

Page 1	Page 3
<p>1 Tuesday, 31 July 2018</p> <p>2 (10.02 am)</p> <p>3 REPRESENTATIVES OF KMB EMPLOYEES UNION: MR KWOK CHI SHING,</p> <p>4 MR LEE KIN KEI, IVAN, AND MR WONG KIN WAI</p> <p>5 (Evidence given in Cantonese, transcription of the</p> <p>6 simultaneous interpretation)</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: Good morning, Mr Kwok, and your colleagues.</p> <p>8 We thank you and the other representatives of the</p> <p>9 Kowloon Motor Bus Employees Union for accepting our</p> <p>10 invitation, and attending today to give evidence.</p> <p>11 In the course of evidence, Ms Wong, Senior Counsel,</p> <p>12 counsel assisting the Committee, will ask you questions,</p> <p>13 and it is a matter for you which one of the three of you</p> <p>14 answers any particular question. But perhaps we could</p> <p>15 ask you, Mr Kwok, to defer to the others if you want the</p> <p>16 others to respond, identifying who it is you wish to</p> <p>17 respond.</p> <p>18 But at the outset I understand that you wish to make</p> <p>19 an opening statement, and we are ready to hear that now.</p> <p>20 Please begin with your opening statement.</p> <p>21 OPENING STATEMENT BY MR KWOK CHI SHING</p> <p>22 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Thank you, Committee. Thank you,</p> <p>23 Chairman. I thank the two members.</p> <p>24 We are glad that finally after a long time waiting</p> <p>25 we have the opportunity to come here to speak to you</p>	<p>1 services. This accounts for about 31 per cent of the</p> <p>2 total population using transportation. This is very</p> <p>3 important to our industry.</p> <p>4 I understand that the time given for unions to speak</p> <p>5 is quite short. We are important stakeholders. We are</p> <p>6 important parts in the industry. We play a very vital</p> <p>7 role in safety.</p> <p>8 There are a lot of issues we would like to cover.</p> <p>9 I have given one submission, and two supplementary</p> <p>10 submissions as per your request, covering a lot of</p> <p>11 different topics. However, these topics are only</p> <p>12 briefly touched in these submissions and supplementary</p> <p>13 statements. If we have ample time to discuss these</p> <p>14 issues, it will be conducive to the Committee reaching</p> <p>15 a conclusion. And the public would get a better</p> <p>16 understanding as well.</p> <p>17 I found that the hearing yesterday could only cover</p> <p>18 a few simple issues without going into details: on</p> <p>19 training, and understanding of the mechanics by bus</p> <p>20 captains, the teachings or lectures, whether bus</p> <p>21 captains are conversant with the functions and mechanics</p> <p>22 as well as control of the buses they drive. I think our</p> <p>23 views are neglected.</p> <p>24 You just ask us for a simple answer, whether to</p> <p>25 agree certain people's views, and to state our views.</p>
Page 2	Page 4
<p>1 about our voices from practitioners as well as bus</p> <p>2 captains.</p> <p>3 I would like to say that I would ask the Committee</p> <p>4 to give us ample time to reflect our views.</p> <p>5 I have been attending all the hearings. Most of the</p> <p>6 hearings are devoted on monitoring of bus captains as</p> <p>7 well as safety issues. I am aware of the statement.</p> <p>8 I don't expect to find the party to be blamed or to be</p> <p>9 responsible, and I do know that there will be</p> <p>10 discussions about safety, about training, I hope that</p> <p>11 you will take my views into account.</p> <p>12 I wonder if we can ask questions of the Chairman, or</p> <p>13 the Committee. Would you allow us to ask questions?</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: Well, you are here to give evidence. We are not</p> <p>15 here to give evidence. We are hear to listen, and we</p> <p>16 are more than happy to listen to what it is you have to</p> <p>17 say.</p> <p>18 What we are trying to find out are the circumstances</p> <p>19 that obtain in the operation of the franchised bus</p> <p>20 system, in order that we can make recommendations to the</p> <p>21 Chief Executive to enhance safety.</p> <p>22 So it is your evidence. We are not involved in the</p> <p>23 bus industry. We want to hear from you.</p> <p>24 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Well, yes, we are in the industry.</p> <p>25 Every day there are 4 million passengers using bus</p>	<p>1 I don't think that is in depth enough.</p> <p>2 The Committee will not be able to reach</p> <p>3 a comprehensive conclusion. I don't want to repeat what</p> <p>4 other people have said. Time is precious. We just want</p> <p>5 to talk about what we are concerned with, issues that</p> <p>6 are pertinent to public safety.</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: No doubt you have identified those issues in your</p> <p>8 written submissions. And that's the purpose of asking</p> <p>9 counsel to now ask you questions on the matters that you</p> <p>10 have identified.</p> <p>11 If there are supplements that you wish to make, as</p> <p>12 the questioning goes on, then please make them. But the</p> <p>13 whole purpose of inviting you to make written</p> <p>14 submissions was to give you the opportunity to tell us</p> <p>15 what it is you wanted to say. And the purpose of this</p> <p>16 oral evidence hearing is so that we can explore the</p> <p>17 matters that occur to us as relevant.</p> <p>18 MR KWOK CHI SHING: We have some questions -- we have</p> <p>19 prepared for some topics covering black box as well as</p> <p>20 safety operation of buses, but we have not submitted the</p> <p>21 information to the Committee yet.</p> <p>22 We have just finished compiling the information and</p> <p>23 we would like to give the same to you.</p> <p>24 So I ask for your indulgence for us to give you the</p> <p>25 information.</p>

Page 5	Page 7
<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Is there any reason why this was not submitted at 2 an earlier stage? We have been asking you, have we not, 3 since 28 March -- am I right, Ms Wong? 4 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. 5 CHAIRMAN: 28 March. It is 31 July now. 6 MR KWOK CHI SHING: We have to make preparations, we are not 7 experts. We realise that the Committee has asked 8 questions of the black box company. We have reviewed 9 the information given. We think that based on the 10 replies you have received we should give you our views, 11 I mean us as operators of buses. Is it the case that 12 you give us a black box and we know how to use it? 13 We have to show or teach our members how to handle 14 a lot of issues, say, for example, when they have been 15 assaulted, how they are going to deal with this 16 situation. Also, verbal exchange after an incident has 17 occurred. 18 CHAIRMAN: Mr Kwok. I think we are going to make more 19 progress if we begin by allowing Ms Wong to ask you 20 questions rather than receiving a lengthy oral 21 dissertation on matters that change, as you have just 22 done, from black boxes, to assaults. 23 Let's see what Ms Wong can make by way of progress, 24 and then we will hear from you in due course; do you 25 understand?</p>	<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: And they include full-time staff and 2 retired bus captains who continued to stay on to work as 3 bus captains. 4 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Yes, that's right. 5 MS MAGGIE WONG: And those 1,300 are all full-time staff? 6 MR KWOK CHI SHING: That's right. 7 MS MAGGIE WONG: And your submissions raised a few areas 8 and I will be focusing on different areas at different 9 times. And the first topic I would like to ask you is 10 concerning about the facilities or the safety aspect 11 which you mentioned with a lot of emphasis in your 12 submission. 13 If I may take you to TU-1A, Chinese at page 84. 14 English at page 90-3. 15 CHAIRMAN: What is the document? 16 MS MAGGIE WONG: This is the first submission -- 17 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 18 MS MAGGIE WONG: -- dated 23 April 2018. 19 Page 93 in English, and page 84 in Chinese. 20 Under 1, you stated that: 21 "In order to save repair cost, KMB has, since 2015, 22 inappropriately removed all defog heater installation 23 causing the front window panel to have serious fogging 24 issues under cold and wet weather ..." 25 And you provided photographs in annex 1, and we can</p>
<p>1 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Yes, thank you. Chairman. 2 I hope that, well, you will allow me to make 3 supplementary information afterwards. 4 EXAMINATION BY MS WONG 5 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you, Mr Kwok, and gentlemen, for 6 coming. 7 May I make a brief remark. We have received your 8 written submissions, all three of them. The Committee's 9 primary concern is set out in the terms of reference, 10 and that is to make recommendation which go to the issue 11 of safety-related matters of franchised buses. 12 So my questions will be focused on safety aspects 13 rather than other areas, or employment issues. 14 I hope you understand, those questions will be 15 focused on safety aspects. 16 May I start with your union, the composition of your 17 union. 18 Mr Kwok, your union was established, if I may invite 19 you to go to TU bundle, at page 112-9. It is only in 20 Chinese, but I will explain the composition. 21 Your union was established on 14 July 2015, correct? 22 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Yes. 23 MS MAGGIE WONG: And as of 15 June, 2018, the membership of 24 your union comprised of 1,400 people. 25 MR KWOK CHI SHING: That's right.</p>	<p>1 see that at page 91 in Chinese, and page 91-1 in 2 English. 3 And you stated in your submission that: 4 "It is especially dangerous when a bus is driving at 5 a fast speed if the bus captain cannot see the road 6 condition clearly. It affects the safety of driving and 7 the passengers." 8 Now, my first question is this: did you reflect, or 9 did your union reflect this to the bus company, KMB? 10 MR KWOK CHI SHING: We did. 11 MS MAGGIE WONG: When? 12 MR KWOK CHI SHING: We talked to the management of the 13 company. 14 MS MAGGIE WONG: When was this? 15 MR KWOK CHI SHING: I can't recollect the time. Because 16 there was no record. Verbally. 17 MS MAGGIE WONG: These photographs, can you tell us 18 approximately when did you take those photographs? 19 MR KWOK CHI SHING: At the middle of last year. WhatsApp 20 photographs taken by colleagues. And this problem has 21 persisted for a long time, and last year it was 22 particularly serious. Our members hoped that our union 23 would speak out for them, and so they sent us a lot of 24 photographs. 25 MS MAGGIE WONG: When you say you verbally reflected this to</p>

Page 9	Page 11
<p>1 the bus company, did the company reply anything on this 2 issue? 3 MR KWOK CHI SHING: There was none. They tried to reject 4 our union as far as possible. If I speak to them in the 5 capacity of the chairman of the union, they would ask me 6 to speak to them in my capacity as an employee, the 7 general manager of the Kowloon Bay depot -- 8 MS MAGGIE WONG: And did you reflect or -- 9 CHAIRMAN: I'm sorry, had you finished your sentence there? 10 What about the general manager of the Kowloon Bay depot? 11 MR KWOK CHI SHING: He frequently stressed that I could only 12 speak in my personal capacity out of political 13 considerations. 14 CHAIRMAN: And what is the name -- 15 MR KWOK CHI SHING: And I -- it is not convenient for me to 16 speak in my capacity as chairman. 17 CHAIRMAN: What is the name of the gentleman who is the 18 general manager of the Kowloon Bay depot? 19 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Yeung Kwok Hung, general manager of the 20 Kowloon Bay depot. 21 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 22 MS MAGGIE WONG: Did the bus captains reflect this to the 23 maintenance staff of the company? 24 MR KWOK CHI SHING: They did. The maintenance staff had 25 a lot of views, but they dare not speak out. Usually</p>	<p>1 unacceptable. 2 CHAIRMAN: Do new vehicles have this device fitted? 3 MR KWOK CHI SHING: As at today, no. All new vehicle, not 4 fitted with this device. Because it was decided back 5 then that it would not be installed. And new vehicles 6 have yet to arrive, and it is promised that the device 7 would be fitted in new vehicles. But this is very 8 undesirable. What about the 9,900-odd buses? Some were 9 commissioned only last year or this year. So do we have 10 to wait until 17, 18 years? 11 So I think they are just trying to tell the public 12 that they are going to do it. Even if it is not 13 immediately, I think every year at the annual vehicle 14 examination the TD should ask them to retrofit that 15 device regardless of the cost. They should not wait for 16 these 17 years to pass. 17 Because originally there was such a device, it was 18 only removed by the company. It is about public safety, 19 and -- 20 CHAIRMAN: We have your point. 21 Yes, Ms Wong. 22 MS MAGGIE WONG: At page 90-5, in English, and at page 85 in 23 Chinese -- 24 CHAIRMAN: What is the point we are moving to now? 25 MS MAGGIE WONG: It is the Transport Department's reply to</p>
Page 10	Page 12
<p>1 I was the one who reflected these views. The 2 maintenance staff were unhappy too, but they could not 3 speak out because the company doesn't like that. 4 CHAIRMAN: What is the present position as far as these 5 defogging devices are concerned? 6 MR KWOK CHI SHING: With the establishment of this 7 Committee, we submitted a lot of documents and we were 8 interviewed by the press. The company told the public 9 and us that for new vehicles they would be installed 10 with this device. When we reflected this problem, we 11 were interviewed by independent media, and also 12 a professor was interviewed, as I mentioned in my 13 submission. The professor confirmed that defog heater 14 installation is most effective, and then the reply from 15 the Transport Department was it was not a necessary 16 installation. Only 90 per cent of the buses were fitted 17 with this device, that is KMB is the only exception. 18 KMB did not have this installation for us, hinders 19 the safety of passengers. It did away with this 20 installation to save maintenance cost. The bus company 21 is of the view that there aren't too many days with this 22 problem, and so bus captains are asked to wipe it 23 themselves. How can they do it when they are on 24 a highway? They can only do so when the bus stops in 25 front of a traffic signal. So the reply is</p>	<p>1 this defog device. 2 CHAIRMAN: Yes. 3 MS MAGGIE WONG: You stated in your first submission that: 4 "The Transport Department shall not approve KMB to 5 remove defog heater which affects the safety of driving, 6 and it is possible to adversely affect other road users. 7 (The Union) received complaints from many bus captains 8 and confirmed this is true. It is strongly recommended 9 that the Transport Department directs the bus company to 10 re-install the defog heater." 11 So my question is: was the Transport Department 12 aware of the removal of the defog heater? 13 CHAIRMAN: Before you answer that question, you told us 14 a moment ago that Transport Department said that this 15 was not a necessary device. Is that the Transport 16 Department's position? 17 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Because independent media was concerned 18 about this, and it saw interviews of me, and then to be 19 fair it interviewed a professor. 20 CHAIRMAN: You told us about that. 21 Did the Transport Department make a decision that it 22 was not necessary to install this device? That's what 23 you told us. Is that correct? 24 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Yes. Yes. 25 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p>

Page 13	Page 15
<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: And did you write to the Transport 2 Department to complain about this defogging device? Did 3 your union write to the Transport Department, 4 complaining about this absence. 5 MR KWOK CHI SHING: We didn't. We didn't. 6 MS MAGGIE WONG: If I may go to the next issue which relates 7 to the gear button installation. 8 At page 84 of your submission, and English at 9 page 90-3, also under section 1, you stated that: 10 "... the company altered the gear buttons installing 11 for safety driving, cancelled the O/D gear button and 12 manual retarder installations and relies only on 13 computer-controlled singular automatic D-gear to control 14 vehicle speed ... Under [emergency] situation it is very 15 dangerous for there to be no saving devices for the bus 16 captain to use." 17 You have shown this in your annexure at page 92, and 18 in Chinese at page 92-1. 19 To complete this point, you further stated at 20 page 90-5 that the hot weather: 21 "... the temperature within the bus machinery, is 22 even higher), has affected the computer-controlled 23 mechanism or system, and therefore immediate commands to 24 activate the brake system cannot be made (deviated from 25 the bus captain's judgments). Therefore the bus</p>	<p>1 the manual retarder affect bus safety? Could you 2 address that question. 3 MR IVAN LEE: In the system, there is a device that allows 4 you to select. It includes a manual selection, 5 automatic selection, and a third one is a combination of 6 manual and automatic control. 7 First, the retarder. There is this function. There 8 are four segments and a lever to control this system. 9 You don't have to use a pedal, you don't have to use the 10 brake system. 11 Mr Lai explained yesterday, said that when you 12 stepped on the pedal, it is automatic. 13 And here it says that when it is affected by high 14 temperature it is about the brake system. Well, when 15 there is friction it generates heat and the temperature 16 will rise. If there is a manual control that means the 17 bus captain can control the retarder from 1 to 4, from 18 mild control to a heavier control. This will control 19 the gear box to secure the torque, thereby securing safe 20 control of the brake system. 21 However, for single or double-decker buses, I don't 22 see many of them with this function. Very few for 23 double-decker buses. There are no selection buttons; 24 only a pedal that is used to activate the retarder. 25 If there is a stick or a lever, as an additional</p>
Page 14	Page 16
<p>1 captains felt that the bus has no brake system to stop 2 the bus, and told the police that if the bus has no 3 brake, it should be inspected (it actually cannot be 4 detected!) because after the bus is cooled down the next 5 day, the computer system will return to normal." 6 Can I ask you this. From your review, or from your 7 union members' review, how does the removal of manual 8 retarder installation affect bus safety? 9 MR KWOK CHI SHING: In that regard, I would like to defer to 10 Mr Lee who is more familiar with it. 11 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr Lee. 12 MR IVAN LEE: Thank you. First, let me introduce myself. 13 Just my brief CV. I have been driving large vehicles 14 for about 20 years, and tractor/trailer vehicles, 15 single-decker buses, double-decker buses, automatic 16 transmission, manual transmission, coaches, modern 17 vehicles. Currently I am an employee of KMB. I have 18 been driving double-decker buses for six years. 19 Well, when it comes to training, the instructors 20 would only train the trainees on requirements of one of 21 their respective bus companies. And I don't think that 22 training on safety is sufficient. 23 CHAIRMAN: No. Mr Lee, you have been asked to deal with 24 a specific question, not to make a speech. 25 The specific question was: how does the removal of</p>	<p>1 device, well, I'm sure that drivers are very familiar 2 with it. However, when it comes to public bus training, 3 instructors don't give trainees this kind of training. 4 They only teach them to use the brake by applying 5 different level of forces, what is a mild force, what is 6 a heavier force. 7 So when bus captains want to stop the bus, they 8 would just step on the pedal and use the brake pad to 9 stop the bus. 10 So the system will not be fully utilised to halt the 11 bus. You step on the pedal to activate the brake system 12 to stop the bus. I think the force you use is about 13 a level 3 or 4, but if you use the same level on the 14 manual system it is rather heavy. If you can use the 15 manual system you use level 1 or 2 force, then it is 16 very mild and the bus will come to a steady stop. 17 So if there is a space of half a bus or even 18 shorter, you can't just step on the pedal to bring the 19 vehicle to a halt. All you can do is just watch the bus 20 ram into the car in front of you. I do think there is 21 inadequacy when it comes to this system on public buses, 22 and the Transport Department is aware of that. 23 When it comes to vehicle examination and licensing, 24 it covers coaches. You drive the coach in for the 25 examination, so they are fully aware of this system.</p>

Page 17	Page 19
<p>1 You must know that public bus carry a lot of</p> <p>2 passengers. However, it seems that --</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: Before you go on. Does it come to this, that the</p> <p>4 absence of a manual retarder removes from the bus driver</p> <p>5 a choice of how to retard the vehicle, and therefore it</p> <p>6 would be better to have it? Is that what it comes to?</p> <p>7 MR IVAN LEE: You can put it this way.</p> <p>8 I will defer to Mr Kwok.</p> <p>9 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Let me answer. Manual retarder is very</p> <p>10 important, especially when it comes to going downhill.</p> <p>11 The Tai Po District Council and Ms Wong said that</p> <p>12 she has heard from coach drivers saying that they drive</p> <p>13 the coach at 70km/ph to the top of the hill and then go</p> <p>14 downhill from there, it is difficult for them to slow</p> <p>15 the car down to 50km/ph.</p> <p>16 I believe the reason is that perhaps the vehicle is</p> <p>17 rather old, so they rely only on the exhaust retarder</p> <p>18 which is not as effective. If you reach 70km/ph at the</p> <p>19 top of the hill, if there is manual retarder and you use</p> <p>20 it, three to four seconds later then the speed will be</p> <p>21 reduced to 30 to 40 without using the brake.</p> <p>22 This is very effective to reduce speed when you are</p> <p>23 travelling downhill.</p> <p>24 In the past, the KMB will offer once every two or</p> <p>25 three years advanced driving courses. Bus captains will</p>	<p>1 15 June 2018.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: Yes.</p> <p>3 MS MAGGIE WONG: And the Chinese is at page 112-19, in</p> <p>4 English, 112-97. It is the third submission. If I may</p> <p>5 go to --</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: So it is not the 15 June one. It is 25 July.</p> <p>7 MS MAGGIE WONG: 25 July 2018. It is page 112-97 in Chinese</p> <p>8 and --</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Yes.</p> <p>10 MS MAGGIE WONG: -- 112-99 in English.</p> <p>11 There are two matters I would like to raise with</p> <p>12 you. It is the use of surveillance cameras at</p> <p>13 page 112-97 at the top.</p> <p>14 You made the point that -- under point 3, you made</p> <p>15 the point that you support use of surveillance camera to</p> <p>16 detect illegal parking.</p> <p>17 Do I take it from your submission that in terms of</p> <p>18 surveillance cameras you supported the idea of</p> <p>19 installation of CCTV or surveillance camera within the</p> <p>20 driver's seat?</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: To monitor illegal parking or to --</p> <p>22 MS MAGGIE WONG: To monitor, first of all, to monitor</p> <p>23 illegal parking.</p> <p>24 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Do we answer? Well, to monitor illegal</p> <p>25 parking, yes, that is feasible. I hope that it would be</p>
Page 18	Page 20
<p>1 have to practise on uphill and downhill sections of</p> <p>2 Tai Po Road. It was an old model of buses, and there</p> <p>3 was -- those without air conditioning, and it came with</p> <p>4 just certain gear, say, gear 1, gear 2, and drive.</p> <p>5 Without manual retarders we would use this system by</p> <p>6 controlling the gear instead of relying solely on the</p> <p>7 brake. Because if you use the brake and you want to</p> <p>8 reduce speed, then there is serious friction on the</p> <p>9 brake pad. There will be heat generated. I think in</p> <p>10 the most dangerous situation the braking system will be</p> <p>11 reduced in effectiveness by about 20 to 30 per cent.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Mr Kwok, forgive me for interrupting. But your</p> <p>13 point is very simple. This is a method of reducing the</p> <p>14 speed of a vehicle, particularly going downhill, without</p> <p>15 having to use the brakes, or having to use the brakes in</p> <p>16 a harsh way. That's the point, isn't it?</p> <p>17 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Yes. You only have to touch slightly on</p> <p>18 the brake pedal. So it is safe for everyone.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. We have your point.</p> <p>20 Ms Wong.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: And if I may move on to the second</p> <p>22 submission that you made.</p> <p>23 You make reference to --</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: What is the date of that?</p> <p>25 MS MAGGIE WONG: The second submission is dated</p>	<p>1 installed at the front of the vehicle. That I support.</p> <p>2 Because we need to collect evidence, for everything. So</p> <p>3 that has to be done.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on. Is this kind of camera not</p> <p>5 installed in many KMB buses already?</p> <p>6 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Still half of the buses don't have it.</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: But half do?</p> <p>8 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Yes. And sometimes for some reasons the</p> <p>9 company said that footage is not captured, so there</p> <p>10 needed to be some enhancements. The effectiveness of</p> <p>11 the device should be enhanced.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: As far as the involvement of the bus captains is</p> <p>13 concerned with this issue, do you support their</p> <p>14 involvement in perhaps pressing a button which would</p> <p>15 flag the fact that this point in time is the one to</p> <p>16 examine the CCTV to find evidence of the illegal</p> <p>17 parking?</p> <p>18 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Yes, it is a very good idea. I support</p> <p>19 that.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>21 Yes, Ms Wong.</p> <p>22 MS MAGGIE WONG: At page 112-97, paragraph (4.1), and in</p> <p>23 English, page 112-100, you stated there that:</p> <p>24 "It is necessary to pass the relevant regulations by</p> <p>25 legislation. Otherwise, no one will abide by the rules.</p>

Page 21	Page 23
<p>1 Even in the past, some employee of KMB ... requested in 2 a report a video clip recorded by a bus camera for the 3 purpose of complaining another driver's careless 4 driving, which, however, was rejected by the then 5 general manager of Kowloon Bay depot ... and if the 6 employee really wanted to get it, he had to pay 7 administrative fee of \$5,000 (only \$600 required by New 8 World Bus and Citybus). It was obvious that the general 9 manager was deliberately refusing the reasonable 10 request ..."</p> <p>11 I wanted to ask you this. What do you mean by it is 12 necessary to pass a relevant regulation by legislation? 13 To do what?</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, I don't understand why we are getting 15 involved in this.</p> <p>16 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes --</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: Because it is perfectly simple to ask for 18 a subpoena to require KMB to come to court to produce 19 the video tape.</p> <p>20 This is not relevant.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. Then why would the employee be 22 required to pay a fee in order to get the footage.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: I thought I just indicated what the proper route 24 is. The laws of Hong Kong permit someone who is 25 a defendant in a criminal trial to require this kind of</p>	<p>1 speeding, perhaps there should be a reminder or an alert 2 at 68. Why should it be that?</p> <p>3 So after February and March, a staff member was 4 disciplined for driving at 83 kilometres per hour. So 5 the threshold for asking the bus captain to stop is 6 a problem.</p> <p>7 And earlier this year there was a case of a tram 8 overturning. According to press reports, the tram 9 company asked their drivers to drive fast, or quickly. 10 So this threshold of 75 allows a bus to speed.</p> <p>11 Actually, it is all for buses to speed and at Tuen Mun 12 Highway, for instance, it can reach 100 kilometres per 13 hour. This is irresponsible. And when there is an 14 incident the bus captain is held accountable. And he 15 has to shoulder all legal responsibility.</p> <p>16 Now, a bus captain only earns \$10,000-odd; for the 17 management, tens of thousands of dollars. So in fact 18 there should be an earlier warning. And how come the 19 speed has reached 83/85, and there is no alert? The 20 threshold required by the company is very low.</p> <p>21 I have heard many hearings of this Committee, and 22 some was 1.3 and 2.3, and the tilting angle 44 degrees. 23 By that the bus can roll over. So it is impossible that 24 the thresholds be set at those levels.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Mr Kwok, it is perfectly obvious, is it not, that</p>
Page 22	Page 24
<p>1 evidence to be produced.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: Then I'll move on.</p> <p>3 In relation to the black box, you mentioned at the 4 bottom, second last paragraph, at page 112-97, and at 5 page 112-101, that the installation of black box has 6 been installed for many years, but you stated that the 7 black box functions have not been properly used.</p> <p>8 Can you elaborate on this?</p> <p>9 MR KWOK CHI SHING: First, the Committee asked the German 10 contractor of the black box, there can be a lot of data 11 inside the black box. It has been many years. The 12 Transport Department was not insincere in requiring the 13 installation of black box, because after the accident in 14 2013 in Tuen Mun, it was under pressure, and the bus 15 company was required to install the black box. For 16 whatever reasons, perhaps to protect itself legally, the 17 company would not want any of the data.</p> <p>18 At the Committee hearing -- now, the speed limit is 19 75, and the acceleration and deceleration mean is 2.3 20 plus a negative 2.3, and the gradient 44, or the tilting 21 angle 44 degrees.</p> <p>22 Can I supplement on this point, Chairman?</p> <p>23 Now, the mean, well, the company has been forcing 24 bus captains to speed. If the speed limit is 25 70 kilometres per hour, to prevent the bus captain from</p>	<p>1 in setting the tilt angle at 44 degrees, all that was 2 being done was it was being disabled? It was not 3 intended to operate as an alert, was it, because the bus 4 was falling over?</p> <p>5 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Well, if it is disabled, then it will 6 roll over. Take motor cycles as an example, if the 7 torque is sufficient, then the motor cycle can be 8 upright again. But it can also roll over when it is 9 disabled. Because there is no force to upright it 10 again.</p> <p>11 So for people who don't know how to drive, may think 12 that it is correct. But when it is disabled it will 13 roll over. When there is a torque, then it will be 14 upright again.</p> <p>15 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Kwok, sorry to interrupt again.</p> <p>16 So can I summarise, the point that the black box has 17 not maximised its capability, is: first, speed, second, 18 the braking system, and the third, stability control; is 19 that it?</p> <p>20 Can you first of all answer whether I have 21 summarised correctly?</p> <p>22 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Well, the black box should store certain 23 data, so that when there is an incident, the driving 24 attitude of the bus captain, should there be any 25 breaking of rules, we can rectify it as soon as</p>

Page 25	Page 27
<p>1 possible, and it can be of use in investigation. We 2 have listed out all the data that should be included in 3 the black box and the thresholds. For instance, the 4 voltage of electronic devices and anti-slip device of 5 the wheels, of the tyres, and also the pressure, and 6 also the sections of the deceleration.</p> <p>7 And the fourth is the figures of the gear, that is 8 the gear being used, and also the revolution, the speed. 9 And the sixth is electronic hanging system, and that is 10 the suspension system. In the past, it was the use of 11 steel plates for shock absorber. Now it is by means of 12 a suspension system.</p> <p>13 The pressure of the suspension system and the tilt 14 angle of the vehicle, whether the pressure was 15 sufficient, if it isn't, then the vehicle will tilt. 16 And whether, after tilting, the figure will 17 automatically make the vehicle upright again, and the 18 independent gas compressor, the figure of the pump, and 19 also the figures for, data for acceleration and 20 deceleration.</p> <p>21 And nine, the total weight of the vehicle. If the 22 black box is functioning normally, all this data can be 23 found, and it is not expensive to require such 24 functions, it is just that the company doesn't want such 25 data to be available. Because if such data are</p>	<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Mr Kwok. You heard the evidence from the Czech 2 Republic of the electronics engineer about how GPS is 3 merely one of a number of systems that allows the 4 position of the bus to be calculated at any one time.</p> <p>5 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Yes. That's what is said. But I think 6 it is not possible in Hong Kong. Maybe in the rural 7 areas, but in the urban areas I don't think it can be 8 accurate.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Mr Kwok, with all due respect, you are not an 10 electronics engineer, are you? We will hear from you 11 about buses and driving of buses, but we will listen to 12 our engineers when it comes to that issue.</p> <p>13 Ms Wong, yes.</p> <p>14 MS MAGGIE WONG: If I may go to the TD-1 bundle, at 15 page 403.</p> <p>16 It is the briefing paper of the LegCo on transport, 17 on enhancement of safety of franchised buses 18 in July 2018.</p> <p>19 TD-1, page 403, and in Chinese at page 416.</p> <p>20 May I ask your views about whether your union 21 supports the use of some of these devices.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: Before we get to that -- do you understand, 23 Mr Kwok, how this paper came about?</p> <p>24 MR KWOK CHI SHING: I have not heard of this paper.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Let me explain to you the evidence that we have</p>
Page 26	Page 28
<p>1 available people may be able to tell that maintenance is 2 not done properly.</p> <p>3 And because the Transport Department hasn't asked 4 for it the company will not do so. They don't want to 5 be caught.</p> <p>6 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, Mr Kwok, about this black box, you 7 earlier mentioned the driving attitude, it can detect 8 the driving attitude of bus captains.</p> <p>9 Does your union support the real-time monitoring of 10 the driving behaviour of bus captains? Real-time 11 monitoring.</p> <p>12 MR KWOK CHI SHING: In principle it is good. We use 13 technology to assist the bus companies, and to assist 14 safety, but are the data correct, or accurate? There is 15 ISO 39001, GPS, and lots of functions, but is the 16 technology mature enough to be used in Hong Kong? As 17 far as I know, it is not very accurate. Take satellite 18 GPS, as an example. When we are in Mong Kok it cannot 19 be accurate, or detected. Because there are too many 20 high rises in Hong Kong, satellite signals are not well 21 received.</p> <p>22 The Committee or members of the public may say that 23 a certain kind of technology is good, but is it mature 24 enough? I am of the view that more experimentation 25 should be carried out.</p>	<p>1 received.</p> <p>2 The Transport Department in the middle of March 3 convened a group made up of the franchised bus 4 operators, three bus manufacturers, and the Transport 5 Department, and they addressed a number of issues.</p> <p>6 One was the issue of the training of bus captains, 7 the other was the deployment or installation of 8 technological safety devices on bus, and the third was 9 the issue of seat belts.</p> <p>10 That committee met a number of times, and at the end 11 of July, 20 July, it published recommendations which 12 were encapsulated in this briefing paper to LegCo. Do 13 you understand?</p> <p>14 MR KWOK CHI SHING: I understand.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: Are we to understand this as well, that at no 16 stage was your union asked to make any representations 17 to this working group?</p> <p>18 MR KWOK CHI SHING: (Chinese channel playing to the floor)</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Ms Wong.</p> <p>20 MS MAGGIE WONG: May I ask in that context whether you 21 support the use of some of this in-vehicle --</p> <p>22 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Well, Chairman, what you said, the 23 answer is yes, that's correct.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: So no representations, never asked to make any 25 representations? That's correct?</p>

Page 29	Page 31
<p>1 MR KWOK CHI SHING: They perhaps don't have much confidence 2 of our union.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: Whether they had confidence in you or not, they 4 didn't ask you for your help. Can you confirm that?</p> <p>5 MR KWOK CHI SHING: That is correct. If we send them 6 letters they won't reply to us.</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: Ms Wong.</p> <p>8 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, and the first device I'm going to ask 9 is the electronic stability control in 4(a). Have you 10 heard about this device before?</p> <p>11 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Well, we only noticed this device after 12 the hearing started.</p> <p>13 MS MAGGIE WONG: Does your union support the use of this 14 device?</p> <p>15 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Yes, we do. We can't avoid using 16 technology. If there are problems in its use we would 17 reflect our views to ask for improvement, and we will 18 continue to do that.</p> <p>19 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can we go to 4(b). The retarder, the speed 20 limiting regard. It is a retarder to cap the maximum 21 speed of the speed limiters on downhill, and it is meant 22 to enhance the speed limiter with a retarder to slow 23 down a bus when the speed is over 70km per hour under the 24 downhill situation. Do you support this device? Does 25 your union support the use of this device?</p>	<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, can we go to 6(a), the bus monitoring 2 and control system. In brief, it is -- they rely on the 3 use of the GPS system, or positioning technologies. And 4 the system will --</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: I think that doesn't represent the position 6 accurately.</p> <p>7 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes --</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: It says "GPS or" -- and perhaps it ought to say 9 "and other positioning technologies".</p> <p>10 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. And other positioning technologies, 11 and I'm reading from the document. Under 6(a), and the 12 system will match the legal speed limit at the actual 13 bus location. The real-time speed limit information can 14 then be used to control the enhanced speed limiter, ie 15 speed limiter with two speed ratings, in other words, 16 the bus speed could be controlled or limited within the 17 applicable speed limits depending on the road section.</p> <p>18 So Mr Kwok, does your union support the use of this 19 device?</p> <p>20 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Yes, I do.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: What about 6(b), collision alert and lane 22 keeping device?</p> <p>23 MR KWOK CHI SHING: In this regard, well, I think the 24 technology is not matured enough. If they are 25 installed, and when buses pull into bus stops one by</p>
Page 30	Page 32
<p>1 MR KWOK CHI SHING: I haven't looked into this device, but 2 I would like to say that, well, for the speed to be 3 reduced that means you do not accelerate, and you are 4 running to neutral, and that is quite dangerous, if you 5 are travelling on neutral gear. That's why we emphasise 6 that there needs to be a manual system as an assistance, 7 because you only stop the injection of fuel, and for 8 a few seconds you may be running on neutral, and you 9 will lose momentum, and that is dangerous, because 10 without further injection of fuel there won't be any 11 torque, and you can't -- well, by injecting -- allowing 12 injection of fuel to control the vehicle. So you are 13 running on neutral gear, you can't effectively slow the 14 car down. When it comes to manual retarder, it is not 15 something new.</p> <p>16 It has always been there for heavy duty vehicles, 17 say, for example, coaches, they are all installed with 18 this. It is just because the Transport Department, 19 tailor made this requirement for bus operators, because 20 it would dispense with maintenance. They thought --</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Mr Kwok, you obviously find it difficult to 22 accept this, but we understand your view about the 23 manual retarder. We have got that point, and there is 24 no need to keep repeating it. 25 Yes, Ms Wong.</p>	<p>1 one, as you see the design is that they will be very 2 close together. With this device, that means the alert 3 will go off all the time. And for the lane keeping 4 device, well buses are large in size. We travel in 5 urban areas or when we pull in a bus stop, there may be 6 some obstructions, say for example a cart, or another 7 car parked there. So we would be straddling on two 8 lanes. Sometimes we would be turning, and we would go 9 into the next lane.</p> <p>10 Very often, we can't just travel within the space of 11 the lane, sometimes we would be going slightly over the 12 other one.</p> <p>13 For the Mobileye, it is only forward looking. 14 Unless the technology evolves to the extent that it will 15 have a 360 degrees view, I don't consider that to be 16 suitable.</p> <p>17 MS MAGGIE WONG: 6(c), driver monitoring device to monitor 18 the driver --</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: I'm sorry, you were talking over the translation, 20 so could you begin again with your question.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. 22 What about the driver monitoring device? 6(c).</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: You are talking about the drowsiness technology? 24 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, the drowsiness technology. 25 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Four buses of the KMB have had this</p>

Page 33	Page 35
<p>1 installed. Bus captains don't support it. Because the 2 camera would be pointing to their faces all the time, 3 and it would put pressure on them.</p> <p>4 Another thing is that if you install this, you will 5 have to reduce the working hours of drivers, otherwise 6 I can tell you that 90 per cent of bus drivers, might 7 just doze off from time to time, because they work very 8 long hours.</p> <p>9 So don't fool yourself by thinking that with this 10 device installed everything would be well and good. If 11 the company wants to penalise you --</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: I don't understand this, Mr Kwok. You are saying 13 that 90 per cent of drivers doze off -- is that what you 14 are saying? Because of long working hours?</p> <p>15 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Yes.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: Wouldn't it be a good idea, then, to have 17 a camera --</p> <p>18 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Well, that means they just may be close 19 their eyes for a bit. I won't try to fool you. Because 20 that is a fact.</p> <p>21 We have raised this issue a lot, it is because of 22 poor management. We have put forward an idea of taking 23 into account where you live. Say, for example, well, 24 you live in Tuen Mun and you work in Lai Chi Kok, and 25 there is only one company car, so you have to wake up</p>	<p>1 said here. We have received a submission from the 2 Transport Department where we have been told that the 3 practice note has been issued.</p> <p>4 The question for you, Mr Kwok, has your union been 5 provided with a copy of this practice note?</p> <p>6 MR KWOK CHI SHING: No, we have not.</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: Were you consulted at all in the review of how 8 training might be provided, monitored, and regulated?</p> <p>9 MR KWOK CHI SHING: No. Well, we have a lot of views.</p> <p>10 MS MAGGIE WONG: And if you look at paragraph 19, it sets 11 out the structure of the training arrangement for bus 12 captain under the practice note, irrespective of whether 13 they are full-time or part-time bus captain.</p> <p>14 It includes regular training, and special purpose 15 training. First of all, do you support this?</p> <p>16 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Yes, we do.</p> <p>17 MS MAGGIE WONG: And paragraph 20, it provides that the 18 regular training for the bus captains should also 19 include the following modules with relative weightings 20 to be covered -- set out in (a) to (e) -- including safe 21 driving and road safety, cognition of in-vehicle device, 22 handling of incident, customer service and knowledge of 23 company rules, traffic regulations, occupational health 24 and safety.</p> <p>25 Do you have any comments on the respective weighting</p>
Page 34	Page 36
<p>1 really earlier --</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: Mr Kwok, thank you.</p> <p>3 Yes, Ms Wong.</p> <p>4 MS MAGGIE WONG: And the next one is the installation of 5 seat belts on all buses on all seats.</p> <p>6 Does your union support this?</p> <p>7 MR KWOK CHI SHING: In order to reduce casualties and 8 fatalities in accidents, yes. Well, it would be like 9 coaches, where it is a 2-point safety belt, not 3-point 10 safety system.</p> <p>11 Yes, there will be inconvenience, because it will 12 take longer for passengers to alight because some 13 passengers might struggle a bit to take the seat belt 14 off.</p> <p>15 But so far, well, with so many risk factors, without 16 proper or perfect measures we support the 2-point safety 17 belt system.</p> <p>18 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. The last topic in this paper is 19 the training for franchised bus captain.</p> <p>20 If you go to paragraph 18, it states that:</p> <p>21 "The working group has agreed that the Transport 22 Department should promulgate a practice note on training 23 framework for franchised bus captain."</p> <p>24 Has your union been given a copy --</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: There are two steps to that. That is what is</p>	<p>1 of these modules?</p> <p>2 MR KWOK CHI SHING: I have some knowledge of the programme, 3 but you have to bear in mind that if you just tell bus 4 captains, they may not be able to grasp or understand 5 the information. In the past, when we were trained, 6 instructors told us the answers, so we all scored 100.</p> <p>7 And the information would be passed on to the 8 Transport Department, or senior management, and I think 9 the Committee can take a look. Everyone scored 100. So 10 it is not desirable.</p> <p>11 In fact, the training programme should provide 12 quantifying, quantitative figures, for instance our 13 speed is usually 50, at most 70, and you should tell 14 them how is it calculated.</p> <p>15 So one kilometre is 1,000 metres, so 70 kilometres 16 you multiply it by 1,000, it is 70,000, and you multiply 17 it by 60, and that is the speed per minute, and then you 18 divide by 60, and it is 19.5 metres per second. So you 19 can quantify.</p> <p>20 And they will understand the speed, because they 21 have an actual figure of -- by 70km/ph that means you 22 can travel 19.5 metres per second.</p> <p>23 If 60km/ph, that is 16.6 metres per second, and 50 24 is 13 metres per second, 40 metres, 11.1 metres per 25 second, so on and so forth.</p>

Page 37	Page 39
<p>1 It will be easier for them to understand if you give 2 them figures. And you ask them to leave more room, then 3 in Hong Kong there should be a space of three to four 4 seconds between two vehicles.</p> <p>5 But you have to let them understand what is meant by 6 travelling speed. And in the past we were taught this 7 way. When you reach the first arrow, you have to remove 8 all fuel, and by the second arrow, well, if the phase is 9 not changed you can add a little fuel, and go through 10 the traffic signal.</p> <p>11 And even if the front wheel has exceeded the line to 12 stop, because we are buses, we have some room, we should 13 go ahead. But nowadays they are not taught this at 14 training.</p> <p>15 Passengers and the public do not understand. They 16 accuse buses of jumping the amber phase. In fact, it 17 was taught in the past, and you have a flash lights.</p> <p>18 Sometimes you have this habit.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Mr Kwok, thank you.</p> <p>20 Yes, Ms Wong.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: The next topic is working hours.</p> <p>22 Mr Kwok, in your submission, the first submission, 23 Chinese at page 88, TU-1A, and English at page 90-7, in 24 paragraph 5 you stated there that: 25 "... the reasonable maximum working hours per day</p>	<p>1 provision, is it not?</p> <p>2 MR KWOK CHI SHING: It is said so.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: Let me ask you these questions.</p> <p>4 Is the guideline, with a requirement of three hours 5 of a continuous break, implemented at all in KMB now?</p> <p>6 MR KWOK CHI SHING: There is no hard and fast rule. It 7 depends on the route. And for some you only have one 8 hour of meal.</p> <p>9 So 11 hours, driving hours, is maximised, sometimes 10 even over that. Because there is no hard and fast rule 11 according to TD.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Please concentrate on the question. Has KMB 13 begun to implement the reduced, or rather the 14 requirement for a continuous break of three hours in 15 special shifts where 14 hours on duty is permitted, but 16 there is a maximum of 10 hours driving. Has it begun to 17 implement that at all?</p> <p>18 MR KWOK CHI SHING: No. No, they don't have enough 19 manpower. It is 11 hours of driving. 10 hours of 20 driving is our suggestion.</p> <p>21 The maximum duty hours are 14 driving hours, and 11. 22 Then in between, 30 minutes.</p> <p>23 Next year, in the second quarter, after continuous 24 driving of six hours, there must be 40 minutes of rest. 25 Right now it is only 30 minutes.</p>
Page 38	Page 40
<p>1 shall be 12 hours, the maximum driving time shall be 2 10 hours."</p> <p>3 May I ask you your view, or your union's view about 4 split shift, with maximum of working hours, maximum 14 5 working hours?</p> <p>6 MR KWOK CHI SHING: You want me to comment on this issue?</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: We want you to give us your opinion, that is the 8 union's opinion on the split shift guidelines. 14 hours 9 maximum duty, 10 hours maximum driving, three hours' 10 continuous break. What is your view?</p> <p>11 MR KWOK CHI SHING: According to the current guidelines the 12 maximum driving hours is 11. So the committee has been 13 talking about three hours of rest, and 10 hours of 14 driving. It will only happen in the second quarter of 15 next year. In 2010, the guideline was 14 hours maximum 16 and maximum working hours 11, and there is no guideline 17 on the minimum hours of rest in between.</p> <p>18 And the new guideline will only be implemented in 19 the second quarter of next year.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: That's why --</p> <p>21 MR KWOK CHI SHING: And many of us will only have two hours 22 or so of rest including meals, and then in the second 23 quarter of next year there is a window.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: Mr Kwok, the second quarter of next year is when 25 these guidelines will be fully implemented. That's the</p>	<p>1 KMB has not implemented this rest of three hours in 2 between. For some, maybe two hours or so. We have 3 a colleague here, driving special shift duties, and he 4 has sent e-mail to the Committee. Perhaps he has sent 5 it to the wrong address. It was not received by the 6 Committee. He talked to us yesterday.</p> <p>7 And he is on monthly salary. He is just sitting 8 next to me, and if the Committee permits, he will spend 9 some time to tell you his views.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: Is that Mr Wong?</p> <p>11 Yes, Mr Wong, did you drive a special shift this 12 week?</p> <p>13 MR WONG KIN WAI: I am on sick leave after injury at work. 14 I have been driving there for one year.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: When did you last drive a special shift?</p> <p>16 MR WONG KIN WAI: 26 June.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: And can you recall, if you are able to, what your 18 day was that day? What time you left home, what time 19 you started duty, what time you took your break, where 20 you took your break?</p> <p>21 MR WONG KIN WAI: I woke up at 6.15. I left home at 6.30, 22 and I travelled to work at Mei Foo. I took two company 23 cars. At 7.35 I clocked in.</p> <p>24 I drove -- I started at 11.40 to Olympic, and there 25 was one hour for a meal, and then the break in between</p>

Page 41	Page 43
<p>1 two hours 47-minutes. I drove again at 15.50.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: Mr Wong, we are not in a hurry. Take your time</p> <p>3 to describe this.</p> <p>4 Where do you live?</p> <p>5 MR WONG KIN WAI: Kwai Shing West Estate.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: And you left Kwai Shing West Estate at 6.30 that</p> <p>7 morning?</p> <p>8 MR WONG KIN WAI: Yes.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: And you went to Mei Foo?</p> <p>10 MR WONG KIN WAI: Yes.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: How did you travel?</p> <p>12 MR WONG KIN WAI: Bus number 37.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: As a passenger?</p> <p>14 MR WONG KIN WAI: Yes.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: And when you got to Mei Foo what did you do?</p> <p>16 MR WONG KIN WAI: I boarded an engineering car to arrive at</p> <p>17 Stonecutters Island bus depot.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: So this is a KMB car, is it?</p> <p>19 MR WONG KIN WAI: Yes.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Car, not bus?</p> <p>21 MR WONG KIN WAI: A coach. A coach of 60 seats.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: With fellow bus captains?</p> <p>23 MR WONG KIN WAI: Yes.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: So from Mei Foo, with your fellow bus captains</p> <p>25 you went to Stonecutters Island?</p>	<p>1 and then the first departure was at 8 am.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: So you had to take the bus from the bus depot to</p> <p>3 Kwai Shing East, and what is the status of that place,</p> <p>4 is that a terminus?</p> <p>5 MR WONG KIN WAI: Yes, it is a bus terminus at Kwai Shing</p> <p>6 West Estate.</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: West?</p> <p>8 MR WONG KIN WAI: Yes.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. And you began driving a route on that</p> <p>10 bus at around 8 o'clock that morning?</p> <p>11 MR WONG KIN WAI: Yes. 8 am is the first departure.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: What was the route number?</p> <p>13 MR WONG KIN WAI: 37.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: What is the destination, the ultimate destination</p> <p>15 that that route goes to?</p> <p>16 MR WONG KIN WAI: Olympic MTR station.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: Carry on. Describe your day.</p> <p>18 MR WONG KIN WAI: Since I work for the special shift on peak</p> <p>19 licence, then I would put on the C licence, that is no</p> <p>20 passenger to go to Kwai Shing West, until 9.31, all the</p> <p>21 way until 11.40, which is the last trip, driving to</p> <p>22 Olympic station, then I would finish my morning session,</p> <p>23 that would be about 12.45.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: Where were you when you finished the morning</p> <p>25 session?</p>
Page 42	Page 44
<p>1 MR WONG KIN WAI: Yes.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: What time did you get there?</p> <p>3 MR WONG KIN WAI: Around 7.20 am.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: And what facilities are there, at Stonecutters?</p> <p>5 MR WONG KIN WAI: It is a KMB bus depot.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: And having arrived there, did you clock in, as</p> <p>7 you called it?</p> <p>8 MR WONG KIN WAI: Yes.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: How do you clock in?</p> <p>10 MR WONG KIN WAI: Use an Octopus card on a computer system,</p> <p>11 and then I will have a roster for the day. I have a job</p> <p>12 sheet for the day.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: You use your Octopus card, so you are</p> <p>14 electronically clocked in at 7.35 in the morning?</p> <p>15 MR WONG KIN WAI: Yes.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: What happens next?</p> <p>17 MR WONG KIN WAI: I had the licence number of the bus I was</p> <p>18 supposed to drive, I went to the car park to find it,</p> <p>19 and then I drove it to the bus terminus.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: What time did you leave Stonecutters bus depot.</p> <p>21 MR WONG KIN WAI: 8.35.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: Between clocking in at 7.35 and leaving the bus</p> <p>23 depot at 8.35, what duties did you perform?</p> <p>24 MR WONG KIN WAI: I left Stonecutters Island depot at 7.35,</p> <p>25 I drove to the bus terminus of Kwai Shing East Estate</p>	<p>1 MR WONG KIN WAI: The vehicle will have to be put on a stop</p> <p>2 service sign, have to drive it to Kwai Shing East Estate</p> <p>3 to leave it there.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: Is that a bus terminus?</p> <p>5 MR WONG KIN WAI: Well, it is kind of. It is for bus</p> <p>6 captains to take their meal break, and before the next</p> <p>7 driver comes to take the bus, we can leave the bus</p> <p>8 there.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: So what time did you arrive at Kwai Shing East</p> <p>10 Estate?</p> <p>11 MR WONG KIN WAI: About 12.45.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: So what time had you finished driving the route</p> <p>13 37 route?</p> <p>14 MR WONG KIN WAI: Normally it will be 12.40, driving for one</p> <p>15 hour, which is the journey time, and then I have to add</p> <p>16 one hour, which is my meal break. So normally, it will</p> <p>17 take me to eight minutes past 2, including the meal</p> <p>18 break.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Where did you have the meal break that day?</p> <p>20 MR WONG KIN WAI: Kwai Shing East Estate.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: And are there rest facilities there? KMB bus</p> <p>22 rest facilities?</p> <p>23 MR WONG KIN WAI: Previously yes. Because of the Housing</p> <p>24 Authority problems they are removed. Recently I walked</p> <p>25 past, I see another facility installed. I think it was</p>

Page 45	Page 47
<p>1 some time last week or so.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: On 28 June, were there any rest facilities at</p> <p>3 Kwai Shing East Estate?</p> <p>4 MR WONG KIN WAI: I don't really know.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: Well, where did you have your meal?</p> <p>6 MR WONG KIN WAI: Shopping mall in Kwai Shing East Estate.</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: What did you do with the rest of the break time?</p> <p>8 MR WONG KIN WAI: I would take transportation to Kwai Shing</p> <p>9 West Estate to the terminus and rest at the rest</p> <p>10 facilities there.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: What transport did you take to do that?</p> <p>12 MR WONG KIN WAI: Many modes. 47X, 37M, and 37. They are</p> <p>13 all buses.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: So you took a bus?</p> <p>15 MR WONG KIN WAI: That's right.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: As a passenger?</p> <p>17 MR WONG KIN WAI: That's right.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: A regular bus route, not a special bus driving</p> <p>19 bus captains?</p> <p>20 MR WONG KIN WAI: I was a bus captain working for a special</p> <p>21 shift for a regular route.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: I understand that. This is your meal break. And</p> <p>23 you moved from Kwai Shing East to Kwai Shing West. And</p> <p>24 you did so as a passenger; is that right?</p> <p>25 MR WONG KIN WAI: That's right. Because there were no rest</p>	<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Were you on route 37 again, or another route?</p> <p>2 MR WONG KIN WAI: Also 37.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: And for how long did you ply that route?</p> <p>4 MR WONG KIN WAI: About one year.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: No, when did you finish driving that route that</p> <p>6 day?</p> <p>7 MR WONG KIN WAI: 20.43. That's the time when I knocked off</p> <p>8 work. Including going to Stonecutters Island to leave</p> <p>9 the bus there.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: So you clocked out, as it were? Is that right?</p> <p>11 MR WONG KIN WAI: That's right.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: So you clocked in at 7.35, is that it?</p> <p>13 MR WONG KIN WAI: Before 7.35. Before 7.35.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: What time did you clock in?</p> <p>15 MR WONG KIN WAI: It was about 7.20, when I clocked in after</p> <p>16 taking the company bus to go to Stonecutters Island.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: And that day, having finished and clocked out,</p> <p>18 clocked off, did you return home straight away, or did</p> <p>19 you do other things?</p> <p>20 MR WONG KIN WAI: I went home straight away.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Can you help us as to what time you arrived at</p> <p>22 home?</p> <p>23 MR WONG KIN WAI: It was around 9.20.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: The following day, 29 June, were you on duty?</p> <p>25 MR WONG KIN WAI: My last day was 26 June. Because in my</p>
Page 46	Page 48
<p>1 facilities at Kwai Shing East, and there are only rest</p> <p>2 facilities for staff at Kwai Shing West.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: And you rested at Kwai Shing West?</p> <p>4 MR WONG KIN WAI: That's right.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: What are the rest facilities there? Are there</p> <p>6 seats? Are there benches?</p> <p>7 MR WONG KIN WAI: There are three benches and some tables.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Are you able to lie down?</p> <p>9 MR WONG KIN WAI: There are something like sofa, so I could</p> <p>10 lean back. But if you are talking about something like</p> <p>11 a bed, no.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: You are able to recline, is that it?</p> <p>13 MR WONG KIN WAI: That is right.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: When did your break come to an end?</p> <p>15 MR WONG KIN WAI: That would be 15.55.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: So what was the length of your break that day?</p> <p>17 When did you start?</p> <p>18 MR WONG KIN WAI: Including taking a meal, it is about two</p> <p>19 hours 47 minutes.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: When did it start?</p> <p>21 MR WONG KIN WAI: I think my roster started, according to</p> <p>22 the schedule, is eight minutes past 2, and then until</p> <p>23 15.55.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: Thank you, and then you resumed your bus driving?</p> <p>25 MR WONG KIN WAI: That is right.</p>	<p>1 last trip to Kwai Shing West Estate there was a traffic</p> <p>2 accident.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: I beg your pardon, the 26th. Were you involved</p> <p>4 in that traffic accident?</p> <p>5 MR WONG KIN WAI: That is right.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: What time was the traffic accident?</p> <p>7 MR WONG KIN WAI: 7.20.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: What was the nature of the traffic accident?</p> <p>9 MR WONG KIN WAI: A taxi travelling on a third lane cut</p> <p>10 across to the first lane to a smaller road, Beech</p> <p>11 Street. I was travelling on the first lane, I could not</p> <p>12 stop in time, and rammed into the taxi.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: Were you injured?</p> <p>14 MR WONG KIN WAI: Yes.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: And is that when your sick leave began?</p> <p>16 MR WONG KIN WAI: That is right.</p> <p>17 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Thank you, Chairman.</p> <p>18 I just want to follow up. When you are talking</p> <p>19 about the resting places, you had three chairs.</p> <p>20 Usually, how many drivers are in that location together?</p> <p>21 MR WONG KIN WAI: I think about three or four. Because,</p> <p>22 well, they would not be there for a prolonged period of</p> <p>23 time. There would be five to six minutes of rest time,</p> <p>24 they would go in to take a seat.</p> <p>25 MEMBER AUYEUNG: So is there enough room for all the drivers</p>

Page 49	Page 51
<p>1 inside the premise?</p> <p>2 MR WONG KIN WAI: I think there was sufficient space for</p> <p>3 seven to eight people.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: Mr Kwok, we are going to take a break now. And</p> <p>5 we will resume at 12 o'clock by that clock. Thank you.</p> <p>6 (11.43 am)</p> <p>7 (A short break)</p> <p>8 (12.03 pm)</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Mr Wong, you told us that you were driving that</p> <p>10 route, or rather the special shift arrangement, for</p> <p>11 a year; is that correct?</p> <p>12 MR KWOK CHI SHING: That is correct.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: Can you describe, if you remember it, perhaps</p> <p>14 going backwards from that week of 26 June, how many days</p> <p>15 in a row were you driving that special shift without</p> <p>16 having a break?</p> <p>17 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Basically from Monday to Saturday</p> <p>18 I would be working continuously for five to six days.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Well, was it five, or was it six, or could you</p> <p>20 change the pattern?</p> <p>21 MR KWOK CHI SHING: We are on a roster on the shift, so</p> <p>22 normally we would be on duty for five or six days, and</p> <p>23 then there will be one rest day.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: And were your hours of work broadly the same --</p> <p>25 clocking in time, clocking off time?</p>	<p>1 I just want to clarify what you said earlier,</p> <p>2 Mr Wong.</p> <p>3 You did mention about your break is about two hours</p> <p>4 and 47 minutes, right? That's including meal time.</p> <p>5 This is the break time, two hours and 47 minutes; is</p> <p>6 that correct?</p> <p>7 MR WONG KIN WAI: That is right.</p> <p>8 MEMBER AUYEUNG: You also mentioned that if it is a bit too</p> <p>9 noisy, you will go home. If you actually have to go</p> <p>10 home, can you make a guess on actually during that two</p> <p>11 hours and 47 minutes, really, what kind of rest you can</p> <p>12 have before you carry on with your work of the day?</p> <p>13 MR WONG KIN WAI: Well, there wasn't enough time for a rest,</p> <p>14 I just closed my eyes, rest my eyes and tried to relax,</p> <p>15 to keep my shape up.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: Mr Kwok, you wanted to say something.</p> <p>17 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Yes. For Kwai Shing East, it seems that</p> <p>18 a rest kiosk has been put in just a few days ago with</p> <p>19 the help of a trade union, Mr Chow Wai Hung, within a</p> <p>20 short time, the work was completed. I mentioned that</p> <p>21 the trade union intervened. We are not affiliated with</p> <p>22 any political parties. If we want something done we</p> <p>23 would go to the community to lobby. I think the main</p> <p>24 objection comes from district councillors. If there are</p> <p>25 no objections coming from the community, it would be the</p>
Page 50	Page 52
<p>1 MR KWOK CHI SHING: That is correct, it is a fixed time.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: If it be necessary, do you consent to KMB</p> <p>3 releasing to us the data they might have obtained about</p> <p>4 your work on 26 June when you clocked in, when you</p> <p>5 arrived at a bus terminus, when your break began, when</p> <p>6 you clocked off, all of the data that day, do you</p> <p>7 consent to that being provided to the Committee?</p> <p>8 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Yes.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: You told us about the rest facilities that were</p> <p>10 available at Kwai Shing West Estate; were there</p> <p>11 occasions when you took your rest in this split shift</p> <p>12 arrangement at other places?</p> <p>13 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Sometimes, I would, if it were too</p> <p>14 noisy, too many people going in and out, I would choose</p> <p>15 to go home.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: The question really is this. Were there other</p> <p>17 places where you took this break, other than Kwai Shing</p> <p>18 West Estate?</p> <p>19 MR WONG KIN WAI: No. Because there was only rest</p> <p>20 facilities at Kwai Shing West Estate. When I went to</p> <p>21 work, there was still no rest facilities at Kwai Shing</p> <p>22 East Estate.</p> <p>23 MR KWOK CHI SHING: I would like to add.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: Just a moment, Mr Kwok, your turn will come.</p> <p>25 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Thank you, Chairman.</p>	<p>1 problem of the government department.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Wong, may I clarify a few matters.</p> <p>3 You said that you clocked in before 7.35, and then</p> <p>4 you take the meal break at 2.08. On my calculation, it</p> <p>5 is around six hours 50 minutes before you take the meal</p> <p>6 break. So, I was trying to find out, do you have breaks</p> <p>7 or rest time during that six hours and 50 minutes?</p> <p>8 MR WONG KIN WAI: The last driving time of mine during the</p> <p>9 morning was 11.40 for a journey time of one hour.</p> <p>10 I could drive the bus to Kwai Shing East Estate to</p> <p>11 leave it there, and it was earlier than expected because</p> <p>12 of little traffic. So I arrived there early. My</p> <p>13 actual -- well, there was no break time at that time.</p> <p>14 Perhaps I can give you my timetable or roster for</p> <p>15 your reference.</p> <p>16 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you, yes. Because I would like to</p> <p>17 know how the rest time was arranged during that shift.</p> <p>18 I would like to know, during that six hours and 50</p> <p>19 minutes, how that rest time was arranged, so it would be</p> <p>20 great if we could get your timetable.</p> <p>21 You referred to the meal break, one hour, included</p> <p>22 within the three successive hours of break; is that</p> <p>23 correct?</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: I don't think it has been acknowledged that the</p> <p>25 three hour continuous break system is being implemented.</p>

Page 53	Page 55
<p>1 Am I right, Mr Kwok, that it is not being 2 implemented? 3 MR KWOK CHI SHING: As I said, that it would be implemented 4 in the second quarter of 2019. Well, now the company 5 will have full flexibility. If there is 14-hour duty 6 hours then there won't be more than 11 hours of driving. 7 So strictly speaking, there is little rest time. It is 8 just because of the manpower shortage. Everyone will be 9 used to the fullest. In the past they said that it was 10 about 6 am or 11 am, and then in the afternoon it would 11 be 3 pm or 4 pm. That would be the arrangement. 12 Now, because of the manpower shortage, well, 3 pm 13 would be late. Some of us would be asked to work on 14 a different route. 15 CHAIRMAN: The question is very simple, Mr Kwok. 16 Thank you, Ms Wong. 17 MS MAGGIE WONG: I think I wanted to ask Mr Wong this 18 question about the allowance in special shift. Is 19 Kowloon Motor Bus paying you the reduced allowance? 20 CHAIRMAN: Well, it is a number, \$21.90. 21 Is that what you get paid when you have your break 22 in a special shift? 23 MR WONG KIN WAI: Could you please wait. I think the 24 special shift allowance per day is \$69.70. 25 CHAIRMAN: That's the total allowance, not a hourly rate?</p>	<p>1 If you cannot complete 15 days, then you cannot get the 2 full rate of allowance. So it is on a pro rata basis. 3 MS MAGGIE WONG: So can you tell us what allowance you would 4 receive from (B) to (G). 5 CHAIRMAN: I think we are being bogged down in a minor 6 detail here. Either way, the figures speak for 7 themselves. 8 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. So maybe I will move on to another 9 topic. 10 Mr Kwok, I would like to raise another topic with 11 you. It is about the issue you raised in your 12 submission about having a priority bus lane. 13 And your submission in English is at page 90-7, and 14 it should be in Chinese, page 88. 15 It states that: 16 "... where a bus has made a direction signal 17 preparing to exit a station, other vehicles that see it 18 must stop or let the bus exit the station. A safety 19 distance of two seconds is used as the termination 20 distance by which the bus must be allowed to exit the 21 station first ... vehicles are prohibited from cutting 22 in front of buses within 10 metres of their front to 23 prevent the buses from suddenly having to decelerate." 24 In your submission you provided some examples as to 25 the problems about cutting lanes -- and that is in the</p>
Page 54	Page 56
<p>1 MR WONG KIN WAI: That is the total. That is the total, 2 \$69.70 is the total. 3 CHAIRMAN: For how many hours of break? 4 MR WONG KIN WAI: Two hours and 47 minutes. 5 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Ms Wong. 6 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you help me with this, about this shift 7 allowance. If you go to KMB bundle 1, Mr Wong, this 8 question is directed at you. If you go to KMB bundle 1, 9 page 109. There is a table showing the allowance. 10 MR WONG KIN WAI: I would like to add something. The \$21.90 11 is the calculation of a staff on a daily rate. \$69.70 12 is the calculation for someone on a monthly salary. 13 MS MAGGIE WONG: Do you have that document in front of you 14 at page 109? 15 MR WONG KIN WAI: Yes. 16 MS MAGGIE WONG: If I may ask you to look at the left 17 column. "Employed after 2004", the old monthly rate. 18 The basic salary. Are they paying you 11,810, or are 19 they paying you 15,366? Which is applicable in your 20 case? 21 MR WONG KIN WAI: 15,366. 22 MS MAGGIE WONG: And then you would be paid the split shift 23 allowance of \$1,951.50; is that for the whole month, the 24 monthly rate? 25 MR WONG KIN WAI: Well, it depends on the number of days.</p>	<p>1 TU bundle at pages 104 to 108 -- at the Hung Hom 2 station. 3 So are you suggesting by this suggestion that you 4 would like to have the priority bus lane system similar 5 to what they have in Singapore? 6 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Yes. 7 MS MAGGIE WONG: Regarding your point about the bus that 8 must be allowed to exit the station first, do you have 9 any view as to how -- 10 CHAIRMAN: By that you mean the bus stop? 11 MS MAGGIE WONG: The bus stop. 12 Do you have any view -- 13 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Yes, yes, correct. Bus stop. 14 MS MAGGIE WONG: Do you have any view as to how it can be 15 enforced? 16 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Well, we use cameras, for new vehicles 17 they have got cameras, so when the signal is issued for 18 two seconds, if the vehicles at the back do not stop 19 then it can be enforced. 20 CHAIRMAN: So that would require a camera at the rear of the 21 vehicle? 22 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Right now, for new vehicles, the rear 23 mirrors on the left and the right there are cameras. 24 Why did I say two seconds? Because we understand 25 that there should be a distance of two seconds, as</p>

Page 57	Page 59
<p>1 promoted by the government, so that there would be 2 a safe distance, so no emergency halting of the vehicle 3 is required. 4 In Singapore they draw a line, and that may lead to 5 misunderstanding. 6 If I have just passed that line and reached that 7 line and you give me a signal, then there may be some 8 misunderstanding. 9 So two seconds is to quantify the distance. 10 I propose two seconds, you may suggest three. It is 11 just to quantify the distance. It doesn't really have 12 to be two seconds. Because in Hong Kong space is 13 limited and bus stops are numerous, people would not 14 know what the line is about. 15 In Hong Kong, to have road markings, you have to 16 guess at it, and you have to set up a sign, it is 17 complicated, and the markings may be removed as time 18 goes on. So it is best to use time as a reference. It 19 is safer. 20 MS MAGGIE WONG: The next topic is on training safety. You 21 mentioned in your first submission at page 84 in 22 Chinese, English at page 90-4 -- you raised the issue 23 about training safety. You stated there that: 24 "During that time, even when road traffic was 25 relatively simple, and I was familiar with the roads,</p>	<p>1 the Transport Department should take a more active role 2 on training and supervision of bus captains courses. Is 3 that the point you are trying to make in your later 4 submission on 25 July? 5 MR KWOK CHI SHING: Yes. Yes, there should be monitoring by 6 the Transport Department, because the training course 7 made by the bus company would only suit its needs 8 without other considerations. The TD should monitor. 9 And there should be consultation with trade unions, 10 because we are in service, we know the qualifications 11 for professional bus captains, they should be more open 12 in discussing with us. That would be much better. 13 MS MAGGIE WONG: I have completed my questioning. Thank 14 you. 15 CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms Wong. 16 Mr Kwok, those are the questions that we have for 17 you. You indicated at the start that there was some 18 other material that you wanted to make available to us. 19 And if you wish us to receive that material, please 20 provide it in writing, and we will consider it. 21 Is that what you wish to do? 22 MR KWOK CHI SHING: We will, if we can. 23 Since the Committee still takes time to complete the 24 whole consultation, and if we can make it we will submit 25 the material as soon as possible for the Committee's</p>
Page 58	Page 60
<p>1 I also need to be trained for one month. Within that 2 one month, majority of the time was spent in bus-driving 3 training ..." 4 And you commented that the training nowadays of 18 5 days is insufficient. 6 So did I summarise it correctly, that your union's 7 view is that the current training to newly recruited bus 8 drivers is in sufficient? 9 MR KWOK CHI SHING: You are correct. You are correct. 10 MS MAGGIE WONG: What is your proposed duration of training 11 to new recruits? 12 MR KWOK CHI SHING: It is about the operation of the bus 13 company. One month is about right, unless the new 14 recruit has a bus licence. Now, for those who have to 15 take a licence examination, one month is the minimum. 16 In particular, the recruiting requirements are lower. 17 And it was said at the hearing that a person with one 18 year private car licence can then learn to drive, and 19 after 18 days he can start driving a bus. That is very 20 dangerous, and I think that consideration is immature. 21 MS MAGGIE WONG: And you commented in your submission, or 22 reply, on 25 July 2018, as to the Transport Department's 23 role in training. If I may take you to the submission. 24 CHAIRMAN: Perhaps you can just summarise the point. 25 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. The point was that you commented that</p>	<p>1 reference. 2 CHAIRMAN: Well, we look forward to receiving whatever it is 3 that you choose to give us. 4 But for the moment, we thank for coming to give 5 evidence. Thank you, Mr Wong, for giving us an insight 6 into a day in a life of a bus captain working a special 7 shift. That was most helpful to us. 8 But we have others from another union who are going 9 to give evidence. So what we will do is take a short 10 break now and invite you to withdraw from the table, and 11 the other representatives can come forward and occupy 12 the table. 13 We will take a 2-minute break. Thank you. 14 (12.27 pm) 15 (A short break) 16 (12.30 pm) 17 REPRESENTATIVES FROM STAFF RIGHTS ASSOCIATION OF KMB: 18 MR CHAN WING HO, MR TAN SHIN HING, MR YIU KWONG CHUN, AND 19 MR LI KWOK WAH 20 (Evidence given in Cantonese, transcription of the 21 simultaneous interpretation). 22 CHAIRMAN: We thank you, Mr Li, and your colleagues, 23 representatives of the Staff Rights Association of KMB, 24 for accepting our invitation to come and give evidence 25 today.</p>

Page 61	Page 63
<p>1 I'm going to ask Ms Wong in a moment to begin asking</p> <p>2 you questions on behalf of the Committee.</p> <p>3 Mr Li, if you wish one of your colleagues to answer</p> <p>4 any particular question, just indicate who it is, and</p> <p>5 defer to him, and then we will hear from whoever it is</p> <p>6 that you wish us to hear from, answering a particular</p> <p>7 question.</p> <p>8 MR LI KWOK WAH: I understand.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>10 Ms Wong.</p> <p>11 EXAMINATION BY MS WONG</p> <p>12 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you, Mr Li. This Committee is tasked</p> <p>13 to review the safety aspects of the franchised bus</p> <p>14 operations, so my questions will be focusing on that</p> <p>15 area.</p> <p>16 Before I ask a few questions I would like to</p> <p>17 ascertain some basic facts about your association.</p> <p>18 Your association was established in January 2017,</p> <p>19 correct?</p> <p>20 MR LI KWOK WAH: Yes.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: And there are approximately 200 members in</p> <p>22 your association as of 18 June 2018.</p> <p>23 MR LI KWOK WAH: That's right.</p> <p>24 MS MAGGIE WONG: And your members, 200 members, are all</p> <p>25 full-time and part-time staff of Kowloon Motor Bus?</p>	<p>1 day. For many bus captains who would need to drive</p> <p>2 various bus routes, in order to have more time for rest</p> <p>3 during work, will try to complete the bus routes as soon</p> <p>4 as possible depending on road traffic condition and</p> <p>5 return to the bus terminals for rest."</p> <p>6 Can you tell us or elaborate how the need to</p> <p>7 maintain scheduled trips would affect bus captains'</p> <p>8 entitled rest time?</p> <p>9 MR LI KWOK WAH: The bus company, say, for example, there is</p> <p>10 one hour of journey time, it would be compressed to 55</p> <p>11 to 58 minutes. Bus captains have little rest time. If</p> <p>12 you compress journey time even by a few minutes, that</p> <p>13 means a loss of a few minutes of rest time.</p> <p>14 MS MAGGIE WONG: So can you confirm that as to whether, when</p> <p>15 trying to complete the bus routes with a less scheduled</p> <p>16 time, would that increase the likelihood of speeding by</p> <p>17 bus captains?</p> <p>18 MR LI KWOK WAH: That is right. Because you have to catch</p> <p>19 up in order to get more rest time. Yes, buses travel at</p> <p>20 70km/ph, in some sections where there is a speed limit</p> <p>21 of 50, we may be travelling at a higher speed, and there</p> <p>22 will be pressure, because we would need to make up for</p> <p>23 the time. As a result they will have to speed, say, for</p> <p>24 example, travelling at 70km/ph at a section of 50km/ph</p> <p>25 speed limit.</p>
Page 62	Page 64
<p>1 MR LI KWOK WAH: That's right.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: In what percentage?</p> <p>3 MR LI KWOK WAH: There are about 8,600 bus captains. We</p> <p>4 have 200 members?</p> <p>5 MS MAGGIE WONG: What percentage is full-time staff and what</p> <p>6 percentage is part-time staff?</p> <p>7 MR LI KWOK WAH: There is only one part-time member. The</p> <p>8 others are all full-time.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: And they are all bus captains?</p> <p>10 MR LI KWOK WAH: There are also some bus regulators, three</p> <p>11 bus regulators.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: And the rest are bus captains?</p> <p>13 MR LI KWOK WAH: That's right.</p> <p>14 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Li, I would like to go to a specific</p> <p>15 topic on scheduled trips and loss of time.</p> <p>16 If we could go to your submission at page 129-4 in</p> <p>17 English. You have only made one submission dated</p> <p>18 23 April 2018. In Chinese it starts at page 117.</p> <p>19 And the passage is at page 120.</p> <p>20 I think in the bottom paragraph, you stated that:</p> <p>21 "... with the continued loss of bus captains, and</p> <p>22 the need maintain the scheduled trips and avoid</p> <p>23 cancelling scheduled trips, causing bus captains'</p> <p>24 entitled rest time during work subject to the situation</p> <p>25 of lost trips and the road traffic circumstances that</p>	<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: And we have heard about the system that</p> <p>2 there is a monitoring system of drivers, and a certain</p> <p>3 threshold was set in the black box that you cannot</p> <p>4 exceed a certain speed limit, for example 50km per hour</p> <p>5 would be set at 55km per hour. In those circumstances,</p> <p>6 if you are speeding --</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: Whose evidence you are quoting there?</p> <p>8 MS MAGGIE WONG: I'm quoting evidence perhaps from Citybus.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>10 MS MAGGIE WONG: I'm just enquiring, is there a similar</p> <p>11 system in the KMB buses for road sections that have 50km</p> <p>12 per hour?</p> <p>13 MR LI KWOK WAH: Yes, for KMB there is the black box. It is</p> <p>14 a tachograph. It records the operations of the bus.</p> <p>15 You can retrieve the data. Regularly the company would</p> <p>16 check the black box, say, for example, on a certain</p> <p>17 date, a particular bus captain sped during a certain</p> <p>18 section. There is this system with the KMB.</p> <p>19 MS MAGGIE WONG: Do you know what threshold has been set for</p> <p>20 the 50km per hour road section?</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: By KMB on their tachomatic devices?</p> <p>22 MS MAGGIE WONG: By KMB on their tachograph devices.</p> <p>23 MR LI KWOK WAH: I don't understand your question.</p> <p>24 MS MAGGIE WONG: We have heard evidence -- perhaps I will</p> <p>25 explain more. We have heard evidence from another bus</p>

Page 65	Page 67
<p>1 operator, Citybus, that for a road section that has 2 a fixed speed limit of 50km per hour they would set at 3 55km per hour within that black box. And once the bus 4 driver exceeded 55km per hour for a continuous period of 5 time, say, 10 consecutive seconds, it would be 6 automatically recorded in the form of an automatic 7 generation exception report, and certain punishment 8 would be accorded to different bus captains for 9 exceeding certain speed limit.</p> <p>10 And we have that particular page there.</p> <p>11 A speed of over 55km per hour for 10 consecutive 12 seconds on road sections with speed limit of 50km per 13 hour, and speed of over 75km per hour for 10 consecutive 14 seconds on road sections with speed limit of 70km per 15 hour.</p> <p>16 So, as far as you know, as bus captain, do you have 17 a similar system for bus captains in Kowloon Motor Bus?</p> <p>18 MR LI KWOK WAH: Yes, there is one. Our understanding is 19 that for KMB black boxes, they would record your speed, 20 say, for example, if you are travelling at 78km/ph, an 21 excess of 8 kilometres per hour, if you do not 22 accelerate within 10 seconds, there won't be any record. 23 But if it is over 10 seconds there would be a record. 24 That's the same for 70km/ph, and 50km/ph. It depends on 25 the duration. 10 seconds. If within that time you do</p>	<p>1 CHAIRMAN: But that's all history now, is it not? There is 2 no bonus, there is no deduction.</p> <p>3 MR LI KWOK WAH: That's true.</p> <p>4 MS MAGGIE WONG: So if a bus driver speeds, or if there is 5 a speed exception report generated, would he receive any 6 penalty?</p> <p>7 MR LI KWOK WAH: It depends on the number of violations -- 8 the company will look at that -- and also the gap 9 between two violations. If it is every month, there 10 will be deduction. If there is one month or seven 11 months in between then a warning letter will be issued 12 to remind the bus captain.</p> <p>13 MS MAGGIE WONG: So under the current system, there is still 14 a deduction regime depending on how frequent the 15 violation is; is that what you are saying?</p> <p>16 MR LI KWOK WAH: Yes.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: From what is the deduction made?</p> <p>18 MR LI KWOK WAH: Now, there can be no bonus to deduct. 19 Because the bonuses are merged into our monthly salary, 20 there can be no deduction. So every time you have one 21 violation you receive a warning letter. Three warning 22 letters result in dismissal.</p> <p>23 MS MAGGIE WONG: So it is not a deduction from salary --</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: Just a moment, Ms Wong. Please. 25 Three warning letters result in what, Mr Li?</p>
<p>Page 66</p> <p>1 not accelerate it will not be recorded. Otherwise, 2 there will be a warning letter or reduction of your 3 bonus.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: So that I can understand that, are you saying 5 that the vehicle can carry on at 78 kilometres an hour, 6 as long as it doesn't accelerate to a greater speed? Or 7 does it have to come back to 70 within the 10 seconds?</p> <p>8 MR LI KWOK WAH: Yes, within 10 seconds it will have to be 9 brought back to 70km/ph.</p> <p>10 MS MAGGIE WONG: You mentioned there will be deduction of 11 allowance. In what circumstances --</p> <p>12 MR LI KWOK WAH: Bonus. Bonus.</p> <p>13 MS MAGGIE WONG: So that would be bonus? In what 14 circumstances would the bonus be reduced, and by how 15 much?</p> <p>16 MR LI KWOK WAH: KMB has merged the bonus into our basic 17 salary. Before that there were two types of bonus. One 18 for service another for safety. Each had the value of 19 1,178.</p> <p>20 Now, if it is a serious incident, such as a traffic 21 accident, then the whole month's bonus will be deducted. 22 Usually it will be half a month's bonus should there be 23 an incident. The same applies to good service bonus. 24 If you receive too many complaints, half or one month of 25 good service bonus will be deducted.</p>	<p>Page 68</p> <p>1 MR LI KWOK WAH: Dismissal.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: So there is not a system of deduction from 3 the salary, but it is simply dismissal following three 4 warning letters; is that the case?</p> <p>5 MR LI KWOK WAH: Yes.</p> <p>6 MS MAGGIE WONG: The next topic I would like to ask is the 7 training.</p> <p>8 If you look at page 129-6 in English, Chinese at 9 page 122. And you mentioned about the 18 day-training 10 and the four-week training.</p> <p>11 Can you tell us what is the difference in terms of 12 the modules between the four-week training and the 13 18-day training provided by Kowloon Motor Bus?</p> <p>14 MR LI KWOK WAH: Right now KMB has this system. Those 15 without a bus driving licence, 18 days will cover the 16 training to get a licence, so the module is very similar 17 to the four-week training, but much compressed.</p> <p>18 For the 18-day course, we believe the quality of 19 training will drop, because for new bus captains we 20 don't know what vehicles they have driven in the past, 21 or even if any. So they might be goods vehicles 22 drivers, or taxi drivers in the main.</p> <p>23 We are heavy duty buses, as a type of mass transport 24 mode. So if training isn't sufficient, will this 25 increase the likelihood of traffic accidents? And I'm</p>

Page 69	Page 71
<p>1 of the view that the training time is insufficient.</p> <p>2 I have served for 27 years. When I joined, I received</p> <p>3 four-week training. Although I already had a licence,</p> <p>4 I had to be trained for four weeks, but for KMB, if</p> <p>5 a new recruit has a licence then the training is only</p> <p>6 for seven days, to train them on the basics and also</p> <p>7 knowledge about the routes, and then he can become</p> <p>8 a professional bus captain.</p> <p>9 There are so many traffic accidents involving buses.</p> <p>10 Many of them involve buses.</p> <p>11 To train a bus captain, there should at least be</p> <p>12 four weeks covering the lessons and also practical</p> <p>13 training on the road. Our suggestion is for every</p> <p>14 driving instructor he can only take two trainees. In</p> <p>15 the past it was three. We want that to be changed to</p> <p>16 two, two trainees per instructor.</p> <p>17 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. Thank you.</p> <p>18 May I take you to a document in the TD-1 bundle, at</p> <p>19 page 403. The Chinese is at page 416.</p> <p>20 Mr Li, this is a briefing paper produced by the</p> <p>21 Transport Department in consultation with five</p> <p>22 franchised bus operators and three major bus</p> <p>23 manufacturers. And this is the product of their</p> <p>24 recommendation.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: This was a special working group set up by the</p>	<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Have we been provided with one?</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: We have not.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>4 MS MAGGIE WONG: And the last topic, Mr Li, I would like to</p> <p>5 ask you is this.</p> <p>6 Amongst your 200 members -- I know some of them are</p> <p>7 not actual bus drivers, but most of them are -- how many</p> <p>8 of them are on special shifts or split shifts, to your</p> <p>9 knowledge?</p> <p>10 MR LI KWOK WAH: Myself, is a special shift duty driver.</p> <p>11 I have not done formal statistics, but I know about 20</p> <p>12 to 30 members who are special shift bus captains.</p> <p>13 MS MAGGIE WONG: We have heard evidence that the recent</p> <p>14 February 2018 guidelines are not strictly enforced or</p> <p>15 implemented in terms of the rest hours, and the three</p> <p>16 consecutive hours.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: I don't think, Ms Wong, with respect, it is</p> <p>18 a question of strictly enforced. The agreement was full</p> <p>19 implementation would not take place until the second</p> <p>20 quarter of 2019, and the issue is whether any</p> <p>21 implementation has taken place as of now.</p> <p>22 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes.</p> <p>23 MR LI KWOK WAH: Not in KMB. No such arrangement. Many</p> <p>24 many special shift vehicles don't even provide three</p> <p>25 hours in between for meals and rest. We have collected</p>
Page 70	Page 72
<p>1 Transport Department in the middle of March, and it was</p> <p>2 required to report within three months and did so on</p> <p>3 20 July, with this, what is now this briefing paper for</p> <p>4 the transport panel of the Legislative Council.</p> <p>5 MS MAGGIE WONG: And this paper covers three aspects: first,</p> <p>6 the in-vehicle safety devices; second, seat belts; and</p> <p>7 third, training of bus captains.</p> <p>8 My first question is, have the Transport Department</p> <p>9 or Kowloon Motor Bus consulted your views on any of the</p> <p>10 topics between March and June 2018?</p> <p>11 MR LI KWOK WAH: No, this is the first time I have seen this</p> <p>12 paper. The company has not consulted my trade union.</p> <p>13 MS MAGGIE WONG: And we have been informed recently that the</p> <p>14 Transport Department has recently issued a practice note</p> <p>15 to franchised bus operators in respect of the training</p> <p>16 for bus captains to align the training arrangements of</p> <p>17 different operators to be implemented from October 2018.</p> <p>18 Have you been provided or has your union been</p> <p>19 provided with a copy of the practice note?</p> <p>20 MR LI KWOK WAH: No.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Ms Wong, before you move on.</p> <p>22 Last week, did the Committee not ask the Transport</p> <p>23 Department to be provided with a copy of the practice</p> <p>24 note?</p> <p>25 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes.</p>	<p>1 information, many special shift do not provide three</p> <p>2 hours. According to KMB they have three hours, but</p> <p>3 according to our survey, no, less than three hours.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: When was this survey conducted?</p> <p>5 MR LI KWOK WAH: About two weeks ago, we have been asking</p> <p>6 our members, and many routes had less than three hours.</p> <p>7 For some routes, like 258P, 5S, 60X, 256B, many</p> <p>8 routes do not provide three hours for meals and rest.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Do you have copies of the survey, the results of</p> <p>10 the survey?</p> <p>11 MR LI KWOK WAH: We have printed -- now, here are two.</p> <p>12 Because the information is in my mobile phone, and for</p> <p>13 some of the information it is not appropriate for me to</p> <p>14 pass it to you because it is a document I have taken</p> <p>15 photo of. They are company documents.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: Well, is there some material that you can provide</p> <p>17 us, redacting it as you feel appropriate so that we can</p> <p>18 see the extent of your survey and how many bus captains</p> <p>19 indicated that they were not being given a three-hour</p> <p>20 break.?</p> <p>21 MR LI KWOK WAH: I have a dozen or so routes, and there are</p> <p>22 special duty routes, and some were given to us.</p> <p>23 Now, there is a roster done by the company, and even</p> <p>24 then, there wasn't three hours for meal and break.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Is there anything you can provide to us to</p>

Page 73	Page 75
<p>1 substantiate what you are saying?</p> <p>2 MR LI KWOK WAH: We have printed two timetables. Chairman,</p> <p>3 if you would like to have a look I can show it to you.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: Very well. Perhaps what we will do is this. We</p> <p>5 have reached the lunch break. If you provide that to us</p> <p>6 now, we can have it copied and perhaps translated so</p> <p>7 that we can resume by asking you questions at 2.30 this</p> <p>8 afternoon on this material.</p> <p>9 If there are other matters where you have statements</p> <p>10 to make to us, we always look for evidence to support</p> <p>11 the assertion. So if there are things that support you,</p> <p>12 please provide them to us.</p> <p>13 But we will take the lunch adjournment now, and we</p> <p>14 will resume at 2.30 this afternoon. Thank you.</p> <p>15 (1.03 pm)</p> <p>16 (The luncheon adjournment)</p> <p>17 (2.30 pm)</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: Good afternoon.</p> <p>19 We have a copy of the document that you wanted to</p> <p>20 hand to us, and we have a translation of part of it.</p> <p>21 I'll ask Ms Wong to deal with the matter.</p> <p>22 Ms Wong.</p> <p>23 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. Thank you for providing us with the</p> <p>24 document. We have extracted an enlarged the part that</p> <p>25 concerns special shifts.</p>	<p>1 some staff members.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: The computer screen picture seems to depict</p> <p>3 a date. 28/04/2018. Do you see that?</p> <p>4 Top of the printout.</p> <p>5 MR LI KWOK WAH: It is actually provided by staff members,</p> <p>6 I didn't actually read the small fonts here, up there.</p> <p>7 So here it says 23 April 2018.</p> <p>8 Now recently, the company has revised substantially</p> <p>9 the schedules for many routes, since 9 July, but this</p> <p>10 photo was WhatsApped to me the day before yesterday.</p> <p>11 Just to point out the problems there. So this was the</p> <p>12 photo, and that's why I used it as an example.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Ms Wong.</p> <p>14 MS MAGGIE WONG: Was this duty hours applied across the</p> <p>15 board for special shifts, or specific routes?</p> <p>16 MR LI KWOK WAH: Well, these are individual routes, and</p> <p>17 so-called running number trips, or -- for example this</p> <p>18 is route 258D, trip number 5 is this schedule, but trip</p> <p>19 number 6 for instance would be a different schedule.</p> <p>20 MS MAGGIE WONG: This schedule was provided by the company</p> <p>21 Kowloon Motor Bus?</p> <p>22 MR LI KWOK WAH: Yes.</p> <p>23 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you find more examples of this?</p> <p>24 MR LI KWOK WAH: For instance, this one. 52X schedule 7.</p> <p>25 Or S7, in short. The early shift, 7.57, logged in, and</p>
Page 74	Page 76
<p>1 We see an example of the duty hours of a bus captain</p> <p>2 currently driving a special shift for route number 258D,</p> <p>3 and we can see it starts at 6.50 and it ends at 13.43.</p> <p>4 Then restarts again at 4 pm to 8.15 pm. There was only</p> <p>5 a rest break of 2 hours and 15 minutes, instead of three</p> <p>6 hours in between.</p> <p>7 Can you tell us when was this -- when was this</p> <p>8 happened? Or is this a recent --</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Do we not see the date on the -- if it is</p> <p>10 a roster, in the coloured photograph? Isn't that</p> <p>11 28 April?</p> <p>12 MS MAGGIE WONG: I can't see.</p> <p>13 MR LI KWOK WAH: Now, this schedule, or roster was amended</p> <p>14 on 9 July, 9 July.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: Of this year?</p> <p>16 MR LI KWOK WAH: Yes. This year. 9 July this year.</p> <p>17 Because the company made major changes to the schedule,</p> <p>18 so the date of commencement of the schedule is 9 July.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Is this a photograph that we see in colour on the</p> <p>20 left-hand side, of something that the company posted?</p> <p>21 MR LI KWOK WAH: No. That's taken from the computer screen</p> <p>22 It is on the company's computer screen, and a picture</p> <p>23 was taken of that.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: Yes, and when was that picture taken?</p> <p>25 MR LI KWOK WAH: I'm not sure. Because it was provided by</p>	<p>1 then the early shift finished at 12.07. But then the</p> <p>2 next shift started at 14.19, and had to go back to</p> <p>3 Po Tin to collect the vehicle. So in between there were</p> <p>4 just over two hours. So there are several more such</p> <p>5 examples.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: And the point that you are illustrating is that</p> <p>7 for maximum duties of, I think the first one is 13 hours</p> <p>8 and 25 minutes, the rest time was less than 3 hours.</p> <p>9 Considerably less than 3 hours?</p> <p>10 MR LI KWOK WAH: Yes, correct.</p> <p>11 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Li, you told us earlier on that you are</p> <p>12 a special shift driver as well.</p> <p>13 MR LI KWOK WAH: Yes.</p> <p>14 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you tell us, from your personal</p> <p>15 experience, a day's work? From your -- from the time</p> <p>16 you start your duty.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: When did you last drive a special shift?</p> <p>18 MR LI KWOK WAH: 14 January, because 15 January -- because</p> <p>19 of a traffic accident I was injured and I have not</p> <p>20 started work again.</p> <p>21 So before 14 January I was driving special shifts.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: Are you able to help us with the times that you</p> <p>23 worked on that last day?</p> <p>24 MR LI KWOK WAH: I have to look up the schedule first.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Please do.</p>

Page 77	Page 79
<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: How long have you been driving --</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: Well, he is looking up the schedule, Ms Wong.</p> <p>3 MR LI KWOK WAH: On 14 January, I took a special shift in</p> <p>4 the morning. 7.30 I logged in. And for the morning</p> <p>5 shift I finished around 11 am. I had one hour for meal</p> <p>6 and in the afternoon shift I started at 16.11, and</p> <p>7 finished at 20.29 -- 21.29.</p> <p>8 MS MAGGIE WONG: In your example you have given, do you have</p> <p>9 three hours consecutive hours break?</p> <p>10 MR LI KWOK WAH: More than that. More than three hours.</p> <p>11 There is four hours 40 plus minutes of break in</p> <p>12 between for this particular special shift.</p> <p>13 MS MAGGIE WONG: Prior to 14 January 2018, how long have you</p> <p>14 been working as special shift driver?</p> <p>15 MR LI KWOK WAH: Around three years.</p> <p>16 MS MAGGIE WONG: Is it the occasion that on -- it is -- was</p> <p>17 14 January 2018 shift where you have been given over</p> <p>18 four hours break, frequent occurrence, or can you tell</p> <p>19 us how you describe four hours break.</p> <p>20 MR LI KWOK WAH: I would just like to supplement.</p> <p>21 For the design of every route, you know, the timing</p> <p>22 is different. For this particular route, or the route</p> <p>23 I drove on, there were six scheduled trips, or -- and</p> <p>24 there is only one day in the week, on Monday. There is</p> <p>25 just one scheduled trip with less than three hours of</p>	<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can we look at the screen capture at the</p> <p>2 moment. It referred to the route 258, (Chinese spoken)</p> <p>3 5. What is meant by (Chinese spoken), first of all?</p> <p>4 MR LI KWOK WAH: Now we use "S", that's called special</p> <p>5 shift. "S" stands for special shift.</p> <p>6 MS MAGGIE WONG: This 258D, can you tell us where this route</p> <p>7 starts and where it ends?</p> <p>8 MR LI KWOK WAH: 258D from Long Mun Oasis to Yau Tong.</p> <p>9 MS MAGGIE WONG: Do you mean Po Tin?</p> <p>10 MR LI KWOK WAH: No, Po Tin in Tuen Mun to Yau Tong.</p> <p>11 MS MAGGIE WONG: Do you know if there are as if facilities</p> <p>12 for this particular route from --</p> <p>13 MR LI KWOK WAH: I'm not certain. But for the Po Tin staff</p> <p>14 room, it is small. We know that we have already brought</p> <p>15 this up to the Tuen Mun depot, we have asked for an</p> <p>16 expansion of the room, but that case is still under</p> <p>17 application.</p> <p>18 MS MAGGIE WONG: You said that you have brought this up to</p> <p>19 the Tuen Mun depot. In what way? Orally or in writing?</p> <p>20 MR LI KWOK WAH: Verbally. Verbally to the depot manager.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Who is the depot manager?</p> <p>22 MR LI KWOK WAH: Wan Wai Yin in Chinese.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: Is that Ms Debbie Wong?</p> <p>24 MR LI KWOK WAH: No, Wan Wai Yin is a male.</p> <p>25 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Lee, you have, if I understand you</p>
<p>Page 78</p> <p>1 break. But for all the other scheduled trips there</p> <p>2 would be at least 3.5 hours of break. But the point I'm</p> <p>3 trying to make is that for the design of other routes,</p> <p>4 with less than three hours of break, and there are such</p> <p>5 cases, and that causes fatigue to the bus captains,</p> <p>6 because they do not get enough rest in between.</p> <p>7 For my route there is sufficient time for a break,</p> <p>8 but if all routes are designed like the route I took,</p> <p>9 then I would totally accept it.</p> <p>10 But in other routes they don't have such a break.</p> <p>11 And we have quoted a few examples. Examples is that</p> <p>12 there are not three hours, but for my route there is</p> <p>13 enough three hours of break. So the route is different</p> <p>14 for -- given the different circumstances. And we are</p> <p>15 just quoting examples of cases where there are not more</p> <p>16 than three hours of break.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: Which route was this?</p> <p>18 MR LI KWOK WAH: KMB has many routes. I cannot really</p> <p>19 provide all the routes, because there are several</p> <p>20 hundreds of routes of the KMB, I can't give examples of</p> <p>21 all routes.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: The route you drove on 14 January. Which route</p> <p>23 was that?</p> <p>24 MR LI KWOK WAH: 269D.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p>	<p>Page 80</p> <p>1 correctly, worked in the Kowloon Motor Bus as bus</p> <p>2 captain for about 27 years?</p> <p>3 MR LI KWOK WAH: Correct.</p> <p>4 MS MAGGIE WONG: Do you know a person called Raymond Cheng,</p> <p>5 or Gary Wong? Raymond Cheng used to be --</p> <p>6 MR LI KWOK WAH: No, I don't know them.</p> <p>7 MS MAGGIE WONG: And do you know, given your experience in</p> <p>8 Kowloon Motor Bus, do you know there is a safety quality</p> <p>9 department in Kowloon Motor Bus, some time in 2010?</p> <p>10 MR LI KWOK WAH: Yes. There was. Yes, there was we call</p> <p>11 this -- I can't remember the full name. There was</p> <p>12 a department dedicated to safety issues. Safety</p> <p>13 training of bus captains. That's my understanding.</p> <p>14 MS MAGGIE WONG: Were there meetings from time to time for</p> <p>15 this safety and quality department, with bus captains?</p> <p>16 MR LI KWOK WAH: I have never heard they would hold meetings</p> <p>17 with bus captains. I have never heard that. I have not</p> <p>18 been invited to such meetings, if any at all.</p> <p>19 MS MAGGIE WONG: Then how do you know the existence of this</p> <p>20 safety and quality department?</p> <p>21 MR LI KWOK WAH: When we talked to the managers of depots we</p> <p>22 heard about that.</p> <p>23 MS MAGGIE WONG: Did you know there was a study conducted in</p> <p>24 around that time in 2010 in relation to the</p> <p>25 identification of 29 sharp bends with certain criteria</p>

Page 81	Page 83
<p>1 for consideration, or implementation by bus captains. 2 Do you know about this? 3 MR LI KWOK WAH: No. Never heard of it. 4 CHAIRMAN: I think to make the point clear, a study the 5 purpose of which was to give advice to bus captains, how 6 they might negotiate certain bends. But you have never 7 heard of that? 8 MR LI KWOK WAH: No, no, no. 9 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 10 MS MAGGIE WONG: You earlier said that you have talked to 11 the manager of depot and heard about the safety and 12 quality department. Do you know if there are any 13 measures suggested by this safety and quality department 14 around the time in 2010? 15 MR LI KWOK WAH: I have not even heard about this 16 department. They have not consulted us, and for our 17 association, we have not been invited. But I don't know 18 whether others have been invited. I'm clueless about 19 this matter. 20 MS MAGGIE WONG: So what have you talked about, about this 21 department, this safety and quality department when you 22 were talking to the depot managers. What topic were you 23 discussing, or talking about? 24 MR LI KWOK WAH: I didn't know about this department, so we 25 didn't talk about matters related to this department,</p>	<p>1 no refresher training. Because previously, once every 2 year -- once every two years there was ancillary driving 3 training. We had to go to the Sha Tin school to receive 4 a one-day training to have some refresher training on 5 training attitude, enhancing our training skills, 6 et cetera. But now, there is no longer such 7 arrangement. 8 In the past 10 years, there is not this refresher 9 training once every two years. 10 Now, if you are a captain, and then you are involved 11 in some sort of an accident, then you have to go back to 12 receive training, but if no accident happens then you 13 don't need to have retraining again. 14 MS MAGGIE WONG: Do you have route-specific training for 15 full-time bus captain? 16 MR LI KWOK WAH: To my understanding, for some routes there 17 is dedicated training. For example, cross-harbour 18 routes, routes plying through Mong Kok, special training 19 is required. And there is another route, 64K, going 20 through Tai Po Road, and Fan Ling, Fan Kam Road, and Tai 21 Lam Chung, and a three-day training is required. 22 MS MAGGIE WONG: So this is apart from the general training, 23 the 18-day general training. For specific routes you 24 have to undergo another, or extra three days training? 25 MR LI KWOK WAH: Correct. On the issue of training can</p>
Page 82	Page 84
<p>1 the discussions were rather on the daily operations of 2 the depot. No, we have not talked to the manager about 3 safety issues. 4 MS MAGGIE WONG: I would like to ask the final topic, which 5 is on the training. Can I take you to the KMB bundle 1 6 at page 120. I'll just briefly explain what this is 7 about. This is a response by the Kowloon Motor Bus to 8 the Commissioner for Transport's letter dated 9 12 February 2018 regarding certain issues on recruitment 10 and training for full-time bus captain. 11 This follows from the tragic incident on 12 10 February 2018. 13 I would like to ask you about the general training 14 for full-time bus captain candidates. 15 Mr Li, are you also a full-time bus captain prior to 16 the sick leave, or 14 January 2018? 17 MR LI KWOK WAH: Right. 18 MS MAGGIE WONG: And if I may ask you, first of all, the 19 training, before we look at this. Was all full-time bus 20 captain candidates obliged to undergo an 18-day training 21 for 9.5 hours a day? 22 MR LI KWOK WAH: Correct. 23 MS MAGGIE WONG: Would there be refresher training once you 24 became a full-time bus captain? 25 MR LI KWOK WAH: Yes, but in the past decade or so there was</p>	<p>1 I defer to Mr Chan to help? 2 CHAIRMAN: Mr Chan? 3 MR CHAN WING HO: Mr Chairman, at the transport panel of the 4 LegCo held on 25 July 2018 there was a background brief 5 paper, and on page 4 point number 15 in the Chinese 6 version, there was this quote: 7 "The KMB said that whether it is the part-time or 8 full-time bus captains, if they have not run on a route 9 for over one month, they need extra training for driving 10 that particular route." 11 So the KMB made this statement. But that has never 12 been implemented among the bus captains. 13 CHAIRMAN: Ms Wong, can you help me locate this passage? 14 This is the LegCo briefing paper TD-1, page 403, 15 paragraph 15. 16 MS MAGGIE WONG: 15. 17 CHAIRMAN: Paragraph 15 is dealing with seat belts. 18 MS MAGGIE WONG: I believe this is a separate document, 19 Mr Chairman. It is a background paper. 20 CHAIRMAN: Is that prepared by the Secretariat? 21 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, the LegCo Secretariat. 22 CHAIRMAN: What is the reference for that paper? 23 MS MAGGIE WONG: We are locating it from online. 24 CHAIRMAN: Is that not in the bundle? 25 I have certainly read the document. We are just</p>

Page 85	Page 87
<p>1 trying to find it.</p> <p>2 Is this in the bundle, does it have a reference,</p> <p>3 Ms Wong?</p> <p>4 May I ask that the document be scrolled up so we can</p> <p>5 see the context? This appears to be a report of what</p> <p>6 happened earlier. Perhaps if we go to paragraph 13/14.</p> <p>7 So it appears to be a reference to a meeting held on</p> <p>8 15 February, and then if we scroll down to paragraph 15,</p> <p>9 yes, we have the context now, Mr Chan.</p> <p>10 Could you repeat your point?</p> <p>11 MR CHAN WING HO: Mr Chairman, the point I want to make is</p> <p>12 that the KMB said that whether it be full-time or</p> <p>13 part-time drivers, if they have not driven a route for</p> <p>14 a month or more they would have to practise driving on</p> <p>15 this route again. On this particular arrangement, since</p> <p>16 I joined the company, it has never been done.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: When did you join the company?</p> <p>18 MR CHAN WING HO: March 2015.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: This is a Secretariat paper gathering together</p> <p>20 materials to brief LegCo panel members about what has</p> <p>21 happened in the past. And this is a reference to</p> <p>22 a meeting on 15 February. Do we have the minutes of</p> <p>23 that meeting?</p> <p>24 MS MAGGIE WONG: I don't think so.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: The minutes will exist, will they not, of that</p>	<p>1 18-day training.</p> <p>2 Over the page it states:</p> <p>3 "A full-time bus captain candidate will have a total</p> <p>4 of at least 68 hours of on-the-wheel bus driving</p> <p>5 training (inclusive of the time for route training)</p> <p>6 under the supervision of instructors."</p> <p>7 Can you confirm if that's the case?</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: If you are unable to do so, please say -- if you</p> <p>9 simply don't know.</p> <p>10 MR CHAN WING HO: Now for this particular response, what is</p> <p>11 mentioned there is a bit different from the training</p> <p>12 I received.</p> <p>13 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you tell us what training did you have</p> <p>14 in your days?</p> <p>15 MR CHAN WING HO: Let's say phase 2, four to five bus types,</p> <p>16 training on four to five bus types. Now, my own</p> <p>17 training, I was only trained on two to three bus types.</p> <p>18 MS MAGGIE WONG: What about route training? It is stated</p> <p>19 there "route training for 2 routes".</p> <p>20 MR CHAN WING HO: Yes, I also was trained on two routes.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: And we have heard some evidence previously</p> <p>22 from Mr Li about route-specific training for full-time</p> <p>23 bus captain candidates. We see at page 122 (v), it sets</p> <p>24 out the:</p> <p>25 "Route training for 2 routes with on-the-wheel</p>
Page 86	Page 88
<p>1 meeting, so we are in a position to check the accuracy</p> <p>2 of what is the assertion by the Secretariat of what KMB</p> <p>3 are supposed to have said?</p> <p>4 But perhaps a matter that can be looked into later.</p> <p>5 We have your point, Mr Chan. That assertion is one</p> <p>6 that you challenge on your personal experience.</p> <p>7 MR CHAN WING HO: Yes.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Ms Wong.</p> <p>9 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. If I may take you to the KMB</p> <p>10 submission. Page, volume 1, KMB-1, page 120.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: What are we being taken to?</p> <p>12 MS MAGGIE WONG: We are taken to the response from the</p> <p>13 Kowloon Motor Bus to the Commissioner for Transport's</p> <p>14 letter dated 12 February 2018 in response to the request</p> <p>15 for investigation report, following the tragic incident</p> <p>16 on 10 February 2018.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>18 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Chan, this is KMB's response to</p> <p>19 the Commissioner's letter setting out the recruitment</p> <p>20 and training for both full-time and part-time bus</p> <p>21 captains.</p> <p>22 I would like to ask you a few questions about</p> <p>23 full-time bus captain in terms of general training, and</p> <p>24 specific training. We can see at page 120 it sets out</p> <p>25 the full-time bus captain training and details of the</p>	<p>1 driving under the supervision of instructors ..."</p> <p>2 And:</p> <p>3 "[Bus captain] candidate must attend route training</p> <p>4 before he/she will be assigned with driving duties."</p> <p>5 We heard there would be three days training. Do you</p> <p>6 know if there has been any change since your days, when</p> <p>7 you joined the company?</p> <p>8 MR CHAN WING HO: Basically there has been no change.</p> <p>9 MS MAGGIE WONG: If I may take you to page 123, it specified</p> <p>10 there is a route-specific training for employed bus</p> <p>11 captain both full-time and part-time, and there would be</p> <p>12 additional route familiarisation to be provided for</p> <p>13 assigning the bus captain after working three to six</p> <p>14 months, to drive another route.</p> <p>15 Has that happened?</p> <p>16 MR CHAN WING HO: Yes.</p> <p>17 MS MAGGIE WONG: Would that be additional training?</p> <p>18 MR CHAN WING HO: From my personal experience, there was</p> <p>19 a department, duty dispatch department of the company.</p> <p>20 Now, this unit would call us up, and then say for</p> <p>21 a particular route, for example 111, then at the</p> <p>22 terminus of route 111 I should ask the regulation</p> <p>23 officer for a schedule, and then I will go on that bus</p> <p>24 route for two trips, and then once I have learned that</p> <p>25 trip, the route, then I will tell the department again,</p>

Page 89	Page 91
<p>1 and then there may be a record, the route record here, 2 for route 111 for me. 3 MS MAGGIE WONG: On page 127, we can see there are some 4 remedial training where there are four liable incidents 5 within one year, new bus captain within two liable 6 incidents within first three months of work. Careless 7 driving or failing to ensure passenger safety, and 8 second careless driving will be termination. 9 It talks about remedial training for duration of one 10 to 3 days, usually one day, subject to the 11 recommendation of instructors. 12 Has that happened? 13 CHAIRMAN: Are you asking whether Mr Chan has had remedial 14 training? 15 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. Has there been remedial training in 16 those situations? 17 CHAIRMAN: "Have you received remedial training?" Is that 18 the question? 19 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. 20 MR CHAN WING HO: No, I have never received remedial 21 training. 22 MS MAGGIE WONG: In your experience with other bus captains 23 do you know if there are remedial training in those 24 circumstances set out on this page? 25 MR CHAN WING HO: As far as I know, I have never heard</p>	<p>1 MR LI KWOK WAH: No. It is the same route, 269D. 2 That means -- because I, you know, have been 3 assigned to that route, fixed route, sort of, and maybe 4 because of occasional need for redeployment I will be 5 taken away from that route, but it doesn't happen often. 6 CHAIRMAN: And when you took your break, the long break in 7 the middle of that shift, where did you take it? 8 MR LI KWOK WAH: Home. Because where the vehicle is parked 9 is close to my home, so I could get home. 10 CHAIRMAN: And where is that? 11 MR LI KWOK WAH: Tin Shui Wai. Because in Tin Shui Wai 12 there is a depot. So buses could be parked there in 13 between. So we could just leave the bus there, at the 14 depot, and I can ride a bicycle to get home more 15 quickly. If I walk it will take me 15 minutes to get 16 home. 17 CHAIRMAN: This was Tin Shui Wai depot that you would park 18 at during these shifts? 19 MR LI KWOK WAH: Yes, the company arrange for the bus to be 20 parked there. 21 CHAIRMAN: Were there facilities at Tin Shui Wai depot for 22 people to rest if they didn't live nearby? 23 MR LI KWOK WAH: Yes, there are some. But bus captains will 24 usually take a meal there. But there is no space for 25 taking a nap. But then you can still take a meal</p>
Page 90	Page 92
<p>1 of it. 2 MS MAGGIE WONG: Chairman, I believe I have completed my 3 questioning. 4 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 5 QUESTIONS FROM THE COMMITTEE 6 MEMBER LO: Just a short question. Based on your experience 7 with other special shift drivers, do you get to choose 8 a route close to your home, or would they consider your 9 home location in assigning a route to you? 10 MR CHAN WING HO: From my experience, if there is a vacancy 11 in a particular route, then we may try to apply -- we 12 submit a report to the scheduling division, and then 13 there will be internal rating for bus captains and then 14 we will see if we are assigned that route. For example, 15 myself, I belong to the Sha Tin depot, I work in the 16 Sha Tin district but I live in Tai Po. 17 MEMBER LO: So that means you don't get to choose a route. 18 Only if there is a vacancy of that route you can apply 19 for the same? 20 MR CHAN WING HO: Correct. 21 CHAIRMAN: Mr Li, you testified that you were a bus captain 22 driving special shifts for three years; is that correct? 23 MR LI KWOK WAH: Yes. 24 CHAIRMAN: And during those three years, did you drive 25 different routes?</p>	<p>1 there -- well, for some bus captains who live far away 2 they can't get home and then they would rest on the bus 3 itself. But for those who can really return home, if we 4 have a rest break of three to four hours we would go 5 back home and take a rest and have a meal there as well. 6 CHAIRMAN: So were you aware that there were work colleagues 7 that would, as you say, take a nap in the bus because 8 they could not get home? 9 MR LI KWOK WAH: Yes, that's correct. Because they live too 10 far away. Some of them live in Kam Tin, and, well, it 11 can take them easily two hours to get back and forth. 12 So the rest break is only three hours and you spend 13 two hours in travelling. So how can you rest? So they 14 then might as well take a rest within the bus, and then 15 within the rest room there is only a space for you to 16 take a meal, and so normally the bus captains will opt 17 to take a rest within the bus. 18 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Thank you. 19 Is there any matter that you would like to raise 20 with us in closing? Because we have finished the 21 questions we have for you. 22 MR LI KWOK WAH: Yes, we would like to raise some 23 suggestions. 24 On -- that is on work hours. We say that for the 25 morning shift, in the special shift, it should not be</p>

Page 93	Page 95
<p>1 beyond 2100. The starting hours for the morning shift 2 should not be before 0330, because it is -- if we start 3 too early, then when people are having breakfast we are 4 already having lunch. For the latter shift it should 5 not start before 1300.</p> <p>6 For many routes the starting hours for the night 7 shift is 11. So how can you call that a night shift? 8 And for newly recruited bus captains, please don't 9 assign them to special shift, because they are not yet 10 familiar with the operation of the company.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: When you say 11 o'clock, do you mean 11 pm? 12 2300 hours?</p> <p>13 MR LI KWOK WAH: I'm referring to the 11 am. I mean the 14 night shift should start -- should not start before 15 11 am.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: 11 am. Thank you.</p> <p>17 MR LI KWOK WAH: Yes.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: You have used terms about naming these shifts. 19 Can you just help me at least: morning, afternoon, 20 night. What do you call the shift?</p> <p>21 MR LI KWOK WAH: Well, there is only morning shift and night 22 shift for the KMB. There is no middle shift, so to 23 speak. There is only morning shift and night shift, and 24 then overnight shift. So this is the system in place in 25 KMB. The association is raising this. Because if the</p>	<p>1 and then they have to report duty at 5 am. And if you 2 are talking about long-haul buses, then it may end up at 3 3 to 4 pm, but for short-haul trips the ending hours may 4 be different.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: What is the range of time during which the night 6 shift begins?</p> <p>7 MR LI KWOK WAH: Let's look at it this way. Well, the 8 timing of the different routes varies. So our 9 suggestion is that the night shift should not start 10 before 1 pm.</p> <p>11 So if we are talking about many departures, then the 12 schedule may be different, some start at, say, 11, some 13 start at 1 pm. Some start even later, so it is 14 different for the bus captains.</p> <p>15 So if you start at 1 pm, the bus captains don't even 16 have breakfast, they have lunch and then they start 17 work.</p> <p>18 And then if the night shift starts too early, then 19 you may have to take your meals earlier, and some night 20 shifts end at around 1 to 2 am. So the bus captains 21 work 12 hours, and they become fatigued easily, tired 22 easily.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: What is the range of time when the overnight 24 shifts begin?</p> <p>25 MR LI KWOK WAH: Before 7.30 pm.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 94</p> <p>1 special shift ends after 2100, then people don't have 2 enough time to rest. Because the road conditions are 3 changing all the time, so if the night shift ends at 4 2100, and maybe because of road congestion, and traffic 5 accidents, the shift may well go beyond 2100. So it is 6 difficult for them to come into the morning shift the 7 next day. So we need at least 10 hours of rest in 8 between.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Please take it step by step. 10 What are the parameters to commence work for the 11 morning shift? What are the range of times at which you 12 commence work in the morning shift?</p> <p>13 MR LI KWOK WAH: What I meant was that when we start the 14 morning shift, the first departure, usually starts at 15 5 am. And for some routes -- some bus captains have to 16 report duty at 3.30 am, and that may be the last trip of 17 the overnight shift, so that is why it starts so early.</p> <p>18 Now, the bus captains if they start too early, well, 19 they may not be ending at 1 or 2, so they are working 20 for at least 11 hours. So if people get up too early, 21 then they become tired easily.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: What range of times does the morning shift 23 finish?</p> <p>24 MR LI KWOK WAH: It depends on the routes. The earliest is 25 around 12 or so, and for some other routes, 3 to 4 pm,</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 96</p> <p>1 CHAIRMAN: And what is the range of time when the overnight 2 shifts end?</p> <p>3 MR LI KWOK WAH: 7.30 am in the morning. So in other words 4 from 7.30 pm to 7.30 am.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. That's your point on work hours and 6 your recommendation. Is there anything else you wish to 7 say?</p> <p>8 MR LI KWOK WAH: I have two issues to raise. They are about 9 road conditions. 10 Well, there are skips being placed all the time 11 along bus routes obstructing buses to get into the bus 12 stops, and other road users as well. 13 So skips, is there a dedicated department to remove 14 them, because the skips are jeopardising the safety of 15 the road users. I don't know whether the law specifies 16 locations where they can be placed, say for example now 17 in Nathan Road some skips are placed and they are 18 obstructing the traffic. 19 So my suggestion is that if there is a dedicated 20 department responsible for this they should remove such 21 skips, because we are talking about busy roads, and 22 skips will cause traffic congestion. For bus captains, 23 if there is traffic congestion then we may be stuck and 24 passengers are made to wait longer. 25 So can skips be placed somewhere else? Can we</p>

Page 97	Page 99
<p>1 complain against them, and then the police will follow 2 up?</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: I'm sure there is an authority or an approval 4 that is required before you can drop a skip off the 5 lorry onto the road. But we will ask the Transport 6 Department about that, and perhaps the police.</p> <p>7 MR LI KWOK WAH: Thank you.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Do you have any photographs that you wish to 9 provide the Committee with, to illustrate the difficulty 10 caused by skips in the road? Particularly if they are 11 near bus stops, then please provide them to us.</p> <p>12 MR LI KWOK WAH: Understand.</p> <p>13 And there is another point on bus stops.</p> <p>14 Earlier, we had a meeting with the Transport 15 Department, some vehicles are parked at the bus stops, 16 making it difficult for buses to get into the bus stops.</p> <p>17 So our suggestion is that if there is illegally -- 18 illegal parking around bus stops can a point deduction 19 system be introduced to serve as a deterrent, so that 20 vehicles other than buses will not be parked within the 21 bus stop area? Because so many vehicles are parked at 22 the bus stop, and buses have to double park to let 23 passengers alight on board.</p> <p>24 And if we go back to the bus terminus and report it 25 to the police, the vehicles would already have gone</p>	<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Well, those that have got cameras, would you 2 support bus captains operating a button, perhaps, that 3 flagged on the CCTV the time for someone to look at the 4 CCTV film to be able to see the illegal parking? Would 5 you support bus captains doing that?</p> <p>6 MR LI KWOK WAH: Yes. We support it. Well, if buses can 7 get into the bus stops then that would make it easier 8 for the bus captains. Because we are talking about 9 illegal parking here. And passenger safety can be 10 enhanced if the buses really can get into the bus stops.</p> <p>11 And passengers --</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Mr Li, we understand your point. It is a point 13 that is well made. All we are trying to do is find 14 methods to assist you this achieving that aim.</p> <p>15 MR LI KWOK WAH: I understand.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: Is there anything else?</p> <p>17 MR LI KWOK WAH: Mr Chan would like to say something.</p> <p>18 MR CHAN WING HO: Mr Chairman, on our bus roster schedules, 19 we would like the Transport Department to make 20 a guideline. Every day, for every bus captain on the 21 same shift there should be just one main route plus 22 a supplementary route. So one plus one. Because for 23 many routes in the same roster, there is a range of one 24 plus two. In other words total of three routes we may 25 have to work on. So we would like the Transport</p>
Page 98	Page 100
<p>1 away.</p> <p>2 So, can we have a point deduction system or demerit 3 point system for vehicles parked illegally within the 4 bus stop?</p> <p>5 So that's our suggestion.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: On your KMB buses you have forward-pointing 7 cameras, do you not? At least on many of the buses.</p> <p>8 MR LI KWOK WAH: Yes, yes.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Now, those cameras would capture vehicles parked 10 illegally in that way, would they not?</p> <p>11 MR LI KWOK WAH: Yes, that can be done. But not the 12 majority of the buses are retrofitted with these 13 cameras. Only 1,800 buses are retrofitted with such 14 forward-looking cameras.</p> <p>15 Well, instead, why don't we install some cameras on 16 the bus stops themselves. There may be surveillance 17 cameras installed at the bus stops to detect illegal 18 parking. It is better to do that than using the cameras 19 on the buses.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Why not use what we have now? Why not use both?</p> <p>21 MR LI KWOK WAH: Because some of the buses are not 22 retrofitted with such cameras, especially some of the 23 old models of the buses. And most of the old buses have 24 not been replaced yet, or phased out yet. So 1,000 or 25 so new models of buses are retrofitted with cameras.</p>	<p>1 Department to come up with a guideline, so drivers won't 2 mix up routes and then take the wrong route or make the 3 wrong stops.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: So at the moment you might be asked to drive 5 three routes, and you are suggesting it be limited to 6 two?</p> <p>7 MR CHAN WING HO: Yes. Correct.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>9 Gentlemen, thank you for attending to give your 10 evidence. We have other representatives of other unions 11 waiting their turn. So we are going to take a short 12 adjournment now so there can be a swap around. Thank 13 you for attending. We will take 2 minutes.</p> <p>14 (3.32 pm)</p> <p>15 (A short break)</p> <p>16 (3.45 pm)</p> <p>17 REPRESENTATIVES OF MONTHLY-RATED DRIVERS UNION: MR CHENG 18 HOI YIU, MR SZETO KUEN, MR CHAN HON WA, MS YIP WAI LAM AND 19 MR CHAN CHI FAI, MR YAN KIN MING</p> <p>20 (Evidence given in Cantonese, transcription of the 21 simultaneous interpretation)</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: We would like to thank you, Ms Yip, and your 23 representatives of the Monthly-rated Drivers Union for 24 accepting our invitation to give evidence, and let me 25 explain, if you have not observed already, how matters</p>

Page 101	Page 103
<p>1 will proceed. Ms Wong, who is Senior Counsel assisting 2 the Committee, will pose questions that in part are 3 based on the submissions that you have made, but also on 4 other matters that have arisen.</p> <p>5 For your part, if you wish somebody else, other than 6 yourself, to answer questions, would you simply defer to 7 them and tell us who it is who is going to answer the 8 question on behalf of the union.</p> <p>9 Is there something you wish to say at the outset?</p> <p>10 MS YIP WAI LAM: Yes. Thank you.</p> <p>11 Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>12 First, I would like to thank the SAR government for 13 appointing this Independent Review Committee to look 14 into franchised bus services. I would particularly like 15 to thank the Committee members, including Mr Peter 16 Duncan, Justice Duncan, Justice Michael Lunn, Mr Auyeung 17 and Professor Lo, and I know you have worked very hard 18 to look into the issue, and I would like to express my 19 special thanks to the Committee.</p> <p>20 We have made a submission. On the first part of our 21 submission, engineering department, which has everything 22 to do with safety, and a very experienced colleague in 23 the engineering department will talk about the 24 difficulties he faces in his daily work.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: He won't do that just now, because I'm going to</p>	<p>1 MS YIP WAI LAM: Correct.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: And you have set out in your letter in 3 Chinese, dated 18 June 2018, at TU bundle, page 75-3 the 4 composition of the members of your union.</p> <p>5 And in that letter you stated that your union have 6 earlier done a consultation and about 800 full-time 7 employees would like to join.</p> <p>8 MS YIP WAI LAM: Correct.</p> <p>9 MS MAGGIE WONG: May I first of all ask, about the current 10 membership of about 150 full-time employees, from which 11 franchise buses do they come?</p> <p>12 MS YIP WAI LAM: Most of them are from KMB. They are the 13 bus captains. Some from New World First Bus, others 14 from Citybus. But the latter two take up a minor 15 portion.</p> <p>16 MS MAGGIE WONG: And can you give us an estimate, out of 150 17 people, how many came from KMB.</p> <p>18 MS YIP WAI LAM: And we asked the secretary to deal with the 19 registration of members. And we all go to work, and we 20 have to prepare for our submission to the Committee. So 21 we don't have an exact proportion here. But from other 22 companies, about five. The remaining are all KMB 23 workers.</p> <p>24 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. Your submission raised a number 25 of issues, or topics. I'll go to the training of bus</p>
Page 102	Page 104
<p>1 ask Ms Wong to pose questions first of all, and then if 2 there are areas that Ms Wong has not touched on, and you 3 wish to amplify, we'll come back to you.</p> <p>4 So if I can invite you to be patient, we will ask 5 Ms Wong to start first of all.</p> <p>6 Ms Wong.</p> <p>7 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you, Ms Yip, and gentlemen.</p> <p>8 MS YIP WAI LAM: Yes, understand.</p> <p>9 EXAMINATION BY MS WONG</p> <p>10 MS MAGGIE WONG: Ms Yip, this Committee is tasked to make 11 recommendations in relation to the safety-related 12 measures for the operation and management of franchised 13 buses. So my questions will only be focused on this 14 aspect, rather than the wider aspects of employment 15 issues.</p> <p>16 So I hope you understand.</p> <p>17 For your union, I believe your union was registered 18 in the Labour Department on 28 March 2018; is that 19 correct?</p> <p>20 MS YIP WAI LAM: Yes.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: And currently, it has 150, 150, full-time 22 staff as of 18 June 2018?</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: By that you mean members who are full-time 24 employees?</p> <p>25 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. Members who are full-time employees</p>	<p>1 captains first.</p> <p>2 Your submission in Chinese at page 68, in English 3 page 72, paragraph 3, you mentioned about a trainee bus 4 captain who passed the competency test for being a bus 5 captain, and he became a bus captain, and later he was 6 involved in a traffic accident, and sustained serious 7 injuries, in less than a week after he worked as a bus 8 captain.</p> <p>9 Can you first of all tell us, is he a part-time or 10 full-time bus captain?</p> <p>11 MS YIP WAI LAM: He or she is from the same class as mine, 12 same training class, and then we got the licence to 13 drive the bus. Why did I raise this particular 14 incident? At the time, well, each instructor will train 15 one to three trainees on a bus. And based on this 16 instructor's experience, the instructor believed that 17 this trainee should not -- is not suited to join the 18 trade and become a professional driver, and he advised 19 this trainee to find some other jobs. But then this 20 trainee came from Malaysia, and he was in dire need to 21 find a job, so the instructor had done his best, and 22 asked that the trainee should not be allowed to continue 23 with the training. But then because of the acute 24 manpower shortage, and there was heavy traffic 25 congestion on the road, and the company, the instructor,</p>

Page 105	Page 107
<p>1 was under great pressure to train enough bus captains. 2 So under great pressure -- yesterday, I met with an 3 experienced instructor, and he talked to me about this 4 particular issue. He said that he was unhappy, and they 5 set aside their own conscience, and just to fend for 6 their living -- 7 CHAIRMAN: Before you go on -- forgive me for interrupting 8 you. This particular trainee is someone who passed the 9 Transport Department exam, is that right? 10 MS YIP WAI LAM: Yes, correct. 11 CHAIRMAN: When was this class when you were trained? What 12 year is your class? 13 MS YIP WAI LAM: 2013. 22 April, I joined the trade. 14 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. The simple point is this, that this 15 trainee having passed the Transport Department exam was 16 employed as a bus captain, and he had an accident. We 17 have that point. 18 Ms Wong. 19 MS MAGGIE WONG: Ms Yip, have you been working for the 20 Kowloon Motor Bus since your training in 2013, for five 21 years? Correct? Yes? 22 CHAIRMAN: Can I ask you to use words, because the 23 stenographer can't write down "head is nodded". 24 Thank you. 25 MS YIP WAI LAM: Thank you. Understood. Yes. I have</p>	<p>1 reflect that, and then he is under pressure that he 2 should train up as many bus captains as possible, and he 3 is not really giving proper regard to safety here. 4 If I may add, instructors also do assessment. 5 Now, I recall that vividly on the day that we took 6 the test, the exam, each instructor was rather nervous, 7 as if he is the one taking the test. Because for the 8 trainees, they trained, if there is a high pass rate, 9 then it may be good for the assessment of the 10 instructors. So that's our guess. 11 That's why the instructors were rather nervous too. 12 They did mention before that it is also about their 13 performance, assessment is one of the criteria. 14 CHAIRMAN: Their performance assessment is not one of the 15 criteria for passing the Transport Department exam, is 16 it? The Transport Department exam is completely 17 separate. 18 MS YIP WAI LAM: Yes, yes. 19 CHAIRMAN: They might -- from what you say, do -- make an 20 assessment for the company. But that's a matter for the 21 company. Transport Department determines that the 22 person, the candidate, has passed the exam and was 23 granted a licence. 24 So Ms Wong, what is the point of this? 25 MS YIP WAI LAM: Yes.</p>
Page 106	Page 108
<p>1 worked for five years. 2 MS MAGGIE WONG: We got the point about the trainee. The 3 point I wish to ask you is in your submission you 4 mentioned that the instructor did make certain comments 5 about the character of the trainee, but the company 6 neglects relevant comments under the existing system. 7 My first question is, how did the company neglect 8 those comments, and what comments were they? 9 MS YIP WAI LAM: The instructor had reflected the situation 10 to the group leader, and the trainee was asked to go up 11 to the rooftop to try out -- to practise training, to 12 parking, to do some parking. So once he has done that, 13 then we will let him continue with the training. 14 MS MAGGIE WONG: Was it your view that the training to bus 15 captains provided by the Kowloon Motor Bus is 16 insufficient, even though the trainee has passed the 17 test? 18 MS YIP WAI LAM: We talked about bus safety all the time. 19 I think that involves a number of factors, including the 20 Transport Department having a role to play. And because 21 when the exam is taken, the Transport Department may 22 believe there would be further training by the company. 23 So maybe the exam standard is relatively lenient. But 24 then if an experienced instructor knows this person is 25 not suited to driving, and he has tried his best to</p>	<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: And if I may move on to your 2 recommendation. One of your recommendations is that 3 everyday driving enhancement course to be included in 4 the training for bus captains, in paragraph 6, and 5 focusing on accelerator and brake control, turn 6 negotiation, and smooth driving. 7 Why you see a need to have this extra three days' 8 driving enhancement course? 9 MS YIP WAI LAM: Yes. Because before we take the bus 10 driving licence exam, we need to have three years of 11 private vehicle licence. So why do we need to 12 strengthen training? Because buses are different from 13 private vehicles in terms of weight. So when it comes 14 to controlling the brake or the accelerator, it is 15 a different kind of skill. So we need to have a better 16 understanding of that. 17 And for new bus captains, in most cases, where they 18 have involved in accident it is because of emergency 19 braking leading to injuries of passengers or leading to 20 car from behind crashing into the bus. So this is 21 a more common scenario, where new bus captains are 22 involved in accidents. 23 So the biggest cause is because they don't brake 24 properly, and so passengers are injured as a result. 25 For turning corners, buses of course are different than</p>

Page 109	Page 111
<p>1 private vehicle, so it needs different skills in turning 2 corners, or manoeuvring corners, so if we have three 3 days of additional training, it is for the instructors 4 to assess the performance. If it is not good enough, 5 there could be further training. It is to make sure 6 that the trainee has completely mastered the driving 7 skills before the trainee is allowed to drive a bus on 8 the road and take passengers.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Have you made this recommendation to KMB? 10 MS YIP WAI LAM: Never had the chance. 11 CHAIRMAN: In five years of employment, you never had the 12 chance? Five years? 13 MS YIP WAI LAM: Employees rarely make suggestions. There 14 is not the platform really for us, me, to share the 15 information in such detail. 16 MS MAGGIE WONG: And you also stated that there should be 17 simulated traffic lights to be installed at driving 18 school with a view to strengthening the bus captain's 19 skill in applying the brake in response to traffic 20 lights. 21 And my question is this. I understand that there 22 would be an 18-day training for 9.5 hours a day for 23 full-time bus captain candidate. Would that not be 24 sufficient? Because it is based on the real life road 25 condition.</p>	<p>1 we actually face the pressure, perhaps there could be 2 some more training. It would be fine too. 3 Because we are always talking about starting afresh. 4 So we need to use some special words to respond. But it 5 is really out of touch with reality. 6 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can we move on to driving while sick? 7 CHAIRMAN: Before you do so -- have you experienced verbal 8 abuse yourself from passengers? 9 MS YIP WAI LAM: Yes. Verbal abuse. Even assault, physical 10 assault. 11 CHAIRMAN: Did you report these incidents? 12 MS YIP WAI LAM: Yes. I reported to the police at the time, 13 but because there was not a camera on board, and then 14 the passenger hired a lawyer, and then that passenger 15 was acquitted. 16 CHAIRMAN: So you report -- this is the assault, is it? You 17 reported an assault -- 18 MS YIP WAI LAM: Yes, I did call the police. 19 CHAIRMAN: That led to an arrest, and it led to a charge, 20 and it led to a trial, and it led to an acquittal; is 21 that right, what you have just said? 22 MS YIP WAI LAM: Yes, yes. 23 CHAIRMAN: And when was this? 24 MS YIP WAI LAM: It should be two years ago, if I recall 25 correctly.</p>
Page 110	Page 112
<p>1 MS YIP WAI LAM: For someone with driving experience, if 2 someone has already got a private vehicle licence for 3 three years, but for many young people they don't even 4 own a private car. So they don't have road experience, 5 and we always say road experience is the most important. 6 Why? Because there are a lot of unforeseen situations 7 on the road. 8 For an experienced bus captain this is fine. But 9 for someone without any driving experience, then 18 days 10 of training alone is not sufficient, definitely. 11 MS MAGGIE WONG: Would you suggest to widen the scope of 12 training, by including emotional control, or emotional 13 training on how to handle passengers, behaviour of 14 passengers? 15 MS YIP WAI LAM: In this respect, when we joined the KMB, if 16 I recall correctly, there was a questionnaire. There 17 would be brief mention of your EQ, or they try to check 18 your EQ. But would there be actual training? Well, 19 there is also training on how we should handle emotions, 20 yes, KMB did do that. But then the problems arose 21 because when you are in an actual duty, and you are 22 humiliated or shouted at by others, that means there is 23 need for more promotion so we can do better. 24 The KMB has always been doing, that but all I could 25 say, yes, in form, they have done everything, but when</p>	<p>1 CHAIRMAN: No doubt you remember the date, having been 2 assaulted on duty? Bus driver? What was the date? 3 MS YIP WAI LAM: I honestly don't remember. Maybe I can 4 provide the date later. 5 CHAIRMAN: Yes, if you would be kind enough. Which court 6 was this matter tried in? 7 MS YIP WAI LAM: Kwun Tong. 8 CHAIRMAN: And hopefully that was the only occasion when you 9 were assaulted; is that right? 10 MS YIP WAI LAM: Yes. 11 CHAIRMAN: What about verbal abuse? On how many occasions 12 have you been verbally abused by passengers? 13 MS YIP WAI LAM: Before the establishment of the 14 Monthly-rated Drivers Union, it happened often. After 15 the establishment of the union there was not a single 16 occasion. 17 CHAIRMAN: And how often had it occurred before? 18 MS YIP WAI LAM: All the time. Every day. As long as there 19 is some traffic congestion, or because there were not 20 enough bus drivers, bus captains on duty, so there were 21 fewer trips, maybe instead of 20 minutes it became 30 22 minutes frequency, and then passengers became really 23 impatient and angry. And very often they would vent 24 their frustration on us. 25 CHAIRMAN: Did you report these occasions of verbal abuse to</p>

Page 113	Page 115
<p>1 KMB?</p> <p>2 MS YIP WAI LAM: It has actually really become part of our</p> <p>3 work, so very rarely would we report that to our</p> <p>4 supervisors. You know, other colleagues just take it as</p> <p>5 it is.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: Could you try a direct answer. Did you report it</p> <p>7 or not?</p> <p>8 MS YIP WAI LAM: No.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>10 Yes, Ms Wong.</p> <p>11 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you tell us on which location this</p> <p>12 assault took place?</p> <p>13 MS YIP WAI LAM: The Cheung Sha Wan playground stop.</p> <p>14 MS MAGGIE WONG: This assault was in the bus or around the</p> <p>15 bus station?</p> <p>16 MS YIP WAI LAM: I was driving at the time. So I was in my</p> <p>17 driver seat, and I was assaulted.</p> <p>18 MS MAGGIE WONG: So the bus was in progress at that time?</p> <p>19 MS YIP WAI LAM: No, it was stopped. It stopped for alight</p> <p>20 at the time.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: May I assist, if you would look at KMB-1</p> <p>22 bundle. It should be case 97.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: Do we have a page?</p> <p>24 MS MAGGIE WONG: Page 214.</p> <p>25 Case 97, it is stated Ms Yip driving 238X, the</p>	<p>1 thing.</p> <p>2 And in any case KMB has now resolved the matter.</p> <p>3 Soon this assessment will be abolished and then you</p> <p>4 won't lose these bonuses because you don't come into</p> <p>5 work.</p> <p>6 And that money has been paid to us. So actually it</p> <p>7 is more than what they paid before, so this has been</p> <p>8 dealt with.</p> <p>9 MS MAGGIE WONG: And Ms Yip, you earlier mentioned about</p> <p>10 a very experienced colleague in the engineering</p> <p>11 department has raised difficulties he faced in daily</p> <p>12 work.</p> <p>13 Are they related to safety issues?</p> <p>14 MS YIP WAI LAM: Yes. Directly related. Definitely.</p> <p>15 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can I invite your colleague to express his</p> <p>16 views on how it related to safety aspect?</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: First of all, do they find a place in your</p> <p>18 written submissions?</p> <p>19 MS YIP WAI LAM: Are we talking about problems in the</p> <p>20 engineering department?</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: The point is your very experienced</p> <p>22 colleague in the engineering department, the problems or</p> <p>23 difficulties he faced. Are they reflected in your</p> <p>24 submissions, or have they been written in your</p> <p>25 submission? Have they been included in your submission?</p>
Page 114	Page 116
<p>1 incident on 29 September 2016, and you injured on your</p> <p>2 right arm. Is that the incident?</p> <p>3 MS YIP WAI LAM: Yes, yes, correct.</p> <p>4 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you.</p> <p>5 The next topic I wish to ask is driving while sick.</p> <p>6 And you mentioned in your submission, your union</p> <p>7 submission, that a lot of drivers -- I should state</p> <p>8 correctly by citing what you have said.</p> <p>9 You said that because of the number of hours</p> <p>10 working, the accumulative effect begins to take its toll</p> <p>11 on their body, but they are reluctant to take sick leave</p> <p>12 with the appraisal bonus in mind.</p> <p>13 I just want to ask you this. We know that the</p> <p>14 Kowloon Motor Bus has included or merged the good</p> <p>15 service bonus and the safety bonus into the monthly</p> <p>16 salary. About this appraisal bonus point, I just want</p> <p>17 to explore.</p> <p>18 Would this be a point that is not that relevant,</p> <p>19 because the safety bonus and the good service bonus have</p> <p>20 already been included in the salary, or merged into the</p> <p>21 salary? Is it still a valid point?</p> <p>22 MS YIP WAI LAM: Well, those are two separate parts. You</p> <p>23 mentioned the safety bonus and the other -- the service</p> <p>24 bonus being included in the base salary right? But this</p> <p>25 assessment bonus is a different one. It is not the same</p>	<p>1 MS YIP WAI LAM: (Answer not translated).</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: Is that paragraph 2, about not using the</p> <p>3 original components of the original bus franchise -- of</p> <p>4 the original bus? Is that the point?</p> <p>5 MR CHAN CHI FAI: Correct.</p> <p>6 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. Please explain the problem.</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: Is it not explained in writing?</p> <p>8 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. Apart from what is written there, is</p> <p>9 there anything you wish to add?</p> <p>10 MR CHAN CHI FAI: The shortage of components is a major</p> <p>11 problem. Well, we used not to have a shortage of</p> <p>12 components, but we don't know what happened to the</p> <p>13 procurement department. Right now we are running short</p> <p>14 of many components and what is required is lacking.</p> <p>15 Every year there was a period where the braking</p> <p>16 component was lacking. And then for each depot they</p> <p>17 have a working capital cash flow and then the depot</p> <p>18 would try to find a factory in the next industrial</p> <p>19 building to buy some components for us. Thank you.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Are you describing a shortage of inventory? Is</p> <p>21 that the problem, that whereas in the past inventory was</p> <p>22 carried, but now it is not; is that it?</p> <p>23 MR CHAN CHI FAI: In the past, we didn't have a shortage, we</p> <p>24 could make available components whenever needed. And</p> <p>25 usually we would check on the components, and we found</p>

Page 117	Page 119
<p>1 that if there is a problem, then we will issue an order, 2 and then when the order gets to the store, the component 3 will be given to us. 4 And for the past two years, we asked for a certain 5 component which could not be provided to us by the 6 stores. 7 And there was this incident involving the braking 8 component that I mentioned. 9 CHAIRMAN: When you say "the stores", you mean the stores 10 department of KMB? 11 MR CHAN CHI FAI: Correct. Yes, within the KMB. 12 CHAIRMAN: Do you know where the problem lies? Does it lie 13 with KMB not carrying sufficient inventory now, or does 14 it lie in supplier not being able to supply an order? 15 MR CHAN CHI FAI: We used to have a procurement department 16 And they press the button of a computer, and they saw 17 that there was a lack of the component in the inventory, 18 then they will order for them. I don't know what 19 happened to them. And then the components got fewer and 20 fewer, and we think that there is a problem. And when 21 we raised the issue it is already too late. And the 22 component that we are asking are lacking. 23 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 24 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. Ms Yip, we have heard evidence 25 previously that the Kowloon Motor Bus has, in one of the</p>	<p>1 month, retraining after one month, I have never heard of 2 that. 3 MR CHENG HOI YIU: Let me supplement. 4 Now, if you have been driving a certain route within 5 two years, then you can still drive that route, but for 6 two years, if you don't -- haven't driven that route, 7 then your record on the computer has -- will be deleted. 8 I have driven 496, and given another route, 47X. 9 Now, after I have driven -- I have not driven 47X for 10 one year, maybe all of a sudden you will be asked to 11 drive that route again, and maybe there will be changes 12 in the alignment of the route and the bus stop. You 13 would still be asked to drive that route. So there is 14 a hazard there. Because we never know what changes have 15 happened to the route. 16 CHAIRMAN: Are you saying that the computer deletes your 17 qualification, if you like, to drive a route, if you 18 have not driven it for two years? 19 MR CHENG HOI YIU: Correct. 20 MS MAGGIE WONG: Ms Yip, you talked about "previously". 21 I think it has not been translated on the screen. You 22 said this two years, if you have not driven the route 23 for two years you would be asked to retrain again, but 24 previously there was not such a requirement. What do 25 you mean by "previously"?</p>
Page 118	Page 120
<p>1 papers -- it was stated in one of the background brief 2 papers, issued to the LegCo, in relation to 3 the February 2018 incident, providing background 4 information on safety of franchised bus operation for 5 the panel meeting on 25 July 2018, and if we go to 6 paragraph 15, it stated there that -- 7 CHAIRMAN: Is this in our bundles or not? 8 MS MAGGIE WONG: No, that's the bundle referred to by the 9 previous -- 10 CHAIRMAN: Can we have it added to the bundles? 11 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. I think it is now put up on the 12 screen. 13 The English reads this: 14 "The KMB advised that if bus captains, regardless of 15 full-time or part-time, had not driven a route for 16 a month or more, they would have to practise driving on 17 that route again." 18 Ms Yip, and the gentlemen present perhaps, can you 19 advise us whether this has happened, where, if a bus 20 captain had not driven a route for a month or more, they 21 would have to practise driving on that route again? 22 MS YIP WAI LAM: To be frank, if for two years we have not 23 driven a route, a particular route, then we will have to 24 undergo training by the instructor again. So my 25 understanding, two years, but if you talk about one</p>	<p>1 MS YIP WAI LAM: Well, I have never heard that you will have 2 to be retrained after one month. 3 MS MAGGIE WONG: Since when was this requirement in place? 4 That required bus captains -- 5 MS YIP WAI LAM: That's been the requirement all along. 6 From the day I joined the company, I learned that, say, 7 if you have not driven a route for two years, after 8 being trained on that route, that, your eligibility to 9 drive that route will be got rid of. 10 MS MAGGIE WONG: Ms Yip, do you drive special shift? Or 11 normal shift? 12 MS YIP WAI LAM: I am on normal shift. 13 MS MAGGIE WONG: Is anyone present here driving on a special 14 shift? 15 MR YAN KIN MING: Yes. 16 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you, Mr Yan. 17 May I ask your experience in driving special shift 18 in terms of we have heard evidence that some of the bus 19 captains who are driving special shifts for Kowloon 20 Motor Bus were not given three hours consecutive -- 21 three consecutive hours of resting. Is this an 22 experience that you have as well? 23 MR YAN KIN MING: Yes. 24 MS MAGGIE WONG: May I know which route you are driving? 25 MR YAN KIN MING: I drive around 10 routes. And we will,</p>

Page 121	Page 123
<p>1 say, follow the orders, and usually on a day we will</p> <p>2 drive three routes.</p> <p>3 MS MAGGIE WONG: For how long did you take up this special</p> <p>4 shift, in KMB?</p> <p>5 MR YAN KIN MING: Around three years.</p> <p>6 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you tell us, did you take the morning</p> <p>7 shift or the night shift?</p> <p>8 MR YAN KIN MING: There is only one shift in special shift,</p> <p>9 just the morning shift.</p> <p>10 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you tell us since when, perhaps since</p> <p>11 when did you start work? For a particular day?</p> <p>12 MR YAN KIN MING: Around 6 to 7. Am.</p> <p>13 MS MAGGIE WONG: So 6 am to 7 pm?</p> <p>14 MR YAN KIN MING: (Answer not interpreted).</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: When did you last drive a special shift?</p> <p>16 Yesterday?</p> <p>17 MR YAN KIN MING: Correct.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: Where do you live?</p> <p>19 MR YAN KIN MING: Mong Kok.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: What time did you get up?</p> <p>21 MR YAN KIN MING: (In English) 5 o'clock.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: Where did you go then?</p> <p>23 MR YAN KIN MING: After I get up, and I will do something,</p> <p>24 and then I will go to work.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: What time did you leave home? The actual fact,</p>	<p>1 CHAIRMAN: What time did you arrive at your destination?</p> <p>2 MR YAN KIN MING: 7.30.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: What time did you begin driving the route?</p> <p>4 MR YAN KIN MING: 7.45.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: What route were you driving?</p> <p>6 MR YAN KIN MING: X42C.</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: Where does that route take you?</p> <p>8 MR YAN KIN MING: To Yau Tong bus terminus.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Did you drive to and from Yau Tong in the</p> <p>10 morning?</p> <p>11 MR YAN KIN MING: No.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Tell us what you did do.</p> <p>13 MR YAN KIN MING: I got to the Yau Tong bus terminus, and</p> <p>14 then I will use my private -- use the private plate.</p> <p>15 That means a bus without passengers, and then I went to</p> <p>16 Tsuen Wan, Discovery Park estate, and then I took a 40M.</p> <p>17 The bus, I drove that route.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: So you went from Yau Tong to Tsuen Wan, and then</p> <p>19 you drove a route; is that it?</p> <p>20 MR YAN KIN MING: Yes.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: What was that route?</p> <p>22 MR YAN KIN MING: 42M.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: Where did you go?</p> <p>24 MR YAN KIN MING: To Cheung Wang bus terminus.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: And then?</p>
Page 122	Page 124
<p>1 yesterday. What time did you leave home?</p> <p>2 MR YAN KIN MING: 6 am.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: And where did you go?</p> <p>4 MR YAN KIN MING: The bus depot.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: Which is where?</p> <p>6 MR YAN KIN MING: On Tsing Yi Island, the bus depot there.</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: How did you get there?</p> <p>8 MR YAN KIN MING: I will take the company bus, the first</p> <p>9 departure, and then I get to somewhere in Tsing Yi, and</p> <p>10 then change for what we call a works bus or vehicle</p> <p>11 which will take us to the bus depot.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Which bus depot did you arrive at yesterday?</p> <p>13 MR YAN KIN MING: Also Tsing Yi.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: What time did you clock on for work?</p> <p>15 MR YAN KIN MING: 7.00.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: And after you clocked on, what did you do?</p> <p>17 MR YAN KIN MING: Then I will find the bus that I have to</p> <p>18 drive on that day.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Presumably you have to check the bus?</p> <p>20 MR YAN KIN MING: (In English) Yes, sir.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: And then did you drive the bus somewhere?</p> <p>22 MR YAN KIN MING: And then I drove the bus to the Cheung</p> <p>23 Hong bus terminus.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: What time did you leave Tsing Yi on that journey?</p> <p>25 MR YAN KIN MING: 7.20.</p>	<p>1 MR YAN KIN MING: I did two rounds on this route, so back</p> <p>2 and forth twice.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: Between Tsuen Wan and Cheung Wang bus terminus?</p> <p>4 MR YAN KIN MING: Yes.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: And then did you have a break?</p> <p>6 MR YAN KIN MING: Yes.</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: What time was the break?</p> <p>8 MR YAN KIN MING: Should be 12.30 or so.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: And how long was the break?</p> <p>10 MR YAN KIN MING: To 3.20 pm.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: And where did the break begin?</p> <p>12 MR YAN KIN MING: Well, it doesn't matter where I took the</p> <p>13 break, but rather I would be given a designated parking</p> <p>14 space, I left my bus there and then the break started</p> <p>15 counting.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: Where did you leave the bus?</p> <p>17 MR YAN KIN MING: Tsing Yi airport station.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: What did you do in that break time? Two hours 50</p> <p>19 minutes?</p> <p>20 MR YAN KIN MING: Lunch and an afternoon nap.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Where did you take the nap?</p> <p>22 MR YAN KIN MING: At the Tsuen Wan bus terminus there is</p> <p>23 room for us to take a rest.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: What facilities are there for you to take a nap?</p> <p>25 MR YAN KIN MING: There are four sofas, and so I could take</p>

Page 125	Page 127
<p>1 a short nap.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: You had a sofa?</p> <p>3 MR YAN KIN MING: Yes. Sofa.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: How many other bus captains were sharing the</p> <p>5 facilities at the time?</p> <p>6 MR YAN KIN MING: Two.</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: Once you resumed driving at 15.20, or 3.20, where</p> <p>8 did you travel to and from?</p> <p>9 MR YAN KIN MING: It was at 3.35 that I started driving,</p> <p>10 because at 3.30 I had to get the bus and went to the bus</p> <p>11 terminus. So at 3.35 I started driving, route 41A from</p> <p>12 Cheung On bus terminus to Tsim Sha Tsui East.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: And then?</p> <p>14 MR YAN KIN MING: Then I went back to Cheung On bus</p> <p>15 terminus.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: Yes.</p> <p>17 MR YAN KIN MING: And then I did the same trip again. One</p> <p>18 round.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Does that bring you to the end of your driving or</p> <p>20 not?</p> <p>21 MR YAN KIN MING: Yes.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: What time is that?</p> <p>23 MR YAN KIN MING: 8.50 pm.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: Where were you when your driving duties came to</p> <p>25 an end?</p>	<p>1 MR YAN KIN MING: Yes.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: Have you been driving those three routes</p> <p>3 for those three years, or there are different routes?</p> <p>4 MR YAN KIN MING: Yes, there are other routes as well.</p> <p>5 MS MAGGIE WONG: Is it a frequent occurrence that you have</p> <p>6 to drive three difference routes on the same day?</p> <p>7 MR YAN KIN MING: Yes.</p> <p>8 MS MAGGIE WONG: How long have you been working for Kowloon</p> <p>9 Motor Bus?</p> <p>10 MR YAN KIN MING: I have been working for about 3.5 years at</p> <p>11 KMB.</p> <p>12 MS MAGGIE WONG: Throughout this period you have been</p> <p>13 driving special shift?</p> <p>14 MR YAN KIN MING: Yes.</p> <p>15 MS MAGGIE WONG: Have you been involved in accidents, road</p> <p>16 accidents?</p> <p>17 MR YAN KIN MING: So far, no.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: Well done.</p> <p>19 MR YAN KIN MING: (In English) Thank you.</p> <p>20 MS MAGGIE WONG: Have you come across any assault incidents</p> <p>21 or verbal abuse?</p> <p>22 MR YAN KIN MING: Every day there is verbal abuse.</p> <p>23 MS MAGGIE WONG: Assault incidents?</p> <p>24 MR YAN KIN MING: No. No assault.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Have you ever reported verbal abuse to the</p>
Page 126	Page 128
<p>1 MR YAN KIN MING: When I finished my duty, I had to take the</p> <p>2 car back to the bus depot to fill up the gas tank and</p> <p>3 then I left the car there and finished the day's work.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: When you say "car", I take it you mean the bus?</p> <p>5 MR YAN KIN MING: Yes, the bus.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: What time had you finished doing all of that,</p> <p>7 refueling the bus?</p> <p>8 MR YAN KIN MING: 9 pm.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: What did you do after that?</p> <p>10 MR YAN KIN MING: After that I took the works vehicle to go</p> <p>11 to the urban area and then I took another bus to go</p> <p>12 home.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: What time did you get home?</p> <p>14 MR YAN KIN MING: 9.40 or so.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: So your day had begun at 6 am, when you left</p> <p>16 home, and it was complete at 9.40 pm; is that it?</p> <p>17 MR YAN KIN MING: Yes.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: That was yesterday?</p> <p>19 MR YAN KIN MING: Yes.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Today is your day off, is it?</p> <p>21 MR YAN KIN MING: Yes.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>23 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you.</p> <p>24 Mr Yan, you said you were on split shift duty for</p> <p>25 three years, correct? Or special shift yes.</p>	<p>1 company?</p> <p>2 MR YAN KIN MING: No.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: Why not?</p> <p>4 MR YAN KIN MING: Because the company knows, all along.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: Have steps been taken to help you deal with</p> <p>6 verbal abuse, as bus captains?</p> <p>7 MR YAN KIN MING: You mean the company, helping?</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Yes.</p> <p>9 MR YAN KIN MING: No. No.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: But on the buses you drive, are there now cameras</p> <p>11 that focus on the bus captain's seat area.</p> <p>12 MR YAN KIN MING: Yes. Sometimes, yes, there is the camera,</p> <p>13 sometimes not, because every day I drive a different bus</p> <p>14 and a different route. So for the older models there</p> <p>15 are no cameras. For the new models there are cameras.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: These ones with cameras, do they not have an</p> <p>17 audio track as well, not just video?</p> <p>18 MR YAN KIN MING: As far as I know, yes, some have audio</p> <p>19 recording, because I see some camera has a microphone.</p> <p>20 MS YIP WAI LAM: If I may add, the judge asked what could be</p> <p>21 done to help us.</p> <p>22 Well, actually we mentioned in our submission, we</p> <p>23 asked that bus captains be allowed to install cameras</p> <p>24 themselves. Why? Because some buses have cameras, but</p> <p>25 some don't. And if something happens, or if the police</p>

Page 129	Page 131
<p>1 try to obtain the video recording from the company, 2 company will say, "No, we don't have it". We don't know 3 why. But we want to protect our own personal safety, 4 and actually, if a camera is installed, it sort of 5 alerts passengers that they can be seen, and usually 6 they are really smart, when there is a camera they will 7 be a lot more restrained.</p> <p>8 So we are not even asking the company to install the 9 cameras, we are just asking the company to allow bus 10 captains to install the cameras, so before the company 11 installs cameras on all buses, we hope they will allow 12 us to install cameras ourselves. And it is important 13 that --</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: Just a moment, Ms Yip. You are racing ahead. 15 Slow down. Like your buses.</p> <p>16 MS YIP WAI LAM: Yes. Got it.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: What was the response to the company, to your 18 request that you be allowed to install your own cameras?</p> <p>19 MS YIP WAI LAM: If bus captains are found to have installed 20 cameras we would be disciplined.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Have you ever made this request in writing, to 22 the company?</p> <p>23 MS YIP WAI LAM: No.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: Why not?</p> <p>25 MS YIP WAI LAM: Do you think that if we tell them -- we</p>	<p>1 regarded as illegal retrofitting.</p> <p>2 MR CHAN WING HO: Because this is not a part in the schedule 3 of the parts, and so if it is found it is there, then it 4 is considered illegal.</p> <p>5 MS MAGGIE WONG: When was this circular issued?</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: Let's not get ahead of ourselves. 7 You said that they issued a circular, Mr Cheng. Can 8 we have a copy of the circular?</p> <p>9 MS YIP WAI LAM: Well, usually after we read the circular we 10 won't keep it.</p> <p>11 MR CHAN WING HO: And it is not -- it's an internal 12 document; we can't make it public.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: We are going to have KMB giving evidence in due 14 course. We will ask them the same questions. So why 15 can't you provide a document to us that explains what 16 this position is?</p> <p>17 MS YIP WAI LAM: (Answer not interpreted).</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: There may be a very good reason why they don't 19 allow you to do this, and we are just trying to find out 20 the facts.</p> <p>21 MS YIP WAI LAM: Say, for example, for the travelling time 22 the company considers that confidential information 23 too --</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: Very well, we don't need to trouble you. We will 25 ask KMB.</p>
Page 130	Page 132
<p>1 think if we tell them and it is going to lead to 2 nowhere, then we won't do it. You know, there is no 3 trust.</p> <p>4 They won't even let us install the cameras. They 5 would actually discipline us for installing cameras, so 6 you would think they won't install the cameras.</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: Well --</p> <p>8 MS YIP WAI LAM: Now, if you are the senior manager of 9 course we would be happy. If you were the senior 10 management, we would be happy because we can reason with 11 you.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Do you know, and if you don't know say so, do you 13 know why bus captains are disciplined if they install 14 their own cameras? Has the company ever explained?</p> <p>15 MS YIP WAI LAM: It is about privacy, they said. It is 16 about privacy.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: Is this something they articulated in writing?</p> <p>18 MR CHENG HOI YIU: I think at the induction training the 19 instructors would briefly mention that they would ask us 20 not to install the cameras, and there is a circular too, 21 through various channels they would ask all frontline 22 bus captains not to install cameras because of privacy 23 issues.</p> <p>24 MS YIP WAI LAM: Also, they said, this is illegal 25 retrofitting, that is if we install camera it would be</p>	<p>1 Yes, Ms Wong.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you tell us approximately when this 3 circular was issued?</p> <p>4 MS YIP WAI LAM: A year ago.</p> <p>5 MS MAGGIE WONG: And you earlier said that if you install 6 these cameras, you would be disciplined. Who said that? 7 Can you tell us, identify the person who said, "If you 8 install this we will discipline you"?</p> <p>9 MS YIP WAI LAM: Usually, if a bus captain breached 10 a certain code, you will be given a piece of paper, a 11 memo, telling you why you are really summonsed to meet 12 with the senior management. So previously, the members 13 have sent us such memo so we know that this is the case.</p> <p>14 MS MAGGIE WONG: Would you be kind enough to provide us with 15 those documents? I assume they are not KMB documents. 16 It is a request from your members to the company.</p> <p>17 MS YIP WAI LAM: It is a company -- it is a document issued 18 by the company.</p> <p>19 MS MAGGIE WONG: It is the KMB issuing the notice to 20 members -- to bus captains. 21 And did they spell out in the letter that "If you 22 install cameras, we will discipline you"? Did they 23 spell in those terms, very specific about those terms?</p> <p>24 MS YIP WAI LAM: It is stated in the circular.</p> <p>25 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can I take it that your union would support</p>

Page 133	Page 135
<p>1 the use of surveillance cameras to be installed for the</p> <p>2 purpose of recording verbally or orally and visually</p> <p>3 events happened in the bus?</p> <p>4 MS YIP WAI LAM: Yes, support.</p> <p>5 The last topic, Ms Yip, is we have heard evidence,</p> <p>6 or the Transport Department provided us with a briefing</p> <p>7 paper, and informed us as a result of a working group</p> <p>8 study carried out in mid-March 2018 consisting of five</p> <p>9 franchised buses, and three bus manufacturers, the</p> <p>10 working group made a recommendation report which set out</p> <p>11 three areas of concern: the first is the seat belt;</p> <p>12 second is the technological device; and the third,</p> <p>13 training of bus captain.</p> <p>14 And the Transport Department informed us that</p> <p>15 recently they have issued a practice note in relation to</p> <p>16 the training of bus captains.</p> <p>17 MS MAGGIE WONG: So my question is: has Kowloon Motor Bus</p> <p>18 consulted your union's views in relation to the practice</p> <p>19 note?</p> <p>20 MS YIP WAI LAM: No.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: Have you been given a copy of the practice</p> <p>22 note issued by the Transport Department?</p> <p>23 MS YIP WAI LAM: We have never received it.</p> <p>24 MS MAGGIE WONG: May I ask your view on some of the</p> <p>25 technological devices, your union's view on some of the</p>	<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: Have you had a chance to read the section</p> <p>2 on training of bus captains, from paragraphs 18 to 22?</p> <p>3 MS YIP WAI LAM: Yes, we have briefly read through it.</p> <p>4 The training mentioned here -- I mean, not many</p> <p>5 details are given, but of course the more training the</p> <p>6 better. But we don't see what bus captains should pay</p> <p>7 attention in our daily work, that nothing is mentioned</p> <p>8 in that regard is regrettable.</p> <p>9 MS MAGGIE WONG: I have completed my questioning,</p> <p>10 Mr Chairman. Thank you.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: Mr Auyeung.</p> <p>12 MEMBER AUYEUNG: I want to follow up on the comment that</p> <p>13 Ms Yip and Mr Yan made earlier about the abuse that you</p> <p>14 are experiencing on a daily basis, and yet both of you</p> <p>15 mentioned that there was no point to report to your</p> <p>16 management.</p> <p>17 Can I hear a bit more about the logic behind that?</p> <p>18 You refuse to report it because you don't think</p> <p>19 management is going to do anything, or whatever they do</p> <p>20 is not going to help? I just want to understand</p> <p>21 a little bit more. Thank you.</p> <p>22 MR CHENG HOI YIU: Well, honestly, we face verbal abuse</p> <p>23 every day. It is something so common.</p> <p>24 Why does this happen? You know, Hong Kong people</p> <p>25 are under a lot of pressure, and people are fast-paced,</p>
Page 134	Page 136
<p>1 technological devices.</p> <p>2 The first, it is at TD-1, page 403. If we look at</p> <p>3 4(a), it is the electronic stability control system.</p> <p>4 Would your union support the use of this system?</p> <p>5 MS YIP WAI LAM: On the safety devices, (a), (b), and 5 and</p> <p>6 6, and also the other systems on the third page, after</p> <p>7 our deliberations, we think these are very good devices.</p> <p>8 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you.</p> <p>9 What about seat belts to be installed on all seats</p> <p>10 in buses?</p> <p>11 MS YIP WAI LAM: Well, it is of course a good thing to have</p> <p>12 seat belts, but there is a problem arising from this.</p> <p>13 If the seat belts are damaged, should buses continue</p> <p>14 to operate, or do the bus captains have the</p> <p>15 responsibility to ensure that passengers have their seat</p> <p>16 belts on? And some elderly persons might need</p> <p>17 assistance in wearing their seat belt. So these are the</p> <p>18 problems that we envisage and we are worried about that.</p> <p>19 But, of course, having an extra safety device is always</p> <p>20 good. And there are so many passengers patronising bus</p> <p>21 services, we have to make sure the seat belt is not</p> <p>22 damaged and once it is damaged then passengers' safety</p> <p>23 will be jeopardised.</p> <p>24 I think the overall direction is good. But in terms</p> <p>25 of actual implementation we see some difficulties.</p>	<p>1 and in view of the manpower shortage in the sector,</p> <p>2 because of road congestion, which is very common, and</p> <p>3 passengers may have to wait longer than they expect. So</p> <p>4 they will vent their anger on the frontline staff.</p> <p>5 The management in all companies in the sector is</p> <p>6 well aware of the situation.</p> <p>7 Well, for every route, for every bus captain, that</p> <p>8 happens. And the management will not do too much,</p> <p>9 because they can't solve the problem.</p> <p>10 MR CHAN HON WA: Let me cite an example. Earlier some</p> <p>11 members have been physically -- I mean verbally abused</p> <p>12 by the passengers, and they have reflected the problem</p> <p>13 to the management. And the bus stops in the middle of</p> <p>14 the road, the passenger hurling the verbal abuse was</p> <p>15 waiting on the bus, waiting for the police's handling,</p> <p>16 and the company's handling, and the company tried to</p> <p>17 water down the matter, and asked the bus captain to</p> <p>18 continue with the trip.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Just a moment.</p> <p>20 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Please.</p> <p>21 MS YIP WAI LAM: Every day we encounter this, and there is</p> <p>22 this performance management group in the company, maybe</p> <p>23 there are complaints by the passengers, and we tell the</p> <p>24 management our side of story, but the company always</p> <p>25 says, well, just be more careful, and they are not of</p>

Page 137	Page 139
<p>1 much actual help.</p> <p>2 I was assaulted, and I was injured, and nobody would</p> <p>3 be able to help us. And we treat all this as part of</p> <p>4 our job.</p> <p>5 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Thank you.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: The police helped you, did they not? Because</p> <p>7 someone was arrested, someone was charged, someone was</p> <p>8 prosecuted.</p> <p>9 The Department of Justice Helped you, because</p> <p>10 someone turned up to prosecute the case?</p> <p>11 MS YIP WAI LAM: That's correct.</p> <p>12 But for the legal section of the company, if they</p> <p>13 can render some help, that would be better.</p> <p>14 Well, the police then were very angry too. Because</p> <p>15 going by the doctor's report, and other documents, the</p> <p>16 case seems to be established. But whenever a case gets</p> <p>17 to the court, the witnesses are not willing to come</p> <p>18 forth. So a camera will help very much.</p> <p>19 So that's why we have been advocating for a camera</p> <p>20 on board all the time. That can also protect the</p> <p>21 passengers as well. If, say, we do anything bad then</p> <p>22 the passengers can also monitor us as well.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: Yes, thank you.</p> <p>24 MEMBER LO: I just have a follow-up question.</p> <p>25 In your 18-day training session, have they trained</p>	<p>1 MS YIP WAI LAM: For tram drivers, well, usually there is</p> <p>2 not much congestion on the road for them.</p> <p>3 And for members of the public, when they have</p> <p>4 conflicts with us, they get agitated, because the</p> <p>5 schedule is not adhered to.</p> <p>6 So that's a problem besetting the KMB for a long</p> <p>7 time, and I don't know why there has not been a solution</p> <p>8 so far.</p> <p>9 We set up this union, we want to safeguard</p> <p>10 passengers' safety, but we are seeing so many</p> <p>11 confrontations of conflicts with the passengers, and</p> <p>12 after discussing with the passengers we know that the</p> <p>13 main cause of the problem is lost trips.</p> <p>14 Well, you can imagine if a passenger waits for half</p> <p>15 an hour before he can get on the bus, and he would say</p> <p>16 something like, "Have all the bus captains died or</p> <p>17 what?" And then maybe the bus captain is stuck in a</p> <p>18 traffic jam for an hour and he gets only a few minutes</p> <p>19 break, and he has to get back to work after going to the</p> <p>20 toilet, and the bus captains will not be in a good mood</p> <p>21 either. So we can't blame, put all the blame on the</p> <p>22 passengers.</p> <p>23 As what the Chairman said, why are bus captains</p> <p>24 seeing the worst problem? Because for MTR driver there</p> <p>25 will not be any lost trips, it happens only two to three</p>
Page 138	Page 140
<p>1 you about how to handle verbal abuse? Would they advise</p> <p>2 you to say nothing? Would they advise you to report?</p> <p>3 What is the procedure to handle verbal abuse during the</p> <p>4 training section?</p> <p>5 MS YIP WAI LAM: They always say that you should use some</p> <p>6 skills, deploy some skills in your language to deal with</p> <p>7 the matter.</p> <p>8 Now, at a time when you don't even have time to go</p> <p>9 to the toilet, and then when you get on board the bus</p> <p>10 people hurl verbal abuse against you, and they will even</p> <p>11 make comment about "Have all the bus captains died? We</p> <p>12 were made to wait so long", and so on.</p> <p>13 So if we were able to have a longer rest time we</p> <p>14 would be better able to deal with own emotions.</p> <p>15 The problems arise from many factors. If we do have</p> <p>16 a sufficient rest break we would have a higher EQ, we</p> <p>17 would deal with such situations better. We hope that</p> <p>18 improvement can be made gradually so that the</p> <p>19 relationship between the two parties can be improved.</p> <p>20 The company has done that, but in actual fact,</p> <p>21 I mean, it is not very effective.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: How are bus drivers particularly selected for</p> <p>23 this kind of abuse, or do you see tram drivers, and the</p> <p>24 Star Ferry coxswains being abused in the same way? Or</p> <p>25 is it bus drivers that are particularly selected?</p>	<p>1 times every year.</p> <p>2 I can give you some preliminary figures, for every</p> <p>3 day, in every depot, some several dozen buses are not</p> <p>4 being in operation.</p> <p>5 So the turnover, the wastage of staff is so very</p> <p>6 serious, and we are seeing more serious conflicts</p> <p>7 between the passengers and bus captains.</p> <p>8 It has a lot to do with the bus trips, some</p> <p>9 passengers are nice, and we are under pressure.</p> <p>10 Thank you.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. That gives us a flavour of what we</p> <p>12 had in mind.</p> <p>13 We do have one more union to hear evidence from, so</p> <p>14 we will thank you for attending. Thank you for your</p> <p>15 evidence, and for assisting us. If you would provide</p> <p>16 whatever documentation it is that you have undertaken to</p> <p>17 give us, we would be grateful.</p> <p>18 We will take a two-minute adjournment now and see if</p> <p>19 we can't resume with the final union, the Part-time</p> <p>20 Drivers Union shortly. Thank you.</p> <p>21 (5.02 pm)</p> <p>22 (A short break)</p> <p>23 (5.11 pm)</p> <p>24</p> <p>25</p>

Page 141	Page 143
<p>1 REPRESENTATIVES OF PART-TIME DRIVERS UNION: MR KENNETH MA, 2 MR LEO CHA, MR GARY CHENG, MR KENNETH CHEUNG, MR JASON NG, 3 AND MR ALEX LEUNG. 4 (Evidence given in Cantonese and English, 5 transcription of the simultaneous interpretation and/or 6 English) 7 CHAIRMAN: Mr Cheng, and representatives of the Part-time 8 Drivers, we thank you for accepting the Committee's 9 invitation to give evidence to the Committee to assist 10 us with gathering information about how buses are 11 operated so that we are better able to make 12 recommendations to ensure safety in the future. 13 Ms Wong will ask you questions in a moment, designed 14 to draw out from the written submissions that you have 15 made points that need amplification. 16 If you, Mr Cheng, wish one of the other members to 17 answer a particular question, please defer to that 18 member, and we will happily hear from that other person. 19 Ms Wong. 20 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) Thank you, before the 21 questioning starts, can we have two minutes to express 22 a certain view for the part-time bus drivers. 23 CHAIRMAN: Certainly if you wish to make an opening 24 statement, do so. 25 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) We do indeed.</p>	<p>1 serve customers also with pride, and so we are quite 2 upset, even until now still some sort of prejudice 3 exists against us. 4 When you look at the report by KMB about the 5 accident to the Transport Department -- 6 CHAIRMAN: You are talking about the one that is on our 7 website? 8 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) Yes, which I think was issued 9 one month after the accident. When the Transport 10 Department asked Kowloon Motor Bus if they have 11 identified any kind of deficiency in the recruitment of 12 drivers, the response of KMB is, "We have stopped 13 recruitment of part-time bus drivers immediately". 14 This is in fact implying that part-time bus captains 15 are inferior, and unprofessional. We are strongly 16 denying that, and we were very, very upset by this kind 17 of reference. 18 So that concludes our opening remark. And I will 19 pass the floor to Ms Wong. 20 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 21 Before we proceed, it would help us if you could 22 identify which of the various bus companies you work 23 for? Can I invite you to just tell us? Who is KMB? 24 (Indicating). 25 That's four of you are KMB.</p>
Page 142	Page 144
<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Bear in mind it is being translated. So if you 2 speak at a speed that allows the simultaneous translator 3 a reasonable chance. 4 OPENING STATEMENT BY MR ALEX LEUNG 5 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) I'll try to keep it slow. 6 Thank you for everybody's time today. After the -- 7 well, first of all, the Part-time Bus union as we sit 8 here, we are not a registered union under the union 9 Ordinance. We are a group of part-time bus drivers who 10 got together after the tragic incident on 10 February. 11 Shortly after that, KMB have stopped duty allocation 12 to us, and we were very upset about this. Because the 13 immediate reaction after the accident was the driver was 14 a part-time bus driver, and as a result, we as a group 15 of part-time bus drivers were under immense unjust, 16 unfounded and untrue attacks from other trade unions, 17 other members of the public, which has led to 18 a suspension of duty allocation to us. 19 And that's why we have got together as a group. 20 We think the part-time bus drivers are as 21 professional and as competent as many full-time bus 22 drivers, if not more. 23 I personally have experience of 15 years as 24 a part-time bus driver. I think we all here are very 25 experienced and professional. We drive with pride, we</p>	<p>1 MR LEO CHA: (In English) I am Long Win Bus. 2 MR KENNETH MA: I was fired by KMB because of this accident. 3 CHAIRMAN: So you are no longer employed. 4 MR KENNETH MA: (In English) Yeah. 5 CHAIRMAN: Because of this accident? 6 MR KENNETH MA: (In English) Yes, because KMB raised some 7 criteria, for part-time bus driver. I don't accept 8 their criteria, KMB raised -- issued, sent a letter to 9 me. I replied them through e-mail. One copy I cc this 10 IRC Committee. 11 And after that, I heard from my friend who worked in 12 KMB, I was know that I was fired by KMB because I have 13 not replied them. 14 But actually I have replied them through e-mail. 15 CHAIRMAN: Right. 16 MR KENNETH MA: And I now work for New World First Bus as a 17 part-time bus driver. 18 CHAIRMAN: So the upshot, Long Win, one of you, you, New 19 World First Bus, you, the other four KMB. 20 Thank you, Ms Wong. 21 EXAMINATION BY MS WONG 22 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you, Mr Leung and gentlemen for 23 coming. 24 As you know, the terms of reference for this 25 Committee is focused on safety aspects or safety related</p>

Page 145	Page 147
<p>1 measures for operation and management of franchised 2 buses. So my question will be focused on those areas. 3 I hope you can understand. 4 About your union, I believe it is a Facebook group 5 which comprised of over 600 members. Is that correct? 6 MR LEO CHA: (In English) Yes, correct. 7 MS MAGGIE WONG: And I believe Mr Cheng was authorised by 8 100 part-time bus drivers as representative in this 9 union to express views on behalf of them? 10 MR JASON NG: (In English) That is correct as well. 11 MS MAGGIE WONG: Do you know which company, or which 12 franchised buses these 100 part-time bus drivers work 13 for? 14 MR JASON NG: (In English) All these drivers are under KMB 15 but it is affected by the suspension of duty deployment. 16 MS MAGGIE WONG: And may I know how long you have worked as 17 part-time bus captains for KMB? 18 MR JASON NG: To whom? 19 MS MAGGIE WONG: For all of you. 20 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) For KMB, I joined in 2014. 21 CHAIRMAN: But you have 15 years as a part-time bus captain? 22 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) I previously worked also for 23 other bus companies. 24 CHAIRMAN: In Hong Kong? 25 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) In Hong Kong, that's right.</p>	<p>1 14 years experience in driving buses. 2 MR LEO CHA: (In English) I've been working for KMB starting 3 from 2016 at early 2016, and changed to Long Win Bus 4 starting from this April. 5 MR KENNETH MA: (In English) I've worked for New World 6 First Bus as part-time bus driver for about 5.5 years, 7 and worked for KMB as part-time bus driver for about 8 three years. 9 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 10 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. 11 Thank you for your submission, I believe you made 12 one submission that is dated 22 April 2018, and that 13 could be found in TU bundle 1C, at page 293 to 294, 14 translation 294-1 and 294-2. 15 There are two matters I wish to raise arising from 16 this submission. 17 The first, on page 294-1 at the bottom. You stated 18 at the bottom that: 19 "Since formation, our union has been emphasising 20 that part-time (or hourly-paid) and full-time bus 21 captains should be given the same treatment." 22 The "same treatment", are you referring to the pay 23 treatment or the training treatment? In what sense are 24 you referring here? 25 MR JASON NG: (In English) I am a little -- can you repeat</p>
Page 146	Page 148
<p>1 MR JASON NG: (In English) Me as well, I started with KMB 2 in 2014 as a part time driver. I personally have driven 3 buses over 10 years, that included driving overseas. 4 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Cheng? 5 MR GARY CHENG: (Interpreted) I worked in KMB for three 6 years, and I worked in some other bus companies before 7 that. 8 CHAIRMAN: Franchised bus companies in Hong Kong? 9 MR KENNETH CHEUNG: (Interpreted) Franchised and 10 non-franchised. 11 CHAIRMAN: For how many years? 12 MR KENNETH CHEUNG: (Interpreted) I started driving buses in 13 2011. I served as a full-timer for three years and 14 after that I served as a part timer. 15 MR GARY CHENG: (Answer not interpreted). 16 CHAIRMAN: Is there a problem with the transcription? 17 INTERPRETER: Sorry, the interpreter forgot to switch the 18 button over to English. 19 CHAIRMAN: Could I ask Mr Gary Cheng to repeat what he said. 20 MR GARY CHENG: (Interpreted) My first job was with the New 21 Lantao Bus Company as a part-time bus captain and then 22 thereafter I worked for KMB for four years as 23 a full-timer, and then thereafter Citybus part-time bus 24 captain, and then I returned to KMB and have worked as 25 a part-time bus captain for one year, so I have in total</p>	<p>1 your question? I'm a little unsure what you are asking 2 about. 3 MS MAGGIE WONG: Because at the bottom you mentioned that 4 your union has been emphasising part-time and full-time 5 bus captains should be given the same treatment. So 6 "same treatment" of what? 7 CHAIRMAN: Perhaps you could read out more of what is 8 asserted. 9 MS MAGGIE WONG: You further stated: 10 "Regardless of training, supplementary training, 11 remedial training, appointment and requirements for 12 dismissal, the same standards should be adopted by bus 13 companies. During recruitment by franchised bus 14 companies, examiners and driving training instructors 15 perform their gate-keeping role by selecting suitable 16 candidates stringently." 17 So by referring to "same treatment", are you 18 referring to the fact that you should be given the same 19 treatment in terms of training and appointment and 20 dismissal requirements? 21 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) Ms Wong, I don't want to blame 22 this as a loss in translation, but I think what we were 23 trying to say is it is part-timers and full-timers are 24 already under the same training treatment. 25 And we would recommend, if possible, for all new</p>

Page 149	Page 151
<p>1 joiners to go through a psychiatric test, or psychology 2 test to make sure they are able to handle the stress of 3 driving and rogue passengers.</p> <p>4 MR JASON NG: (In English) I would like to add on. Like 5 what Alex is saying, is, what we are stating is that the 6 company has been providing the same kind of training 7 between the full-timers and the part-timers, from our 8 standpoint we don't see any differences in there, in any 9 kind of training.</p> <p>10 Because from what we hear from the public there has 11 been different opinions and voices and, you know, 12 justice regarding the part-time drivers, which, like 13 what we stated, we thought was unjust.</p> <p>14 So what we are saying is any kind of training, 15 safety measures, or whatever kind of suggestion, should 16 have been -- sorry, should have been provided or 17 requiring both full-timers and part-timers.</p> <p>18 So what we are talking about here should not be 19 focusing -- or there should not be any differentiation 20 between full-timers and part-timers, so to speak.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: We have your point.</p> <p>22 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, and about this same treatment for bus 23 captains, I'm going to take you to a document from the 24 KMB. It appears there is a difference in terms of 25 training for full-time and part-time bus captain. In</p>	<p>1 an 18-day training and the driving test administered by 2 instructors.</p> <p>3 But for part-time bus captain, if you look at 4 page 121, all that requires, it appears, is that 5 a part-time bus captain with class 10 or class 17 6 driving licence, and then you can undergo a 2.5-day 7 training for 9 hours a day and pass the driving test.</p> <p>8 So it appears the prerequisite is to have a class 10 9 or class 17 driving licence.</p> <p>10 But once you get that, all you need to do is to 11 undergo a 2.5-day training for nine hours, and then 12 a driving test.</p> <p>13 MR JASON NG: (In English) Ma'am, if you look at it, it says 14 "pass the driving test administered by instructors".</p> <p>15 Now, the instructors, that is an internal exam 16 carried by KMB. So, if you do not pass that, they will 17 not hire us even though we have a class 17 or class 10 18 licence.</p> <p>19 Now, that is very much a -- in fact, it is a higher 20 standard than hiring a full-time driver.</p> <p>21 I was sitting here listening to Ms Yip when she was 22 testifying. She said 18 days was not enough. But when 23 we pass the driving test by KMB, we are actually taking 24 the bus on the road. It is a road test, which is even 25 more extensive than the drive test given by the TD.</p>
Page 150	Page 152
<p>1 short, for full-time bus captain they have to undergo 2 an 18-day training for 9.5 hours a day.</p> <p>3 And we can see that in KMB-1 bundle at page 120.</p> <p>4 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) Ms Wong, I believe those are 5 for drivers who only have class 1 licence before 6 joining, whereas in our cases, we already have class 10 7 licence before joining KMB.</p> <p>8 So inherently they are two different groups of 9 people.</p> <p>10 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes.</p> <p>11 That's what I'm trying to drive at. Because 12 technically they do differentiate training between 13 full-time and part-time bus captains.</p> <p>14 I understand what you are trying to say, but they do 15 have a difference in terms of training.</p> <p>16 And may I just take you to that document, because 17 I just want to see what you say, if certain suggestions 18 are made.</p> <p>19 Page 120. We can see, the three requirements for 20 full-time bus captain candidate, and the second one also 21 requires the full-time bus captain to pass a driving 22 test which is a class 17. And class 17 is a public bus 23 franchise driving licence.</p> <p>24 So you have to go through the Transport Department 25 to get that licence, quite apart from undergoing</p>	<p>1 So the prerequisites, you are right, it is 2 different. In fact, our prerequisite is higher than the 3 full-time drivers.</p> <p>4 So you are correct, they are different. But we are 5 higher.</p> <p>6 MS MAGGIE WONG: I think your union is the one that 7 suggested to have psychological assessment to be carried 8 out by the government or third party as part of the 9 assessment to be a bus driver, if I understand 10 correctly. Is that your submission, or proposal?</p> <p>11 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) Yes, that's right.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Where do we find that? 294-1.</p> <p>13 MS MAGGIE WONG: Line 4, from the bottom.</p> <p>14 Why would you make that suggestion?</p> <p>15 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) I think when we made that 16 discussion, we were referring to obviously the tragic 17 accident on 10 February. There were news reports which 18 said the driver had some complications with the 19 passengers waiting at the racecourse at the time which 20 have sort of affected his emotion. And -- well, before 21 the conviction, I could not speculate. But it was 22 reported that as a result --</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: I think you perhaps mean before the trial.</p> <p>24 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) Well, yes, thank you.</p> <p>25 So that's why we make that suggestion, that may be</p>

Page 153	Page 155
<p>1 you never know, there is something in your brain that is 2 just waiting to explode. 3 MR JASON NG: (In English) May I add on again? In fact, 4 I did some study about bus accidents. 5 Now, if you recall in 1997 or 1998 there was a bus 6 flipped over in Wan Chai, okay? When you looked at that 7 case, actually, the determine of the route cause was an 8 emotional breakdown or some psychological problem of the 9 bus drivers that was undetectable. 10 CHAIRMAN: Was this a crash that occurred on an elevated -- 11 MR JASON NG: (In English) Correct, on the flyover, yes. 12 MR LEO CHA: (In English) Fleming Road incident. Tonnochy 13 Road, I'm sorry. 14 MR JASON NG: (In English) So anyway, that accident. 15 So we looked at some documents and reports, and 16 that's what the route cause was for that particular 17 accident, which, similarly, flipped the bus over. 18 So applying that case to here, that could be one of 19 the cases or one of the reasons or that could -- having 20 a psychological test or some kind of emotional training 21 could help detect that. 22 So we don't know. Like, what Your Majesty just said 23 or Justice just said, the trial hasn't been carried on. 24 We don't know what was the cause, but you were asking 25 for our suggestion, and when we looked at the past data,</p>	<p>1 MR JASON NG: (In English) It don't matter. I do want to 2 answer that. Because let me ask you a question? How do 3 you regulate a full-time driver having enough rest 4 between shifts? You can't. 5 You see, when I look at it, it is like drunk 6 driving. We expect all drunk drivers when you sit 7 behind a wheel to be completely sober. So we expect all 8 drivers, when they sit behind a wheel, to be completely 9 rested, alert, when they go on a shift. 10 So I don't understand why we are so hung up on this 11 topic. 12 CHAIRMAN: We don't require all drivers to be completely 13 sober. We set a threshold, and it is the same thing -- 14 MR JASON NG: (In English) Well, for bus drivers we do. 15 CHAIRMAN: It is the same approach for looking at part-time 16 captains, or, for that matter, anyone else, to try and 17 do the best one can to -- practically, to better achieve 18 safety, and the real question is this: at the moment it 19 appears prior to this accident in February no 20 information was gathered as to what part-time bus 21 captains did in their other job. 22 And that is the issue that engages our interest. 23 MR JASON NG: (In English) Well, I don't know about other 24 bus companies, but at KMB, when we report to a shift or 25 duty, we have to sign -- or in the past, we had to sign</p>
Page 154	Page 156
<p>1 that's what we got. 2 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. 3 And the second proposal, I believe is in your first 4 paragraph. Your union also supported the use of or 5 installation of video cameras by bus companies on all 6 buses to protect safety of bus captain passengers, and 7 other road users. And so you supported the idea of 8 having surveillance cameras in the bus? 9 MR JASON NG: (In English) Yeah, we do, 100 per cent yes. 10 MS MAGGIE WONG: And may I ask another topic. 11 We have heard evidence from some of the franchised 12 bus operators stating that for part-time bus captains 13 they don't require the bus captains or rather the 14 current regulations or current guidelines don't appear 15 to require the part-time bus captains to declare the 16 working hours prior to their work as part-time bus 17 captain. 18 So in other words, one of their worries or concerns 19 is that they don't know how many hours part-time bus 20 captains have been working prior to becoming part-time 21 bus captain. 22 CHAIRMAN: I'm not sure that has been expressed as a worry 23 or a concern of them. 24 MS MAGGIE WONG: It is not them. 25 CHAIRMAN: It is a matter that engages our interest.</p>	<p>1 a document or declaration saying we are in good state to 2 operate a bus. 3 Now, is there something that -- is there something 4 you are looking for? I don't know. Now, is that 5 enough, I don't know -- 6 CHAIRMAN: That's a bland statement with no possibility of 7 an audit check. 8 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) Maybe I can add on it. 9 Back in 2014, when I first joined KMB as 10 a part-timer, I was required to declare my full-time 11 jobs, and, well, external dealings, and I understand 12 that even for Citybus and New World First Bus they 13 required a part-time bus driver to declare annually the 14 full-time jobs, or other jobs, the hours required, 15 whether they are on shifts for the other -- 16 CHAIRMAN: Citybus have introduced that as a new form, not 17 that they did it in the past. 18 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) Well, I think they did it in 19 the past. 20 CHAIRMAN: They have given us a form that which is very 21 comprehensive -- 22 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) There was a new form. 23 I understand that there was an old form in which 24 part-time drivers were required to declare their 25 full-time jobs.</p>

Page 157	Page 159
<p>1 Of course they have extended the list to cover 2 whether it is shift work, how many hours they work. 3 So we do -- we did have to declare, it is not 4 something new, but I think we also we are grown up 5 people, we take responsibility of our act, you know, if 6 we are not fit for reporting a duty we just call in sick 7 like the full-time bus drivers do all the time. 8 CHAIRMAN: Let me ask you gentlemen. You don't have to 9 answer if you don't wish. Let me ask you one by one. 10 Do you have other work, and if so, is it a driving 11 job? 12 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) Well, I do have other work. 13 CHAIRMAN: Is it a driving job? 14 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) I work in an office, I have 15 multiple jobs, put it this way. 16 CHAIRMAN: Is any one of them a driving job? 17 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) Yes, there is one. 18 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Mr. Ng. 19 MR JASON NG: (In English) No. 20 CHAIRMAN: No other job? 21 MR JASON NG: (In English) Yes other job, but not driving 22 job. 23 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Mr Cheung. 24 MR KENNETH CHEUNG: (Interpreted) Yes, I have other work 25 and there is a chance of me having to drive, even when</p>	<p>1 transparency, let's put it this way. 2 MR JASON NG: (In English) I personally would support it 3 only if they will require the full-time driver to do the 4 same. By that I mean if I need to declare what I've 5 been doing outside of my driving time, wouldn't you 6 worry about if the full-time driver went party overnight 7 before they report to work? I would. 8 MS MAGGIE WONG: We have seen a table that has been kindly 9 pulled up, showing the requirements that are required to 10 be filled in. If we can scroll it up, because you will 11 see at the top of the form. 12 CHAIRMAN: Can you give me the reference in the files? 13 MS MAGGIE WONG: That would be in CTB-571. 14 CHAIRMAN: CTB1? 15 MS MAGGIE WONG: CTB-3. 16 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 17 MS MAGGIE WONG: And the translation can be found at 18 page 571-1 and 571-2. 19 It requires part-time bus captain to sign 20 a declaration form setting out the hours of work in 21 a column, need to work in shift, and with a declaration 22 showing that the information filled in is correct. 23 Otherwise there would be disciplinary consequences. 24 So by that I mean it requires part-time captain 25 nowadays to declare that.</p>
Page 158	Page 160
<p>1 I go to work myself I drive. 2 CHAIRMAN: Yeah. 3 MR GARY CHENG: (Interpreted) Yes, I have other full-time 4 work. I also have a chance to drive. 5 MR LEO CHA: (In English) I also have another job, and I'm 6 a civil servant in Lands Department. 7 CHAIRMAN: You are driven to distraction rather than 8 driving! 9 MR LEO CHA: (In English) Yes. 10 MR KENNETH MA: (In English) I have other full-time job but 11 no need to drive. 12 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. That's a useful snapshot for us. 13 Yes, Ms Wong. 14 MS MAGGIE WONG: One of the changes made by the Citybus in 15 the new form is to require part-timers to make 16 a declaration as to the number of hours they have worked 17 previously, or prior to becoming part-time or taking up 18 part-time bus captain. 19 Would you support that idea? 20 MR KENNETH MA: (In English) I support that idea. The new 21 form used by Citybus and New World First Bus is more 22 comprehensive than in the past. 23 MS MAGGIE WONG: And would that be a view shared by the 24 entire union or your Facebook members? 25 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) I think we would support</p>	<p>1 And similar has been done for, I believe, Kowloon 2 Motor Bus; is that the case? 3 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) Correct. 4 CHAIRMAN: Do we have a Kowloon Motor Bus form in the same 5 terms? 6 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. 7 CHAIRMAN: Just give me the reference, if you would. There 8 is no need to turn it up. 9 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) I want to add that this form is 10 an annual declaration, but not every time you start 11 a duty. 12 CHAIRMAN: Obviously not that. 13 Ms Wong, is there anything on the form that requires 14 the information to be updated? 15 MS MAGGIE WONG: No. 16 That would be at page 128 to 129 of KMB-1 bundle. 17 And the translation at 129-1 to 129-2. 18 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 19 MS MAGGIE WONG: The topic I would like to ask is, I believe 20 Mr Kenneth Ma earlier mentioned that the Kowloon Motor 21 Bus set up a new requirement for part-time bus captains, 22 and it required them to -- it set up a few requirements 23 for part-time bus captain to accept before they can 24 continue. 25 If I may take you to KMB bundle 1: page 140 to 141.</p>

Page 161	Page 163
<p>1 And that is a submission submitted by the Kowloon 2 Motor Bus to the Commissioner for Transport in response 3 to the incident in February 2018. 4 And at the bottom it states this: 5 "In late March 2018 most of those 209 part-time [bus 6 captains] have accepted our requirements. We have 7 assigned driving duty to them after they have met the 8 following requirements: 9 1. Having made a written declaration that being 10 a part-time [bus captain] does not breach the employment 11 contract of his/her full-time job; 12 2. Having made a written declaration of illness; 13 3. Having made a written declaration of criminal 14 record; 15 4. Having passed traffic conviction record check; 16 and 17 5. Having attended a full day remedial training if 18 the [bus captain] involved has not been driving a bus 19 for one month or more." 20 And it set up the latest status of the 209 part-time 21 bus captains. 22 My first question may be for Mr Ma first. Are those 23 the requirements you mentioned first that you refused to 24 agree to, or are they different? 25 MR KENNETH MA: (Interpreted) I don't accept point number 1</p>	<p>1 never heard the saying that if we have not driven a bus 2 for more than one month or more, then we have to attend 3 this training. No, I have never heard about that 4 before. 5 MR JASON NG: (In English) I know there was a little 6 confusion for item 5. So I think there is a little 7 confusion between route training and driving training. 8 Now, as far as I know, which has been a practice at 9 KMB for a long time, is that if you have not been 10 reporting -- or if you have not been sitting behind 11 a wheel driving the bus for over 30 days, you are 12 required to attend a driving training and get cleared by 13 the instructor before you can go back on your driving 14 duties. 15 Now, I think that's what point 5 is referring to. 16 But, the wording in point 5 said if you have not been 17 driving a route, one particular route for 30 days, then 18 you have to retrain for that route. Now, that's 19 something we have not heard of. 20 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. 21 That's what I am trying to ask you, because we have 22 received a background paper from the LegCo. We are 23 going to pull that up for you. 24 I'm sorry we don't have hard copies. 25 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) I think we are aware of the</p>
Page 162	Page 164
<p>1 (In English) Written declaration that being 2 a part-time bus captain does not breach the employment 3 contract of his or her full-time job. 4 (Interpreted) I don't accept that. 5 The KMB had a second meeting with our union that 6 took place in the Kowloon Bay depot, and they first 7 raised this. In the first meeting, the KMB had never 8 mentioned about this point. 9 So for myself I don't accept that. 10 As for second requirement, declaration of illness, 11 during my service as part-time bus captain, every time 12 when I try to get a bus from the depot I have to sign 13 a declaration stating that I am fit to drive on that 14 day. 15 And also we have an Octopus card which enables -- 16 well, as long as we tap the Octopus card into the 17 Octopus card reader at the depot, that means we have 18 made that declaration. 19 Now, for item 3 and 4, these are reasonable 20 requirements, we don't have a lot of driving points 21 deducted, then we can drive safely. 22 And that has to do with safety and we think it is 23 reasonable. 24 And the fifth point about driving a bus for one 25 month or more, we have never heard that before. We have</p>	<p>1 point you are trying to make. We picked up when Ms Yip 2 was doing her testimony. 3 Well, the current practice is, if you have not, as 4 Jason has just mentioned, if you have not driven a bus 5 for one month you have to go back to training, and then 6 for a particular route, if you have not driven on that 7 route for two years, then your training record of that 8 route will be erased. That means you will have to go on 9 training again before you can drive on that particular 10 route. 11 Take an example. If I have done route 2 in 2014 and 12 have not done it since, then I would not be able to 13 drive on route 2 today. 14 MR JASON NG: (In English) On top of that, in the route 15 training session, if there is certain deviation that it 16 made on the route, for example a route extension, 17 a deviation of route, you will have to be retrained, or 18 your training record will be erased as well. So you 19 will not be -- for example, like, if I have been 20 doing -- if I have gone through training for route 2, 21 and if they have -- for example, one year went by, and 22 they have extended the route, and I have not been 23 retrained again, then I will not be able to drive on 24 that route again. 25 MS MAGGIE WONG: On this aspect, since we are on this KMB</p>

Page 165	Page 167
<p>1 bundle, can I take you to KMB bundle 1, page 104.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: What are we going to?</p> <p>3 MS MAGGIE WONG: This is a report of the investigation</p> <p>4 report filed by the KMB to the Commissioner for</p> <p>5 Transport following the request by the Commissioner for</p> <p>6 Transport on 12 February 2018.</p> <p>7 This report is dated 12 March 2018. If we may go to</p> <p>8 page 104 setting out the recommendation of Kowloon Motor</p> <p>9 Bus, and at paragraph 13 with the heading</p> <p>10 "Discontinuance of Employment of Part Time [bus</p> <p>11 captains]</p> <p>12 Paragraph 13 states:</p> <p>13 "KMB has discontinued the employment of all part</p> <p>14 time [bus captains] whose working hours fall below</p> <p>15 18 hours per week. However, in order to meet the demand</p> <p>16 for bus services during peak hours, KMB has already</p> <p>17 offered the previous part-time [bus captains] the option</p> <p>18 to convert to contract hourly rated [bus captains] or to</p> <p>19 take up alternative duties in the company."</p> <p>20 So my question is, has this happened?</p> <p>21 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) Yes, it has.</p> <p>22 MS MAGGIE WONG: And in what aspect?</p> <p>23 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) For instance for the six of us</p> <p>24 sitting here, Mr Ma has not accepted this offer,</p> <p>25 I personally have opted for a 10 hours week duty, and</p>	<p>1 doing part-time [bus captain] at KMB will not breach the</p> <p>2 employment contract with their employer ..."</p> <p>3 Being 123. So, Mr Leung, you would be in the second</p> <p>4 category.</p> <p>5 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) Absolutely.</p> <p>6 MS MAGGIE WONG: About this arrangement, do they require you</p> <p>7 to separately sign a declaration form as to how many</p> <p>8 hours you have worked, for example on that day, prior to</p> <p>9 taking up duties as part-time bus captains?</p> <p>10 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) I'm not aware of that.</p> <p>11 MS MAGGIE WONG: About this 10 hours a week, can you utilise</p> <p>12 it in one go, like you can drive --</p> <p>13 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) I can do five hours a day for</p> <p>14 two days, I can do one shift of 10 hours. That's not</p> <p>15 a problem. It is quite flexible.</p> <p>16 MS MAGGIE WONG: As long as you do it within the week.</p> <p>17 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) As long as I do 10 hours.</p> <p>18 MS MAGGIE WONG: If I may ask you to look at page 124 of the</p> <p>19 KMB submission. It sets out the KMB's policy on</p> <p>20 part-time bus captains in (i).</p> <p>21 Can you look at that and confirm, or rather let us</p> <p>22 know whether it reflects the KMB's treatment of</p> <p>23 part-time bus captains before February 2018?</p> <p>24 MR JASON NG: (In English) Ms Wong, just glancing through,</p> <p>25 as I stated earlier, I think the first two bullets, as</p>
Page 166	Page 168
<p>1 I think other members have opted for 18 hours -- more</p> <p>2 than 18 hours per week arrangement.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: So what KMB did was discontinue hiring bus</p> <p>4 captains who worked less than 18 hours a week, but they</p> <p>5 permitted you to sign up to 10 hours a week?</p> <p>6 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) Absolutely.</p> <p>7 I think let me -- I can understand your feeling</p> <p>8 about, because it is counterintuitive. We were working</p> <p>9 as casual drivers. They are weekends -- I usually work</p> <p>10 on weekends, usually Saturdays.</p> <p>11 It was a time when if I am engaged, I would just</p> <p>12 call in and say I'm not working this particular weekend,</p> <p>13 but with this new arrangement, there is some kind of</p> <p>14 a pressure for us --</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: You have to 10 hours a week.</p> <p>16 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) To do 10 hours a week, despite</p> <p>17 the fact that I really cannot make it most of the time.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: Yes.</p> <p>19 MS MAGGIE WONG: So if we go to page 141, we can see the</p> <p>20 numbers of part-time bus captains that have agreed to</p> <p>21 this arrangement in that table in the first and second</p> <p>22 row.</p> <p>23 "Agreed to work more than 18 hours a week", that</p> <p>24 would be 78.</p> <p>25 And "Agreed to work over 10 hours a week; declare</p>	<p>1 I told you, I think our entry requirements are higher</p> <p>2 than the full-time bus drivers, because we have to have</p> <p>3 undergone a driving test that was carried out by the</p> <p>4 instructor at KMB.</p> <p>5 And --</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: So they are not the same, they are higher?</p> <p>7 MR JASON NG: (In English) In my opinion they are higher.</p> <p>8 And I think all six of us can comment on that as well.</p> <p>9 As far as the other bullet points below, I would have to</p> <p>10 agree to that.</p> <p>11 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you.</p> <p>12 If one were to suggest that there be a requirement</p> <p>13 for KMB to require all part-time bus captains to fill in</p> <p>14 a declaration form declaring the number of hours they</p> <p>15 have worked before taking up duty as part-time bus</p> <p>16 captain, would your union be agreeable to this</p> <p>17 arrangement?</p> <p>18 MR JASON NG: (In English) See, I still don't understand why</p> <p>19 we are still asking these questions. I think it is by</p> <p>20 law you cannot drive more than 14 hours a day.</p> <p>21 Now, if you drive over that, I think that's</p> <p>22 breaching the law; am I correct?</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: It is not a question of the law. It is</p> <p>24 a question of enforcing the law. And you can only</p> <p>25 enforce the law if you have knowledge of what the person</p>

Page 169	Page 171
<p>1 has done.</p> <p>2 MR JASON NG: (In English) And like what Kenneth just said,</p> <p>3 when we tap card to report to duty we already declare</p> <p>4 that.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: I am sorry, could you repeat that.</p> <p>6 MR JASON NG: (In English) When we report to duty with our</p> <p>7 Octopus card, that is already confirming and affirming</p> <p>8 that we are complying all the laws and we are capable</p> <p>9 and suitable of driving the bus that day.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: The issue that is outstanding is this: what if</p> <p>11 you have been driving a coach all night, and you turn up</p> <p>12 to drive in the morning. How is the bus company to know</p> <p>13 that you cannot comply with the guidelines? How is it</p> <p>14 to get that information to enforce the law that you</p> <p>15 advert to?</p> <p>16 There may not be an immediate answer to that. But</p> <p>17 that's the question.</p> <p>18 MR JASON NG: (In English) Well --</p> <p>19 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) I would just repeat that we are</p> <p>20 fully aware of the consequences, the particular criminal</p> <p>21 consequences of fatigued driving. We are all grown up</p> <p>22 people. We are not here to -- well, there is a popular</p> <p>23 saying amongst bus drivers, you have one foot in the</p> <p>24 prison cell, and you have one foot in the mortuary. So</p> <p>25 we are fully aware of the consequences.</p>	<p>1 fit to drive.</p> <p>2 MR JASON NG: (In English) Right, but the thing is, you</p> <p>3 don't have to do a breathalyser test every time when we</p> <p>4 get behind a wheel, or you don't do that on all 3,000</p> <p>5 drivers at KMB every day.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: Ms Wong.</p> <p>7 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. Mr Chairman, I've finished my</p> <p>8 questioning. Thank you.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Gentlemen, those are the questions we have for</p> <p>10 you. If there is any closing statement that you wish to</p> <p>11 make, don't feel that you have to, but if there is</p> <p>12 anything you wish to say, we will give you the</p> <p>13 opportunity.</p> <p>14 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) Thank you, Justice Lunn.</p> <p>15 I think what we are trying to reiterate is there has</p> <p>16 been a very unjust perception formed about the</p> <p>17 professionalism of our part-time bus drivers. I hope</p> <p>18 today's testimony has changed that perception, and</p> <p>19 I cannot care more about the public, but I think the</p> <p>20 three gentlemen in front of me would have a much better</p> <p>21 understanding of what a typical part-time bus driver</p> <p>22 would be.</p> <p>23 Again, I want to repeat that we take pride in</p> <p>24 driving, we enjoy driving, we like serving passengers</p> <p>25 from different areas, all walks of life, and we just</p>
Page 170	Page 172
<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Well balanced drivers?</p> <p>2 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) Yes, thank you.</p> <p>3 MR JASON NG: (In English) Well, let me add on that. I gave</p> <p>4 some thoughts to that.</p> <p>5 So you would rather us to sign a paper saying that</p> <p>6 I have not been driving for, say, nine hours, on other</p> <p>7 circumstances, on top of tapping the -- when we report</p> <p>8 to duty, tapping our card saying "We are going to drive</p> <p>9 the bus"?</p> <p>10 So --</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: Tapping your card provides no information at all</p> <p>12 about what you have been doing prior to that.</p> <p>13 MR JASON NG: (In English) Well, tapping the card means you</p> <p>14 are accepting the duty which means you are understanding</p> <p>15 the consequences that you are not -- if you are not</p> <p>16 complying to the law.</p> <p>17 That also included -- if you say, for example, like</p> <p>18 what I said earlier, if you have consumed alcohol, by</p> <p>19 tapping the card I -- my understanding is you are</p> <p>20 implying you have not been consuming, and you are in</p> <p>21 good state on driving the bus.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: That's why for enforcing alcohol laws we have</p> <p>23 breathalysers.</p> <p>24 MR JASON NG: (In English) Right, but you don't --</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: You can get in the car, thereby declaring you are</p>	<p>1 like doing this. And it will be devastating for us if</p> <p>2 we are barred from working as part-time bus drivers.</p> <p>3 That will be the most undesirable outcome for us here.</p> <p>4 And we will be very unhappy about that.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: May I ask you this.</p> <p>6 How typical are you six gentlemen of part-time bus</p> <p>7 captains? What I have in mind is, in particular, the</p> <p>8 New Lantao Bus Company, where I think one-third of the</p> <p>9 bus drivers are part time? Are you typical of them or</p> <p>10 are they quite different from you?</p> <p>11 MR ALEX LEUNG: (In English) I personally have never worked</p> <p>12 with New Lantao Bus Company.</p> <p>13 It may be for Mr Cheng to give elaboration.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>15 MR GARY CHENG: (Interpreted) Actually, as part-time bus</p> <p>16 captains, maybe we all do it differently. But I think</p> <p>17 the primary reason is because there is more flexibility</p> <p>18 in the working hours. For many part-time drivers, they</p> <p>19 want to take two days off in the week. That's why they</p> <p>20 choose to become part-time drivers. Of course, at the</p> <p>21 expense of certain benefits that full-time drivers</p> <p>22 enjoy. But then they want freedom, more flexibility.</p> <p>23 So that's why some people choose to become part-time</p> <p>24 drivers. That's really the issue.</p> <p>25 As for the New Lantao Bus Company, how come</p>

Page 173	Page 175
<p>1 one-third of the bus captains are on a part time basis? 2 I think it is because it is only on weekends they have 3 huge patronage because people will go to Lantau Island 4 on weekends for sightseeing and that's why they need 5 more bus drivers on weekends. So that's why there is 6 a bigger demand for part-time drivers, probably. 7 So it is all about flexibility. 8 And, say, when I'm free then I will come and work 9 part time. For me, anyway, it is because it fits in 10 with my schedule, that's why I take up the part-time 11 job. 12 MR LEO CHA: (Interpreted) Perhaps let me supplement in 13 Cantonese, and I'm free to say what I want to say. 14 Now, before this tragic accident, for Long Win there 15 is a serious problem of lost trips. I think between 16 2016 and 2017 because of the expansion of the service 17 for the A series of routes, so that's why for North 18 Lantao Island there is a higher lost trip rate. 19 So there are relatively more serious problems with 20 some of the routes, and that's when the part-time bus 21 drivers can come in to help remedy the situation. 22 Going back to the question raised by the counsel 23 earlier, for KMB and Long Win Bus, bundle 1, page 124, 24 it is whether KMB treats part-time bus captains equally, 25 (i). The answer is yes. For both full-time and</p>	<p>1 there is no channel for us to do so. 2 CHAIRMAN: We are very much alive to this issue, which is 3 why we have been asking so many questions about the use 4 of CCTV with both video and audio function. And why we 5 are interested in forward-looking CCTV on buses so that 6 illegal parking could be picked up, not just picked up, 7 but then enforced, the law enforced. Without being 8 enforced, the law is meaningless. 9 MR JASON NG: (In English) I completely agree to that. 10 I think our question, or our point is, if that's the 11 case, we actually already have the ordinance to regulate 12 the behaviour of passengers. Has that been enforced? 13 Has that been enforced? If so, can we put a bigger 14 magnitude on being enforced. 15 Like what Ms Yip was talking about, or her 16 colleagues, they are all have been verbally insulted. 17 They said they get verbally insult almost on a daily 18 basis -- 19 CHAIRMAN: As I have said. That is why we are looking at 20 how the law can be enforced. Because passengers do not 21 have a God given right to abuse bus captains. 22 MR JASON NG: (In English) Correct, so what we saw is if we 23 can look at MTR, actually some of the MTR staff are 24 empowered to enforce and fine the passenger that has 25 obsessive behaviour --</p>
Page 174	Page 176
<p>1 part-time bus drivers they are treated equally. Every 2 day, before we start work, we have to tap the Octopus 3 card as a few of my colleagues mentioned already. 4 We have to tap our Octopus card on the reader in the 5 regulator's office, and that is equivalent to 6 a declaration of our health status, enough rest, that we 7 are fit to serve as a part-time driver on the day. 8 That's something that the KMB has been doing all 9 along. Anyway, since I joined KMB in 2016 and then 10 I switched to Long Win, all along this has been the 11 practice. 12 MR GARY CHENG: (Interpreted) Finally, I would like to make 13 this suggestion to the Committee. 14 All along, we are talking about bus drivers. But 15 what about passengers? Have we considered any measures 16 that could target the behaviour of passengers? You 17 know, Hong Kong people start complaining when they have 18 to wait a long time, and as long as they are not happy 19 they will make a formal complaint, they like to do that. 20 So it is not about monitoring the speed of buses, don't 21 worry, the bus passengers will call and complain. 22 So there are plenty of channels for passengers to 23 make complaints but there is no channel for bus drivers 24 to complain against passengers. Even if the passenger 25 is in the wrong we can't complain against them because</p>	<p>1 CHAIRMAN: I don't want to lengthen the proceedings, but it 2 has been pointed out to us and is obvious really, 3 railway stations are much easier places to enforce 4 things. A bus captain is one man on a bus out in the 5 open. The train driver can bring his train into 6 a station which he has alerted there is a problem to. 7 And people are waiting to help him. That's the big 8 difference. That's been pointed out to us. 9 MR JASON NG: (In English) Well, it might have been because 10 manpower issue, like there are supervisors that are on 11 the road, if we can increase that number, maybe that can 12 help relieve that, or increasing the patrol on buses? 13 Would that be something we can consider? 14 CHAIRMAN: Well, gentlemen, thank you very much, for the 15 evidence that you have given us. It has been most 16 informative. As you can tell, we have various factors 17 we have to balance in making these enquiries. What we 18 are trying to do is seek information, and you have been 19 most helpful. 20 So these proceedings are adjourned, and I would like 21 to thank the long suffering stenographers and the 22 simultaneous interpreters for working such a long day. 23 We will adjourn then until 10 o'clock tomorrow. 24 Thank you. 25 (6.15 pm)</p>

1 (The hearing adjourned to 10.00 am on
 2 Wednesday, 1 August 2018)
 3
 4
 5
 6
 7
 8
 9
 10
 11
 12
 13
 14
 15
 16
 17
 18
 19
 20
 21
 22
 23
 24
 25

1 INDEX
 2 PAGE
 3 REPRESENTATIVES OF KMB EMPLOYEES1
 4 UNION: MR KWOK CHI SHING,
 5 MR LEE KIN KEI, IVAN, AND MR
 6 WONG KIN WAI
 7 OPENING STATEMENT BY MR KWOK CHI SHING1
 8 EXAMINATION BY MS WONG6
 9 REPRESENTATIVES FROM STAFF RIGHTS60
 10 ASSOCIATION OF KMB: MR CHAN
 11 WING HO, MR TAN SHIN HING,
 12 MR YIU KWONG CHUN, AND MR LI
 13 KWOK WAH
 14 EXAMINATION BY MS WONG61
 15 QUESTIONS FROM THE COMMITTEE90
 16 REPRESENTATIVES OF MONTHLY-RATED100
 17 DRIVERS UNION: MR CHENG HOI
 18 YIU, MR SZETO KUEN, MR CHAN
 19 HON WA, MS YIP WAI LAM AND MR
 20 CHAN CHI FAI, MR YAN KIN MING
 21 EXAMINATION BY MS WONG102
 22 REPRESENTATIVES OF PART-TIME DRIVERS141
 23 UNION: MR KENNETH MA, MR LEO
 24 CHA, MR GARY CHENG, MR KENNETH
 25 CHEUNG, MR JASON NG, AND
 MR ALEX LEUNG.
 OPENING STATEMENT BY MR ALEX LEUNG142
 EXAMINATION BY MS WONG144