management to take.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Dr Leung.</p> <p>17 Yes, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>18 MR PETER DUNCAN: Gentlemen, could you turn up, please, the</p> <p>19 transcript for Day 11.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: In which bundle do you find that?</p> <p>21 MR PETER DUNCAN: Bundle 4.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: Whose evidence are we going to?</p> <p>23 MR PETER DUNCAN: This is the evidence of Mr Lam Kam Piu,</p> <p>24 who is a representative of the Federation of Bus</p> <p>25 Industry Trade Unions.</p>	<p>1 Could I ask this question: to what extent are</p> <p>2 12.8-metre buses used in Hong Kong; and secondly, does</p> <p>3 the company share the concern of Mr Lam that these may</p> <p>4 pose a hazard in some of the regions of narrow streets?</p> <p>5 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) 12.8-metre buses? We</p> <p>6 have them. KMB has these buses. Most are not</p> <p>7 rear-wheel steered. There are advantages. We did try</p> <p>8 such buses. We had some concerns, so we converted them</p> <p>9 to ordinary 12.8-metre buses. They are not rear-wheel</p> <p>10 steered.</p> <p>11 Of course, 12.8 metres means that these buses are</p> <p>12 longer, with a higher passenger capacity. We will use</p> <p>13 them for busy routes, especially long-haul routes, so</p> <p>14 that we can carry more passengers. That's helpful, to</p> <p>15 improve our services.</p> <p>16 It's longer than the 12-metre-long buses, but we</p> <p>17 would try them out first on the routes. The routes for</p> <p>18 which we would deploy such buses would be determined</p> <p>19 after carrying out tests in conjunction with the</p> <p>20 Transport Department. The deployment will come after</p> <p>21 the trials.</p> <p>22 So far, for KMB, we have some 200 buses,</p> <p>23 12.8-metre-long buses.</p> <p>24 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Maybe I can supplement.</p> <p>25 What is meant by the rear-wheel steering -- most are</p>

Page 97	Page 99
<p>1 front-wheel steering vehicles. They have three axles. 2 So, when the bus makes a turn into a bend or when 3 there's a sharp bend, the outward displacement would be 4 less serious. For the first batch, we only got one with 5 rear-wheel steering and our colleagues don't think 6 highly of that, so we stopped the use of this kind of 7 buses with rear-wheel steering. 8 CHAIRMAN: Mr Leung, you said you had some concerns about 9 rear-wheel steering. What were those concerns? Are 10 they the ones Mr Lee has just told us about? 11 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) The concerns are the 12 bus captains' concerns. The turning circle would be 13 smaller. But the characteristic of outswing would be 14 different. The outswing is bigger. That is, when you 15 negotiate a bend, you have to make some adjustment to 16 adapt to it. If you drive a rear-wheel steering this 17 day, and then tomorrow you drive another one which is 18 not rear-wheel steering, you need to do some adjustment 19 yourself. So that's the concern of bus captains. 20 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) It's not related to safety. 21 It's about the adaptability. 22 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 23 MR PETER DUNCAN: So, if I understand correctly, there are 24 no rear-wheel 12.8-metre buses now in the fleet? 25 CHAIRMAN: Rear-wheel steering.</p>	<p>1 appropriate to deploy such buses, and the bus captains 2 would have to learn to drive 12.8-metre-long buses, 3 before they really drive these buses. 4 So we would do it only if it is not a rear-wheel 5 steering 12.8-metre-bus and only when the bus captain 6 has been properly trained. 7 MR PETER DUNCAN: So are you aware of any particular issue 8 with any of the unions at the present time with regard 9 to this matter? 10 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) No. 11 MR PETER DUNCAN: I want you to go to another volume now, 12 this time TU-1(A). At page 84, you will see a copy of 13 a submission received by the committee from the KMB 14 Employees Union. The translation of that commences at 15 page 90-1. I am working on the translation and I wish 16 to refer you, please, to page 90-3, which refers to the 17 matter of facilities safety. 18 Do you have that? 19 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes. 20 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you. The union has said this to the 21 committee: 22 "In order to save repair cost, KMB has, since 2015, 23 inappropriately removed all defog heater installation, 24 causing the front window panel to have serious fogging 25 issue under cold and wet weather (when the difference</p>
Page 98	Page 100
<p>1 MR PETER DUNCAN: Rear-wheel steering, yes. 2 Is that correct? 3 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Correct. 4 MR PETER DUNCAN: With regard to the 12.8-metre buses that 5 do exist in the fleet, how many are there? 6 CHAIRMAN: I think you have told us about 200? 7 MR ROGER LEE: Yes, 200. 8 MR PETER DUNCAN: When you say you would deploy them on 9 certain routes after contact with the Transport 10 Department, has that already happened? 11 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Correct. 12 MR PETER DUNCAN: And are these buses simply used on defined 13 routes? 14 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Correct. 15 MR PETER DUNCAN: Do you have any concerns about their use, 16 given what the committee was told by the trade union 17 representative? 18 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: No. 19 MR PETER DUNCAN: Do you have any concerns that when the 20 vehicle goes around a bend, it might end up going 21 outside the lane, causing a hazard to other vehicles? 22 Is that a concern at all? 23 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) First of all, in deciding 24 which route would be suitable, we will talk to the 25 Transport Department. For some routes, it would not be</p>	<p>1 between external and internal temperature is big) ..." 2 And they have referred to annex 1 which I think you 3 will find at page 91, the original, and 90-1 as the 4 translation. 5 The question I would like to ask is: is it correct 6 that since 2015, the company has removed all defog 7 heater installations? 8 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) That is not correct. 9 MR PETER DUNCAN: Do you know what the union may be 10 referring to here? 11 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) I believe they were 12 talking about some demisters. We have two models. Some 13 used heated air, and then in 2010 we changed it to using 14 cold air ones. The bus shown in annex 1 with the plate 15 UF 2751, it had a cold air defog installation. 16 I believe this bus was two years old. 17 Why is it that we changed from hot air to cold air 18 defog installation? Before 2010, all the defog 19 installations were heaters, and the heated air would use 20 the coolant at the end of the bus and then it would be 21 heated up, and then the hot water would travel from the 22 end of the bus through pipes to the front of the bus, 23 and it runs throughout entire bus for 12 metres, and 24 a two-way pipe would measure 24 metres. The hot water 25 would be travelling along the 24-metre hot-water pipe.</p>

Page 101	Page 103
<p>1 The defog heaters would use such hot water to generate 2 hot air, so that the windscreen will not see any 3 condensation, especially when the weather is wet and 4 cold.</p> <p>5 However, that installation was not reliable. Very 6 often, the pipes might burst. If the pipes burst, the 7 very hot water, which is of a very high temperature, and 8 in certain cases some hot water travelled into the bus 9 itself, and in 2010 we changed it to a cold air 10 installation in order to resolve that problem.</p> <p>11 But whether we use hot air or cold air defog 12 installation, you have to turn it on for five to ten 13 minutes before you can remove the condensation.</p> <p>14 In 2010, we started to use cold air defog 15 installation to replace the heaters, but the bus 16 captains did not welcome it because it was already cold 17 and there was cold air blowing onto the windscreen. So, 18 by 2015, we heard those views from bus captains and we 19 had to resolve the problem, because this might affect 20 the driving situation of the buses, and then we found 21 some anti-fog coating to remove the fog. This would be 22 painted onto the windscreen. It sounded old-fashioned 23 but it was effective. You paint it on the windscreen, 24 there would be no condensation.</p> <p>25 At the same time, we looked for other ways to deal</p>	<p>1 retrofit those buses with these installations. We will 2 do this on the cold air demisters so that the entire 3 fleet can be provided with proper demisters so the bus 4 captains will welcome using them. And in future, we are 5 inclined to use heated windscreens in our new buses.</p> <p>6 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Let me add something here. 7 From this picture, we actually know -- well, actually, 8 with regard to the coating, the anti-fog coating, there 9 would be different problems because bus captains did not 10 know there was this coating and they might remove it, 11 and at the depot we had to rely on our staff to do the 12 anti-fog coating, and the staff did not like it. Now, 13 we have posted notices to say that some windscreens have 14 had anti-fog coating painted on them.</p> <p>15 And in the past, we have always been trying to 16 research into new ways to deal with the condensation, 17 and even in future, if we embed demisters within the 18 windscreens, we would be the first in the whole wide 19 world.</p> <p>20 We have spent over a year with the manufacturers. 21 As Mr Leung was saying, buses are very different from 22 private cars. We have to do so much more.</p> <p>23 MR PETER DUNCAN: Can I ask you, please, to turn to KMB-1 at 24 page 98. You will see that this is the commencement of 25 the report which was sent to the Commissioner for</p>
Page 102	Page 104
<p>1 with the problem. At the same time, we researched into 2 other demisters together with bus manufacturers. We 3 discussed with Volvo to see whether we could find 4 anything, and then we found two things. One, heated 5 windscreen. There would be heated wires within the 6 windscreen. That is very common for private cars, but 7 if you don't ask, if the manufacturer doesn't do it for 8 you, you cannot do it yourself. But was it immediately 9 available? No. It was not as simple as buying it from 10 a supermarket. This had to be particularly manufactured 11 for buses, and we tried it on 25 buses in 2016, and the 12 situation is still the same now.</p> <p>13 Then, at the same time, together with ADL, another 14 manufacturer, we researched into another thing, and that 15 is to use electrical demisters. We would use heated 16 wires to generate hot air to remove condensation.</p> <p>17 Many trials were done because it involved heating 18 elements and we had to resolve other possible problems, 19 and in the end we resolved the problem this year, and 20 functional electrical demisters that can be installed 21 now.</p> <p>22 So, at this moment, we have electrical demisters, we 23 have heated windscreens. These are the two options for 24 now. And the bus company has decided that these two 25 will be installed on buses without heaters. We will</p>	<p>1 Transport on 12 March after the accident. I want to 2 bring to your attention page 115 of the bundle.</p> <p>3 At paragraph 46 is the question, this issue of 4 condensation, addressed and communicated to the 5 Transport Department. Is that where you can see that?</p> <p>6 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes.</p> <p>7 MR PETER DUNCAN: The second sentence: 8 "Prior to the incident, for the sake of defogging, 9 anti-fog coating would be applied to the windscreens of 10 buses that were without hot air demisters. Having 11 reviewed the mechanism, either hot air demisters or 12 heated windscreens will be adopted, for more effective 13 and faster dehumidification."</p> <p>14 Does that statement recognise that before the 15 incident, ie the accident on 10 February, the defogging 16 provisions were not satisfactory?</p> <p>17 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes.</p> <p>18 MR PETER DUNCAN: Can I ask you, please, to turn to the 19 action plan, the first of the action plans, at page 151. 20 At item 20, is the matter of condensation addressed?</p> <p>21 MR ROGER LEE: Yes.</p> <p>22 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you. The second of the bullets 23 indicates that the existing buses, as opposed to new 24 buses, will be retrofitted with hot air demisters or 25 heated windscreens by phase within the next 12 months.</p>

Page 105	Page 107
<p>1 So how far through this programme are you at the</p> <p>2 moment?</p> <p>3 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: As I said, we have already started some</p> <p>4 of the retrofit and we are already ordering most of the</p> <p>5 components.</p> <p>6 MR PETER DUNCAN: How many buses will require to be</p> <p>7 retrofitted?</p> <p>8 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) A total of about</p> <p>9 2,700.</p> <p>10 MR PETER DUNCAN: And how many have been done already?</p> <p>11 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Probably ten, as at today.</p> <p>12 MR PETER DUNCAN: Is the union aware of this programme?</p> <p>13 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) They do.</p> <p>14 MR PETER DUNCAN: Are you aware of any disagreement between</p> <p>15 the company and the reason why presently with regard to</p> <p>16 this matter?</p> <p>17 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) There is none.</p> <p>18 MR PETER DUNCAN: Could I go back to the union submission,</p> <p>19 that's the KMB Employees Union submission, again at</p> <p>20 page 90-3 -- that's the translation -- in</p> <p>21 bundle TU-1(A).</p> <p>22 In the paragraph which immediately follows that to</p> <p>23 which I referred previously, we have this information</p> <p>24 that the union has brought to the attention of the</p> <p>25 committee:</p>	<p>1 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) All buses are equipped</p> <p>2 with a retarder. All retarders are handled by the foot</p> <p>3 pedal in automatic mode. But for specific routes, we</p> <p>4 have manual retarders. Those running on Tai Mo Shan</p> <p>5 with long, steep slopes, they will use hand-retarders.</p> <p>6 All buses are equipped with retarders.</p> <p>7 MR PETER DUNCAN: The written submission seems to imply that</p> <p>8 the manual retarder was cancelled. Is that correct?</p> <p>9 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) It's not correct.</p> <p>10 MR PETER DUNCAN: Let us have a look at what was said to the</p> <p>11 committee on Day 10. Bundle 4.</p> <p>12 At page 13, line 6, Ms Wong says this:</p> <p>13 "If I may go to the next issue which relates to the</p> <p>14 gear button installation."</p> <p>15 She then refers to the section that I have just read</p> <p>16 out:</p> <p>17 "... the company altered the gear buttons installing</p> <p>18 for safety driving, cancelled the O/D gear button and</p> <p>19 manual retarder installations and relies only on</p> <p>20 computer-controlled singular automatic D-gear to control</p> <p>21 vehicle speed ..."</p> <p>22 Then further on, on page 14, line 25, the chairman</p> <p>23 brings Mr Kwok to this question:</p> <p>24 "The specific question was: how does the removal of</p> <p>25 the manual retarder affect bus safety? Could you</p>
Page 106	Page 108
<p>1 "Besides, the company altered the gear buttons</p> <p>2 installation for safety driving, cancelled the</p> <p>3 [overdrive] gear button and manual retarder</p> <p>4 installations and relies only on computer-controlled</p> <p>5 singular automatic D-gear to control vehicle speed ...</p> <p>6 Under emergent situation it is very dangerous for there</p> <p>7 to be no saving devices for the bus captains to use.</p> <p>8 For example (such as aeroplane, mass railway transit,</p> <p>9 Express Rail Link and cruises) all adopt computer</p> <p>10 navigation, but during emergency, manual operation mode</p> <p>11 is used to avoid danger. This is like all</p> <p>12 automatic-transmission private vehicles are equipped</p> <p>13 with ... [plus or minus] M gear ..."</p> <p>14 There are references then to annexes 2 and 3 in the</p> <p>15 bundle, which one can find on pages 92, 92-1, 93, and</p> <p>16 93-1.</p> <p>17 The representative of the union spoke of this during</p> <p>18 the hearing, during an earlier part of this hearing.</p> <p>19 The reference is Day 10, pages 13 to 18.</p> <p>20 Have you had the opportunity of reading his</p> <p>21 evidence?</p> <p>22 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes.</p> <p>23 MR PETER DUNCAN: Could I just ask, first of all, was there</p> <p>24 a time when there was what the document described as</p> <p>25 a manual retarder available to the captain?</p>	<p>1 address that question."</p> <p>2 And Mr Ivan Lee replies:</p> <p>3 "In the system, there is a device that allows you to</p> <p>4 select. It includes a manual selection, automatic</p> <p>5 selection, and a third one is a combination of manual</p> <p>6 and automatic control."</p> <p>7 Then at page 17, again the chairman intervenes and</p> <p>8 asks this question:</p> <p>9 "Before you go on. Does it come to this, that the</p> <p>10 absence of a manual retarder removes from the bus driver</p> <p>11 a choice of how to retard the vehicle, and therefore it</p> <p>12 would be better to have it? Is that what it comes to?</p> <p>13 Mr Ivan Lee: You can put it this way."</p> <p>14 Mr Kwok at line 9:</p> <p>15 "Let me answer. Manual retarder is very important,</p> <p>16 especially when it comes to going downhill."</p> <p>17 Then at page 18, line 5.</p> <p>18 "Without manual retarders we would use this system</p> <p>19 by controlling the gear instead of relying solely on the</p> <p>20 brake."</p> <p>21 So there is no further information from the</p> <p>22 witnesses as to the cancellation -- direct evidence as</p> <p>23 to the cancellation of the manual retarder. It seems to</p> <p>24 be implicit in those replies that at some stage the</p> <p>25 manual retarder device has been cancelled. Do you know</p>

Page 109	Page 111
<p>1 what he getting at here, Mr Leung?</p> <p>2 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Let me try to say</p> <p>3 this. We have not cancelled any retarder. If you may</p> <p>4 refer to appendix 2.</p> <p>5 MR PETER DUNCAN: Of ...?</p> <p>6 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Annex 2 of the union</p> <p>7 submission.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Yes?</p> <p>9 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) If you take a look at</p> <p>10 the gear selector -- that's not a gear selector as such.</p> <p>11 That's a gear inhibitor. To limit the gear, you can</p> <p>12 engage, for old buses, we have this gear inhibitor. In</p> <p>13 2008, we switched to automatic gear, so there is no need</p> <p>14 to have this gear inhibitor anymore. The design of the</p> <p>15 gear inhibitor is that when you go up a slope, and the</p> <p>16 power is not sufficient, then the bus captain can choose</p> <p>17 not to go beyond number 2 gear or number 3 gear, because</p> <p>18 if you don't have the power to go up, you may have to --</p> <p>19 the gear would go up and then down, so that would be the</p> <p>20 selection allowed for the bus captain to ensure</p> <p>21 a smoother journey. That's the gear inhibitor. That</p> <p>22 would mean they would limit the gear from going up to</p> <p>23 a certain level.</p> <p>24 If it's pressed when it goes down a slope, it will</p> <p>25 not drop from a higher gear to a lower gear instantly.</p>	<p>1 accelerator and also whether he's trying to accelerate</p> <p>2 or decelerate and to what extent, and a suitable gear</p> <p>3 would be automatically set or selected. If it's</p> <p>4 an uphill journey, the gearbox knows that and it would</p> <p>5 not allow the gear to go up a higher level, and the bus</p> <p>6 captain doesn't have to expend a lot of effort to try to</p> <p>7 reduce the gearing, and the bus captain can pay more</p> <p>8 attention to traffic conditions. That's the advantage</p> <p>9 of this smart system.</p> <p>10 We have never dismantled any safety device on the</p> <p>11 buses, and we are here talking about standard</p> <p>12 installations or devices.</p> <p>13 MR PETER DUNCAN: So are you aware of any issue at the</p> <p>14 moment with any of the unions with regard to the manual</p> <p>15 retarder system?</p> <p>16 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) I repeat, we don't</p> <p>17 have manual retarder system now. And we haven't heard</p> <p>18 views on this subject from other unions.</p> <p>19 MR PETER DUNCAN: There is one other matter raised by the</p> <p>20 unions with the committee which I wanted to give you the</p> <p>21 opportunity of commenting on. That is the number of</p> <p>22 routes that any one driver might be asked to travel on</p> <p>23 during the course of one shift.</p> <p>24 The committee heard evidence from representatives of</p> <p>25 two unions who said that some drivers would be required</p>
<p>Page 110</p> <p>1 If you press number 2 gear and you are travelling at</p> <p>2 gear number 4, you will not drop to gear number 2, as in</p> <p>3 the case of a private car. So this gear inhibitor is</p> <p>4 not for the purpose of deceleration or slowing down the</p> <p>5 speed. We are talking about a very big bus with</p> <p>6 passengers, a number of passengers. So to ensure safety</p> <p>7 we have pneumatic decelerator. It's within the gearbox.</p> <p>8 It's in the annex. It's in every bus. This pneumatic</p> <p>9 device is operated like this. It's in the brake. What</p> <p>10 it requires is to press the brake lightly, to trigger</p> <p>11 the pneumatic braking, to slow down the vehicle. It's</p> <p>12 used by exerting -- it's operated through pneumatic</p> <p>13 transmission, and you would not damage the brake, and</p> <p>14 the brake lining would not be damaged. The brake is not</p> <p>15 subject to additional loading. It's a safety device.</p> <p>16 It has been a safety device, a standard safety device,</p> <p>17 on every bus for a long time, and it cannot be</p> <p>18 dismantled by us.</p> <p>19 In 2008, when we adopted the automatic gear, there</p> <p>20 would be no need for this inhibitor. So it's D, N, R,</p> <p>21 the three buttons, and we don't have that gear inhibitor</p> <p>22 button anymore. So that's already the smart gearbox</p> <p>23 that we have adopted since 2008. And the gearbox would</p> <p>24 be able to tell whether the journey is uphill or</p> <p>25 downhill or whether the bus captain is stepping on the</p>	<p>Page 112</p> <p>1 to drive up to three routes in a day, and this was</p> <p>2 regarded as too much of an onus on the drivers.</p> <p>3 First of all, are some drivers required to drive on</p> <p>4 three different routes in the course of one day's work?</p> <p>5 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Mr Duncan, yes, that</p> <p>6 happens. So yes.</p> <p>7 MR PETER DUNCAN: And the union takes the view that it's too</p> <p>8 much of an onus on the drivers. What is the company's</p> <p>9 position with regard to this?</p> <p>10 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) We have an internal</p> <p>11 guideline on this issue. In a day's work, a bus captain</p> <p>12 is not to be asked to drive on more than three different</p> <p>13 routes, and also our duty despatch staff know this. If</p> <p>14 individual bus captains say they may drive on three</p> <p>15 routes in a day -- well, it can happen. This is within</p> <p>16 the scope of our guidelines.</p> <p>17 MR PETER DUNCAN: Have the unions raised with you the fact</p> <p>18 that the view is that three routes is too many?</p> <p>19 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) This really depends --</p> <p>20 well, if you are only talking about the unions, they</p> <p>21 have not really mentioned that three routes are too</p> <p>22 many. Very often, many bus captains are equipped to</p> <p>23 drive on a number of routes, but our guidelines are</p> <p>24 there to ensure that within any shift on a day, there</p> <p>25 will not be too much change, because they may have</p>

Page 113	Page 115
<p>1 difficult remembering the stops.</p> <p>2 But all the routes must be despatched to drivers</p> <p>3 only when they have been trained on those routes, but we</p> <p>4 don't want them to drive on too many routes because they</p> <p>5 have to remember the stops, and to a certain extent this</p> <p>6 may be difficult for them.</p> <p>7 MR PETER DUNCAN: Sorry, I don't quite understand your</p> <p>8 answer. I asked you whether any of the unions had</p> <p>9 complained three routes are too many, and your answer</p> <p>10 was "have not really mentioned". Either they have</p> <p>11 mentioned it or they haven't.</p> <p>12 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Individual bus captains,</p> <p>13 a minority of bus captains, mentioned that, that is</p> <p>14 a fact. So the company said that it should be three</p> <p>15 routes or fewer in any shift.</p> <p>16 MR PETER DUNCAN: Those who have mentioned to you that three</p> <p>17 routes is too many, is that a very large majority of --</p> <p>18 a large number of the bus drivers or is it a small</p> <p>19 number? Can you give the committee some idea of that?</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: I think Mr Pang has already said it was</p> <p>21 a minority, but can you give us an idea of the number</p> <p>22 you are describing?</p> <p>23 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) At this moment, I cannot</p> <p>24 give you an exact figure, but we can go back and take</p> <p>25 a look. We can look at one particular day and -- we can</p>	<p>1 committee was set up and commenced its deliberations.</p> <p>2 Do you see that letter?</p> <p>3 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes.</p> <p>4 MR PETER DUNCAN: Prior to receiving this letter which</p> <p>5 informs the receivers of the availability of digital</p> <p>6 road mapping, prior to receiving this letter dated</p> <p>7 7 June 2018, was KMB aware of this facility?</p> <p>8 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: You mean geo-fencing?</p> <p>9 MR PETER DUNCAN: Yes. Digital road mapping, rather.</p> <p>10 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Yes.</p> <p>11 MR PETER DUNCAN: When did you first become aware that</p> <p>12 digital road mapping was accessible?</p> <p>13 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) I thought you were</p> <p>14 talking about geo-fencing. The map was only</p> <p>15 available -- well, we only knew about the map after</p> <p>16 receiving this letter, 7 June.</p> <p>17 MR PETER DUNCAN: Right --</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: There are two matters here, are there not? It's</p> <p>19 a digital map but it also contains speed limit</p> <p>20 information, and that's the question: did you know that</p> <p>21 this was available before the letter of 7 June 2018?</p> <p>22 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: No.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>24 MR PETER DUNCAN: In the second paragraph, the writer of the</p> <p>25 letter says that the speed limits managed by the</p>
Page 114	Page 116
<p>1 look at that.</p> <p>2 DR JOHN CHAN: (Chinese words not interpreted).</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr Chan.</p> <p>4 MR PATRICK PANG: (Via interpreter) Sorry, Chairman, to my</p> <p>5 knowledge there are not many, as far as I know. As to</p> <p>6 how we can quantify it and what is regarded as</p> <p>7 a majority or what is regarded as a minority, but to my</p> <p>8 knowledge there are not too many.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>10 MR PETER DUNCAN: Mr Chairman, this would be a convenient</p> <p>11 time for the afternoon break, if it suits the Chairman.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Yes, certainly.</p> <p>13 Gentlemen, as we have done on previous days, we will</p> <p>14 take an afternoon break to give everyone a rest.</p> <p>15 15 minutes, please.</p> <p>16 (3.49 pm)</p> <p>17 (A short adjournment)</p> <p>18 (4.04 pm)</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>20 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>21 Gentlemen, would you be good enough, please, to turn</p> <p>22 up TD-1 at page 477.</p> <p>23 You should be looking at a copy of a letter from the</p> <p>24 Transport Department to the franchised bus operators,</p> <p>25 dated 7 June 2018, the date of course after the</p>	<p>1 Transport Department in the geographical information</p> <p>2 system format is "already available", do you see that,</p> <p>3 "already available"?</p> <p>4 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes.</p> <p>5 MR PETER DUNCAN: Do you know now when that information</p> <p>6 actually became available?</p> <p>7 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) We have since talked</p> <p>8 to our suppliers, and we have tried to access the</p> <p>9 information through the data set. We have to deal with</p> <p>10 the format in some way, but we are in the process of</p> <p>11 accessing the information.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: No. The question is simply this: do you know at</p> <p>13 what date the information was available? Because it's</p> <p>14 said to be "already available". Do you know now when it</p> <p>15 was available?</p> <p>16 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: I only learn from this letter.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: No, I appreciate that. You have been given the</p> <p>18 good news that there is a digital map of Hong Kong and</p> <p>19 it's got speed limits on it, and you can redeploy your</p> <p>20 37 people who are involved in tracking this information.</p> <p>21 Did you then find out when it was that this was</p> <p>22 first available?</p> <p>23 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) I don't quite get the</p> <p>24 question.</p> <p>25 DR JOHN CHAN: (Via interpreter) We know that it's</p>

Page 117	Page 119
<p>1 available; not when we knew about this, when it was 2 available.</p> <p>3 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) It was available for 4 a long time.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: That's what I'm trying to find out, and that's 6 what Mr Duncan is asking you. It's been available for 7 quite a long time. Do you know when it was -- not 8 "quite", it was available for a long time. Do you know 9 when it first became available?</p> <p>10 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: I don't know.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: What did you mean when you said it was available 12 for a long time? What's the time period?</p> <p>13 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Sorry about the confusion. I was not 14 aware that the government is releasing this information 15 to us freely.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: No, we understand this, but having -- as I've 17 tried to put it -- received the good news that this 18 digital map with speed limits is available, have you 19 troubled to find out for how long it has been available, 20 for how many years, for example?</p> <p>21 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: I think our IT department is able to get 22 one last year, so I know this exists.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: Are you suggesting that they didn't tell you 24 about it?</p> <p>25 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: You mean TD?</p>	<p>1 government to ascertain whether this digital mapping 2 system was available?</p> <p>3 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: No.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: Are you aware that, for example, in London, 5 a digital map with speed limits on has been available 6 since at least 2008-9; are you aware of that?</p> <p>7 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: No.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>9 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you, Chairman. 10 If you could look, please, at KMB-1 at page 279. 11 Perhaps we should start with page 235, just to see what 12 this document is. You can see there your letter of 13 8 August, which is addressed to the committee, and 14 addresses items 1, 3, 6 and a poster plus a circular 15 under item 4. It's the second paragraph of the letter. 16 Do you see that?</p> <p>17 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Yes.</p> <p>18 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes.</p> <p>19 MR PETER DUNCAN: Then if we try to find out what item 6 is, 20 we have to go back one page to the annex to the 21 committee's letter of 8 August. We see there, it's: 22 "Copies of the documentation that describe and 23 evidence the steps taken, including the involvement of 24 Openmatics, to enable data to be obtained in real-time 25 to distinguish between speeding in speed limits of</p>
Page 118	Page 120
<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Yes. No, your IT department, "I think our IT 2 department was able to get one last year".</p> <p>3 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: But that is not a live map. I know 4 that --</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: Mr Leung, they are very simple questions. You 6 are being told by this letter that there is a digital 7 map available and it has a function which allows you to 8 know speed limits, and the question is, subsequently, 9 have you found out how long this has been available? 10 "How long have we been missing out on this device?" 11 Have you troubled to find that out?</p> <p>12 DR JOHN CHAN: Sorry, Mr Chairman. 13 (Via interpreter) Not when we were told by the 14 government about it but when was it available first on 15 the part of the government?</p> <p>16 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Sorry about this. The 17 answer is I don't know.</p> <p>18 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) GIS, that is something in 19 the last couple of years. The geographical information 20 system has been around for a long time on the part of 21 the government.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 23 Yes, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>24 MR PETER DUNCAN: Prior to the receipt of the letter of 25 7 June, had the company made any enquiries of the</p>	<p>1 50 kilometres per hour and speeding in speed limits of 2 70 kilometres per hour and the documents describing and 3 evidencing the results of those tests ..."</p> <p>4 You kindly then provided an amount of information, 5 and that which I am interested in is at page 279, 6 item 6.</p> <p>7 If I could bring your attention there to paragraphs 8 under the heading "Works undertaken": 9 "A number of initiatives have [been] carried out to 10 improve the above. 11 Openmatics has manually defined 50 ... and 70 12 [kilometre per hour] zonings (please refer to annex). 13 KMB had started a conceptual trial on 31 July 2008 by 14 comparing the above speed limits with the actual speed. 15 Such [speed] is to verify whether the real-time on-board 16 speed alert would notify the bus captains upon the 17 actual speed of the trial bus exceeds the speed limit of 18 the road. The result of the initial trial is so far 19 positive. Further testing will be carried out. We are 20 prepared to introduce the government's digital map into 21 the Openmatics black box, which will take three to four 22 months. However, the government's digital map does not 23 contain live information, and can only be updated every 24 6 months." 25 The question is, what deficiencies do you regard</p>

Page 121	Page 123
<p>1 there as being with regard to what you have identified 2 in the last sentence, "The government's digital map does 3 not contain live information, and can only be updated 4 every 6 months"; what's the problem there? 5 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) By "live information", it 6 means if there is a road situation which may affect the 7 speed to be used, the information should be sent to the 8 digital map. This is what we mean by "live 9 information". Say, for example, tonight a tunnel will 10 be closed, and another tunnel, there would be just one 11 tube for both directions, then the speed would have to 12 be reduced, and within a very short time the map should 13 tell us the new speed limit in a tunnel. 14 But right now the digital map is updated only every 15 six months. In other words, if the time period is 16 shortened, it will become more like a live situation. 17 CHAIRMAN: Is that accurate, that it is updated every six 18 months, or is that what it says on the website? 19 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) We discussed this with 20 government officials. We hope we can be given a live 21 map. But so far, it is still only updated every six 22 months, and they only update the permanent road speeds. 23 CHAIRMAN: With whom did you have this conversation? 24 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: This is an email message between our 25 staff and TD.</p>	<p>1 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: So you may have some shortened. 2 CHAIRMAN: But these are all gazetted, are they not, 3 government gazette? 4 Well, let's approach this step by step. There is 5 a system, is there not, so that speed limits can be 6 changed legally, and that involves the government 7 posting gazettes, saying such and such a section of 8 road, the speed limit which is 70 will change for the 9 next three months and become 50? Are you familiar with 10 that system? 11 MR ROGER LEE: Yes, I do. 12 CHAIRMAN: And that system of gazettes deals with both 13 changes for months, or some of them are even for a year, 14 and it also deals with short-term changes? 15 MR ROGER LEE: Yes. 16 CHAIRMAN: Sometimes it deals with changes that are for 17 a certain hours of the day for a few days or a month? 18 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes. 19 MR ROGER LEE: Like tunnel or accident. 20 CHAIRMAN: So what I am asking you about, these are all 21 gazetted, are you saying there is another system of 22 changing speed limits legally that are not gazetted? 23 You are not saying that? So they are all gazetted. 24 If one looks back at the 2018 gazettes, I think you 25 will find there are 22 gazettes that deal with this</p>
Page 122	Page 124
<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Do you have that with you? 2 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes, I bring it with me. 3 MR ROGER LEE: August 8. 4 CHAIRMAN: Can you provide a copy of it to us? 5 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes. 6 CHAIRMAN: Can you do it now? We can copy it -- it's not 7 marked, is it? Thank you very much. 8 Can we have multiple copies. 9 You were answering my question when I interrupted 10 you. With whom did you have the conversation? Perhaps, 11 now the document has been taken away from you, you can't 12 answer. 13 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: It was an email to the TD engineer, my 14 email to Mr Danny Chan. 15 MR PETER DUNCAN: We will find out when we get it. 16 Prof Lo, please. 17 MEMBER LO: It seems to me the speed limit will not change 18 every day. Once in a while, certain segments will 19 change speed limit, maybe construction sites, maybe 20 certain kinds of scenario. So it's not going to change 21 every day; is that correct? 22 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Depending on the road conditions, 23 because sometimes you have a temporary construction 24 site. 25 MR ROGER LEE: Accident.</p>	<p>1 issue. Some of them are temporary and some of them are 2 long term. 3 Perhaps we had better wait for the document. 4 Mr Duncan, are there some other matters you can deal 5 with? 6 MR PETER DUNCAN: I was simply going to ask whether the 7 Transport Department has yet responded to your email. 8 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: The TD hasn't replied to last reply yet. 9 CHAIRMAN: Well, don't hold your breath. 10 MR PETER DUNCAN: I'm going to turn now to a number of the 11 technology devices that have been referred to in the 12 submissions to the committee, possible technology 13 devices which are available and which relate to safety 14 matters. 15 Could I start, please, by asking you to look at 16 KMB-1, page 114. This is an extract from the report 17 sent to the Transport Department on 12 March, and on 18 this page we see part 5, "Other measures to enhance bus 19 safety", and what I wish to bring to your attention is 20 paragraph 43, which is under the heading of "Tilt 21 alarm". What is contained under that heading is the 22 following: 23 "A tilt alarm will be installed on every bus on the 24 entire fleet. Upon reaching a specific inclination, the 25 alarm will be triggered to alert the driver."</p>

Page 125	Page 127
<p>1 Do you see that entry?</p> <p>2 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes.</p> <p>3 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>4 We heard on Tuesday -- in fact, we saw the statement</p> <p>5 of Mr Kulis that the black box that was supplied by</p> <p>6 Openmatics contained a provision for a tilt parameter.</p> <p>7 Do you remember that?</p> <p>8 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes.</p> <p>9 MR PETER DUNCAN: And I think it was you, Mr Leung, who</p> <p>10 explained on Tuesday that the company did not provide</p> <p>11 any value for this parameter because you could not</p> <p>12 identify any particular reference values. Do you</p> <p>13 remember saying that?</p> <p>14 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes, I did.</p> <p>15 MR PETER DUNCAN: Can we go back to page 114, that</p> <p>16 paragraph 43. Would it be fair to say that that</p> <p>17 statement was made in reaction to what had happened to</p> <p>18 the bus involved in the Tai Po incident?</p> <p>19 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: This is after the incident.</p> <p>20 MR PETER DUNCAN: Yes. Was it a reaction to it, because</p> <p>21 that bus had in fact tilted and it in fact overturned?</p> <p>22 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: This is the recommendation of the</p> <p>23 committee, so this is after the incident.</p> <p>24 MR PETER DUNCAN: Well, this was very shortly after the</p> <p>25 incident, wasn't it?</p>	<p>1 it would not be meaningful, and the bus captains would</p> <p>2 be receiving a lot of misleading information, and if the</p> <p>3 angle is too broad, it may be dangerous and the bus</p> <p>4 captains will either steer the bus or apply the brake.</p> <p>5 Therefore, ADL and Volvo both did not recommend</p> <p>6 a tilt angle. Rather, they proposed to deal with this</p> <p>7 with ESP or ESC, in order to deal with this matter of</p> <p>8 tilting, and in fact we could not take reference from</p> <p>9 other countries. We could not find any relevant tilt</p> <p>10 angle for reference.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: Did you raise this with Openmatics, since it is</p> <p>12 in their equipment, whether or not it is used anywhere?</p> <p>13 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: We did, we did.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: What was their response?</p> <p>15 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: There isn't any relevant -- they didn't</p> <p>16 recommend anything for us.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: Did they indicate to you whether or not they knew</p> <p>18 that this alert was used by anybody?</p> <p>19 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Not any double-decker that is relevant</p> <p>20 to us, no.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: By that, is it to be inferred it is used by</p> <p>22 vehicles other than double-decker vehicles? Is that</p> <p>23 what you are saying?</p> <p>24 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: They are referring to some coaches,</p> <p>25 presumably.</p>
Page 126	Page 128
<p>1 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Yes.</p> <p>2 MR PETER DUNCAN: 12 March.</p> <p>3 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Yes.</p> <p>4 MR PETER DUNCAN: What do you mean by "the committee"?</p> <p>5 DR NORMAN LEUNG: The special committee of the board of KMB.</p> <p>6 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>7 If you could then go, please, to page 150.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on, the context in which this</p> <p>9 statement is made at paragraph 43 is paragraph 39, under</p> <p>10 the heading, "Other measures to enhance bus safety",</p> <p>11 specifically this, the last three lines:</p> <p>12 "The special committee has considered these issues,</p> <p>13 in consultation with KMB's bus suppliers, and made</p> <p>14 various recommendations which KMB's management will be</p> <p>15 implementing or further examining."</p> <p>16 That's the context, is it?</p> <p>17 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: That's the context.</p> <p>18 (Via interpreter) With regard to the tilt alarm and</p> <p>19 the tilt angle, we would decide on the angle. Before</p> <p>20 that, we did not know how to do it. Together with ADL</p> <p>21 and Volvo, we discussed this, and their advice was that</p> <p>22 they could not give us any specific recommendation.</p> <p>23 They could not recommend any particular tilt angle.</p> <p>24 Their recommendation was that it would be difficult to</p> <p>25 decide on an angle, because if the angle was too narrow</p>	<p>1 CHAIRMAN: So it is used on coaches; is that what Openmatics</p> <p>2 told you?</p> <p>3 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Not exactly. We asked them any relevant</p> <p>4 double-decker for reference. They didn't -- they come</p> <p>5 up with a figure but that presumably is not</p> <p>6 double-decker, so we still awaiting for their</p> <p>7 confirmation but it is not double-decker.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Was this done in writing?</p> <p>9 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes, in writing.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: Are you in a position to provide us with copies</p> <p>11 of this exchange?</p> <p>12 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes, I try to, yes.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: When was this done, approximately?</p> <p>14 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: One or two weeks ago.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. So please provide the exchange of</p> <p>16 correspondence that addresses this issue.</p> <p>17 MR PETER DUNCAN: Mr Leung, having regard to what you have</p> <p>18 just said, if I can go back to page 114, the statement</p> <p>19 at paragraph 43 seems to be quite unequivocal:</p> <p>20 "A tilt alarm will be installed on every bus of the</p> <p>21 entire fleet. Upon reaching a specific inclination, the</p> <p>22 alarm will be triggered to alert the driver."</p> <p>23 Was that in fact the resolution of the company at</p> <p>24 this point, 12 February 2018?</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Well, it's 12 March I think when this report was</p>

Page 129	Page 131
<p>1 made. The accident was on 10 February.</p> <p>2 MR PETER DUNCAN: 12 March, I beg your pardon, yes.</p> <p>3 There's a positive statement there at paragraph 43</p> <p>4 that the company will install a tilt alarm on every bus</p> <p>5 in the entire fleet.</p> <p>6 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) That should be in the</p> <p>7 black box, and we are talking about triggering the</p> <p>8 alarm, the one in the black box, not that we would</p> <p>9 install another alarm, another tilt alarm.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: No, that's understood, but perhaps if one stands</p> <p>11 back, this was a recommendation from the special</p> <p>12 committee. It was recommended that:</p> <p>13 "A tilt alarm will be installed on every bus of the</p> <p>14 ... fleet. Upon reaching a specific inclination, the</p> <p>15 alarm will be triggered to alert the driver."</p> <p>16 Now, that's 12 March. Since then, you have carried</p> <p>17 this forward, from what you have said. You have spoken</p> <p>18 to ADL and Volvo and you have spoken to Openmatics.</p> <p>19 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Right.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: So what is the result of that? Just summarise it</p> <p>21 because I think I understand what the result is.</p> <p>22 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Volvo, ADL --</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: There is no need to go through the details. What</p> <p>24 is the end result?</p> <p>25 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) There is no suitable</p>	<p>1 implementing or further examining.</p> <p>2 There is then reference at paragraph 41 to the</p> <p>3 electronic stability control system, and it is described</p> <p>4 as follows:</p> <p>5 "[It is] an important safety feature available for</p> <p>6 buses. It is a mandatory safety feature on coaches in</p> <p>7 Europe. ESP reduces the risk of skidding and rolling</p> <p>8 over. Installation of ESP in Euro V and Euro VI buses</p> <p>9 is under testing and verification with the suppliers.</p> <p>10 Upon confirmation by the suppliers, ESP will be</p> <p>11 installed in the entire fleet phase by phase."</p> <p>12 Now can I ask this question: prior to the incident,</p> <p>13 had the company considered the application of this</p> <p>14 system?</p> <p>15 MR ROGER LEE: Yes.</p> <p>16 MR PETER DUNCAN: When did it first consider the application</p> <p>17 of the electronic stability programme?</p> <p>18 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) It is between 2014 and</p> <p>19 2015. We tried to approach a German company, MAN, they</p> <p>20 had this ESP programme. In 2016 we purchased 20 buses</p> <p>21 with ESP system. We used them on the road. 21</p> <p>22 altogether, 21 buses altogether.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: From MAN?</p> <p>24 MR ROGER LEE: Yes.</p> <p>25 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Double-decker.</p>
Page 130	Page 132
<p>1 angle. They cannot specify any particular angle.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: So is the result this, that although this is</p> <p>3 a recommendation of the special committee, it's not one</p> <p>4 that you are able to enforce or put into practice?</p> <p>5 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: That's correct. Thank you very much.</p> <p>6 MR PETER DUNCAN: So if we look at the second action plan,</p> <p>7 at page 231 of the same bundle -- this is the action</p> <p>8 plan provided to the committee on 6 August -- have you</p> <p>9 summarised in writing what you have just told the</p> <p>10 chairman --</p> <p>11 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes.</p> <p>12 MR PETER DUNCAN: -- in the right-hand column on that page?</p> <p>13 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes.</p> <p>14 MR PETER DUNCAN: So the upshot is there will in fact be no</p> <p>15 tilt alarm; is that correct?</p> <p>16 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: That's correct.</p> <p>17 MR PETER DUNCAN: Now, you mentioned in the course of those</p> <p>18 remarks the electronic stability control system.</p> <p>19 Could you go, please, to page 114 of KMB-1. Do we</p> <p>20 see there what was contained in the report to the</p> <p>21 Transport Department on 12 March, and to put into proper</p> <p>22 context it was said that the special committee had</p> <p>23 considered the issues which had been described in</p> <p>24 consultation with the bus suppliers and it made various</p> <p>25 recommendations with KMB's management will be</p>	<p>1 MR PETER DUNCAN: So these had been in use for some time</p> <p>2 prior to the accident on 10 February?</p> <p>3 MR ROGER LEE: Correct.</p> <p>4 MR PETER DUNCAN: Had any decision been made by the company</p> <p>5 as to whether the use of this system should be extended</p> <p>6 beyond that's MAN buses?</p> <p>7 MR ROGER LEE: Yes.</p> <p>8 MR PETER DUNCAN: What was that decision?</p> <p>9 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) All new buses that we are</p> <p>10 going to purchase, all Euro VI new buses will be</p> <p>11 equipped with ESP.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: But when was that decision made?</p> <p>13 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Volvo and ADL, we need</p> <p>14 some time. We have to talk to them further as to when</p> <p>15 these will be available. So those buses will be</p> <p>16 available after that happen.</p> <p>17 DR NORMAN LEUNG: Mr Chairman, if I may, this was actually</p> <p>18 reported in the updated action plan as of 1 August 2018.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Can you give us the page reference? 235,</p> <p>20 something like that?</p> <p>21 MR PATRICK PANG: 230, should be.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Thank you.</p> <p>23 I think the context of Mr Duncan's question was</p> <p>24 this. From 2016, you had 21 buses, double-decker buses,</p> <p>25 supplied by MAN which had ESC. Had you made any</p>

Page 133	Page 135
<p>1 decision whether or not to go ahead with installing ESC</p> <p>2 on new buses prior to the Tai Po accident?</p> <p>3 I see you are shaking your head, Mr Leung.</p> <p>4 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Well, it was still on</p> <p>5 trial. We wanted to get more data. We only had 21</p> <p>6 buses at that time. But we found out that ESP could</p> <p>7 help us in preventing skidding and rolling over, so we</p> <p>8 wanted to speed up the programme.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: So the decision to act in the way that is set out</p> <p>10 at page 230 of KMB-1 is a consequence of, firstly, the</p> <p>11 10 February accident and, secondly, the investigation of</p> <p>12 the special committee, and thirdly its recommendation?</p> <p>13 MR ROGER LEE: Yes.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>15 MR PETER DUNCAN: Could you describe the current position</p> <p>16 then with regard to the retrofitting of the ESP</p> <p>17 programme? It is said on page 114 that:</p> <p>18 "Upon confirmation by the suppliers, ESP will be</p> <p>19 installed in the entire fleet phase by phase."</p> <p>20 Have you received any confirmation by suppliers that</p> <p>21 this is feasible?</p> <p>22 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) They are still</p> <p>23 developing their own equipment. The new buses will</p> <p>24 arrive in 2019 and these will be equipped with this</p> <p>25 system then the next step will be for the retrofitting</p>	<p>1 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes.</p> <p>2 MR PETER DUNCAN: Is that correct?</p> <p>3 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: That is correct.</p> <p>4 MR PETER DUNCAN: Just to complete the picture on this,</p> <p>5 could we go to TD-404 again, please.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: Which bundle is that in?</p> <p>7 MR PETER DUNCAN: TD, I beg your pardon, TD-1.</p> <p>8 Has the working group recommended that all</p> <p>9 franchised bus operators, in paragraph 4, have committed</p> <p>10 that all new double-deck buses procured from July 2018</p> <p>11 onwards will be incorporated with that device, the</p> <p>12 electronic stability control device?</p> <p>13 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes.</p> <p>14 MR PETER DUNCAN: And does that contain, in paragraph (a),</p> <p>15 a description, full description, of the nature of that</p> <p>16 device?</p> <p>17 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) For KMB, all new buses</p> <p>18 starting from 1 January 2019 will be fitted with this.</p> <p>19 MR PETER DUNCAN: While we are on page 404, do you see the</p> <p>20 reference in paragraph (b) to ""Retarders for capping</p> <p>21 the maximum speed of the speed limiters on downhill</p> <p>22 ('speed limiting retarder')"? Do you see that</p> <p>23 reference?</p> <p>24 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes.</p> <p>25 MR PETER DUNCAN: Could I ask you just to keep that open,</p>
Page 134	Page 136
<p>1 of the same device or system to our existing buses.</p> <p>2 The initial response is positive; the initial</p> <p>3 indication is positive.</p> <p>4 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) For Volvo it's 18 to 24,</p> <p>5 but for ADL, we don't have a timetable for the</p> <p>6 retrofitting programme.</p> <p>7 MR PETER DUNCAN: Have ADL indicated whether it is feasible?</p> <p>8 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Yes. It can be done.</p> <p>9 It can be retrofitted.</p> <p>10 MR PETER DUNCAN: So does that then cover the entire fleet</p> <p>11 by referring to --</p> <p>12 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) We are restricted to</p> <p>13 Euro V buses.</p> <p>14 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Pre Euro V vehicles, there</p> <p>15 is no electronic braking system.</p> <p>16 MR PETER DUNCAN: So does that mean some of the fleet will</p> <p>17 not have this system?</p> <p>18 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Correct.</p> <p>19 MR PETER DUNCAN: What numbers?</p> <p>20 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Euro V or newer buses</p> <p>21 account for more than half of our fleet.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: So just under or some figure under half will not</p> <p>23 have this fitted --</p> <p>24 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Correct.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: -- when retrofitting has been complete?</p>	<p>1 but to refer again to the report to the Transport</p> <p>2 Department after the accident, at page 115, please.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: Of KMB-1?</p> <p>4 MR PETER DUNCAN: KMB-1, yes.</p> <p>5 Can you read paragraph 45 to yourself, please.</p> <p>6 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes.</p> <p>7 MR PETER DUNCAN: Does it finish by saying this?</p> <p>8 "A retarder is a hydraulic system that slows down</p> <p>9 the gearbox. Speed limitation systems could be offered</p> <p>10 on new buses after a period of engineering and testing."</p> <p>11 Who supplies these sorts of devices?</p> <p>12 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: The bus manufacturer.</p> <p>13 MR PETER DUNCAN: How long have they been available?</p> <p>14 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: They will become available on our new</p> <p>15 buses for ADL in early next year.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: I think Mr Duncan's question is more general than</p> <p>17 that. How long have they been available to buy or fit,</p> <p>18 purchase?</p> <p>19 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Not at the moment.</p> <p>20 MR PETER DUNCAN: Let me ask it -- I haven't made myself</p> <p>21 clear, I'm sorry -- were these devices available prior</p> <p>22 to the Tai Po accident?</p> <p>23 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: No.</p> <p>24 MR ROGER LEE: No.</p> <p>25 MR PETER DUNCAN: When did they become first available?</p>

Page 137	Page 139
<p>1 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: They will become available.</p> <p>2 MR ROGER LEE: Maybe the first one in KMB.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: They are not available elsewhere in the world?</p> <p>4 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: For double-decker, no. I'm not sure.</p> <p>5 I'm not sure.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: By all means be cautious.</p> <p>7 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: I'm not sure.</p> <p>8 MR PETER DUNCAN: Let's go back to square one. Before the</p> <p>9 accident, were you aware of the existence of these</p> <p>10 device?</p> <p>11 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: We did, we did, but not with ADL. We</p> <p>12 did go to Wrightbus, we did go to Belfast, we did go to</p> <p>13 Queen's University to talk about a lot of new features,</p> <p>14 safety features. Yes, we know this technology. We know</p> <p>15 this technology, especially on vehicles.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: Are you saying that this was a technology that</p> <p>17 was offered on Wrightbuses?</p> <p>18 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Not at that moment.</p> <p>19 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Actually, after the</p> <p>20 accident, we talked to ADL and Volvo in order to explore</p> <p>21 whether retarders can be fitted onto buses. At that</p> <p>22 time they spent some time to think about the possibility</p> <p>23 and we can only say this, because it was not readily</p> <p>24 available.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr Duncan.</p>	<p>1 DR JOHN CHAN: May I try to explain what is a slightly</p> <p>2 technical question. We had referred earlier to a system</p> <p>3 of hand-retarders on certain bus routes coming down</p> <p>4 Hiram's Highway, because it is particularly steep. In</p> <p>5 the context of Mr Duncan's question, yes, those buses</p> <p>6 and those hand-retarders had been in use for a long time</p> <p>7 before the Tai Po accident. So to that extent, yes, we</p> <p>8 knew.</p> <p>9 But this particular type of speed retarder that we</p> <p>10 are talking about here, that's something that has</p> <p>11 occurred to us only since, after the February accident.</p> <p>12 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you, I understand.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: By that you mean the hydraulic system?</p> <p>14 DR JOHN CHAN: Yes.</p> <p>15 MR PETER DUNCAN: Can we go to the action plan, please, the</p> <p>16 first action plan, to understand the situation here.</p> <p>17 I think this can be found at page 150.</p> <p>18 Is that the reference, "Speed limitation -- speed</p> <p>19 limitation system which will automatically activate the</p> <p>20 brakes to slow down the gearbox should be installed on</p> <p>21 new buses after a period of engineering and testing"?</p> <p>22 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes.</p> <p>23 MR PETER DUNCAN: And the action plan as at 10 April:</p> <p>24 "Both ADL and Volvo are studying how this system</p> <p>25 could be implemented on new bus. Feasibility will be</p>
Page 138	Page 140
<p>1 MR PETER DUNCAN: Presumably, before the incident, before</p> <p>2 February this year, you would have been aware of the</p> <p>3 fact that the retarder mechanism that you had to keep</p> <p>4 buses below 70 would not be effective on a downhill</p> <p>5 slope; you must have known that? Would that be correct?</p> <p>6 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes.</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: Because that system simply works by starving the</p> <p>8 engine of fuel, doesn't it, reducing the amount of fuel?</p> <p>9 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Correct.</p> <p>10 MR PETER DUNCAN: So given that you were aware that the</p> <p>11 system did not retard a bus going in excess of 70</p> <p>12 downhill, had you before the incident made any enquiries</p> <p>13 into whether there was available in the market any</p> <p>14 device which would offer assistance in that respect?</p> <p>15 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) There should have been</p> <p>16 but I don't know where we mentioned this.</p> <p>17 If the buses use hand-retarders, this can be done.</p> <p>18 The speed going downhill can be limited.</p> <p>19 MR PETER DUNCAN: That's not quite the question. Had you</p> <p>20 considered with the bus manufacturers before the</p> <p>21 incident anything in the nature of what you discovered</p> <p>22 since the incident with regard to inhibiting the speed</p> <p>23 downhill?</p> <p>24 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Not that, from my</p> <p>25 memory, nothing.</p>	<p>1 updated in due course."</p> <p>2 Then if we follow this through to action plan no. 2,</p> <p>3 item 19.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: Which page?</p> <p>5 MR PETER DUNCAN: This will be at page 232, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>7 MR PETER DUNCAN: We are informed that:</p> <p>8 "ADL's Euro VI new buses will come with this</p> <p>9 feature. Volvo will have this feature available in July</p> <p>10 2019 and their Euro VI new buses delivered before this</p> <p>11 time will have the feature retrofitted."</p> <p>12 Does that cover all the new buses that you will be</p> <p>13 acquiring in the future, just ADL and Volvo?</p> <p>14 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes, all new Euro VI buses.</p> <p>15 MR PETER DUNCAN: So are you going to be acquiring new buses</p> <p>16 apart from Euro VI buses?</p> <p>17 MR ROGER LEE: All the new buses will be Euro VI.</p> <p>18 MR PETER DUNCAN: And they will be restricted to ADL and</p> <p>19 Volvo, will they?</p> <p>20 MR ROGER LEE: So far, only these two manufacturers.</p> <p>21 MR PETER DUNCAN: If we go back to the working group's</p> <p>22 recommendations, are we able to see those in detail at</p> <p>23 TD-1, pages 404 and 405?</p> <p>24 Do you see those entries?</p> <p>25 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes.</p>

Page 141	Page 143
<p>1 MR PETER DUNCAN: With regard to retrofitting, you will 2 notice that the working group recommends that the 3 operators and the bus manufacturers start the 4 development of these two add-on devices for existing 5 buses with a working target to commence the tests of the 6 devices and trials of the retrofitting work in about 12 7 to 18 months. That's the second half of 2019. 8 Could you just confirm for us, please, what the 9 company's intentions are with regard to retrofitting 10 with regard to this device? 11 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) We will do it. 12 MR PETER DUNCAN: And will you do that in accordance with 13 the working group's recommendations? 14 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) We will do that 15 accordingly. 16 MR PETER DUNCAN: I would now like to move to the next 17 device referred to by the working group. This is under 18 the heading of page 405 of "Trials of new safety 19 technology". 20 If I could just introduce this by reading the 21 introductory paragraph: 22 "In order to enable the [franchised bus] operators 23 to step up their management and control of their bus 24 fleet, and reduce the potential risks arising from human 25 errors or effect of unsafe driving behaviour, the</p>	<p>1 real-time speed limit information can then be used to 2 control the enhanced speed limiter (ie speed limiter 3 with 2 speed settings). In other words, the bus speed 4 could be controlled or limited within the applicable 5 speed limits (50 [kilometre per hour] or 70 [kilometre 6 per hour] depending on the road section). The system 7 will also enable the [franchised bus] operators to 8 monitor their bus fleet more closely and to take 9 appropriate management action against overspeeding and 10 other unsafe or improper driving behaviour such as heavy 11 braking or inappropriate speed during cornering or 12 downhill. To this end, [franchised bus] operators have 13 agreed to proceed with developing the system and 14 conducting trials in two phases ...: 15 (i) Phase 1: a BMCS with positioning function, 16 operational information (such as vehicle speed, brake 17 status, deceleration, et cetera) monitoring function and 18 geo-fencing technology for fleet management will be put 19 on trial to achieve detection of speeding and provide 20 real-time alert to the bus captains; and 21 (ii) Phase 2: Subject to the successful development 22 of the phase 1 trial, the BMCS so developed will be 23 incorporated with additional application of enhanced 24 speed limiter being developed by bus manufacturers so as 25 to limit the bus speed in accordance with the</p>
Page 142	Page 144
<p>1 [working group] considered that new safety technology 2 which can assist the [franchised bus] operators in 3 monitoring and controlling bus safety should be actively 4 explored. Generally, the [franchised bus] operators 5 have committed to further exploring sources of supply of 6 various latest safety devices/technology and launch 7 trials with a view to establishing the technical 8 feasibility and cost-effectiveness of their application 9 in [franchised buses]. 10 The first matter to which the working group has 11 referred is what is described as the "bus monitoring and 12 control system". Could I just read out, please, what 13 this is said to contain: 14 "In view of the latest technological development in 15 bus fleet management system and black box with functions 16 on real-time fleet supervision, bus speed recording, 17 Global Positioning System ... location recording, 18 et cetera, the [working group] considered that it should 19 be a medium-term goal for [franchised bus] operators to 20 develop a comprehensive BMCS with positioning function, 21 operational information monitoring function, and 22 variable speed limiting function with geo-fencing 23 technology. In brief, by making use of GPS or other 24 positioning technologies, the system will match the 25 legal speed limit at the actual bus location. This</p>	<p>1 corresponding speed limit of various road sections." 2 If we go there to the company's action plan -- 3 CHAIRMAN: Before you do that, Mr Duncan, may I interrupt -- 4 and this is a question for you, Mr Leung. 5 If you go back to page 402, where the Transport 6 Department provided the committee with information 7 relating to progress of the working group's meetings, 8 you will see that in the final two lines it says that: 9 "... the report of the working group will be 10 provided the soonest possible for the committee's 11 reference." 12 Now, this letter is dated 19 July. You are a member 13 of the working group. When might we expect to receive 14 the working group's report? 15 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) I haven't received it. 16 CHAIRMAN: I appreciate that. Can you help us as to when we 17 might all expect to receive it? 18 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) The working group is 19 still in session. 20 CHAIRMAN: I understand that. It's obviously gone over the 21 time that we were told by the Commissioner for Transport 22 was to be its reporting time, when she gave evidence in 23 May, but I'm trying to get some indication from you, as 24 a member of the group, nothing more than that, when we 25 might expect to receive the report.</p>

Page 145	Page 147
<p>1 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) There are minutes of 2 meeting, and all I've got are the minutes of meetings. 3 CHAIRMAN: You misunderstand me. At the end of the day, the 4 working group is going to produce a report. When might 5 we expect to get the report? 6 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) I have to ask the 7 chairman of the working group. 8 CHAIRMAN: I understand that, but you are a member of it. 9 Are you close to the end? Is it about to be signed off 10 or not? 11 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: I think it's close to the end. 12 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 13 Sorry, Mr Duncan. 14 MR PETER DUNCAN: That's perfectly in order, Mr Chairman. 15 Is it proposed to have any more meetings of the 16 working group, or has the working group fulfilled its 17 function? 18 MR GODWIN SO: (Via interpreter) According to the agenda, 19 there have been three general meetings on training and 20 fleet management. We have made some progress. We 21 expect a report to be written up. And there will be 22 a fourth meeting. The agenda will be on bus training 23 and the monitoring mechanism of bus captain training. 24 It will be convened in mid-September. 25 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p>	<p>1 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you. For a further update on that, 2 can we go to the second action plan, at page 231 of 3 KMB-1, please. Do we see on page 231 the action plan, 4 as of 1 August 2018, and in the first paragraph, does it 5 refer to the test drive which you mentioned a few 6 moments ago? 7 MR ROGER LEE: Yes. 8 MR PETER DUNCAN: So going back to the recommendations of 9 the working group, according to the Transport 10 Department, where is KMB exactly with regard to phase 1 11 and phase 2 respectively? 12 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Phase 1 will involve 13 giving alerts only. Only alerts would be given. 14 MR PETER DUNCAN: Yes. What stage has been reached? Is 15 phase 1 completed? Is it halfway done? What's the 16 situation? 17 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) We are still doing the 18 trials. We haven't reached the stage where we can have 19 the findings. 20 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) We have to install the 21 digital map in the black box so that we can tell between 22 50kmh and 70kmh, and this test drive is about finding 23 out whether this will work, the digital map will work, 24 this can be done in the short term. 25 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Let me supplement. We</p>
Page 146	Page 148
<p>1 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you. Let us go to the action plan, 2 the first of the two action plans, at page 150 of KMB-1. 3 Is it at paragraph 16 on that page that this matter, 4 that is to say BMCS, is reflected? 5 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) We are working towards this 6 objective. We have talked about digital map and black 7 box, and these are being worked out. We have 8 a timetable. If we achieve that goal, then the next 9 stage -- there will be a second stage. In the future, 10 we will be able to give alerts to the bus captain 11 instantaneously, real-time, whether it's a 50km speed 12 limit or 70km speed limit. 13 But geo-fencing is more complicated. There will be 14 information fed into the black box and the black box 15 will identify whether there is speeding, and then the 16 CAN system will be provided with the input so as to 17 reduce the speed, to reduce the fuel supply. We have to 18 be very careful because this will mean taking over the 19 captain's driving. 20 We have a bus being tried for this new system but it 21 is still on trial. 22 MR PETER DUNCAN: So is it at item 16 of the action plan 23 which reflects the work to be done on the bus monitoring 24 and control system? 25 MR ROGER LEE: Yes.</p>	<p>1 have manually installed information on some road 2 sections in the black box. That is to say for certain 3 GPS coordinates, it is subject to -- it is a 50-kmh 4 zone, we have manually inputted the information to the 5 black box. But if we have a live map, the entire map 6 would be installed and then we can carry out a more 7 comprehensive test. 8 CHAIRMAN: And how many road sections have you dealt with by 9 installing that manually, the distinction between 10 a 50-kilometre zone and a 70-kilometre zone? 11 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) The manual input is done 12 this way. If the section is 70kmh zone, we would 13 manually install or input the map, and then we can 14 actually test all buses but we are just doing this for 15 one bus. Then, if the alarm doesn't go off when it 16 exceeds 70kmhkmh we know whether it works. 17 If it works on one bus, it will work for all 4,000. 18 This is done manually now. If we can install the 19 digital map, of course we need to verify the format 20 first, and if that can be done then we can 21 comprehensively do this for both 50kmh zones and 70kmh 22 zones. 23 CHAIRMAN: But the question was, in this manual trial, how 24 many sections of road have you installed with these 25 latitude/longitude parameters?</p>

Page 149	<p>1 MR ROGER LEE: In fact all of them.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>3 MR PETER DUNCAN: Are you able to provide any sort of</p> <p>4 indication to the committee as to how long it might take</p> <p>5 for these two phases to be totally trialled?</p> <p>6 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) We have given you the</p> <p>7 indicative information.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Can you remind us where we can find that in</p> <p>9 the bundles? You have given us a bar chart, haven't</p> <p>10 you?</p> <p>11 DR NORMAN LEUNG: 279 to 281.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.</p> <p>13 Can you help us then as to what is meant by the</p> <p>14 first heading, "Incorporate speed limit into black box</p> <p>15 by Openmatics", end of November 2018?</p> <p>16 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) This is about the</p> <p>17 government's data set.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: Digital map with speed limits?</p> <p>19 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes, right.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Installed by Openmatics into all black boxes?</p> <p>21 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: All black boxes. But for the trial, it</p> <p>22 may be one or two, but ...</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: This is what you hope to achieve, presumably?</p> <p>24 MR ROGER LEE: Yes.</p> <p>25 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Correct.</p>	Page 151	<p>1 a flyover and the other road is beneath?</p> <p>2 MR ROGER LEE: Yes, and also the parallel one.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: Yes.</p> <p>4 Just going through the steps here -- so you are</p> <p>5 going to carry out an internal trial. What is meant by</p> <p>6 that?</p> <p>7 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Well, it may be a test</p> <p>8 drive by our own staff, or a trial on a specific route.</p> <p>9 We need to carry out the trials to see whether the</p> <p>10 operation will meet expected results.</p> <p>11 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Because today, if the light</p> <p>12 would be activated at 70km, there will be a light on the</p> <p>13 speedometer. But later on, the 50km and 70km alert will</p> <p>14 be done by the system. So it is totally different.</p> <p>15 From the angle of the bus captain, today there will be</p> <p>16 a light, it is because today he is reminded that it</p> <p>17 exceeds 70km, but later on, whether it is 50km or 70km,</p> <p>18 we will have to rely on the system to check it against</p> <p>19 the speed limit of the road section, and bus captains</p> <p>20 have to adapt to this and we have to give them some time</p> <p>21 to tell them that this is the incentive behind the</p> <p>22 change of the system.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: You have another bar here, "Consultation with</p> <p>24 frontline staff"; I suppose that speaks for itself.</p> <p>25 "Implementation to full fleet", by the end of</p>
Page 150	<p>1 CHAIRMAN: But going through the steps, what is meant by</p> <p>2 "Validate the speed limit accuracy"?</p> <p>3 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) We hope the system can</p> <p>4 operate normally. We would like to try whether, at</p> <p>5 a certain location, that it can really fulfil the</p> <p>6 requirement.</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: So cross-check; is that it?</p> <p>8 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Cross-check.</p> <p>9 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Chairman, sometimes it</p> <p>10 relies a lot on the GPS for positioning. Sometimes</p> <p>11 certain road sections, even if the map speed limit is</p> <p>12 accurate, the bus speed as fed into it might not be</p> <p>13 accurate, because if you only rely on GPS it may not be</p> <p>14 accurate and it needs to be adjusted.</p> <p>15 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) One of the</p> <p>16 considerations is whether the signals of the GPS are</p> <p>17 stable and accurate. That has to be adjusted.</p> <p>18 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Say, for example, on</p> <p>19 Tuen Mun highway, we have a bus speed at 70 kilometres</p> <p>20 per hour, but then if you rely on GPS for positioning,</p> <p>21 sometimes they would tell you that the bus is on</p> <p>22 Castle Peak Road and the speed limit is 50km there.</p> <p>23 Therefore, sometimes the roads can be very close and we</p> <p>24 have to adjust the positioning.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: This is a problem that occurs when one road is on</p>	Page 152	<p>1 January of 2019.</p> <p>2 MR ROGER LEE: Yes.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: Then in terms of time, if one goes to the bottom</p> <p>4 of this bar chart, you repeat the matters that you have</p> <p>5 set out earlier: carry out internal trial, consult</p> <p>6 frontline staff. Why is that repeated?</p> <p>7 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) They are different. This</p> <p>8 is phase 2, Chairman. The first one is that on the</p> <p>9 dashboard there will be two real-time indicators,</p> <p>10 telling the bus captain that he has gone beyond 50km and</p> <p>11 he will be alerted, or whether he is exceeding 70km so</p> <p>12 we alert him. But the one that is below, it is about</p> <p>13 phase 2. When the bus captain exceeds the speed limit</p> <p>14 or is driving at a high speed, then the geo-fencing</p> <p>15 system will take over the bus captain's driving, and to</p> <p>16 tell him that he has to cut the fuel supply.</p> <p>17 We have left out 70km here. In other words, when it</p> <p>18 comes to phase 2, if the bus captain goes beyond 70km,</p> <p>19 say for example when he goes downhill, then the bus will</p> <p>20 use geo-fencing technique in order to cut the fuel</p> <p>21 supply. We will not just alert the bus captain. This</p> <p>22 is about phase 2.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: So phase 1 will be complete on this timeline by</p> <p>24 the end of January 2019?</p> <p>25 MR ROGER LEE: We hope.</p>

Page 153	Page 155
<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Yes.</p> <p>2 Yes, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>3 MR PETER DUNCAN: Thank you, Chairman.</p> <p>4 TD/406, please. TD-1/406, please, leads on to the</p> <p>5 next device to be trialled. This is the collision alert</p> <p>6 and lane-keeping devices. It is said that:</p> <p>7 "The collision alert system is an add-on device</p> <p>8 which will give an alert to the bus captain in the event</p> <p>9 of a possible crash. The lane-keeping device is also</p> <p>10 an add-on device to alert the bus driver when the bus</p> <p>11 starts moving away from the lane other than proper</p> <p>12 steering. Both devices are available in the market.</p> <p>13 Thus, trial of using the devices in [franchised buses]</p> <p>14 to assess their applicability and effectiveness is</p> <p>15 recommended."</p> <p>16 We saw earlier today in the accident statistics that</p> <p>17 head-on and tail collisions, and collisions involving</p> <p>18 a changing of lane, were responsible for something like</p> <p>19 25 per cent of bus accidents.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Remind me, if you would, Mr Duncan, where those</p> <p>21 figures are to be found.</p> <p>22 MR PETER DUNCAN: Yes. That's at page 183, Mr Chairman, of</p> <p>23 the same volume, TD-1.</p> <p>24 Had the company given any consideration to the</p> <p>25 application of these devices prior to the accident in</p>	<p>1 Queen's University in Belfast, exactly to look into</p> <p>2 these two matters.</p> <p>3 KMB in-house has a group of engineers who actually</p> <p>4 have been sent to Northern Ireland to do this, and</p> <p>5 Queen's University sent professors to Hong Kong to look</p> <p>6 at our buses.</p> <p>7 These are two main projects. The first one is</p> <p>8 collision alert. We would like to know the distance</p> <p>9 between our bus and the vehicle in front of the bus,</p> <p>10 because we have found that direct collision on long-haul</p> <p>11 routes can be fatal, and we want to do something to see</p> <p>12 whether our bus can be a distance away from the vehicle</p> <p>13 in front, and if the braking distance is not sufficient</p> <p>14 we will have to alert the bus captain and we have been</p> <p>15 doing this internally. Now we have engaged a university</p> <p>16 in Belfast so that we can develop this together.</p> <p>17 If you look at the W-Tech document, you will see</p> <p>18 that when there is a change of lanes, when the bus</p> <p>19 captain engages in lane changing but he doesn't do</p> <p>20 proper steering, there will also be alerts. We are</p> <p>21 researching into this now.</p> <p>22 But today, I can only tell you that we are still</p> <p>23 doing the research. We don't even have initial</p> <p>24 conclusions or results.</p> <p>25 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) I would like to add</p>
Page 154	Page 156
<p>1 Tai Po in February?</p> <p>2 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Yes, we did.</p> <p>3 MR PETER DUNCAN: Could you please describe what</p> <p>4 consideration was given and what the outcome of that</p> <p>5 consideration was.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: Before you answer that question, I'm looking at</p> <p>7 183. Lane collision seems to be 11 per cent, does it</p> <p>8 not? Are you including some other figures?</p> <p>9 MR PETER DUNCAN: Yes, I'm sorry, Mr Chairman. I should</p> <p>10 have broken it down. I was combining "head on/tail</p> <p>11 collision" with "collision (changing lane)", giving</p> <p>12 approximately 25 per cent.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Thank you.</p> <p>14 I'm sorry, please put the question again.</p> <p>15 MR PETER DUNCAN: Yes.</p> <p>16 What consideration had been given to the engagement</p> <p>17 of these sorts of devices prior to the accident in</p> <p>18 February?</p> <p>19 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) Actually, in 2017, our</p> <p>20 engineering department -- well, myself and our</p> <p>21 operations director, Mr Leung, together with some young</p> <p>22 engineers in the company -- we thought of new ways to</p> <p>23 help those two things that you mentioned, and because of</p> <p>24 that, as I said, in the spring or actually in the autumn</p> <p>25 of last year we went to Northern Ireland to go to</p>	<p>1 one point. In the market, we will be watching out for</p> <p>2 third-party products. Later on, we are going to address</p> <p>3 driver monitoring device. We don't know whether the</p> <p>4 device would be applicable, but we hope so.</p> <p>5 MR PETER DUNCAN: According to the Transport Department's</p> <p>6 account of the working group's deliberations at</p> <p>7 page 406, there are already devices available on the</p> <p>8 market. Do you see that reference?</p> <p>9 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes.</p> <p>10 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) That's right, for (c), on</p> <p>11 drowsiness.</p> <p>12 MR PETER DUNCAN: No, for (b).</p> <p>13 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) I know that some other</p> <p>14 bus companies are also trying this out. We will be</p> <p>15 keeping a close watch. We will try it out again. We</p> <p>16 will do that.</p> <p>17 Talking about lane-keeping devices and the alert,</p> <p>18 I remember many years ago we tried out something, but</p> <p>19 the results were not satisfactory. But given present</p> <p>20 technology, we will be keeping watch and we will be</p> <p>21 doing further trials.</p> <p>22 MR PETER DUNCAN: I'm just wondering why you are entering</p> <p>23 into this research project with the overseas university</p> <p>24 if there are in fact already devices available on the</p> <p>25 market.</p>

Page 157	Page 159
<p>1 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Via interpreter) Mr Duncan, even if</p> <p>2 some products are available, you may try them out and</p> <p>3 you don't know whether they are good for your buses.</p> <p>4 MR ROGER LEE: (Via interpreter) I would like to say</p> <p>5 something more here. Actually, a product may be very</p> <p>6 good for a particular place, but we drive on different</p> <p>7 roads. We have long-haul routes. We have urban routes.</p> <p>8 We have routes where there are many people and many</p> <p>9 vehicles. The situation is complex. There is no one</p> <p>10 third-party product that can be applicable to our buses.</p> <p>11 We are talking about very congested and sometimes</p> <p>12 long-haul routes. It is very difficult to find one</p> <p>13 product. We can only try them out. But at the same</p> <p>14 time we should also try to seek a way out for ourselves.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: Mr Duncan, we have reached the close of play and</p> <p>16 it's been a very long day for everyone, as always for</p> <p>17 the stenographers the longest, but that's why it's time</p> <p>18 to close.</p> <p>19 Gentlemen, it's clear, as was obvious during the</p> <p>20 day, that you have much information to provide us. We</p> <p>21 will go through the transcript, as no doubt you will,</p> <p>22 and we will identify exactly what it is that you are to</p> <p>23 provide to us, which is most helpful. We would ask you,</p> <p>24 if you could, to make that available to us within two</p> <p>25 weeks of today, because it is clear that we will need to</p>	<p>1 INDEX</p> <p>2 PAGE</p> <p>3 EVIDENCE FROM KOWLOON MOTOR BUS CO (1933) LTD AND ...</p> <p>4 LONG WIN BUS CO LTD: DR NORMAN LEUNG, DR JOHN</p> <p>5 CHAN, MR ROGER LEE, MR GODWIN SO, MR LEUNG</p> <p>6 KIN WANG, MR PATRICK PANG, MR JAMES WONG</p> <p>7 (simultaneous interpretation used only where</p> <p>8 indicated)</p> <p>9</p> <p>10 Statement by DR NORMAN LEUNG1</p> <p>11</p> <p>12 Examination by MR PETER DUNCAN (continued)5</p> <p>13</p> <p>14</p> <p>15</p> <p>16</p> <p>17</p> <p>18</p> <p>19</p> <p>20</p> <p>21</p> <p>22</p> <p>23</p> <p>24</p> <p>25</p>
Page 158	
<p>1 have another oral session. But it is helpful to</p> <p>2 everyone if we can get the documents in good time, have</p> <p>3 them paginated. You can then digest them and so can our</p> <p>4 counsel.</p> <p>5 So can I ask that you provide the information that</p> <p>6 you have undertaken to provide within two weeks and we</p> <p>7 will fix another hearing thereafterwards.</p> <p>8 Thank you very much for attending. I know these</p> <p>9 have been long days but it has been helpful to the</p> <p>10 committee.</p> <p>11 So we will adjourn now and the hearing will resume</p> <p>12 when we are able to fix a date. Thank you.</p> <p>13 (5.32 pm)</p> <p>14 (The hearing adjourned to a date to be fixed)</p> <p>15</p> <p>16</p> <p>17</p> <p>18</p> <p>19</p> <p>20</p> <p>21</p> <p>22</p> <p>23</p> <p>24</p> <p>25</p>	