

Page 1	Page 3
<p>1 2 Wednesday, 1 August 2018 3 (10.00 am) 4 EMPLOYEE OF KOWLOON MOTOR BUS COMPANY (1933) LIMITED: 5 MS DEBBY WONG 6 (Evidence given in Cantonese and English, transcription of 7 the simultaneous interpretation and/or English) 8 CHAIRMAN: Good morning, Ms Wong. 9 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Good morning. 10 CHAIRMAN: Thank you for accepting our invitation to give 11 evidence to the committee. 12 You are a current employee of the Kowloon Motor Bus 13 Company, are you not? 14 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes, I am. 15 CHAIRMAN: The way in which your evidence will be taken is 16 by Ms Wong, Senior Counsel, who is counsel assisting the 17 Committee posing questions to you. If there is anything 18 you wish to amplify, feel free to do so. 19 You will be referred to documents, you can look at 20 them on the screen, or you can ask for a hard copy, if 21 you want to look ahead or behind where the document 22 deals with things; do you understand? 23 MS DEBBY WONG: Yes. 24 CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. 25 Ms Wong.</p>	<p>1 MS DEBBY WONG: Well, for some stations, we may not have 2 somebody stationed there as a bus regulator, so when 3 counting the number of bus stations, there may be a 4 discrepancy. It should be between 30 and 31. 5 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. 6 And how many bus stations did you manage? 7 MS DEBBY WONG: Almost 10, because I'm responsible for Tin 8 Shui Wai area. Let me, sort of count them. 9 CHAIRMAN: Take your time. 10 MS DEBBY WONG: Well, under me, at Tuen Mun depot I have got 11 four. As the assistant manager of Tuen Mun depot, four 12 for Tin Shui Wai area. 13 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. I understand that Tuen Mun depot is 14 responsible for bus operations of three districts, Tuen 15 Mun, Yuen Long and Tin Shui Wai, and you are responsible 16 for Tin Shui Wai. 17 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes. 18 MS MAGGIE WONG: Is that all bus stations in Tin Shui Wai? 19 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes. 20 MS MAGGIE WONG: So there are four bus stations in Tin Shui 21 Wai? 22 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes. 23 MS MAGGIE WONG: What about the rest? Are they all managed 24 by Kelvin? 25 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Kelvin manage only on Tuen Mun</p>
Page 2	Page 4
<p>1 EXAMINATION BY MS WONG 2 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you, Ms Wong, for coming. 3 My questions will be focused on the resting 4 facilities set out in your submission or reply to the 5 letter of IRC dated 28 June 2018, and your letter of 6 reply was sent on 4 July 2018. That can be found at FE 7 bundle, page 199. 8 Ms Wong, before I start questioning on this topic, 9 may I know how long have you worked for Kowloon Motor 10 Bus? 11 MS DEBBY WONG: May I speak in Cantonese? 12 Yes, for 21 years. I have worked with the KMB for 13 21 years, and I've been involved in operations, and 14 I have had experience in two depots: Lai Chi Kok and 15 Tuen Mun respectively. 16 MS MAGGIE WONG: Since when did you take up the current post 17 as operator in charge of the Kowloon Motor Bus Tuen Mun 18 depot? 19 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Since 1997 I work at Tuen Mun 20 depot and then I transferred to Lai Chi Kok depot in 21 2016. And then I went back to Tuen Mun depot in 2018. 22 MS MAGGIE WONG: Your reply stated that there were 30 bus 23 stations under Tuen Mun depot. I notice in Mr Kelvin 24 Yeung's submission he stated there are 31 bus termini. 25 May I just ascertain which one is correct? 30 or 31?</p>	<p>1 zone. Yuen Long is under another AM. 2 MS MAGGIE WONG: Another AM, assistant manager. 3 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Assistant manager. 4 MS MAGGIE WONG: And who is that? 5 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Amanda Hung. 6 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. 7 Now, Ms Wong, in your submission you stated there 8 are two types of rest kiosk. The first is type A, and 9 the second type B. 10 Now, I notice type B is bigger in size. Can you 11 tell us what is the difference -- apart from size, what 12 is the difference between the two? 13 MS DEBBY WONG: Other than the size, well, in fact the 14 internal partitioning is different. For the larger 15 kiosk we can place more electrical appliances, like 16 a microwave, as well as the drinks dispenser. For 17 smaller ones, that's mainly for the bus regulator, it is 18 more like their working station. 19 So the microwave and the drinking dispenser, so they 20 are the things that we kept there. 21 MS MAGGIE WONG: Would sort of a bench so that you can sleep 22 be provided for either type? 23 MS DEBBY WONG: Well, this is the working place. At 24 a larger bus station we may be able to provide a rest 25 room, what we call them, for bus captains to take</p>

Page 5	<p>1 a rest. The size would be similar to the size of the</p> <p>2 larger kiosk. The larger kiosk is for both the</p> <p>3 regulator as well as the bus captains. The size is the</p> <p>4 same, but then the design is such that we have tables</p> <p>5 and chairs.</p> <p>6 And then we have some offices which are concrete,</p> <p>7 say, for example, at the PTI, it already provides</p> <p>8 a concrete office. Then the space will be larger. As</p> <p>9 I've mentioned, at some locations we have more space,</p> <p>10 and we are able to provide more chairs. That's because</p> <p>11 the office is a concrete one.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: What is a PTI?</p> <p>13 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Public transport interchange.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: Are any of the four bus stations that you manage,</p> <p>15 places at which there are rest facilities?</p> <p>16 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Like Tin Shui Wai town centre</p> <p>17 there is a concrete office and we provide a rest area</p> <p>18 for bus captains and another room is for terminus</p> <p>19 supervisor.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>21 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Also in -- what I manage is Tin</p> <p>22 Yan, Tin Fu and Tin Tsz, they all have two bigger-size</p> <p>23 kiosk, one is for terminus supervisor and the other one</p> <p>24 is for bus captain.</p> <p>25 Also what I manage, the four bus stations already</p>	Page 7	<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Is Tin Shui Wai a town centre a depot or bus</p> <p>2 station?</p> <p>3 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) We have another depot, it is</p> <p>4 Tin Shui Wai depot, it is also in Tin Shui Wai zone.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: Do you see on the screen we have a list of bus</p> <p>6 stations, which one is the depot?</p> <p>7 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Tin Shui Wai town centre is the</p> <p>8 bus station and we have another location named Tin Shui</p> <p>9 Wai depot. That is only bus parking only.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: So we don't have Tin Shui Wai depot listed here?</p> <p>11 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes, that's right.</p> <p>12 MS MAGGIE WONG: Just to clarify, on that page, page 207,</p> <p>13 there are two Tin Shui Wai. One is Tin Shui Wai town</p> <p>14 centre, one is Tin Shui Wai railway station. So they</p> <p>15 are not the ones that are referred to by you as rest</p> <p>16 facilities?</p> <p>17 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Sorry, I missed this one. This</p> <p>18 is under my management too. Tin Shui Wai station.</p> <p>19 MS MAGGIE WONG: So both of them?</p> <p>20 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) This is another one. The</p> <p>21 station, another bus terminus another bus station under</p> <p>22 my manage.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: You told us earlier that Tin Shui Wai town centre</p> <p>24 has a rest area; is that right?</p> <p>25 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) We provide rest area there.</p>
Page 6	<p>1 provided the rest room.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: The four bus stations that you managed, are</p> <p>3 these stations providing split shifts for bus captains?</p> <p>4 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>5 MS MAGGIE WONG: How many of them provided split shifts?</p> <p>6 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) I don't have the number. But</p> <p>7 at each bus station we have certain bus routes, and some</p> <p>8 is long-haul routes and some is short-haul routes, and</p> <p>9 we have a mix, bus captains, some is split shift that</p> <p>10 you mentioned, and some is one duty. That means only am</p> <p>11 shift or night shift.</p> <p>12 MS MAGGIE WONG: So in all these bus stations, there are</p> <p>13 split shifts and are they all provided with rest</p> <p>14 facilities for all four bus stations?</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: Are you referring to just the four?</p> <p>16 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>18 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes, we provided the facility</p> <p>19 in my managed bus terminus, and also we have a bus depot</p> <p>20 in Tin Shui Wai, and bus captains can rest during the</p> <p>21 break inside the depot, Tin Shui Wai depot. Or they can</p> <p>22 -- if they live close to their home, they can go home,</p> <p>23 rest, and then return to work. Because we will give</p> <p>24 around three or more hours for them to rest during the</p> <p>25 break.</p>	Page 8	<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: And the rest areas, are they type A or</p> <p>2 type B, or the bigger kiosk that you mentioned?</p> <p>3 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Type B.</p> <p>4 MS MAGGIE WONG: Type B. So in all the four bus stations,</p> <p>5 are they type B?</p> <p>6 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Except Tin Shui Wai town</p> <p>7 centre, this is a concrete office, so we have concrete</p> <p>8 office for bus captain rest room.</p> <p>9 The other is a kiosk, Tin Yan, Tin Fu, Tin Shui Wai</p> <p>10 station, they are all in kiosk B, type B.</p> <p>11 MS MAGGIE WONG: So there would be benches provided for</p> <p>12 them, for bus captains?</p> <p>13 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes, there is a chair. Not</p> <p>14 really a bench. It is a chair, and table, for them to</p> <p>15 take meal and rest.</p> <p>16 MS MAGGIE WONG: In your submission you mentioned that there</p> <p>17 is a long lapse or long lead time to have a placement,</p> <p>18 even for chemical toilets, during your management of Lai</p> <p>19 Chi Kok depot, and that is at page 198, paragraph 3D of</p> <p>20 your submission.</p> <p>21 And you mentioned an example of Allway Garden. And</p> <p>22 can you also refer to a minute, because it appears the</p> <p>23 trade union have also reflected this to the Transport</p> <p>24 Department. I just want to ascertain if you know about</p> <p>25 this.</p>

Page 9	Page 11
<p>1 And that's at TU-260-192 in English. That's minutes 2 of the meeting between the Transport Department, and 3 Legislative Councillor and Mr Cheung Kwok Che, and 4 representatives of the Federation of Bus Industry Trade 5 Unions, and representative of franchised bus unions. 6 CHAIRMAN: And the date? 7 MS MAGGIE WONG: The date is 4 March 2015. Page 260-200. 8 It was under the topic of bus stop facilities, and 9 it is stated there that: 10 "The unions were discontent that ... most of the bus 11 termini did not have pre-existing fixed restrooms for 12 employees and toilets, and requested the Transport 13 Department to review the planning and management of bus 14 termini. The unions were also dissatisfied with the 15 present complicated procedure for bus companies to apply 16 for the installation of employee rest rooms, mobile 17 toilets and other bus stop facilities and the 18 consultation was very time-consuming. It was suggested 19 that the application and consultation procedure should 20 be simplified and speed up." 21 It mentioned a number of locations. And one of them 22 is "Allway Garden bus terminus (no toilets)", which is 23 one of the examples given in your submission. 24 Is that the location, or is Allway Garden bus 25 terminus the location you mentioned in your submission</p>	<p>1 our plan, and again made an application. And eventually 2 TD approved our application last October. The reason 3 was that our staff had no toilet they can use. 4 And we communicated with district councillors to 5 convince them of the need for our staff to have 6 a toilet. So we received an approval letter last 7 October. 8 MS MAGGIE WONG: This is only one of the examples. And the 9 examples you gave based on the minutes is from 10 March 2015, and you only managed to get the application 11 approved in last October, which took at least two years 12 to successfully apply for a toilet facility; is that 13 correct? 14 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Actually, more than two years. 15 Before they have some e-mail with our -- my other 16 colleague, but under my management from 2017 for the 17 whole year we have applied again, and again. 18 CHAIRMAN: How long has Allway Garden been a bus station? 19 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Over 20 years. I'm not quite 20 remember the history, but once the bus terminus was 21 here, the bus -- was there. 22 CHAIRMAN: How does it happen that a bus station is brought 23 into use and there is not a provision for a toilet? 24 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) So -- 25 CHAIRMAN: How does that happen?</p>
Page 10	Page 12
<p>1 at page 198? 2 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Correct. 3 MS MAGGIE WONG: So what is the status today? Has a toilet 4 or rest facility been given at Allway Garden? 5 MS DEBBY WONG: (Interpreted) The Allway Garden terminus is 6 uncovered and it is some way from a public toilet, and 7 opposite Allway Garden there is a shopping centre, but 8 the rest rooms there are always locked. We would have 9 to borrow keys from the management office if our staff 10 are to use their toilet. 11 The management office indicated that since we are 12 not tenants they are reluctant to lend us the keys. 13 As I know, for the Lai Chi Kok terminus or depot, we 14 have made submissions multiple times to the Transport 15 Department to apply for chemical toilets. In 16 January 2017, I submitted an application myself. It 17 was January 2016. Again, we submitted an application to 18 TD for a chemical toilet, and in the process TD rejected 19 our application citing rejection from the public 20 consultation. 21 It is an outdoor depot or terminus, so residents 22 would be somewhat affected, but we considered the need 23 for our staff to have a toilet, that's why we again 24 applied to the Transport Department for other viable 25 alternative locations, and in July last year we revised</p>	<p>1 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Our bus captain obtain need to 2 borrow the commercial centre, their office, with the 3 key, and they change the key if they know we borrowed, 4 and they change the key -- change the lock again. 5 CHAIRMAN: No, the question is more fundamental than that. 6 Why do you provide a bus service to a bus station if 7 there is not a toilet there? How does it happen that 8 that comes about? 9 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yeah. 10 CHAIRMAN: Why do you do it? 11 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) So when I manage, I see the 12 problem, so I try to communicate with the TD, Transport 13 Department, and DC -- actually, I know the background is 14 the DC members very unhappy of the chemical toilet 15 placed in the public PTI. 16 CHAIRMAN: Then perhaps they have a choice. They either 17 have a bus service or they have a toilet. But they -- 18 so how is it that you provide a bus service and you 19 allow them to oppose putting a toilet in? 20 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) So they asked us to borrow the 21 commercial centre's toilet. That's what the solution 22 they think it would be. 23 CHAIRMAN: That's not a solution, is it? 24 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yeah, it is true. 25 MS MAGGIE WONG: And the second example you gave is the Lok</p>

Page 13	Page 15
<p>1 Wah issue in August 2017. That's at page 198. And in 2 your submission you stated that the Lok Wah issue was 3 only resolved in October 2017, after several lobbying 4 with the district council. 5 How long have you applied for a rest kiosk in Lok 6 Wah Estate, since when? 7 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) I read from the news it is over 8 five years?. Sorry, this is not under my managed zone, 9 but I read from the newspaper it is over five years we 10 have applied. By KMB. 11 CHAIRMAN: Is Lok Wah in Kwun Tong? 12 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes. 13 CHAIRMAN: Is it a bus station? 14 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes. 15 MS MAGGIE WONG: And the third example you gave is also at 16 Tuen Mun depot, is the Yuen Long Park. 17 And you stated that you applied for the resting 18 facility in 2014, and only approved in 2016. 19 So why did it take so long to provide, or two years 20 to provide a resting facility? 21 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Actually, we don't know the 22 reason. But our procedure is submit our application to 23 Transport Department and they will circulate our 24 application to public, all relevant publics, like 25 police, or DC member, and the residents, near Yuen Long</p>	<p>1 And may I take you to the TU bundle, as well as. 2 This time it is in relation to -- this is a report 3 compiled by the Federation of Bus Industry Trade Unions. 4 Annex 7 of their submission dated 16 July. 5 And it listed out -- 6 CHAIRMAN: Page? 7 MS MAGGIE WONG: Page 260-346-2. 260-346-2. 8 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 9 MS MAGGIE WONG: It is a table setting out the bus terminus 10 and the location, and the progress of the application. 11 I would just like to ask you a few examples here to ask 12 you whether progress has been made, or whether there has 13 been further progress. 14 On that page, it is under the bus company KMB, and 15 the location is at Tuen Mun Po Tin Estate, and it was 16 stated there that it has been consulted for two years 17 and no reply has yet been received. 18 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) I think that is Kelvin Yeung's 19 submission. Po Tin. 20 MS MAGGIE WONG: I believe that's not. Because that's the 21 document provided to us by Federation of Bus Industry 22 Trade Unions, annex 7. It is not a document by Kelvin 23 Yeung. 24 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Okay. 25 MS MAGGIE WONG: But in any event, I just want you to</p>
Page 14	Page 16
<p>1 Park, they will consult them, and I remember they 2 replied that the rejection party is police. 3 That's very rare from my understanding, it is not 4 their living area, that's police. So we asked police to 5 come out and discuss with them how can we solve this 6 issue. Because providing the kiosk, not only our 7 working station for terminus supervisor, also that was a 8 resting area for our bus captains. If there is really 9 a service providing in Yuen Long Park, we need 10 a station, we need a rest room for them. 11 So we asked the police to come out to solve the 12 issue, and try to make every party happy. 13 MS MAGGIE WONG: Do you have written correspondence 14 exchanged with the police about this matter? 15 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes. We resubmit the 16 application to Transport Department, and asked them 17 to -- for another round consultation in 2015. 18 MS MAGGIE WONG: Would you be able to provide us with the 19 documentation in relation to this particular incident 20 concerning Yuen Long Park -- 21 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes. 22 MS MAGGIE WONG: -- with the Transport Department and with 23 the police? 24 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes, I can provide that. 25 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you.</p>	<p>1 confirm whether that's the position. 2 We see in the right column, it is stated there that: 3 "The relevant application has to be approved by the 4 Housing Department. [Transport Department] has already 5 written to the Housing Department requesting KMB's 6 application to be handled as soon as possible, it has 7 also made follow-up call to the Housing Department to 8 further follow up. The Housing Department replied and 9 said it is still handling the relevant matter." 10 And it was in relation to the Tuen Mun Po Tin 11 Estate. 12 So is that, first of all, an estate managed by you? 13 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) No. 14 MS MAGGIE WONG: Or the bus station, is that managed by you? 15 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) No, it is under Kelvin Yeung. 16 MS MAGGIE WONG: But you don't know about the status of this 17 application? 18 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Not so familiar. 19 MS MAGGIE WONG: And what about the rest of the facilities 20 from 260-346-2, if you look through to 260-346-6? Can 21 you look through them and see which one of them may be 22 applicable to you, or an estate managed by you, a bus 23 station managed by you? 24 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) No. All is not under my 25 management.</p>

Page 17	Page 19
<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes.</p> <p>2 And Ms Wong, I'm going to ask you another topic.</p> <p>3 You mentioned that you have been working for Kowloon</p> <p>4 Motor Bus for over 20 years.</p> <p>5 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>6 MS MAGGIE WONG: Do you know a person named Raymond Cheng?</p> <p>7 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Raymond Cheng, yes.</p> <p>8 MS MAGGIE WONG: He used to work for Kowloon Motor Bus</p> <p>9 between 2010 and 2014 in the safety and service quality</p> <p>10 department.</p> <p>11 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Mm-hmm.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Do you know that?</p> <p>13 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>14 MS MAGGIE WONG: And in his submission he mentioned that</p> <p>15 there was a study conducted during his time, following</p> <p>16 the accident in Tseung Kwan O in 2009, that there was</p> <p>17 a study about 29 sharp bends in Hong Kong, and to</p> <p>18 discuss the possible speed limit that could be</p> <p>19 applicable.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Perhaps if we were to show the witness the</p> <p>21 witness statement?</p> <p>22 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. The witness statement is at page 96.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: Of which bundle?</p> <p>24 MS MAGGIE WONG: FE bundle, page 96-4.</p> <p>25 If you look at the section, buses can overturn</p>	<p>1 MS DEBBY WONG: (Interpreted) Yes, I was aware of the 29</p> <p>2 sharp bends. But then I was not within the group making</p> <p>3 this.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: Do you know who was in the group?</p> <p>5 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) As mentioned by Raymond, maybe</p> <p>6 it is the depot manager plus the training school</p> <p>7 instructor.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>9 MS MAGGIE WONG: And this study group, it mentioned that --</p> <p>10 if you look over the page at 96-6, it referred to the</p> <p>11 study group carrying out tests of these 29 turns in</p> <p>12 different road conditions, different speeds, different</p> <p>13 passengers, load conditions, and they video-recorded the</p> <p>14 whole study for future reference.</p> <p>15 Did you know about this video-recorded study?</p> <p>16 MS DEBBY WONG: (Interpreted) No.</p> <p>17 MS MAGGIE WONG: If you look, if you follow on at the</p> <p>18 bottom, it mentioned there was a safety booklet.</p> <p>19 I believe subsequently it was clarified as a small</p> <p>20 printed card, by Mr Raymond Cheng:</p> <p>21 " ... for Bus Captains detailing each potentially</p> <p>22 dangerous turns' exact location, direction, and road</p> <p>23 nature, road condition, past record, related photos or</p> <p>24 grimes from Transport Department's document or passenger</p> <p>25 complaints ..."</p>
Page 18	Page 20
<p>1 easily --</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: Give Ms Wong a moment to have a look at the</p> <p>3 document.</p> <p>4 MS MAGGIE WONG: I apologise, yes.</p> <p>5 Do you mind looking at the document at page 96-4?</p> <p>6 If you look through to 96-6, so three pages.</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: Take your time. There is no hurry.</p> <p>8 Yes, Ms Wong.</p> <p>9 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, Ms Wong, we can see from this</p> <p>10 statement that Mr Raymond Cheng stated that he:</p> <p>11 "... started the study of safe driving in the sharp</p> <p>12 turns back in 2013. The Safety and Quality Service</p> <p>13 Department invited the 4 depot managers, the</p> <p>14 representatives from Bus Captain Training School and Bus</p> <p>15 Maintenance Section of Service Department to form</p> <p>16 a study group looking deeply into all the sharp turns</p> <p>17 within [KMB] bus route network. The study collected</p> <p>18 thousands of daily bus turning data and formulated</p> <p>19 hundreds of potentially dangerous turns within the</p> <p>20 network. We then narrowed it down to top 29 corner</p> <p>21 turns that may cause serious overturning</p> <p>22 [incidents] ..."</p> <p>23 And he named a few in Chinese characters there.</p> <p>24 May I ask you first, did you know about the study</p> <p>25 carried out by Raymond Cheng.</p>	<p>1 Then they have made 31 safety driving suggestions</p> <p>2 from a study of over 1,500 studies.</p> <p>3 Did you know about this?</p> <p>4 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) I know there is a safety</p> <p>5 booklet, but I'm not sure of the study.</p> <p>6 MS MAGGIE WONG: So there is a safety booklet of these 29</p> <p>7 turns; is that correct?</p> <p>8 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) In general. The safety</p> <p>9 booklet is in general for bus captains to be careful.</p> <p>10 MS MAGGIE WONG: Did you know about the outcome of this</p> <p>11 study?</p> <p>12 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Not sure.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: Do you know if it was disseminated, passed out to</p> <p>14 bus captains?</p> <p>15 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes, we will pass this safety</p> <p>16 handbook to bus captains, and we will have a very brief</p> <p>17 instruction to them.</p> <p>18 MS MAGGIE WONG: But in relation to this safety handbook to</p> <p>19 bus captain, do you know if it contains anything about</p> <p>20 these 29 sharp bends?</p> <p>21 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Sorry, I'm not very quite read</p> <p>22 the details from the booklet, so maybe I have no idea on</p> <p>23 this subject.</p> <p>24 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mmm. During your time in Kowloon Motor</p> <p>25 Bus, did you at any time discuss with the management</p>

Page 21	Page 23
<p>1 about conducting a study or gathering views from bus 2 captains as to the dangerous road conditions in Hong 3 Kong? 4 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) We will give -- I remember 5 during Mr Cheng's -- the period I was not assistant 6 manager, and I am one of the operations staff and we 7 will provide some location that may have potential to 8 have the hazard on the sharp bends. So during that time 9 we provide some location to SSQ session to have more 10 review on this. 11 CHAIRMAN: That's safety and service session, is it? 12 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes. 13 MS MAGGIE WONG: For which period? 14 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) During Mr Cheng's -- 2010 to 15 2014. 16 MS MAGGIE WONG: What about after 2014? 17 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) After -- 18 MS MAGGIE WONG: After 2014, did you continue to provide 19 information about this? 20 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes, continuous. 21 MS MAGGIE WONG: Would you be able to provide us with some 22 of the documentation concerning your relaying of the 23 concerns about locations about the topic you mentioned 24 about the dangerous road condition that may pose risk? 25 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Maybe I will not have the</p>	<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: So after they retired or resigned what 2 happened to the focus group? 3 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) We changed to each depot to 4 keep monitor the safety issue. Not by this section, 5 safety -- SSQ -- the ownership shifted to each depot, 6 operations. 7 CHAIRMAN: So rather than being centralised it became 8 dispersed to each depot? 9 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Individual. Mm-hmm. 10 MS MAGGIE WONG: When you mentioned each individual depot, 11 would you discuss with the bus captains that based on 12 their experience that certain road or bends are 13 dangerous, and then to warn the other bus captains that 14 they have to be careful? Would you do something like 15 that? 16 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) We will analyse some, the 17 accident location, bus captain experience, in the 18 sharing group, the bus captain experience, and like 19 this. To analyse the -- any hazard in -- on the road, 20 and we need to maybe if that is necessary, we will 21 discuss with training school, the instructor, how to 22 train some bus captain to pay attention to the road. 23 MS MAGGIE WONG: This sharing group, is this only confined 24 to individual depot, or would there be discussions 25 amongst different depots?</p>
Page 22	Page 24
<p>1 black and white, but we will have a focus group to 2 discuss this topic. I remember after the accident in 3 Tseung Kwan O they have a focus group to discuss this 4 topic. 5 CHAIRMAN: Were there minutes kept of these meetings? Was 6 it documented in any way? 7 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) I'm not sure we have the 8 document. 9 MS MAGGIE WONG: You mentioned a focus group, is it 10 different from the study group? 11 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Similar. Similar, the study 12 group to study the sharp bend location. 13 MS MAGGIE WONG: But what about the membership in this focus 14 group? 15 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) I think they all left KMB. 16 The department -- the depot manager did mention they are 17 all -- some is retired, some is resigned. 18 CHAIRMAN: So the group of people involved in studying sharp 19 bends either retired or resigned; is that what you are 20 saying? 21 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Mm-hmm. 22 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 23 MS MAGGIE WONG: So when did they retire or resign? 24 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) In these few years. I don't 25 exactly remember the date.</p>	<p>1 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) In -- because different 2 location -- it depends on each depot. They will 3 individually discuss with training school, or we have 4 some meeting, maybe with training school we will -- we 5 will provide to the -- any time actually, not specific, 6 not specific in any meeting. 7 MS MAGGIE WONG: How often you hold this sharing group? 8 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Like what I say. It is -- if 9 we analyse some traffic accident, so it is not time 10 limit to them. So another is bus captains sharing 11 experience, then if we find their location is a hazard, 12 we will talk to the instructor, or make some notice or 13 reminder to remind bus captain to pay attention on some 14 hazard location. So there is no specific meeting or any 15 time to make a promise in that meeting, or what. 16 MS MAGGIE WONG: You refer to making some notice, or 17 reminder to remind bus captains to pay attention on some 18 hazard location. Are they in writing, or orally? 19 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Both. Mostly it is in 20 writing. 21 MS MAGGIE WONG: Within each individual depot? 22 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes. 23 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you provide us with some of these 24 notices or reminders? 25 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) I can provide to you later.</p>

Page 25	<p>1 I don't it have now.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you.</p> <p>3 So about these individual notices, are they reactive</p> <p>4 to accidents? That's the first question. Are they</p> <p>5 reactive to accidents? The notice was issued reactive</p> <p>6 to accidents?</p> <p>7 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) For your first question, yes,</p> <p>8 sometimes it is react to the accidents. Like</p> <p>9 a reminder, for the bus captain.</p> <p>10 MS MAGGIE WONG: And the second is, are they reactive to bus</p> <p>11 captains' complaints, or if I put it correctly, is it</p> <p>12 bus captains' views, initiative to inform you about</p> <p>13 certain road condition?</p> <p>14 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes, if there is road</p> <p>15 condition will create some accident we will also issue</p> <p>16 some reminder for bus captain.</p> <p>17 MS MAGGIE WONG: My question is, sorry, are they reactive --</p> <p>18 are they study -- is it a study carried out by your</p> <p>19 company's initiative, or due to the bus captains'</p> <p>20 voicing out their views about certain road conditions?</p> <p>21 Which one is that?</p> <p>22 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) If the bus captain voice out</p> <p>23 that, we will verify the cause, or something we can</p> <p>24 protect, I mean, prevent any accident appear again, so</p> <p>25 we will find out the root cause first. If there is</p>	Page 27	<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: So you can't identify at the moment? Okay.</p> <p>2 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>3 MS MAGGIE WONG: Concerning the last topic, it is about lost</p> <p>4 trip.</p> <p>5 We have heard some evidence that there are a number</p> <p>6 of lost trips due to the fact that -- they are due to</p> <p>7 various reasons; sometimes due to road conditions and</p> <p>8 sometimes due to the inaccurate estimation of the</p> <p>9 journey time.</p> <p>10 Can you confirm if that's what happened --</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: Before you do that, can you tell us what a lost</p> <p>12 trip is?</p> <p>13 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Lost trip will be -- we have</p> <p>14 a scheduling service that we have gazette -- like</p> <p>15 gazetted trips that we promise to make a certain service</p> <p>16 level, in a certain period there is a gazetted schedule.</p> <p>17 And there is a -- if we cannot follow the scheduling of</p> <p>18 service, that trip missing was named lost trip.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: So, inability to fulfil your gazetted schedule?</p> <p>20 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: Does this happen in the Tuen Mun depot that</p> <p>22 you managed?</p> <p>23 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes, lost trip happened there.</p> <p>24 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you tell us the reasons why there were</p> <p>25 lost trips?</p>
Page 26	<p>1 really can prevent, we can do something. Like, maybe,</p> <p>2 remind them some road conditions have some -- like after</p> <p>3 the raining, the tree branches always will create some</p> <p>4 accident, we will remind them to be patient when they</p> <p>5 drive near the roadside, so we will remind something</p> <p>6 like "Be careful driving near that road section".</p> <p>7 MS MAGGIE WONG: So that's reactive to the experience of the</p> <p>8 bus captains' views?</p> <p>9 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>10 MS MAGGIE WONG: And not something initiated by the bus</p> <p>11 company; is that what you are saying?</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: I think what you have told us is that you reacted</p> <p>13 to accidents and you also listened to what bus captains</p> <p>14 had to say?</p> <p>15 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: That's how you formulated these cautionary</p> <p>17 advices?</p> <p>18 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Mm-hmm. Right.</p> <p>19 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you.</p> <p>20 Can you give us a few examples during your time</p> <p>21 perhaps in Tuen Mun, as to some of the road that you</p> <p>22 have identified as dangerous or posed risk?</p> <p>23 (Pause)</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: If you can't, just say so.</p> <p>25 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Okay. No.</p>	Page 28	<p>1 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Basically we will have the</p> <p>2 crew, the sufficient of crew. Second will be the</p> <p>3 traffic condition will create -- the bus cannot arrive</p> <p>4 on time. And the third will be the bus breakdown, we</p> <p>5 don't have spare buses to replace shortly.</p> <p>6 Fourth will be if there is an urgent -- sudden</p> <p>7 demand happened in other area, we need to redeploy some</p> <p>8 service from gazetted service to others to make the</p> <p>9 demand solved.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: To meet the demand?</p> <p>11 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes. So there is these</p> <p>12 reasons will create lost trip. Some -- actually, we are</p> <p>13 doing some -- actually, we always need to review the --</p> <p>14 assess the scheduling of service time and time.</p> <p>15 Actually, when we create the schedule of service we need</p> <p>16 to review the -- every area, any changes, if there are</p> <p>17 changes maybe my during the off peak, the service do not</p> <p>18 need so frequent, so we will submit the application to</p> <p>19 Transport Department to reduce some schedule of service,</p> <p>20 some trips, so make use this time for bus captain for</p> <p>21 more rest time or to let them have more time to rest.</p> <p>22 So we, on and on going, we will apply this to</p> <p>23 Transport Department and this can also reduce the trips,</p> <p>24 so we can -- may have less lost trip rates.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Do Transport Department measure your lost trips?</p>

Page 29	Page 31
<p>1 Is this something you have to report?</p> <p>2 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>3 MS MAGGIE WONG: How do you assess the journey time when you</p> <p>4 gazette all these scheduled trips?</p> <p>5 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Okay, for the first time we</p> <p>6 will use our patrol car. Maybe for the first time the</p> <p>7 timetable issued we will use our patrol car to follow</p> <p>8 the scheduled trips, scheduled routing to measure the --</p> <p>9 estimate the journey time. After the timetable</p> <p>10 implement, maybe after certain period the environment is</p> <p>11 changed, we will analyse the previous days of regular</p> <p>12 service to summarise the journey time to average the</p> <p>13 journey time to estimate any changes after the timetable</p> <p>14 implement.</p> <p>15 So that is how to generate the journey time.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: So if you find that the journey time in fact is</p> <p>17 taking longer than the scheduled time, what do you do</p> <p>18 about it?</p> <p>19 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) We will apply to TD to make</p> <p>20 the scheduling service -- to revise the scheduling of</p> <p>21 service.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: Is that something that you do regularly?</p> <p>23 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: When did you last do that?</p> <p>25 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Actually, last month we also</p>	<p>1 the bus arrive, bus captain reach to us report they</p> <p>2 arrive. So we will actually use our internal system,</p> <p>3 TER system. Instead of black box.</p> <p>4 MEMBER LO: But TD does not look at that as sufficient</p> <p>5 evidence to change a timetable?</p> <p>6 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) No. I don't know how they do</p> <p>7 the analysis.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: But isn't the equipment that you have, we call it</p> <p>9 a black box, if you like, isn't it capable of doing this</p> <p>10 automatically? Or don't you know?</p> <p>11 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) You mean the black box data do</p> <p>12 it automatically?</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Tell you the journey time.</p> <p>14 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Actually, we will keep it in</p> <p>15 a database. Once we need to retrieve the data, we will</p> <p>16 recall that to see if the bus arrive on time, or</p> <p>17 something, or the speed of the bus. So not actually we</p> <p>18 rely on this to monitor journey time.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: The system you use is the fact that the bus</p> <p>20 captain uses his Octopus card on arrival at a terminus,</p> <p>21 is that it?</p> <p>22 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>23 MS MAGGIE WONG: And what are the consequences for your</p> <p>24 company if you have lost trips?</p> <p>25 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) It depends on -- "what are</p>
Page 30	Page 32
<p>1 submit that -- not last month, in May.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>3 How long typically does it take to get a response</p> <p>4 from the Transport Department?</p> <p>5 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) It will take long, because</p> <p>6 Transport Department say they will arrange a survey.</p> <p>7 Actually, not only we add the journey time, if we will,</p> <p>8 that's necessary, we also review the non-peak hour, the</p> <p>9 trip may be not that frequent, maybe reduce some trips,</p> <p>10 and the Transport Department need to make a survey, and</p> <p>11 then it will take a very long time for the process.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Are you talking about years? How long are you</p> <p>13 talking about?</p> <p>14 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Some certain months, maybe</p> <p>15 a year, Mr Chairman, yes.</p> <p>16 MEMBER LO: Have you used the black box information to</p> <p>17 ascertain that the trip time is actually longer?</p> <p>18 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Actually, we don't use black</p> <p>19 box for the journey time. We use -- we have a system,</p> <p>20 our -- our KMB system, which is the bus captain use</p> <p>21 their Octopus to report on the bus terminus, bus</p> <p>22 station, when they reach any bus station they will need</p> <p>23 to tap the Octopus card so that we can know that they</p> <p>24 arrive, and if there is some uncertainty, we will use</p> <p>25 its black box to see their arrival time. Actually, if</p>	<p>1 your consequences"? Actually, we try to deploy</p> <p>2 sufficient crew, bus captain to make a lost trip --</p> <p>3 minimise the lost trip. That's what -- our solution.</p> <p>4 And the other solution maybe what I mentioned, try to</p> <p>5 reduce the off-peak trips to make less bus captain to</p> <p>6 use on the road, and that's another solution.</p> <p>7 MS MAGGIE WONG: Ms Wong, do you know a person call Alok</p> <p>8 Jain?</p> <p>9 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Yes, our planner, ex DOD.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: What does that stand for?</p> <p>11 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Deputy operations director.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>13 MS MAGGIE WONG: During your time, have you been able to</p> <p>14 have a discussion or meetings with Alok Jain in relation</p> <p>15 to the safety aspects of franchised buses?</p> <p>16 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) In my understanding, I only --</p> <p>17 the planning issue, I will discuss with him. Because he</p> <p>18 have another --</p> <p>19 (Interpreted) He had got another sort of capacity.</p> <p>20 He was the planner, he was the head of planning.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: You mentioned planning issues. What is</p> <p>22 planning issue?</p> <p>23 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Because we have a division</p> <p>24 named "Planning", we will discuss with Planning</p> <p>25 Department on some routes development, or the bus type</p>

Page 33	Page 35
<p>1 issue with the Planning Department.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: In relation to the bus type issue, would</p> <p>3 you discuss black box?</p> <p>4 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Not with him.</p> <p>5 MS MAGGIE WONG: But during your time did you have meetings</p> <p>6 with this Planning Department concerning black box?</p> <p>7 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) No.</p> <p>8 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Chairman, I have finished my</p> <p>9 questioning.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>11 QUESTIONS FROM THE COMMITTEE</p> <p>12 MEMBER AUYEUNG: I just want to follow up on the comment you</p> <p>13 made earlier, that when a particular spot to be defined</p> <p>14 as hazardous by yourself or a bus captain, do you also</p> <p>15 have a procedure to report it to the head office, or the</p> <p>16 training instructor?</p> <p>17 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) We will discuss with training</p> <p>18 instructor for the -- any hazard. Something like maybe</p> <p>19 a -- sharing from experience, maybe we have a terminus,</p> <p>20 we see there always have accident when bus captain</p> <p>21 turning into the bus bay, like there is a shelter, maybe</p> <p>22 a shelter erected there which will create some hazard</p> <p>23 there, we will discuss with training school how to make</p> <p>24 more training on bus captain, or do some modification on</p> <p>25 the shelter issue.</p>	<p>1 you observe over the years, that we should be aware of?</p> <p>2 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) I think for the safety issue,</p> <p>3 not only our company can do everything. Like what</p> <p>4 I say, some road conditions, and some -- road condition</p> <p>5 is not -- maybe, the design of the road may have some</p> <p>6 not -- not good for double-decker bus or something -- so</p> <p>7 not the company can do, it is the design of the road, or</p> <p>8 Transport Department maybe can do something on some road</p> <p>9 design.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms Wong. Thank you for coming to</p> <p>11 assist us by giving evidence. But your evidence is now</p> <p>12 complete, and you can withdraw from the table. You can</p> <p>13 stay and listen to your colleague if you wish, or you</p> <p>14 are free to leave.</p> <p>15 But we will take the evidence now from Mr Yeung.</p> <p>16 EMPLOYEE OF KOWLOON MOTOR BUS COMPANY (1933) LIMITED</p> <p>17 MR KELVIN YEUNG</p> <p>18 (Evidence given in Cantonese and English, transcription of</p> <p>19 the simultaneous interpretation and/or English)</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr Yeung for coming to assist us by</p> <p>21 giving evidence for accepting our invitation to do so.</p> <p>22 You have heard me explain to Ms Wong and you have seen</p> <p>23 how we proceed.</p> <p>24 So I'll move straight away and ask Ms Wong to ask</p> <p>25 you questions.</p>
Page 34	Page 36
<p>1 So this kind of review or something experienced from</p> <p>2 bus captain, we will do, as what I said, we will verify</p> <p>3 the final, the root cause, and then we will try to find</p> <p>4 a way out, how to solve that.</p> <p>5 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Is this communication in writing, or</p> <p>6 verbal?</p> <p>7 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Both. Both will have.</p> <p>8 Sometimes e-mail, e-mail to training school.</p> <p>9 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Thank you.</p> <p>10 The other question is during your time working in</p> <p>11 your particular responsibility, have you ever received</p> <p>12 complaints from bus captain that the resting facilities</p> <p>13 are not good enough?</p> <p>14 MS DEBBY WONG: (In English) Mm-hmm, yes. We -- sometimes</p> <p>15 we will receive some bus captain request, maybe a bigger</p> <p>16 resting area, like the kiosk will be too small, they</p> <p>17 want one more, or they want more facility. Like they</p> <p>18 want distilled water, they want hot and cold water, so</p> <p>19 we will try to use our force to make them happy.</p> <p>20 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Thank you.</p> <p>21 MEMBER LO: This is just a very open question. I know you</p> <p>22 are a very experienced frontline manager.</p> <p>23 Are there issues that you think the company can do,</p> <p>24 maybe should do, but has not done, other than the</p> <p>25 aspects we have already discussed, about safety, that</p>	<p>1 MR KELVIN YEUNG: Good morning, Mr Chairman, and good</p> <p>2 morning, members. Could I have your permission to make</p> <p>3 some opening remarks, thank you.</p> <p>4 Good morning, ladies and gentlemen. I would like to</p> <p>5 thank the Committee for inviting me to today's hearing.</p> <p>6 Just now, Ms Debby Wong spoke. Like her, I'm also an</p> <p>7 assistant manager. Others would call us zone head, in</p> <p>8 Chinese "(Chinese spoken)". I'm also responsible for</p> <p>9 the operation of Tuen Mun depot. As has been pointed</p> <p>10 out -- perhaps I should speak slower for the sake of the</p> <p>11 interpreters.</p> <p>12 Now, for Tuen Mun depot, we are responsible for Tuen</p> <p>13 Mun, Yuen Long and Tin Shui Wai. For zone heads the</p> <p>14 main duty is such that he or she will take care of the</p> <p>15 operation of the bus service including bus routes and</p> <p>16 frontline bus captains, terminus supervisors, as well as</p> <p>17 other staff members, as well as facilities at the</p> <p>18 terminus like the rest kiosk. They are within our</p> <p>19 duties.</p> <p>20 We have to closely liaise with the frontline</p> <p>21 colleagues. Therefore, we have to know what the need,</p> <p>22 and at the same time other than dealing with the</p> <p>23 frontline colleagues regularly we have to meet with the</p> <p>24 management. We have to communicate with them, having</p> <p>25 meetings with them, telling them or relaying to them</p>

Page 37	Page 39
<p>1 what frontline colleagues have said, and regularly 2 I have to talk about what happens to the individual 3 routes, like what difficulties we have encountered. 4 So we have to be aware of the directions of the 5 management. 6 So I can say that for zone heads, we are sort of 7 like a bridge, a very important one, between the 8 frontline colleagues as well as the management. 9 Allow me to say a few words about myself. 10 I have been with the KMB for almost 10 years. 11 I started at a junior level. 10 years ago I joined the 12 Sha Tin depot as an inspector, operations inspector. It 13 is an outdoor sort of a duty. 14 My main duty was to assist the passengers as well as 15 frontline bus captains. 16 If bus captains encounter any problems then we have 17 to arrive at the scene to provide assistance. I was 18 also responsible for the terminus facilities. So there 19 was a lot for me to take care of. 20 Two years later I was promoted and I became an 21 officer for operations. So it is an office duty. Not 22 outdoors, but of course I have to go out to pay such 23 visits as well. 24 For the first two years, as far as the safety and 25 service quality department is concerned, I would have a</p>	<p>1 of the KMB have aired different views regarding the 2 company. 3 It is not just myself, but my colleagues have also 4 found that quite a lot of the view points or the 5 allegations were untrue. Together with the other six 6 zone heads we believe that such untrue allegations 7 regarding our bus captains' frontline officers, back 8 office colleagues and the management, such untrue 9 allegations are most unfair. Therefore, we have 10 co-signed a letter addressed to our board of directors. 11 We would like to tell them what we have seen, and what 12 actually happened. 13 So it was a brief one, but we told the board of 14 directors what we saw, and then we forwarded the letter 15 to the Committee for your reference. I know that a few 16 zone heads have had correspondence with you. Today only 17 Debby and myself can find time to attend your hearings. 18 What we want to do is that in the capacity of a zone 19 head we would like to tell you what actually happens. 20 From my point of view, before the accident, in other 21 words, before February, if you asked the public or 22 residents what they feel about KMB service in recent 23 years, they would say that service has improved, and 24 they are doing rather well in terms of the bus service, 25 and facilities, real-time arrival information,</p>
Page 38	Page 40
<p>1 close relationship because I was responsible for safety 2 matters. 3 Two years later, I was deployed to Tuen Mun, Yuen 4 Long, Tin Shui Wai responsible for the operations, and 5 then the company deployed me to take up a ROM project, 6 so that's the real-time operation management. 7 CHAIRMAN: Very sensibly you admonished yourself that you 8 would take this slowly, but you are not doing it. Can 9 I ask you to slow down. 10 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (In English) Slow down? Sure, let me slow 11 down. Would you like me to repeat it again -- 12 CHAIRMAN: No -- 13 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (In English) -- or just keep going? 14 CHAIRMAN: -- but do it slowly. 15 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Two years later I was 16 responsible for operations at Tuen Mun Tin Shui Wai. At 17 that time the company deployed me to take up a project 18 called ROM. I gathered from previous hearing sessions 19 that's the real-time operation management. So for ROM 20 and for the SSQ department, I'm experienced. 21 So I am -- I welcome questions from you on those two 22 topics. This year, unfortunately, there was a very 23 serious bus accident in February and I found that KMB 24 has become the focus point of the media, political 25 parties, trade unions, and even some former colleagues</p>	<p>1 et cetera. There have been improvements. 2 Unfortunately, after the accident in February, if 3 you ask the residents again -- 4 CHAIRMAN: Mr Yeung -- 5 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (In English) Yes. 6 CHAIRMAN: Thank you for making the opening statement, but 7 you have occupied quite a lot of time already -- 8 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (In English) I am nearly finished. 9 CHAIRMAN: You can make some closing remarks if you like, 10 but we are going to move now to questions. 11 EXAMINATION BY MS WONG 12 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Yeung, thank you for coming. You 13 mentioned that you joined KMB 10 years ago, that would 14 be around 2008? 15 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (In English) 2009. 16 MS MAGGIE WONG: Since when you became the operator in 17 charge of the Tuen Mun depot? 18 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Around 2013. 19 MS MAGGIE WONG: And we can see that in your statement that 20 the -- or rather in your opening statement, Tuen Mun 21 depot is responsible for bus operation of Tuen Mun, Yuen 22 Long and Tin Shui Wai, and you are only responsible for 23 Tuen Mun, correct? 24 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) In 2013, I once managed the 25 stations in Yuen Long and Tin Shui Wai. I was</p>

Page 41	Page 43
<p>1 responsible for a little more than half a year, and</p> <p>2 after that, I was responsible for Tuen Mun, and I was</p> <p>3 the zone head of Tuen Mun. Until July this year --</p> <p>4 well, after July I was rotated to Yuen Long and Tin Shui</p> <p>5 Wai, so I'm very familiar with Yuen Long, Tuen Mun and</p> <p>6 Tin Shui Wai.</p> <p>7 MS MAGGIE WONG: And you mentioned in your submission there</p> <p>8 are 31 bus terminus with full-day bus services under</p> <p>9 Tuen Mun depot. So currently, how many bus termini are</p> <p>10 you managing?</p> <p>11 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) For Yuen Long, Tuen Mun and</p> <p>12 Tin Shui Wai there are a total of 31. Ms Wong mentioned</p> <p>13 30, because one terminus only started operation at the</p> <p>14 end of June. So there might be a discrepancy.</p> <p>15 For bus terminals with full day service --</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: The question was very simple. How many bus</p> <p>17 stations do you manage? Don't tell us your mental</p> <p>18 process at arriving at the answer. Just give us the</p> <p>19 answer.</p> <p>20 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) But I must tell you how we</p> <p>21 ascertain the number of 31.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: No, that's not necessary, Mr Yeung. Listen to</p> <p>23 the question, and please respond directly to the</p> <p>24 question.</p> <p>25 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) There are 31 stations with</p>	<p>1 don't mind, I will count them now.</p> <p>2 From my recollection, all of them have bus captains</p> <p>3 on special shifts.</p> <p>4 MS MAGGIE WONG: And would resting facilities be provided to</p> <p>5 all 31 bus stations or bus termini?</p> <p>6 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes, there are resting</p> <p>7 facilities.</p> <p>8 MS MAGGIE WONG: All 31?</p> <p>9 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) If you need, I would like to</p> <p>10 elaborate on this. Of the 31 bus stations, there are</p> <p>11 special shifts, but the bus captains might not end their</p> <p>12 working days at the same station, so at all 31 stations</p> <p>13 there would be resting facilities for captains.</p> <p>14 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Yeung, you mentioned there are two types</p> <p>15 of rest kiosk. We have heard that, type A and type B,</p> <p>16 and you stated that for type A, the kiosk is about the</p> <p>17 size of 17 square feet, and for type B, 50 square feet.</p> <p>18 And we heard from Debby Wong that there is a bigger</p> <p>19 kiosk. Can you tell us how much bigger in comparison</p> <p>20 with type A and type B?</p> <p>21 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) For type A it can</p> <p>22 accommodate a maximum of two staff. For type B, the</p> <p>23 size is around double of type A. So in other words, if</p> <p>24 you put two type A kiosks together, they would look</p> <p>25 around the same size as one type B kiosk. However, if</p>
Page 42	Page 44
<p>1 full-time service.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: How many terminals do you manage?</p> <p>3 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) In July I was responsible</p> <p>4 for stations in Tuen Mun, Yuen Long and Tin Shui Wai.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: The question was: how many stations do you</p> <p>6 manage?</p> <p>7 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) 31 terminals with full-day</p> <p>8 service.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>10 MS MAGGIE WONG: So you manage the station together with</p> <p>11 Debby Wong for Tin Shui Wai as well, co-manage?</p> <p>12 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (In English) Correct, and Yuen Long as</p> <p>13 well.</p> <p>14 MS MAGGIE WONG: But you are of the same rank as Debby Wong</p> <p>15 is that correct, or you are of a higher rank?</p> <p>16 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) I'm mainly responsible for</p> <p>17 Tuen Mun terminals, but the company wants me to look at</p> <p>18 Yuen Long and Tin Shui Wai as well. But for Yuen Long</p> <p>19 and Tin Shui Wai, Debby and Amanda are chiefly</p> <p>20 responsible.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: And in your opening statement you stated</p> <p>22 that you take care of bus routes and front line of bus</p> <p>23 captains, et cetera. Do you know how many bus stations</p> <p>24 have special shifts?</p> <p>25 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Of the 31 stations, if you</p>	<p>1 you place two type A kiosks there would be a wall in</p> <p>2 between. So the space would be -- would not be able to</p> <p>3 be used some fully.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: Is this designation A and B a KMB designation?</p> <p>5 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes. These are our two</p> <p>6 standard kiosks: type A and type B.</p> <p>7 MS MAGGIE WONG: The Transport Department has made no</p> <p>8 guidelines on provision of rest facilities; is that</p> <p>9 correct? No guidelines whatsoever.</p> <p>10 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Correct. As far as I know,</p> <p>11 they do not have guidelines in place. So KMB would</p> <p>12 decide what kind of facilities to install.</p> <p>13 MS MAGGIE WONG: There is another type you mentioned. It is</p> <p>14 tailor-made kiosk, to cater special need of individual</p> <p>15 bus terminus. Can you tell us how many of these</p> <p>16 tailor-made kiosks were under your management?</p> <p>17 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Let me count.</p> <p>18 There are two to three. But I would have to verify</p> <p>19 the exact number of tailored kiosks.</p> <p>20 MS MAGGIE WONG: And what is meant by "tailor-made"?</p> <p>21 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Sometimes the applications</p> <p>22 for certain kiosks were not approved by TD or the</p> <p>23 Housing Department. For example, the sizes might be</p> <p>24 inappropriate or they might stand in the way of other</p> <p>25 facilities such as facilities for the blind. Then we</p>

Page 45	Page 47
<p>1 might have to tailor special sizes to fulfil the</p> <p>2 department's requirements.</p> <p>3 MS MAGGIE WONG: What is the approximate size of this</p> <p>4 tailor-made kiosk?</p> <p>5 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) The total area should be</p> <p>6 similar to a type B kiosk. If the width is too much, we</p> <p>7 might narrow it down, but then we might make the kiosk</p> <p>8 longer. So that is the situation as I know.</p> <p>9 MS MAGGIE WONG: Would sleeping sofa or benches be provided</p> <p>10 in all or some of these resting facilities that you</p> <p>11 manage?</p> <p>12 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) In Yuen Long, there are</p> <p>13 three locations with sleeping areas with benches for</p> <p>14 captains.</p> <p>15 MS MAGGIE WONG: You mentioned three locations with sleeping</p> <p>16 areas. Can you tell us where?</p> <p>17 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Tuen Mun depot, Tuen Mun</p> <p>18 town centre, and Tuen Mun south depot: at Tuen Mun south</p> <p>19 depot there are no sleeping benches, but there is still</p> <p>20 space for captains to sleep.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: How many sleeping benches were there for</p> <p>22 each of these locations?</p> <p>23 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) I cannot give the exact</p> <p>24 number now. But there are approximately five benches.</p> <p>25 MS MAGGIE WONG: For each of them?</p>	<p>1 least one to two times. For Tuen Mun depot I would go</p> <p>2 more frequently, because my office is right at Tuen Mun</p> <p>3 depot.</p> <p>4 MS MAGGIE WONG: And may I now go to some of the examples</p> <p>5 that you mentioned in your submission that you stated</p> <p>6 that there are difficulties in obtaining permission or</p> <p>7 in obtaining successful application for resting</p> <p>8 facilities.</p> <p>9 It is at page 181-1 to 181-2.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: Of which bundle?</p> <p>11 MS MAGGIE WONG: Of FE bundle.</p> <p>12 And in your statement at the bottom you mentioned</p> <p>13 three locations that require improvement, and the first</p> <p>14 one is So Kwut Wat, newly introduced on 25 June 2018,</p> <p>15 and you state there had that:</p> <p>16 "... provision of a type A kiosk and chemical toilet</p> <p>17 is needed. (application ... is pending since</p> <p>18 13 June 2018)."</p> <p>19 May I first ask you, how long this So Kwut Wat bus</p> <p>20 terminus existed?</p> <p>21 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) If you talk about full-day</p> <p>22 operation, it was introduced on 25 June 2018.</p> <p>23 MS MAGGIE WONG: So this was a bus stop newly placed,</p> <p>24 instead of being there for years?</p> <p>25 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Correct.</p>
Page 46	Page 48
<p>1 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes, at each location.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: And that location would be shared by how</p> <p>3 many bus captains?</p> <p>4 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) For all bus captains,</p> <p>5 whether or not they are on special shifts, they can use</p> <p>6 the facilities. I don't have the exact figure on hand.</p> <p>7 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you give us an estimate of the number</p> <p>8 of bus captains that would use each of these locations?</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Are you talking about any one time, or what?</p> <p>10 MS MAGGIE WONG: Any one time.</p> <p>11 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) From what I see at the</p> <p>12 stations, most of the time the five benches would not be</p> <p>13 fully occupied by captains, so at any one time less than</p> <p>14 five captains would be using the facilities.</p> <p>15 MS MAGGIE WONG: At what time did you go down to these</p> <p>16 locations?</p> <p>17 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Usually in the so-called</p> <p>18 middle hours, in other words from 11 am to 3 or 4 pm.</p> <p>19 When I visit in those hours, sometimes benches would be</p> <p>20 occupied by captains.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: How frequently did you go down for these</p> <p>22 three locations?</p> <p>23 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Well, our duty is such that</p> <p>24 for every week I have to visit different terminus. So</p> <p>25 for the three places on a monthly basis I would go at</p>	<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: When you introduced this new bus terminus,</p> <p>2 with the Transport Department, did the Transport</p> <p>3 Department require at any stage that your company do</p> <p>4 provide resting facilities to bus captains?</p> <p>5 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) The TD didn't require the</p> <p>6 provision of such facilities for bus captains.</p> <p>7 MS MAGGIE WONG: The Transport Department, when they</p> <p>8 approved this bus terminus, were there requirements set</p> <p>9 out in writing?</p> <p>10 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) What do you mean? You mean</p> <p>11 when we introduced the route, whether there is any</p> <p>12 written correspondence? The answer is yes. We have to</p> <p>13 formally submit papers to get a formal application, and</p> <p>14 the TD will formally sort of reply to us, saying that it</p> <p>15 is approved.</p> <p>16 MS MAGGIE WONG: When the Transport Department approves a</p> <p>17 certain route, would they, in your experience, normally</p> <p>18 impose certain conditions?</p> <p>19 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) What do you mean by</p> <p>20 "conditions"?</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: For running that particular route.</p> <p>22 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes, the TD would ask for</p> <p>23 the alignment and the bus stops along the route, and the</p> <p>24 journey time, the journey distance, the frequency. All</p> <p>25 such will be clearly stated in their approval letter.</p>

Page 49	Page 51
<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: In relation to this So Kwut Wat terminus, 2 would there be special shifts for this particular bus 3 terminus? 4 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes. 5 MS MAGGIE WONG: So because you stated there that the 6 application was only made since 13 June 2018, so at the 7 moment there will be no resting facility, is that 8 correct, for that So Kwut Wat bus terminus? 9 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Correct, for so Kwut Wat bus 10 terminus we have placed a type A kiosk and a chemical 11 toilet -- we would like to do so, but so far we have not 12 got the approval from the TD. 13 MS MAGGIE WONG: How many bus captains are working in that 14 So Kwut Wat bus terminus? 15 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) If you look at the number of 16 bus captains involved, if I remember correctly, I would 17 say three or four of them. 18 MS MAGGIE WONG: How many of them are on special shifts? 19 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) One. 20 MS MAGGIE WONG: Do I take it that the type A kiosk is 21 installed notwithstanding the fact that approval has not 22 been given? 23 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) This is a fact. We haven't 24 got the approval, but we have already installed it 25 there, because we have commissioned the route. If we</p>	<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: Why do you see a need to convert type A to 2 type B for Po Tin Estate? 3 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) We went there, we saw the 4 bus captains were outside the kiosk eating their meal 5 box, because there was not sufficient space within the 6 kiosk. Bus captains have also told us that they didn't 7 have sufficient space, therefore we believe that two 8 type A kiosks would not be adequate. 9 MS MAGGIE WONG: Are there special shifts for this Po Tin 10 Estate? 11 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes. 12 MS MAGGIE WONG: How many bus captains are using the two 13 type A kiosks? 14 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) I haven't got the detailed 15 figures as to how many bus captains doing special shifts 16 are using the facilities. My understanding is that many 17 of them go home to take a rest. 18 MS MAGGIE WONG: How many routes are running for this Po Tin 19 Estate? 20 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) For whole-day routes there 21 are two of them. 22 MS MAGGIE WONG: What about non-full day? 23 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) For non-full day service 24 another two bus routes. They have morning service only. 25 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Chairman, I see the time. May we take</p>
Page 50	Page 52
<p>1 don't have it there, it means that the bus captains can 2 not take a rest there. 3 MS MAGGIE WONG: And the second example you gave is Po Tin 4 Estate, in which you state there that in order to cater 5 for more bus captains for resting, there is a need to 6 convert type A to type B kiosk, and you applied to the 7 Housing Authority since 24 November 2014. 8 Can you tell us what is the progress so far as 9 this -- because you are applying on 24 November 2014. 10 Is the current state still type A kiosk, or did you do 11 similar thing as in So Kwut Wat Estate, installing 12 type B nevertheless? 13 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) For Po Tin terminus, we used 14 to have three type A kiosks. As I have said, well, two 15 of them were merged together, but then the space was not 16 put to maximum use, we reviewed the situation, we found 17 that it wasn't adequate, so we applied to the Housing 18 Department hoping that the two merged type A kiosks can 19 be converted into a type B kiosk, and for the third 20 type A kiosk it should become a type B kiosk. As of 21 this moment, we have not got any approval from the HD, 22 but still, we have already replaced the two type A 23 kiosks by a type B kiosk. So the replacement has taken 24 place. We are yet to convert one more type A kiosk into 25 a type B kiosk.</p>	<p>1 a break? 2 CHAIRMAN: Certainly. 3 Mr Yeung, we are going to take a break until 4 12 o'clock by that clock on the wall behind you. 5 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (In English) Thank you. 6 (11.41 am) 7 (A short break) 8 (12.00 pm) 9 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Yeung, just to wrap this matter up, do 10 you mind providing us with some figures about Po Tin 11 Estate, in terms of how many bus captains are using the 12 kiosk in the Po Tin Estate, in terms of special shifts. 13 And you have also stated in your submission that it 14 normally requires a long lead time for about five years 15 before your application for resting facilities can be 16 approved, and you cited four examples at page 181-2; is 17 that correct? 18 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Correct. 19 MS MAGGIE WONG: I'm going on to another topic, Mr Yeung. 20 In your opening statement you said you are 21 experienced in real-time monitoring, ROM device, and 22 also the SSQ, is that correct -- SSQ department, that is 23 safety and service quality department; is that correct? 24 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Correct. 25 MS MAGGIE WONG: And you said that two years later, after</p>

Page 53	<p>1 you were assigned to the Tuen Mun depot you were</p> <p>2 assigned to take up the project concerning ROM. Can you</p> <p>3 tell us when that was.</p> <p>4 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Regarding the ROM project,</p> <p>5 I think it was around about 2013 that I started to take</p> <p>6 part.</p> <p>7 MS MAGGIE WONG: Since 2013?</p> <p>8 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: I am sorry, what was that question? Because you</p> <p>10 talked over the interpretation.</p> <p>11 MS MAGGIE WONG: I am so sorry, since 2013 Mr Yeung was</p> <p>12 assigned --</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: We got that one, then you asked another question</p> <p>14 which produced an affirmative answer, but we didn't hear</p> <p>15 the question.</p> <p>16 Never mind. Move on then.</p> <p>17 MS MAGGIE WONG: I think my question is whether it is since</p> <p>18 2013, and then Mr Yeung said "Yes".</p> <p>19 Do you know a person by the name of Raymond Cheng?</p> <p>20 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can I take you to his statement that he</p> <p>22 mentioned, something about a study that he conducted for</p> <p>23 safe driving in the sharp turns back in 2013. That's at</p> <p>24 page 96-4 of FE bundle.</p> <p>25 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes.</p>	Page 55	<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: And did you contribute to the narrowing</p> <p>2 down to 29 corner turns?</p> <p>3 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) As far as I can recall,</p> <p>4 I think at that time there were more than that. I think</p> <p>5 they identified certain sharp bends locations as</p> <p>6 identified by Mr Raymond Cheng. I recall that there</p> <p>7 were more than 20 plus.</p> <p>8 MS MAGGIE WONG: You mentioned that according to Mr Cheng he</p> <p>9 has identified more than 29 turns. How did you know</p> <p>10 that?</p> <p>11 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) I think from internal</p> <p>12 communication, for our driving instructors, I did have</p> <p>13 a discussion with them over such a topic. My</p> <p>14 understanding was that from our driving instructors,</p> <p>15 they said that for sharp bends, if it is 90-degrees or</p> <p>16 almost 90 degrees, they would regard it as a sharp bend.</p> <p>17 So I understand there were more than such a number of</p> <p>18 locations.</p> <p>19 MS MAGGIE WONG: If you turn over the page at 96-6, at the</p> <p>20 top it mentioned that:</p> <p>21 "The colleagues from the Safety and Service Quality</p> <p>22 Department accompanied all the colleagues from the study</p> <p>23 group to test all the 29 turns in different road</p> <p>24 conditions, different speeds, different passenger load</p> <p>25 conditions and video-recorded the whole study for future</p>
Page 54	<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you read three pages, 96-4 to 96-6.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: Yes?</p> <p>3 MS MAGGIE WONG: There are a few questions I would like to</p> <p>4 ask.</p> <p>5 First, at page 96-4, Mr Cheng mentioned:</p> <p>6 "The Safety and Quality Service Department invited 4</p> <p>7 Depot Managers, the representatives from Bus Captain</p> <p>8 Training School and bus maintenance section of Service</p> <p>9 Department to form a study group to looking deeply into</p> <p>10 all the sharp turns within [KMB] bus route network."</p> <p>11 Are you part of this study group?</p> <p>12 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) At that time I wasn't</p> <p>13 a manager, so I wasn't on the study group. But then the</p> <p>14 then manager did ask for my opinions.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: Who was that?</p> <p>16 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) If you talk about depot</p> <p>17 managers, at that time it was the general manager for</p> <p>18 Tuen Mun depot, Mr Woo Kin Keung, who has already</p> <p>19 retired.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: And according to this study they have</p> <p>22 narrowed it down to the top 29 corner turns that may</p> <p>23 cause serious overturning accidents. Did you know about</p> <p>24 these 29 corner turns?</p> <p>25 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes.</p>	Page 56	<p>1 reference."</p> <p>2 Did you know about this video-recorded study?</p> <p>3 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) At the time I heard that</p> <p>4 they invited driving instructors to carry out test runs</p> <p>5 at such locations. As to whether it was really done,</p> <p>6 and what extent, and how many was covered I don't know.</p> <p>7 But I did hear about such a matter, and I was also aware</p> <p>8 that they had the idea of making a video recording.</p> <p>9 MS MAGGIE WONG: You mentioned that you heard from the</p> <p>10 driving instructors. Are those driving instructors</p> <p>11 still employed by KMB?</p> <p>12 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) My understanding is they are</p> <p>13 still working with the company, I mean the driving</p> <p>14 instructors.</p> <p>15 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you tell us who?</p> <p>16 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Well, I don't know who</p> <p>17 actually had meetings on that day. There were dozens of</p> <p>18 driving instructors, I can't give you the names of the</p> <p>19 driving instructors.</p> <p>20 MS MAGGIE WONG: And if we read on from that paragraph, it</p> <p>21 appears that this video-recorded study was carried out.</p> <p>22 Because it is stated there that important data was</p> <p>23 collected from these experiments to come up with a set</p> <p>24 of safety guidelines.</p> <p>25 And if we follow on and read from that paragraph, he</p>

Page 57	Page 59
<p>1 further stated: 2 "From the study, we were able to produce a safety 3 booklet ..." 4 He subsequently clarified as small printed cards: 5 "... for Bus Captains detailing each potentially 6 dangerous turns' exact location, direction, and road 7 nature, road condition, past record, related photos 8 [et cetera]." 9 And he suggested 31 safety driving suggestions from 10 a study of over 1,500 studies. 11 Did you know about these small printed cards for bus 12 captains? 13 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes. 14 MS MAGGIE WONG: Have you seen one of them? 15 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes. 16 MS MAGGIE WONG: Are they still in existence? 17 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) No longer in use. 18 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you retrieve a copy? 19 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) I'm not sure whether we 20 still get them in our office. Some frontline bus 21 captains and some driving instructors have different 22 views for such cards, so they have not formed part of 23 our training. 24 MS MAGGIE WONG: So why are those cards no longer in use? 25 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) As I have said, some driving</p>	<p>1 sharp bends or we can put up some warning signs. 2 MS MAGGIE WONG: You referred to "at that time we raised the 3 point with the Transport Department to install the 4 arrows at sharp bends". When was that? 5 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) We suggested to the SSQ, but 6 I do not know whether the SSQ eventually applied to the 7 Transport Department. 8 MS MAGGIE WONG: When? 9 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) In 2013. I do not know 10 whether they eventually applied to the TD. 11 CHAIRMAN: When were the cards issued to the bus captains, 12 as you said? 13 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) I cannot remember the exact 14 dates, it was around 2013 or 2014. 15 CHAIRMAN: Is that throughout the bus captains in KMB? 16 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes, we attempted to 17 distribute the cards but having heard the captains' 18 comments we stopped distributing the cards. 19 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Yeung, you also mentioned that you're 20 experienced in real-time ROM device, and can you tell us 21 how experienced are you in knowing the functions and 22 capabilities of black box? 23 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Are you referring to ROM or 24 the black box? 25 MS MAGGIE WONG: Both.</p>
Page 58	Page 60
<p>1 instructors and some frontline bus captains think that 2 it is difficult to define what is a sharp bend. The 3 definition could be wide. If you are to set a speed for 4 each and every sharp bend, it may be beyond the 5 capability of the KMB. Probably the rationale behind 6 the study is to enable each bus captain know about the 7 maximum speed to be deployed at each bend. But then for 8 a bus captain, he will be going through different sharp 9 bends and then for the TD, the speed limit is 50, so 10 they believe that it is better to make a judgment on 11 each and every occasion rather than asking the bus 12 captain to remember the maximum speed for each and every 13 bend. 14 CHAIRMAN: How did you come to know about these different 15 views? 16 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Well, the cards had been 17 issued by the bus captains, and they did reflect their 18 views to me. They said that if they didn't follow the 19 suggested speed limit, in fact they did not commit any 20 offence or speeding within the laws of Hong Kong, but 21 then the company would not say the same. 22 So if an accident didn't happen, is it a risk? We 23 didn't come to any conclusion. 24 At that time, we raised the point perhaps we should 25 talk to the TD to sort of install the arrows at the</p>	<p>1 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) For ROM I was one of the 2 staff representing operations in the design phase of 3 this system. I was involved throughout the development 4 of ROM. 5 For black box I'm not too familiar with the 6 technologies involved. Many of our computer programmes 7 would be supported by the black box, which would provide 8 the necessary data. 9 MS MAGGIE WONG: You -- ROM is -- stands for real-time 10 monitoring. So is your involvement limited to the 11 provision of real-time data for passengers to know the 12 schedule time of buses? Or is your involvement wider in 13 terms of the safety aspect? 14 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) As far as I know, the design 15 of ROM did not involve any safety considerations. We 16 relied on black box data in designing the system and we 17 wanted to make use of the data to determine our 18 frequencies, so safety was not among the considerations. 19 MS MAGGIE WONG: You mentioned that at that time, I don't 20 think it has been translated -- you mentioned that at 21 that time it was not mentioned at any of the meetings 22 about the issue of safety, in terms of the real-time 23 monitoring. I think you also mentioned "at the 24 meetings". 25 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Correct.</p>

Page 61	Page 63
<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: What meetings?</p> <p>2 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) ROM was a new project, and</p> <p>3 we started from scratch. We made use of existing black</p> <p>4 box data, so we would meet regularly and everyone would</p> <p>5 provide input on how we should design the system.</p> <p>6 MS MAGGIE WONG: Since when?</p> <p>7 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) It should be 2013, I cannot</p> <p>8 remember the exact month.</p> <p>9 MS MAGGIE WONG: Who were present in these meetings?</p> <p>10 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) We had representatives from</p> <p>11 our IT department, representatives from the operations</p> <p>12 unit of the four depots, and there was a central</p> <p>13 department known as the traffic department. They were</p> <p>14 the project managers who would coordinate these</p> <p>15 meetings.</p> <p>16 MS MAGGIE WONG: Was the planning and development</p> <p>17 department, or were people from planning and development</p> <p>18 department present in these meetings?</p> <p>19 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) No, they were not involved.</p> <p>20 MS MAGGIE WONG: Did you know about Alok Jain?</p> <p>21 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes, I know him.</p> <p>22 MS MAGGIE WONG: Did you have dealings with him during the</p> <p>23 time of 2013 to 2015?</p> <p>24 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) We did have meetings on</p> <p>25 certain planning issues.</p>	<p>1 KMB radio. It operates around the clock. When captains</p> <p>2 and other staff run into issues on the road they can</p> <p>3 call this 24-hour number, and staff would be deployed</p> <p>4 for support. The radio would have direct lines with the</p> <p>5 police, and they would exchange intelligence with the</p> <p>6 ETCC of the Transport Department, and police.</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: What is ETCC?</p> <p>8 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) I don't know what the full</p> <p>9 name is in English. It is something like the Emergency</p> <p>10 Transport Coordination Centre.</p> <p>11 MS MAGGIE WONG: As you said, it sounds like a radio station</p> <p>12 for emergency situation instead of real-time monitoring</p> <p>13 using black box; is that correct?</p> <p>14 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Eventually, ROM transformed</p> <p>15 into another kind of system, and this system is still in</p> <p>16 use.</p> <p>17 But the current system is a bit different from the</p> <p>18 design of ROM back then.</p> <p>19 MS MAGGIE WONG: You mentioned "a bit different". How</p> <p>20 different?</p> <p>21 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Back then the idea of ROM</p> <p>22 was to monitor the separation between buses, and if the</p> <p>23 system realised that a certain bus is too close to the</p> <p>24 bus in front, prompts might be given to the bus captain</p> <p>25 so that they would set off later. So if they are going</p>
Page 62	Page 64
<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: What are the certain planning issues?</p> <p>2 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) For example, we planned bus</p> <p>3 routes for the coming year, they had to be submitted to</p> <p>4 TD and the district councils, so he and I took part in</p> <p>5 meetings with the TD and district councils on bus route</p> <p>6 rationalisation or other changes.</p> <p>7 MS MAGGIE WONG: We have heard evidence from Mr Alok Jain</p> <p>8 that at that time there was an idea, to use Lai Chi Kok</p> <p>9 as the real-time operation management centre, or</p> <p>10 so-called, the operation control centre, in which the</p> <p>11 data analysis would be done company-wide. Have you</p> <p>12 heard about that?</p> <p>13 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes, I heard about it.</p> <p>14 MS MAGGIE WONG: And we also heard evidence that ultimately</p> <p>15 Lai Chi Kok office was not used in that way. It became</p> <p>16 an office instead of a real-time operation management</p> <p>17 centre; is that correct?</p> <p>18 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Incorrect.</p> <p>19 MS MAGGIE WONG: So up until now is it still being used as</p> <p>20 real-time monitoring centre?</p> <p>21 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) We had a radio control</p> <p>22 section. It is still exists today.</p> <p>23 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you tell us what is this radio control</p> <p>24 section?</p> <p>25 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) In Chinese we call it the</p>	<p>1 too slow, again prompts might be given, or issued to bus</p> <p>2 captains. The idea was to allow more even waiting times</p> <p>3 for passengers.</p> <p>4 So the idea was that ROM could share some work of</p> <p>5 terminal regulators, and if the Lai Chi Kok depot was</p> <p>6 turned into a control centre, then most regulators would</p> <p>7 not be needed anymore. But now we have retained all the</p> <p>8 terminal regulators and ROM became a system of</p> <p>9 monitoring the locations and speed of buses and, if</p> <p>10 necessary, we can use this database to retrieve the past</p> <p>11 records of buses.</p> <p>12 MS MAGGIE WONG: You mentioned that this system was</p> <p>13 transformed, or rather a bit different from the original</p> <p>14 design, or idea. Why would there be a transformation of</p> <p>15 this idea?</p> <p>16 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) I'm not sure about the</p> <p>17 reason for the decision made by the management, but</p> <p>18 myself and some staff from the project team felt that if</p> <p>19 we are to use the system to replace the functions of</p> <p>20 regulators, the idea was not very realistic, that's why</p> <p>21 we offered comments to the management that there would</p> <p>22 be certain risk if regulators are dismissed, but I do</p> <p>23 not know whether this was the reason for the eventual</p> <p>24 decision.</p> <p>25 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you tell us when this transformation</p>

Page 65	Page 67
<p>1 took place?</p> <p>2 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) It took place in around 2014</p> <p>3 or early 2015.</p> <p>4 MS MAGGIE WONG: So after 2015?</p> <p>5 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes, in the subsequent</p> <p>6 months.</p> <p>7 MS MAGGIE WONG: We also heard from Mr Alok Jain that at the</p> <p>8 time when this real-time monitoring system was</p> <p>9 considered, one of the ideas was to nudge the driver to</p> <p>10 drive in a better way on the road by creating some kind</p> <p>11 of a system where they could give them feedback about</p> <p>12 how they are driving and whether they are outliers or</p> <p>13 whether they are falling within the normal pattern or</p> <p>14 whether it is good behaviour or bad behaviour.</p> <p>15 Have you heard about that?</p> <p>16 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes.</p> <p>17 MS MAGGIE WONG: What happened to this idea?</p> <p>18 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) It was implemented. Now on</p> <p>19 every bus there is a small device with four lights, and</p> <p>20 it would emit a low beep reminding bus captains of any</p> <p>21 improper driving behaviour.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: Any improper driving behaviour?</p> <p>23 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Right. Say, for example</p> <p>24 speeding, or sharp braking, or sudden acceleration, or</p> <p>25 if the engine has been idling, we don't want the engine</p>	<p>1 black box that was on the Tai Po bus that had the</p> <p>2 accident on 10 February of this year.</p> <p>3 MS MAGGIE WONG: That is, for the record, BM-66.</p> <p>4 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) I have come across such</p> <p>5 figures. I understand that our management would tune</p> <p>6 the figures so as to see whether there was a need to</p> <p>7 enhance the warning. As to whether they are the current</p> <p>8 set of figures, I'm not sure.</p> <p>9 MS MAGGIE WONG: You mentioned the management would tune the</p> <p>10 figures. Can you tell us who are those members in the</p> <p>11 management that would tune the figures?</p> <p>12 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) I think the management of</p> <p>13 our engineering department, if they want to modify the</p> <p>14 system, it will be such engineers who would do it. So</p> <p>15 in my daily work I have not come across such figures.</p> <p>16 MS MAGGIE WONG: If we may go to 67, page 67 of BM bundle.</p> <p>17 Scroll it down.</p> <p>18 In the blue section, blue paragraph, the third</p> <p>19 paragraph, this is the black box, or telematics company,</p> <p>20 in which your company has a contract to provide</p> <p>21 telematics system.</p> <p>22 It states there:</p> <p>23 "Regarding the real-time operations management</p> <p>24 system we are not aware about any plans by KMB to</p> <p>25 introduce such a system. Hence, we are neither aware of</p>
Page 66	Page 68
<p>1 to be on and yet the bus remains stationary. So there</p> <p>2 will be a beeping sound and there will be light signals.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: So four areas?</p> <p>4 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Correct.</p> <p>5 MS MAGGIE WONG: Since when do you have this system of</p> <p>6 alerting drivers by using this alert system, or small</p> <p>7 device, you call it?</p> <p>8 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Sorry? If you ask for an</p> <p>9 exact date, I can't recall. But I would say that it</p> <p>10 must have been there for a few years. If you wanted</p> <p>11 information, I can go back to check it up for you.</p> <p>12 MS MAGGIE WONG: And can you tell us more about the system</p> <p>13 of black box in terms of monitoring drivers' behaviour?</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on, what thresholds are set to</p> <p>15 cause this device to illuminate a light and to emit</p> <p>16 a low sound. What is the threshold for speeding?</p> <p>17 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) For the details, I don't</p> <p>18 think I have got them with me. But there will be</p> <p>19 a speed, and also the number of seconds taken to</p> <p>20 accelerate or decelerate, or to brake, but I have not</p> <p>21 got the figures with me now.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: None of them?</p> <p>23 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) No.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: Does what is on the screen now help you? We have</p> <p>25 received evidence that this information comes from the</p>	<p>1 any plan by KMB to interface the technograph/telematics</p> <p>2 system with the ROM system."</p> <p>3 It appears --</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: I think give Mr Yeung a chance to read this.</p> <p>5 This is provided by Openmatics and ZF Friedrichschafen.</p> <p>6 MS MAGGIE WONG: Have you finished, Mr Yeung?</p> <p>7 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (In English) Finished.</p> <p>8 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you confirm that's the position of KMB?</p> <p>9 Was this accurately recorded there?</p> <p>10 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) As far as I know, yes, it is</p> <p>11 correct.</p> <p>12 MS MAGGIE WONG: Have KMB considered interfacing the</p> <p>13 telematics system with the ROM system in future?</p> <p>14 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) I don't know.</p> <p>15 MS MAGGIE WONG: Do you know who would know?</p> <p>16 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) I think colleagues from the</p> <p>17 engineering department.</p> <p>18 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can we go back to black box. Can you tell</p> <p>19 us briefly how KMB would monitor the drivers' driving</p> <p>20 behaviour by using black box?</p> <p>21 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Well, there are two areas</p> <p>22 here. First of all, the most straightforward one is</p> <p>23 about speeding. So for us, in the operations, in the</p> <p>24 depot, as well as the TQD, they would monitor the</p> <p>25 situation by using the program. The data would be fed</p>

Page 69	Page 71
<p>1 from the black box, so that's about speeding. 2 And then, we have got alerts from the small device 3 for driving behaviour, so we would also record the 4 number of times that the light was emitted, so it is an 5 area which falls within the responsibility of the TQD. 6 CHAIRMAN: Where do you get the information about the number 7 of times that the light is lit and the sound is emitted? 8 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Our IT department will send 9 a report telling us how many times the light was 10 activated regarding a driver. For harsh braking, when 11 the light is activated it doesn't always mean that the 12 driver is wrong, because if the vehicle in front has 13 braked, then the driver has to do the same. So the 14 department would review to see whether a particular bus 15 captain has more times that the light is activated and 16 we may get a plain clothes assessor to ride with the bus 17 captain to check if there is anything wrong with the 18 driving behaviour. 19 MS MAGGIE WONG: You mentioned your IT department will send 20 a report telling you how many times the light was 21 activated regarding a driver. How frequent would that 22 be done? 23 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) A report for every week or 24 two. 25 MS MAGGIE WONG: So let's quote an example: if a driver had</p>	<p>1 braking all the time so as to follow up on such bad 2 driving behaviour. 3 MS MAGGIE WONG: What is the TQD, sorry? 4 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Training and quality 5 assurance department. And their responsibility is to 6 train our bus captains and to carry out assessment about 7 their driving skills, and if necessary, to take 8 follow-up action, say, for example, disciplinary action, 9 or issuing warnings. Such will be the responsibility of 10 this department. 11 MS MAGGIE WONG: You mentioned that you would identify 12 together with TQD those who are repeaters, and you would 13 first call them by telephone and give them a gentle 14 reminder. 15 How many of those repeaters were there? Perhaps 16 just quote an example for this year. 17 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) I think there would be one 18 or two every time. It may not be a repeater. If I see 19 that in a particular report the number of times is more 20 than other bus captains, then I will find out from the 21 list who they are, and I will give a reminder. For 22 others, who have had this once or two times only, we 23 will wait for the next time to see whether they have the 24 same again. 25 Take Tuen Mun as an example. If you ask for the</p>
Page 70	Page 72
<p>1 a habit of harsh braking, and it is recorded in your 2 data, and that report would only be given to you a week 3 later; is that the position? 4 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) I would say yes, correct. 5 I can't recall how many days later we get the report. 6 MS MAGGIE WONG: And would the driver know about his harsh 7 braking habit instantly? 8 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) If he has harsh braking 9 while driving, the light will be emitted and then the 10 beeping would also be activated. 11 MS MAGGIE WONG: What would be the consequence of a driver 12 who has a habit of constantly having harsh braking 13 within that week? 14 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) As I've mentioned, 15 therefore, both departments would work on it. 16 Let me focus on my department. Well, if the light 17 comes up once, we can't, on that basis, say that there 18 is a problem. We would identify those who are 19 repeaters, we would call them by telephone, and give 20 them a gentle reminder, or as I have said, we will get 21 our inspectors to check if there is anything wrong, and 22 then for TQD, as I have mentioned, they would also get 23 someone who is in plain clothes to act as an assessor to 24 be with the bus captain to assess whether their bus 25 captain is jerky, and whether he has resorted to harsh</p>	<p>1 number, it would be a couple of them, less than 10. 2 CHAIRMAN: Per what? 3 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) 900 or so for the entirety 4 of Tuen Mun depot. 5 CHAIRMAN: So 900 bus captains but less than 10 would fall 6 into this category; is that what you are saying? 7 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Correct. 8 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 9 MS MAGGIE WONG: For those 10, how many times did they have 10 that harsh braking? How many times have they had this 11 problem of harsh braking before it triggers or activates 12 your concerns? 13 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Usually it would be a single 14 digit, say five times, or six times. And if we think 15 that in this case he has relatively more such occasions, 16 then we will take the action I referred to. 17 MS MAGGIE WONG: You mentioned five or six times. Within 18 a day or within a week? 19 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Within a week. As to the 20 exact figure I need to verify, I'm not sure. 21 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you provide us with the information 22 later? 23 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes. 24 MS MAGGIE WONG: Now if the person have this habit -- simply 25 referring to those 10, what would you do? If you</p>

Page 73	Page 75
<p>1 noticed that he had a habit of harsh braking, what would</p> <p>2 you do apart from telephoning him? Would you talk to</p> <p>3 him and find out the reasons?</p> <p>4 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes, I would call him or</p> <p>5 a face-to-face interview. I may do that as well.</p> <p>6 MS MAGGIE WONG: Have you done that to those 10?</p> <p>7 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes, either me or my</p> <p>8 colleagues would make that move.</p> <p>9 MS MAGGIE WONG: Have they improved?</p> <p>10 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Some of them did and some of</p> <p>11 them would not have a relapse of such behaviour. From</p> <p>12 my recollection, most would not repeat such behaviour.</p> <p>13 So there has been improvement in most cases.</p> <p>14 MS MAGGIE WONG: We have heard also from Mr Alok Jain's</p> <p>15 evidence that during one of the meetings, they explored</p> <p>16 the idea of having a scorecard system for drivers, and</p> <p>17 one of the systems that was explored is the</p> <p>18 GreenRoad.com system. And what it does is it gives an</p> <p>19 analysis of the driver's driving behaviour, and it would</p> <p>20 fall into three different categories, like red, amber</p> <p>21 and green.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: Have you heard of such a system?</p> <p>23 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes.</p> <p>24 MS MAGGIE WONG: Since when did you hear about this system?</p> <p>25 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) The year was around 2013 or</p>	<p>1 meetings?</p> <p>2 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) For many of our meetings we</p> <p>3 would have e-mail recaps and they would serve as</p> <p>4 minutes. I cannot really remember whether minutes were</p> <p>5 taken for this meeting.</p> <p>6 MS MAGGIE WONG: And this system was not used. Do you know</p> <p>7 why?</p> <p>8 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) This system should have been</p> <p>9 deployed. I'm not very sure about the name mentioned by</p> <p>10 Mr Alok, but from what you described, it is very similar</p> <p>11 to one of our current systems.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: What is that system?</p> <p>13 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) As I said, there would be</p> <p>14 beeps and lights emitted, and lights of three colours</p> <p>15 would be shown depending on driving behaviour. And</p> <p>16 these lights would go on when the bus captain beeped the</p> <p>17 Octopus card at the terminal, the time of the next bus</p> <p>18 would be shown, and lights of three colours would be</p> <p>19 shown to represent the performance of the captain.</p> <p>20 Green is the best, yellow, and red means something to be</p> <p>21 improved. And this system is still in use.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: So when the bus captain comes off duty and he</p> <p>23 taps his Octopus card, where is this information</p> <p>24 displayed for him?</p> <p>25 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) It would only be displayed</p>
Page 74	Page 76
<p>1 2014. I cannot remember the exact time. It was quite</p> <p>2 a few years ago.</p> <p>3 MS MAGGIE WONG: Has this system been explored or discussed</p> <p>4 in one of your meetings with other depot managers or</p> <p>5 other management, or other members of the management?</p> <p>6 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) This was not covered in ROM</p> <p>7 meetings.</p> <p>8 MS MAGGIE WONG: What about meetings other than ROM?</p> <p>9 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes, a meeting was convened</p> <p>10 on this issue.</p> <p>11 MS MAGGIE WONG: In 2013 and 2014?</p> <p>12 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes, around that time.</p> <p>13 MS MAGGIE WONG: So who were present in the management?</p> <p>14 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) I would have to check which</p> <p>15 members were present, because we have many meetings with</p> <p>16 many people in attendance, I was among the attendees.</p> <p>17 For the others, quite a few have left KMB or retired</p> <p>18 already.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Were records made of this meeting?</p> <p>20 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes, I believe there are</p> <p>21 records and there might be a brief e-mail, but I'm not</p> <p>22 sure whether I still have it in my e-mail account.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: Can you look to see if you do?</p> <p>24 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Apart of e-mails, were no minutes kept of such</p>	<p>1 the first time a bus captain beeps his Octopus card in</p> <p>2 the morning. I'm not sure whether it would show the</p> <p>3 records for the previous days, but what I'm sure is that</p> <p>4 the records for the same day would not be shown. So no</p> <p>5 information is displayed during sign-off.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: Are you saying the information is displayed at</p> <p>7 the time of sign-on?</p> <p>8 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes, information is</p> <p>9 displayed during sign-on.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: And the information relates to what with time</p> <p>11 period?</p> <p>12 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) I would have to check the</p> <p>13 period concerned. But this is not same-day information.</p> <p>14 It refers to a past period, but as for the range of that</p> <p>15 period, I have no such information on hand.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: And where is the display? Where does the bus</p> <p>17 captain see this?</p> <p>18 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) At each bus terminal there</p> <p>19 would be a computer. When a captain returns to the</p> <p>20 terminal he would have to beep his staff card to obtain</p> <p>21 such information. The computer would be located outside</p> <p>22 the kiosk at each terminal facing the bus captains.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: And the computer screen depicts what?</p> <p>24 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) One of three colours would</p> <p>25 be displayed to the captain, red, amber and green.</p>

Page 77	Page 79
<p>1 CHAIRMAN: What do they signify?</p> <p>2 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) For the detailed</p> <p>3 definitions, I would have to look it up. Green means</p> <p>4 very good performance, in other words, the captain has</p> <p>5 performed very well. Amber means that there is room for</p> <p>6 improvement in terms of driving behaviour, and this is</p> <p>7 based on the reminding device on board I mentioned. And</p> <p>8 red means very poor performance.</p> <p>9 As I said, the IT department would generate a list</p> <p>10 and very likely these captains would get a red light.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: Is the colour green displayed simply because no</p> <p>12 alert was signaled in the previous driving period?</p> <p>13 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes, as far as I know.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: What triggers amber?</p> <p>15 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) I would have to look up the</p> <p>16 exact definition on what triggers amber or red. I don't</p> <p>17 have the definitions to hand now.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: Would you do so and would you provide that</p> <p>19 information?</p> <p>20 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes, it is possible.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Is the information in hard copy?</p> <p>22 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) If e-mails or minutes were</p> <p>23 available the information would be listed. So if I can</p> <p>24 locate that e-mail, I can disclose the information.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Please do so.</p>	<p>1 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) We do not reward bus</p> <p>2 captains with a green light because we would assume that</p> <p>3 good driving is expected. So, as far as I know, we are</p> <p>4 not doing any such thing.</p> <p>5 MS MAGGIE WONG: This system, does it also apply to</p> <p>6 part-time bus captains?</p> <p>7 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes, as far as I know.</p> <p>8 Because the same devices would emit light and sound as</p> <p>9 reminders if necessary.</p> <p>10 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Yeung, I'm going to the next topic. It</p> <p>11 is on the surveillance cameras.</p> <p>12 We have heard evidence from a few trade unions about</p> <p>13 assaults on bus captains, on frequent assaults on bus</p> <p>14 captains. And --</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: I think if you are moving to a new topic, given</p> <p>16 the time, we will take the adjournment now.</p> <p>17 Mr Yeung, we are going to adjourn, and we will</p> <p>18 resume our hearing at 2.30 this afternoon. Thank you.</p> <p>19 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (In English) Thank you.</p> <p>20 (1.00 pm)</p> <p>21 (The luncheon adjournment)</p> <p>22 (2.30 pm)</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: Good afternoon.</p> <p>24 Yes, Ms Wong.</p> <p>25 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. Thank you.</p>
Page 78	Page 80
<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you also take a photograph of what was</p> <p>2 displayed on the screen, the kiosk that you mentioned,</p> <p>3 about this signal?</p> <p>4 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes, it is possible.</p> <p>5 MS MAGGIE WONG: Now, what would be the consequence if that</p> <p>6 driver has a red signal.</p> <p>7 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) It is actually a reminder.</p> <p>8 As I said, if the IT department's list shows repeaters,</p> <p>9 action would be taken, for example we would call them or</p> <p>10 the TQD would follow up with them. But as for this</p> <p>11 computer display, the nature is more of a reminder than</p> <p>12 to take certain actions against a bus captain.</p> <p>13 MS MAGGIE WONG: Have you explored the idea of having that</p> <p>14 bus captain who has red signal to undertake a remedial</p> <p>15 training? Have you explored that?</p> <p>16 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes. From my computer,</p> <p>17 I cannot see the colour of the signal, because the</p> <p>18 coloured lights are reminder to the bus captains</p> <p>19 themselves.</p> <p>20 For the report set out by IT department, if there</p> <p>21 are repeaters, with a high frequency of relapse, then</p> <p>22 the TQD would provide training.</p> <p>23 MS MAGGIE WONG: What about those with green signal? Has</p> <p>24 your company considered giving a reward for those who</p> <p>25 consistently have green signal, good driving behaviour?</p>	<p>1 Mr Yeung, before the lunch break we were on the</p> <p>2 black box. May I ask a few more questions about this</p> <p>3 black box? I think you said that about the system of</p> <p>4 having -- alerting bus captains that they have certain</p> <p>5 driving, bad driving habits like harsh braking and</p> <p>6 acceleration was in place a few years ago, but you can't</p> <p>7 remember the year; is that correct?</p> <p>8 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Correct.</p> <p>9 MS MAGGIE WONG: May I just refer you to a few documents</p> <p>10 from your company's submission to see if it may assist</p> <p>11 you. KMB-1, page 168.</p> <p>12 We can see this is a submission from Kowloon Motor</p> <p>13 Bus to the Committee dated 18 May 2018. If we look at</p> <p>14 this page, it refers to what the black box will capture,</p> <p>15 including records of speeding, harsh braking, and abrupt</p> <p>16 acceleration.</p> <p>17 If we go down and see the third bullet, it mentions</p> <p>18 that:</p> <p>19 "Identification of the [bus captain] of a particular</p> <p>20 bus is done through our Terminus Management System ..."</p> <p>21 This terminus management system, are you one of the</p> <p>22 personnel involved in this terminus management system?</p> <p>23 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes, this is a system that</p> <p>24 I will use in my work.</p> <p>25 MS MAGGIE WONG: If we go back to page 148, this is an</p>

Page 81	Page 83
<p>1 action plan for implementation of the key 2 recommendations, as of 10 April 2018. This is in 3 response to the report on the Tai Po accident, dated 4 12 March 2018.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: This is a redacted version of that report? 6 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, this is the redacted version of that 7 report.</p> <p>8 If we look at page 148, paragraph 10 on the 9 right-hand side, it provides that the KMB should -- the 10 topic is, if I read that out:</p> <p>11 "KMB should monitor [bus captains'] performance by 12 analysing his driving record from the black box 13 installed on buses and improve the effectiveness and 14 timeliness of follow-up disciplinary actions on [bus 15 captains'] inappropriate driving behaviour and 16 attitude."</p> <p>17 And on the right-hand side it appears to suggest 18 there was a system because BOP 207 function in the black 19 box system, and:</p> <p>20 "This checking is done on a daily basis for the 21 driving record of the preceding 10 days. Any 22 abnormalities will be dealt with and reported promptly 23 to TQD, which will then commence disciplinary 24 procedures."</p> <p>25 So it appears this report would only be generated</p>	<p>1 CHAIRMAN: What is the excess, to determine that there is 2 speeding?</p> <p>3 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) To my understanding, there 4 should be some allowance. Because we are afraid that 5 the speeding measurement or the GPS may not be accurate 6 all the time, but as to the range, I don't have the 7 figures with me. And for me, whenever there is a record 8 generated we will verify that this is the right 9 location, then we will hand over the records to the TQD 10 for follow-up action.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: And against what do you verify the record? 12 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Say if a bus is found to be 13 speeding, then we will check the departure record of the 14 bus, maybe whether there would be an error in the TER 15 system, but then if it is a correct record proving that 16 the bus captain drives the bus, then we would look at 17 the GPS coordinates, the X/Y coordinates, because 18 sometimes there might be interference, and the exact 19 location of the bus cannot be shown.</p> <p>20 So if we identify that this is the right location, 21 and we see that, say, the speed limit doesn't match with 22 the actual speed, ie there is speeding, then we will 23 confirm that this is the location where speeding takes 24 place.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Apart from reference to GPS coordinates of</p>
Page 82	Page 84
<p>1 after 10 days, if I summarise it correctly; is that the 2 position?</p> <p>3 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) To my understanding, for our 4 IT department, we will try to reduce the number of days, 5 bring it to lower than 10 days, but I'm not sure by how 6 many, but if I remember correctly, it would be less than 7 10 days.</p> <p>8 MS MAGGIE WONG: If you look further -- 9 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on, what is BOP 207? 10 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) BOP 207 is a function within 11 BOM, and BOM stands for bus on-board management, 12 something like that. And for this function, it will 13 capture the speeding records of every bus. And if a bus 14 speeds, exceeding the speed limit of the roads, we will 15 use the BOP 207 function to retrieve the speeding 16 records.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: What is the threshold set to determine whether 18 a bus is speeding? 19 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) For every location, we would 20 identify the statutory speed limit, either it is 50km 21 per hour or 70km per hour, so that's the two standards 22 for buses. So if a bus goes through a certain area, 23 then the system through the GPS location function will 24 match this bus against the speed limit, and if there is 25 an exceedance, then that will be shown on the report.</p>	<p>1 latitude and longitude, do you have any other method of 2 determining location?</p> <p>3 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) No, to my understanding we 4 just use X/Y coordinates of the GPS, no other method.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: By that you mean latitude and longitude? 6 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) I -- well, we mainly use X 7 and Y coordinates to confirm. I'm not aware of the 8 longitude and latitude. I press the coordinate button 9 and a map will show up, and the map will show the 10 current location of the bus and then we will look at the 11 location to see whether the bus has indeed driven 12 through that area and the speed it is being driven at.</p> <p>13 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, and if we see in that box, we can see 14 a milestone as to the IT department. It is stated there 15 that:</p> <p>16 "IT [department] is in the process of enhancing the 17 presentation of the Bus Performance Reports to 18 facilitate monitoring speeding, harsh braking and abrupt 19 acceleration. After the enhancement ... Operation 20 Sections will analyse the data of preceding 8 days twice 21 a week to provide driving records of [bus captains] with 22 irregularities. The reports will be passed to TQD twice 23 a week. Immediate actions will be taken to alert 24 respective [bus captains] to deter them from committing 25 the same faults."</p>

Page 85	<p>1 This is the submission filed to the Transport 2 Department which appears to suggest -- 3 CHAIRMAN: This is an accident report, is it not? 4 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. 5 CHAIRMAN: Not a submission. 6 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, this is an accident report and this is 7 an action plan for implementation of key recommendations 8 as of 10 April 2018. It starts at page 145. 9 So Mr Yeung, according to this milestone, what is 10 improved is the generation of the report will be reduced 11 from 10 total days, correct? 12 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Answer not interpreted). 13 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on, the existing system monitors 14 speed only; is that right? 15 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) BOP 207 function only 16 monitors the speed. 17 CHAIRMAN: And the change is to monitor not only speed but 18 also harsh braking and abrupt acceleration. So that's 19 one of the changes. 20 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) For BOP 207 function, that 21 does not cover harsh braking and a sudden acceleration. 22 It only focuses on speeding. 23 CHAIRMAN: So the supposed change is to monitor not only 24 speeding, but harsh braking and abrupt acceleration. 25 That's what is stated here, is it not?</p>	Page 87	<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Yes, please do. 2 MS MAGGIE WONG: Moving on to the next topic about 3 surveillance cameras, Mr Yeung, we have heard from 4 a number of unions, and particularly KMB, that there 5 were increasing assault incidents on bus captains by 6 passengers, and one of the measures that would help the 7 police to enforce the law is to use surveillance cameras 8 to capture both audio and visual images -- audio 9 recording and visual images of what happened. 10 And we have heard some evidence that -- or at least 11 from your KMB submission, that currently, there are only 12 2,319 KMB buses, and 146 Long Win Bus buses that have 13 these surveillance cameras. Can you tell us, to your 14 knowledge, what about the remaining buses? 15 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Well, according to the 16 figures you mentioned, my knowledge is this. With the 17 procurement of new buses and replacement of old buses, 18 at the time of procurement CCTV systems are already 19 installed on new buses. So the actual figures should be 20 more than what you just quoted. 21 As for remaining buses, I understand that the 22 company plans, by the end of this year, to -- well, I'm 23 not sure about the exact figure, but to retrofit 600 to 24 700 buses with CCTVs. That's what I know about the 25 management's plan in 2018.</p>
Page 86	<p>1 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Correct. We need to 2 generate another kind of report which was mentioned 3 before lunchtime, and that speeding, acceleration and 4 braking will be reviewed. That was covered previously. 5 CHAIRMAN: So what is meant when it says that there will be 6 an enhancing of presentation of the bus performance 7 report -- presumably that's what the acronym "BOP" 8 stands for -- to facilitate monitoring, speeding, harsh 9 braking and abrupt acceleration. Are you saying that 10 already exists? 11 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) I'm not sure whether the 12 action plan on improvement has been implemented. But as 13 of today, I'm still using BOP 207 to monitor speeding, 14 and as I said, the IT report will be monitoring 15 speeding, harsh braking and abrupt acceleration. 16 I'm not sure what I'm doing now matches with the 17 action mentioned in this milestone. 18 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 19 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. About this report that you talked 20 about this morning about receiving reports about harsh 21 braking. Since when did you start to receive these 22 reports? 23 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) I started seeing such 24 a report in 2017. But I don't have the exact date now. 25 I can find it out for you if needed.</p>	Page 88	<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: And about this management's plan in 2018, 2 does that cover all buses, all KMB buses, even though 3 they are old models? 4 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Judging from the figures, 5 I don't think they are all covered. I think there will 6 still be a minority of buses to be replaced, that will 7 not have the CCTV installed. It doesn't cover all. 8 But I'm not sure whether in 2019 this will still be 9 their plan. I'm not sure. 10 MS MAGGIE WONG: We have heard some suggestions from some of 11 the union members, that they wish to install some of 12 the -- they wish to install their own surveillance 13 camera, because some of the old model buses did not have 14 surveillance camera. So they consider it as a measure 15 to protect their own safety and also the passengers' 16 behaviour, but that was a measure vetoed by the KMB. 17 And a circular was issued. Does that happen, to 18 your knowledge? 19 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) To my knowledge, yes. We 20 don't allow bus captains to install their own 21 surveillance cameras. 22 MS MAGGIE WONG: Did you issue a circular -- 23 CHAIRMAN: Why not? 24 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Let me answer Chairman's 25 question.</p>

Page 89	Page 91
<p>1 As far as I know, it has to do with some limitations 2 under the PDPO as to how this video -- 3 CHAIRMAN: What is that an acronym for? 4 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Sorry, Personal Data Privacy 5 Ordinance. Exactly which clause, I'm not sure, but from 6 what I heard, this is to protect the bus captain, 7 because previously in some cases, the KMB bus captains 8 took some video clips and posted them onto the Internet, 9 and subsequently we received complaints about invasion 10 of privacy of the other persons. 11 So, to my understanding, the bus captains would be 12 told that because of the requirements under the Personal 13 Data Privacy Ordinance bus captains are not allowed to 14 install their own cameras. That's my knowledge. 15 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 16 MS MAGGIE WONG: In your opening statement, you said that 17 you have a very important role in the sense that you are 18 the very important bridge between the frontline 19 colleagues as well as the management. 20 Did you express or voice out this bus captains' 21 concerns or requests to the management? 22 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes, I did. Well, there 23 were some bus captains who reflected that they preferred 24 not to have cameras installed on board. And I once told 25 the management that if you install many cameras on buses</p>	<p>1 themselves, and if they are not willing to cooperate we 2 would refer the matter to the TQD, but we won't disallow 3 bus captains to drive simply because they are not 4 willing to take it down. 5 CHAIRMAN: So it is a recommendation, and not a prohibition? 6 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Well, this is my role. 7 I give recommendations to frontline staff asking them 8 not to do it. As for the TQD, after the case had been 9 referred to the TQD, further action may be taken so that 10 an explanation be given to the bus captains as to the 11 pros and cons of installing their own cameras. 12 CHAIRMAN: But again, a recommendation and not 13 a prohibition? 14 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Well, that's the role 15 I play. In front of frontline staff, that's what I do. 16 I give recommendations. 17 CHAIRMAN: And TQD as you call them, do they give 18 recommendations or do they issue prohibitions? 19 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) I'm not sure. 20 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you find that out from TQD? 21 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) No problem. 22 MS MAGGIE WONG: For those frontline staff who wish to have 23 surveillance cameras installed, but didn't have one, did 24 you pass on their message to the management that those 25 who wish to have surveillance camera installed should</p>
Page 90	Page 92
<p>1 some captains would like the protection, but some 2 captains would not prefer it, because they would be put 3 to great pressure since they would be under constant 4 surveillance, and I did tell the management that. 5 MS MAGGIE WONG: About these assault incidents, we see from 6 the KMB submission that they would provide some 7 psychological support -- 8 CHAIRMAN: Before we leave this subject, Ms Wong began to 9 ask you about the issue of a circular and I interrupted 10 her. Was a circular issued telling bus captains that 11 they could not deploy their own CCTV cameras? 12 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) In my recollection -- 13 I mean, I don't have any recollection of ever seeing 14 such a circular. I don't know whether I have forgotten, 15 but I myself have not seen this circular. 16 CHAIRMAN: How was the information passed to the bus 17 captains that they were not permitted to install their 18 own CCTV cameras? 19 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Well, in fact, we understand 20 the bus captains' positions. If they wish to install 21 their own device we understand their position. Usually 22 we would very gently tell them that "If you install 23 cameras, of course you are protecting yourself but you 24 could be breaching certain laws", and I would recommend 25 that they take down the CCTV cameras they installed</p>	<p>1 have them? So they don't have -- in that sense, the bus 2 captains wouldn't have to violate the so-called Privacy 3 Data Protection Ordinance? Have you voiced that out? 4 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes, I did on various 5 occasions. I would receive feedback from bus captains 6 during formal or informal visits, bus captains would 7 tell me and I would tell the management the wishes of 8 bus captains. 9 MS MAGGIE WONG: So what is the response from the 10 management? 11 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) The response I got from the 12 management is that they would like to do it as soon as 13 possible. That is, of course, new buses would come with 14 CCTVs; as for old bus they would also be retrofitted. 15 At the time I was told that the management also 16 understood the need of bus captains. 17 MS MAGGIE WONG: We have heard from union members that 18 because of these increasing assault incidents, they 19 treat it as part of their daily lives, and your KMB 20 submission mentions assistance, psychological assistance 21 or support to be given to these staff. 22 In your view, did the bus captains make any 23 discussions as to how this condition can be improved 24 from the company's perspective? 25 Can you see from that page, I believe that's</p>

Page 93	Page 95
<p>1 page 149-113, which set out:</p> <p>2 "The taskforce will engage a professional consultant</p> <p>3 to provide a comprehensive view of the current practice</p> <p>4 and make recommendations in areas including ...</p> <p>5 recruitment on [bus captains'] emotional intelligence,</p> <p>6 and stress tolerance, training, counseling and</p> <p>7 performance management."</p> <p>8 Did you participate in this process?</p> <p>9 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) KMB engages a third party in</p> <p>10 collaboration to set up a hot line for bus captains, and</p> <p>11 it is an independently run hot line. As for</p> <p>12 paragraph 38, on page 113, I understand this is what the</p> <p>13 management is doing now.</p> <p>14 At one of the meetings I also attended, and a</p> <p>15 university in Hong Kong, was also invited to conduct</p> <p>16 a review and make recommendations to KMB. One of the</p> <p>17 meetings involved meeting the psychologists where</p> <p>18 I would tell them the plight faced by bus captains.</p> <p>19 MS MAGGIE WONG: And moving on to another topic, it is about</p> <p>20 lost trips.</p> <p>21 We have heard evidence from your colleague, Ms Debby</p> <p>22 Wong, that lost trips appear to be a frequent</p> <p>23 occurrence, and it affects driving behaviour because of</p> <p>24 the inaccurate estimation of scheduled journey time.</p> <p>25 And also it would, in turn, affect the rest time period.</p>	<p>1 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: And in Po Tin Estate, I've checked your KMB</p> <p>3 website, there are a number of routes, and one of them</p> <p>4 is 258D. It is a route from Po Tin Estate to Lam Tin.</p> <p>5 I believe the estimated journey time is about 1.5 hours;</p> <p>6 is that correct?</p> <p>7 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Roughly. Yes. That's the</p> <p>8 journey time. Roughly.</p> <p>9 MS MAGGIE WONG: And we have heard some evidence about this</p> <p>10 particular trip, 258D, that the scheduled trip does not</p> <p>11 provide sufficient rest time, three hours rest time, for</p> <p>12 bus captain on split shifts.</p> <p>13 Can we pull up the supplementary information that we</p> <p>14 received from the union yesterday.</p> <p>15 We received information about this 258D (Chinese</p> <p>16 spoken) which is split shift 5, and it specified the</p> <p>17 start time as 0650 to 1343, and another period is 1600</p> <p>18 to 2015. So the rest hours, the one in the middle, only</p> <p>19 provides 2 hours and 15 minutes, and not the three hours</p> <p>20 rest time.</p> <p>21 And this appears to be a schedule devised by the</p> <p>22 company, KMB.</p> <p>23 What is your answer to this?</p> <p>24 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) I don't have the schedule</p> <p>25 with me now. I was involved in formulating the</p>
Page 94	Page 96
<p>1 What is your view on this matter?</p> <p>2 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) From my perspective, lost</p> <p>3 trip is due to various reasons.</p> <p>4 First, we may lose a trip because of shortage of bus</p> <p>5 captains, there may be traffic jam in Hong Kong, there</p> <p>6 may be emergency situations, public events,</p> <p>7 demonstrations, rallies, or special traffic</p> <p>8 arrangements, inclement weather, and vehicles breaking</p> <p>9 down on the road. All these contribute to the problem</p> <p>10 of lost trips. But we try our best not to affect the</p> <p>11 rest periods of bus captains, because we have a schedule</p> <p>12 of journey time, we have provided that to the bus</p> <p>13 captains, and about 96 per cent of these, or 90 per cent</p> <p>14 of these trips allow bus captains to have sufficient</p> <p>15 rest periods.</p> <p>16 As for 90 per cent, well, it varies. But on the</p> <p>17 whole, of 10 trips, bus captains could have sufficient</p> <p>18 time for operating the bus for nine trips with</p> <p>19 sufficient rest time. As for the remaining one trip, it</p> <p>20 may be due to the reasons I mentioned.</p> <p>21 But we would not deliberately shorten the journey</p> <p>22 time to make up for the lost trips.</p> <p>23 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you quote an example? And you</p> <p>24 mentioned in the morning about the Po Tin Estate having</p> <p>25 split shifts; do you recall?</p>	<p>1 timetable here. If my memory serves me right, for the</p> <p>2 first section, the end time should be 12.43 and not</p> <p>3 13.43. We have a meal break, we give our pay -- the pay</p> <p>4 for the meal break for the bus captain. So on a normal</p> <p>5 day without congestion, the bus captain should be able</p> <p>6 to take a rest, starting 12.43, and then he will ask to</p> <p>7 drive again at 4 pm.</p> <p>8 So it would be longer than the guideline of the TD,</p> <p>9 which will take effect in 2019.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: Are you able to confirm that this is a mistake,</p> <p>11 1343, that in fact the break starts at 1243, by</p> <p>12 reference to records?</p> <p>13 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes, I can.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: Please provide that information.</p> <p>15 MS MAGGIE WONG: Moving on to another topic.</p> <p>16 One of the union members expressed that you can</p> <p>17 actually calculate the journey time by using black box</p> <p>18 data, rather than having someone who drove the route and</p> <p>19 without the actual scientific data.</p> <p>20 And one of the suggestions is to get information on</p> <p>21 peak or non-peak hours and then factor in the congestion</p> <p>22 situation, then come up with a journey time estimate</p> <p>23 which is a more scientific approach.</p> <p>24 What is your view on this?</p> <p>25 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Well, we are already doing</p>

Page 97	Page 99
<p>1 that. We have a scheduling section which is responsible</p> <p>2 for reviewing all timetables and bus captains' duties.</p> <p>3 So this department is responsible for that. My role is</p> <p>4 to provide input to them.</p> <p>5 Now, if I receive any feedback I would tell this</p> <p>6 section, say, bus captains would tell us that there is</p> <p>7 not enough journey time, and on and off, they will use</p> <p>8 a system to review the journey time. Maybe we can use</p> <p>9 a bus to do the actual trial of the route. We don't do</p> <p>10 that frequently. We will do that when a new route is</p> <p>11 being put in operation. We don't have any historical</p> <p>12 data, so we will ask a bus to conduct a trial and then</p> <p>13 simulate the journey time.</p> <p>14 And then when sufficient data are gathered for</p> <p>15 a route then the scheduling section will use two ways to</p> <p>16 review the journey time. One, is the departure and</p> <p>17 arrival time of the bus captains, which is recorded in</p> <p>18 the TER mentioned before, that whenever a bus captain</p> <p>19 arrives at the terminus at the regulator's room he will</p> <p>20 tap the staff card and his arrival time will be</p> <p>21 recorded, and of course the regulator will also input</p> <p>22 the departure time from that bus terminus. So, having</p> <p>23 the departure and arrival time, we will know the exact</p> <p>24 journey time.</p> <p>25 The other method is using the GPS location function.</p>	<p>1 timetable, we don't need to apply from the TD.</p> <p>2 So if the schedule is a frequency of 10 minutes, and</p> <p>3 then we have to increase the journey time, maybe we use</p> <p>4 different methods, for example redeploying buses to run</p> <p>5 this route or maybe we can add in a new bus, and based</p> <p>6 on the actual situation we will see whether that can be</p> <p>7 done.</p> <p>8 So if, say, if that can be done, if there is talking</p> <p>9 about drastic changes in journey time, and we can't cope</p> <p>10 with it with our own existing resources maybe we have to</p> <p>11 adjust the frequency then.</p> <p>12 So if we have to adjust the frequency then we will</p> <p>13 have to apply to the TD for doing so, and we need the</p> <p>14 TD's approval before we can adjust the frequency.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>16 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you.</p> <p>17 Going to another topic, we heard this morning from</p> <p>18 your colleague Ms Debby Wong about having a focus group</p> <p>19 to discuss some of the roads that may pose a dangerous</p> <p>20 risk to bus captains or to passengers. So, as far as</p> <p>21 Tuen Mun is concerned, do you have similar focus group</p> <p>22 where you would discuss with bus captains about certain</p> <p>23 road conditions that bus drivers have to pay more</p> <p>24 attention or sharp bends, or -- along that line?</p> <p>25 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes. Yes, we do that.</p>
Page 98	Page 100
<p>1 These two methods are valid, we believe, because</p> <p>2 they can reflect when actually the bus will arrive at</p> <p>3 the terminus.</p> <p>4 So when will we review the journey time? Let me</p> <p>5 cite an example. Po Tin is a very good example. We</p> <p>6 talked about 258D. The other route is 260X, from Po Tin</p> <p>7 to Hung Hom railway station. And it will go through</p> <p>8 a very congested area, where the XRL is being built near</p> <p>9 Jordan, and because of the construction of the XRL there</p> <p>10 is major diversion of traffic there, and when the</p> <p>11 construction work started then the journey time for 260X</p> <p>12 was very insufficient. So in that kind of scenario, we</p> <p>13 will review the journey time and we lengthen the journey</p> <p>14 time substantially as a result.</p> <p>15 And up to now, there is now an underpass built</p> <p>16 already, so Jordan is not so congested and we found that</p> <p>17 this journey time is excessive now, so much so that</p> <p>18 there are not enough parking spaces at the terminus for</p> <p>19 buses because they arrive too early. Also then we will</p> <p>20 review the journey time based on the actual situation.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: And you do this by seeking the approval of the</p> <p>22 Transport Department to alter the journey time; is that</p> <p>23 it? The schedule.</p> <p>24 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Well, if we don't -- if we</p> <p>25 don't have to alter the frequency, if we revise the</p>	<p>1 We have some examples of that.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you provide us with some of the</p> <p>3 examples?</p> <p>4 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Say, we resort to two</p> <p>5 channels to solicit information on hazards. First is</p> <p>6 from the bus captains themselves, because they have</p> <p>7 first hand experience on potentially dangerous areas.</p> <p>8 For example in July and August there may be heavy</p> <p>9 downpour, and on some road sections maybe pot holes will</p> <p>10 appear because of the downpour. Private cars may not</p> <p>11 encounter problems, but it will be a bumpy ride for the</p> <p>12 buses, and as a result maybe the passengers will lose</p> <p>13 balance, and if bus captains tell us so, we will notify</p> <p>14 the relevant department in the first instance, and if we</p> <p>15 find that the problem is really serious we will tell the</p> <p>16 regulator who should then tell all the bus captains who</p> <p>17 will drive along that route maybe they should slow down,</p> <p>18 or they should try to divert, or what. So this is the</p> <p>19 first way that we collect information.</p> <p>20 Second way, say, in during the rainy season, our</p> <p>21 field staff will inspect regularly the road conditions.</p> <p>22 In Tuen Mun and Yuen Long there would be a number of</p> <p>23 rural routes, and trees, after heavy downpour they may</p> <p>24 tilt, and it may be dangerous. So the trees may crash</p> <p>25 into the glass windows of the buses, and if the problem</p>

Page 101	Page 103
<p>1 is identified to be serious we will notify the police</p> <p>2 and we will seek the Fire Services people to cut the</p> <p>3 trees or we will approach the TD to prune the trees, if</p> <p>4 the problem is not serious.</p> <p>5 MS MAGGIE WONG: You mentioned few staff will inspect</p> <p>6 regularly. How regular?</p> <p>7 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) In Tuen Mun depot we have</p> <p>8 a list of black spots where there will be a lot of trees</p> <p>9 actually branching out into the carriageway, so the</p> <p>10 field staff will do that, especially during the rainy</p> <p>11 season.</p> <p>12 So the field staff will inspect all the black spots</p> <p>13 in the area once a month, and if the rain fall is really</p> <p>14 heavy, we will ask them to step up the frequency of</p> <p>15 inspections. Say, if a period is a sunshine period</p> <p>16 there might not be much of a problem with the trees,</p> <p>17 then they will really inspect the road condition.</p> <p>18 Their duty is to continuously observe and raise</p> <p>19 safety concerns and report the same to us.</p> <p>20 MS MAGGIE WONG: And the last topic is, we have been</p> <p>21 informed recently by the Transport Department that they</p> <p>22 have issued a practice note in relation to the training</p> <p>23 of bus captains. Have you seen a copy of this practice</p> <p>24 note?</p> <p>25 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) I don't know which one you</p>	<p>1 instruction from the management. If need be, we won't</p> <p>2 allow the bus captain to complete the course. Only when</p> <p>3 the bus captain himself is confident or the mentor is</p> <p>4 confident, then we will allow him to complete the</p> <p>5 course. That means originally he may be required to</p> <p>6 train a number of days, but if there is no confidence we</p> <p>7 would extend the training before we allow the bus</p> <p>8 captain to graduate.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>10 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you.</p> <p>11 Mr Chairman, I have finished my questioning.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>13 Mr Yeung, thank you for coming here to assist us by</p> <p>14 giving your evidence. That is now complete, and you are</p> <p>15 free to leave, but equally you are free to stay. We</p> <p>16 have other people to give evidence. Thank you.</p> <p>17 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (In English) Thank you.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: We will take a short break while Mr Yeung leaves</p> <p>19 the desk. Two minutes.</p> <p>20 (3.16 pm)</p> <p>21 (A short break)</p> <p>22 (3.21 pm)</p> <p>23 FORMER EMPLOYEE OF KOWLOON MOTOR BUS COMPANY (1933) LIMITED:</p> <p>24 MR RAYMOND CHENG</p> <p>25 (Evidence given in Cantonese and English, transcription of</p>
Page 102	Page 104
<p>1 are referring to. Can you refer me to exactly which one</p> <p>2 you are talking about.</p> <p>3 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, if I may refer you to TD-1 page 403.</p> <p>4 If we go to paragraph 18 -- paragraphs 18 and 19</p> <p>5 make reference to the practice note.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: If this helps you at all, this was something that</p> <p>7 was issued apparently in the last 10 days or so.</p> <p>8 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Well, we have enhanced our</p> <p>9 training several months ago. I don't know whether the</p> <p>10 paper talks about is what I know of.</p> <p>11 MS MAGGIE WONG: In what way did you enhance some training?</p> <p>12 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Well, there are two phases</p> <p>13 of training, phase 1 and phase 2. And for phase 1, if</p> <p>14 the bus captains have only class 1 and class 2 private</p> <p>15 car licences then they will have to go through phase 1</p> <p>16 training. They have to pass the TD's bus exam and</p> <p>17 that's phase 1. After they pass the TD test --</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: Did you enhance phase 1 in the last several</p> <p>19 months? Can you answer that "yes" or "no".</p> <p>20 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) I don't see an enhancement</p> <p>21 for phase 1.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: Did you enhance phase 2?</p> <p>23 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: How did you enhance it?</p> <p>25 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) If need be -- that's the</p>	<p>1 the simultaneous interpretation and/or English)</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: Mr Cheng.</p> <p>3 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: Thank you for responding affirmatively to our</p> <p>5 invitation to give evidence, and thank you for waiting</p> <p>6 patiently all day whilst the other evidence was adduced,</p> <p>7 but now we come to you.</p> <p>8 You will have seen the method by which we adduce</p> <p>9 evidence. I'm going to ask Ms Wong to start asking you</p> <p>10 questions.</p> <p>11 Yes, Ms Wong.</p> <p>12 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (In English) Yes, Chairman, corporate</p> <p>13 members, you are all welcome. It is my pleasure to</p> <p>14 attend this hearing. But first of all, before the Q&A,</p> <p>15 I want to declare the interest. May I use Chinese?</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: Of course you may.</p> <p>17 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (Interpreted) In relation to the bus</p> <p>18 accident occurred on 10 February, I have no relationship</p> <p>19 or affiliation with any persons injured or died in the</p> <p>20 bus accident.</p> <p>21 In relation to the KMB directors, or the management,</p> <p>22 I have no affiliation or no relationship with them.</p> <p>23 Before 2015, I had a working relationship with the</p> <p>24 managing director and the board of directors of KMB.</p> <p>25 EXAMINATION BY MS WONG</p>

Page 105	Page 107
<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you, Mr Cheng, for coming. 2 And Mr Cheng, you were the senior manager in safety 3 and quality department -- 4 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (In English) Yes. 5 MS MAGGIE WONG: -- for the period of 1 May 2010 and you 6 retired on 12 September 2014? 7 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (In English) Correct. 8 MS MAGGIE WONG: At that time, Mr Edmond Ho was the KMB 9 managing director? 10 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (In English) Yes. 11 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Gary Wong was your supervisor at that 12 time. 13 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (In English) Yes. 14 MS MAGGIE WONG: I'm going to focus on a few areas. The 15 first is the identification of 29 sharp bends for 16 internal analysis that you have explained and produced 17 documentation in your submission to the committee. 18 If I may invite to you look at FE bundle, page 96-4 19 to 96-6. 20 On this page, 96-4, if we go down the section "Buses 21 can overturn easily", the second paragraph, it referred 22 to you starting a study of safe driving in the sharp 23 turns back in 2013. And: 24 "The Safety and Quality Service Department invited 25 the 4 depot managers, the representatives from Bus</p>	<p>1 increase. 2 And next point, we also took into account the actual 3 situation at the sharp turns, and then we conducted an 4 assessment on over 1,000 sharp turns from all the data 5 collected in Hong Kong, Kowloon, New Territories, and we 6 narrowed them down to 29 sharp turns. 7 And we also used actual buses to ply these routes 8 and you can see we also made use of cameras on board to 9 record the situation of these buses manoeuvring the 29 10 sharp turns. 11 We conducted tests on all these 29 turns at 12 different speeds, 20, 30, 40, 45, 50 kilometres, and we 13 repeated the test a number of times. 14 We also made use of the black box you mentioned. It 15 is BOM, the acronym. That is bus-on-board monitoring 16 system to calculate the safe speed that buses should use 17 in manoeuvring the turns without affecting traffic flow. 18 We then put forward a recommendation to the senior 19 manager. 20 I would like to pause here. 21 Any further question from you? 22 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you, Mr Cheng. 23 May I ask who initiated this study? 24 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (Interpreted) Back then, the managing 25 director, Mr Edmond Ho instructed my then supervisor</p>
<p>Page 106</p> <p>1 Captain Training School and Bus Maintenance Section of 2 Service Department to form a study group looking deeply 3 into all the sharp turns within [KMB] bus route network. 4 Can you tell us who the four depot managers were at 5 the time? 6 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (Interpreted) Those four managers were 7 respectively from Tuen Mun, Lai Chi Kok, Sha Tin -- and 8 Lai Chi Kok, Sha Tin, Tuen Mun and Sha Tin depot 9 managers. For these four depot managers, we formed 10 a taskforce, and apart from these four depot managers, 11 there were also representatives from bus captain 12 training school. And the representative was in the rank 13 of assistant manager, Richard Lee, and he was the school 14 principal of the training school, and we also had 15 representatives from the bus maintenance section, who 16 was an engineer, and had already left the post, and he 17 is called Henry So, and this study group looked into all 18 the sharp turns involved in the bus routes in Kowloon 19 and New Territories in particular proposed by the depot 20 managers. 21 As for the study method, the criteria, first of all, 22 were, a reduction of speed limit from 70 to 50; number 23 2, the curvature; and number 3, number of passengers for 24 these bus routes, plying the sharp turns, because if 25 these buses are usually fully loaded, the weight would</p>	<p>Page 108</p> <p>1 Mr Gary Wong, and then Mr Gary Wong talked to me and my 2 team members. 3 CHAIRMAN: What position did Gary Wong hold? 4 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (Interpreted) Head of SSQ. 5 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 6 MS MAGGIE WONG: Did you have meetings with the colleagues 7 you mentioned earlier on from time to time in relation 8 to this study? 9 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (Interpreted) Yes. 10 MS MAGGIE WONG: When was that? 11 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (Interpreted) Around end of 2013 and 12 early 2014. 13 MS MAGGIE WONG: Were there minutes of these meetings? 14 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (Interpreted) I believe there were. 15 There might not be formal minutes, but there may be 16 exchanges of e-mail, like what Mr Yeung said. We would 17 try to confirm everything through e-mails. Because we 18 had to put in a lot of arrangements later on, maybe we 19 needed a bus captain to drive the route, we needed to 20 arrange for engineers, and the instructors of training 21 school to fix the dates to do all these. 22 My e-mail account was closed so I couldn't retrieve 23 any information, but for other colleagues who were 24 involved in the work, they might be able to retrieve the 25 relevant e-mails.</p>

Page 109	Page 111
<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Cheng, do you know of any persons who 2 are currently working in KMB but were involved in this 3 study that we can ask?</p> <p>4 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (Interpreted) Well, it has been four 5 years on. To my understanding, most of the colleagues 6 left.</p> <p>7 MS MAGGIE WONG: About this video cam of those 29 sharp 8 bends you mentioned?</p> <p>9 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (Interpreted) Before I retired, after 10 I finished with the project, I handed the footage in 11 person to the principal of the bus captain training 12 school, Mr Richard Lee. As to the whereabouts of the 13 footage, I don't know.</p> <p>14 MS MAGGIE WONG: Who took the footage of these 29 sharp 15 bends? Or who drove the car so that the video cam could 16 record these images?</p> <p>17 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (Interpreted) The car cam, who hand-held 18 the camera? It was fixed on the front part, the front, 19 or the handrail of the front seat in the upper deck, so 20 it did not need to be hand-held, all we needed to was to 21 turn it on, or turn it off. So this was done by myself. 22 As to the question of who stored the footage, it was 23 I who stored the footage. And then I handed the footage 24 to my then supervisor, Mr Gary Wong. We should first 25 take a look at the footage to make sure it is done in</p>	<p>1 undertaken in short-listing those 29 sharp bends?</p> <p>2 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>3 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you recall what those 29 sharp bends 4 were? Are you able to still remember?</p> <p>5 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (Interpreted) It has been five years on. 6 I forgot the majority of them. 7 I do remember individually some of them. 8 The four quoted in my paper were the ones 9 I remember. As I said, for the 29 sharp bends, they are 10 mostly in the rural areas. In urban areas there are so 11 many traffic lights and there is congestion, and bus 12 captains usually do not speed. But in rural areas when 13 bus captains ply through highways, they may speed, or 14 they may display incorrect driving behaviour, especially 15 when we talk about going down from highway to the 16 downtown area. 17 Well, for the four examples that I cited, it is 18 about a highway having a speed of 70km, and then 19 suddenly they have to reduce the speed to 50km in order 20 to go into the downtown area. So that's where the 21 danger lies. 22 For the 29 sharp bends, sorry, I don't have records 23 on hand what these bends are. 24 So I try to recollect what these are so I can 25 remember only four.</p>
Page 110	Page 112
<p>1 the correct way. 2 And we took many footages. And the footage was 3 handed to the principal of the bus captain training 4 school who edited the video, and then he handed back the 5 footage to us. Well, some of the footage was useful, 6 others not. And after the editing we handed the footage 7 to the training school which stored it. 8 On one or two occasions, Mr Gary Wong showed it to 9 the then MD, Mr Edmond Ho for viewing. That was just 10 for viewing. We didn't study in depth as to say whether 11 a particular speed was right or not. We didn't discuss 12 this at the occasions I mentioned.</p> <p>13 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. Mr Cheng, in your paper at page 96-6 14 you stated that at the bottom that: 15 "From the study, we were able to produce a safety 16 booklet for ..." 17 I think you later clarified it as small reminding 18 cards: 19 "... for Bus Captains detailing each potentially 20 dangerous turns' exact location, direction, and road 21 nature, road condition, past record, related photos or 22 diagrams from Transport Department's document or 23 passenger complaints. There were 31 safety driving 24 suggestions from a study of over 1,500 studies." 25 Are those 1,500 studies the test that you have</p>	<p>1 But I do remember the number is 29 in total. The 2 sharp bends.</p> <p>3 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you, Mr Cheng. 4 In your paper you stated this study followed on from 5 the Tseung Kwan O bus accident in 2009. May I refer you 6 to a LegCo paper that mentions -- 7 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on, if we are leaving the four 8 areas that Mr Cheng remembers, can you describe to us 9 what these four areas are, the four places that you do 10 remember?</p> <p>11 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (Interpreted) Yes, I can. Say, for 12 example, from Kwun Tong Road near the Choi Hung PTI, 13 there are two highways with four lanes, and then all of 14 a sudden there are just two lanes going to To Kwa Wan, 15 and two lanes going to Sai Kung, and the curvature is 16 around 230 degrees. And if a bus goes at 70km in Kwun 17 Tong Road, and it has to go uphill through a ramp, and 18 the ramp has a curvature of 230 degrees, and it has to 19 make a certain turn to go to the Choi Hung roundabout, 20 and then it can choose to go to either San Po Kong or 21 Sai Kung. 22 But then this bend is only one lane, and there are 23 no trees, this is an elevated highway. But then 24 sometimes obstacles were left behind by lorries, and 25 there were oil stains left over by motorbikes and cars,</p>

Page 113	Page 115
<p>1 and there is this film of oil which would lead to 2 skidding. If you drive at 50km and the way ahead is 3 smooth, if you use 50km you would not be able to 4 negotiate the 230 degrees bend, because the road surface 5 may be slippery, and the curvature is so big, and 6 especially for double-deckers, it comes with a loading, 7 and if there is acceleration, and then if you go to the 8 apex of the bend, there will be a G force created. 9 The heavier the bus, the faster the bus, the greater 10 is the G force, and as a result, the chances of a bus 11 overturning will also increase. 12 CHAIRMAN: Is this an example of where a road, or a vehicle 13 on a road is moving from a 70 kilometre an hour limit to 14 a 50 kilometre an hour limit? 15 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (In English) Yes. 16 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 17 That's one of them. What are the others? 18 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (Interpreted) To my recollection it is Ma 19 On Shan, from the Tate's Cairn Tunnel going in the 20 direction of Ma Liu Shui, and if you pass through Ma On 21 Shan around the housing estate Kam Ying Court, there is 22 a left turn bend and the curvature of that bend is above 23 180 degrees, and again it is from 70km switching to 24 50km, turning left down to the Ma On Shan town centre. 25 This bend is similar to the one that I mentioned</p>	<p>1 Ma On Shan. Number 4, Kwun Tong Road westbound, and 2 then turning to Clear Water Bay Road. I explained the 3 last one. 4 Let me first explain the one about Kwong Ming Road 5 in Tseung Kwan O. 6 In 2009, November, there was a bus accident 7 involving two fatalities and numerous injuries. 8 The MD then already gave me a mission when I took 9 office that I should look into this roundabout to see 10 whether there was room for improvement. So after 11 I assumed office, I visited the roundabout in Kwong Ming 12 Road in Tseung Kwan O to inspect the site, and there was 13 a highway that went to the roundabout with a left turn 14 to Kwong Ming Road/Kwong Ming Estate, I don't actually 15 remember the name. But the curvature of the bend, it 16 is -- I mean, it is a roundabout, so it is 360 degrees. 17 If you go the wrong way, you can just follow the 18 roundabout for another round to choose the exit you 19 want. 20 So for Kwong Ming Road, say if you are travelling at 21 50 kilometres, or below 50, there is not much problem. 22 But when it is raining, or at night, when the sight line 23 is poor, then you shouldn't exit the roundabout at 24 50 kilometres, which is the speed limit, because it 25 would be prone to accident.</p>
Page 114	Page 116
<p>1 from Kwun Tong Road to Choi Hung Road. From Kwun Tong 2 Road to Choi Hung Road the bend is turning right, and 3 then there is a sharp bend of 230 degrees down to the 4 Choi Hung roundabout, and for Ma On Shan, from the 5 Tate's Cairn Tunnel Highway to Ma On Shan is a left 6 turn: the curvature and the carriageway, they were 7 similar to the previous example. 8 And there is also the noise barrier, and the view of 9 the bus captain was not that good compared to the 10 previous example. In other words, the view was worse 11 here in this latter example. 12 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 13 MS MAGGIE WONG: That's the second example. Can you provide 14 the remaining two that you can recall? 15 CHAIRMAN: I think all you need to do is tell us where the 16 place is and what the curvature was, if that is the 17 relevant fact. 18 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (Interpreted) For the curvature -- 19 CHAIRMAN: What is the place, first of all? 20 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (In English) Okay. 21 (Interpreted) The first one is Tseung Kwan O/Kwong 22 Ming Road roundabout. The second one is Cha Kwo Ling 23 Road northbound, left turn to Lei Yue Mun Road 24 westbound. The third one, as I described, Tate's Cairn 25 Tunnel Highway northbound down to Shek Mun, and then to</p>	<p>1 The other one is Cha Kwo Ling Road northbound, left 2 turn to westbound of Lei Yue Mun Road. This is in Kwun 3 Tong, off the Kwun Tong post office, there is a bend. 4 Again, there is a highway, one takes a left turn 5 downhill to Kwun Tong and the speed limit also drops 6 from 70 to 50 kilometres. 7 This carries the same characteristic. It is single 8 lane traffic, and as I explained just now, if you travel 9 at 50, you could be speeding. Although the Transport 10 Department provides signage reminding drivers that there 11 is a bend ahead, sometimes drivers may not be very 12 attentive all the way. But we have professional 13 drivers, but in the lapse of moment, the driver may 14 forget, or that he may be pressing the gas pedal in 15 a way that he can exceed 50 kilometres and then at that 16 junction it would be dangerous. 17 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 18 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Cheng, I would like to invite you to 19 look at a document following on the accident. It was 20 a LegCo paper -- 21 CHAIRMAN: Which accident? 22 MS MAGGIE WONG: The accident, the traffic accident on Tuen 23 Mun Road in 2012. 24 This LegCo paper can be found at page 260-443-20. 25 CHAIRMAN: Of which bundle?</p>

Page 117	Page 119
<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: Of TU bundle. 2 CHAIRMAN: Which number? 3 MS MAGGIE WONG: TU-1B. 4 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 5 MS MAGGIE WONG: 260-443-20. 6 It is a LegCo paper for the special meeting on 7 27 November 2012. It is stated as "Background brief on 8 safety of franchised bus operation and safety of long 9 downhill roads". 10 If you go to paragraph 6, it made reference to the 11 fatal traffic accident on New Hiram's Highway in 12 May 2008 resulting in a total of 18 fatalities and 44 13 injuries. 14 And drop a few lines, we see that: 15 " ... [Transport Department] had also conducted 16 a territory-wide review of long steep downhill roads and 17 had identified a total of 29 downhill road sections in 18 the territory." 19 The list can be found in appendix 1, which is also 20 in this bundle at page 260-443-29. 21 Mr Cheng, would you mind taking a look at these 29 22 sections or locations and see whether the four locations 23 you mentioned can be found in this list? 24 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (Interpreted) On the first page, that's 25 29, these road sections are in Hong Kong Island, and</p>	<p>1 I would report back to the then supervisor, Mr Gary 2 Wong. 3 Therefore, in identifying the 29 sharp turns, 4 I provided a lot of comments which were accepted. 5 MS MAGGIE WONG: If I may invite you to look at page 96-6 of 6 the FE bundle, your submission, in that paragraph you 7 stated you made 31 safety driving instructions, 8 suggestions from that study. 9 Do you recall what those safety driving suggestions 10 were, or what it related to? 11 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (Interpreted) Most of these suggestions 12 related to driving demeanour. Some of them related to 13 driving speed. 14 CHAIRMAN: What do you mean by "driving demeanour"? 15 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (Interpreted) For driving demeanour 16 I mean whether the bus captain would be very attentive 17 in driving, or whether all of a sudden he would 18 accelerate or brake abruptly, or make a sharp turn 19 abruptly as mentioned by the previous witnesses. 20 Because if the driver makes a sharp turn all of 21 a sudden, it may affect the centre of gravity of the 22 bus. Let me give you one example. 23 When negotiating a bend of 30 degrees, if the driver 24 manoeuvres the bend, normally it may take one second or 25 one to five seconds. However, if the driver drives at</p>
Page 118	Page 120
<p>1 then for 330, number 15, Clear Water Bay Road, Ngau Chi 2 Wan in Kowloon. That's the one that I personally 3 checked. But it is not the same as the one I studied. 4 Because one is upstream, the other is downstream, and 5 for New Territories, none. I can find none. 6 But I want to supplement. In 2008, I hadn't assumed 7 office as senior manager of SSQ. 8 MS MAGGIE WONG: I understand, Mr Cheng. 9 So the exercise you conducted is a valuable one? 10 Because you have undertaken a detailed task of looking 11 at how many roads -- how many roads have you looked at 12 in terms of New Territories? 13 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (Interpreted) A lot. But I can't tell 14 you how many now, because my responsibility relates to 15 safety and driving, and I would get on board a bus for 16 inspection at least once a month. 17 I mean, I would be in plain clothes, without any 18 advance notice, I would board a bus of my company. From 19 the very beginning, like I said, in rural areas, very 20 often drivers would neglect safety, so I would say it is 21 very frequent, at least once or twice a month I would 22 take these buses from Yuen Long, I would take 968 to Tin 23 Hau, and then in Tin Hau I would take another bus back 24 to Tuen Mun. It is a working trip. And I would record 25 details relating to the dangerous road sections, and</p>	<p>1 speed such that the bend of 30 degrees is manoeuvred 2 with just 0.1 seconds, then the bus would slide. 3 I don't know what it is called in Chinese, but it is 4 some kind of drifting of the tail of the bus, such that 5 passengers seated or even standing passengers would tend 6 to fall. 7 Do you get my meaning? That is to manoeuvre a bend 8 with 0.1 seconds, it is very different from manoeuvring 9 a bend in 1 second. That's about driving demeanour. 10 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 11 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (In English) Welcome. 12 MS MAGGIE WONG: When talked about some of them related 13 to driving speed, when you made that suggestion, did you 14 recommend to the bus captains for some of the sections 15 of the road that have 70km per hour, the driver should 16 drive below the speed limit permitted for that road 17 section? Did you suggest that in that handbook? 18 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (Interpreted) First of all, buses have 19 now been equipped with a device limiting the speed at 20 70. Even if he floors the pedal, when the bus reaches 21 70 kilometres it won't go faster. 22 However, if the bus is going downhill or perhaps -- 23 well, coming back to driving demeanour, the bus could go 24 beyond 70 kilometres if he uses the neutral gear. And 25 my answer is, no, because my answer is about safety</p>

Page 121	Page 123
<p>1 driving, and the driver must not exceed the speed limit. 2 So if he drives below 70 or 68 kilometres, I would 3 appreciate that, but we also need to consider sight line 4 and driving demeanour. Maybe the driver is in a bad 5 mood, or he may have something on his mind, and then he 6 drives at 25 kilometres, then I won't recommend it. 7 MS MAGGIE WONG: And page 96-7, you mentioned small 8 reminding cards printed and readily available to be 9 issued to all bus captains -- all concerned routes' bus 10 captains. 11 Did you participate in drafting the small reminding 12 cards? 13 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (Interpreted) No, but I can supplement 14 Mr Yeung said that the cards were printed in 15 2013/2014. That's not correct. The card's dimension is 16 2 inches by 3-inches and they give a summary of the 17 locations of the 29 sharp bends, the direction, the safe 18 driving speed, and all these are in the card. But 19 unfortunately, the cards were printed after I retired. 20 And I knew from Mr Gary Wong, my then supervisor -- 21 CHAIRMAN: Just tell us what you know yourself, not what 22 others have told you that happened. Do you understand 23 the difference? 24 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (Interpreted) I got it. 25 CHAIRMAN: So did you ever see any printed cards?</p>	<p>1 evidence to receive, so we will take another short 2 adjournment and then I think we are ready to receive the 3 representatives of the Federation of Bus Industries. 4 So we will take a short break. Thank you. 5 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (In English) Thank you. 6 (4.05 pm) 7 (A short break) 8 (4.16 pm) 9 REPRESENTATIVES OF THE FEDERATION OF BUS INDUSTRY TRADE 10 UNIONS: MR LEUNG KAM KEUNG, MR CHUNG CHUNG FAI, MR LAM KAM 11 PIU, MR LAU KAI HIM, MR HUI HON KIT, MR KWOK WAI KWONG 12 (Evidence given in Cantonese; transcription of the 13 simultaneous interpretation) (continued) 14 CHAIRMAN: Gentlemen, good afternoon, apologies for the 15 delay in reaching you. As you will have seen, we have 16 been taking evidence from others but we are now ready to 17 resume with your evidence. 18 Ms Wong. 19 EXAMINATION BY MS WONG (continued) 20 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you so much, gentlemen, for coming. 21 Yesterday, I have asked some questions about the 22 resting facilities in relation to your submission dated 23 16 July, annex 7, in relation to Lai Kok Estate. 24 I understand that Mr Lau has dug up further information 25 about the progress of this Lai Kok Estate and would like</p>
Page 122	Page 124
<p>1 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) No, no. 2 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 3 MS MAGGIE WONG: And if I may go over to page 96-6. 4 In answer to question 7, you stated there that: 5 "I was very disappointed upon hearing that SSQ 6 study" -- 7 CHAIRMAN: Ms Wong, I only want evidence to be led of what 8 this witness knows personally. 9 MS MAGGIE WONG: Then I won't pursue this. 10 Mr Cheng, do you know a person by the name of Alok 11 Jain? 12 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (Interpreted) Yes. 13 MS MAGGIE WONG: In your study, in relation to this 29 14 covered turns, did you have a chance to work with 15 Mr Jain? 16 MR KELVIN YEUNG: (Interpreted) No. 17 MS MAGGIE WONG: During the time when you were working with 18 KMB, did you have a chance to work with Mr Alok Jain in 19 relation to the safety aspects of franchised buses? 20 MR RAYMOND CHENG: (Interpreted) No. 21 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Chairman, I've finished my questioning. 22 CHAIRMAN: Mr Cheng, thank you very much for coming to 23 assist us, for agreeing to give evidence, and giving us 24 the evidence you have. We are grateful. 25 Your evidence is concluded, and we have more</p>	<p>1 to supplement on this. 2 CHAIRMAN: Yes. 3 MR LAU KAI HIM: Thank you, Chairman. 4 Regarding the locations in annex 7, take Lai Kok as 5 an example as mentioned by Madam Wong, the resting 6 lounge has been installed. 7 I want to supplement that regarding resting 8 facilities, KMB has been more proactive than other bus 9 companies. At other locations KMB has striven to 10 install resting facilities and it is not only Lai Kok, 11 but Tsing Yi Pier, Kowloon City Pier, and also another 12 bus terminus in Cheung Wang, so you can see that KMB is 13 more proactive than Citybus and New World First Bus, 14 because for the other franchised bus companies, take 15 Quarry Bay as an example, over the years they have 16 failed to install the resting lounge. 17 This may be due to various reasons, but I can say, 18 on the whole, KMB is more proactive. 19 Of course, the facilities, or the size of the lounge 20 may not be perfect, but at least they are providing 21 resting facilities for use by staff of KMB. 22 I would also like to supplement that there is one 23 resting lounge that may be demolished soon, that is TST 24 terminus. We received a paper from the Harbourfront 25 Commission suggested that the bus terminus at Tsim Sha</p>

Page 125	Page 127
<p>1 Tsui ferry pier would be demolished. But this terminus 2 involves a lot of bus routes. The Harbourfront 3 Commission already discussed the topic and we also wrote 4 to Transport Department requesting the department to 5 explain a number of things: after demolition where will 6 the bus routes be accommodated and also, after taking 7 down the bus terminus, there would be no resting 8 facility for KMB drivers. And it is also very crowded, 9 and so far the Transport Department has not been able to 10 answer our questions.</p> <p>11 Because for Tsim Sha Tsui ferry pier terminus the 12 facilities are very good. If the terminus is 13 demolished, as the proposal goes, it will turn into an 14 ordinary bus stop without resting facilities for KMB bus 15 captains.</p> <p>16 I also have another paper for reference. And this 17 is from the Hong Kong Institute of Landscape Architects.</p> <p>18 Thank you, Chairman.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Is that a document you wish us to receive? 20 MR LAU KAI HIM: (In English) Yes. 21 CHAIRMAN: Do you have copies of it? We will have it 22 copied. 23 MR LAU KAI HIM: (In English) Here is my copy. (Handed). 24 CHAIRMAN: Very well, we will have it copied now. 25 MR LAU KAI HIM: No need to photocopy.</p>	<p>1 be attended by the government, bus company, and labour 2 union. That's at page 260-523-8. Regular meetings to 3 be attended by bus company and labour union so as to 4 facilitate discussion on matters including the design of 5 facilities in old and new bus terminus.</p> <p>6 And we can see in one of the replies of the 7 Transport Department, at page 260-523-22, that they 8 appear to consider that this request should not be 9 three-party, but instead they invite you to go through 10 the bus company.</p> <p>11 It would be at page 206-523-22, second paragraph: 12 "When designing a new bus terminus, in addition to 13 referring to the usual design standards, our Department 14 would also take into account the circumstances of the 15 terminus, including the number of expected routes, 16 number of passengers, direction of the flow of people, 17 environmental limitations, operational needs of the 18 buses, et cetera. We would also consult the relevant 19 bus companies for their opinion on the design in 20 concern. Therefore, if staffs have any suggestions on 21 the design and facilities of the bus terminus, the 22 staffs may reflect them to their company. Our 23 department believes that the current mechanism is 24 effective." 25 So the Transport Department appeared to reject your</p>
Page 126	Page 128
<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you, Mr Lau. 2 In one of your annexures, annexure 18, can 3 I summarise one of the points you made in your 4 submission? 5 CHAIRMAN: What is the reference? 6 MS MAGGIE WONG: The reference, it is annex 18 of the 7 supplemental document filed by the union on 8 16 July 2018, and the document itself contains a minute, 9 a letter dated 28 June 2007. In Chinese it is at 10 page 260-522; in English page 260-523-22. It is 11 a letter -- 12 CHAIRMAN: Which bundle? 13 MS MAGGIE WONG: In TU bundle, I apologise. 14 CHAIRMAN: Which one. 15 MS MAGGIE WONG: 1C. 16 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 17 MS MAGGIE WONG: That is a letter dated 24 November 2016 18 from your union to the Transport Department. I'm only 19 interested in one topic. It is paragraphs 1.1 to 1.3. 20 In relation to this topic, your union requested, or 21 invited the Transport Department to consider having 22 three-party negotiation or meeting in relation to the 23 design and facilities of newly built bus terminus. 24 And at 1.3 you stated that you would like the 25 department to consider to arrange for regular meeting to</p>	<p>1 request to have three-party negotiation. Is that the 2 position? 3 MR LAU KAI HIM: Correct. 4 MS MAGGIE WONG: May I now go to another topic, on year-end 5 attendance bonus. 6 May I invite you to your second submission, at 7 page 260-94 in English, and Chinese at page 260-57. 8 Now, have you got the document, Mr Lau? 9 MR LAU KAI HIM: (In English) Yes. 10 MS MAGGIE WONG: May I ask you this. You mentioned 11 something here about the year-end bonus. Is that on top 12 of the safety and good service bonus that the KMB is 13 currently offering to bus captains? 14 MR LAU KAI HIM: Let me put it this way. For safety award 15 and attendance bonus, these are incorporated into the 16 basic salaries of bus captains. For (a), on this page, 17 it refers to a year-end bonus, and in 2018 KMB already 18 undertook to scrap the year-end bonus, and that double 19 pay would be implemented. As for the year-end bonus, an 20 assessment would be conducted and staff would be graded 21 from 1 to 5, or not available. And then award would 22 be -- or bonuses would be given according to the 23 grading. 24 So these are two different things. 25 CHAIRMAN: When in 2018 did KMB agree to scrap the year-end</p>

Page 129	Page 131
<p>1 bonus?</p> <p>2 MR LAU KAI HIM: Around May or June they undertook to scrap</p> <p>3 the year-end bonus system, and a double pay system would</p> <p>4 be implemented. And the actual announcement date was</p> <p>5 in June.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: Do you have a copy of the announcement?</p> <p>7 MR LAU KAI HIM: You mean a notice issued by the company?</p> <p>8 We can get a copy from KMB. If the Committee would like</p> <p>9 to have a copy I can provide a copy to the Committee.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: Thank you, please do so.</p> <p>11 MR LAU KAI HIM: Mr Lam would also like to supplement about</p> <p>12 the bonus system for New World First Bus.</p> <p>13 MR LAM KAM PIU: For New World First Bus and Citybus they</p> <p>14 share the management, and for safety bonus, attendance</p> <p>15 award, since March this year they have been incorporated</p> <p>16 into the basic salaries. But I want to supplement</p> <p>17 regarding bonuses.</p> <p>18 Many years ago we already reflected our view to the</p> <p>19 company. For the bonuses, allowances, they should be</p> <p>20 part of the salary and they should be incorporated into</p> <p>21 the basic salaries as a remuneration package. But for</p> <p>22 various reasons the company had all along rejected the</p> <p>23 idea.</p> <p>24 But ever since the tragedy happened, the company</p> <p>25 claimed that in light of the market situation they would</p>	<p>1 Mr Lau referred to the year-end bonus, and for us,</p> <p>2 there are the new systems and the old systems. In the</p> <p>3 old system it is in the form of a double pay without any</p> <p>4 conditions attached. So an extra month of pay will be</p> <p>5 disbursed. But for those under the new system, they</p> <p>6 have to meet with certain conditions stipulated by the</p> <p>7 company. Say, for example, if you take sick leave you</p> <p>8 will be given less. So the number of sick leave days</p> <p>9 you have in a year will be factored in. Maybe if you</p> <p>10 are complained against, your year-end bonus will also be</p> <p>11 deducted.</p> <p>12 So for the frontline bus captains, especially the</p> <p>13 new recruits, they are not willing to stay long. They</p> <p>14 will just work for one year or half a year, and then</p> <p>15 they quit.</p> <p>16 MR LAM KAM PIU: Mr Hui would also like to supplement.</p> <p>17 MR HUI HOU KIT: Citybus and New World First Bus, our</p> <p>18 year-end bonus is different from the New World First</p> <p>19 Bus. We have three systems under Citybus. The first</p> <p>20 system covers the most experienced staff members, we</p> <p>21 call that double pay, and for the second batch, for</p> <p>22 myself I'm in that, we call that remuneration in</p> <p>23 a sense, and that comprises three parts.</p> <p>24 The first is the basic salary, the other, the second</p> <p>25 is the -- your OT pay for the whole year divided by</p>
<p>Page 130</p> <p>1 include the bonuses and allowances in the remuneration.</p> <p>2 So it is just a consolation prize. It is just better</p> <p>3 than nothing. But over the years we have been striving</p> <p>4 for this. We didn't just start after the tragedy</p> <p>5 happened. Because we understand that this problem has</p> <p>6 affected staff all along, because our staff all along</p> <p>7 have been given very low basic salary.</p> <p>8 So we have been reflecting this to the company.</p> <p>9 MR LAU KAI HIM: Ms Wong, the New World First Bus staff</p> <p>10 union has reflected to the management, and that was in</p> <p>11 annex 17, and in 2017 our trade union has asked for the</p> <p>12 attendance bonus to be incorporated into the basic</p> <p>13 salary. We have been striving for it for a long time</p> <p>14 already. But we have lost the older minutes of</p> <p>15 meetings. But in appendix 17 it shows that they have</p> <p>16 been talking to the management all along about this.</p> <p>17 Mr Chung would like to supplement.</p> <p>18 MR CHUNG CHUNG FAI: I would like to supplement.</p> <p>19 Mr Lam talked about safety bonus, attendance bonus,</p> <p>20 et cetera, being incorporated into the basic salary and</p> <p>21 that started in November, and there were two bus</p> <p>22 tragedies, and the company told us that because of the</p> <p>23 pressure from the community and our salary is on the low</p> <p>24 side, all these allowances would be incorporated into</p> <p>25 the basic salary.</p>	<p>Page 132</p> <p>1 one-third, and that is your bonus.</p> <p>2 And the third batch is the contract bus captains.</p> <p>3 So that means one month's basic salary for them.</p> <p>4 And there is also a grading system.</p> <p>5 If in one year you do not have full attendance, then</p> <p>6 your bonus will be deducted. So your basic salary will</p> <p>7 be divided by 365, say, if you are absent for one day of</p> <p>8 work, then you would get your bonus deducted by that</p> <p>9 amount, and then if it is sick leave and all that, then</p> <p>10 it would be deducted in the same manner.</p> <p>11 And if you receive warning letters, well, if it is</p> <p>12 a final warning letter, then your bonus will also be</p> <p>13 deducted. If you receive a final warning letter, then</p> <p>14 you will only get 75 per cent of your basic salary as</p> <p>15 the bonus.</p> <p>16 So that's how it works in Citybus.</p> <p>17 Starting 2005, Citybus has started hiring contract</p> <p>18 bus captains. Initially, there was no year-end bonus,</p> <p>19 but we have been striving for it all along. And now</p> <p>20 that is being given.</p> <p>21 But for new recruits, and the year-end bonus, there</p> <p>22 is one thing we object strongly against. Say, if they</p> <p>23 are on leave, and they do not have a full attendance,</p> <p>24 then their year-end bonus will be deducted. We don't</p> <p>25 think it is reasonable.</p>

Page 133	Page 135
<p>1 Maybe the person is taken ill or he suffers injury</p> <p>2 at work, maybe he applies for leave because of marriage</p> <p>3 or he has to attend a funeral or something like that.</p> <p>4 This is something beyond his control.</p> <p>5 So if the pay for the colleague is being deducted</p> <p>6 for those reasons, that would be very unreasonable.</p> <p>7 That's all I wanted to say as a supplement.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Ms Wong.</p> <p>9 MS MAGGIE WONG: And we have heard about a system that was</p> <p>10 in place in Kowloon Motor Bus. Maybe Mr Kwok can</p> <p>11 assist.</p> <p>12 We heard about the bus having a small device with</p> <p>13 four lights which would inform the driver immediately</p> <p>14 when there are four conditions, speeding, harsh braking,</p> <p>15 abrupt acceleration -- I think those are the three</p> <p>16 conditions.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: And engine idling.</p> <p>18 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. Engine idling.</p> <p>19 Mr Kwok, do you remember when these lights were put</p> <p>20 in place in buses?</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Could we bring a photograph of -- there it is.</p> <p>22 Thank you.</p> <p>23 MS MAGGIE WONG: That's, for record purpose, BM-65.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: This is a document provided by Openmatics</p> <p>25 describing to us this alert system with the four LED</p>	<p>1 MR LAU KAI HIM: Chairman, I have something to supplement.</p> <p>2 There are the red, amber and green lights, so that,</p> <p>3 well, based on the information collected from this box,</p> <p>4 then that shows the driver's driving behaviour, so if</p> <p>5 you have a green light then you are okay. If you have</p> <p>6 an amber light you need improvement. Red, of course, is</p> <p>7 not good, and there is also an incentive programme</p> <p>8 launched.</p> <p>9 So if the drivers have the green light, then</p> <p>10 a reward is given to the driver. But for some time</p> <p>11 I don't see any information regarding this bonus or</p> <p>12 reward scheme. But this Octopus reader is still in</p> <p>13 operation at KMB, and the system pointed out by Ms Wong</p> <p>14 still exists.</p> <p>15 Now, bus drivers will tap the card and then the</p> <p>16 relevant lights will come on. This system is connected</p> <p>17 to the GPS to monitor the bus driver's performance, and</p> <p>18 then information collected can then classify the bus</p> <p>19 drivers into amber, red and green drivers.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Do you know what period of driving is reflected</p> <p>21 by this colour display, red, amber, green? To which</p> <p>22 period of driving does it relate?</p> <p>23 MR KWOK WAI KWONG: Well, it is from the start of work to</p> <p>24 the end of your duty.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: So when you come on duty, you tap your card, and</p>
Page 134	Page 136
<p>1 lights.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: We have been informed by one of the depot</p> <p>3 managers, Tuen Mun depot manager, that in fact there was</p> <p>4 this LED light system that would signal the driver</p> <p>5 immediately when one of these situations happened.</p> <p>6 So my question is, do you recall when was this LED</p> <p>7 light implemented in buses in Kowloon Motor Bus?</p> <p>8 MR KWOK WAI KWONG: 2013. 2013.</p> <p>9 MR LAU KAI HIM: We tried that out in 2013, and that was</p> <p>10 installed.</p> <p>11 MR KWOK WAI KWONG: 2013.</p> <p>12 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you.</p> <p>13 And they also talked about a system where whenever</p> <p>14 you go to work you put the Octopus card on the kiosk,</p> <p>15 there was an Octopus card where you can put on the</p> <p>16 reader, and it will automatically show whether you are</p> <p>17 a green driver, amber driver, or red driver.</p> <p>18 Can you confirm if that was the system in place in</p> <p>19 Kowloon Motor Bus?</p> <p>20 MR KWOK WAI KWONG: Yes.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: How does this work? You put your Octopus card on</p> <p>22 the reader and what display do you see?</p> <p>23 MR KWOK WAI KWONG: When I go into work, and when I tap the</p> <p>24 card, then there will be this display. Usually it is</p> <p>25 a green light.</p>	<p>1 this is displayed, is that right, Mr Kwok?</p> <p>2 What does the display refer to? Yesterday's</p> <p>3 driving, the month's driving, a week's driving?</p> <p>4 MR LAU KAI HIM: It is a kind of sustainable performance on</p> <p>5 your part, and every time when you tap the card you will</p> <p>6 be reminded on your performance as indicated by the</p> <p>7 colour. Well, we don't have a specific period, say, for</p> <p>8 assessing your performance -- well, that's a reminder on</p> <p>9 a sustainable basis. Every time when you tap your card,</p> <p>10 the relevant colour will show up to tell you your actual</p> <p>11 performance.</p> <p>12 It doesn't cover a specific period. I wonder</p> <p>13 whether Mr Kwok has anything to supplement.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: We have been told that it does. If you don't</p> <p>15 know, please say so.</p> <p>16 MR KWOK WAI KWONG: Well, as far as I can recollect, it is</p> <p>17 usually about the performance in the previous week.</p> <p>18 Yes, indeed there is a period.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>20 Now we can see on the screen that there are these</p> <p>21 four thresholds that trigger some kind of alert. Do you</p> <p>22 know whether triggering one of the alerts, for example</p> <p>23 that the engine has been idling too long affects the</p> <p>24 colour that you have given for your record? In other</p> <p>25 words, if you left the engine idling at the bus station</p>

Page 137	Page 139
<p>1 do you get a red signal?</p> <p>2 MR KWOK WAI KWONG: There will be also a beeping sound, and</p> <p>3 the light will also come on.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: I understand that.</p> <p>5 Does the fact that you left the engine running too</p> <p>6 long, and the light flashed, and you got a beeping sound</p> <p>7 as you sat waiting in the bus station, does that result</p> <p>8 in a day or two, or a week's time later, you getting</p> <p>9 a red indicator when you tap your Octopus card, or not?</p> <p>10 MR KWOK WAI KWONG: They will take the average statistics.</p> <p>11 We would not have that kind of consequence. Only if it</p> <p>12 happens one or two times. If that happens frequently</p> <p>13 then the reminder will come on.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: Have you ever been provided with details that</p> <p>15 tell you exactly how it works, or not?</p> <p>16 MR KWOK WAI KWONG: No. Well, no explanation has been</p> <p>17 given.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: Do you know what the threshold values are for</p> <p>19 triggering the audio and visual alert in the bus</p> <p>20 captain's cockpit? Do you know what the thresholds are?</p> <p>21 Speed, acceleration, deceleration?</p> <p>22 MR KWOK WAI KWONG: I have driven many different buses, and</p> <p>23 different buses have different devices that give</p> <p>24 different effect. Some are very sensitive. Some would</p> <p>25 be triggered very easily, say if you press on the gas</p>	<p>1 on this, Mr Lau earlier mentioned that you used to have</p> <p>2 a reward system based on the driving performance, but</p> <p>3 now it appears that the system did not exist. Is that</p> <p>4 what Mr Lau is saying?</p> <p>5 MR LAU KAI HIM: That's right, yes.</p> <p>6 MS MAGGIE WONG: So what is the reward?</p> <p>7 MR LAU KAI HIM: First of all, because of lapse of time,</p> <p>8 I really cannot remember very clearly, but when it was</p> <p>9 first implemented, there was a poster. Some sort of</p> <p>10 a poster, which I had seen that there was this scheme</p> <p>11 reminding drivers to drive in an environmentally</p> <p>12 friendly manner in a safe manner, and if you reached the</p> <p>13 target you would get a reward.</p> <p>14 As for the actual details, I no longer remember.</p> <p>15 But I do have the recollection that there was some sort</p> <p>16 of reward coming from data of the box, but since then</p> <p>17 I have not heard anything about the reward or its</p> <p>18 details.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Mr Kwok, have you ever received a reward?</p> <p>20 MR KWOK WAI KWONG: Yes.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Yes? And what was the reward? Money? Fruit?</p> <p>22 Balloons? What was it?</p> <p>23 MR KWOK WAI KWONG: Do you mean the red, amber, green</p> <p>24 performance related one?</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Yes.</p>
Page 138	Page 140
<p>1 pedal quite hard, or when you brake hard, or when you</p> <p>2 take a turn too sharply, some devices are sensitive,</p> <p>3 some are not.</p> <p>4 So I have the impression that this system is not</p> <p>5 very consistent among the buses.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: For example with speed, do you know what speed</p> <p>7 the alert is triggered at?</p> <p>8 MR KWOK WAI KWONG: It will beep if it goes above 70.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: So if you are in a 50 kilometre an hour speed</p> <p>10 limit and you are doing 60, it doesn't beep?</p> <p>11 MR KWOK WAI KWONG: If it is 50, well, I haven't heard any</p> <p>12 beeping sound so far.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: In the five years that this system has been</p> <p>14 working, no beep in a 50-kilometre zone?</p> <p>15 MR KWOK WAI KWONG: That's right.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr Kwok.</p> <p>17 MS MAGGIE WONG: About the Octopus card reader system</p> <p>18 showing the green, amber, red colour of the drivers.</p> <p>19 When was it implemented?</p> <p>20 MR KWOK WAI KWONG: Five years ago -- 2013.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: So the same time when you have this LED</p> <p>22 illuminating light system?</p> <p>23 MR KWOK WAI KWONG: I suppose so.</p> <p>24 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you.</p> <p>25 And since we are on this topic, may I ask your view</p>	<p>1 MR KWOK WAI KWONG: I think it related to a promotion, or</p> <p>2 star bus captain.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: So not monetary, not immediately monetary?</p> <p>4 MR KWOK WAI KWONG: No, no. Not monetary.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr Kwok.</p> <p>6 Mr Auyeung, yes.</p> <p>7 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Mr Kwok, I want to ask a question about --</p> <p>8 as a bus captain, do you find this system helping your</p> <p>9 work?</p> <p>10 MR KWOK WAI KWONG: Do you mean this LED surveillance or</p> <p>11 monitoring system? Yes.</p> <p>12 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Thank you.</p> <p>13 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Kwok and Mr Lau, do you remember when</p> <p>14 this reward system was first implemented? Would it be</p> <p>15 around the time when you have this red, amber, green</p> <p>16 system?</p> <p>17 MR LAU KAI HIM: First of all, regarding the LED system,</p> <p>18 I remember very clearly that it was in 2013. When I was</p> <p>19 at work I first got in touch with the LED system and</p> <p>20 I was told by other bus drivers that they didn't get</p> <p>21 used to the LED system because it kept beeping and the</p> <p>22 lights kept going on, and it was in 2013. But I do not</p> <p>23 remember whether the reward system was also implemented</p> <p>24 around the same time.</p> <p>25 I only have the recollection that I saw a poster</p>

Page 141	Page 143
<p>1 about this incentive, if the performance was good, but 2 I no longer remember details.</p> <p>3 I can tell you very clearly, however, that this 4 system was implemented in 2013 and the black box with 5 four LED lights are still being used at the moment.</p> <p>6 MS MAGGIE WONG: If this system was re-implemented, that 7 there would be reward, or bonus --</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Well, what we have been told is that insofar as 9 there is a reward, it might have been promotion, but it 10 was not monetary.</p> <p>11 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes.</p> <p>12 If one were to suggest that there be a reward in the 13 form of bonus payment, based on the colour of the 14 system, that is if you consistently have green colour, 15 being good driving behaviour, you would receive 16 a bonus --</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: A monetary bonus?</p> <p>18 MS MAGGIE WONG: A monetary bonus, would you find it 19 helpful, or useful in enhancing the safety awareness of 20 driving?</p> <p>21 MR LAU KAI HIM: First of all, whenever there is an 22 incentive or reward system, I think psychologically 23 speaking it would be helpful. It would be positive.</p> <p>24 But let's say if you are given a bonus if you have 25 green colour, then it serves as an incentive for bus</p>	<p>1 in terms of this system, this Octopus card system?</p> <p>2 MR KWOK WAI KWONG: I have not seen one.</p> <p>3 MS MAGGIE WONG: We have heard evidence from KMB former 4 employee that there was a small reminding card that 5 informed bus captains about 29 sharp bends and providing 6 some safety driving tips.</p> <p>7 Do you recall receiving a small printed card?</p> <p>8 MR KWOK WAI KWONG: No.</p> <p>9 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, Mr Lau.</p> <p>10 MR LAU KAI HIM: Let me supplement.</p> <p>11 For this small card, I have not received it, I never 12 saw it, but the company does provide information on the 13 intranet regarding these road sections, and previously 14 the company also reminded colleagues to read the notice 15 about dangerous road sections on the intranet. That 16 would remind them about the road sections and the 17 information came with pictures and text.</p> <p>18 As for the small card, I have not seen it myself.</p> <p>19 As for safety information about road sections, the 20 information is on the intranet as I can see on the 21 screen.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: When you say "the company", you mean KMB?</p> <p>23 MR LAU KAI HIM: That's right.</p> <p>24 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you tell us when did you start to have 25 this intranet information about these road sections?</p>
Page 142	Page 144
<p>1 captains to improve his performance. But I need to make 2 it clear, that the awareness of safety will not be 3 enhanced simply by having a bonus. If the driver's 4 safety awareness isn't high, then even if there is 5 a bonus I don't know whether certainly this will help 6 improve the safety aspect of driving.</p> <p>7 These are two different concepts.</p> <p>8 Of course, if you have a bonus, it will be helpful, 9 it will be an incentive, but about enhancing safety 10 awareness, I don't think the black box with four LED 11 lights would really substantially improve the safety 12 awareness of drivers. It only serves as a reminder, and 13 the bonus would be an incentive for them to improve 14 their performance, but their awareness will not be 15 enhanced simply by the black box with four LED lights 16 and bonuses.</p> <p>17 MR KWOK WAI KWONG: Let me supplement.</p> <p>18 As I mentioned just now, different buses have 19 different devices that give off different responses. 20 Some are responsive, some are not. So if this is used 21 to assess the work performance of bus captains, I think 22 this is substandard. I think we should assess the 23 performance with other means.</p> <p>24 MS MAGGIE WONG: In your experience, have you come across 25 a driver who consistently has red signal, or red colour</p>	<p>1 Since when?</p> <p>2 MR LAU KAI HIM: The information, when I joined in 2013, 3 I could already access this information. So all along, 4 they are on the website, and about two or three years 5 ago they were still updating and collecting data about 6 potentially hazardous road sections, and they would 7 update information on the intranet.</p> <p>8 MS MAGGIE WONG: You mentioned two or three years ago they 9 were still updating; what about now?</p> <p>10 MR LAU KAI HIM: I don't know whether there has been any 11 update now.</p> <p>12 MS MAGGIE WONG: May I go to the next topic, on assault of 13 bus captains.</p> <p>14 Your union has made a lot of emphasis on this by 15 providing us with minutes of meeting, and also in your 16 submission. If I may take you to your submission only, 17 that's at page 260-93 in English; Chinese is at 18 page 260-56.</p> <p>19 And it refers to your union: 20 "...always followed up with incidents where bus 21 captains were attacked."</p> <p>22 And you also stated that your record would not be 23 complete because only those union members who informed 24 you would you have support them.</p> <p>25 "However, in the past, the Federation has always</p>

Page 145	Page 147
<p>1 been communicating with the Police on bus captain 2 safety."</p> <p>3 And you produced a Transport Department minutes of 4 meeting on 30 June 2017 in annexure 15. That's at 5 page 260-473 in English.</p> <p>6 Now, is this a recent occurrence about assaults on 7 bus captains by passengers which led to you having these 8 meetings with the Transport Department and the police, 9 and the Department of Justice?</p> <p>10 MR LAU KAI HIM: (In English) Correct.</p> <p>11 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can I ask about your views on installation 12 of surveillance cameras? We have heard evidence from 13 different unions that most of them support the use of 14 surveillance cameras being installed in the driver's 15 cockpit in order to protect the bus captain as well as 16 to record in video form and in audio recording the 17 incident.</p> <p>18 Does your union support this, the installation of 19 surveillance cameras?</p> <p>20 MR CHUNG CHUNG FAI: We agree to the installation of CCTVs 21 not just to protect the bus captains but also the 22 passengers as well. With CCTV, then the facts can be 23 known.</p> <p>24 MR LAU KAI HIM: I have something to supplement. 25 In our meetings with the police, the police have</p>	<p>1 witnesses, so if we have such CCTV then it can help show 2 that passengers actually beat up the bus captains and 3 then there is a higher chance of a conviction. And that 4 will help the bus captains.</p> <p>5 MR LAU KAI HIM: I would like to supplement.</p> <p>6 The union has been emphasising to the DoJ and the 7 police that Hong Kong is a common law jurisdiction and 8 the burden of proof lies with the prosecution, and if we 9 have CCTV footages, the prosecution will be more 10 effective.</p> <p>11 And we have expressed our worry about bus captains 12 being assaulted and at the court we must emphasise the 13 seriousness of such a problem, because it will have an 14 adverse impact on not just the bus captains, but other 15 road users and passengers.</p> <p>16 We don't want to interfere with the ruling of the 17 court, but we notice that every time the penalty meted 18 out is not deterrent enough and the message for the 19 community seems to be that this is a sort of low court 20 criminal offence, I mean the passengers assaulting the 21 bus captains. I don't think bus captains should be 22 assaulted by passengers, and under cap 230A the 23 passengers should not be assaulting the bus captains.</p> <p>24 And we haven't seen the DoJ emphasising to the 25 judiciary the seriousness of the problem and, as</p>
Page 146	Page 148
<p>1 emphasised the importance of producing evidence. In 2 assaults on bus captains, evidence is important. If we 3 have CCTV footage, then we will know how the incident 4 happened. It can protect bus captains, and passengers 5 alike. If we have footage serving as evidence of bus 6 captains being assaulted then that will help in 7 presenting the case in the court.</p> <p>8 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, thank you.</p> <p>9 Related to this topic is the installation of 10 protective --</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on -- do any of you gentlemen 12 have any experience of CCTV being used in this way in 13 the courts -- taken from a bus showing an assault on 14 a bus driver?</p> <p>15 MR CHUNG CHUNG FAI: No.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr Hui?</p> <p>17 MR HUI HOU KIT: Yes, I have a case.</p> <p>18 But that happened before we had the installation of 19 the CCTV. At that time there were human witnesses. 20 I mean, there were people who served as witnesses 21 telling the court that I was assaulted, I was beaten up, 22 and there was a fine imposed on the culprit.</p> <p>23 But then if we had footages, then we don't have to 24 rely just on the witnesses. Because passengers are 25 worried, and they sometimes they don't want to be</p>	<p>1 a result, people think that this is just something 2 common place, and how can the law protect the safety of 3 bus captains, if this is the case?</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: You have made this submission to both the police 5 and the Department of Justice, have you not?</p> <p>6 MR LAU KAI HIM: Yes, in the meeting on 30 June 2017, we 7 reflected our views, and we made two major points.</p> <p>8 First, in the prosecution process the DoJ must tell 9 the court the seriousness of the problem of assault on 10 the bus captains, and the harm it does to this society. 11 And also because the sentencing is always very light, 12 and is not deterrent enough. And we have asked the DoJ 13 that after the prosecution they should also actively 14 follow up, maybe they should appeal against the 15 sentencing. So we have mentioned all these.</p> <p>16 We have been talking to the DoJ, we said that we are 17 not interfering with the court's ruling, we respect such 18 a ruling, but we think the rule of law is the foundation 19 or the cornerstone of Hong Kong success, and this is 20 something that the DoJ is also proud of.</p> <p>21 But then what the DoJ does does not really bring out 22 the seriousness of the problem, so the bus captains are 23 not adequately protected under the law.</p> <p>24 If some of the sentencing can be harsher, then it 25 will be deterrent.</p>

Page 149	Page 151
<p>1 We also notice that in dealing with such cases the 2 police may not know too well about the actual situation, 3 and in some cases the police will ask the bus captains 4 to settle the case by conciliation, and we have 5 emphasised to the police that the power given to us 6 under cap 203A is very big, but then many frontline 7 police officers don't know about the content and how 8 203A operates.</p> <p>9 MR HUI HOU KIT: At the hospital, my injury was examined, 10 and the police was not notified yet, but then the 11 witness has not come forth yet, and the police would 12 advise me to resort to conciliation. And then, after 13 I know that there was a witness I said to the police 14 that I would like to have prosecution.</p> <p>15 I have served in a trade union for over 10 years, 16 and I have seen cases of colleagues whereby the police 17 have advised the bus captains to conciliate, "because 18 you don't have a witness, and even if there is a 19 conviction, well, only a fine will be imposed. So why 20 don't you just resort to conciliation?"</p> <p>21 We had meeting with the police, and with the DoJ, 22 and we emphasised that the police's role is to protect 23 the rights of the underprivileged. The bus captains 24 have been beaten up, so there is no reason why you 25 should ask us to resort to conciliation.</p>	<p>1 small an area. And the location is undesirable, and it 2 blocks the sight line and there is also a sound, 3 a noise.</p> <p>4 There is a suggestion, that it should not be half 5 a panel, but the entire panel. Even if the passengers 6 want to beat us they can still do so. So it should go 7 all the way from the bottom to the top.</p> <p>8 MR LAU KAI HIM: Mr Lam and Mr Chung would like to 9 supplement.</p> <p>10 MR LAM KAM PIU: On the bus captains being assaulted, and 11 the installation of protective devices, we have made 12 a suggestion to the Transport Department. I went to the 13 UK myself, and I took some buses in the UK. Well, Hong 14 Kong bus models are similar to the UK's, but at the 15 driver's cabin, in the UK buses, well, a full enclosure 16 is being put in place made of plastic. It is like 17 a room, so to speak. And the passengers will not be 18 able to get in touch with the bus captains, whereas the 19 bus captains would be able to view the roads and the 20 external situation. I wonder whether this kind of 21 device is suited to Hong Kong.</p> <p>22 But we have made the suggestion to the TD for their 23 consideration.</p> <p>24 On the KMB's device, it is only a pilot programme, 25 and there is still room for improvement.</p>
<p>Page 150</p> <p>1 CHAIRMAN: Mr Hui, when were you attacked? What was the 2 date?</p> <p>3 MR HUI HOU KIT: Over 10 years ago. When I was working as 4 an overnight bus captain.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: Very well. We have some statistics going back 6 three years, but -- we have particulars going back three 7 years, but we don't have anything going back that far.</p> <p>8 Yes, Ms Wong.</p> <p>9 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. Mr Chairman, for record purpose, the 10 minutes of meeting, 30 June 2017 mentioned by Mr Lau and 11 gentlemen is in TU bundle, at pages 260-474 to 477.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>13 MS MAGGIE WONG: Related to this topic, gentlemen, is about 14 the use of protective shield.</p> <p>15 We have heard one union expressing that there are 16 problems relating to the use of protective shields. May 17 I enquire, Mr Kwok, perhaps, in relation to Kowloon 18 Motor Bus, because I believe that's the step taken by 19 KMB. Do you have any issues about the use of protective 20 shield installed near the cockpit, driver's cockpit?</p> <p>21 MR KWOK WAI KWONG: There is no problem with the 22 installation of protective shield, but the way it is 23 installed is undesirable.</p> <p>24 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you tell us why?</p> <p>25 MR KWOK WAI KWONG: Well, the protective shield covers too</p>	<p>Page 152</p> <p>1 Well, as users, we can make suggestions on 2 improvement to the bus company. The engineering staff 3 of the bus company do not know how it works. Only the 4 users will know how well it works so we should reflect 5 our views to the engineering staff of the company. And 6 improvement or enhancement can then be made.</p> <p>7 This device can help bus captains, but Citybus and 8 New World First Bus are against the idea.</p> <p>9 The management of these two companies said that if 10 the bus captains do not offend the bus captains then the 11 passengers won't beat you up.</p> <p>12 So in other words, we are prepared to be beaten up.</p> <p>13 So for Citybus, New World First Bus, our colleagues 14 have seen KMB's device and we have given our feedback to 15 our company, and they have given us a response.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: Where were you in the UK when you encountered 17 this full protective cover? Where were you? Which 18 place?</p> <p>19 MR LAM KAM PIU: London. Even Birmingham.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Do you know which bus company in London was using 21 this device?</p> <p>22 MR LAM KAM PIU: I really don't know which company, but 23 I saw that a number of bus operators had this system 24 installed.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p>

Page 153	Page 155
<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you.</p> <p>2 Your union also expressed concerns about the use of</p> <p>3 12.8 metre bus that have rear wheel steering function,</p> <p>4 and the Transport Department has replied to your union</p> <p>5 that they will review the suitability of each route and</p> <p>6 require the bus company to conduct road testing to</p> <p>7 ensure safety for driving.</p> <p>8 And the letter of reply from Transport Department</p> <p>9 was dated 11 September 2017.</p> <p>10 That's TU bundle, page 260-2 to 260-4.</p> <p>11 Does your union still have concerns about the use of</p> <p>12 this particular kind of buses?</p> <p>13 MR LAM KAM PIU: True. Because for 12.8 buses in light of</p> <p>14 the road conditions in Hong Kong, because we have narrow</p> <p>15 roads, and heavy pedestrian flow, and there is a hazard</p> <p>16 using very long buses.</p> <p>17 As for 12.8 bus with the rear axle steering</p> <p>18 function, when manoeuvring a bend of course it would be</p> <p>19 very good for the driver. But for other vehicles they</p> <p>20 may not know that the bus comes with this rear wheel</p> <p>21 steering function, and the Transport Department would</p> <p>22 issue something to let the driver know that it has the</p> <p>23 function, but other drivers may not know. So when the</p> <p>24 rear axle steers during a bend, when another vehicle</p> <p>25 approaches very closely the back of the bus, the wheel</p>	<p>1 However, the Transport Department replied by saying</p> <p>2 a test had been conducted and union representatives</p> <p>3 would not be invited to another test.</p> <p>4 We requested once again recently, that the union</p> <p>5 should be invited to give comments as well, and we</p> <p>6 proposed the location, Fleming Road flyover, turning</p> <p>7 into Hennessy Road on Hong Kong Island, because at that</p> <p>8 road junction vehicles can either turn left or right, so</p> <p>9 we can test the 12.8 bus there, because Citybus and New</p> <p>10 World First Bus both have 12.8 buses. So if two buses</p> <p>11 turn at that junction, definitely there will be an</p> <p>12 accident.</p> <p>13 At the moment other motorists do not understand the</p> <p>14 rear axle --</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: Mr Lam, we do have a shortage of time. We have</p> <p>16 your point. You still have concerns that these buses</p> <p>17 are not safe in Hong Kong. We have that. Thank you.</p> <p>18 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. If you would not mind, can you</p> <p>19 give us the request in writing that you wrote to the</p> <p>20 Transport Department requesting for a retest for that</p> <p>21 particular section. If you can supply it to the</p> <p>22 Committee later.</p> <p>23 Now --</p> <p>24 MR LAU KAI HIM: Chairman. I'm sorry to say that the</p> <p>25 Federation received a phone call from a top official of</p>
Page 154	Page 156
<p>1 would actually go outside its own lane, causing danger</p> <p>2 to the vehicle next to it.</p> <p>3 We may not have the statistics at the moment, but at</p> <p>4 certain locations such as bus termini, or different road</p> <p>5 sections, we had instances of the rear wheels grazing</p> <p>6 vehicles next to it. But, of course, we would be in</p> <p>7 a disadvantageous position, because we grazed the other</p> <p>8 vehicle, and at the moment, because of the width of the</p> <p>9 lanes in Hong Kong, we have a width of 9 feet but for</p> <p>10 buses it has a width of 8.5 feet. So the bus itself is</p> <p>11 fully occupying the whole width.</p> <p>12 Imagine if there is another large vehicle making</p> <p>13 a turn at the same time, for the 12.8 bus, definitely</p> <p>14 the rear would graze the other vehicle, and then once</p> <p>15 you turn the vehicle, the tail of the bus would go into</p> <p>16 the next lane.</p> <p>17 KMB used a 12.8 bus for trial, and they set up</p> <p>18 cones, to check how the 12.8 bus makes a turn, and in</p> <p>19 fact, the tail went 3 feet off its own lane.</p> <p>20 So we told the Transport Department that when the</p> <p>21 12.8 bus is tested, there should be union</p> <p>22 representatives attending the test, and, well, traffic</p> <p>23 cones should be set up, so that when the bus negotiates</p> <p>24 the bend of 90 degrees we could see whether the tail</p> <p>25 would touch other vehicles.</p>	<p>1 Transport Department expressing deep dissatisfaction</p> <p>2 that we passed three documents to the Committee which</p> <p>3 are minutes of meetings. But we do believe that these</p> <p>4 documents would help the work of the Committee.</p> <p>5 So we are going to provide the minutes of meetings</p> <p>6 in the past, but for the August 2017 meetings onwards,</p> <p>7 the Transport Department would not provide minutes to</p> <p>8 us.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Who was it that spoke to you on the telephone</p> <p>10 expressing deep dissatisfaction that you had passed</p> <p>11 documents to this Committee? Who was it?</p> <p>12 MR LAM KAM PIU: Well, that day it was I who rang the</p> <p>13 Transport Department with a view to asking them to</p> <p>14 return documents to us, because we have been asking for</p> <p>15 meeting minutes for a long time, and they have been</p> <p>16 telling us that other departments have not forwarded</p> <p>17 documents to them, et cetera. So I just asked them to</p> <p>18 give us as soon as possible.</p> <p>19 And the other side then told me that, "Well, we</p> <p>20 didn't provide document even if the Committee asked us.</p> <p>21 That's because we respect the privacy of the union."</p> <p>22 And then I told -- and then I told them that if the</p> <p>23 minutes of the meeting are passed on to others we</p> <p>24 definitely would not do that.</p> <p>25 But if this is for helping the enquiry, we</p>

Page 157	Page 159
<p>1 definitely will submit the minutes, and that's our 2 position. Because the other official is in the 3 directorate grade, I don't want to disclose his 4 identity, I don't know whether there would be some 5 problem. I can just say that he is a directorate grade 6 officer.</p> <p>7 MR LAU KAI HIM: We hope --</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: When was this conversation? When?</p> <p>9 MR LAM KAM PIU: In June, no --</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: Take your time.</p> <p>11 MR LAM KAM PIU: It was in July, mid July when I asked for 12 documents, as we knew we were awaiting the Commission's 13 invitation to attend the hearing.</p> <p>14 MR LAU KAI HIM: I would like to apologise to you, Chairman 15 on behalf of the Federation. We tried to look for 16 documents, but unfortunately we have not been able to 17 submit documents to the Committee, and we are sorry, and 18 we can't think whether there would be further minutes 19 received by the Federation.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Thank you for the documents that you have 21 supplied us.</p> <p>22 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: Ms Wong.</p> <p>24 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you, gentlemen. My last topic is 25 about practice note, a recent practice note issued by</p>	<p>1 other documents.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you, Mr Lau. We have not received it 3 either.</p> <p>4 So may I also ask, about this practice note. Have 5 you ever been consulted about this practice note in 6 terms of training of bus captains? Has Transport 7 Department or each of the bus operators consulted your 8 union about the topic of future training of bus 9 captains?</p> <p>10 MR LAU KAI HIM: First of all, we only learned about that 11 from the Commission, that a working group had been set 12 up by the Transport Department comprising 13 representatives from the bus manufacturers and FB 14 operators.</p> <p>15 We only learned about this working group through 16 the Commission, and in May during our meeting with the 17 Transport Department we requested the Transport 18 Department to allow a representative of the union to 19 join the working group because we are related. Of 20 course, the Transport Department did not agree. And for 21 the practice note, from its drafting to its issuance, we 22 had no participation. We only learned from the 23 Commission that there is this working group. So we have 24 never been consulted.</p> <p>25 When we knew about the working group we were</p>
Page 158	Page 160
<p>1 the Transport Department.</p> <p>2 We have recently been informed that the Transport 3 Department has issued a practice note to franchised bus 4 operators in respect of the training for bus captains to 5 align the training arrangements of different operators, 6 and to lay down a common framework of the training 7 system for their bus captains. And this is supposed to 8 be implemented from October 2018.</p> <p>9 This practice note was issued in the context of 10 a working group set up as a result of the February 2018 11 Tai Po accident.</p> <p>12 This working group comprised five bus operators, 13 three bus manufacturers, and the Transport Department. 14 And recently, they have informed us that they have 15 issued a practice note.</p> <p>16 So my question is, has your union been supplied with 17 a copy of the practice note?</p> <p>18 MR LAM KAM PIU: No.</p> <p>19 MR LAU KAI HIM: (In English) Excuse me. 20 (Interpreted) We received a reply from the Transport 21 Department and we read the reply. As to whether the 22 practice note -- I want to know whether it comes in 23 the form of a booklet or otherwise? We never received 24 any booklet. We did receive a letter from the Transport 25 Department regarding training of bus captains, but not</p>	<p>1 concerned. We said that we should be consulted, but we 2 were never consulted.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: When you made this request of the Transport 4 Department, did you do so in writing?</p> <p>5 MR LAU KAI HIM: In May, we had an inter-departmental 6 meeting together with the Transport Department. That 7 was on the next day after the TD came to the hearing 8 here. And we had a meeting, and we asked to be included 9 in the working group.</p> <p>10 The Administration's response is that, well, we have 11 certain members already, and they have not responded 12 directly as to whether we would be included. And they 13 have not mentioned anything about the practice note and 14 they have not consulted us.</p> <p>15 And as to the minutes of that meeting, we don't have 16 the minutes, as I said.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: So the request was not made in writing, it was 18 made at a meeting and was made orally; is that the 19 position?</p> <p>20 MR LAU KAI HIM: Yes. Correct.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Do you not have your own minutes of the meeting?</p> <p>22 MR LAU KAI HIM: Our colleagues had recorded the discussion, 23 but every time it is usually the Transport Department 24 who drafted the minutes. We have jotted down some notes 25 ourselves, but these are not formal meeting minutes.</p>

Page 161	Page 163
<p>1 But we have jotted down the salient points, and every 2 time the TD has special staff who worked on the minutes, 3 which would then be distributed to us. 4 CHAIRMAN: Perhaps you could provide us with what notes you 5 have got of the meeting. 6 MR LAU KAI HIM: Mr Chairman, I have to talk to the 7 colleagues and try to compile something, and then supply 8 it to the Chairman afterwards. Can that be done? 9 CHAIRMAN: If you would, that would help us. Thank you. 10 MR LAU KAI HIM: (In English) Thank you very much. Thank 11 you very much. 12 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Chairman, that will be all my 13 questioning. 14 CHAIRMAN: Well, gentlemen, that concludes the questions 15 that have been asked. Are there any concluding remarks 16 that you wish to make -- short remarks? You don't have 17 to, but if you wish to we will listen to them. 18 MR CHUNG CHUNG FAI: Chairman, the union would like to 19 emphasise this position. On the TD's guidelines on bus 20 captain working hours, the guidelines are not law, but 21 then they do sort of regulate or govern the bus 22 companies' operations. And they will also directly 23 affect our colleagues, because the stakeholders, our 24 colleagues are affected. 25 Now, on this special shift, so this special shift is</p>	<p>1 talking about the guidelines of the Transport 2 Department, and not on individual bus companies' way of 3 calculating the pay. According to the guidelines, the 4 bus companies can choose not to pay the bus captain 5 during the rest breaks. 6 CHAIRMAN: Mr Chung, the Transport Department's approach and 7 the guidelines don't address the issue of pay at all, do 8 they? Is that your complaint, that they should address 9 the issue of pay? 10 MR CHUNG CHUNG FAI: Yes, correct. 11 CHAIRMAN: So the Transport Department say, "Pay is a matter 12 between the bus companies and the bus drivers, not us." 13 That's their approach as we understand it. 14 MR CHUNG CHUNG FAI: Yes, correct. The guidelines are 15 compiled by the Transport Department. They should have 16 the responsibility. And also franchised bus services 17 are public services, and public interest is at stake. 18 If you don't handle the issues properly, all people of 19 Hong Kong would be affected. 20 Let me cite an example. 21 Back then, the government was launching 22 anti-corruption measures, so that public interest would 23 not be undermined. But then TD is being irresponsible, 24 it is trying to meet with the demands of the bus 25 companies, and it is disregarding our livelihood. And</p>
Page 162	Page 164
<p>1 still at 14 hours and driver fatigue is created. And 2 not only that, on the three consecutive hours of rest, 3 there is still no further guideline. I think we should 4 get paid for that as well. And the Transport Department 5 is being irresponsible by not specifying that. We spend 6 14 hours in our shift, but we don't get paid for 7 14 hours. 8 It says that a rest break of not less than three 9 consecutive hours. That means it can be more than three 10 hours, according to the guidelines. 11 Well, in accordance with the guidelines they can 12 give six consecutive hours of rest. So that means we 13 get paid only for eight hours. 14 Now, as we said, we get \$21.90 per hour. I think 15 the TD, Transport Department is very irresponsible. 16 (Chinese spoken) -- 17 CHAIRMAN: Just a moment, Mr Chung. 18 Ms Wong, have we not been told by Citybus that they 19 propose paying, when they introduce the special shift, 20 they propose paying not this allowance rate, but the 21 normal rate for working hours? 22 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, they do, in their submission. 23 CHAIRMAN: It is Kowloon Motor Bus that apparently are 24 paying a different rate. 25 MR CHUNG CHUNG FAI: I would like to supplement. I am</p>	<p>1 14 hours, well, we don't have enough rest breaks for 2 a 14-hour shift. 3 CHAIRMAN: We have your point now. 4 Mr Lau, was there something you wished to say on 5 that point? 6 MR LAU KAI HIM: Thank you, Chairman. 7 CHAIRMAN: A concluding remark. 8 MR LAU KAI HIM: (In English) Two minutes. Two minutes, 9 okay? 10 (Interpreted) Well, electricity, water supply, bus 11 services are all public services and public interest is 12 involved, I understand the Chief Executive appointed the 13 three gentlemen to serve in this Committee because 14 public interest is at stake, but then the TD is not 15 bearing public interest in mind. It is condoning 16 fatigued driving, it is allowing excessively low pay. 17 The Transport and Housing Bureau know about the 18 accounts of the bus companies, and they are actively 19 involved in the income and laws of the bus companies, 20 and if they want to have a fair hike the CE in Council's 21 approval has to be obtained. 22 And the TD is coming up with guidelines only on the 23 working hours and they are not, they are disregarding 24 the pay, and we work long hours with low pay, and we 25 have made suggestions to the TD on pay rise based on</p>

Page 165	I N D E X
1 very good grounds, and we can only provide good service	1 P A G E
2 if we have enough manpower, so everything is related.	2
3 If you just focus on working hours and you don't say	3 EMPLOYEE OF KOWLOON MOTOR BUS1
4 anything about pay, low pay, then that's no good.	COMPANY (1933) LIMITED:
5 Because it is all related to safety.	4 MS DEBBY WONG
6 We can only provide good service if we have enough	5 EXAMINATION BY MS WONG2
7 bus captains, and if we get paid reasonably, then we	6 QUESTIONS FROM THE COMMITTEE33
8 would not have driver fatigue and we can drive safely.	7 EMPLOYEE OF KOWLOON MOTOR BUS35
9 We regard it as a responsibility. This is not	COMPANY (1933) LIMITED:
10 a job, so to speak. But the bus companies regard it as	8 MR KELVIN YEUNG
11 a kind of job, and don't see it as a trade coming with	9 EXAMINATION BY MS WONG40
12 great responsibility.	10 FORMER EMPLOYEE OF KOWLOON MOTOR BUS103
13 That's all I want to say. Thank you, Chairman.	COMPANY (1933) LIMITED:
14 CHAIRMAN: Thank you for your closing remarks, and thank you	11 MR RAYMOND CHENG
15 for abiding by your promise that it would take two	12 EXAMINATION BY MS WONG104
16 minutes.	13 REPRESENTATIVES OF THE FEDERATION OF123
17 These proceedings are now adjourned, and we will	BUS INDUSTRY TRADE UNIONS:
18 resume again -- I think it is on Tuesday, when we have	14 MR LEUNG KAM KEUNG, MR CHUNG
19 other evidence to receive.	CHUNG FAI, MR LAM KAM PIU,
20 Thank you, gentlemen, for attending, and we	15 MR LAU KAI HIM, MR HUI HON
21 apologise for the inconvenience and having to ask you to	KIT, MR KWOK WAI KWONG
22 come back. Thank you for being patient and waiting	16
23 until we could reach you. But we are now adjourned.	EXAMINATION BY MS WONG (continued)123
24 (5.40 pm)	17
25 (The hearing adjourned to Tuesday, 7 August 2018)	18
	19
	20
	21
	22
	23
	24
	25

Page 166	
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	