

Page 1	Page 3
<p>1 Tuesday, 7 August 2018</p> <p>2 (10.00 am)</p> <p>3 EVIDENCE FROM KOWLOON MOTOR BUS CO (1933) LTD AND LONG WING</p> <p>4 BUS CO LTD: DR NORMAN LEUNG, DR JOHN CHAN, MR ROGER LEE, MR</p> <p>5 GODWIN SO, MR LEUNG KIN WANG, MR PATRICK PANG, MR JAMES WONG</p> <p>6 (evidence given in Cantonese; transcription of simultaneous</p> <p>7 interpretation unless otherwise indicated)</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Dr Leung, gentlemen, thank you for helping the</p> <p>9 invitation of the committee to give evidence to assist</p> <p>10 us in our duties. I understand, Dr Leung, that there is</p> <p>11 an initial statement that you wish to make, so we will</p> <p>12 hear from you then, after which I will ask Mr Duncan,</p> <p>13 who is one of the counsel assisting the committee, to</p> <p>14 pose questions to you.</p> <p>15 It may be that one or other of your colleagues is</p> <p>16 better equipped to answer questions, and I leave it to</p> <p>17 you to indicate if that's the case and to give way to</p> <p>18 that colleague. If you can nominate who it is, that</p> <p>19 would assist us. But perhaps I could invite you first</p> <p>20 of all to make your opening statement.</p> <p>21 Opening statement by DR NORMAN LEUNG</p> <p>22 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Thank you.</p> <p>23 Good morning, Mr Chairman and members of the</p> <p>24 committee. May I say from the outset that we were and</p> <p>25 still are very sorry about the tragic incident that</p>	<p>1 passengers and we welcome any recommendations that would</p> <p>2 enhance bus safety. Subject to technological and</p> <p>3 financial feasibility, we would be glad to implement</p> <p>4 your recommendations.</p> <p>5 Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Dr Leung.</p> <p>7 Yes, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>8 Examination by MR DUNCAN</p> <p>9 MR DUNCAN: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>10 Good morning, Dr Leung, and gentlemen.</p> <p>11 I would firstly like to echo the chairman's remarks</p> <p>12 by thanking you for your attendance today, and also for</p> <p>13 providing a very significant amount of written material</p> <p>14 to the committee for its consideration.</p> <p>15 There are some areas where clarification or further</p> <p>16 assistance would be appreciated, and it is in that</p> <p>17 respect that I have a number of questions for you.</p> <p>18 I appreciate that you are representing both the</p> <p>19 Kowloon Motor Bus (1933) Ltd and also Long Win Bus</p> <p>20 Company, but if it is in order and just to ease matters,</p> <p>21 I will refer generally to both entities as "the</p> <p>22 company"; it will make things easier.</p> <p>23 If, however, at any point you wish to distinguish</p> <p>24 between the two entities, please feel free to do so.</p> <p>25 If I could firstly raise one point, just from your</p>
Page 2	Page 4
<p>1 occurred on Tai Po Road on 10 February 2018.</p> <p>2 On 11 February 2018, I took chairman's action to</p> <p>3 form a special committee of the board of directors</p> <p>4 comprising Dr John Chan and Mr Andy Tsang as members and</p> <p>5 I as the chairman, to conduct an investigation into the</p> <p>6 incident and to come up with recommendations on bus</p> <p>7 safety.</p> <p>8 The special committee has held a number of meetings</p> <p>9 with KMB/Long Win management, representatives of two</p> <p>10 trade unions two bus manufacturers, ADL and Volvo.</p> <p>11 The special committee produced a report on 12 March</p> <p>12 2018, setting forth therein a number of recommendations</p> <p>13 to enhance bus safety. This report was submitted to the</p> <p>14 Commissioner for Transport on the same date and the same</p> <p>15 has also been submitted to this committee.</p> <p>16 On 10 April 2018, we reduced into writing our action</p> <p>17 plan to implement the recommendations set out in the</p> <p>18 report dated 12 March 2018, and yesterday we submitted</p> <p>19 to this committee an update on the action plan, stating</p> <p>20 therein actions taken by our management to execute the</p> <p>21 recommendations up to the end of July 2018.</p> <p>22 Mr Chairman and members of the committee, my</p> <p>23 colleagues and I have come before you this morning with</p> <p>24 a humble heart and with proactive attitude. We know</p> <p>25 that we are duty-bound to offer safe bus services to our</p>	<p>1 opening remarks, Dr Leung.</p> <p>2 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>3 MR DUNCAN: I am looking at the fifth paragraph of those</p> <p>4 remarks, where you referred to the production by the</p> <p>5 special committee of 12 March this year, following the</p> <p>6 tragic accident at Tai Po. It is said in your remarks</p> <p>7 that that report was submitted to the Commissioner for</p> <p>8 Transport on the same date, and that the same has also</p> <p>9 been submitted to the committee.</p> <p>10 Are you aware that certain portions of that report</p> <p>11 were withheld from the committee?</p> <p>12 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes, the redacted portion,</p> <p>13 relating to the traffic accident, yes.</p> <p>14 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. Could you perhaps turn to the copy</p> <p>15 of the report that is in the bundles. We will find this</p> <p>16 in file KMB-1 at page 98.</p> <p>17 You will see at that page the front --</p> <p>18 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) What page are we on, Mr</p> <p>19 Duncan?</p> <p>20 MR DUNCAN: I'm just taking you to the report itself.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Page 98.</p> <p>22 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>23 MR DUNCAN: You will see the cover of the report, and then</p> <p>24 if you turn the page through to page 99, you will see</p> <p>25 a table of contents. You will see the table of contents</p>

Page 5	<p>1 at page 99.</p> <p>2 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Table of contents, page 99,</p> <p>3 yes.</p> <p>4 MR DUNCAN: The portions which are of interest to the</p> <p>5 committee, which are being withheld, are part 2,</p> <p>6 accident regulation report, and part 3, issues relating</p> <p>7 to bus captains.</p> <p>8 Issues relating to bus captains is obviously</p> <p>9 a matter of central importance to the operation of this</p> <p>10 inquiry, and I'm simply going to make a request of you</p> <p>11 as to whether you would consider releasing to the</p> <p>12 committee both parts 2 and 3 for the committee to</p> <p>13 consider, of course within the confines of its terms of</p> <p>14 reference.</p> <p>15 You may wish to discuss that with your colleagues,</p> <p>16 but I'm simply making that request of you and ask you to</p> <p>17 consider that, please, perhaps after the hearing today.</p> <p>18 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Specifically you are</p> <p>19 referring to part 2, accident investigation report?</p> <p>20 MR DUNCAN: Correct.</p> <p>21 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) As well as part 3, issues</p> <p>22 relating to bus captains?</p> <p>23 MR DUNCAN: Correct. If you look at pages 102 and 103 of</p> <p>24 the bundle, you will see that that information is being</p> <p>25 withheld.</p>	Page 7	<p>1 MR DUNCAN: If you just want to put it in context, if you go</p> <p>2 back to page 1 of the bundle.</p> <p>3 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Page 1?</p> <p>4 MR DUNCAN: Yes.</p> <p>5 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>6 MR DUNCAN: You will see a letter from the secretariat of</p> <p>7 the committee dated 28 March 2018.</p> <p>8 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>9 MR DUNCAN: If you go through the following pages, you will</p> <p>10 see that the committee has asked for information</p> <p>11 relating to a number of specified matters.</p> <p>12 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>13 MR DUNCAN: Then if I take you to page 31, you will see at</p> <p>14 the top of the page one of the questions which was posed</p> <p>15 by the committee:</p> <p>16 "Please identify and supply copies of:</p> <p>17 (iv) any codes of corporate and social</p> <p>18 responsibility published by your company."</p> <p>19 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>20 MR DUNCAN: I am interested in the first of the three</p> <p>21 components, which appears in paragraph 2 of the answer.</p> <p>22 Do you see the component described as a key component,</p> <p>23 "Safety"? Perhaps I can just read that out for the</p> <p>24 record. You have said:</p> <p>25 "The three key components of our [corporate social</p>
Page 6	<p>1 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>2 MR DUNCAN: And no doubt a position was taken on that.</p> <p>3 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>4 MR DUNCAN: But I am asking you to reconsider that with your</p> <p>5 colleagues, not right now but during the course of these</p> <p>6 proceedings.</p> <p>7 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) In that connection, may</p> <p>8 I please ask whether this information would be submitted</p> <p>9 for the consideration of this committee or would it</p> <p>10 become public information? I have to know that.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: All information that this committee receives is</p> <p>12 on the basis that it becomes public, if the committee</p> <p>13 deem it appropriate.</p> <p>14 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Thank you, Mr Chairman, for</p> <p>15 that clarification.</p> <p>16 I will consider your request.</p> <p>17 MR DUNCAN: Thank you, Dr Leung.</p> <p>18 Sticking with this file, KMB-1, could I ask you to</p> <p>19 go, please, to page 31.</p> <p>20 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Page 31. Yes.</p> <p>21 MR DUNCAN: Just to put this page in context, this is</p> <p>22 an extract from the initial submission made by Kowloon</p> <p>23 Motor Bus, by the company, in response to the</p> <p>24 committee's request for information.</p> <p>25 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes.</p>	Page 8	<p>1 responsibility] have been listed on the corporate</p> <p>2 website:</p> <p>3 KMB and LWB are committed to providing customers</p> <p>4 with a safe, reliable and comfortable bus service, which</p> <p>5 gives value for money. KMB and LWB continue to invest</p> <p>6 heavily in improving the safety of its bus operations by</p> <p>7 providing intensive training to its staff, strengthening</p> <p>8 performance monitoring procedures, implementing reward</p> <p>9 schemes, improving bus design and promoting passenger</p> <p>10 safety both internally and to the public."</p> <p>11 What I want to do, Dr Leung, is, concentrating on</p> <p>12 the implementing of reward schemes --</p> <p>13 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Maintenance?</p> <p>14 MR DUNCAN: Reward schemes. Do you see the reference to</p> <p>15 "reward schemes"?</p> <p>16 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>17 MR DUNCAN: I want to ask you a few questions, please, with</p> <p>18 regard to what schemes currently exist relating to the</p> <p>19 safety performance of bus drivers. Do you understand</p> <p>20 that?</p> <p>21 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Reward schemes, improving bus</p> <p>22 design -- okay.</p> <p>23 Godwin, would you please answer the question.</p> <p>24 MR DUNCAN: I haven't really asked the questions yet. I'm</p> <p>25 just indicating the matters I'm going to pursue. That's</p>

Page 9	Page 11
<p>1 the topic I am going to pursue with you and your 2 colleagues.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: And Mr So will be dealing with the questions? 4 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes. 5 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 6 MR DUNCAN: In that respect, can I ask you to turn to 7 page 108 of the bundle. 8 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) 108? 9 MR DUNCAN: Yes. 10 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes. 11 MR DUNCAN: We see at paragraph 29 on that page that on 12 21 February 2018, KMB and LWB announced that safety 13 bonus and good service bonus would be incorporated into 14 basic salary, effective from 1 March 2018. There is 15 reference then to table 2, table 3 and table 4, which 16 set out the pay structures before and after the salary 17 optimisation. 18 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes. 19 MR DUNCAN: And you will see the tables by turning the page, 20 finding those at 109 and 110. 21 I notice that this change was announced on 22 21 February, which was just 11 days after the accident 23 in Tai Po. My question is: was the occurrence of the 24 accident a factor in the announcement of this change? 25 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Thank you, Mr Duncan. Thank</p>	<p>1 was formerly based -- was made by reference to the basic 2 salary at the then rate of less than \$12,000 per month, 3 so, as a result of incorporating this bonus amount into 4 the basic salary, the overtime payment would likewise be 5 increased by reference to the new basic salary rate. 6 That was another reason. 7 So, to cut a long story short, after this 8 enhancement, the monthly rated bus captain will receive 9 a basic salary of about \$15,400 a month, and likewise 10 the overtime payment will be increased accordingly. 11 Thirdly, the annual bonus which was previously set at 12 \$12,000 per year would likewise be increased to the new 13 level of over \$15,000. 14 So that really enhanced the pay of our bus captains. 15 The decision was made in December with a view to 16 implementing such new rate of pay in March, on 1 March, 17 but unfortunately this tragic incident happened in 18 February, so it was misinterpreted by some people that 19 we adjusted the pay because of the traffic accident. It 20 had nothing to do with it. It was actually decided at 21 my own initiative at the board meeting in December, 22 Mr Duncan. 23 MR DUNCAN: Thank you, Dr Leung. 24 CHAIRMAN: Dr Leung, you referred to the Sham Shui Po 25 accident as having occurred in November. Do you have in</p>
Page 10	Page 12
<p>1 you for your question. I'm glad I have an opportunity 2 to make a clarification on this point. In fact, last 3 November, when there was unfortunately a traffic 4 accident happened in Sham Shui Po, involving casualties 5 and injury to a number of passengers, I noticed from the 6 newspaper report that our monthly rated bus captains at 7 the time were earning a salary of less than \$12,000 8 a month. It was just under \$12,000. Then -- in fact, 9 this is my initiative -- I said to myself that something 10 had to be done about it. 11 So I examined the pay structure of the monthly rated 12 bus captains, and I noticed each month that apart from 13 the basic salary and safety bonus of \$18,000, as well 14 as -- 15 CHAIRMAN: 1,800? 16 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) 1,800, I beg your pardon, 17 1,800 -- thank you for your correction -- as well as 18 a safety performance bonus of another 1,800, were paid. 19 Then I decided that we can perhaps enhance the 20 remuneration structure. So at the board meeting in 21 December, the board approved that the safety bonus as 22 well as the performance bonus totalling \$3,600 be 23 incorporated into the basic salary. That's the first 24 thing. 25 And the second thing, because the overtime payment</p>	<p>1 mind the accident that occurred on 22 September 2017? 2 Mr So. 3 MR GODWIN SO: That accident that happened on 22 September 4 was in Cheung Sha Wan. 5 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) I stand corrected. 6 CHAIRMAN: Well, perhaps you are not corrected. Was it the 7 November accident and, in which case, what was the date? 8 MR GODWIN SO: There was no accident in November. Our 9 action was in response to the accident that took place 10 in September in Cheung Sha Wan. 11 MR ROGER LEE: Sham Shui Po. 12 CHAIRMAN: 22 September? 13 MR GODWIN SO: (In English) Yes. 14 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 15 MR ROGER LEE: I would like to add, talking about bonuses, 16 at that time we felt that bonuses were actually 17 a pressure on bus captains. We did not think that 18 bonuses was a kind of incentive. Bus captains would be 19 under a lot of pressure if they were given bonuses and 20 it might not be appropriate. That is why the board 21 decided that the bonuses be incorporated into basic 22 salary. 23 As the chairman said just now, there will be 24 a points system for paying salaries. I think that has 25 been covered, and I think Mr So will tell you more about</p>

Page 13	Page 15
<p>1 the present situation.</p> <p>2 MR GODWIN SO: Our company does have rewards to encourage</p> <p>3 bus captains to pay attention to bus safety. We used to</p> <p>4 have safety bonuses, and in 2016 we changed it to a kind</p> <p>5 of star bus captain reward. Within a certain period of</p> <p>6 time, if there is no accident record and if there is any</p> <p>7 compliment from passengers, then the bus captain will</p> <p>8 receive different rewards. If they are within 15 years,</p> <p>9 it would be one star. If it is 15 to 29 years, if there</p> <p>10 is another good record, they will be given another star,</p> <p>11 and then in the end they will be given a grand star.</p> <p>12 Also, in December each year, we have an annual</p> <p>13 gathering in order to give recognition to bus captains</p> <p>14 with good safety records. This is the star bus captain</p> <p>15 scheme.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: Does this scheme still operate?</p> <p>17 MR GODWIN SO: Yes, it is still operating. It is going on.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>19 MR DUNCAN: Thank you, Mr So. I'm going to ask you a few</p> <p>20 more questions about that reward scheme in a few</p> <p>21 moments. It's something which has been included in the</p> <p>22 information you provided us.</p> <p>23 Just keeping with the removal of the safety bonus</p> <p>24 for a moment, Dr Leung, you told us that the</p> <p>25 announcement -- the new scheme was resolved at a board</p>	<p>1 engaged in unsafe driving, and then the safety bonus</p> <p>2 will be used as a kind of disciplinary action, to</p> <p>3 discipline bus captains who commit unsafe driving.</p> <p>4 MR DUNCAN: Prior to this change, when the bonus system was</p> <p>5 in place, what proportion of your drivers received the</p> <p>6 full bonus?</p> <p>7 MR GODWIN SO: When we had the safety bonus, 90 per cent of</p> <p>8 our colleagues would get a full bonus. Those who would</p> <p>9 have the bonus deducted or delayed, they would account</p> <p>10 for less than 10 per cent.</p> <p>11 MR DUNCAN: During the course of the committee's</p> <p>12 deliberations, and no doubt taking up some of your</p> <p>13 management time, we have learned that technology can</p> <p>14 detect such things as speeding, excessive braking,</p> <p>15 excessive acceleration, those sorts of factors. Were</p> <p>16 any of those factors taken into account when the old</p> <p>17 safety bonus was in existence?</p> <p>18 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: At that time, the safety bonus only</p> <p>19 focused on the disbursement of the bonus after</p> <p>20 an accident. The daily performance is covered by other</p> <p>21 bonuses, like the good service bonus.</p> <p>22 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. Can I refer you now, please, to</p> <p>23 page 77, where these reward schemes to which you have</p> <p>24 already referred are set out. The question that the</p> <p>25 committee posed, at the top of page 77, is this,</p>
Page 14	Page 16
<p>1 meeting in December. Is there any reason why it wasn't</p> <p>2 announced until 12 February?</p> <p>3 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Well, it was approved by the</p> <p>4 board in December, I think 22 December, and then the</p> <p>5 management would take time to implement the new pay</p> <p>6 structure. In fact, I understand from the managing</p> <p>7 director the proposed day of implementation would be</p> <p>8 1 March of this year.</p> <p>9 MR DUNCAN: Prior to this change, during the time when the</p> <p>10 safety bonus existed, how was the awarding of the safety</p> <p>11 bonus determined in any particular individual case?</p> <p>12 MR GODWIN SO: In the old safety bonus scheme, we looked at</p> <p>13 a few indicators. First, whether there was any accident</p> <p>14 that was committed by the bus captain, whether it was</p> <p>15 liable, and whether there was unsafe driving. Then</p> <p>16 there would be the safety bonus of \$1,700. Then, if he</p> <p>17 performs well within half a year, the bonus which was</p> <p>18 withheld because of a poor record will then be disbursed</p> <p>19 and this is controlled by the operations department.</p> <p>20 MR DUNCAN: Do I understand from that that it was restricted</p> <p>21 to whether or not the person had been responsible for</p> <p>22 an accident?</p> <p>23 MR GODWIN SO: The company also has plain clothes inspection</p> <p>24 and we also rely on complaints from passengers. From</p> <p>25 these channels, we will know whether the bus captain has</p>	<p>1 "Remuneration packages":</p> <p>2 "Is there any reward system for bus captains with</p> <p>3 good performance (and/or with low accident records)?"</p> <p>4 The first of these is described as the "Safe Driving</p> <p>5 Award". Can I ask: how long has this been in place?</p> <p>6 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: The safe driving award has been there</p> <p>7 for many years. It was like one or two years ago we</p> <p>8 replaced it with the star bus captain scheme.</p> <p>9 MR DUNCAN: Does it no longer exist?</p> <p>10 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: We have replaced it with the star bus</p> <p>11 captain scheme so it no longer exists.</p> <p>12 MR ROGER LEE: Let me explain clearly. This scheme still</p> <p>13 exists but it was like a sheet of paper, it is a kind of</p> <p>14 certificate, but now we call it the star bus captain and</p> <p>15 we use gold and silver, real gold and silver to reward</p> <p>16 the bus captains, so they feel it more strongly because</p> <p>17 this can be tagged to their lapel.</p> <p>18 MR DUNCAN: Is the safety aspect of this award restricted</p> <p>19 solely to responsibility for accidents or otherwise?</p> <p>20 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) The criteria for the award?</p> <p>21 MR DUNCAN: The criteria, yes. Is anything taking into</p> <p>22 account apart from the fact that the driver is</p> <p>23 accident-free, so to speak?</p> <p>24 MR GODWIN SO: In the past, yes, you are right. The award</p> <p>25 was about zero liability. In other words, the bus</p>

Page 17	Page 19
<p>1 captain does not have to bear any responsibility in 2 accidents. In other words, for five consecutive years, 3 if the bus captain did not get himself involved in any 4 liable accidents, he would be sort of commended in the 5 form of a certificate. 6 MR DUNCAN: And there is no financial reward involved in 7 this award; is that correct? 8 MR GODWIN SO: You are correct, no bonus. 9 MR DUNCAN: Could I then turn to the outstanding service 10 award. Does any component of the outstanding service 11 award depend on safety performance? 12 MR GODWIN SO: Perhaps. You may want to turn to annex 9c. 13 So, other than the bus captains, all other staff members 14 are covered by this outstanding service award. 15 MR DUNCAN: You are saying it's not restricted to bus 16 drivers? Thank you. My question, though, is in the 17 context of a bus driver, is whether he drove safely or 18 not a matter which is taken into account in deciding 19 whether he should be awarded an outstanding service 20 award? 21 MR GODWIN SO: Well, in the case of an outstanding service, 22 say for example he has helped a passenger, then he will 23 be given this award. But prior to giving him this 24 award, we will also check whether he has a safe driving 25 record. If he has, and if he served passengers well,</p>	<p>1 I gave an example of helping the passengers. I was 2 sort of citing an example. I just wonder if you can go 3 to the document annexed as annex 9c. I think it would 4 be illustrative. 5 MR DUNCAN: Certainly. If we go to 9c-2. You find that at 6 KMB-9 at page 3853. Is that what you are referring to? 7 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Outstanding service award. 8 Okay. 9 MR GODWIN SO: As I think you can see from the screen, this 10 is to recognise staff members' contribution and 11 outstanding performance. Nomination is by directors and 12 department heads. So this is for everyone. 13 MR DUNCAN: A few moments ago, you mentioned that it would 14 depend on a good driving record. Do you mean by "good 15 driving record" accident-free? 16 MR GODWIN SO: Let me clarify. For the first one, that's 17 the safe award, we have to check the accident record. 18 For this one, this is about the outstanding service. 19 When it comes to outstanding service, we will also check 20 whether he has got a good driving record before he would 21 be nominated to be given this award which is outstanding 22 service award. 23 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. My question is does "good driving 24 record" mean no accident for which he was responsible? 25 MR GODWIN SO: Not all.</p>
Page 18	Page 20
<p>1 then he will get this outstanding service award. 2 MR ROGER LEE: In other words, this is mainly about the 3 service, say what he has done, say how he has helped 4 a passenger, his attitude towards passengers. 5 Of course, it may also be related to his safety 6 performance, but it is mainly about service, because bus 7 captains, in the course of driving, they are very good 8 in terms of their attitude towards the passengers. So 9 this is about outstanding service and it covers not just 10 bus captains but also terminus supervisors, regulators, 11 as well as the bus stop assistants. 12 MR DUNCAN: So keeping with the bus driver and reflecting 13 the fact that he might have been helpful to a passenger, 14 that aspect of bus safety, would the fact that he had 15 driven without any accident for which he was responsible 16 also be taken into account? 17 MR GODWIN SO: Well, let me say this. For his driving 18 behaviour, he will be given the safe driving award, so 19 it is a matter of zero accident and depending on the 20 duration involved. Then, for the outstanding service 21 award, for BCs and non-BCs, if they put up a good 22 service, they will be awarded. But prior to giving the 23 award for bus drivers, there is a prerequisite, that is 24 he must have a good driving record, because, after all, 25 it is an award.</p>	<p>1 MR DUNCAN: What else? 2 MR GODWIN SO: Other than accidents, there may be complaints 3 by passengers, and then of course internally we have got 4 plain-clothed inspectors checking on the drivers to see 5 if they have a good driving record. 6 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. Does this outstanding service award 7 carry with it any financial reward? 8 MR GODWIN SO: No, no financial reward. 9 MR DUNCAN: This is simply again a certificate, is it? 10 MR GODWIN SO: Correct, a certificate, sort of 11 a commendation. 12 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. 13 Now let's turn to the next one on page 77, star bus 14 captain, about which you have already given very clearly 15 some information this morning. 16 What criteria are taken into account in the award of 17 a star to a bus captain? 18 MR GODWIN SO: Maybe the secretary can go to annex 9c-3. 19 MR DUNCAN: KMB-9/3858. Thank you. 20 MR GODWIN SO: Please go to another page. 21 Yes, this is the right one; please stop here. 22 Under this scheme, first of all, a good service 23 record and a good accident record. 24 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Page 3864. 25 CHAIRMAN: In which page of the bundle is this to be found,</p>

Page 21	Page 23
<p>1 Mr Duncan?</p> <p>2 MR DUNCAN: The original, which is in Chinese, is at 3864.</p> <p>3 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Page 3864.</p> <p>4 MR DUNCAN: The translation?</p> <p>5 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) In Chinese.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: 3865-1?</p> <p>7 MR DUNCAN: 3865-7, I think.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>9 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) There's an English version on</p> <p>10 page 3865-7.</p> <p>11 MR DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>12 We have that. Is there anything you want to bring</p> <p>13 to our attention there?</p> <p>14 MR JOHN CHAN: (In English) If I may supplement, this is</p> <p>15 a scheme which was devised to recognise in particular</p> <p>16 good bus captains, and the number of awards every year</p> <p>17 was very limited; it was only two or three every year.</p> <p>18 This was a very specially designed scheme for</p> <p>19 recognition and incentivising of good bus captain</p> <p>20 performance.</p> <p>21 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. Did this contain any financial</p> <p>22 reward?</p> <p>23 MR JOHN CHAN: (In English) No.</p> <p>24 MR DUNCAN: Let's go to the next matter on page 77 and back</p> <p>25 to KMB-1, "Career path for [bus captains] with</p>	<p>1 the driving record and whether he has been disciplined,</p> <p>2 and then his attendance record. By "attendance", I mean</p> <p>3 he hasn't had any record of absent without permission,</p> <p>4 because that would affect the service stability.</p> <p>5 So there are three main elements.</p> <p>6 MR ROGER LEE: If I may also supplement. Just a few months</p> <p>7 ago, we made a change. We have got a 13th month salary.</p> <p>8 In the past, there was an assessment once every six</p> <p>9 months; there was an annual performance bonus. Now we</p> <p>10 have got the 13th month bonus. In other words, we</p> <p>11 haven't got this assessment.</p> <p>12 MR DUNCAN: Are you saying the annual performance bonus does</p> <p>13 no longer exist?</p> <p>14 MR ROGER LEE: (In English) Correct.</p> <p>15 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Correct. Mr Duncan,</p> <p>16 I mentioned earlier in the hearing that not only did</p> <p>17 I incorporate the safety bonus and performance into the</p> <p>18 basic salary; at the same time, at the end of the year,</p> <p>19 this annual performance bonus will become the 13th month</p> <p>20 pay to the bus captains.</p> <p>21 In other words, formerly they were getting at most</p> <p>22 an annual bonus of \$12,000 per year, payable in two</p> <p>23 instalments. Now, at the end of the year, they will be</p> <p>24 getting annual pay --</p> <p>25 MR ROGER LEE: (In English) Just like double pay.</p>
Page 22	Page 24
<p>1 outstanding performance".</p> <p>2 If I could just ask this question. The promotion</p> <p>3 from bus captain to bus captain II, would that involve</p> <p>4 an increase in a bus captain's salary?</p> <p>5 MR GODWIN SO: Yes.</p> <p>6 MR DUNCAN: Likewise, from bus captain II to bus captain I,</p> <p>7 would that also result in an increase in the salary of</p> <p>8 the bus driver?</p> <p>9 MR GODWIN SO: Yes.</p> <p>10 MR DUNCAN: I think the details of that we can see on the</p> <p>11 earlier pages to which you referred us when looking at</p> <p>12 the bonus. I won't take you back there.</p> <p>13 I think we can see from the bottom of page 77 the</p> <p>14 criteria which are invoked for that particular career</p> <p>15 path, so no accident or disciplinary warnings and good</p> <p>16 attendance in the past two years.</p> <p>17 Is that correct?</p> <p>18 MR GODWIN SO: Correct.</p> <p>19 MR DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>20 Let's go then to the last of these matters, on</p> <p>21 page 78, the annual performance bonus. It is said on</p> <p>22 this page that the bonus is paid twice a year and it is</p> <p>23 linked with BC's performance. Just now is it linked</p> <p>24 with the bus captain's performance?</p> <p>25 MR GODWIN SO: It covers a number of points. First of all,</p>	<p>1 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) A 13th month pay, a double</p> <p>2 pay. They will be getting double pay by reference to</p> <p>3 the new rate of basic pay, which is now \$15,400.</p> <p>4 MR DUNCAN: Do I understand correctly that the extra month's</p> <p>5 pay is not performance-based?</p> <p>6 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) No, no. Mr Duncan, you are</p> <p>7 correct.</p> <p>8 MR DUNCAN: So before the change which was approved by the</p> <p>9 board last year, a person could receive first of all</p> <p>10 a safety bonus, and that applied to 90 per cent of your</p> <p>11 captains, if I understood correctly before, and would</p> <p>12 also qualify for an annual performance bonus?</p> <p>13 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>14 MR DUNCAN: What proportion of your bus captains would have</p> <p>15 received a grade 1 performance bonus each year?</p> <p>16 MR GODWIN SO: About 90 per cent, almost 90 per cent.</p> <p>17 MR DUNCAN: Do I understand that the annual performance</p> <p>18 bonus was done away with then by virtue of the decisions</p> <p>19 made at the December board meeting so that from 1 March</p> <p>20 this year you have the new pay structure?</p> <p>21 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Since 1 March, yes. Yes,</p> <p>22 Mr Duncan.</p> <p>23 MR DUNCAN: So is the situation at present then that there</p> <p>24 is no specific financial reward for a bus driver</p> <p>25 depending on his safety performance?</p>

Page 25	<p>1 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Well, there are other 2 safeguards to ensure that our bus captains will drive 3 properly and safely. 4 Perhaps I should mention at this stage that apart 5 from the remuneration enhancement which became effective 6 on 1 March, I am also proposing, with the blessing of 7 the board, other enhancements. 8 For example, just now, you referred to bus captains, 9 there are three grades of bus captain, bus captain, bus 10 captain II and bus captain I, and I have the support of 11 the board of directors that these three grades will soon 12 be expanded into five grades. And also the annual 13 increment point, it will be expanded from the current 14 eight increments to 20 increments. So this will be, you 15 know ... 16 This, for example, promotion to the next grade, as 17 well as the award of the annual increment, will not be 18 automatic. This will be subject to performance of the 19 bus captains. But more importantly, I think, and 20 I believe I'm correct in saying, that the bus captains 21 will not be less responsible in their behaviour, because 22 the safety bonus was done with. I think they are 23 professional drivers and they have their own safety to 24 safeguard, apart from the safety of the passengers. 25 So my principal objective is to enhance the</p>	Page 27	<p>1 come first, they are very important to us, and our staff 2 are equally important to us, and of course at the same 3 time I have to be accountable to my shareholders as 4 well. So I am doing my level best to enhance the 5 remuneration of all staff, not just bus captains, other 6 frontline staff, in the hope that we can recruit and 7 retain quality staff members for our services. 8 MR ROGER LEE: I would like to add one point here. 9 Actually, we have communicated with many other members 10 of staff. 11 MR GODWIN SO: I can also say something here. We have heard 12 these aspirations in the past. They also thought that 13 if money is pegged to safety, they would experience 14 pressure when they drove, and also the annual 15 performance bonus, they also had the aspiration about 16 this. When I met with bus captains and also when 17 I talked to depot staff, they wanted this to be changed. 18 So we heard them, and as the chairman said, he met 19 unions' representatives, and so there is this change. 20 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. 21 I want to refer you, Dr Leung, to the evidence of 22 one of the persons from whom the committee has heard. 23 This was Mr Lai Siu Chung who came from the Motor 24 Transport Workers General Union. Do you know Mr Lai? 25 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Mr Chung, yes, I met him as</p>
Page 26	<p>1 remuneration of the bus captains as a whole and hope 2 that not only would I be able to recruit new bus 3 captains but to retain the serving bus captains as well. 4 That's my intention, Mr Duncan. 5 MR DUNCAN: Thank you, Dr Leung. 6 With regard to those matters for which you have the 7 support of the board, if you are changing the pay 8 structure at all, is that something which as a matter of 9 practice you would discuss with the unions before they 10 were implemented, or would you implement it and then 11 tell the unions? 12 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes, I did. In fact, as you 13 know, I met with representatives of the trade union 14 personally a few months ago. 15 And apart from the remuneration incentive that was 16 executed on 1 March, I indicated to the trade union 17 further enhancements would be coming, and they know 18 that. For example, they know that instead of three bus 19 captain grades there will be five grades; instead of 20 eight annual increments, there will be 20 increments. 21 And there are other incentives too. 22 But I am always willing to listen to the views of 23 the bus captains. Really, how should I say, I find that 24 because, personally, my governance philosophy is people 25 first. People always come first. Of course passengers</p>	Page 28	<p>1 a representative of one of the trade unions, I met with 2 him, yes. 3 MR DUNCAN: I'm going to ask to be turned up the transcript 4 at Day 9 at page 98. 5 CHAIRMAN: What is the reference in the bundles? 6 MR DUNCAN: It's the page on the screen now, and in the hard 7 copy of the transcript, it will be Day 9, page 98, 8 line 13. 9 CHAIRMAN: Which of the four transcript bundles is it to be 10 found in? 11 MR DUNCAN: Number 4. 12 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 13 MR DUNCAN: If I could just explain the commencement of this 14 dialogue, Dr Leung, at line 13, there is an entry 15 attributed to Ms Maggie Wong, my colleague, one of the 16 counsel for the commission, and she asked this question 17 of Mr Lai: 18 "Mr Lai, we are not talking about deduction. It is 19 addition. What I'm suggesting here is not about 20 deduction. It is on top of your basic salary. If you 21 drive well you would receive an extra bonus. That's the 22 system. It's not about deduction." 23 And Mr Lai replies: 24 "Well, KMB doesn't have such a system." 25 And Ms Maggie Wong says:</p>

Page 29	Page 31
<p>1 "Not about whether you have the system. If one were 2 to recommend such a system, would you support that?" 3 And what I am interested to bring to your attention 4 is the reply of Mr Lai, which follows: 5 "Chairman, we support any type of reward system or 6 incentive system. Right now we are talking to the KMB 7 on another kind of bonus system: there would be 8 a 20-point increment system. So in other words, if you 9 achieve certain requirements then you will get an 10 increment, an extra point. And that is beyond the 11 annual salary increase. The KMB has verbally promised 12 that there will be a 20-point system, it's calculated 13 based on the performance, safety performance, 14 attendance, discipline. If the bus captain does not 15 achieve the standards then he will not get an extra 16 point. 17 So that's a kind of bonus system." 18 Now, the 20-point system to which Mr Lai referred 19 I think is something that you referred to in your 20 evidence; correct? 21 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes. 22 MR DUNCAN: The system that you have in mind, will it depend 23 at all on safety performance? 24 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes. As I said earlier on 25 too, the award of this increment, as well as promotion</p>	<p>1 know that there is undesirable behaviour on the part of 2 the bus captain or that he has broken traffic rules. In 3 this regard we also have plain-clothed inspection. If 4 we get a complaint from any passenger, we will arrange 5 for our plain-clothed driving inspector to go on board 6 to look at the driving behaviour of the bus captain 7 personally in order to decide whether his attitude or 8 techniques are correct. 9 Just now you asked how we monitored whether there is 10 any irregularity on the part of bus captains. We have 11 done a lot in this regard. Our objective is to achieve 12 safe driving. In our Bus Captain Training School, we 13 have different kinds of driving training. Let me talk 14 about with about basic training. There are two phases. 15 Phase 1 is to allow the bus captain to achieve the 16 standard to get a driving licence of the right class 17 from the TD, Transport Department, and in phase 2 we 18 will allow the bus captain to achieve the standards of 19 training with KMB so he can serve passengers. 20 In the case of poor behaviour, we will rely on other 21 ways to monitor. 22 MR ROGER LEE: As has been pointed out, there are many 23 channels. We will have more communication with the bus 24 captains. As to whether bus captains would regard it as 25 a way of further monitoring before he gets a promotion,</p>
Page 30	Page 32
<p>1 to the next grade, will not be automatic, but the safety 2 performance as well as other performance will be taken 3 into account. Yes. 4 MR DUNCAN: Have you yet decided how you would assess safety 5 performance in that context? 6 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes. We do have a quality 7 assurance department, Mr Duncan, and they are 8 responsible for monitoring the performance of all bus 9 captains. 10 At this point in time, perhaps I can ask the head of 11 our quality assurance department -- 12 MR ROGER LEE: Perhaps I would like to add something here. 13 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Wait, wait -- and he can tell 14 you how we monitor the performance of the bus captains, 15 and after that, Roger, you can supplement. 16 MR JAMES WONG: Good morning. I am James Wong; I am the 17 head of training and quality assurance department of 18 KMB. I am responsible for training bus captains. 19 I also monitor their behaviour and integrity. Within my 20 area of responsibility, we regularly monitor the 21 behaviour of bus captains. Whether there is speeding or 22 whether there is any unsafe driving, this is monitored 23 by the black box. 24 On the other hand, if we receive complaints from 25 passengers or even prosecution by the police, we will</p>	<p>1 certainly we will heed your advice. This is our initial 2 suggestions. That's the way for the future. We are 3 going to have more communication with the bus captains. 4 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. The monitoring of the bus drivers is 5 a matter I will ask further questions about later on 6 when we come to the black box situation, but 7 I appreciate your remarks. Thank you. 8 Leaving the question of awards and so forth, I want 9 to move to a different matter, still connected with 10 safety, by taking you to another bundle. This time, 11 KMB-6, at 2110. 12 You should be looking at a copy of the Kowloon Motor 13 Bus management structure supplied to the committee by 14 the company. 15 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes. 16 MR DUNCAN: We will see at the top of the management 17 structure Mr Roger Lee, who is here today. We then have 18 a line which includes the operations director, Mr Kin 19 Wang Leung, who is also here today. On that same line 20 we have the general manager, corporate planning and 21 business development, Mr So, who is also here today. 22 Underneath the operations director, we have the 23 deputy operations director, Mr Patrick Pang, who is with 24 us as well, and under the human resources director we 25 have Mr James Wong, who has just answered one of the</p>

Page 33	Page 35
<p>1 questions, in the box of training and quality assurance.</p> <p>2 I want to go from that management structure to</p> <p>3 another entry in the bundles which have been provided by</p> <p>4 you. That's at KMB-3 at page 708.</p> <p>5 This is an extract from the annual report of the</p> <p>6 holding company, Transport International Holdings Ltd,</p> <p>7 and it's the annual report for 2011.</p> <p>8 I want to pick up on page 708 one of the paragraphs.</p> <p>9 It's under the general heading, if we go back to a few</p> <p>10 pages, to 705, "Operational review", "Care for</p> <p>11 customers".</p> <p>12 Then we have, on pages 706 and 707, a number of</p> <p>13 headings, and we come to 708 and an entry which is</p> <p>14 headed, "Safety Management System". If I could read the</p> <p>15 first of the paragraphs under that section:</p> <p>16 "As stated in its corporate safety policy, KMB is</p> <p>17 firmly committed to striving for continual improvement</p> <p>18 in safety performance. Robust safety governance is the</p> <p>19 backbone of our safety management system. A rigorous</p> <p>20 safety governance framework ensures that the highest</p> <p>21 levels of safety performance and sustainable operations</p> <p>22 are achieved. Established in 2010, the safety and</p> <p>23 service quality department focuses on enhancing our</p> <p>24 safety performance and delivering high quality</p> <p>25 services."</p>	<p>1 of the same bundle, and on that page, we will see again,</p> <p>2 under the heading of "Key Corporate Executives", the</p> <p>3 name of Mr Wong included as the head of safety and</p> <p>4 service quality department. Is that correct?</p> <p>5 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>6 MR DUNCAN: Let's move from bundle 3 to bundle 4 of KMB, and</p> <p>7 go firstly to page 1202. If you would take it from</p> <p>8 me -- at page 1202, do you see the reference again to</p> <p>9 Mr Wong as the head of the safety and service quality</p> <p>10 department?</p> <p>11 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Which year is this annual report?</p> <p>13 MR DUNCAN: This is, if you could take it from me, the 2013</p> <p>14 annual report.</p> <p>15 At this point, I would like to go back to</p> <p>16 a reference that we have already seen this morning,</p> <p>17 KMB-9/3855. This is the reference of the outstanding</p> <p>18 service award.</p> <p>19 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Outstanding service award.</p> <p>20 MR DUNCAN: Do you see that?</p> <p>21 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) I see it on the screen, yes.</p> <p>22 MR DUNCAN: The distribution includes a distribution to the</p> <p>23 head of the safety and service quality department. You</p> <p>24 will see that on the right-hand side of the distribution</p> <p>25 list --</p>
Page 34	Page 36
<p>1 Then there's a reference in the following paragraph,</p> <p>2 you will see, to the development and implementation of</p> <p>3 the Occupational Health and Safety Assessment Series</p> <p>4 18001, and it continues.</p> <p>5 So did there, in 2011, exist a safety and service</p> <p>6 quality department? Is that the position?</p> <p>7 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) It has been replaced by the</p> <p>8 quality and assurance department.</p> <p>9 MR DUNCAN: Right. We will come to its replacement, but</p> <p>10 I just want to first establish that back in 2011 it was</p> <p>11 called the safety and service quality department; is</p> <p>12 that correct?</p> <p>13 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>14 MR DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>15 Can you then go, please, to page 774 of the same</p> <p>16 bundle. We are still with the 2011 report. You will</p> <p>17 see on that page "Key Corporate Executives"; do you see</p> <p>18 that?</p> <p>19 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>20 MR DUNCAN: Then if you go down the list, one of the key</p> <p>21 corporate executives is a Mr Gary Wong, head of safety</p> <p>22 and service quality department. Do you see that?</p> <p>23 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>24 MR DUNCAN: If we go to the annual report for the following</p> <p>25 year, 2012 -- we can find that, I believe, at page 995</p>	<p>1 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>2 MR DUNCAN: -- about six down from the top.</p> <p>3 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>4 MR DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>5 Then back to bundle 4, this time, please, at</p> <p>6 page 1410, you will see at page 1410 the key corporate</p> <p>7 executives as they are listed in the 2014 annual report.</p> <p>8 On this occasion, there is no reference, is there,</p> <p>9 to any head of the safety and service quality</p> <p>10 department; is that correct?</p> <p>11 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>12 MR DUNCAN: In fact, I think you have said earlier in your</p> <p>13 evidence that this department was replaced at some</p> <p>14 point; is that correct?</p> <p>15 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>16 MR DUNCAN: The committee has received evidence -- I'm not</p> <p>17 sure whether you've seen this or not -- to the effect</p> <p>18 that the employment of Mr Gary Wong was terminated</p> <p>19 during the year of 2015. Is that correct?</p> <p>20 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Correct.</p> <p>21 MR DUNCAN: Did that coincide with the safety and service</p> <p>22 quality department no longer existing?</p> <p>23 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: No.</p> <p>24 MR DUNCAN: Please continue.</p> <p>25 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Regarding the work of this particular</p>

Page 37	Page 39
<p>1 department, at that time, Mr Owen, head of the 2 operations, didn't know much about the past and the 3 communication with the bus captains was poor. So there 4 was a decision to enhance the work, so as to let it be 5 taken up by the two deputy heads of operations, one of 6 them being me, myself.</p> <p>7 In terms of the hardware, I am very familiar with 8 it. I've been with KMB for a long time, most of the 9 time with the engineering department. So regarding bus 10 hardware and engineering and safety, I can do more.</p> <p>11 Earlier on, the department's knowledge about those 12 parts, it wasn't adequate, and for this department, as 13 to its earlier communication with bus captains, it was 14 poor, and in fact bus captains were not satisfied and in 15 fact it could have been done better. Say, for example, 16 at a specific bend there were certain suggestions and 17 many bus captains found them unrealistic or impractical. 18 Say, for example, they would like to specify certain 19 speeds for entering a bend and the speed would be 20 recorded on a card and ask the bus captains to remember 21 the speed. For professional bus captains, it is just 22 not practicable and in fact it would cause confusion. 23 This is one of the examples.</p> <p>24 When the function was incorporated with the 25 operations director, the function would be strengthened</p>	<p>1 director who is looking over our operations and 2 including road safety. Bus captains face their work 3 environment every day and safety is important, including 4 facilities, road facilities, terminus facilities, road 5 congestion. All these are related to safety, and rest 6 time is also an important element.</p> <p>7 We hope we will adopt a human approach in 8 communicating with bus captains with regard to 9 operations, so we can enhance bus safety.</p> <p>10 As for monitoring, safety training and also 11 discipline, in September 2017 we set up a new 12 department. That is the quality assurance department. 13 It is responsible for training bus captains, training of 14 new bus captains, safety training, remedial training, 15 monitoring, discipline, et cetera. Hopefully we can 16 enhance hardware and software in the area of safety, so 17 we can perform better. We can also see that when the 18 department is enhanced to the level of deputy operations 19 director, the injury rate resulting from traffic 20 accident has been improved. We hope we can continue to 21 work hard in this regard.</p> <p>22 Thank you.</p> <p>23 MR ROGER LEE: All in all, basically, we are talking about 24 the same staff. It is just that the head is not there, 25 and we are talking about an interdepartmental approach</p>
Page 38	Page 40
<p>1 within the compartment of the bus, and in terms of 2 hardware, we have done a lot, like on-board facilities. 3 At that time many bus captains had a lot of views about 4 demisters, they were not happy with the demisters. We 5 did a series of matters in order to provide a long-term 6 solution. And there were new black box monitoring 7 reports which were generated, and on-board stickers were 8 also placed in a more proper manner.</p> <p>9 With regard to CCTV, we also strengthened it. 10 Of course, we faced a lot of difficulties with regard to 11 the installation of CCTV. We had to communicate with 12 the bus captains and we had to do it step by step.</p> <p>13 In terms of hardware, there is a lot more, including 14 how we could have facilities to help bus captains, and 15 in the past half-year or so we had a lot of discussion 16 with the sector and the manufacturers. We talked to bus 17 manufacturers to see how our buses could become more 18 safe. All in all, in terms of hardware, we enhanced it. 19 We placed emphasis on the hardware. Anything that could 20 be enhanced in terms of hardware would be attended to by 21 an open mind on our part. And in terms of hardware, and 22 especially with regard to safety, there has been a lot 23 of enhancement in the past few years. We will continue 24 to go in that direction.</p> <p>25 As for operations, we have another deputy operations</p>	<p>1 to tackle safety and quality control. I think that is 2 what Mr Leung has been doing in the past few years.</p> <p>3 MR DUNCAN: Thank you for that.</p> <p>4 So the safety and service quality department was, if 5 I understand it correctly, established in 2010, and 6 ceased to exist, at least in its former form, in 2015; 7 would that be correct?</p> <p>8 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: That's correct.</p> <p>9 MR DUNCAN: We have seen from the 2011 annual report that 10 that was a department which focused on enhancing the 11 company's safety performance and, as it said in the 12 report, delivering high-quality services.</p> <p>13 Apart from Mr Gary Wong, how many other staff were 14 in that safety and service quality department between 15 2010 and 2015?</p> <p>16 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Fewer than 10.</p> <p>17 MR DUNCAN: Is there any person in the management structure 18 now who carries the responsibility for the matter of 19 safety across the company?</p> <p>20 MR GODWIN SO: At present, the company structure is such 21 that every department has some responsibility for 22 safety. In September last year, we set up a department 23 which is under the human resources department. It is 24 called the training and quality assurance department. 25 My colleague sitting next to me is the head of that</p>

Page 41	Page 43
<p>1 department. He is responsible for different matters, 2 but he trains bus captains. And as for hardware, this 3 is left to the engineering department, because safety 4 has to do with the stability and the facilities of the 5 vehicle, and then on the human side it is the driving 6 technique. 7 In the training and quality assurance department, we 8 have done a lot of enhancement with software in terms of 9 training and staff performance. I think I can hand over 10 to Mr Wong to introduce that to you. 11 MR JAMES WONG: Actually, safety should not be the 12 responsibility of just one person in the company. 13 Rather, everyone in the company should ensure safety, 14 whether it is occupational safety or driving safety. In 15 my department, I am mainly responsible for driving 16 safety of bus captains. From the training stage, we 17 would require them to place emphasis on safety. In 18 terms of bus captains, first of all they must have safe 19 driving techniques. Secondly, they must have a safe 20 driving attitude. Then, they must have good knowledge 21 about the company and Hong Kong's roads so that he can 22 be safe. 23 First of all, I place emphasis on driving 24 techniques, because if he doesn't have driving 25 techniques he just cannot manoeuvre such a big bus.</p>	<p>1 stress suffered by bus captains when they drive, so that 2 we can enhance the psychological state of bus captains, 3 for them to achieve a safe driving attitude. This is 4 going on, and the psychologists of the Chinese 5 University of Hong Kong have talked to our frontline 6 staff and bus captains to understand their work 7 difficulties. We hope that in the future our driving 8 instructors will be able to train our bus captains in 9 such a way that the psychological state of our bus 10 captains will be enhanced. 11 As for knowledge, we require bus captains to know 12 the operations of KMB so that they can drive safely. 13 MR ROGER LEE: I would like to add something. As I said, 14 safety is an interdepartmental matter. Our training 15 school has to do more with bus captains, but then we 16 also look at the hardware. Hardware installation is 17 an important part. In the past year, together with 18 Mr Leung, we went to bus fairs overseas, to understand 19 better safety installations for buses. In autumn last 20 year, we had an exchange with Queen's University in 21 Belfast and another organisation. We sent our staff to 22 learn there, to understand how we can enhance driving 23 safety. There were professors and research personnel 24 who also came to Hong Kong, to KMB, and there will be 25 more cooperation between us later on, in order to</p>
Page 42	Page 44
<p>1 From joining KMB, we have increased driving instructors 2 from 65 to 81. The 81 driving instructors have to have 3 certain qualification. They must have ten years of 4 experience in driving a bus and they must have not 5 committed any serious or liable traffic accident, and 6 of course they must perform well because they would be 7 responsible for teaching new bus captains. 8 Now that we have 81 driving instructors, we place 9 emphasis on achieving standards for bus captains. In 10 phase 1 of training, we make sure that they would have 11 the qualification to get a driving licence for driving 12 a franchised bus, that would be issued by the Transport 13 Department, which would confirm that our school has 14 achieved that standard. After the bus captain has got 15 a driver's licence, he will continue with training to 16 achieve KMB standards, meaning that he will have to 17 understand the routes and he will have to know the 18 roads, the road situations in Hong Kong. 19 Then I also mentioned driving attitude, which is 20 also important. Very often, this will be affected by 21 the stress that they experience and it also depends on 22 their mental state. In order to do something about 23 this, in May we signed an agreement with the psychology 24 department of the Chinese University of Hong Kong in 25 order to do a consultancy to help us to understand the</p>	<p>1 research into hardware of buses, to see whether it can 2 be done so that we can help bus captains to have more 3 support when they drive. 4 This is already starting, and I believe that in 5 future the driving school and the hardware aspects will 6 be enhanced so that there will be better driving safety. 7 CHAIRMAN: Are there any specific devices that you have 8 considered with Queen's University? 9 MR ROGER LEE: There are many aspects but there are mainly 10 two aspects. First, in terms of bus operation, how we 11 can allow it to be steered in a more smooth way. This 12 is one aspect. Another aspect is when we purchase 13 hardware in the market, we are procuring them from 14 a third party, and when it is applied on board there 15 will be some difficulty, because especially with 16 double-deckers, we only have two to three companies 17 supplying the devices and there is a lack of 18 competition. We must look for technological institutes. 19 I think Belfast has almost the only university which 20 does research into the mechanics of double-deckers. 21 At this stage, maybe I can ask Mr Leung, our 22 operations director, to explain things to you. 23 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Let me show you a paper, that's 24 paper 190. 25 CHAIRMAN: Yes.</p>

Page 45	Page 47
<p>1 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: This is what Mr Lee has been referring 2 to. That is that KMB together with the Queen's 3 University in Belfast, have come to a cooperation. 4 W-Tech is a sort of institute under the university. We 5 have got a project. We have got an engineer, Mr Lo, 6 just the end of last month, went to visit this 7 university. We have a cooperation. So he is acting 8 like a visiting researcher so as to take part in the 9 project. 10 We have researchers from this university in Northern 11 Ireland. For the guiding professors, there were two of 12 them who came to visit KMB last month. We talked to 13 them. They were aware of the bus operations in 14 Hong Kong. We told them about our safety issues and we 15 talked about ways to improve the hardware, so when we 16 talk about the content of the cooperation, it is 17 a holistic way to take a look to see what can be done in 18 terms of hardware, say for example in reminding the bus 19 captains, say for example, whether the bus captains are 20 attentive, and we talk about the traffic conditions, the 21 driving attitude. We want to alert the bus captains. 22 Then, further on, we would like to see the 23 following. We want to know whether we can rectify 24 certain improper behaviour of the drivers. So this 25 would be part of the project. A lot will be covered.</p>	<p>1 I went to Northern Ireland. I firmly believe that 2 for the researchers in Queen's University as well as the 3 company called Wright, I think they are really 4 passionate about buses. I believe that KMB's 5 cooperation with them will produce a product in which 6 I will be confident. I think this will help KMB. It 7 will also help the trade as a whole so we can achieve 8 improvements. It is going to be a very meaningful 9 initiative. I believe that KMB has a lot of expectation 10 about this project. We have got some young engineers 11 within KMB. 12 When we talk about safety, in the past we have a lot 13 of research, say for example a solar facility based on 14 the roof of the bus. In fact, this has helped many bus 15 captains. During hot weather, when they return to the 16 bus -- of course, when you park a bus during hot 17 weather, the temperature of the bus is high, it is 18 acting like a greenhouse; it will be up to 50 degrees 19 under the sun. He has to switch on the engine, he has 20 to cool down the temperature before he can start 21 driving. It takes time; it is very hard on them. So 22 having installed the solar panels, and in fact we have 23 entered phase 2. We believe that after parking a bus 24 the solar panels can reduce the temperature of the bus 25 substantially. After his rest break or after a meal</p>
Page 46	Page 48
<p>1 Please refer to the paper itself. A lot will be covered 2 in terms of the hardware and software. As to why we are 3 cooperating with this university and how it is to be 4 done, as Mr Lee has said, we are going to cover all the 5 facilities on board the bus, so it would be 6 comprehensive. 7 So in terms of bus design, I think a lot of things 8 can be applied in the situation of Hong Kong, and then 9 we may come up with certain standards. I think I can 10 say that currently we haven't got any standards, quite 11 unlike the case of private cars. 12 For private cars, we have got many safety 13 facilities, but then for double decked buses we 14 encounter a difficulty here. We do want certain 15 facilities. We do want new technologies. We want to 16 have them on our double-deckers. But then usually it is 17 not easy to achieve. 18 I joined in 2015. Almost on a yearly basis, I went 19 to Europe, so as to talk to the two bus manufacturers. 20 I shared views of Mr Leung. Unlike private cars -- 21 well, in the case of private cars, there are many 22 facilities that cannot be available on double-deckers. 23 It is difficult to persuade the bus manufacturers to do 24 so. Maybe this is due to the lack of cooperation. 25 I won't elaborate. But indeed it is difficult.</p>	<p>1 break, it will be easier for him to switch on the engine 2 and start again. It may be something small but we hope 3 this will become a standard feature. 4 In other words, for our new buses, we hope we can 5 ask our bus manufacturers to fit the solar panels on the 6 roof. Hong Kong is really too hot. In the coming year, 7 2019, the new buses will get the solar panels on the 8 roof. This can reduce the air temperature. We have 9 succeeded in bringing down the temperature. 10 CHAIRMAN: I think we have got your point. You have made it 11 a few times. 12 May I ask this, and then we are going to take 13 a 20-minute break: may I ask that you provide to the 14 committee a legible version of the document that we have 15 at page 190 in the bundle, W-Tech. I think perhaps the 16 problem is that it's coloured ink and it hasn't come 17 through properly. If you could provide a copy we can 18 read, then we can follow your suggestion and read the 19 paper. 20 But we will take a 20-minute break now. 21 (11.37 am) 22 (A short adjournment) 23 (12.00 pm) 24 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr Duncan. 25 MR DUNCAN: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p>

Page 49	Page 51
<p>1 Dr Leung, could I have you and your colleagues, 2 please, at KMB-1 at page 188. You should be looking at 3 a copy of a letter from KMB to the committee dated 4 23 May 2018. Do you see that?</p> <p>5 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: Does that refer to the matter about which 7 evidence was given just before the break, the 8 collaboration with a company called W-Tech?</p> <p>9 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Correct.</p> <p>10 MR DUNCAN: If I could bring your attention page 188 and the 11 letter two-thirds of the way down: 12 "The purpose of the ... meeting was to discuss 13 implementing a series of advanced driver assist systems 14 ... in the fleets of KMB and LWB." 15 And it goes on to say: 16 "The objectives of the said collaboration with as 17 follows", and we can see them outlined: 1, 2 and 3: 18 "1. To complete a technology viability assessment 19 of pre-commercial/commercial ADAS technologies 20 applicable to the Wrightbus Streetdeck configuration; 21 2. To recommend ADAS appropriate for implementation 22 within the KMB and LWB fleets of Wrightbus vehicles on 23 the basis of this assessment; and. 24 3. To deliver a roadmap for ADAS implementation to 25 KMB and LWB."</p>	<p>1 a Wrightbus configuration?</p> <p>2 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: I don't have the exact figure, but 3 I would say roughly 800 to 900 of them.</p> <p>4 MR DUNCAN: What is the total number of your fleet?</p> <p>5 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Together with LWB, almost 4,300, for 6 both KMB and LWB.</p> <p>7 MR DUNCAN: Can you explain again what the Wrightbus 8 prototype is, please?</p> <p>9 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: The chassis and bodywork have been 10 manufactured by Wrightbus. It's a two-axle 11 double-decker.</p> <p>12 MR DUNCAN: And the collaboration agreement that you have 13 reached with W-Tech, does that anticipate that the 14 company will be purchasing a number of Wrightbus 15 vehicles of that nature?</p> <p>16 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: No.</p> <p>17 MR DUNCAN: What does it anticipate? On what buses would 18 the possible ADAS system be installed?</p> <p>19 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: This is a research to see what will be 20 of assistance in relation to enhancing bus safety. We 21 want to find out what can be available and achievable on 22 Wrightbus, and then we will take into account bus 23 operations in Hong Kong. We also hope that the outcome, 24 if feasible, will be applied and benefit the buses in 25 Hong Kong, but after all this is a research. This is</p>
Page 50	Page 52
<p>1 Now could I ask this question: does the KMB fleet at 2 the moment include a number of Wrightbus vehicles?</p> <p>3 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Currently, there is one undergoing 4 prototyping. For the bodywork for Wrightbus, we have 5 got many bus bodies on Volvo chassis, hundreds of them.</p> <p>6 MR DUNCAN: Apart from the Wrightbus, who are the other 7 manufacturers of the buses in the Kowloon Motor Bus 8 fleet?</p> <p>9 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Sorry, please repeat your question.</p> <p>10 MR DUNCAN: Who are the vehicles in the KMB bus fleet 11 manufactured by -- I think there's a series, a number of 12 different manufacturers; is that correct?</p> <p>13 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Other bus -- Volvo, MAN, mainly ADL and 14 Volvo.</p> <p>15 MR DUNCAN: So Volvo, MAN, ADL, that's Alexander Dennis; is 16 that correct?</p> <p>17 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Correct.</p> <p>18 MR DUNCAN: So basically three types within the bus fleet?</p> <p>19 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Correct.</p> <p>20 MR DUNCAN: Now, the bus that was involved in the Tai Po 21 accident, was that a Wrightbus?</p> <p>22 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: With Volvo chassis, with Wrightbus bus 23 body. It's a double-decker.</p> <p>24 MR DUNCAN: So how many of your buses have this 25 configuration, a Volvo or a MAN or an ADL base with</p>	<p>1 too early to talk about implementation. So it is 2 an academic research. We have deployed a colleague to 3 Queen's University in Belfast to carry out a one-year 4 project, which is a research, to see what would be 5 possible, so that in future they can be applied to 6 double-decker buses, in this particular case Wrightbus, 7 but we are not ruling out any possibilities, and we also 8 hope that in future such safety features will become 9 standard safety features. We hope that all other bus 10 manufacturers will also take part or will use such 11 measures to enhance bus safety.</p> <p>12 MR DUNCAN: Could you just kindly explain for the committee 13 what is the use of, say, the Volvo chassis with the 14 Wright-tech [sic] body, as I understand you? Could you 15 explain that, please?</p> <p>16 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: For the chassis, we have to 17 (unclear word) three of them, and the engine, and the 18 transmission system and the driver's cab. For the bus 19 body, that's on top of the chassis, including the 20 bodywork, the flooring, the seats, the air-conditioning. 21 So they will be regarded as the body. 22 For the bus body, it is by Wrightbus. For the 23 chassis, that's by Volvo.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: Where are the two joined together, the chassis 25 and the bus body?</p>

Page 53	Page 55
<p>1 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: It can take different ways at different 2 points. As to the one I mentioned, I suppose it should 3 be in the UK, at Wrightbus, manufactured by Wrightbus. 4 (In English) Just to clarify, a chassis can have 5 different kinds of bus bodies. 6 CHAIRMAN: Yes, I understand that. My question is simple: 7 where are they put together? 8 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) They can be put together 9 either in the original manufacturer's facilities or they 10 can assembled elsewhere. In the past, KMB did our own 11 bus assembly. We also had buses assembled in China and 12 there are buses assembled in different places. 13 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 14 MR DUNCAN: When you say it could be done by the original 15 manufacturer, in this case would that be Volvo or would 16 it be Wright Group? 17 MR ROGER LEE: Well, for the chassis, if it is by Volvo, and 18 if the body is Wright, then there are two functions. 19 First of all, the chassis can be transferred to Belfast 20 and then the body, the bus body, would be fitted onto 21 the chassis. It is complicated because both would 22 undergo a lot of research. We talk about the torque, 23 et cetera. Then in Malaysia, Wright has got a plant in 24 Malaysia, to carry out bus assembly work. So for the 25 Volvo chassis, and in fact we have got it for Gemilang,</p>	<p>1 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Thank you very much. Mr Duncan asked my 2 question already. Thank you. 3 MR DUNCAN: Just going back to the management structure -- 4 we don't need to go to the document -- Mr Wong, when you 5 were giving your answer before, you mentioned a lot 6 about responsibility for training, and that's clearly in 7 the training and quality assurance department. 8 Who in the company carries the responsibility of 9 monitoring not the training of the drivers but the 10 actual performance of the drivers, in particular their 11 safety performance? Where does the responsibility for 12 that sit? 13 MR PATRICK PANG: Mr Duncan, let me answer this question. 14 As far as the monitoring of the safety of bus captains 15 is concerned, it is done at different levels by 16 different colleagues. For each bus, we have got the 17 so-called black box, we have got this tool. On a weekly 18 basis, we have monitoring reports. We get the data. 19 Three main sets of data would be available. First 20 of all, speeding; second, abrupt acceleration, sudden 21 acceleration; third, harsh braking. 22 For our depots, for our management at the depots, on 23 a weekly basis we take a look. Currently, what we can 24 achieve is that we can look at the data collected by the 25 black box for the preceding four days.</p>
Page 54	Page 56
<p>1 Wright is for body, Volvo is for the chassis, and Wright 2 has also researched and developed its own chassis but we 3 have only got one, that is the one being tested. Now, a 4 bus has got the chassis as well as the body. You need 5 both. Before you can research into the ADAS, you must 6 have a bus physically to do it. After we have got the 7 ADAS, it means it can be used in any bus. 8 MR DUNCAN: What's the advantage of having the Wrightbus 9 body, over just having the complete Volvo bus? 10 MR ROGER LEE: For Wrightbus, let me supplement. Today, 11 their chassis cannot have three axles, because in the UK 12 they have got many Wrightbus bodies and Wrightbus axles 13 but they can only accommodate two, but in Hong Kong we 14 are mainly having three axles, because this has a larger 15 capacity and we carry a larger air-conditioner at the 16 back, and for Hong Kong for each axle, we have this 17 standard; the loading cannot exceed a particular limit. 18 So, in the case of Hong Kong and for us, KMB as 19 well, we usually use the three axles. For Wrightbus, it 20 has got a chassis as well as body, it's similar to ADL. 21 ADL has both chassis as well as the body, but before 22 Wrightbus has got three-axle buses, the only one we have 23 got from Wrightbus is only two-axle, for Volvo, three; 24 that is why we have got their bodywork fitted on to 25 Volvo chassis.</p>	<p>1 In fact, every day we start with the following. 2 That is we will analyse the data, in particular speeding 3 beyond the limits covering beyond the 50km per hour and 4 beyond the 70km per hour limits. For sudden 5 acceleration and abrupt braking, we have got data to 6 tell us the case of individual bus captains. This is 7 because we do generate exception reports, and we can 8 find out whether the driving behaviour of certain bus 9 captains should warrant our attention. 10 If we see that for a particular bus captain over 11 a particular period of time, his driving attitude is 12 such that it warrants our attention, then we will first 13 of all advise the bus captain and will get our frontline 14 staff to talk to the bus captain to find out whether 15 there is a special reason for that. And then regarding 16 the over-speeding, we will refer the cases of speeding 17 to our training and quality assurance department 18 immediately, to take follow-up action. And then for 19 speeding, maybe Mr Wong can also supplement. 20 What I would like to say is that the black box data 21 will be kept, will be reviewed and will be followed up. 22 MR DUNCAN: The question really was who has the 23 responsibility. So you have talked about the depots 24 carrying out work. What staff are at a depot? 25 MR PATRICK PANG: Mr Duncan, who should be responsible,</p>

Page 57	Page 59
<p>1 I can answer you --</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: "Who is", not "should be"; "who is". And please</p> <p>3 can I ask you to speak more slowly.</p> <p>4 MR PATRICK PANG: (In English) Okay.</p> <p>5 (Via interpreter) The management at depot starts</p> <p>6 with our operations officers. The operations officer,</p> <p>7 in every depot or zone -- overall speaking, at KMB, we</p> <p>8 have four main depots, including the one at Lai Chi Kok,</p> <p>9 the one in Kowloon Bay, another one in Sha Tin, and the</p> <p>10 one in Tuen Mun, and of course we have Long Win Bus. At</p> <p>11 every depot, there are boundaries delineated for them.</p> <p>12 They are responsible for different zones. There is</p> <p>13 an assistant manager or manager responsible for every</p> <p>14 zone. We call them managers or assistant managers.</p> <p>15 Every manager or assistant manager has different numbers</p> <p>16 of operation officers under them. On a daily basis,</p> <p>17 when operations officers come to work, the first thing</p> <p>18 they do is to look at the black box information for the</p> <p>19 preceding four days, including speeding, sudden</p> <p>20 acceleration, and harsh braking.</p> <p>21 Assistant managers and operations officers do this</p> <p>22 every day.</p> <p>23 MR DUNCAN: So how many operations officers would there be</p> <p>24 at each of the four depots?</p> <p>25 MR PATRICK PANG: Altogether, at every depot, depending on</p>	<p>1 Bus. These five experienced general managers or</p> <p>2 managers directly report to me.</p> <p>3 MR DUNCAN: I'm going to come back to the black box in a few</p> <p>4 moments, but there are just two other matters I want to</p> <p>5 explore with you before I do that.</p> <p>6 Can I ask you to have in front of you, please,</p> <p>7 bundle FE-1, and could you go, please, to page 96-1 of</p> <p>8 that bundle. At that page, you should be looking at</p> <p>9 a copy of a document sent by email by the committee to</p> <p>10 a Mr Raymond Cheng. Are you looking at that? Do you</p> <p>11 see that?</p> <p>12 Do you recognise Mr Raymond Cheng as being a former</p> <p>13 employee of the company? Is he known to you as a former</p> <p>14 employee?</p> <p>15 MR ROGER LEE: He left when I joined the company. He left</p> <p>16 in 2014.</p> <p>17 MR DUNCAN: Right. You will see that one of the matters</p> <p>18 that the committee has enquired into is under the</p> <p>19 heading "Employment by KMB"; do you see that?</p> <p>20 Can you just read to yourself, please, paragraphs 1,</p> <p>21 2 and 3 of that email letter from the committee to</p> <p>22 Mr Cheng.</p> <p>23 Have you been able to read that? Thank you.</p> <p>24 Could you then please turn to page 96-4. Have you</p> <p>25 seen this response previously, Mr Lee?</p>
Page 58	Page 60
<p>1 the size of the depot, some may have six to seven</p> <p>2 operations officers, some may have three to four</p> <p>3 operations officers, and altogether there are about 37</p> <p>4 colleagues dealing with the data analysis.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: Do you have a graphic or a map that shows the</p> <p>6 zones that are applicable in each of the four depots?</p> <p>7 MR PATRICK PANG: Chairman, can I be allowed to supply --</p> <p>8 absolutely, yes, definitely.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Can you answer "yes" or "no" -- thank you. Try</p> <p>10 answering "yes" or "no" to this as well.</p> <p>11 MR PATRICK PANG: (In English) Okay.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Can you provide a copy of such a map or plan to</p> <p>13 us, "yes" or "no"?</p> <p>14 MR PATRICK PANG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: Will you do so, "yes" or "no"?</p> <p>16 MR PATRICK PANG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>18 Yes, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>19 MR DUNCAN: Now, the operations officers presumably report</p> <p>20 to the depot manager; would that be correct?</p> <p>21 MR PATRICK PANG: Correct.</p> <p>22 MR DUNCAN: And who do the depot managers report to?</p> <p>23 MR PATRICK PANG: At every depot, there will be</p> <p>24 an experienced general manager or manager who will</p> <p>25 coordinate the operation of the four depots and Long Win</p>	<p>1 MR ROGER LEE: No.</p> <p>2 MR DUNCAN: Could you take the time, please, just to read to</p> <p>3 yourself what appears at page 96-4, 96-5, and there's</p> <p>4 also an extract on page 96-6. Just read that to</p> <p>5 yourself, please, to familiarise yourself with it.</p> <p>6 Thank you. Then at page 96-7, you will see</p> <p>7 a further response from Mr Cheng, where he addresses</p> <p>8 again question 1 and question 2. I wonder if you would</p> <p>9 be good enough, please, just to read those entries to</p> <p>10 yourself, at page 96-7.</p> <p>11 Thank you. Now, on page 96-7, just under the</p> <p>12 heading "Answer to Q2", Mr Cheng refers to the matter of</p> <p>13 29 sharp bends, and it talks about information being in</p> <p>14 an Excel format. Do you see that?</p> <p>15 MR ROGER LEE: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>16 MR DUNCAN: Does that information still exist within the</p> <p>17 company?</p> <p>18 MR ROGER LEE: I joined the company in 2015. I have not</p> <p>19 seen such information. In the past few months, however,</p> <p>20 I sought an understanding with people who have worked in</p> <p>21 the company for a long time and how these 29 sharp bends</p> <p>22 came about. I can supply the record to the committee.</p> <p>23 According to the information, at that time,</p> <p>24 Mr Edmond Ho, the managing director, said that the</p> <p>25 operations director of that time should approve it</p>

Page 61	<p>1 before it would be implemented. According to the</p> <p>2 records, in 2014, the proposal of the 29 sharp bends was</p> <p>3 not implemented, and in the record papers it was seen</p> <p>4 that many bus captains and frontline staff had a lot to</p> <p>5 say about the implementability, and in 2015, when I took</p> <p>6 over in early 2015, I knew nothing about that</p> <p>7 recommendation, but the present operations director,</p> <p>8 Mr Leung, or the head of the training school, can</p> <p>9 supplement.</p> <p>10 MR DUNCAN: I don't want to labour this point. All I'm</p> <p>11 asking is whether the information in the Excel format is</p> <p>12 available, and I think you've said that you could make</p> <p>13 the record available. Are you saying that it is</p> <p>14 available?</p> <p>15 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: I cannot answer the question now. I can</p> <p>16 find out.</p> <p>17 MR DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: And if you are able to locate it, would you</p> <p>19 provide it to the committee?</p> <p>20 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: The other records that I think Mr Lee was making</p> <p>22 reference to was the explanation for why the scheme was</p> <p>23 not implemented.</p> <p>24 MR ROGER LEE: (In English) That's right.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Could you make those records available?</p>	Page 63	<p>1 information.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: By all means add more, but tell us directly: do</p> <p>3 they exist or not?</p> <p>4 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) I don't have.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: They don't exist, as far as you are concerned?</p> <p>6 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) No.</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: I don't want to cut you off so tell us what it is</p> <p>8 you want to tell us.</p> <p>9 MR JAMES WONG: According to the documents, it said that it</p> <p>10 would require the approval of the OD to implement it.</p> <p>11 According to the record, at that time it was obstructed</p> <p>12 by many staff members so it was not implemented and</p> <p>13 therefore I think that this didn't go into the staff</p> <p>14 members telling them about the sharp bends.</p> <p>15 For the sharp bends, KMB came up with safety</p> <p>16 guidelines, but it is not about those 29 sharp bends.</p> <p>17 In fact, for our website for staff members, we have</p> <p>18 provided road sections, including sharp bends and</p> <p>19 others, carrying with them the driving tips. They are</p> <p>20 available from the website for staff members. So, for</p> <p>21 an employee who has to drive a particular route, he</p> <p>22 types in the route and then, covering the starting point</p> <p>23 and the ending point, there will be things that would</p> <p>24 warrant the attention of the bus captains, including the</p> <p>25 bends. So, when he drives, he will follow the</p>
Page 62	<p>1 MR ROGER LEE: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: So there are two records. One is the Excel</p> <p>3 format with the 29 bends and whatever else went with it,</p> <p>4 and then the records that go to why it was not</p> <p>5 implemented.</p> <p>6 MR ROGER LEE: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>7 MR DUNCAN: Just to supplement that, if you look down at the</p> <p>8 bottom of the page, 96-7, there is reference to small</p> <p>9 reminding cards with exact locations of sharp bends and</p> <p>10 safe speeds having been printed. Could you also enquire</p> <p>11 into the company's records as to whether a sample of the</p> <p>12 printed card is available?</p> <p>13 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: I haven't seen that.</p> <p>14 MR JAMES WONG: In fact, in relation to this matter, I have</p> <p>15 looked it up. According to the information, I think at</p> <p>16 that time there was a proposal for the KMB to identify</p> <p>17 the sharp bends so that the bus captains would slow down</p> <p>18 the speed. I've got the minutes for that meeting, and</p> <p>19 as our MD has already said, at that time it would</p> <p>20 require the approval of the MD before it could be</p> <p>21 implemented.</p> <p>22 According to the agenda of that meeting --</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: Mr Wong, do these cards exist or not? Could you</p> <p>24 just answer that question directly?</p> <p>25 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) Because I want to add some more</p>	Page 64	<p>1 guidelines and drive carefully.</p> <p>2 That's all I want to supplement.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>4 MR DUNCAN: Thank you, Chairman.</p> <p>5 Could you go back now, please, to KMB-1 at page 30.</p> <p>6 We are back on the initial submissions to the committee,</p> <p>7 and in this particular respect you have been asked, you</p> <p>8 can see at the top of the page, to "identify and supply</p> <p>9 copies of any codes of practice established by your</p> <p>10 company"; do you see that?</p> <p>11 Under the codes of practice, there are two standards</p> <p>12 referred to, together with the Occupational Health and</p> <p>13 Safety Assessment Series. Do you see those references?</p> <p>14 The first of those is the International Organization</p> <p>15 for Standardization. Do you see that?</p> <p>16 MR ROGER LEE: Yes.</p> <p>17 MR DUNCAN: Would it be fair to say that there is nothing</p> <p>18 within that standard which applies directly to the</p> <p>19 matter of safety, applicable to bus captains?</p> <p>20 MR ROGER LEE: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>21 MR GODWIN SO: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>22 MR DUNCAN: Likewise, if we go to the second of the</p> <p>23 standards, the International Organization for</p> <p>24 Standardization -- ISO 14001 -- again, would there be</p> <p>25 nothing within that standard which is applicable to the</p>

Page 65	Page 67
<p>1 safety procedures which should be undertaken by a bus 2 captain?</p> <p>3 MR GODWIN SO: For ISO 14001, nothing, but ISO 9001, that's 4 all about quality management. It does involve safety.</p> <p>5 MR DUNCAN: Yes, but the question I'm asking is does it 6 concern safety with regard to the manner in which a bus 7 captain drives?</p> <p>8 MR GODWIN SO: For this question, I would like to ask you to 9 look at the second bullet above, "Staff Handbook". The 10 fifth item, there is this safe driving manual for bus 11 captains, and that involved the safety measures. 12 Perhaps Mr Duncan would like to talk about this one.</p> <p>13 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Let me supplement. Back to ISO. For 14 OHSAS 18001, that is the Occupational Health and Safety 15 Assessment Series, we do mention safety, one of them 16 being that for each depot, we have to set up a depot 17 safety committee with two elements. First, maintenance, 18 that is maintenance carried out within the depot. Then 19 another committee is for operations. 20 For each depot, it has to set up a structure, and it 21 is an occupational safety committee. The majority of 22 the members are from the operations section, including 23 Mr Pang. For the depot safety committee, for the part 24 concerning operations -- now, for bus captains, at the 25 bus termini, and for bus captains driving on the road,</p>	<p>1 there is nothing in the corporate safety manual, 2 OHSAS 18001 which dictates how a driver is to drive 3 safely? That's my simple question.</p> <p>4 MR GODWIN SO: If you want to know how a bus captain should 5 drive safely, then you should refer to what I have 6 talked about. That is the one found at annex 1837, that 7 is the safe driving manual for bus captains. That's 8 from the corporate.</p> <p>9 MR DUNCAN: Yes, the bus captain safety handbook; we are 10 aware of that. 11 What I want to refer you to is miscellaneous file 2 12 at page 769. You should be looking at a copy of the 13 letter apparently to the chairman of the LegCo's Panel 14 on Transport, dated 16 June 2016. Do you have that in 15 front of you?</p> <p>16 MR GODWIN SO: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>17 MR DUNCAN: And it appears to be from an organisation called 18 the Community for Road Safety; do you see that?</p> <p>19 MR GODWIN SO: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Is the heading of the letter, "Administration's 21 paper on new franchise for bus network of the Kowloon 22 Motor Bus Company Ltd -- report on the public 23 consultation on the new franchise"; is that the heading?</p> <p>24 MR GODWIN SO: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>25 MR DUNCAN: Now, if you read the letter itself, you will see</p>
Page 66	Page 68
<p>1 for bus captains moving around in the depot, we talk 2 about their working environment. For the depot safety 3 committee, it also examines the traffic accidents of the 4 depot. So it is under ISO 18001. We do have a "plan, 5 do, check, act", and that takes care of driving safety 6 matters. We do have it.</p> <p>7 MR DUNCAN: What I'm asking you is whether 18001 dictates 8 how a driver should drive. It doesn't descend to that 9 detail, does it?</p> <p>10 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: I would like to say that this is not the 11 only thing to govern the driving of bus captains. As 12 Mr So has said, for ISO 9001, there are measures 13 relating to the safe driving of bus captains. 14 What I want to say is that there are different 15 systems, and each will have its own functions, and in 16 different ways it can contribute to the training, with 17 monitoring, enforcement of our bus captains. For 18001, 18 we talked about the depot safety committee. That takes 19 care of matters at the depot level. But then for the 20 Bus Captain Training School and then for the human 21 resources department, we have to look at it from the 22 corporate perspective. 23 So it isn't a matter of just having a single 24 element. We have to take a holistic view.</p> <p>25 MR DUNCAN: Yes, I understand that. My simple question is:</p>	<p>1 it refers to the submission of a document on 18 April 2 2016 to the government, which you can see on the 3 following page, 770. Is the company aware of this 4 organisation called the Community for Road Safety?</p> <p>5 MR GODWIN SO: I became aware of this organisation as 6 a result of this submission. Prior to that, I didn't.</p> <p>7 MR DUNCAN: Have you read this document then, the document 8 which commences at page 770, "New Franchise for Bus 9 Network of the Kowloon Motor Bus Co Ltd"? Have you 10 already read it?</p> <p>11 MR GODWIN SO: (In English) Briefly.</p> <p>12 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. Can I take you, please, to page 772. 13 Do you see a heading on that page, "Bus Safety -- Road 14 Safety Management System"?</p> <p>15 MR GODWIN SO: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>16 MR DUNCAN: Could you read the contents of that section, 17 please, to yourself.</p> <p>18 MR GODWIN SO: (In English) Okay.</p> <p>19 MR DUNCAN: Are you aware of that standard, ISO 39001?</p> <p>20 MR GODWIN SO: Yes, from this submission.</p> <p>21 MR DUNCAN: Were you not aware of this prior to reading this 22 submission?</p> <p>23 MR GODWIN SO: No, not before that.</p> <p>24 MR DUNCAN: Have you read the standard since reading this 25 submission?</p>

Page 69	Page 71
<p>1 MR GODWIN SO: (In English) Briefly.</p> <p>2 MR DUNCAN: And do you think there is some merit in the</p> <p>3 standard as far as your company is concerned?</p> <p>4 MR GODWIN SO: Well, let me say this. First of all, for</p> <p>5 this report or for this submission, I don't think they</p> <p>6 have carried out any site visit at our company, nor did</p> <p>7 they consult us. Then, for this standard, this is not</p> <p>8 the only safety standard. For the author writing this</p> <p>9 report, I think he also said that the bus operator</p> <p>10 should come up with a safety system so as to achieve</p> <p>11 this particular ISO standard, namely 39001.</p> <p>12 In our company, there is a safety system. We built</p> <p>13 it on the premise of ISO 9001, and ISO 39001 is actually</p> <p>14 evolving from ISO 9001. It has covered four main</p> <p>15 pillars: plan, do, check, act. And we have also got</p> <p>16 renewed accreditation under ISO 9001. And recently we</p> <p>17 engaged a transport expert from the UK to the company to</p> <p>18 look at our operation, our maintenance, in order to</p> <p>19 conduct a health check on us, so as to enhance our</p> <p>20 internal safety standards. That is our own safety</p> <p>21 standard. It might not have to be pegged to ISO 39001.</p> <p>22 Nevertheless, it is a very high quality standard.</p> <p>23 MR DUNCAN: When you say "recently", when was that?</p> <p>24 MR ROGER LEE: I would like to add, I think it was in</p> <p>25 March/April this year, our board of directors hoped to</p>	<p>1 MR ROGER LEE: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>2 (Via interpreter) Actually, a lot of information was</p> <p>3 submitted beforehand but the actual work just started.</p> <p>4 The consultant will certainly submit reports to our</p> <p>5 board after he has reviewed our operations.</p> <p>6 MR DUNCAN: When do you expect that that report would be</p> <p>7 available?</p> <p>8 MR ROGER LEE: Within the year.</p> <p>9 MR DUNCAN: You mean within 2018 or within 12 months?</p> <p>10 MR ROGER LEE: It will be in stages. The first stage is for</p> <p>11 them to do a body check, to see where we can improve.</p> <p>12 This is difficult because, first of all, he has to get</p> <p>13 to know our colleagues, so this will be done in stages.</p> <p>14 I believe there should be an initial report by the end</p> <p>15 of the year.</p> <p>16 MR DUNCAN: Right. I'm now going to turn to the topic of</p> <p>17 the black box, which has been referred to on a number of</p> <p>18 occasions already this morning.</p> <p>19 Can we start by picking up KMB-1 at page 50. Again,</p> <p>20 this page is part of the initial submission made by the</p> <p>21 company to the committee back in April of this year.</p> <p>22 At page 50, the question that was asked, question</p> <p>23 number 2:</p> <p>24 "Are electronic recording device eg</p> <p>25 tachographs/blackboxes and speed Limiters installed on</p>
Page 70	Page 72
<p>1 engage a overseas expert to look at our operations.</p> <p>2 Whether it is about maintenance of our fleet or duty</p> <p>3 despatch for bus captains and even training, we would</p> <p>4 like to see how we can enhance our service in this</p> <p>5 regard.</p> <p>6 Actually, there is more than one expert. Actually,</p> <p>7 yesterday they started to work.</p> <p>8 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Well, yesterday they came to Hong Kong</p> <p>9 They came to our depots to start working.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: And who are they?</p> <p>11 MR ROGER LEE: I don't have the name of the company. Can</p> <p>12 I supplement it afterwards?</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: Yes, please do so. Do none of your colleagues</p> <p>14 know the name of this consultant?</p> <p>15 MR ROGER LEE: Actually, it was in spring this year that</p> <p>16 I went to London. I met a few consultants. Some worked</p> <p>17 at London Transport. Some worked at large bus operators</p> <p>18 in the UK. Most of them are experienced operators in</p> <p>19 the UK. The company's name is Direx Solutions Ltd. It</p> <p>20 is a consultant company. Most of the consultants have</p> <p>21 been experienced in large bus operation in the UK.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>23 MR DUNCAN: So do I understand there is an investigation</p> <p>24 underway; there is no report available as yet?</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: I think you said they began yesterday.</p>	<p>1 all buses? What information from these devices</p> <p>2 pertaining to monitoring the driving performance of bus</p> <p>3 captains is captured, and how is the collected</p> <p>4 information used to enhance driving safety? Are the</p> <p>5 buses equipped with forward-looking cameras that record</p> <p>6 and retain the progress of the vehicle?"</p> <p>7 I'm particularly interested in the second sentence,</p> <p>8 "What information from these devices pertaining to</p> <p>9 monitoring the driving performance of bus captains is</p> <p>10 captured, and how is the collected information used to</p> <p>11 enhance driving safety?"</p> <p>12 You will see the answer which has been provided to</p> <p>13 the committee, the first bullet:</p> <p>14 "All KMB and LWB buses are equipped with black boxes</p> <p>15 and speed limiters."</p> <p>16 Secondly:</p> <p>17 "The black boxes capture the information of vehicle</p> <p>18 speed and vehicle location.</p> <p>19 Operations sections of KMB and LWB monitor bus speed</p> <p>20 daily for the driving record of the preceding 10 days to</p> <p>21 monitor BCs' driving performance. Information will be</p> <p>22 passed to performance managers to commence disciplinary</p> <p>23 action within 14 working days from the time of the</p> <p>24 contravention."</p> <p>25 Do you see that answer?</p>

Page 73	Page 75
<p>1 MR ROGER LEE: (Nodded head).</p> <p>2 MR DUNCAN: Now, there are a number of matters I want to</p> <p>3 explore with you with regard to these black boxes. Let</p> <p>4 me make it clear at the outset what I'm interested in</p> <p>5 finding out on behalf of the committee. In particular,</p> <p>6 I'm interested in finding out what data these black</p> <p>7 boxes in your buses are capable of capturing, firstly;</p> <p>8 and secondly, what do they in fact capture, as opposed</p> <p>9 to what they are capable of capturing. And there's</p> <p>10 a third aspect, the use to which that data is actually</p> <p>11 put.</p> <p>12 I just make that all clear to you so you can</p> <p>13 understand why I'm asking these questions.</p> <p>14 I'm going to cover those matters in four areas, to</p> <p>15 try and make it simple for everybody concerned.</p> <p>16 First of all, I'm going to ask you what</p> <p>17 requirements, if any, the Transport Department has laid</p> <p>18 down for the installation and use of black boxes. So</p> <p>19 what obligations do you have by virtue of the Transport</p> <p>20 Department requirements? That's number one.</p> <p>21 Number two, I'm going to explore with you the data</p> <p>22 which is actually collected by the black boxes in the</p> <p>23 company's buses.</p> <p>24 Thirdly, I'm going to cover what use is actually</p> <p>25 made of that data to provide real-time alerts to the bus</p>	<p>1 MR DUNCAN: And is that a reference to a black box,</p> <p>2 an electronic data recording device?</p> <p>3 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes.</p> <p>4 MR DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>5 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: In reality, in November 2003, we started</p> <p>6 the installation. That was in November 2003. And</p> <p>7 before --</p> <p>8 MR DUNCAN: Right.</p> <p>9 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Sorry.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: Mr Leung, be patient. Mr Duncan will ask you</p> <p>11 questions. If there's something you wish to add because</p> <p>12 his questions aren't good enough, feel free to do so.</p> <p>13 MR DUNCAN: And does that contain the requirement, namely</p> <p>14 that buses first registered after 1 July 2004 should be</p> <p>15 installed with a black box complying with the stated</p> <p>16 technical specification? Is that the requirement?</p> <p>17 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Correct.</p> <p>18 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. If you turn the page, are the</p> <p>19 requirements set out there in items number 2 and 3?</p> <p>20 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Correct.</p> <p>21 MR DUNCAN: And the first of those, item 2, does that demand</p> <p>22 that, "The device should sample the following data at 1</p> <p>23 second intervals, and store data every 30 seconds for</p> <p>24 a period of 2 weeks"?</p> <p>25 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Correct.</p>
Page 74	Page 76
<p>1 drivers as they are driving the bus.</p> <p>2 Then, finally, I'm going to ask questions to find</p> <p>3 out what use is made of recorded black box data in order</p> <p>4 to facilitate the assessment of driving behaviour and</p> <p>5 also the monitoring of the driver as he is driving the</p> <p>6 bus.</p> <p>7 So those are the areas, I think, that the committee</p> <p>8 will be interested in, and we will go through those one</p> <p>9 by one; okay?</p> <p>10 MR PATRICK PANG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>11 MR DUNCAN: So the first of those topics is what</p> <p>12 requirements, if any, what obligations you have under</p> <p>13 the franchise agreement, or otherwise, to the Transport</p> <p>14 Department in respect of the installation and use of</p> <p>15 these black boxes.</p> <p>16 So can I take you in that context first of all to</p> <p>17 TD-5, and ask you to turn up, please, page 1597.</p> <p>18 Are you looking at a note from the Transport</p> <p>19 Department?</p> <p>20 MR ROGER LEE: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>21 MR DUNCAN: And is it addressed to a number of bus</p> <p>22 companies, including your own? And does it carry the</p> <p>23 heading, "Installation of Electronic Data Recording</p> <p>24 Devices on New Buses"? Is that the heading?</p> <p>25 MR ROGER LEE: (In English) Yes.</p>	<p>1 MR DUNCAN: And does it refer to two aspects, first of all</p> <p>2 the operation times?</p> <p>3 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Correct.</p> <p>4 MR DUNCAN: And, secondly, vehicle speed?</p> <p>5 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Correct.</p> <p>6 MR DUNCAN: In item 3, there is further reference to the</p> <p>7 software for analysing on-board or downloaded data</p> <p>8 should be capable of reporting two matters; is that</p> <p>9 right?</p> <p>10 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Correct.</p> <p>11 MR DUNCAN: First of all, with regard to an accident report,</p> <p>12 the vehicle speed profile, at a time interval which is</p> <p>13 then set out.</p> <p>14 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Correct.</p> <p>15 MR DUNCAN: Then, secondly, the over-speeding report: the</p> <p>16 frequency, maximum speed attained and over-speeding</p> <p>17 duration for speeds over 70 kilometres per hour?</p> <p>18 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Correct.</p> <p>19 MR DUNCAN: So was that the first requirement issued by the</p> <p>20 Transport Department with regard to the installation of</p> <p>21 black boxes and what they should be able to provide?</p> <p>22 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Correct.</p> <p>23 MR DUNCAN: We can perhaps come back to that further after</p> <p>24 the lunch break.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Gentlemen, we will take our lunch break now</p>

Page 77	Page 79
<p>1 and resume the hearing at 2.30 this afternoon. 2 2.30. Thank you. 3 (1.02 pm) 4 (The luncheon adjournment) 5 (2.30 pm) 6 CHAIRMAN: Good afternoon, gentlemen. 7 Mr Duncan. 8 MR DUNCAN: Thank you, Mr Chairman. 9 Gentlemen, we had seen before lunch the requirements 10 from the Transport Department with regard to the use of 11 black boxes in October 2003. 12 The next document I'd like to take you to, to be 13 found in KMB-1, and perhaps we can go to page 159 14 firstly. 15 This is the second submission that the company made 16 to the committee dated 18 May. If I could take you, 17 please, through to page 175. You will see at the top of 18 the page a question (5), in which the matter of the 19 franchise requirements is mentioned. 20 You will then see question (6), a question posed by 21 the committee: 22 "Please identify those franchise requirements. Are 23 the requirements imposed by the Transport Department? 24 Are they expressed in writing? If so, please provide 25 copies of those documents."</p>	<p>1 will see, I think, eight of them, numbered (i) through 2 to (viii). The third one of those refers to the 3 electronic data processing device, ie the black box. 4 Is it correct that the department has not stipulated 5 any requirement with regard to any particular use of the 6 black box? It has simply said that that is a safety 7 feature which the company should have? Is that correct? 8 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) That's correct. 9 MR DUNCAN: So to the extent that the explanation suggested 10 that that was an enhanced use of the black box, that 11 would be not the correct way to read this document at 12 page 3997; is that correct? 13 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: It's a bit complicated. 14 CHAIRMAN: It's complicated? 15 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes. 16 CHAIRMAN: What's complicated? 17 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) I try to explain. 18 CHAIRMAN: Yes. 19 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Chinese words not interpreted) ... 20 there's a commitment that we are going to do, but is it 21 an enhanced feature? It's difficult to comment. But we 22 have undertaken to do that. 23 MR DUNCAN: As I read it, you have undertaken to utilise the 24 device? 25 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: That's correct.</p>
Page 78	Page 80
<p>1 And in the company's response, there is reference to 2 clause 7(1) of the franchise, and then an explanation 3 which reads as follows: 4 "During the discussions of the new franchise, the 5 government has requested KMB to commit to adopt a list 6 of enhanced safety features including but not limited to 7 on-bus electronic data processing device (also known as 8 black box), speed limiter and surveillance cameras, as 9 the standard provisions when acquiring new buses (please 10 refer to extracts of the letter from [the department] 11 dated 10 March 2017 ...). KMB has given its undertaking 12 to TD to implement these commitments under the new 13 franchise." 14 The letter from TD is referred to in an annex, which 15 I'll ask you to turn up. That would be at KMB-9 at 16 page 3997. It's the second-last page of the bundle. 17 If you look at that page, it's headed, "Provision of 18 on-bus facilities", and it is introduced by saying, 19 "Pursuant to clause 7 of the new franchise, KMB has 20 committed", and there are set out under that sentence 21 item (a), and then an item (b) on the second page. 22 The one which is relevant for our purposes is under 23 (a) and under the heading, "Enhanced safety features", 24 as referred to in the previous document. 25 If you just go down the list of safety features, you</p>	<p>1 MR DUNCAN: And that's all? 2 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Of course, that device would be used, as 3 said, but we will make it as helpful as possible to the 4 company. But is it an enhanced safety feature? We are 5 of the view that it would be helpful for safety purpose. 6 CHAIRMAN: Mr Duncan's question was: there is no stipulation 7 by the Transport Department of any enhanced use of the 8 device, is there? 9 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) No. 10 CHAIRMAN: Nor is there any stipulation as to any 11 enhancement of the capabilities of the device. 12 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) No. 13 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 14 MR DUNCAN: I am grateful, Mr Chairman. 15 Apart from these two documents which we have seen, 16 the one in 2003 and this one in 2017, has the Transport 17 Department at any time required the company to make any 18 particular type of use of the black box? 19 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) No. 20 MR DUNCAN: Just before I leave the document at page 175 of 21 bundle 1, it is said in the last sentence that KMB has 22 given its undertaking to the Transport Department to 23 implement these conditions under the new franchise. 24 In what form was that undertaking given? 25 MR GODWIN SO: Maybe I should answer this question, because</p>

Page 81	<p>1 I played an important role in the franchise renewal.</p> <p>2 It's an undertaking, according to page 3997, it was the</p> <p>3 content of a letter, it was signed by the company,</p> <p>4 representing the commitment to implement these, so that</p> <p>5 the matter, the franchise, can be granted by referring</p> <p>6 the matter to ExCo. That's a commitment on our part.</p> <p>7 MR DUNCAN: Would you be able to provide a copy of the</p> <p>8 letter to the committee?</p> <p>9 MR GODWIN SO: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>10 MR DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: This is a standard letter that is issued very</p> <p>12 close to the time when the franchise is renewed? We've</p> <p>13 seen these before.</p> <p>14 But you're undertaking to do nothing, because there</p> <p>15 was no enhanced safety capability of the black box that</p> <p>16 had been stipulated and there was no enhancement of the</p> <p>17 use that was to be made of it. This was a puff, was it</p> <p>18 not?</p> <p>19 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: That's the requirement from the</p> <p>20 Transport Department, enhanced safety feature. It's the</p> <p>21 term used in the paper. We would see how we can make</p> <p>22 the best use of these features. It's not just about the</p> <p>23 wording. For example, electronic data processing device</p> <p>24 is mentioned, and they have certain specifications, and</p> <p>25 we would take the opportunity to enhance safety.</p>	Page 83	<p>1 MR DUNCAN: Have you had the opportunity of reading his</p> <p>2 evidence?</p> <p>3 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Briefly, yes.</p> <p>4 MR DUNCAN: What about the written documentation that he</p> <p>5 provided to the committee? Have you had the opportunity</p> <p>6 of reading that?</p> <p>7 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: I think you are referring to the documentation</p> <p>9 provided by Openmatics' solicitors?</p> <p>10 MR DUNCAN: Indeed, it came through the solicitors. Thank</p> <p>11 you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>12 In that respect, can I take you to one of the other</p> <p>13 bundles, BM-1. If you would be good enough, please, to</p> <p>14 turn up page 64 of that volume, you will see there that</p> <p>15 the law firm that the chairman obviously had in mind</p> <p>16 writing with regard to the services provided by the</p> <p>17 company referred to in that letter. Do you see that</p> <p>18 letter from the law firm?</p> <p>19 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Okay.</p> <p>20 MR DUNCAN: Then if you turn to page 65, you will see the</p> <p>21 information with which the committee has been provided</p> <p>22 from page 65 right through to page 72.</p> <p>23 The questions are in black and the answers have been</p> <p>24 provided in blue. I think that's the correct way of</p> <p>25 reading that letter.</p>
Page 82	<p>1 CHAIRMAN: The only specifications were dated November 2003.</p> <p>2 Nothing had changed since then.</p> <p>3 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Apart from this undertaking, we would do</p> <p>4 more. That's the minimum.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: Mr Leung, it's not a criticism of you. If the</p> <p>6 Transport Department, for their own reasons, invite you</p> <p>7 to undertake to commit to do nothing, you had agreed to</p> <p>8 it, hadn't you?</p> <p>9 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Chinese words not interpreted).</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: Mr Duncan.</p> <p>11 MR DUNCAN: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>12 I want to move on to the second of the areas</p> <p>13 I indicated I would cover with regards to the black box,</p> <p>14 and that is asking questions with regard to what data</p> <p>15 the black boxes in the KMB boxes are capable of</p> <p>16 collecting and what data they do actually collect. Do</p> <p>17 you understand that?</p> <p>18 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>19 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. I think you are aware that the</p> <p>20 committee have heard evidence from a Mr Kulis who is</p> <p>21 a representative of Openmatics, the company that</p> <p>22 supplied the black boxes to the company.</p> <p>23 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>24 MR DUNCAN: You are aware of that?</p> <p>25 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes.</p>	Page 84	<p>1 The first matters I wish to bring to your attention</p> <p>2 are on page 65. You will see in item 1:</p> <p>3 "In written submissions provided to the committee,</p> <p>4 dated 24 April 2018 ... KMB stated that ...</p> <p>5 'Since 2015, KMB has taken the initiative to equip</p> <p>6 its buses with speed limiters, black boxes and</p> <p>7 surveillance cameras to monitor the driving performance</p> <p>8 of the bus captains as well as to assist in accident</p> <p>9 investigation."</p> <p>10 If I could bring your attention, please, to the</p> <p>11 response in the next three paragraphs:</p> <p>12 "Please note that the Openmatics portfolio does not</p> <p>13 consist of the aforementioned speed limiters and</p> <p>14 surveillance cameras. However, the black box is part of</p> <p>15 the Openmatics telematics system as explained below.</p> <p>16 Openmatics entered into a supply contract to deliver</p> <p>17 telematics systems, dated 16th of April 2013 with</p> <p>18 Kowloon Bus Company ... and Long Win Bus Company ...</p> <p>19 Openmatics started offering telematics services by</p> <p>20 using the first black box system called the 'Mozart</p> <p>21 box'. Later on, Openmatics replaced the Mozart Box by</p> <p>22 a successor platform black box called the 'Bach Box'.</p> <p>23 However, clients can use both systems in parallel as</p> <p>24 [Kowloon Motor Bus] does."</p> <p>25 First of all, I will ask you to confirm that what is</p>

Page 85	<p>1 said in those three paragraphs is correct.</p> <p>2 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) It is correct.</p> <p>3 MR DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>4 I now want you, please, to turn to page 68 of the</p> <p>5 letter. If I could bring your attention to the second</p> <p>6 paragraph on that page which is coloured blue, and which</p> <p>7 reads this:</p> <p>8 "What does the term 'BC' stands for?"</p> <p>9 Then the following paragraph:</p> <p>10 "The Openmatics telematics system installed at KMB</p> <p>11 can identify", and then four bullets:</p> <p>12 "records of speeding; recorded every second and</p> <p>13 stored together with the related GPS data;</p> <p>14 'malpractice' of harsh braking;</p> <p>15 Abrupt acceleration;</p> <p>16 The corresponding bus registration numbers with the</p> <p>17 assistance of other systems".</p> <p>18 Are you able to confirm that that sets out what data</p> <p>19 the systems on the KMB bus are capable of identifying?</p> <p>20 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>21 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. Before I go to the next page, there</p> <p>22 is one matter I would like to take up with you. If you</p> <p>23 would look down to the next entry:</p> <p>24 "The Openmatics telematic system installed at KMB</p> <p>25 cannot identify:</p>	Page 87	<p>1 transmitting the information to bus headquarters. The</p> <p>2 data will be kept in the computer under the bus on-board</p> <p>3 monitoring system ..."</p> <p>4 Now, there would appear, at least on the face of</p> <p>5 those two documents, to be a difference in that,</p> <p>6 according to the letter from the law firm, the data is</p> <p>7 sent every 30 seconds, whereas according to the return</p> <p>8 from the company it seems that the delay or the time at</p> <p>9 which the data is sent is every 10 seconds. Would you</p> <p>10 be able to comment on what appears to be a difference?</p> <p>11 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>12 (Via interpreter) Currently, the delay is 30</p> <p>13 seconds. We hope to achieve a delay of 10 seconds, and</p> <p>14 we hope to achieve this by enhancing our servers, and</p> <p>15 technically we want to enable data to be committed to be</p> <p>16 transmitted more frequently. So currently the delay is</p> <p>17 30 seconds.</p> <p>18 MR DUNCAN: So what steps are you taking to achieve</p> <p>19 a 10-second delay?</p> <p>20 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: We will look to enhance server</p> <p>21 technologies in order to achieve our target of 10</p> <p>22 seconds.</p> <p>23 MR DUNCAN: When do you expect that to happen?</p> <p>24 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: We have no concrete timeline now but we</p> <p>25 are moving towards that direction.</p>
Page 86	<p>1 Route numbers of certain buses".</p> <p>2 But then the next paragraph is the one I am now</p> <p>3 interested in:</p> <p>4 "The data are collected as defined by the system.</p> <p>5 Every second, the system collects the defined data and</p> <p>6 sends that data every 30 seconds -- if connected to WiFi</p> <p>7 or other cellular network or via USB -- to the defined</p> <p>8 FDP server. The information is also stored locally on</p> <p>9 the telemetry unit (black box) for 30 days. But data</p> <p>10 from the telemetry unit can be lost if it is not</p> <p>11 downloaded correctly."</p> <p>12 If you look at the bottom of the page, the very last</p> <p>13 paragraph, there is a repetition of that entry, and it</p> <p>14 refers to the data being sent to the server every 30</p> <p>15 seconds.</p> <p>16 Could I then take you, please, to KMB-1 again, at</p> <p>17 page 72. This again, if I could remind you, is the</p> <p>18 response of 24 April this year of the company to the</p> <p>19 committee, the first response.</p> <p>20 Could I bring your attention, please, to the last</p> <p>21 paragraph on that page:</p> <p>22 "Black boxes are installed in all buses to capture</p> <p>23 the real-time information, such as speed, route, door</p> <p>24 open or close status and Global Positioning System (ie</p> <p>25 GPS), but there is a delay of about 10 seconds for</p>	Page 88	<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Can you help me at least by explaining what you</p> <p>2 mean by "enhance server technology"?</p> <p>3 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: The current delay is 30 seconds mainly</p> <p>4 due to server capacity, and the flow of data would</p> <p>5 increase. So this is an issue we have to solve.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: What server? Whose server?</p> <p>7 MR GODWIN SO: I would like to add to what I just said about</p> <p>8 the difference between 10 seconds and 30 seconds and how</p> <p>9 we can reconcile the difference.</p> <p>10 10 seconds referred to a delay when an incident is</p> <p>11 triggered, data would be sent after 10 seconds, and if</p> <p>12 the delay is 30 seconds, data would be transmitted to</p> <p>13 our headquarters every 30 seconds. So 10 seconds refers</p> <p>14 to a data delay, whereas for 30 seconds data would be</p> <p>15 sent to the headquarters every 30 seconds. So the two</p> <p>16 are referring to different procedures or processes.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: I'm asking for an explanation as to what this</p> <p>18 server is. Whose server is it? Where is it? What</p> <p>19 function does it perform?</p> <p>20 MR GODWIN SO: The server is located in the data centre of</p> <p>21 our Kowloon Bay depot and the function is to store the</p> <p>22 data for analysis, to explain certain exceptions.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: So its capacity is not sufficient at the moment</p> <p>24 to produce a 10-second transmission; is that it?</p> <p>25 MR GODWIN SO: (In English) Correct.</p>

Page 89	Page 91
<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>2 MR DUNCAN: Are you aware of the fact that whether it's</p> <p>3 a 30-second gap or a 10-second gap or even a 5-second</p> <p>4 gap is a matter of choice for the user of the black box?</p> <p>5 MR GODWIN SO: For the transmission gap of 30 seconds, that</p> <p>6 would not affect our analysis of data from the black</p> <p>7 box. As suggested in another paper, no bus route data</p> <p>8 is provided, so we would have to store this data and we</p> <p>9 would have to identify from other systems what the</p> <p>10 routes are and who the relevant bus captains are, before</p> <p>11 we can take warning or disciplinary action.</p> <p>12 These reports are generated daily, so whether or not</p> <p>13 the transmission delay is 10 seconds or 30 seconds has</p> <p>14 no bearing on the task of analysis.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: Because there is no real-time analysis; is that</p> <p>16 it?</p> <p>17 MR GODWIN SO: For real-time, yes, correct, we do not</p> <p>18 perform real-time analysis.</p> <p>19 MR DUNCAN: Just if I could have an answer to my question,</p> <p>20 please.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Mr Duncan, perhaps Prof Lo could ask a question.</p> <p>22 MEMBER LO: I just want to clarify. There's this 10-second</p> <p>23 delay, and then you send the data 30 seconds later, so</p> <p>24 the total delay is 40 seconds, right? Is that correct?</p> <p>25 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Let me correct it. At the</p>	<p>1 advances we can achieve that goal sooner. It has to do</p> <p>2 with data volume and data traffic and data storage.</p> <p>3 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Could it be just a matter of having a much</p> <p>4 more powerful server? Could that be the solution?</p> <p>5 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Not necessarily. We are looking into</p> <p>6 ways to improve or increase the speed of traffic.</p> <p>7 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Thank you.</p> <p>8 MR DUNCAN: Could you look, please, at page 69 of BM-1,</p> <p>9 again the same enclosure to the law firm's letter. If</p> <p>10 you look at the second portion in blue on that page, and</p> <p>11 the second paragraph:</p> <p>12 "The telematics system installed at KMB is capable</p> <p>13 of recording deceleration and acceleration of the buses.</p> <p>14 However, the deceleration and acceleration of the buses</p> <p>15 as feature recording this on an ongoing basis is not</p> <p>16 enabled."</p> <p>17 If I could just supplement what is said there by</p> <p>18 taking you to the oral evidence of Mr Kulis, who was</p> <p>19 a representative of Openmatics. You will find this in</p> <p>20 the transcript for Day 6, transcript volume 3, Day 6,</p> <p>21 page 146.</p> <p>22 Can I bring your attention to line 21, please. Line</p> <p>23 21 starts with the words "Mr Derek Chan" who is the</p> <p>24 gentleman sitting beside me, one of the counsel for the</p> <p>25 committee, and he asks this question:</p>
Page 90	Page 92
<p>1 moment, every 30 seconds the data, for that 30 seconds,</p> <p>2 are transmitted through the internet to our server. The</p> <p>3 10 delays are equivalent to 30, I mean in terms of</p> <p>4 meaning. So existing is 30. Our intention is to</p> <p>5 shorten it to 10. That's the situation.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>7 Mr Duncan, your question.</p> <p>8 MR DUNCAN: Yes. The question I'm asking is this. Do you</p> <p>9 realise that it's a matter of choice for the user of the</p> <p>10 black box as to what the time delay should be: 30</p> <p>11 seconds, 20 seconds, 10 seconds or 5 seconds? It is</p> <p>12 just a matter pertaining to the parameters; are you</p> <p>13 aware of that?</p> <p>14 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: This is a decision. It depends on</p> <p>15 technical consideration, resources, and whether we feel</p> <p>16 that this is conducive to our work on how data can be</p> <p>17 transmitted to the system sooner.</p> <p>18 MR DUNCAN: Technically, it's feasible?</p> <p>19 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: It should be.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: What are the financial implications for</p> <p>21 increasing the capacity of the server to permit</p> <p>22 transmission in 10 seconds rather than 30 seconds, in</p> <p>23 broad terms?</p> <p>24 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: We haven't looked into that but it would</p> <p>25 not be a small sum. We hope with the technological</p>	<p>1 "In the middle of the page, again, in blue, that is</p> <p>2 the answers from your company, it is stated that ..."</p> <p>3 And he has referred to the same passage I just</p> <p>4 referred you to, where it is said that the deceleration</p> <p>5 and acceleration is not enabled, and the question he</p> <p>6 asks is this:</p> <p>7 "Are you able to elaborate or explain to us what is</p> <p>8 meant by this paragraph, especially the part about</p> <p>9 recording acceleration and deceleration on an ongoing</p> <p>10 basis?"</p> <p>11 Mr Kulis responds as follows:</p> <p>12 "Yes, I'm also not sure if I will get the point of</p> <p>13 this sentence correctly, but I think the sentence is</p> <p>14 referring to the situation that these values,</p> <p>15 acceleration and deceleration, for the KMB we are using</p> <p>16 to raise realtime warnings, not for recording them to</p> <p>17 the data. This is my understanding of this declaration.</p> <p>18 So we have the system, the driver feedback device, which</p> <p>19 is warning the drivers in the realtime if they [are]</p> <p>20 accelerating too much or decelerating too much. For</p> <p>21 this propose we are using the values of acceleration and</p> <p>22 deceleration, we are not storing these values for the</p> <p>23 historical data. That's my understanding of this</p> <p>24 sentence declaration.</p> <p>25 MR DEREK CHAN: I see. Okay.</p>

Page 93	Page 95
<p>1 So your understanding is that the acceleration and 2 deceleration are not recorded in the black box data 3 systems? 4 Is that correct, Mr Kulis? 5 MR KULIS: Yes, that's my understanding. Because 6 another function of the -- our box is the record, the 7 several data, as the black box feature. There are maybe 8 20 different values, but not the acceleration and 9 deceleration." 10 So we will pause there. So what Mr Kulis seems to 11 be saying is that although the KMB black box is capable 12 of storing the data pertaining to acceleration and 13 deceleration, that facility has not been enabled for 14 KMB. Now, I would ask whether the company would wish to 15 comment on that, in the light of the evidence given this 16 morning by one of you that the deceleration and 17 acceleration data is in fact stored and is in fact 18 accessed in the context of monitoring driver behaviour. 19 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: It's correct to say that it is not 20 stored, data are not stored, on the black box, but the 21 information on acceleration and deceleration will be 22 transmitted back to our server, so it's there. 23 MR DUNCAN: So are you saying it's stored in the server? 24 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Correct. 25 MR DUNCAN: Once it is stored in the server, how would the</p>	<p>1 information about a particular black box? Is that what 2 you are saying? 3 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: It's not that. 4 CHAIRMAN: Then I missed it. Try again. 5 MR ROGER LEE: Let me supplement. The information in 6 relation to a black box, that is the information on 7 acceleration and deceleration, will be transmitted to 8 the server from the black box, and in that server we can 9 tell the entire journey from the start to the end. We 10 can check information on the entire journey, and also 11 the position of the relevant stops -- 12 CHAIRMAN: Forgive me for interrupting. Is this done by 13 going to a particular black box, "We want information 14 from this black box"? Presumably, you can tie up the 15 black box with a bus number; is that how it's done? 16 MR ROGER LEE: That's correct. 17 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) At the back end we can -- 18 (Via interpreter) Yes, we can match the two. The 19 number of black box, it is connected to the number of 20 the bus. We know which bus has got this particular 21 black box. You know the number of the black box and you 22 know the number of the bus. 23 CHAIRMAN: So the operator who is searching the server is 24 asking for data in respect of a particular black box and 25 therefore bus; is that it?</p>
Page 94	Page 96
<p>1 persons in the company get access to that data, in 2 a practical sense? 3 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: The information in the server would tell 4 us the information on acceleration and deceleration, and 5 then we can see whether there is any exceedance of 6 standards or norms, extreme acceleration and extreme 7 deceleration, leading to improper driving behaviour, as 8 an example. We will use the information to identify the 9 relevant bus captains so that we can review the driving 10 behaviour by some other department in my company. 11 That's how we use the information stored. 12 CHAIRMAN: Mr Duncan's question was: how does the person 13 access that information? What happens; what steps are 14 taken? That was the question. 15 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: The information is in the computer. We 16 have some computer software to deal with such 17 information, which would mean that some reports would be 18 generated through such software. The information is 19 only about information of that black box in question, 20 acceleration/deceleration, et cetera. But there is no 21 information on the bus routes or the bus captains 22 concerned. So we have to process the information before 23 the reports can be generated and some other departments 24 in my company can then take follow-up action. 25 CHAIRMAN: So the person requests the computer to give</p>	<p>1 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes. Yes. 2 CHAIRMAN: Before I ask Mr Duncan to resume, let me ask you 3 this. Why, if the black box is capable of storing the 4 data of deceleration and acceleration, is it not stored 5 there as well as being transmitted to the server? 6 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Let me explain. The black box records 7 on a second-to-second basis the location, the speed of 8 the time, the coordinates, and we compare the speed of 9 this second with that of the last second. If the 10 acceleration is over a pre-set value, it's 4km at 11 present, if it exceeds the value of 4km, then there 12 would be an alert for the bus captain, by a light and 13 also by a sound alarm. 14 If, for this second, the alarm has been triggered, 15 then the data of the fact that the alarm has been 16 triggered would also be recorded. If, for a particular 17 second, the speed compared with that of the last second 18 is lower than a set value 7km -- it used to be 8km -- 19 that is to say it is a very abrupt deceleration, 20 likewise, the warning device would be lit and a beep 21 will come off and the warning for abrupt braking would 22 also be recorded at that moment. 23 So all these warnings during that second or moment 24 would be transmitted back to our server, so we can check 25 whether warnings were issued in that second. So the</p>

Page 97	<p>1 number of reminders or warnings are stored in our 2 server, so we know when warnings were issued to bus 3 captains and for what reason. All this information is 4 available in our servers. 5 CHAIRMAN: So does it come to this, that whereas speed is 6 recorded on a black box every second, as is required by 7 the Transport Department, deceleration is only recorded 8 if it crosses the thresholds you have just identified, 9 namely an increase in speed of 4 kilometres per second 10 and a decrease of 7 kilometres? Is that it? 11 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: I would like to supplement. I forgot to 12 mention speeding. Likewise, if the speed exceeds 13 a pre-set value, that second, right now our threshold is 14 70kph, if the speed exceeds 70kph, the device would go 15 off, and in that second the warning given by the device 16 would be recorded if the speed of the vehicle exceeds 17 70 kilometres per hour. So in case of harsh braking or 18 sudden deceleration, if it exceeds the pre-set value, it 19 would be recorded, and the second-by-second record would 20 be transmitted to our servers. 21 CHAIRMAN: When was the speed excess set at 70 kilometres 22 per hour? 23 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: On 23 February, we adjusted the speed 24 threshold to 70. It used to be 75. 25 CHAIRMAN: That's 2018?</p>	Page 99	<p>1 because we can calculate this based on the difference in 2 speed. 3 CHAIRMAN: This answer is not a complete answer to the fact, 4 is it, as Mr Duncan is suggesting to you? The question 5 is why. 6 This is 12 words, that was the answer, to what was 7 an open-ended question, seeking assistance from your 8 company. 9 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: I can only say that the black boxes 10 capture vehicle speed. 11 CHAIRMAN: Amongst other things. 12 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Among other things, yes. 13 CHAIRMAN: The question is why didn't you mention the other 14 things. I'm asking you the question because you are the 15 person answering. I don't know who made this submission 16 but somebody wrote this and I'm asking why it's less 17 than complete. 18 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: There are more than 20 parameters 19 including time, date, vehicle speed, engine, the number 20 of revolutions per minute. 21 CHAIRMAN: So why are they not mentioned here? 22 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: These are the two main data to monitor 23 bus captains. 24 CHAIRMAN: Mr Duncan. 25 MR DUNCAN: I'm going to move now to the third area which</p>
Page 98	<p>1 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes. 2 CHAIRMAN: Yes. 3 Mr Duncan. 4 MR DUNCAN: Thank you, Mr Chairman. 5 Just so I understand this completely -- I want to 6 take you back to the information that you provided the 7 committee in your first submission and then what was 8 provided in the second submission. 9 Could I take you to your first submission at 10 page 50. I've taken you to this page and indicated that 11 I was interested in the second sentence of the question: 12 "What information from these devices pertaining to 13 monitoring the driving performance of bus captains is 14 captured, and how is the collected information used to 15 enhance driving safety?" 16 In your answer, with regard to the capturing of 17 information, the only matter which is mentioned is 18 vehicle speed and vehicle location. There is no mention 19 there of acceleration or deceleration. Is there any 20 reason for that? 21 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Vehicle speed is available 22 second-by-second, and I explained the difference between 23 speed at this moment and the next equates to 24 acceleration or deceleration. That's why we do not have 25 another device to record deceleration or acceleration,</p>	Page 100	<p>1 I indicated I was interested in and -- we've touched on 2 this already but -- sorry, we haven't touched on this 3 yet. The third area is what use is made of the data 4 being collected to provide real-time assistance to the 5 bus captain? That's the area I'm now interested in. 6 I'm going to ask you, with respect, to go to page 65 7 of BM-1 again, the letter from the law firm. Halfway 8 down the page, in blue, it is stated: 9 "The telematics system consists of the three main 10 parts". 11 The first part he has referred to is the driver 12 feedback device. There's an introduction: 13 "This device provides visual and acoustic feedback 14 to the driver about four basic threshold values (engine 15 revving, speeding, idling, and acceleration). It is 16 placed in the driver's cabin and connected to the 17 Openmatics on-board unit. 18 Driver feedback overview means the driver will be 19 informed about the information by beeping and 20 illuminating four LED lights if the - calibrated - 21 thresholds will be reached." 22 Then you have further details of the engine, the 23 speed, the idling and the acceleration set out on that 24 page. 25 Does this accurately reflect the real-time driver</p>

Page 101	Page 103
<p>1 alert system which is installed in the KMB buses?</p> <p>2 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Correct.</p> <p>3 MR DUNCAN: If you would then be good enough, please, to</p> <p>4 turn the page, so I can ask questions about thresholds.</p> <p>5 At the top of page 68, the writer of this document says</p> <p>6 this:</p> <p>7 "To our knowledge, the driver feedback system was</p> <p>8 installed in the accident vehicle."</p> <p>9 Referring to the Tai Po accident.</p> <p>10 "The driver feedback thresholds for the accident bus</p> <p>11 were initially defined by KMB and then calibrated by</p> <p>12 Openmatics to fit KMB's defined parameters."</p> <p>13 Do you confirm that to be correct?</p> <p>14 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes, it's correct.</p> <p>15 MR DUNCAN: "According to the history, the four thresholds</p> <p>16 on the accident vehicle were defined by KMB and then</p> <p>17 calibrated by Openmatics latest at [24 July] 2017."</p> <p>18 Is that correct?</p> <p>19 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: I would like to add one point. Yes, for</p> <p>20 acceleration and deceleration, for tilting angle, it</p> <p>21 says 44 here, 44 degrees. We never had any defined</p> <p>22 threshold. We did not provide any value because we</p> <p>23 could not identify any reference values and it wasn't</p> <p>24 provided to ZF.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, by KMB? By KMB? It wasn't provided by</p>	<p>1 correct?</p> <p>2 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: And there is a second threshold configuration,</p> <p>4 speed in areas.</p> <p>5 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: As opposed to speed, and that is also set at 75?</p> <p>7 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) That we are not aware of.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: I should say 75 kilometres per hour. But you are</p> <p>9 not aware of the second one?</p> <p>10 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) No.</p> <p>11 (Via interpreter) Correct.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>13 Mr Duncan.</p> <p>14 MR DUNCAN: Then there's a configuration of idling values</p> <p>15 and engine values; do you see that?</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: 3,000 revs per minute, isn't it?</p> <p>17 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>18 (Via interpreter) Yes.</p> <p>19 MR DUNCAN: Were these the thresholds that existed not just</p> <p>20 in the bus which was involved in the Tai Po accident but</p> <p>21 on all Kowloon Motor Bus buses at that time?</p> <p>22 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: And they will be defined by KMB and calibrated</p> <p>24 by Openmatics; is that correct?</p> <p>25 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes.</p>
Page 102	Page 104
<p>1 the company?</p> <p>2 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) By KMB.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Were you aware that this threshold had been</p> <p>4 inputted into the Tai Po bus, 44 degrees?</p> <p>5 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes, we are aware of that.</p> <p>6 MR DUNCAN: Are you aware that Mr Kulis explained that that</p> <p>7 is really a default provision, which means there is no</p> <p>8 provision for a tilting parameter at all?</p> <p>9 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes, I understand.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: In effect, it disabled this function? Would that</p> <p>11 be fair?</p> <p>12 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Correct.</p> <p>13 MR DUNCAN: The document continues to say:</p> <p>14 "According to our best knowledge at the time of the</p> <p>15 accident, the thresholds were", and they are there set</p> <p>16 out; we can read them for ourselves.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: Perhaps, for the record, you would read them out</p> <p>18 for us, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>19 If I can help, acceleration is set in metres per</p> <p>20 second, is it not, 1.15?</p> <p>21 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) 1.15 metres per second</p> <p>22 squared.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: Squared, yes.</p> <p>24 Deceleration set at 2.3 metres per second squared.</p> <p>25 Speed, set at kilometres per hour, 75; is that</p>	<p>1 MR DUNCAN: Just dealing with the two matters pertaining to</p> <p>2 speed, if I understand things correctly, if any of the</p> <p>3 particular buses exceeded a speed of 75 kilometres per</p> <p>4 hour, the driver would experience a beeping sound and</p> <p>5 also a blinking light in the cabin; is that correct?</p> <p>6 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Correct.</p> <p>7 MR DUNCAN: What about the situation if the bus was</p> <p>8 travelling at, say, 60 kilometres per hour in</p> <p>9 a 50 kilometre per hour speed limit zone? Would there</p> <p>10 be any sort of alert to the captain?</p> <p>11 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Not at the moment.</p> <p>12 MR DUNCAN: Would it be desirable that such a system</p> <p>13 existed?</p> <p>14 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes, yes, absolutely.</p> <p>15 MR DUNCAN: Could I in this respect take you to the evidence</p> <p>16 of Mr Kulis, at Day 6, volume 3, at page 150.</p> <p>17 If I could bring your attention to line 7 on</p> <p>18 page 150, where Mr Chan has introduced the subject by</p> <p>19 saying:</p> <p>20 "The next parameter under tilting angle is the</p> <p>21 configuration of excessive speed values.</p> <p>22 In this screenshot we can see two parameters under</p> <p>23 that. One is speed and one is speed in areas, and [in]</p> <p>24 this case, both are set at 75 kilometres per hour.</p> <p>25 Now, firstly, a more basic question. Just to see if</p>

Page 105	Page 107
<p>1 my understanding is correct. So if the bus in this case 2 exceeds 75 kilometres per hour, the threshold would be 3 considered crossed; is that correct?" 4 Then at line 17, Mr Chan asked this question: 5 "What is the difference between these two 6 parameters, speed and speed in areas?" 7 Perhaps you would be good enough to read to yourself 8 what follows, from line 19 right through to page 155 at 9 line 9. Just take your time to read that through, 10 please. 11 Have you been able to read that through? 12 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes. 13 MR DUNCAN: If I understand that evidence correctly, 14 Mr Kulis is suggesting two different ways whereby there 15 may be the two different speed limits set up. Is that 16 your own understanding? 17 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes. 18 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. The first is what we can see on 19 page 151. This is at line 2: 20 "... you need also to configure the areas in some 21 other window, or enter some geo-fencing into the 22 system." 23 And at line 7, Mr Chan's question: 24 "Obviously the bus, if you wish to take advantage of 25 the speed in areas parameter, the system would have to</p>	<p>1 And he then proceeds to give an explanation. 2 Now, as I understand it, there is available in 3 Hong Kong digital mapping of our roads; is that correct? 4 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes. 5 MR DUNCAN: So given what you said a few moments ago, that 6 it would be desirable to have a system whereby speeds in 7 excess of 50 in a 50 zone would be detected, what is 8 your reaction to the possible implementation of either 9 of these two possible routes suggested by Mr Kulis? 10 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: We are glad to learn about this, and, 11 well, because of the IRC, we will be able to have access 12 to official digital maps. 13 The speed limit is an important matter, in respect 14 of different road sections. If the information is 15 incorrect, it would have grave consequences. So we have 16 been talking to different parties on how we may know the 17 speed limits in different locations, different areas, so 18 that when the vehicle reaches a certain location, we 19 will know that it is 70kmh or 50kmh as the limit, 20 because right now we can't tell one from the other, so 21 we set it at 70kmh. 22 If we know that in that particular location the 23 speed limit is 50kmh, then the alarm will be triggered. 24 We have conducted a test drive, by incorporating the 25 road speed limits into the black box, so that the road</p>
Page 106	Page 108
<p>1 know where the bus is to trigger that parameter." 2 Then it concludes at line 23, in that part: 3 "Of course they need to configure or in cooperation 4 with us, we need together to configure the areas, we 5 need to define results, the rules, then the system is 6 capable." 7 So the commission has heard -- I'm not sure whether 8 you are aware of this -- that Citybus engaged that 9 system, where they have defined, I think, 25 areas and 10 there is provision for feedback for those 25 areas. Are 11 you aware of that? 12 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes. 13 MR DUNCAN: So that's one. 14 The second one, in which I'm a little bit more 15 interested, is the utilisation of the digital mapping. 16 You can see, I think, mainly from page 154, from line 8, 17 where Mr Chan poses this question to Mr Kulis: 18 "If I have a digital map that is able to show 19 different speed limits on different roads, would I be 20 able to use that combining with the system currently 21 available here, to configure to set different speed 22 thresholds depending on where the bus is on the digital 23 map? Or is that not possible under the system?" 24 Mr Kulis responds: 25 "Definitely it is possible."</p>	<p>1 speed limit is known by the system, and the test drive 2 tells us that it's a possible solution. 3 We will explore on how this may be taken forward, 4 and if it is tested to be feasible it will be 5 incorporated into our fleet, so that when the speed 6 limit, whether it's 50kmh or 70kmh, is exceeded, 7 an alarm will be triggered. That would represent 8 a great improvement over the current situation. 9 MR ROGER LEE: The map is important, because the speed limit 10 can change from time to time. For example, if there is 11 an accident or if there is a road excavation, the limit 12 may be changed very quickly. So we need to have 13 a so-called live map. We have just received the digital 14 map and the Openmatics have helped us to incorporate 15 that into the system. We have a vehicle fitted with 16 this new system and we have conducted a test drive. So 17 there will be real-time information provided to the bus 18 captain that the limit has been exceeded. 19 But geo-fencing, it will take a lot more time, 20 because that would have to do with the control over 21 acceleration. We have one vehicle fitted out for that 22 trial so far. 23 MR DUNCAN: Why did you say that "because of the IRC we 24 would be able to have access to the digital maps"?" 25 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: That's just my gut feeling. Maybe it's</p>

Page 109	Page 111
<p>1 just a coincidence.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: Where did you get the digital map from?</p> <p>3 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) From government.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: From which department of government?</p> <p>5 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Transport Department.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: Have you asked them before?</p> <p>7 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Not really.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: When did you ask them?</p> <p>9 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) I didn't ask.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: How did you come by it, then?</p> <p>11 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) I don't know. I just</p> <p>12 received a letter from them.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: So the Transport Department informed you that it</p> <p>14 was available?</p> <p>15 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) That's correct.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: When was that?</p> <p>17 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) In June, the letter dated</p> <p>18 June 7.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: June 7?</p> <p>20 MR DUNCAN: So no information from the Transport Department</p> <p>21 prior to June of this year that digital mapping was</p> <p>22 available?</p> <p>23 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) No.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: Would you be prepared to provide us with a copy</p> <p>25 of this letter?</p>	<p>1 drive down than 70 kilometre per hour roads, are there</p> <p>2 not? If you still can't answer, please feel free to say</p> <p>3 so.</p> <p>4 MR DUNCAN: Can I help you out: do Kowloon Motor Bus</p> <p>5 vehicles regularly travel on roads which have a speed</p> <p>6 limit of 50 kilometre per hour?</p> <p>7 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes, but you know, the</p> <p>8 number of trips that you go on that journey, on that</p> <p>9 road, may be different. You may have buses very</p> <p>10 frequently running on ... So, you know, I'm an engineer.</p> <p>11 I have to get the facts before I can tell you.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: I think perhaps you ought to be a politician.</p> <p>13 MR DUNCAN: Can I just ask this before I leave the topic:</p> <p>14 what steps prior to the formation of the committee had</p> <p>15 KMB taken to explore whether it could have an alert</p> <p>16 system on buses which exceeded the 50 kilometre per hour</p> <p>17 speed limit?</p> <p>18 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: When the speedometer reaches</p> <p>19 50 kilometres per hour, we once prompted the captain, we</p> <p>20 would not know which route the captain was on, we once</p> <p>21 reminded the captain that he reached 50 kilometres per</p> <p>22 hour. But since we could not identify the locations of</p> <p>23 the buses, we still wanted to prompt captains that they</p> <p>24 have exceeded 50 kilometres per hour when they are in</p> <p>25 urban areas, but in some cases, some bus captains might</p>
Page 110	Page 112
<p>1 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: Thank you, in which case, let's have it copied</p> <p>3 now. Somebody can come and take the letter and</p> <p>4 physically copy it. It's not marked in any way, is it?</p> <p>5 We'll just photocopy it and we can return it to you.</p> <p>6 Yes, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>7 MR DUNCAN: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>8 It would be fair to say, wouldn't it, that Kowloon</p> <p>9 Motor Bus vehicles put up far greater mileage on</p> <p>10 50 kilometre per hour roads than 70 kilometre per hour</p> <p>11 roads?</p> <p>12 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: I can't answer this question because</p> <p>13 I need more data.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: You can take solace from the fact that Citybus</p> <p>15 were unable to answer that question as well, but we have</p> <p>16 maps with the speed limits of the roads of Hong Kong,</p> <p>17 and we've got them coloured, so we can tell at a glance</p> <p>18 that there are many more roads that are 50 kilometre per</p> <p>19 hour roads than 70 kilometre per hour roads.</p> <p>20 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) I think it's about the</p> <p>21 roads that our buses run on.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: No, we understand that as well. We have that as</p> <p>23 well. We can put your bus routes on top. But broadly</p> <p>24 speaking, I'm sure you can answer the question: there</p> <p>25 are many more 50 kilometre per hour roads that the buses</p>	<p>1 find these alerts unnecessary. So after pilot testing</p> <p>2 this approach for a short time, we discontinued the</p> <p>3 practice because we could not determine whether the bus</p> <p>4 was on a 50 kilometre zone or 70 kilometre zone.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: So, as I understand what you are saying, you</p> <p>6 tried a pilot test where you had an alert go off</p> <p>7 whenever you went over 50 kilometres per hour but that</p> <p>8 annoyed the bus drivers because presumably they were</p> <p>9 driving quite a lot of the time in 70 kilometre per hour</p> <p>10 areas and you gave up?</p> <p>11 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes, Correct.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: When was that?</p> <p>13 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Some years back. I can't</p> <p>14 remember.</p> <p>15 (Via interpreter) So this was not from the</p> <p>16 telematics system or the black box.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: This was from the speedometer?</p> <p>18 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) That's right, yes.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: We are going to take a short break at some stage</p> <p>20 in the afternoon because it's a long time for everybody,</p> <p>21 to stretch your legs and have a drink. If this is</p> <p>22 convenient, please say so. If you want to finish</p> <p>23 a topic, say so.</p> <p>24 MR DUNCAN: Just one question, Chairman, if I may.</p> <p>25 The system was purchased from Openmatics in 2013,</p>

Page 113	Page 115
<p>1 I think.</p> <p>2 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Correct.</p> <p>3 MR DUNCAN: And it would have been at that time that the</p> <p>4 parameter of 75 kilometres per hour would have been</p> <p>5 installed into the system.</p> <p>6 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: KMB established this value and they</p> <p>7 informed Openmatics.</p> <p>8 MR DUNCAN: So, between 2013 and the time the committee was</p> <p>9 formed, did you look into the possibility of this system</p> <p>10 capturing speeds in excess of the 50 kilometre speed</p> <p>11 limit, with the help of the GPS system? Did you</p> <p>12 investigate that at all during that period?</p> <p>13 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: I am not sure, but I believe that we</p> <p>14 once discussed this issue with the manufacturer.</p> <p>15 MR DUNCAN: Can you give us any idea as to when that was?</p> <p>16 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Not that I can recall.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: Can you recall who was involved from the company</p> <p>18 side of things?</p> <p>19 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) I can't recall.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Mr Duncan, we will take a break now. We will</p> <p>21 take 15 minutes. Thank you.</p> <p>22 (3.53 pm)</p> <p>23 (A short adjournment)</p> <p>24 (4.08 pm)</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr Duncan.</p>	<p>1 The chairman then asks:</p> <p>2 "What is that system?"</p> <p>3 Mr Kelvin Yeung then gives this answer:</p> <p>4 "As I said, there would be beeps and lights emitted,</p> <p>5 and lights of three colours would be shown depending on</p> <p>6 driving behaviour. And these lights would go on when</p> <p>7 the bus captain beeped the Octopus card at the terminal,</p> <p>8 the time of the next bus would be shown, and lights of</p> <p>9 three colours would be shown to represent the</p> <p>10 performance of the captain. Green is the best, yellow,</p> <p>11 and red means something to be improved. And this system</p> <p>12 is still in use."</p> <p>13 The chairman asked the question:</p> <p>14 "So when the bus captain comes off duty and he taps</p> <p>15 his Octopus card, where is this information displayed</p> <p>16 for him?"</p> <p>17 Mr Kelvin Yeung replies:</p> <p>18 "It would only be displayed the first time a bus</p> <p>19 captain beeps his Octopus card in the morning. I'm not</p> <p>20 sure whether it would show the records for the previous</p> <p>21 days, but what I'm sure is that the records for the same</p> <p>22 day would not be shown. So no information is displayed</p> <p>23 during sign-off.</p> <p>24 Chairman: Are you saying the information is</p> <p>25 displayed at the time of sign-on?</p>
Page 114	Page 116
<p>1 MR DUNCAN: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>2 Gentlemen, would you please have in front of you the</p> <p>3 transcripts bundle for Day 11, that will be</p> <p>4 bundle number 4, and I'd like you to turn up, please,</p> <p>5 page 73 of that transcript.</p> <p>6 If I could pick it up, please, at line 14, where</p> <p>7 Ms Maggie Wong, counsel for the committee, is asking</p> <p>8 questions of Mr Kelvin Yeung. I think, gentlemen, you</p> <p>9 will recognise Mr Kelvin Yeung as being a current</p> <p>10 employee of the company. Is that correct?</p> <p>11 MR ROGER LEE: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>12 MR DUNCAN: So at line 14, Ms Wong poses this question:</p> <p>13 "We have heard also from Mr Alok Jain's evidence</p> <p>14 that during one of the meetings, they explored the idea</p> <p>15 of having a score card system for drivers, and one of</p> <p>16 the systems that was explored is the GreenRoad.com</p> <p>17 system. And what it does is it gives an analysis of the</p> <p>18 driver's driving behaviour, and it would fall into three</p> <p>19 different categories, like red, amber and green."</p> <p>20 Then if we could jump, please, to page 75, at</p> <p>21 line 8, where we have Mr Kelvin Yeung saying:</p> <p>22 "This system should have been deployed. I'm not</p> <p>23 very sure about the name mentioned by Mr Alok, but from</p> <p>24 what you described, it is very similar to one of our</p> <p>25 current systems."</p>	<p>1 Mr Kelvin Yeung: Yes, information is displayed</p> <p>2 during sign-on.</p> <p>3 Chairman: And the information relates to what time</p> <p>4 period?</p> <p>5 Mr Kelvin Yeung: I would have to check the period</p> <p>6 concerned. But this is not same-day information. It</p> <p>7 refers to a past period, but as for the range of that</p> <p>8 period, I have no such information on hand.</p> <p>9 Chairman: And where is the display? Where does the</p> <p>10 bus captain see this?</p> <p>11 Mr Kelvin Yeung: At each bus terminal there would</p> <p>12 be a computer. When a captain returns to the terminal</p> <p>13 he would have to beep his staff card to obtain such</p> <p>14 information. The computer would be located outside the</p> <p>15 kiosk at each terminal facing the bus captains?</p> <p>16 Chairman: And the computer screen depicts what?</p> <p>17 Mr Kelvin Yeung: One of the three colours would be</p> <p>18 displayed to the captain, red, amber and green."</p> <p>19 So having taken you through that, my question is: do</p> <p>20 you confirm that this green/Yellow/red system currently</p> <p>21 exists?</p> <p>22 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>23 MR DUNCAN: Could you describe, please, what the basis of</p> <p>24 this scheme is, how it works?</p> <p>25 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: It's an appraisal system of the bus</p>

Page 117	Page 119
<p>1 captain's performance. It gives you -- it's based on 2 some scores. Four things are assessed under this 3 system. First, excessive idling, that is prolonged 4 idling; second, harsh braking; thirdly, sudden 5 acceleration; finally, speeding.</p> <p>6 For these four conditions, each bus captain has to 7 engage in multiple trips per day, so these four criteria 8 would be assessed over the week, to assess the captain's 9 performance. For the criteria I mentioned, we have 10 certain standards. If a captain performs well, the bus 11 would operate more smoothly and passengers would be more 12 comfortable and the fuel consumption of that bus would 13 be more satisfactory and the bus would be greener. In 14 other words, the driving experience would be equal to 15 safe.</p> <p>16 According to the assessed scores, the best captains 17 would be given green, and there would also be an amber 18 class and red class. So there are three classes. So 19 scores would be given on a weekly basis. When bus 20 captains report duty at termini, when they sign in, 21 their scores for the seven days preceding the period ten 22 days ago would be displayed. Red and amber performance 23 classes would not be shown, but there would be reminders 24 displayed to the captain.</p> <p>25 For the screens at the termini, they might be</p>	<p>1 CHAIRMAN: There is no need to repeat the categories; you 2 were very clear about that. Perhaps Mr Duncan's 3 question is this. What is the threshold that is set for 4 these four categories?</p> <p>5 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: There are two thresholds, one for 6 excessive idling, no more than 15 minutes. No more than 7 15 minutes. For harsh braking, the threshold is based 8 on the black box setting. For sudden acceleration, it 9 follows the black box setting. For speeding, again it 10 follows the black box setting. In other words, for 11 speeding, the threshold is 70; for sudden acceleration, 12 4 kilometres per hour per second.</p> <p>13 MR DUNCAN: It seems that the information is communicated to 14 the driver when he signs on for the day; is that 15 correct?</p> <p>16 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: For each journey or trip, at the start 17 and end of the journey, the captain would tap his card 18 at the terminus. So every day the information is 19 displayed twice to the captain. If the information is 20 displayed all the time, the captain might feel annoyed, 21 so twice a day the score of the captain would be 22 displayed.</p> <p>23 MR DUNCAN: Is he tapping on the screen with his card, is 24 that how it works, or does he insert a card or 25 something?</p>
Page 118	Page 120
<p>1 visible to other people sometimes. In other words, 2 certain information is displayed to the captains. When 3 a bus captain accesses our staff site, he can check his 4 scores for the past eight weeks. So, when they report 5 duty at the bus terminus, the screen would show their 6 score, and as for details, the bus captain can check the 7 information on the staff website. This way, the bus 8 captains can know more about their driving performance 9 and they can seek to make improvements as appropriate.</p> <p>10 So this is the purpose of our design. It was 11 launched in November 2015.</p> <p>12 MR DUNCAN: So it's there for the benefit of the bus 13 captain, primarily?</p> <p>14 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes, and for the benefit of 15 the company and the passengers as well.</p> <p>16 MR DUNCAN: On what data is the classification of red, amber 17 or green based?</p> <p>18 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: I have no data on hand on how the colour 19 is classified, but most of the time it's green; there is 20 a formula.</p> <p>21 MR ROGER LEE: (Chinese words not interpreted).</p> <p>22 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Sorry, I misunderstood. 23 I repeat -- 24 (Via interpreter) There are four categories 25 including excessive idling.</p>	<p>1 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: When the card is tapped, the information 2 is shown on the screen.</p> <p>3 MR DUNCAN: Does the classification of red, amber or green 4 have any impact with regard to the sorts of awards we 5 were discussing this morning?</p> <p>6 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) No. 7 (Via interpreter) No. It was only true at the 8 beginning phase, for a short period of time. So, 9 basically, the system serves to inform the captains of 10 their performance so they can improve their driving 11 techniques.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Can I ask you to help me further about the 13 criteria that apply. You've told us about the four 14 categories. You have given us the thresholds. What if 15 one was to have one speeding in excess: does that stop 16 you having a green score? Or what if it was one 17 excessive acceleration? How does this work?</p> <p>18 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) There's a formula for that.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Are you prepared to tell us what the formula is? 20 Do you know what the formula is?</p> <p>21 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) There's a formula for that. 22 (Via interpreter) Can we share that with you later?</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: Certainly. No doubt the formula is rendered into 24 writing. Is it something that is on the staff website 25 so that the bus captains also know what the formula is?</p>

Page 121	Page 123
<p>1 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: On the website, bus captains can see 2 their own performances, so only green, amber or red 3 would be displayed, and there are four categories being 4 displayed. So the captain would see the colour for the 5 respective category. The actual scores would not be 6 displayed but only the colours.</p> <p>7 But if the bus captain is in the red, we would 8 remind them to be gentle when they accelerate or brake, 9 they should also minimise idling time, et cetera. So we 10 would remind them of the respective improvements needed.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: Please provide this formula. Thank you. 12 Mr Duncan.</p> <p>13 MR DUNCAN: Is there a circular or a document of some sort 14 which explains to the drivers what the purpose of this 15 scheme is and how it works?</p> <p>16 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Yes. We issued notices and posters.</p> <p>17 MR DUNCAN: Would you be able to provide some samples of 18 those as well, please?</p> <p>19 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Okay. Yes.</p> <p>20 MR DUNCAN: Have you received any feedback from the drivers 21 or from the unions as to how they regard this particular 22 score card system?</p> <p>23 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: No formal feedbacks were given, but from 24 communication with captains we were aware of their 25 feedbacks. They also knew that this is not an award</p>	<p>1 MR DUNCAN: So he'd end up a green?</p> <p>2 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>3 MR DUNCAN: Do you have any feedback as to whether the 4 drivers really take any notice of this scheme?</p> <p>5 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: This is only one of the ways to tell how 6 captains drive. There are four other criteria, 7 including excessive idling, harsh braking, sudden 8 acceleration and speeding. We can see other reports. 9 This is just a colour classification of red, amber and 10 green, to inform captains, but we have other reports in 11 place to assess drivers.</p> <p>12 So for certain captains on red, we would know about 13 the details, and if they speed in a 50 kilometre zone we 14 can deal with it through other reports. So the 15 management would look at the situation.</p> <p>16 There are officers responsible for monitoring their 17 performance. This green/amber/red system is 18 a straightforward system to inform the captains of their 19 performance, just one of them.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Mr Duncan's question was not what notice you take 21 about how drivers drive; it was whether they take any 22 notice of this green/amber/red system.</p> <p>23 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Every day, when they tap their card, 24 they have two opportunities to be informed of their 25 performance, and they can also see their own performance</p>
Page 122	Page 124
<p>1 scheme. This is an exercise to inform captains of their 2 driving performances.</p> <p>3 MR DUNCAN: What proportion of captains would consistently 4 get a green rating?</p> <p>5 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: According to preliminary figures, most 6 captains would receive a green rating. The 7 percentage -- about 1 per cent of the captains would get 8 a yellow and few captains would get a red.</p> <p>9 MR DUNCAN: Hardly any would get a red if only 1 per cent 10 get yellow; would that follow?</p> <p>11 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: For example, for the week of 15 to 12 22 July, there were nearly 90,000 records of green, or 13 rather 69,000, 69,824 cases of green, 800-plus cases of 14 amber, and eight cases of red. For the week before 15 that, from 8 July to 14 July 2018, 61,010 cases of 16 green; for amber, 768 cases; for red, two cases.</p> <p>17 MR DUNCAN: If I could take, perhaps, a relatively extreme 18 example: what about a driver who had been constantly 19 speeding in a 50 kilometre speed zone but travelling 20 less than 70 kilometres per hour, and driving into 21 roundabouts with the bus tilted? Under this scheme, he 22 would still command a green rating, would he not?</p> <p>23 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: We do not know what the location is of 24 whether the bus captain is in a 50 kilometre zone, so it 25 cannot be determined. So only speed is displayed.</p>	<p>1 through the website. So the captain is aware of the 2 grade that they have got.</p> <p>3 MR ROGER LEE: It's just provided as a reminder, a gentle 4 reminder, but it is very individual. Bus captains have 5 individualistic driving behaviour. We are just telling 6 them the basic information so that they at least know 7 how they are assessed, how their performance is 8 assessed. Of course, we can provide more information, 9 as the next step. We can provide more detailed 10 information in the future. We also have plain-clothed 11 inspectors and also complaint investigation. This is 12 something designed to give space for self-improvement by 13 captains.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: Mr Duncan.</p> <p>15 MR DUNCAN: Does it function effectively, efficiently? 16 I mean, does it work in a technical sense? Are there 17 any problems with it?</p> <p>18 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: It can be better. If the data are more 19 real-time in nature and if it can more accurately 20 reflect the driving behaviour. As this example given 21 suggests, if he is speeding in a 50kmh road section, the 22 system won't be able to tell. And if there's a digital 23 map to indicate that the driver is speeding in a road 24 section with 50kmh as the speed limit, the scores will 25 be very different.</p>

Page 125	Page 127
<p>1 At present, that's the best we can do with the 2 current system, but if there's a better way to reflect 3 the actual situation, we will certainly strive to make 4 improvement along that line.</p> <p>5 MR DUNCAN: My question was more related to accepting the 6 current system. Does it work efficiently, in the sense 7 the drivers know the system works and they utilise the 8 system and if they tap their card it actually works? So 9 in a practical sense does it work efficiently?</p> <p>10 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>11 MR DUNCAN: I ask that because of what appears in 12 a miscellaneous bundle, number 3, at page 899. Could 13 you turn that up, please.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: I think it's to be found in miscellaneous 15 bundle 2, still. At least it is in my version.</p> <p>16 MR DUNCAN: Page 899.</p> <p>17 You probably have not seen this document, gentlemen, 18 so I will take you through the relevant parts in 19 a moment, but I think Mr Lee at least will be aware that 20 the chairman and members of the secretariat of the 21 committee visited a number of the termini and depots 22 last Friday, 3 August, and if I can explain, these are 23 the notes that were drawn up after the meeting and after 24 the visit.</p> <p>25 The first one which is documented on page 899 is</p>	<p>1 So we have that report. Then if I could take you to 2 page 902, which refers to the visit to the Luen Wo Hui 3 bus terminus, and the last entry, the captain was also 4 asked about the colour-coded boxes or screens, and the 5 answer was also negative. The committee observed "that 6 when a bus captain tapped his Octopus/staff card at the 7 bus regulator's office, the same white screen with 8 a reminder message in blue-coloured letters, followed by 9 details of the driving duties of the bus captain was 10 displayed."</p> <p>11 Then item (E), the Tuen Mun depot, page 903, the 12 reference halfway down there, during the visit the 13 committee also talked to a bus captain resting in the 14 sleeping room and learned from the KMB staff present at 15 the depot that, and it's the second bullet, that the bus 16 captain was aware of the colour-coded messages, boxes or 17 screens and he described it as a monitoring mechanism on 18 whether the bus captain had practised eco-driving. He 19 was aware that green colour generally signalled 20 everything was fine, amber meant that a captain would 21 need to improve, while red generally depicted problems 22 with the bus captain.</p> <p>23 Then finally, the Shan King bus terminus, page 904. 24 We have reference to the committee talking to three bus 25 captains at the terminus and learning from the bus</p>
Page 126	Page 128
<p>1 a visit to the Sha Tin New Town Plaza terminus, and I'm 2 interested in the last entry on that page. Perhaps 3 I should start off with the reference under "Photos are 4 at annex A". There's a reference during the visit the 5 committee also talked to three bus captains and learned 6 certain things. So there was a discussion between the 7 committee and three of the bus captains.</p> <p>8 Then resuming at the last dash on the page: 9 "The same bus captain subsequently demonstrated [to 10 the committee] the use of the Octopus/staff card 11 terminal at the bus regulator's office."</p> <p>12 Then there's a reference to what Mr Kelvin Yeung had 13 said at the hearing; we have just been through. If 14 I could pick it up in the second-last line of the page: 15 "The bus captain having tapped his Octopus staff 16 card ... the computer screen displayed a white screen 17 with a message in blue-coloured letters, reminding the 18 captain to drive carefully within the rainy conditions 19 of the day. The screen then showed the details of the 20 next bus trip that the bus captain was assigned to 21 drive. No colour-coded messages, boxes or screens were 22 noted. When asked about whether [the captain saw] 23 colour-coded messages displayed on the screen when he 24 first reported for duty that day, the captain gave 25 a negative response".</p>	<p>1 regulator and the bus captain that, and the third bullet 2 down, the other two bus captains were invited to show 3 the effect of tapping their Octopus/staff card at the 4 bus regulator's office when reporting for duty. The 5 same white screen with a reminder message in 6 blue-coloured letters, followed by details of the 7 driving duties of the bus captain was noted. No 8 colour-coded messages, boxes or screens were noted. 9 When one of the bus captains was asked whether there was 10 a screen which refers to their Octopus/staff card on the 11 day of the visit, the bus captain replied that she could 12 not remember as she did not really care about the 13 screen.</p> <p>14 I appreciate of course that you weren't present and 15 it's not fair to ask you to comment on that, but are you 16 able to offer anything with regard to the screens 17 apparently being tapped but then simply reminding the 18 captain to drive carefully and showing details of the 19 next trip, but apparently not showing the green, amber 20 or red? Are you able to comment on that at all?</p> <p>21 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Well, there may be a reminder of the 22 rainy conditions on that day. Yes, that's a reminder.</p> <p>23 The amber message is not displayed every time. We 24 don't want to give too many reminders, especially when 25 they have to make frequent trips and they will have just</p>

Page 129	Page 131
<p>1 spent a little bit of time at the terminus, and then the 2 message is not shown on that occasion. But I cannot 3 rule out technical problems of individual terminus. We 4 have to look into whether there is any technical hiccup, 5 and also whether, in terms of publicity, some bus 6 captains are not really fully aware of this three-colour 7 message system. We may have to do more. But we still 8 think that this is a good way to tell bus captains how 9 they have performed.</p> <p>10 As for how we calculate the scores and whether the 11 scores should be fine-tuned to more accurately reflect 12 the performance, I think we should have to work harder 13 on that.</p> <p>14 MR DUNCAN: Are you able to tell us when the bus drivers 15 were last informed about the significance and purpose of 16 the system?</p> <p>17 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: I can't tell.</p> <p>18 MR DUNCAN: I think you have indicated to the committee that 19 you will make some documents available with regard to 20 the formula and also the description of the scheme for 21 the staff.</p> <p>22 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>23 MR DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>24 I move now to the last of the aspects of the black 25 box that I wanted to ask questions about. That is the</p>	<p>1 the response is that:</p> <p>2 "A sample of the data retrieved from black boxes (in 3 the form of a report known as BOP 207) is annexed ..., 4 which shows speeding cases (personal data withheld). It 5 shows the date, time, bus registration number, route 6 number, and concerned [bus captain's] information." 7 We will find that annex at KMB-9 at page 3993. 8 There is a translation at page 3995-1. I have a couple 9 of questions with regard to this report, please. If you 10 look at the very first row, there's an entry towards the 11 right-hand side of the document which has the duration, 12 it says in seconds, and a maximum speed of 67.9, which 13 I assume is kilometres per hour. Would that be correct?</p> <p>14 MR JAMES WONG: Yes, I can read.</p> <p>15 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. So is a correct reading of that that 16 a bus was found to be travelling over 67.9 over the 17 whole 32 seconds; under 67.9, about 67.9? What exactly 18 is it that that chart tells you?</p> <p>19 MR JAMES WONG: According to the table, for this bus TW5352, 20 on 1 May 2018, 0000 hours, 00:00, and the time 20:07, at 21 this time, for the duration of 32 seconds, the maximum 22 speed was 67.9 kilometres per hour.</p> <p>23 MR DUNCAN: Throughout that period it was 67.9?</p> <p>24 MR JAMES WONG: In the duration of 32 seconds, that was the 25 speed.</p>
Page 130	Page 132
<p>1 use that's made of the data captured by the black box in 2 order to facilitate the monitoring and the assessment of 3 the driving behaviour.</p> <p>4 We have seen already that one of the functions of 5 the black box is to capture the speed of the bus. I'm 6 going to ask you, please, to look at the second 7 submission to the committee, again, of the company, this 8 time at page 167.</p> <p>9 There are two reasonably long questions asked at the 10 top of page 167. I don't believe I need to go through 11 those, but what I would simply do is bring your 12 attention to the second paragraph of the response. It 13 is stated as follows:</p> <p>14 "There is a dedicated computer programme in 15 generating suspected speeding cases for the officers to 16 check and verify. After examination, confirmed speeding 17 cases will then be forwarded to performance managers of 18 bus captain performance management section for taking 19 further action."</p> <p>20 If I could then ask you to turn to page 170, please. 21 The committee has there asked, at the top of the page, 22 the company to "provide some copy samples of the data 23 obtained illustrating driving at inappropriate speeds 24 and/or speeds in excess of the speed limit at particular 25 locations", and amongst the answers, the first bullet,</p>	<p>1 MR DUNCAN: Throughout the 32 seconds?</p> <p>2 MR ROGER LEE: (Chinese words not interpreted).</p> <p>3 MR JAMES WONG: In the 32 seconds, the maximum speed 4 occurred was 67.9.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: But why choose 32 seconds? Why not choose 90 6 seconds or 10 seconds?</p> <p>7 MR JAMES WONG: The black box display would be updated every 8 second. Once a vehicle reaches a particular speed, the 9 black box would show the maximum speed of the bus within 10 a certain duration.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: What I'm trying to understand is why 32.</p> <p>12 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: This is an exception report and there 13 are certain settings. When a certain setting is 14 exceeded, information would be displayed. In other 15 words, for a duration of 32 seconds, the setting was 16 exceeded, but the maximum speed was 67.9. So over this 17 period of 32 seconds, our pre-set setting was exceeded. 18 So apparently this is a 50 kilometre per hour zone. 19 If this is a 70 kilometre zone, this entry should 20 not exist. So for a duration of 32 seconds the bus 21 exceeded the limit for this speed zone and the maximum 22 speed was 67.9.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>24 MR DUNCAN: So is the duration pre-set?</p> <p>25 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: No. It would depend on the duration in</p>

Page 133

1 which the bus exceeded the threshold. It depends on the
 2 duration within the bus trip. It is an accumulative
 3 value. It is not a continuous duration. It refers to
 4 the total duration of all the trips that day, and this
 5 shows the number of seconds in which the bus had
 6 exceeded our threshold.

7 MR ROGER LEE: For this example, the area is a 50 kilometre
 8 per hour zone, so for a duration of 32 seconds the bus
 9 exceeded the speed limit of 50 and within the 32 seconds
 10 the bus once reached 67.9. So, in other words, during
 11 the 32 seconds, the speed of the bus exceeded 50 but the
 12 maximum speed was 67.9.

13 CHAIRMAN: Am I correct in understanding that an exception
 14 report would not be generated unless you exceeded the
 15 speed limit for more than 10 seconds?
 16 We can all do the exercise of doing down to find if
 17 there are any single digits, but this is a matter of
 18 principle. Is that a correct understanding, that
 19 an exception requires a continuous excess of speed limit
 20 of 10 seconds or more?

21 MR JAMES WONG: I will answer this question. In a computer
 22 programme, we will set certain thresholds, and when
 23 a bus reaches certain speed it will be displayed.
 24 I would like to share some figures.

25 CHAIRMAN: Can you try answering the question? Is that

Page 134

1 a wrong understanding? If so, just say, yes, it's
 2 wrong.

3 MR JAMES WONG: It's not 10 seconds.

4 CHAIRMAN: What is it?

5 MR JAMES WONG: That's why I would like to tell you about
 6 the situation for different durations --

7 CHAIRMAN: Why not try answering the question directly first
 8 and then give an explanation. What is the threshold?

9 MR JAMES WONG: Between 56 and 65 kilometres per hour an
 10 entry will show up if the duration is more than 30
 11 seconds. This is on roads with a speed limit of 50.
 12 And between 66 to 70 kilometres per hour, in
 13 a 50 kilometre zone, if the duration is more than 15
 14 seconds, it will show up on the computer screen.

15 CHAIRMAN: Why is this information not in the thousands of
 16 pages that you have provided us in these reports? Why
 17 do we have to ask these questions in an oral hearing?
 18 It's perfectly clear what the committee were seeking
 19 when we asked these open-ended questions.
 20 Carry on with your explanation, if you would be kind
 21 enough.

22 MR JAMES WONG: In 50 kilometre roads, for speeds from 76 to
 23 79 kilometres per hour, information would be displayed
 24 if the duration lasts more than two seconds. This is
 25 for areas with a 50 kilometre speed limit.

Page 135

1 CHAIRMAN: That's most helpful. Is there a similar pattern
 2 with speed limits of 70 kilometres per hour?

3 MR JAMES WONG: At 70 kilometre speed zones, if the speed is
 4 between 76 to 79kph and the duration is more than 30
 5 seconds, the occurrence would show up on the screen.

6 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: If it's over 80, two seconds would be
 7 the threshold.

8 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.
 9 Yes, Mr Duncan.

10 MR DUNCAN: Let us go back, please, to KMB-1 at 168.
 11 In the first bullet answer that you've given the
 12 committee -- this is the second submission of the
 13 company -- you have stated that:
 14 "By means of a computer programme, black boxes will
 15 ... capture records of speeding ... malpractice of harsh
 16 braking, and/or ... abrupt acceleration for analysis.
 17 Further information ... corresponding bus registration
 18 numbers and route numbers, can be retrieved with the
 19 assistance of other systems", which are then described.
 20 "It takes about 10 days to retrieve such data for
 21 analysis, where necessary, further disciplinary actions
 22 will be taken."
 23 Why does it take as long as 10 days to retrieve what
 24 might be quite significant data?

25 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: It's four days now. Four days is still

Page 136

1 too long. We would like to make it faster. The data in
 2 the server will be the black box number, the bus number,
 3 the data, from second to second the location, where
 4 there is speeding, harsh braking, abrupt acceleration.
 5 These are the data, but we have to relay the data to
 6 individual bus captains. For that, we will rely on
 7 a lot of information, including TER, terminus management
 8 system.

9 For this TER, terminus management system, it
 10 requires the sign-on or sign-in of bus captains, when
 11 the bus captain starts the journey, the bus number, the
 12 route number, and at the end of the trip the bus captain
 13 will sign off. So the system knows when the journey
 14 starts, when it ends, and the system would capture the
 15 information of the bus captain, the information of the
 16 bus and of the journey.

17 For this system, TER, it captures such data on
 18 a daily basis with more than 200 termini, and all of the
 19 information would then be transmitted to the server, to
 20 our servers. There are also data on the bus on-board
 21 system. We need to provide the interface between the
 22 systems so that we can tell the bus driven by
 23 a particular bus captain, the relevant locations and the
 24 performance.
 25 Then we need to do more processing, to know which

Page 137	<p>1 zones are 50kmh road sections. So we need to have the</p> <p>2 FMI, the fleet management information system, which can</p> <p>3 tell the journey, the locations, and which road sections</p> <p>4 are 50kmh and which are 70kmh. So we need to know the</p> <p>5 route, the bus captain, the data of the journey, and so</p> <p>6 on. That's why it's complicated.</p> <p>7 So if we have a digital map and everything is stored</p> <p>8 in the black box, we can do it much more quickly, and we</p> <p>9 will be able to produce the same report in one day.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: This technology has been available for a long</p> <p>11 time, has it not?</p> <p>12 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes, I know.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: You can answer "yes" or "no" and then you can</p> <p>14 explain.</p> <p>15 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes. Yes, I know.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: If you want to explain, the obvious next question</p> <p>17 is: why haven't you done it before?</p> <p>18 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: I have tried to look into the same</p> <p>19 issue. I have asked the same questions. I would say we</p> <p>20 will do whatever we can as an operator, and the</p> <p>21 resources available to us, the influence that we can</p> <p>22 exert, and we hope this will present an opportunity,</p> <p>23 this time, so that we can make things move more quickly.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>25 MR DUNCAN: At the committee's request, you have provided</p>	Page 139	<p>1 a problem of bad or poor performance.</p> <p>2 MR JAMES WONG: Maybe I can supplement. This morning, when</p> <p>3 we talk about the black box, we said there are four</p> <p>4 lights to provide the feedback to the bus captain --</p> <p>5 I won't repeat the details -- which will provide</p> <p>6 an instantaneous reminder to the bus captain so the</p> <p>7 performance can be rectified, and also there is the</p> <p>8 three-colour system, when the bus captain taps his</p> <p>9 Octopus card, when he signs on, all these messages are</p> <p>10 meant to remind the bus captain of the need to improve,</p> <p>11 if appropriate. And on top, there's the weekly report</p> <p>12 which would record the speeding, acceleration and</p> <p>13 deceleration data.</p> <p>14 And the data in the past kept are not as detailed</p> <p>15 here. We only got accumulative data. There's</p> <p>16 a performance management group under my department, and</p> <p>17 they would inform the operation, the depot, not to issue</p> <p>18 warning but to remind bus captains that certain speeding</p> <p>19 episodes have been recorded, so that they would improve.</p> <p>20 As for the harsh braking or sudden acceleration, we</p> <p>21 would send plain-clothed driving instructors to check on</p> <p>22 the bus. They will observe how the bus captain drives,</p> <p>23 so whether it's unsafe driving, as reflected by the</p> <p>24 data, and then the inspector or the instructor would</p> <p>25 report back to us so that we can take appropriate</p>
Page 138	<p>1 the data which we see in the form of the table in</p> <p>2 respect of excessive speed. Are you able to provide</p> <p>3 a report which has reflected instances of harsh braking</p> <p>4 or excessive acceleration?</p> <p>5 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: We have a weekly report on these</p> <p>6 conditions. This weekly report will look back at the</p> <p>7 past week in respect of a bus captain and how many</p> <p>8 seconds of exceedance in those three areas: harsh</p> <p>9 braking, sudden acceleration and speeding. We have</p> <p>10 a weekly report to reflect these matters.</p> <p>11 When these weekly reports are generated, relevant</p> <p>12 departments in my company would take follow-up action.</p> <p>13 Sometimes, harsh braking and sudden acceleration are</p> <p>14 unavoidable because of road conditions, and it may not</p> <p>15 reflect a problem on the part of the bus captain because</p> <p>16 the road conditions can change suddenly, you have</p> <p>17 pedestrians crossing, suddenly there are other vehicles,</p> <p>18 and we understand the tremendous pressure faced by bus</p> <p>19 captains and sometimes they may make some undesirable or</p> <p>20 unsatisfactory moves, but we need to tell them what they</p> <p>21 have done. Sometimes, our colleagues would arrange</p> <p>22 an interview or would talk to the bus captain over the</p> <p>23 phone, and if necessary we would have to send some</p> <p>24 plain-clothed officers to do some on-spot inspection.</p> <p>25 Otherwise, we cannot really tell whether it's</p>	Page 140	<p>1 action.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: Mr Leung, can I bring you back to the question</p> <p>3 Mr Duncan asked some minutes ago now: are you able to</p> <p>4 provide the committee with a report that evidences harsh</p> <p>5 braking or harsh acceleration? We've got one on the</p> <p>6 screen which enables us to understand, now it's been</p> <p>7 explained to us, how you look at speeding. Are you able</p> <p>8 to give us a similar document that deals with harsh</p> <p>9 braking and acceleration?</p> <p>10 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: Would you please provide us with that?</p> <p>12 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Nodded head).</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.</p> <p>14 MR DUNCAN: I'm now going to ask you to look again at the</p> <p>15 transcript, please. Day 6.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: Whose evidence is this, Mr Duncan?</p> <p>17 MR DUNCAN: This is the evidence of Mr Kulis, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>19 MR DUNCAN: At page 161.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Of which bundle?</p> <p>21 MR DUNCAN: This would be bundle number 3, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>23 MR DUNCAN: I mentioned earlier on the concept of a score</p> <p>24 card for the drivers' driving behaviour, the bus</p> <p>25 captains' driving behaviour, and I just want to ask</p>

Page 141	Page 143
<p>1 a few questions of you in relation to this part of 2 Mr Kulis' evidence. 3 If I could pick it up, please, on page 160, at line 4 22. Mr Chan says: 5 "The next item that I'm interested in, or I am going 6 to ask questions on, is the ability or the capability of 7 using software analysis to provide a report on 8 acceptable or unacceptable, safe or unsafe driving 9 behaviour." 10 And he asks this question: 11 "Does your company provide the software that is 12 capable of assessing, based on the data collected by the 13 black box, capable of assessing or coming up with 14 a report of what is acceptable or unacceptable driving 15 behaviour? Is that possible?" 16 And he says, "Yes, it is possible." 17 Mr Chan asks: 18 "How is that possible ... If I'm a bus operator and 19 I come to you and say I want something that allows me to 20 generate a report of a particular driver? How would you 21 tell me that can be done, how can that be done?" 22 Mr Kulis: In that case, I will introduce you to our 23 application driver feedback, together with the portal 24 parts, together with the software solution which we are 25 providing, so then you can regard the parameters as we</p>	<p>1 correct? I don't need to buy new equipment? In order 2 to come up with such a score card of a driver's 3 behaviour? 4 Mr Kulis: No, you don't need new equipment. If, 5 for example, now you are the customer, and you already 6 have our boxes we can just talk about new possibilities 7 and we can give you the new software and you will use 8 the same hardware for that. 9 Mr Derek Chan: In your experience, how common is it 10 around the world in commercial fleet management for the 11 operator to use software to come up with a score card of 12 the driver's driving behaviour? How common is it around 13 the world? 14 Mr Kulis: It is -- based on my experience it is 15 relatively common in the West European countries. On 16 the other hand, in some other regions, they want to keep 17 the system simple, like is the driver feedback negative. 18 Only a simple warning, and that's it. Because still we 19 need to consider that drivers need to understand what 20 they are scored for. So if you introduce more complex 21 calculation, to evaluate the score cards, we need to 22 provide the training of the drivers, need to understand 23 it. So it differs by the countries and regions." 24 Mr Chan at line 18: 25 "Moving on then from this driver score card --"</p>
Page 142	Page 144
<p>1 were talking about, then, and you can get also the 2 statistics, so then at the end of the day, or some 3 period, you can make your own analysis, for example, 4 which driver have most warnings, thresholds, speeding 5 events, and so on. 6 This is one option. 7 And then we can also design the solution for you, if 8 you are not satisfied with the driver feedback only, if 9 you want to have more sophisticated calculations, we can 10 log the driving data, the parameters, into the database 11 and make the analysis relevant for you. If you are more 12 focused on different inputs, maybe some other parameter 13 is concerning you, we can make analysis and score it on 14 that. 15 It depends how you feel the logic. If you want to 16 calculate the bonus points and evaluate the best driver, 17 or if you want to introduce, let's say, the negative 18 restriction, it is just check they are better drivers, 19 or better behaviour, and so on. There are multiple ways 20 to achieve it. 21 Also depends what the drivers are open for, or the 22 unions, it can have more solutions. 23 Mr Derek Chan: So it is just the software 24 capabilities. Because the hardware itself is just the 25 data collected by the black boxes. Is my understanding</p>	<p>1 Mr Chairman interposes: 2 "Before you move on. If it is quite common in 3 Western European countries, what thresholds do they use 4 to monitor driver behaviour if they are scoring the 5 driver 'good' or 'bad', or 'average'. Whatever the 6 score card might be? 7 Mr Kulis: To give you the example, for example the 8 truck companies in Germany, they are using the 9 parameters as we have here, the basic parameters, so the 10 speeding events, acceleration, deceleration, but on top 11 of that they are, for example, evaluating if the driver 12 is using the [something] for the driving, so he is 13 saving the brakes, or they even have the analysis of the 14 speed value shape in time, and the brake application. 15 So if they are not using the aggressive driving style or 16 if they are not -- how to say, if they are driving more 17 effectively. There are multiple analyses for this. 18 Chairman: So the basic model would be to start with 19 analysing speeding, acceleration and deceleration, 20 that's the basic model? 21 Mr Kulis: Yes. Also the idling, if you keep the 22 engine running, if you are standing, then you are 23 wasting money obviously. That's the basic model. And 24 then on top of that, maybe saving of the brakes and so 25 on."</p>

Page 145	Page 147
<p>1 Now, you can see the approach that Mr Kulis is 2 suggesting in that part of his evidence. Given that the 3 software is clearly available, does that sort of 4 approach have any appeal to you, rather than approaching 5 it from, "Well, you have exceeded the speed and that's 6 bad", so it's going to be negative, converting it to 7 some sort of positive, from the way in which the driver 8 is generally approaching his duties? 9 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: Their approach is the same as ours. We 10 are doing the same thing. We would look at it from 11 a safety perspective. We would look at the items that 12 need to be considered. Of course, the black box would 13 capture many data, including fuel consumption, braking 14 patterns and other scenarios. I believe that there is 15 an application. They are talking about -- the document 16 mentions a transportation committee, for commercial 17 drivers, they might be driving the same vehicle all the 18 same, so from a commercial perspective, it can find out 19 whether a vehicle is idling for too long and whether 20 there would be breakdowns and they can tell whether or 21 not the air-conditioning is switched off. So this is 22 commercially useful. 23 But for bus captains, they might not drive the same 24 bus every day, they might not be driving the whole day, 25 and a bus would be driven by different captains, and</p>	<p>1 Do you recall that? 2 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (Nodded head). 3 MR DUNCAN: So are you familiar with this GreenRoad vehicle 4 tracking system? 5 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) No. 6 MR DUNCAN: Do you have any sort of immediate reaction to 7 what is contained in this article? Assuming its content 8 to be true, do you think this would be of any value for 9 the company to consider? 10 CHAIRMAN: By that, are you referring to a bonus system of 11 rewarding good driving? 12 MR DUNCAN: Yes. 13 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: This is something that can be 14 considered. 15 MR DUNCAN: Has it been considered to date? 16 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Not to date. 17 MR DUNCAN: So your reaction is that this is worthy of 18 consideration by the company? 19 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Can you repeat the 20 question? 21 MR DUNCAN: Is your reaction that this is something worthy 22 of consideration by the company? 23 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) I think I can confirm that, 24 yes, we will consider -- we will study and consider the 25 recommendations mentioned in this article. Thank you.</p>
Page 146	Page 148
<p>1 a captain can drive different buses on different days. 2 So the assessment considerations might be different 3 from consideration from just a safety perspective. So 4 we would assess safety aspects. So we are mainly 5 thinking about safety. 6 If you include other factors, we might not be able 7 to conduct the analysis within four days. We might need 8 five, six or seven days or even more. 9 MR DUNCAN: I'm going to ask to be put up on the screen 10 a short article which the committee has seen which 11 appeared in the Straits Times on 16 July this year. 12 Have you seen this particular article before? 13 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) No. 14 MR DUNCAN: I just ask the secretariat to scroll down and 15 I invite you to read the contents of it. 16 CHAIRMAN: I think the date of the article is July last 17 year. 18 MR DUNCAN: Oh. I beg your pardon, yes. It was published 19 June 29, 2017. Thank you, Mr Chairman. 20 Have you been able to finish reading that? 21 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes. 22 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. You can see that it refers to 23 something called a GreenRoad vehicle tracking system, 24 and you may recall earlier this afternoon we saw 25 GreenRoad.com, I think, referred to in the transcript.</p>	<p>1 MR DUNCAN: Thank you, Dr Leung. 2 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) May I have a copy of this? 3 CHAIRMAN: Of course we can provide you with a copy. 4 DR NORMAN LEUNG: (In English) Thank you. 5 MR DUNCAN: Chairman, that would be a convenient moment, if 6 it suits the committee. 7 CHAIRMAN: Yes. 8 Gentlemen, we have reached the end of our working 9 day. The consequence is that we will adjourn shortly 10 and I would ask you, or those of you who are available, 11 to return to carry on giving evidence on Friday, that's 12 Friday, 10 August, at the same venue. 13 Mr Leung, before we do adjourn, there is one matter 14 I would seek your help with. You spoke of having 15 conducted a test drive with a vehicle that had been 16 fitted with a system to enable you to, as I understand 17 it, differentiate between being in a 50 kilometre speed 18 limit and a 70 kilometre speed limit, and you say that 19 Openmatics had assisted you in incorporating devices in 20 order to do that. That is something that the committee 21 would like to hear more about. Is this documented in 22 any form that you can provide to us? 23 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) You mean the test itself? 24 CHAIRMAN: The various steps that you have taken, how the 25 vehicle has been fitted up, so we can understand what it</p>

Page 149	Page 151
<p>1 is that you are examining.</p> <p>2 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) We will prepare that for</p> <p>3 you.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: Thank you, and obviously somebody who can speak</p> <p>5 to it orally at the hearing. But it would help us if we</p> <p>6 could have something in advance so we can try and digest</p> <p>7 what steps you have been taking. That would help us.</p> <p>8 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>9 MR ROGER LEE: (In English) Do you mean provide those</p> <p>10 information before Friday?</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: Yes, if you can, whatever you have available, and</p> <p>12 then someone who can speak to it and answer our</p> <p>13 questions on Friday, because this is obviously a most</p> <p>14 interesting development.</p> <p>15 MR ROGER LEE: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: Mr Auyeung has a question.</p> <p>17 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Thank you, Chairman.</p> <p>18 I just want to follow up on two questions, both of</p> <p>19 them addressed to Mr Lee.</p> <p>20 In the morning, Mr Lee, you did mention about, on</p> <p>21 the compensation side, that the leadership team decided</p> <p>22 to merge the driving bonus into the base salary, and you</p> <p>23 did mention that it puts pressure on the bus drivers,</p> <p>24 because of that bonus. Then later on, I think you</p> <p>25 mentioned that you have introduced this 20-point system</p>	<p>1 In the past year or two, have the team run into</p> <p>2 situations in which the departments have</p> <p>3 misunderstanding, thinking that the other department are</p> <p>4 handling certain safety issue and it ended up with</p> <p>5 nobody addressing the issue at all?</p> <p>6 MR ROGER LEE: (In English) Every Monday morning, we</p> <p>7 actually, myself and my operation directors and all the</p> <p>8 other directors, have a couple of hours, we sit down,</p> <p>9 and we talk through, no matter it's a bus hardware</p> <p>10 issue, and the bus captains, their performance, and also</p> <p>11 the facilities at the terminus and depot, we actually</p> <p>12 basically work as a team to ensure safety will not just</p> <p>13 simply apply for just the bus captain.</p> <p>14 Presumably, Mr Leung, you ...</p> <p>15 MR LEUNG KIN WANG: For example, there is a case where the</p> <p>16 bus captain had a conflict with a passenger, so we</p> <p>17 install the protective shield to protect the bus</p> <p>18 captain. So it's the job of not just the operations</p> <p>19 department but also the procurement, the engineering</p> <p>20 department, so everyone will have to look into this.</p> <p>21 Whether it would be possible resource-wise, it cannot be</p> <p>22 determined by one single department.</p> <p>23 Another example is the retrofitting of CCTV. No</p> <p>24 single department can make a decision on when this can</p> <p>25 be done and how quickly this can be done is also</p>
Page 150	Page 152
<p>1 which would also generate some sort of monetary reward.</p> <p>2 My question is, this 20-point sort of measurement,</p> <p>3 also would that generate any kind of pressure to the bus</p> <p>4 drivers? If not, why?</p> <p>5 MR ROGER LEE: (In English) I think the actual bonus, as far</p> <p>6 as the bus captain is concerned, the bonus I think is</p> <p>7 deserved. They think it's part of their pay. Let's</p> <p>8 imagine if because there is an accident, whether they</p> <p>9 are liable or not, somehow that so-called bonus would be</p> <p>10 deferred, it creates some unnecessary pressure.</p> <p>11 If you can imagine, the bonus should be part of</p> <p>12 their salary, and every year there are increments,</p> <p>13 judging on their performance, so it doesn't feel like</p> <p>14 you take something away, so that is some kind of, if you</p> <p>15 like, assessment or benchmarking and you say, okay, you</p> <p>16 performed well this year, you deserve an increment, or</p> <p>17 something further, you are actually talking about they</p> <p>18 move to another grade. So it's not like it's completely</p> <p>19 different.</p> <p>20 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Thank you. Then I will move on to the</p> <p>21 second issue which is on safety. I also heard comments</p> <p>22 this morning that from your leadership team's</p> <p>23 perspective, safety is the responsibility of all</p> <p>24 departments, henceforth there is no single department</p> <p>25 responsible for risk or safety.</p>	<p>1 a matter for all the departments and whether the</p> <p>2 procurement can speed up the process. It's all</p> <p>3 teamwork.</p> <p>4 MR ROGER LEE: You have to be responsive whatever you do,</p> <p>5 and you have to make sure that it's comprehensive. And</p> <p>6 you cannot really do anything which is not amenable to</p> <p>7 the hardware, the bus. And of course the operations</p> <p>8 department have their needs. So it must be</p> <p>9 interdepartmental in the nature of these works.</p> <p>10 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. In which case, gentlemen, we will</p> <p>12 adjourn now until 10 o'clock on Friday. Thank you.</p> <p>13 (5.36 pm)</p> <p>14 (The hearing adjourned until 10.00 am</p> <p>15 on Friday, 10 August 2018)</p> <p>16</p> <p>17</p> <p>18</p> <p>19</p> <p>20</p> <p>21</p> <p>22</p> <p>23</p> <p>24</p> <p>25</p>

1	INDEX
2	PAGE
3	EVIDENCE FROM KOWLOON MOTOR BUS CO (1933) LTD1
4	AND LONG WING BUS CO LTD: DR NORMAN
5	LEUNG, DR JOHN CHAN, MR ROGER LEE, MR
6	GODWIN SO, MR LEUNG KIN WANG, MR PATRICK
7	PANG, MR JAMES WONG (evidence given in
8	Cantonese; transcription of simultaneous
9	interpretation unless otherwise
10	indicated)
11	Opening statement by DR NORMAN LEUNG1
12	Examination by MR DUNCAN3
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	