

Page 1	Page 3
<p>1 Saturday, 14 July 2018</p> <p>2 (9.00 am)</p> <p>3 EVIDENCE FROM TAI PO DISTRICT COUNCIL: MS WONG PIK KUI,</p> <p>4 MR CHAN CHO LEUNG, MR YAM KAI BONG, MR CHAN SIU KUEN, DR LAU</p> <p>5 CHEE SING</p> <p>6 (given in Cantonese; transcription of the simultaneous</p> <p>7 interpretation)</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Good morning. We welcome the representatives of</p> <p>9 the Tai Po District Council. We thank them for</p> <p>10 responding to our invitation by coming today to assist</p> <p>11 us with their evidence.</p> <p>12 I'm going to ask Ms Wong to begin by posing</p> <p>13 questions to the representatives. If Ms Wong wishes one</p> <p>14 of the other representatives of the council to respond</p> <p>15 to a particular question, please feel free to identify</p> <p>16 that person, and that person can then deal with the</p> <p>17 particular question. But I will ask counsel assisting</p> <p>18 the committee to begin her questioning now.</p> <p>19 Examination by MS MAGGIE WONG</p> <p>20 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. Thank you, Chairman. And thank you,</p> <p>21 ladies and gentlemen, for coming to this hearing today.</p> <p>22 I have a few topics and areas of questions.</p> <p>23 First of all, may I draw your attention to a letter</p> <p>24 sent by the Committee on 4 May 2018, inviting you to</p> <p>25 address three accidents. That would be DC-2 page 759.</p>	<p>1 I may read you. It is a letter from the Tai Po District</p> <p>2 Council, replying to the committee. Dated 23 May 2018.</p> <p>3 The letter states that:</p> <p>4 "Among the records, the Tai Po District Council, its</p> <p>5 Committees and Working Groups had only discussed about</p> <p>6 the traffic accident that occurred on Tai Po Road near</p> <p>7 Tai Po Mei on 10 February 2018."</p> <p>8 Is that correct?</p> <p>9 MS WONG PIK KUI: Yes. Yes.</p> <p>10 MS MAGGIE WONG: So do I take it that according to your</p> <p>11 records, the discussion, you were only able to retrieve</p> <p>12 documents in relation to the Tai Po accident, but not</p> <p>13 the other two accidents?</p> <p>14 MS WONG PIK KUI: Yes. For the accident on</p> <p>15 10 February 2018, we had a special meeting to</p> <p>16 discuss it.</p> <p>17 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. And may I first of all refer</p> <p>18 you to the minutes of the special meeting on</p> <p>19 12 February 2018. The Chinese is at page 766, English</p> <p>20 starts at page 782. If I may refer to English version,</p> <p>21 we can see that the persons in attendance at page 768 in</p> <p>22 Chinese and 783 in English, that includes Ms Mable Chan,</p> <p>23 Commissioner for Transport, and also Mr Chau, amongst</p> <p>24 others, Chau Chung Mun, superintendent of police, do you</p> <p>25 see that? 768 in Chinese and 783 in English.</p>
Page 2	Page 4
<p>1 It is in Chinese. I will just summarise the three</p> <p>2 accidents.</p> <p>3 The first accident is at Dai Kwai Street on</p> <p>4 10 August 2011, at footnote 1; the second incident is at</p> <p>5 Tai Wo Service Road West on 12 May 2013; and the third</p> <p>6 is the Tai Po Road accident on 10 February 2018. And by</p> <p>7 that letter the committee invited you to provide</p> <p>8 documentation in relation to these three accidents.</p> <p>9 Is that correct?</p> <p>10 MS WONG PIK KUI: Good morning.</p> <p>11 So is it now for the Tai Po District Council to give</p> <p>12 our views on the three accidents?</p> <p>13 MS MAGGIE WONG: This is just a general question, that by</p> <p>14 that letter the committee invited you to comment or give</p> <p>15 documentation in relation to these three accidents. Can</p> <p>16 you confirm that, first of all.</p> <p>17 MS WONG PIK KUI: Yes. In this document, it is true, on</p> <p>18 those three days there were the accidents.</p> <p>19 MS MAGGIE WONG: And the reply, I believe the Tai Po</p> <p>20 District Council, its committee and working group, was</p> <p>21 able to confirm that you have only discussed about the</p> <p>22 Tai Po accident on 10 February 2018. If I invite you to</p> <p>23 look at the document at page 762 in Chinese, English at</p> <p>24 page 764.</p> <p>25 Do you see that? It is in the second paragraph. If</p>	<p>1 MS WONG PIK KUI: Yes, correct.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: If I may take you to paragraph 5, English</p> <p>3 at 785, Superintendent of Police, Mr Chau Chung Mun</p> <p>4 stated in that paragraph as to that particular road</p> <p>5 section, that:</p> <p>6 "In 2017, the police had made 4 arrests involving 2</p> <p>7 drunk drivers, 1 case of dangerous driving and 1 case of</p> <p>8 drug-related crime. The police had issued a total of 32</p> <p>9 fixed penalty tickets at the road section in 2017 for</p> <p>10 speeding and traffic violations. A total of 29 traffic</p> <p>11 accidents had occurred in the Chek Nai Ping to Wong Yee</p> <p>12 Au section on Tai Po Road, out of which 2 are more</p> <p>13 serious. Although there were no speed enforcement</p> <p>14 cameras installed at the above mentioned road section,</p> <p>15 the police could carry out operations to detect speeding</p> <p>16 from time to time by placing detection equipment a few</p> <p>17 designated spots along the road section."</p> <p>18 Do you see that?</p> <p>19 MS WONG PIK KUI: Yes.</p> <p>20 MS MAGGIE WONG: Now in relation to this, is this enquiry</p> <p>21 made in response to the Tai Po District Council's query,</p> <p>22 or questions as to the number of accidents that happened</p> <p>23 in that particular Tai Po Road accident that the police</p> <p>24 provided those information?</p> <p>25 MS WONG PIK KUI: Yes.</p>

Page 5	Page 7
<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: And as a matter of fact, your minutes state 2 at paragraph 16, if I may take you to paragraph 16, 3 page 772 in Chinese and English at 789, if you see at 16 4 (iv) it stated that: 5 "Some district councillors had made suggestions on 6 how to improve the design of the road section involved 7 in the past. But the Transport Department cited 8 technical factors as a reason and did not follow up, he 9 [that is Mr Lo Hiu Fong, I believe he is a member of the 10 Tai Po District Council] hoped that after this accident, 11 the Transport Department could respond to the demands of 12 the district councillors and install road-side speed 13 detection equipment and signage to improve road safety." 14 In relation to that paragraph, can you elaborate on 15 the first sentence that some district councillors had 16 made suggestions in the past how to improve the road 17 design, but the Transport Department did not follow up. 18 Can you elaborate on that. 19 MS WONG PIK KUI: Yes, thank you. Now, today, we have 20 district councillor from the constituency Mr Chan Siu 21 Kuen attending the meeting. Perhaps he could give his 22 views on this paragraph. 23 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: May I speak please? 24 As the district councillor of that constituency 25 I received comments from residents. On holidays there</p>	<p>1 After that incident people asked me whether I have 2 looked at that particular section of road. Fortunately, 3 as a district councillor I have been monitoring the 4 government's work all the time so I was able to produce 5 the two letters at once at the District Council meeting. 6 I'm the District Councillor of that constituency, 7 when the media asked me questions I could produce proof 8 that I did ask the Transport Department to put up a road 9 sign slowing down, and also speed cameras there and I 10 made the request both to the Transport Department and 11 the police. That's why you now ask how come there is no 12 response to my two letters. 13 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you, Mr Chan. 14 You mentioned a few letters. The first one is 15 24 July 2015. May I first of all take you to that 16 document. It is a letter to the Transport Department. 17 Chinese at 840-72 in DC-2-bundle. English at 840-75. 18 That's the first letter in which you wrote to the 19 Transport Department project in Tai Po section, 20 engineer, Mr Wong Kwok Leung, stating that you have 21 received request for assistance from the residents in 22 the vicinity of Tai Po Road, and there was an absence of 23 speed limit traffic signs around the bend of Savannah 24 Garden. Then you stated that: 25 "To ensure the safety of road users, your department</p>
Page 6	Page 8
<p>1 are often cars speeding along the Tai Po Road and it 2 causes great disturbance to residents and they go at 3 great speed. So after I received complaints from 4 residents I wrote to the Transport Department asking for 5 speed cameras at the road section. 6 On 24 July 2015 and also on 5 June 2017, as 7 mentioned in the letter, I wrote to the Transport 8 Department, and the police respectively, the first 9 letter to Transport Department, the second one to 10 police, and I made it clear in the letters that near the 11 Savannah Garden on weekends there is car speeding. 12 The Transport Department responded to me orally, and 13 they said they would consult the Owners' Corporation 14 first to see what the response is. For the Savannah 15 Garden it is not a major traffic black spot, accident 16 black spot. That's why there has been no follow-up. 17 On the second letter from Tai Po Mei to this Green 18 Wood Villa, that's a slope, so when cars go up, you 19 know, for ordinary cars they can't speed, but of course 20 sports cars could. When they come down that bend, cars 21 come at a great speed and it is scary. That's why 22 I wrote to police directly to ask the police to put 23 a speed camera there. The police responded to me saying 24 that that is not a traffic black spot, but they would 25 put some police officers there to set up speed traps.</p>	<p>1 is now requested to expeditiously install the '50km' 2 speed limit signs at the above location to remind the 3 motorists to pay attention to driving at safe speed for 4 prevention of unnecessary incidents." 5 Is that the first letter you refer to in your 6 answer? 7 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: Correct. 8 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Chan, you mentioned that about 9 expeditiously install the 50-kilometre speed limit 10 signs, but in fact during that time, for that particular 11 road section, the speed limit is actually 70 kilometre 12 per hour. In that regard, why did you write 13 50 kilometres per hour? 14 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: 70 kilometres -- one step down from 70 is 15 50 under the laws of Hong Kong, there is no 60 or 16 65 kilometres per hour of speed limit. And for 17 residents living near Savannah Garden they said to me 18 that "Please write on behalf of us as the District 19 councillor", and so I wrote on their request. 20 And also there were some minor traffic accidents, at 21 the biggest bend. I believe for that section a speed 22 limit of 50 kilometres is reasonable. But of course I'm 23 not the expert, that's why I have asked the Transport 24 Department, asking them to help me do a consultation and 25 see whether it is possible to put up this 50-kilometre</p>

Page 9	Page 11
<p>1 sign.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: Do we understand that this was a request that the</p> <p>3 speed limit be reduced from 70 kilometres per hour to</p> <p>4 50 kilometres per hour?</p> <p>5 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: Yes. Yes. I have just listened to</p> <p>6 residents' views. Residents called me up, and I also</p> <p>7 believe that for that bend it is rather dangerous.</p> <p>8 That's why I have stated specifically for that</p> <p>9 particular bend the speed limit should be reduced from</p> <p>10 70 to 50 kilometres per hour.</p> <p>11 MS MAGGIE WONG: In relation to this letter the Transport</p> <p>12 Department no written response was received from the</p> <p>13 Transport Department in reply to this letter before the</p> <p>14 Tai Po accident, is that correct? I believe you stated</p> <p>15 that in the further submission to the committee by</p> <p>16 letter dated 11 July 2018. Chinese at 840-76, and</p> <p>17 English at 840-86.</p> <p>18 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: That is right. At that time, the</p> <p>19 Transport Department did not give me a direct reply.</p> <p>20 However, I have spoken to them on the phone. They said</p> <p>21 that if the speed is to be reduced to 50 they would have</p> <p>22 to consult residents as well as owners corporations.</p> <p>23 And in 2014, near the Japanese International School</p> <p>24 there was a traffic accident at the signal junction, as</p> <p>25 a result a person was injured, and the TD, Transport</p>	<p>1 councillor, every day as soon as I receive calls for</p> <p>2 assistance I would deal with departments as soon as</p> <p>3 possible. I urged them to erect the sign and reduce the</p> <p>4 speed as soon as possible. However, the government is</p> <p>5 very serious about following procedures, I understand</p> <p>6 that they have to follow the procedure if the sign is to</p> <p>7 be put up. I have been following the matter up, and</p> <p>8 I have a lot of work as a district councillor.</p> <p>9 Residents from time to time would call me to say that in</p> <p>10 that road section where there is a bend, they ask for</p> <p>11 the speed to be reduced.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Ms Wong, before we go any further, could we see</p> <p>13 a photograph of this area of road, and perhaps we could</p> <p>14 see a map so that we can all understand what we are</p> <p>15 talking about?</p> <p>16 MS MAGGIE WONG: I wonder if we may pull up the map of the</p> <p>17 Tai Po Road section. And first of all, Mr Chan, if you</p> <p>18 look at the map, the section where you propose to reduce</p> <p>19 the speed limit is in relation to Savannah Garden. And</p> <p>20 it appears it would be around the location between</p> <p>21 numbers 26 to 29 on the map. Is that correct?</p> <p>22 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: Yes. It is before the Hung Lam Road, at</p> <p>23 the bend.</p> <p>24 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you point out the parts that you</p> <p>25 propose to the Transport Department to look into the</p>
Page 10	Page 12
<p>1 Department replied to me. He said for the speed to be</p> <p>2 reduced to 50 the TD would have to conduct a study, and</p> <p>3 after the accident they have appealed to the public to</p> <p>4 abide by road traffic regulations. They said that from</p> <p>5 the perspective of the TD, for the speed to be reduced</p> <p>6 to 50, they would have to do a lot of consultation and</p> <p>7 to liaise with the police.</p> <p>8 I have been waiting. And I have been in contact</p> <p>9 with them. Well, Mr Wong of the Transport Department</p> <p>10 has been transferred out. And regrettably we had the</p> <p>11 traffic accident at Tai Po Mei. And I approached the</p> <p>12 police, because the TD could not help us. I asked the</p> <p>13 police to install speed cameras and I have been</p> <p>14 following that up.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: Who was it that you spoke to the telephone at the</p> <p>16 Transport Department about this matter?</p> <p>17 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: It was Mr Wong Kwok Leung, an engineer of</p> <p>18 the TD.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: What was his status or rank within the Transport</p> <p>20 Department?</p> <p>21 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: At that time I think he was a senior</p> <p>22 officer in the department.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: When did you have this conversation in relation</p> <p>24 to the letter of 24 July 2015?</p> <p>25 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: I can't remember. I'm a district</p>	<p>1 speed limit or reduction of the speed limit from 70 to</p> <p>2 50 kilometres per hour by reference to the number shown</p> <p>3 on the map?</p> <p>4 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: I think it is 30, 28 and 29. That's the</p> <p>5 bend. So going from 30 to 29 and 28, and for that road</p> <p>6 surface, as soon as there is heavy rain it would flood.</p> <p>7 That is at location 28. I have just sent a letter to</p> <p>8 the Highways Department asking for them to do something</p> <p>9 about the underground water, because as soon as there is</p> <p>10 heavy rain there will be accumulation of water under the</p> <p>11 road surface. In the mornings on Saturdays and Sundays</p> <p>12 there are cars racing and doing that bend, and it is</p> <p>13 very dangerous.</p> <p>14 MS MAGGIE WONG: Maybe we can show you the photographs of</p> <p>15 number 28, 29 and 30. So that we know which bend or</p> <p>16 curve we are talking about.</p> <p>17 Photo 28, Mr Chan, I believe is the area near the</p> <p>18 Hung Lam Road, is that correct.</p> <p>19 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: That is a bit too forward. You have to</p> <p>20 go back a little bit. This is the Kowloon-bound</p> <p>21 section. I think you have gone the other way. You</p> <p>22 should go the other way.</p> <p>23 MS MAGGIE WONG: 27?</p> <p>24 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: I think you have to go further back.</p> <p>25 MS MAGGIE WONG: 26?</p>

Page 13	Page 15
<p>1 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: You have overshot.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: So it should be between 26 and 27; is that</p> <p>3 correct?</p> <p>4 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: Not this one. This is a different</p> <p>5 residential development. Go back a bit.</p> <p>6 MS MAGGIE WONG: Or photo 29?</p> <p>7 Mr Chan, maybe we will show you a video about the</p> <p>8 relevant locations, so that you can ask us to pause when</p> <p>9 the location we talked about is the location mentioned.</p> <p>10 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: It is close, it is close. Keep going.</p> <p>11 Keep going.</p> <p>12 (Video played)</p> <p>13 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: It is after this bend. Stop. And all</p> <p>14 the way, when you continue, if there are two</p> <p>15 double-decker buses servicing this bend, it would be</p> <p>16 very dangerous. And just now at the position where</p> <p>17 someone was standing, as soon as there is rain, it would</p> <p>18 flood. So it is particularly dangerous here.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Before we move on. Can we identify this from the</p> <p>20 still photographs?</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. Maybe we would print out a photo of</p> <p>22 that particular photo that you have identified.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: Do we have a physical album of photographs?</p> <p>24 MS MAGGIE WONG: We have selected a few photographs, but</p> <p>25 this does not happen to be one of them. We will mark</p>	<p>1 a traffic accident. I was concerned about it, that's</p> <p>2 why I wrote a letter about the area near Savannah Garden</p> <p>3 asking for the speed to be reduced to 50. I asked the</p> <p>4 TD about details of the accident, whether the person</p> <p>5 dashed into the road, or someone did not obey the</p> <p>6 traffic light. If the person involved rushed into the</p> <p>7 road, well, that one might be different. The TD was</p> <p>8 asked by me to make some improvement at the signal</p> <p>9 junction to facilitate pedestrian crossing to make that</p> <p>10 location safer to cross.</p> <p>11 And as to whether that location is suitable, I have</p> <p>12 actually talked to the TD about it.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: This was a letter addressed to Mr Man; how did</p> <p>14 you come to be dealing with it?</p> <p>15 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: Yes, it is just that I see it here.</p> <p>16 Oh, yes, it is written to the chairperson, Mr Man,</p> <p>17 who is the chairperson of the Tai Po Transport and</p> <p>18 Traffic Committee.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>20 MS MAGGIE WONG: And this matter was discussed at the</p> <p>21 District Council meeting on 13 March 2015. Chinese is</p> <p>22 at page 840-81, and English at 840-92. And we can see</p> <p>23 the chairman's name there, Mr Man Chen Fai. If you look</p> <p>24 at paragraph 79, the chairman made reference to the</p> <p>25 letter of the Japanese International School stating</p>
Page 14	Page 16
<p>1 the time, we can look at the time, and we will print out</p> <p>2 that particular photo in due course. Or with those</p> <p>3 particular coordinates.</p> <p>4 And Mr Chan, you mentioned another incident about</p> <p>5 a Japanese International School accident, and if I may</p> <p>6 refer you to the letter of complaint from the Japanese</p> <p>7 International School, that was dated 10 February 2015.</p> <p>8 English at page 840-84, and Chinese at 840-85.</p> <p>9 The original version is 840-84, and Mrs Juliet</p> <p>10 Ashton wrote to you stating:</p> <p>11 "Last year, outside our school a lady was killed</p> <p>12 whilst crossing the road. The speed limit is</p> <p>13 70 [kilometres an hour] which probably contributed to</p> <p>14 the severity of her injuries."</p> <p>15 In the fourth paragraph she also mentioned that:</p> <p>16 "Along the Tai Po Road there are other areas where</p> <p>17 the speed limit has been adjusted to 50 [kilometres per</p> <p>18 hour] and I would ask that the same adjustment is made</p> <p>19 for outside our school."</p> <p>20 So that's a plea made by Ms Juliet Ashton on behalf</p> <p>21 of the Japanese International School to reduce the speed</p> <p>22 limit from 70 to 50 kilometres per hour. Is that the</p> <p>23 letter you mentioned earlier on?</p> <p>24 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: I mentioned this letter, which is in</p> <p>25 front of me. I am aware that someone talked about</p>	<p>1 their request to reduce the speed limit from</p> <p>2 70 kilometres per hour to 50 kilometres per hour, and</p> <p>3 actually invites the district council members to go</p> <p>4 there to visit their school to discuss about the</p> <p>5 transport issues. Do you see paragraph 79?</p> <p>6 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: Yes, I can see it.</p> <p>7 MS MAGGIE WONG: If you go to paragraph 80, that's at</p> <p>8 page 840-92, a Mr Wong Kwok Leung responded. I believe</p> <p>9 that is the Mr Wong Kwok Leung referred to in your</p> <p>10 letter that you addressed to in July 2015. Is that</p> <p>11 correct?</p> <p>12 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: Yes, it is related. At that time when</p> <p>13 I wrote to him it was when I received complaints from</p> <p>14 residents of Savannah Garden, especially on the mornings</p> <p>15 of Saturdays and Sundays, there were a lot of cars</p> <p>16 racing. Around that area, it is very dangerous, that</p> <p>17 was a different matter.</p> <p>18 And I wrote to him to ask for the speed to be</p> <p>19 reduced to 50, around Savannah Garden. And I was aware</p> <p>20 of that.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: And in that paragraph 80, Mr Wong Kwok</p> <p>22 Leung responded that he knew that the Japanese</p> <p>23 International School suggested the reduction of speed</p> <p>24 limit of the road section in front of the school in view</p> <p>25 of a traffic accident in the section of Tai Po Road in</p>

Page 17	Page 19
<p>1 front of the school in 2014, in which a member of the 2 public was killed.</p> <p>3 It also stated that the Transport Department and 4 police were examining the cause of that traffic accident 5 which might not necessarily be related to the speed 6 limit of that road section, including issues of some 7 motorists' driving attitude and problem as to whether 8 pedestrians observed traffic light signals. But it also 9 stated that the Transport Department would examine 10 whether the present speed limit of that road section was 11 appropriate.</p> <p>12 Furthermore, the Transport Department has sent an 13 interim reply to the school, and will provide a detailed 14 reply letter.</p> <p>15 So Mr Chan, it appears that the Transport Department 16 stated back in March 2015 that they are going to examine 17 the speed limit of that road section.</p> <p>18 Did they follow up with the district council, with 19 your district council about their proposal or suggestion 20 since that meeting?</p> <p>21 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: Yes, I was shown this by the deputy 22 chairperson. They said the case is sub judice, so it 23 was not appropriate for them to discuss the case. There 24 might be a prosecution against the driver. It was 25 mentioned in paragraph 87 in the district council.</p>	<p>1 That's why in 2017 I sent a letter to the police.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: Before we move on, can I show you the map 3 identifying where the location of the Japanese 4 International School. I believe the location is 5 around -- it is between number 21 and 22. If we can 6 pull up the photo, 21 and 22, I believe it is 21. This 7 shows the site of the Japanese International School. Is 8 that correct?</p> <p>9 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: This one is correct. This one, near the 10 traffic signal.</p> <p>11 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. And you referred to the letter 12 to the police, and if I may refer you to the bundle at 13 page 840-70 in Chinese, and 840-74 in English. It was 14 a letter dated 5 June 2015, written by you to the Hong 15 Kong Police.</p> <p>16 We can see that the letter stated that there were 17 a lot of people over-speeding during holidays and then 18 requesting for installation of speed enforcement 19 cameras. Is that correct?</p> <p>20 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: Correct.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: And there was a reply from the police --</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on. The reference here is 23 generally to the Tai Po Road. Was there any particular 24 part of the Tai Po Road where there was this problem 25 with speeding?</p>
Page 18	Page 20
<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: But my question is not about the cause of 2 the accident, but the fact that the Transport Department 3 would examine whether the present speed limit of that 4 road section was appropriate. Did you see that sentence 5 in paragraph 80 where Mr Wong Kwok Leung stated that?</p> <p>6 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: Every day we have a lot of meetings. As 7 far as I know, we asked them -- we told that we could 8 only wait, because they are dealing with the procedure 9 or the proceeding.</p> <p>10 MS MAGGIE WONG: So is the answer no, that after the 11 minutes, or after the meeting in March 2015 the 12 Transport Department did not approach the district 13 council discussing about the speed limit of that road 14 section. Is that the case?</p> <p>15 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: I don't know whether they have talked to 16 the chairperson, Mr Man, but I was the councillor of 17 that constituency, so I would talk to them. They said 18 there needed to be consultation. They needed to consult 19 if the speed limit is to be reduced to 50.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: The question really is this. Did they tell you 21 what was the result of this consultation? This happened 22 three years ago.</p> <p>23 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: No, they did not. If there was a result, 24 I would not have sent a second letter to the police. 25 From the letter dated 2015, there wasn't much result.</p>	<p>1 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: I think just now I said that 2 Tse Lai King(?), uphill, when they approach the bus 3 accident location, the first bend, there are a lot of 4 accidents there. So in that section I had specified all 5 the way up to Ng San Jong(?) that there are some 6 residents who wrote a letter in Dragon Hill Bay -- 7 Deerhill Bay, where they say there is a lot of speeding 8 from sports cars, and in the first bend, that's where 9 the bus accident occurred, when they turn right, there 10 is a drifting, and vehicles can flip very easily. So 11 that's why we want a 50-kilometre speed limit and also 12 a speed camera.</p> <p>13 MS MAGGIE WONG: We have a map pulled up. Can you first of 14 all identify the location of the Deerhill Estate 15 mentioned in your letter. Or your evidence. Deerhill 16 Bay. Is that around the location of the Japanese 17 International School?</p> <p>18 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: This is the second letter. The first 19 letter was referring to Savannah Garden. This is the 20 second letter, and this letter does not mention the 21 Japanese school. The first letter involved the 22 international school.</p> <p>23 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. So that's the location that you are 24 referring to on the map, the Deerhill Bay, which is 25 behind the Japanese International School on the map.</p>

Page 21	Page 23
<p>1 Can you confirm that?</p> <p>2 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: Let me see. It is not very clear. It is</p> <p>3 between 22 and 20, right? Kon Hang is also on the map.</p> <p>4 This is Cheung Shue Tan, the bus stop before we reach</p> <p>5 Deerhill, that would include -- this is Deerhill. That</p> <p>6 is correct. This is approaching Deerhill, the approach,</p> <p>7 the entrance to Deerhill.</p> <p>8 MS MAGGIE WONG: And your letter stated that there are often</p> <p>9 speeding and unlawful motor racing on the Tai Po Road,</p> <p>10 but there appears no reference to the speed limit in</p> <p>11 this letter. Can you tell us why? Or request in</p> <p>12 relation to the speed limit.</p> <p>13 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: Well, in the heading I said that</p> <p>14 I request a 50-kilometre speed limit sign, and I also</p> <p>15 wanted -- I had written that, I had requested that.</p> <p>16 MS MAGGIE WONG: I refer to a letter dated 5 June.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: Perhaps we can put that letter up on the screen.</p> <p>18 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: Well, this speeding camera, the --</p> <p>19 typically it is 70 kilometres, if you have a speeding</p> <p>20 camera they will take pictures, if it exceeds the speed</p> <p>21 limit. A typical motorist when they see the camera they</p> <p>22 will slow down, it is very natural, so what I wrote was</p> <p>23 they needed to heed our residents' request to add</p> <p>24 a speed camera -- you are correct, I did not add that</p> <p>25 there, but the purpose is that if you have a speed limit</p>	<p>1 Department have not concluded their work, so I wrote</p> <p>2 directly to the police to see if they could install the</p> <p>3 speeding camera at the end of where the slope is going</p> <p>4 downhill, and that was my request.</p> <p>5 MS MAGGIE WONG: So in other words they said that the</p> <p>6 Transport Department refused the request, and the police</p> <p>7 is simply the enforcement department. So they can't do</p> <p>8 anything about it unless the Transport Department</p> <p>9 install the fixed speed monitoring cameras; is that</p> <p>10 correct?</p> <p>11 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: That is correct. It is clear that's what</p> <p>12 they responded, and subsequently, after this serious</p> <p>13 accident, I had contacted a police officer, we went to</p> <p>14 the site, and they promised that at the end of the year</p> <p>15 they would install a speeding camera.</p> <p>16 MS MAGGIE WONG: I refer you back to the minute dated</p> <p>17 12 February 2018. That would be at page 790 in English.</p> <p>18 Chinese at page 772.</p> <p>19 In this paragraph 17(ii), Dr Lau Chee Sing raised</p> <p>20 the following views, and he stated that:</p> <p>21 "Half a year ago, some district councillors had</p> <p>22 proposed installing speed enforcement cameras in the</p> <p>23 road section where the accident had occurred but were</p> <p>24 rejected by the relevant departments. He opined that</p> <p>25 despite there were sufficient signage at the scene,</p>
<p>Page 22</p> <p>1 of 50 then it would activate the camera if it exceeds</p> <p>2 50, and if --</p> <p>3 MS MAGGIE WONG: There was a reply from the police on</p> <p>4 16 June 2017.</p> <p>5 If I may take you to 840-71 in Chinese, English at</p> <p>6 840-73. The police stated that:</p> <p>7 "The locations for installation of fixed speed</p> <p>8 monitoring cameras are mainly determined by the</p> <p>9 Transport Department. After installation, the Police is</p> <p>10 responsible for taking enforcement action. This office</p> <p>11 understands that the Transport Department currently has</p> <p>12 no plans to install fixed speed monitoring cameras in</p> <p>13 the captioned road section. At the same time, the</p> <p>14 Police will continue to closely monitor the traffic</p> <p>15 situation of the road section concerned."</p> <p>16 This letter was copied to the Transport Department,</p> <p>17 Mr Paul Chiu, Traffic Control Division, Technical</p> <p>18 Service Branch, and the district commander at Tai Po.</p> <p>19 Do you see that?</p> <p>20 This letter was addressed to you personally.</p> <p>21 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: That is correct. I issued the letter and</p> <p>22 they should have responded to me. I had submitted them</p> <p>23 the letter, and I have a record of all the letters</p> <p>24 I send, so all these three letters were disclosed by</p> <p>25 myself, and the fact is we -- I see the Transport</p>	<p>Page 24</p> <p>1 a vehicle's speed would increase as a result of the</p> <p>2 impulse and centrifugal force generated as the vehicle</p> <p>3 went downhill and made a turn. Relevant departments</p> <p>4 should review on whether it was appropriate to keep the</p> <p>5 speed limit of the road section in concern at</p> <p>6 70 [kilometres per hour]. He said, for example, there</p> <p>7 had been an accident at Sai Kung ... [and] Clear Water</p> <p>8 Bay ... as the vehicle failed to brake in time. The</p> <p>9 speed limit was then lowered from 70 kph to 50 kph, and</p> <p>10 speed enforcement cameras were also installed. He</p> <p>11 suggested to lower the speed limit to 50 [kilometres per</p> <p>12 hour] and install speed enforcement cameras in the road</p> <p>13 section concerned to deter drivers from speeding."</p> <p>14 This is perhaps a question directed at Dr Lau.</p> <p>15 Reference was made to the fact that half a year ago</p> <p>16 district councillors had proposed installing speed</p> <p>17 enforcement cameras in the road section where concerned</p> <p>18 in relation to this accident. Was that in writing? Was</p> <p>19 this request made in writing?</p> <p>20 DR LAU CHEE SING: So it was not my request. At the time</p> <p>21 they were aware that district councillors had written</p> <p>22 a request.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: Were you referring to Mr Chan's request, is that</p> <p>24 what this is a reference to?</p> <p>25 DR LAU CHEE SING: (In English) Yes, that was Mr Chan's</p>

Page 25	Page 27
<p>1 request, yes.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: And when you made reference to "rejected by</p> <p>3 the relevant departments", that was the letter of</p> <p>4 rejection by the police that we have just seen; is that</p> <p>5 correct?</p> <p>6 DR LAU CHEE SING: (In English) Correct, yes.</p> <p>7 MS MAGGIE WONG: If we continue, if we look at</p> <p>8 paragraph 24(iii), English at page 794, Chinese at</p> <p>9 page 776, paragraph 24(iii), that's the response by</p> <p>10 Mr Au Chun Wah stated that:</p> <p>11 "He agreed that the speed limit of the road section</p> <p>12 concerned should be lowered from 70 [kilometres per</p> <p>13 hour] to 50 [kilometres per hour]. Yet, the attitude of</p> <p>14 the driver was just as important. Some bus drivers who</p> <p>15 knew the route extremely well might drive at a higher</p> <p>16 speed. To add one, the road section was sloping</p> <p>17 downwards. Even if the bus would be 'locked' when the</p> <p>18 speed exceeds 70 [kilometres per hour], there would be</p> <p>19 an impulse generated from the slope and the weight of</p> <p>20 the vehicle, causing an increase in the speed. He</p> <p>21 suggested that the bus company should remind bus drivers</p> <p>22 to be patient at all times, and to slow down when going</p> <p>23 downhill. In addition, he hoped that the bus company</p> <p>24 would instruct all bus drivers to maintain a good</p> <p>25 attitude while driving."</p>	<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Mr Chan, can you help us? The question is, was</p> <p>2 there a site visit?</p> <p>3 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: Well, I personally did, now whether the</p> <p>4 district council chairman, he spoke at that -- on that</p> <p>5 occasion, he just raised the question, but whether there</p> <p>6 was any follow-up, that was another issue. Now, as</p> <p>7 a councillor, I definitely went to examine the scene</p> <p>8 before and after the accident. I definitely went</p> <p>9 myself, and Dr Lau Chee Sing, as chairman, whether he</p> <p>10 attended I could not recall.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: Did you go with the Transport Department, I think</p> <p>12 is the question. Was there any joint site visit?</p> <p>13 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: I went personally with the Transport</p> <p>14 Department.</p> <p>15 MS WONG PIK KUI: Let me also answer, well, we -- the Tai Po</p> <p>16 District Council, the chairman, Mr Cheung Hok Ming, the</p> <p>17 Home Affairs officer DO, Ms Cheung, together with us,</p> <p>18 the whole Tai Po Transport Traffic Committee, all our</p> <p>19 members went to the site to visit once. And Au Chun Wai</p> <p>20 had also attended.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>22 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. Out of this site visit was it</p> <p>23 agreed amongst Transport Department and the persons in</p> <p>24 attendance at this site visit that the speed limit has</p> <p>25 to be reduced? For that particular road section in</p>
Page 26	Page 28
<p>1 Then at (vi):</p> <p>2 "He enquired the police for the number of traffic</p> <p>3 accidents that had happened ..."</p> <p>4 Not only for the road section concerned, but also</p> <p>5 for the entire length of Tai Po Road, and he asked</p> <p>6 whether there were speed enforcement cameras at Tai Po</p> <p>7 Road, and if yes, the number and the locations.</p> <p>8 And now may I ask, first of all, about this speed</p> <p>9 limit lowering from 70 kilometres to 50 kilometres per</p> <p>10 hour. After this meeting, did you and the Transport</p> <p>11 Department have a site inspection of the location of the</p> <p>12 accident, in order to discuss about this request of</p> <p>13 reduction of speed limit?</p> <p>14 DR LAU CHEE SING: (In English) You asking me? Or ask</p> <p>15 Mr Chan?</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: It is a matter for you, amongst yourselves, to</p> <p>17 decide who should answer a particular question. Perhaps</p> <p>18 Ms Wong could indicate who might best reply.</p> <p>19 MS MAGGIE WONG: Maybe Ms Wong, if --</p> <p>20 MS WONG PIK KUI: I will invite our TT group chairman</p> <p>21 Dr Lau.</p> <p>22 DR LAU CHEE SING: (In English) That question was raised by</p> <p>23 Mr Au, another district councillor. I think that should</p> <p>24 be better answered by Mr Chan, because he is the</p> <p>25 district councillor of that area.</p>	<p>1 relation to the accident?</p> <p>2 MS WONG PIK KUI: Yes, when we were at the site we had</p> <p>3 raised two requests. The first was to bring in the</p> <p>4 70 kilometres speed limit and lower it to 50 kilometres</p> <p>5 per hour, and we also wanted signage, and the second</p> <p>6 request was that in this section where we needed the</p> <p>7 speed limit to be slowed down, they should also install</p> <p>8 the speeding cameras.</p> <p>9 MS MAGGIE WONG: During the site visit did you discuss about</p> <p>10 where the speed enforcement cameras should be installed,</p> <p>11 or the location of the cameras?</p> <p>12 MS WONG PIK KUI: We, yes. We did identify the location.</p> <p>13 We had a whole coach, tour bus coach, some 40 people</p> <p>14 visiting the site, and we had more than 40 people on</p> <p>15 that section, and we felt it was dangerous to conduct</p> <p>16 our site visit under those conditions, so we took our</p> <p>17 request, and raised that in our district council meeting</p> <p>18 room in our Traffic and Transport Committee.</p> <p>19 So if we wanted a precise location for the speeding</p> <p>20 cameras, we handed that over to the TD and the police,</p> <p>21 and our Councillor Chan Siu Kuen would follow up.</p> <p>22 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: I did. I was with the police officer</p> <p>23 responsible for traffic at the site, and I identified</p> <p>24 and designated the site -- that is the stretch that is</p> <p>25 going downhill where the cameras should be installed,</p>

Page 29	Page 31
<p>1 and we did have a discussion.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: So was all this in writing? Or recorded in</p> <p>3 minutes, apart from the ones that you produced to us?</p> <p>4 MS WONG PIK KUI: No. These were not listed out in such</p> <p>5 details at the meeting, because on the locations of the</p> <p>6 cameras, the district councillor of the constituency had</p> <p>7 to liaise with the village heads of the three villages</p> <p>8 at Tai Po Mei, he had to listen, consult them on the</p> <p>9 views, because there are also bus stops involved, maybe</p> <p>10 they need to be repaired and then need to remove the</p> <p>11 lamp post, and so on. So these are all details which</p> <p>12 are left to Mr Chan Siu Kuen to follow up by making</p> <p>13 appointment on another occasion with the relevant</p> <p>14 parties. That is why it was mentioned repeatedly,</p> <p>15 Mr Chan said he and the department went to the site</p> <p>16 several times afterwards.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: Can we have the date of the communal visit, the</p> <p>18 40-odd people in the coach. When was that?</p> <p>19 MS WONG PIK KUI: I think it should be 12 April. Perhaps</p> <p>20 our colleagues could all help out. I think it was</p> <p>21 12 April. On that day we hired a coach bus to go there.</p> <p>22 Yes. 2 pm on 12 April. We started from the Tai Po</p> <p>23 government offices and then we went up to the Tai Po</p> <p>24 Road bus stop for a site inspection. We arrived at 2.15</p> <p>25 at the scene at Tai Po Mei.</p>	<p>1 shouldn't continue to go via the racecourse, and then on</p> <p>2 to Tai Po Road to the terminus. I hope there would be</p> <p>3 a new route. And then the new route could take the Tolo</p> <p>4 Harbour Highway.</p> <p>5 MS MAGGIE WONG: Did they submit any proposal to your</p> <p>6 council for consideration? Since -- (Simultaneous</p> <p>7 speakers - unclear) --</p> <p>8 MS WONG PIK KUI: After the end of the meeting, well, it was</p> <p>9 close to the Chinese New Year, there was no further</p> <p>10 meeting. The Transport Department colleague called me,</p> <p>11 and asked if I agreed to this, that is for route 872X,</p> <p>12 it will go from the racecourse via the Tolo Highway to</p> <p>13 Tai Po centre.</p> <p>14 MS MAGGIE WONG: If I may refer you to paragraph 12 at</p> <p>15 page 788 in English, and 771 in Chinese. This request</p> <p>16 was made by Mr Kwan Wing Yip, at paragraph 12(iv). He</p> <p>17 stated that:</p> <p>18 "Since he began serving as District Councillor</p> <p>19 18 years ago, there had not been any large-scale road</p> <p>20 widening or improvement works carried out on Tai Po</p> <p>21 Road. He understood that Tai Po Road was subjected to</p> <p>22 geographical limitations, but he still hoped that the</p> <p>23 relevant departments could try their best to work on</p> <p>24 improvement plans. He also hoped that the Transport</p> <p>25 Department could also consider improvement plans of</p>
<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>2 MS WONG PIK KUI: Yes, and then ... then at 3.30 there was</p> <p>3 a DMC, the district management committee meeting. At</p> <p>4 that meeting, we had a discussion after the site</p> <p>5 inspection. Now only the chairman and deputy chairman</p> <p>6 of the district council and the chairman of the five</p> <p>7 committees, so altogether seven district councillors who</p> <p>8 met with the district office and the departments of Tai</p> <p>9 Po. So that's a meeting for these people. And yes,</p> <p>10 there is a minute for this meeting.</p> <p>11 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can I take you back to -- still in</p> <p>12 the February 2018 minutes, as to the response by the</p> <p>13 KMB. That would be at 798 in English, and 780 in</p> <p>14 Chinese. At paragraph 35 it stated that:</p> <p>15 "Mr Godwin So's views and responses to the questions</p> <p>16 raised by the district councillors were as follows ..."</p> <p>17 And 35(ii) stated:</p> <p>18 "The KMB will consider the views of the District</p> <p>19 Councillors on the routes, schedules, and dispatches of</p> <p>20 Route 872, and will submit proposals to the Transport</p> <p>21 Department and the district council for future</p> <p>22 considerations."</p> <p>23 First of all, what views of the district councillors</p> <p>24 was he referring to?</p> <p>25 MS WONG PIK KUI: The route 872, I proposed that it</p>	<p>1 other roads (eg Ting Kok Road, Lam Kam Road, Sai Sha</p> <p>2 Road) proposed by the Traffic And Transport Committee of</p> <p>3 the Tai Po District Council ... so as to prevent traffic</p> <p>4 accidents caused by road defects."</p> <p>5 In relation to this request by Mr Kwan, he mentioned</p> <p>6 that the Tai Po Road had not had any improvement works</p> <p>7 carried out during the past 18 years.</p> <p>8 What is your view on that, when he stated that?</p> <p>9 MS WONG PIK KUI: Now I think, perhaps it is best to get</p> <p>10 a response from the district councillor of the</p> <p>11 constituency, Mr Chan Siu Kuen.</p> <p>12 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: For the Tai Po Road, there are quite</p> <p>13 a number of bends. Yes, there have been widening works,</p> <p>14 for example the bend near Savannah Garden, this slope</p> <p>15 was cut before. There were not too many serious</p> <p>16 accidents there, it is true. But really, I think in</p> <p>17 this case, it is the bus driver, who drove carelessly.</p> <p>18 For this whole section, now as the district councillor</p> <p>19 of the constituency, most of the complaints were about</p> <p>20 speeding, and the residents were worried that might lead</p> <p>21 to serious traffic accidents, but for that particular</p> <p>22 location, best of course if it could be widened. You</p> <p>23 know, in Hong Kong there are many such roads with such</p> <p>24 bends, but for Tai Po Road it is not particularly</p> <p>25 dangerous, but of course if the widening could be done</p>

Page 33	Page 35
<p>1 we could support it.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: Before you go on, Mr Chan, may I remind you, in</p> <p>3 view of the remarks that you just made, that the causes</p> <p>4 and liability of the accident on 10 February are not</p> <p>5 within the terms of reference of this committee. We are</p> <p>6 interested to find out about the circumstances, but we</p> <p>7 are precluded from making any determination about that,</p> <p>8 for obvious reasons in light of prospective litigation.</p> <p>9 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: Yes. I got it.</p> <p>10 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Chan, that paragraph made reference to</p> <p>11 improvement plans. Can you tell us when did the Traffic</p> <p>12 and Transport Committee of your district council propose</p> <p>13 the improvement plan? When?</p> <p>14 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: There is no mention here. On widening of</p> <p>15 Tai Po Road, it is not mentioned.</p> <p>16 MS MAGGIE WONG: Dr Lau --</p> <p>17 MS WONG PIK KUI: Perhaps I could say this here. Mr Kwan</p> <p>18 said he has been a district councillor for 18 years,</p> <p>19 actually I am in the same case.</p> <p>20 Now, at the district council, for all these years,</p> <p>21 it is true, there are widening works at some sections of</p> <p>22 Tai Po Road, for instance, Ting Kok Road has been</p> <p>23 widened and is open to traffic already, it is a very</p> <p>24 successful case. The roundabout at Lam Kam Road, again</p> <p>25 widening works have been completed. Sai Sha Road, there</p>	<p>1 Department as experts, to execute the improvement works.</p> <p>2 Is that what you are saying?</p> <p>3 DR LAU CHEE SING: Yes. Correct.</p> <p>4 MS MAGGIE WONG: And may I also refer you to paragraph 26,</p> <p>5 page 796 in English. And 778 in Chinese.</p> <p>6 Paragraph 26(ii). Mr Yu Chi Wing, councillor, commented</p> <p>7 as follows. He said that:</p> <p>8 "The staff of the Transport and Housing Bureau and</p> <p>9 Transport Department often refused to implement the</p> <p>10 suggestions put forward by the District Councillors, and</p> <p>11 they are often biased in favour of KMB at the meeting.</p> <p>12 In addition, there are often personnel changes in the</p> <p>13 Transport Department, which has led to a slow progress</p> <p>14 in handling cases."</p> <p>15 First of all, when Mr Yu made reference to</p> <p>16 suggestions put forward by the district councillors are</p> <p>17 they referring to safety-related measures in relation to</p> <p>18 the road section of Tai Po Road? Or can you tell us</p> <p>19 what those suggestions were?</p> <p>20 MS WONG PIK KUI: Now, I think, perhaps I should say this.</p> <p>21 Mr Yu Chi Wing expressed his views at the meeting so it</p> <p>22 should be for him to explain and clarify his views. We</p> <p>23 really cannot speak for him and interpret what he meant</p> <p>24 here.</p> <p>25 MS MAGGIE WONG: Have there been meetings with the Transport</p>
Page 34	Page 36
<p>1 is now consideration of an option. Next time, when we</p> <p>2 talk about road improvement works again, we would ask</p> <p>3 the Transport Department to submit proposals together</p> <p>4 with others for the consideration of the Traffic and</p> <p>5 Transport Committee. That should be the case.</p> <p>6 MS MAGGIE WONG: Do you have anything to supplement?</p> <p>7 DR LAU CHEE SING: Yes, I would like to add this. At the</p> <p>8 Traffic and Transport Committee meetings we discussed</p> <p>9 requests made by a particular member. When that is the</p> <p>10 case, it is not necessarily that the committee would</p> <p>11 submit plans. Usually at meetings we would ask the</p> <p>12 Transport Department to make improvements, and we would</p> <p>13 wait for the Transport Department to make proposals.</p> <p>14 Because they are the experts on transport matters. So</p> <p>15 it is for them to respond to members' requests, and come</p> <p>16 up with some improvement proposals for our</p> <p>17 consideration. Because district council councillors are</p> <p>18 not experts in this area. So usually when we make</p> <p>19 request at the Traffic and Transport Committee meetings,</p> <p>20 then we hope the Transport Department or the relevant</p> <p>21 departments would then put forward proposals for</p> <p>22 improvement for our consideration.</p> <p>23 That's the point I would like to clarify.</p> <p>24 MS MAGGIE WONG: In other words, you propose a certain idea</p> <p>25 but in terms of execution, you leave it to the Transport</p>	<p>1 and Housing Bureau and Transport Department after</p> <p>2 suggestions had been put forward by the district</p> <p>3 councillor each time?</p> <p>4 MS WONG PIK KUI: Yes. Now let me put it this way.</p> <p>5 District councillors receive complaints from residents.</p> <p>6 So through various channels they would convey these</p> <p>7 complaints. Going through the district council is one</p> <p>8 way, then writing is another way, or calling up someone</p> <p>9 is also a possibility. And then district councillors</p> <p>10 would speak with the Transport Department on their</p> <p>11 proposals or suggestions.</p> <p>12 Perhaps other departments could also express their</p> <p>13 views on the matter. Mr Yam, thank you.</p> <p>14 MR YAM KAI BONG: Now, on Mr Yu Chi Wing's views, and the</p> <p>15 counsel just asked about the views of other members, for</p> <p>16 example on how the Transport Department views members'</p> <p>17 views. I would like to give my opinion as well.</p> <p>18 Now, the Transport Department, the police, and</p> <p>19 relevant departments did respond expeditiously including</p> <p>20 reducing the speed limit from 70 to 50, or undertaking</p> <p>21 to install speed cameras, speeding cameras, but then as</p> <p>22 Mr Chan Siu Kuen said, he has actually followed up on</p> <p>23 such proposals for a long time. Let me say this, it's</p> <p>24 a fact which may not be pleasing to the ear, it is only</p> <p>25 when someone is killed or injured then the would</p>

Page 37	Page 39
<p>1 actively respond to our views, and we don't want to see 2 that.</p> <p>3 Now, there's mention of questions asked by district 4 councillors and often the Department would reject 5 district councillors' demands, and that's true. It is 6 not just on this particular subject. For example, in 7 Tai Po district we would like to build a flyover at 8 Kwong Fuk Road, we have talked about it for 10, 9 20 years, but because no lives were lost -- and then for 10 district councillors of the Tai Po town going into Tai 11 Po town or Kam Shan Village there is just a single road 12 section, and if there should be a traffic accident and 13 ambulances or fire engines prevented from entering it 14 would affect rescue effort. So because nothing 15 happened, that's why this demand of the district council 16 for many years could not be addressed.</p> <p>17 Now, you have to understand it. You know, district 18 council is rather passive, especially when departments 19 often cite technical reasons to block our request, and 20 it is hard for us to question those technical 21 considerations, and technical considerations include 22 a lot of data, or a thousand reasons why something 23 cannot be done.</p> <p>24 Now we are very unhappy about it, but we feel rather 25 helpless too -- and I must say this too.</p>	<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: I believe after this meeting there was 3 another meeting on 9 March 2018, also in relation to the 4 Tai Po Road accident. Is that correct?</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: Perhaps you could bring up the minutes of the 6 meeting.</p> <p>7 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. The Chinese is at page 801 and the 8 English is at page 815.</p> <p>9 Maybe I will summarise some of the key matters in 10 this minute before I go straight to the Transport 11 Department's proposals.</p> <p>12 This meeting was on 9 March 2018, and paragraph 4. 13 Mr Cheung Wai Fung representing the Transport 14 Department --</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: Slow down a bit, Ms Wong, so that the 16 representatives can see what you are addressing. 17 I think you have hard copies, do you, of these minutes? 18 You don't. In that case, take time, so that we can show 19 them to you on the screen.</p> <p>20 You are going to ask some questions about 21 paragraph 4?</p> <p>22 MS MAGGIE WONG: Paragraph 4. Mr Cheung Wai Fung 23 representing the Transport Department made four 24 suggestions in that paragraph. First, to study whether 25 to revise speed limits. Second, to strengthen traffic</p>
Page 38	Page 40
<p>1 Now, district councillors collect views from the 2 public on traffic and transport issues, whether it be 3 about professional drivers or pedestrians or after 4 accidents have happened. Yes, of course those are minor 5 accidents, but after minor accidents have happened does 6 it mean that there could be more serious accidents in 7 the future? This is something we can see. That's why 8 Mr Chan Siu Kuen or other district councillors here have 9 put forward these views. It is not groundless, because 10 we predict something could happen so we want to make 11 improvements as earlier as possible.</p> <p>12 As to how improvements could be made, we don't have 13 the capacity or the expertise to deal with it. But if 14 certain measures are taken, could it then reduce the 15 chance of accidents happening? This is what the 16 district council could like to achieve.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: Ms Wong, perhaps we could move forward to the 18 improvements that did actually happen. And as I recall, 19 there was a paper dated 9 April which was discussed by 20 the district council on 11 May.</p> <p>21 And I think that we might have received the approved 22 minutes yesterday.</p> <p>23 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. Chairman. Maybe I should jump 24 immediately to the proposals made by the Transport 25 Department.</p>	<p>1 signs, and road markings. Third, installation of speed 2 enforcement cameras, and fourth, to examine the 3 topography of the site of the accident and explore how 4 the bus stop could be optimised.</p> <p>5 So those are the four issues the Transport 6 Department would comprehensively review as stated in 7 paragraph 4. Do you confirm that?</p> <p>8 MS WONG PIK KUI: Yes.</p> <p>9 MS MAGGIE WONG: I believe in that meeting some members 10 voiced their discontent about the progress in general 11 terms because some district councillors considered that 12 the reduction of the speed limit of the particular road 13 section where the accident occurred could be reduced at 14 a shorter time, and to have the road section, the entire 15 length of the road section reviewed comprehensively 16 later.</p> <p>17 Can you recall that?</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: Can you take us to an example of such 19 a suggestion?</p> <p>20 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. If you look at paragraphs 11 and 12, 21 by Councillor Yam Kai Bong, and in the first paragraph 22 he expressed discontent or disappointment about the 23 progress.</p> <p>24 And he mentioned that there are many sharp bends or 25 slopes at paragraph 12 in the section of Tai Po Road</p>

Page 41	Page 43
<p>1 between Chek Nai Ping and Kwong Fuk Road to Savannah 2 Garden. 3 CHAIRMAN: Perhaps it is paragraph 12(ii) that captures what 4 you are saying. 5 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. 6 CHAIRMAN: The suggestion was that the department should 7 first install a speed enforcement camera on this road 8 section. 9 "Do it now, don't wait until later." 10 Wasn't that the suggestion. 11 Yes, Doctor? 12 MS WONG PIK KUI: I defer to Dr Lau. 13 DR LAU CHEE SING: I was chairman of that meeting. The 14 first item for discussion was about the traffic 15 accident, we would like to know the progress of 16 follow-up of improvement measures by the Transport 17 Department. 18 Their representative on that day mentioned the four 19 items mentioned. However, what he said was there was no 20 confirmation as to when they would be implemented. We 21 are district councillors, something major happened 22 in February. In March there was still nothing to 23 respond to our request. That is, reduction of speed. 24 Because that was something simple and could be done 25 immediately.</p>	<p>1 were disappointed. 2 MS MAGGIE WONG: I think, Dr Lau, you have also recorded 3 your sentiments at paragraph 31 of the minutes, just for 4 completeness. That's at page 811 in Chinese, and 825-2 5 in English. By the time of this meeting you had not 6 received the proposal from the Transport Department, and 7 you complain about reducing speed limits and the fact 8 that installing speed cameras are not difficult to 9 implement. The matters that you have averred to 10 earlier. 11 If we may look further at the Tai Po District 12 Council paper dated 9 April 2018 -- that's at 13 TD-1 page 354 in Chinese, and 360-1 in English. 14 This paper lists out a number of measures that they 15 proposed to the Tai Po District Council. If you can see 16 the first section -- the second section is the review of 17 the speed limit, and it is proposed that the speed limit 18 of certain sections be reduced from 70 kilometres per 19 hour to 50 kilometres per hour. 20 If we could go to subparagraphs 4(a), (b) and (c). 21 Subparagraph 4(c) is the part where they proposed the 22 section between Chek Nai Ping and Yun Yi Road of Tai Po 23 Road be adjusted, the speed limit be adjusted from 24 70 kilometres per hour, be lowered to 50 kilometres per 25 hour. That's subparagraph 4(c).</p>
Page 42	Page 44
<p>1 The representative of the Transport Department at 2 that time still said that it would be under 3 consideration. District councillors expressed 4 discontent and disappointment. That was because even 5 though they have mentioned four items, they did not say 6 anything about implementation date. 7 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 8 MS WONG PIK KUI: Mr Yam is here, maybe we can hear from 9 him. 10 MR YAM KAI BONG: I agree what Dr Lau said. It was not that 11 I was not happy with the recommendation of the Transport 12 Department. I was not happy about the lack of 13 timetable, and the date of installation of speed camera. 14 The meeting took place on 9 March, and on 12 April 15 during the site visit they then gave us a report saying 16 that there would be speed camera and improvement to 17 facilities and the locality of the bus stop as well as 18 speed reduction. So it was only on 12 April that they 19 gave us a confirmation about the improvement. 20 However, at that time the Transport Department used 21 words like they would consider "whether" there would be 22 an adjustment to the speed limit, as well as "whether" 23 there should be improvement to road signs. 24 So it was "whether" they would do it or not. That's 25 why I myself and other councillors were not happy and</p>	<p>1 And if we could -- if you could read it first, and 2 then we will pull up the map for you to look at. 3 Subparagraph 4(c). If we enlarge it, the section that 4 we are referring to where the speed limit is reduced is 5 the section starting from number 15 to number 31. The 6 line marked in orange or brown colour. 7 Can you confirm that's the Transport Department's 8 proposal? 9 DR LAU CHEE SING: (In English) Yes. By Transport 10 Department. 11 MS MAGGIE WONG: And they also proposed other measures 12 including the road traffic signs be put up and other 13 road markings. That's at subparagraph 8(a). If we may 14 look, first of all, at the map showing where the road 15 traffic signs are proposed by the Transport Department. 16 That's TD-1 page 360. 17 So they proposed to add two "Ahead" sign at the 18 bottom, and then warning traffic sign, you can see the 19 first, "Reduce speed now", "100 metres", and "Bend to 20 the right ahead"; and then the second traffic sign, then 21 we can see nine signs of sharp deviation of route, used 22 with amber border. Then we can see the enlargement of 23 the building, or construction of the pedestrian, and 24 other road markings, or more markings on the road 25 indicating the reduction of speed limit.</p>

Page 45	Page 47
<p>1 Can you confirm that's the proposal you have 2 discussed with the Transport Department? 3 DR LAU CHEE SING: (In English) Yes. Actually that was 4 presented by the Transport Department. 5 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. 6 DR LAU CHEE SING: (In English) And we discussed that at the 7 TTC meeting. 8 CHAIRMAN: So the paper was 9 April, and the meeting was on 9 the 12th. 10 DR LAU CHEE SING: (In English) That was the -- the meeting 11 was on -- 12 CHAIRMAN: I'm talking about the site visit. As 13 I understand the evidence, that was 12 April: then there 14 was a meeting on 11 May. 15 DR LAU CHEE SING: (In English) No. 16 DR LAU CHEE SING: It was mentioned during site visit and 17 then it was mentioned later. 18 (In English) The meeting on 12 April. 19 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 20 MS MAGGIE WONG: As to this proposal, I believe there was 21 draft minutes of the meeting dated 11 May this year. If 22 we may go to Chinese at page 840-9. 23 CHAIRMAN: Before we do that, were we not told that they 24 would be considered and approved in a meeting that was 25 held yesterday? The 13th?</p>	<p>1 Department. If we go to paragraph 4: 2 "The chairman said that the Transport Department had 3 earlier submitted documents to the committee introducing 4 the latest traffic control measures on Tai Po Road ..." 5 And it made reference to a Tai Po District Council 6 paper. That is the paper I took you to earlier on. 7 "The secretariat had also sent the same by e-mail on 8 10 April 2018 to the members ... Further, the 9 secretariat had assisted the Transport Department in 10 arranging the members of this committee to conduct 11 a site inspection of Tai Po Road with the District 12 Management Committee on 12 April this year, and the 13 Transport Department had explained the traffic control 14 measures to be implemented shortly. He invited the 15 Transport Department to report on the implementation of 16 the various measures." 17 And paragraph 5 is the response from the Transport 18 Department by Mr Henry Hui. He made five updates of 19 work progress. First, he stated that: The speed limits 20 of the Tai Po Road between Chek Nai Ping and Yung Yi 21 Road had been lowered from 70 to 50 kilometres per hour 22 from 27 April this year. 23 Second, that they have added the traffic sign and 24 road sign with yellow fluorescent on the background on 25 the signs to enforce reminder to drivers. Third,</p>
Page 46	Page 48
<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. 2 CHAIRMAN: Have they been approved? 3 MS MAGGIE WONG: Have they been approved? 4 DR LAU CHEE SING: So Mr Lunn would like to know whether it 5 was discussed yesterday? 6 MS MAGGIE WONG: No because what we have here is a draft 7 minute. Has that been approved, this draft minute, or 8 have there been changes? 9 DR LAU CHEE SING: (In English) That was approved. 10 MS MAGGIE WONG: Without changes? 11 CHAIRMAN: Without changes? 12 DR LAU CHEE SING: (In English) Without changes. 13 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. In which case we can go to the draft 14 minutes, if that is what you were going to do. 15 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. 16 If we go to page 840-09 in Chinese, and 840-20 in 17 English. And at paragraph 5 -- 18 CHAIRMAN: Which bundle are we in now? 19 MS MAGGIE WONG: We are at DC-2, page 840-23 in English, and 20 840-12 in Chinese. 21 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 22 MS MAGGIE WONG: And maybe we should go back one page to see 23 who is present. At page 840-22, the chairman welcomed 24 a few representatives, including Dr Lau and Mr Hui Kam 25 Nin Henry, the senior engineer of the Transport</p>	<p>1 widening of the bus bay that was damaged in the accident 2 with protective barriers. The works were expected to be 3 completed in this month, in July 2018. 4 The fourth is optimise the bus stop near the Tai Po 5 Mei. The work is supposed to be completed in August 6 2018. 7 Fifth is to improve the traffic sign and road 8 markings near Hung Lam Drive, Dragon Fountain and Yin 9 Tse Lane. The relevant works expected to be completed 10 by the end of this year. 11 Can you confirm the suggestions or the work progress 12 reported by the Transport Department? 13 MS WONG PIK KUI: Counsel, Mr Chan can respond. 14 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: (No interpreted answer). 15 MS MAGGIE WONG: If we go to paragraph 14. Mr Henry Hui 16 also reported that the Transport Department endeavoured 17 to complete installation of speed enforcement cameras by 18 the end of this year. As to operation matters, it would 19 be the responsibility of the police. 20 So the Transport Department has reported on the work 21 progress thus far. Is that correct? Or is this an 22 ongoing process? 23 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: It is not ongoing, it is a single 24 project. They had installed the camera and they were 25 restoring the bus stop to its previous condition. That</p>

Page 49	Page 51
<p>1 was the end of the project.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: If we could go further to see Henry Hui's</p> <p>3 observations after the reduction of the speed limit. At</p> <p>4 paragraph --</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on. Was the committee given any</p> <p>6 explanation as to why it would take until the end of the</p> <p>7 year to install a single speed camera, one camera?</p> <p>8 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: There was an explanation given. They</p> <p>9 said that it took time to order the camera, they</p> <p>10 couldn't order just one camera, they had to order</p> <p>11 a whole batch, and second, it had to go through EMSD,</p> <p>12 Highways, Transport, Police, they had to go to visit the</p> <p>13 site. They had to dig up the road site, they had to get</p> <p>14 permits, they could not do it for one project, so that's</p> <p>15 why they had to take until the end of the year. I asked</p> <p>16 why they couldn't speed it up, and they said that they</p> <p>17 received the permit, after questioning by district</p> <p>18 councillors they promised by the end of this year that</p> <p>19 they would install a speed camera for us.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: They had various procedures to go through in</p> <p>21 order to lower the speed limit, did they not? But they</p> <p>22 had managed to achieve that by 27 April.</p> <p>23 DR LAU CHEE SING: Because the speed reduction is simple,</p> <p>24 and it does not involve a lot of government departments,</p> <p>25 so I think regarding the speed reduction it was just the</p>	<p>1 meeting, and the subsequent discussion on 12 April, and</p> <p>2 then in May, July, we focused on urging for the</p> <p>3 installation of a speed camera vociferously and up until</p> <p>4 now we still have not accomplished this request.</p> <p>5 So perhaps our councillors could also add.</p> <p>6 MR YAM KAI BONG: I agree with the honourable judge. We do</p> <p>7 have a question why there isn't inventory. It is such</p> <p>8 a large traffic department. How come they don't have</p> <p>9 back-up, or even parts, because the government said they</p> <p>10 were going to respond to the issue very promptly, and</p> <p>11 the honourable judge said just now, or Mr Chan Siu Kuen</p> <p>12 said that the changing of the speed limit, that could be</p> <p>13 done very quickly in terms of works, but the Transport</p> <p>14 Department said that they had to purchase the</p> <p>15 components, and use that as a reason, and the district</p> <p>16 council found that unreasonable.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>18 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you.</p> <p>19 Madam Wong, I would like to take you to paragraph 19</p> <p>20 in this minute. At page 840-29, and that's</p> <p>21 paragraph 19. I would like to ask a few observations</p> <p>22 you made in this paragraph.</p> <p>23 The first paragraph, you make reference to the</p> <p>24 lowering of the speed limit. After it came into effect,</p> <p>25 you received feedback from school coach drivers, bus</p>
Page 50	Page 52
<p>1 Transport Department, they could make the arrangements</p> <p>2 themselves. And Highways Department -- they are also an</p> <p>3 executive, or a branch of the government. It is easier</p> <p>4 to coordinate the work.</p> <p>5 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: So when you order the speed camera you</p> <p>6 cannot order one unit. I recall from memory that they</p> <p>7 had to order a whole batch, and there are still a lot of</p> <p>8 areas in Hong Kong where they need to install these</p> <p>9 camera heads and they were ordering a batch then, they</p> <p>10 couldn't just order one single camera ahead, and there</p> <p>11 were a lot of procedures, government department</p> <p>12 procedures. They had to consult the different</p> <p>13 government departments, they had to contact EMSD,</p> <p>14 Electrical and Mechanical Services Department to get the</p> <p>15 power supply for the camera. That was the response</p> <p>16 I had at the site.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: Are we to understand that although there are</p> <p>18 4,200 kilometres of roads in Hong Kong, the Transport</p> <p>19 Department has no inventory of speed cameras?</p> <p>20 Perhaps you can't answer that.</p> <p>21 MS WONG PIK KUI: Let me add. The incident occurred on</p> <p>22 10 February, and after that, in our special meeting on</p> <p>23 12 February, and then in March, we had our regular</p> <p>24 session at the district council meeting, and then the</p> <p>25 third meeting was the Traffic and Transport Committee</p>	<p>1 drivers, and traffic accident victims, et cetera.</p> <p>2 May I know what feedback you have received?</p> <p>3 MS WONG PIK KUI: Well, the incident had been discussed</p> <p>4 thoroughly in the district council and we were focused</p> <p>5 on reducing the speed from 70 to 50 kilometres per hour</p> <p>6 and I received feedback from school bus drivers</p> <p>7 regarding this road section. And they say that this is</p> <p>8 an incline, and if you want to travel uphill and then</p> <p>9 you want them to brake and brake to 50 kilometres, they</p> <p>10 say it is very hard to control or maintain the speed of</p> <p>11 the bus. But they understand that the incident needs to</p> <p>12 lead to some improvements, but they are worried that if</p> <p>13 they have to reduce the speed, their school bus, they</p> <p>14 have more than 40 passengers, so such a large vehicle,</p> <p>15 it is very hard to keep it under 50 kilometres speed.</p> <p>16 So I heard different drivers' input, and I reflected</p> <p>17 that in the district council.</p> <p>18 MS MAGGIE WONG: At (iii), you mentioned that some bus</p> <p>19 drivers reflected that double-decker buses are not</p> <p>20 suitable to operate on Tai Po Highway since the speed</p> <p>21 limit will easily exceed 50 kilometres per hour, even</p> <p>22 the bus is accelerated when not at a full capacity.</p> <p>23 Can you elaborate on this. Are you suggesting that</p> <p>24 double-decker buses are not suitable for this road</p> <p>25 section? Or are you making other suggestions here?</p>

Page 53	Page 55
<p>1 MS WONG PIK KUI: Well, I have visited the injured, after 2 they were discharged from hospital -- one of the victims 3 was a bus driver, there were also lorry driver victims, 4 so they had -- they were victims, and they told me that 5 double-decker buses on this road is very dangerous 6 because a double-decker bus is so large. When they 7 accelerate uphill they have to step on the gas, and such 8 a large double-decker bus compared to a single-decker 9 bus, they told me that they don't want to see 10 double-decker buses running on this section. They say 11 it is very dangerous, and they were asking for 12 single-decker buses. So that's the opinion that 13 I brought back to the council.</p> <p>14 MS MAGGIE WONG: Before we move on, can we look at the map 15 with some of the photographs to identify the location as 16 to how -- what it looks like now with the improvement 17 works? That would be photo 14 to 19. That's the first 18 reduced -- that's the first "ahead" traffic sign.</p> <p>19 And then that's the reduction of limit 50 kilometres 20 per hour and the road markings.</p> <p>21 And I believe just now what we saw is the -- what 22 you said is when the bus is driving uphill and then 23 slightly downhill, that's the part you referred to 24 earlier on. Is that correct? The 50 speed limit.</p> <p>25 MS WONG PIK KUI: Yes.</p>	<p>1 lamps or street lighting it is sufficient.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: Did your council have any comments on any 3 of these improvement measures, whether they are 4 sufficient to address the concerns that you have 5 expressed previously in the previous meetings? Would 6 they be sufficient to address your concerns?</p> <p>7 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: Well, basically, I personally had 8 discussed with the relevant government departments 9 including TD, so the bus stop is now moved forward, it 10 is widened, they have removed, they felled the old tree, 11 they widened that piece of road. And I also asked for 12 a traffic signal, but they were not able to do that. 13 They created some pedestrian crossing, and so the 14 village entrance has been widened a little bit. They 15 cannot do that right now.</p> <p>16 So is it 100 per cent meeting the villagers' 17 requirements, no? The village head also asked whether 18 the bus stop could be moved further ahead, make it more 19 visible. So TD, after looking at the actual site they 20 said they can't do it. They said there is a very steep 21 incline. After the improvement they have to consider 22 the actual usage and conditions before they make further 23 decisions.</p> <p>24 MR CHAN CHO LEUNG: Honourable judge, I want to say that 25 they cannot meet our requirements. Even when we provide</p>
Page 54	Page 56
<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: And then we see the first warning sign, 2 "Reduce speed now", "100 metres". And then the next is 3 the second sign, and then we see a lot of -- nine of 4 them, nine signs with amber background asking drivers to 5 be alert to slow down.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: I think they are described as "chevrons", are 7 they not? Nine chevrons.</p> <p>8 MS MAGGIE WONG: If we go to the next photo we can see the 9 reconstruction of the bus stop and the expansion of the 10 pedestrian area.</p> <p>11 We also see there are three new lamp posts installed 12 in that bus stop. This is something I wish to ask. 13 What is the lighting condition before the Tai Po 14 accident, for this area? Do you know?</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: You mean by that the street lighting? Or the 16 road lighting?</p> <p>17 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, for this particular bus stop. Because 18 we can see there are three new lamp posts installed.</p> <p>19 MR CHAN SIU KUEN: Basically, the lighting is sufficient, 20 there is a requirement of a street lighting every 21 60 feet, and there was a tree that had shaded the bus 22 stop, but now with three extra lamp posts there is 23 sufficient lighting, but we are most concerned about the 24 bend. There is a slight incline on the bend, and that 25 is where it is most dangerous, but now with three extra</p>	<p>1 input regarding safety, I feel this kind of signage, the 2 arrows, the chevrons, are only visual information, but 3 a lot of our colleagues have provided input that when 4 you are going downhill the most effective input is not 5 visual input, you would need a small speed bump, or 6 yellow stripes, when you go downhill. You can feel 7 there is a palpable sensation, and it helps you meet the 8 safety needs.</p> <p>9 MS MAGGIE WONG: Did you relate the request that you made 10 about putting speed bump or yellow stripes to allow 11 people to feel, or there is a palpable sensation so that 12 people feel they have to slow down. Did you relate this 13 request to the Transport Department?</p> <p>14 MR CHAN CHO LEUNG: We did. All councillors had expressed 15 this, but the response was the Hong Kong TD have some 16 constraints. The constraint is installing the yellow 17 stripes, they can only do that at say the interchange 18 going downhill, for example in Sai Kung where they have 19 an incline, they have installed it there. But it is not 20 in front of the interchange, if it doesn't go down 21 towards the interchange they cannot do it.</p> <p>22 MS WONG PIK KUI: I had visited this site, and in another 23 picture where we have these nine chevrons, this is the 24 highest point. The bus drivers say if you are driving 25 a double-decker full of passengers they need to step on</p>

Page 57	Page 59
<p>1 the gas to -- and then they start going downhill. There</p> <p>2 is a sharp bend, and we also feel it is dangerous, so on</p> <p>3 this road surface, as Mr Chan Cho Leung said, can we</p> <p>4 have some yellow stripes, we had mentioned that on the</p> <p>5 site, but TD said it is not easy to implement, and the</p> <p>6 reason was given by Mr Chan Cho Leung.</p> <p>7 We also said that the rest area, could it be</p> <p>8 relocated, and they said it couldn't, because that</p> <p>9 little resting area, that is the entrance to the Tai Po</p> <p>10 village, they need to cross the road to access the bus</p> <p>11 stop, but the bus stop is at the steepest point in this</p> <p>12 indented area, and the buses turning into that bend from</p> <p>13 the high point you have to decelerate, and then you have</p> <p>14 to turn into that indentation, so you need to consider</p> <p>15 the bus driver's skills, can they accomplish this</p> <p>16 manoeuvre. So that is something we do not wish to see</p> <p>17 repeated.</p> <p>18 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you.</p> <p>19 I'm going to refer to the last document. It is the</p> <p>20 25 May 2018 minutes. In Chinese it is at page 826,</p> <p>21 English at page 827, where you enclosed the 25th minutes</p> <p>22 at page 828 in Chinese, and then English starts at 834.</p> <p>23 In this minute you made a number of suggestions or</p> <p>24 expressed certain opinion. I would like to explore that</p> <p>25 with you. First, it is paragraph 4 of this minute.</p>	<p>1 to work, and here we are talking about drivers. We are</p> <p>2 not talking about someone just sitting there, and you</p> <p>3 can just close your eyes if you want, or when you are</p> <p>4 tired you can just stretch or something. No, they can't</p> <p>5 do that.</p> <p>6 So we are talking about 14 hours, in such an</p> <p>7 important position. He is responsible for the lives of</p> <p>8 over 130 passengers on a bus, and this is totally</p> <p>9 inappropriate.</p> <p>10 I can invite my colleagues also to give their views</p> <p>11 on this.</p> <p>12 MR YAM KAI BONG: Thank you, Ms Wong.</p> <p>13 On working hours we would like to say this.</p> <p>14 Especially in the New Territories, I hope you will</p> <p>15 appreciate this, for New Territories residents early in</p> <p>16 the morning they will go from New Territories to Kowloon</p> <p>17 or Hong Kong Island and then in the evening they go from</p> <p>18 Hong Kong Island or Kowloon to go back to the New</p> <p>19 Territories or Tai Po. Now this is the way of</p> <p>20 commuting. So, say, we are talking about 10 loaded</p> <p>21 buses going to Kowloon, then there won't one or two</p> <p>22 loaded buses going back to Tai Po.</p> <p>23 In fact, bus operators said in their evidence that</p> <p>24 there are especially during peak hours, that is why</p> <p>25 there is this special shift. Maybe in the morning they</p>
Page 58	Page 60
<p>1 Reference was made to the working hours, the</p> <p>2 Transport Department's current guidelines which state:</p> <p>3 "The maximum duty hours of bus captains shall not</p> <p>4 exceed 14 hours."</p> <p>5 And then it is stated there:</p> <p>6 "It was thought that the maximum duty hours as</p> <p>7 stipulated in the guidelines is too long and caused</p> <p>8 safety concerns to passengers. It was hoped that the</p> <p>9 committee could review the issue of the overly long</p> <p>10 working hours of bus captains."</p> <p>11 It also states at 835 in English and 830 in Chinese</p> <p>12 that:</p> <p>13 "Irrespective of how duty is arranged it was thought</p> <p>14 that it was in fact too long for bus captains to work</p> <p>15 14 hours on a daily basis."</p> <p>16 My question is, can you explain why you consider</p> <p>17 14 hours too long?</p> <p>18 MS WONG PIK KUI: In a day, there are 24 hours, and how we</p> <p>19 distribute the 24 hours, well, they should be divided</p> <p>20 into three parts, 8 hours for work, 8 hours for rest,</p> <p>21 and 8 hours for us to, you know, take care of family, or</p> <p>22 do studying and so on. That's reasonable.</p> <p>23 But then for 24 hours in a day now, the KMB has</p> <p>24 divided that into just two parts. In fact it is more</p> <p>25 than half of a day, it's 14 hours, they ask staff to go</p>	<p>1 work four or five hours, then in the evenings they work</p> <p>2 another three or four hours, in between. So 14 hours is</p> <p>3 not 14 hours straight in a row driving. But they are on</p> <p>4 duty, or the so-called rest break.</p> <p>5 Do they really get to rest during that break?</p> <p>6 Sometimes bus drivers will tell us maybe they live in</p> <p>7 Tuen Mun or Yuen Long but they are assigned to Tai Po to</p> <p>8 work, let's say they finish at 10 am, that is the peak</p> <p>9 morning shift, they may have three or four hours to take</p> <p>10 a rest, but can they really get home to take a nap, for</p> <p>11 instance? If they go from Tai Po to go home to take</p> <p>12 a nap they may spend two hours or so commuting, and then</p> <p>13 they have to come back to Tai Po, pick up the bus and</p> <p>14 then take the second shift of driving duties.</p> <p>15 And then in between they have a few hours of free</p> <p>16 time, but can they really take a rest then? That's the</p> <p>17 question.</p> <p>18 Now we learned this from bus drivers for the break</p> <p>19 in between there is not a proper environment for them to</p> <p>20 take a rest.</p> <p>21 Ms Wong led us to the mainland some time ago on</p> <p>22 a study visit, we went to Hangzhou and visited a bus</p> <p>23 company. The bus company actually had a proper rest</p> <p>24 facilities, similar to dormitory for drivers to rest.</p> <p>25 All around the world people usually work from 9 to</p>

Page 61	Page 63
<p>1 5, so that's why there are peak hours for travelling. 2 But in between, probably few people take the bus, so 3 there are such a special arrangement, but then in 4 between, do staff really get to go home to take a rest? 5 Probably not. 6 But then shouldn't the bus company have the duty to 7 provide a good environment for drivers to take a rest? 8 Maybe they start working at 5 am and then they have to 9 work again until 8 to 9 pm in between do they get to 10 take a rest. 11 So shouldn't the bus company have the responsibility 12 to provide proper environment for their drivers to take 13 a rest during their breaks? 14 Now I hope members of the committee will appreciate 15 this, especially for empty bus routes, this is even more 16 important. 17 Because after 9 am or 10 am, for passengers going to 18 Hong Kong Island or Kowloon there are far fewer in 19 number, and then probably the peak hours start again at 20 4 or 5 pm when people start to come home from work. 21 So let's say we just remove the special shift 22 altogether, it will actually affect bus services in the 23 New Territories, unless the bus company is to hire 24 double the number of drivers so there would be drivers 25 from the morning shift, another batch of drivers for the</p>	<p>1 government is responsible for hardware assets such as 2 bus depot, vehicles, operation system, and operators are 3 responsible for operation. So the operators are simply 4 responsible for the operation, and that could have 5 additional bonus. 6 So first, why do you think the Singapore model, or 7 do you advance the Singapore model as suitable for Hong 8 Kong? 9 MS WONG PIK KUI: Can I invite Mr Yam Kai Bong to respond 10 please. 11 MR YAM KAI BONG: Thank you, Ms Wong. 12 Yes, I raised this suggestion. We have looked at 13 studies done in the market on how bus services should be 14 run, should buses be totally privately run as is done 15 here now? Or should bus services be owned by the 16 government, and they could hire staff as civil servants 17 or it could be a public-private partnership, the 18 Singapore model, the London model. That is, the 19 government buys the bus depot, the vehicles, and so on, 20 and then the routes are contracted out to contractors. 21 Why did I suggest that? For franchised bus services, we 22 count there are all together five operators. 23 So they each have their own turf, if I could put it 24 that way. KMB, Kowloon; New World Bus, New Territories, 25 Hong Kong Island, blah, blah, blah.</p>
Page 62	Page 64
<p>1 evening shift, but if the bus companies cannot do that 2 and they just reduce the special shifts, then for 3 residents of the New Territories, or many of the bus 4 routes in the New Territories will be affected, so 5 please appreciate that. 6 You have to understand the way NT residents commute 7 and how bus services are provided as a result. 8 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. 9 I would like to ask four proposals set out in your 10 minutes -- 11 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on, on this issue of the 12 Guideline of Bus Captain Working Hours, Rest Times, and 13 Meal Breaks, in September of 2017, the Transport 14 Department announced that it was reviewing the then 15 guidelines, which was the 2010 version. Were you asked 16 to give your views as a district council about the 17 proposed changes to guidelines? 18 MR YAM KAI BONG: (In English) No. 19 MS WONG PIK KUI: No. We were not consulted. 20 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 21 MS MAGGIE WONG: I would like to ask four proposals set out 22 in your minutes. The first one is at page 836, second 23 bullet from the bottom, in English, and then page 830 in 24 Chinese, also the second bullet from the bottom. 25 You quoted Singapore as an example where the local</p>	<p>1 So they will just focus on profit-making routes. 2 For loss-making routes, because they are franchise 3 operators, they may overlook the service to the public 4 on these routes. Perhaps Mr Chan Siu Kuen could say 5 a bit more later. 6 Now, if the companies could be split up further, 7 that is we have more companies, that means there would 8 be more competition, then would there be a possibility 9 of improvement? For the Singapore model, the services 10 are contracted out to a few operators, so for the bus 11 routes, the fare level, or staff, wages, it is for the 12 government to decide. So their consideration is not 13 just about profit then. They will consider whether the 14 wage level is reasonable, for instance, and so on. 15 And then you can look at another place, Taipei. In 16 Taipei there are many different companies operating 17 different bus routes. Even for routes that are similar, 18 there could be different operators and that leads to 19 competition. With competition, it leads to two things. 20 One, because they have to, you know, fight for 21 staff, so there may be an increase in wage, and if the 22 routes are similar, that could also bring about 23 competition, maybe they will offer concessions, so 24 passengers will benefit from that. 25 Why we are proposing that the government should buy</p>

Page 65	Page 67
<p>1 up the whole bus system and then contract out the routes 2 to different operators? Because then we could 3 consolidate certain routes, let's say for some 4 profit-making routes they could be packaged together 5 with some of the less profitable routes to meet the 6 needs of smaller groups of residents, because the needs 7 of these residents are now overlooked, and they cannot 8 provide more bus services in such cases.</p> <p>9 But if a route is profitable the bus company will 10 just focus on that.</p> <p>11 That's why we believe the Singapore model is more 12 flexible. If it is a totally privately run bus service, 13 of course, first of all, companies will put profits 14 first. They will exploit -- maybe I shouldn't say 15 "exploit", they will see where they could save costs, 16 they can't save fuel costs, you know, as for costs of 17 vehicles, there's probably a world standard, so there is 18 not much room for reduction. So they could save only 19 staff costs, or at least they won't increase wages, and 20 that's why some staff or unions say that the pay and 21 conditions of service of bus drivers have always been 22 kept on the low side.</p> <p>23 Why is it that, it will change, that's why we say if 24 we change the models, maybe we can bring about changes 25 in the services provided.</p>	<p>1 released. He is of the opinion that the passengers' 2 oversight will be of certain use to improve the 3 operation of buses. It is hoped that the committee will 4 consider to [require] bus companies to release similar 5 application, to use technology to monitor bus service." 6 Can you elaborate on this about how the passenger 7 could use this technology to monitor the loss trip rate, 8 if I understand it correctly.</p> <p>9 MR YAM KAI BONG: Well, let me explain that. Because it is 10 from me. I found this information on line or it is also 11 from my own experience. And that's why I expressed this 12 view at the meeting.</p> <p>13 I mentioned the Taipei Citybus information system. 14 That's a mobile app, and on that app you can see on the 15 map where the bus is, say, the bus is at a certain 16 junction, or it has arrived at a certain bus stop. For 17 the KMB's mobile app it can only show that the bus will 18 arrive in three minutes or five minutes.</p> <p>19 But we cannot see how long the distance is, where 20 the bus is.</p> <p>21 Now, why do we want to know that? If they say it is 22 just three minutes but maybe there is traffic 23 congestion, so it doesn't mean that the bus will 24 actually arrive at three minutes.</p> <p>25 The mobile app only tells us it is three minutes</p>
Page 66	Page 68
<p>1 MR CHAN CHO LEUNG: Let me provide two facts by way of 2 supplement. Of course there are merits for the model 3 proposed. One fact is there are buses without 4 patronage, so these are the loss-making routes. Of 5 course, bus companies are not keen on them. Let's say 6 there are popular routes like the Lam Tsuen route, there 7 is just one bus route so it is heavy patronage. But the 8 bus company will still just make use of existing 9 resources for that route to redeploy bus services to 10 meet our needs.</p> <p>11 These are the two facts I would like to share with 12 you.</p> <p>13 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you.</p> <p>14 The second suggestion you made is using the real 15 time technology, or real time information, and you asked 16 that information be released as similar application.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: Where do we find this suggestion?</p> <p>18 MS MAGGIE WONG: If we look at page 838 in English, and 83 19 in Chinese at the bottom. And 838 is the second bullet.</p> <p>20 It states that:</p> <p>21 "Some members indicated that because Hong Kong buses 22 has high loss trip rate, if the bus companies are to 23 provide this information, the passengers will discover 24 the loss trip problem more easily and this is the reason 25 why this realtime information has not been fully</p>	<p>1 journey time but maybe for the three-minute journey, if 2 it is totally congested then maybe the bus will not 3 arrive in 15 minutes. But if it is like the Taipei bus 4 information system the public can see that the bus is 5 trapped in traffic congestion two blocks away. It is 6 like when you read the Google map you have realtime 7 information on traffic condition whether the road is 8 congested or not, we see there is true traffic and the 9 bus still does not arrive in three minutes then we can 10 ask what the problem is.</p> <p>11 Or if we want to monitor bus service many we should 12 say the next bus should have arrived, why is it that it 13 is still not here after so long? Is it because of 14 a road condition, like traffic congestion, or traffic 15 accident, or is it a case of loss trip?</p> <p>16 For the KMB mobile app we can't see such information 17 and there is limited information provided. If we could 18 follow the example of other countries or places with 19 realtime display of information, then we can see this 20 clearly for ourselves, we see there is a bus two blocks 21 away, it will arrive in about three minutes and traffic 22 condition is fine, but maybe there is another bus at 23 a junction five minutes away but it is actually, you 24 know, trapped in traffic congestion, for instance, and 25 then the passenger may decide not to wait for the bus,</p>

Page 69	Page 71
<p>1 instead I'll take the MTR so I get a choice. But now we 2 don't see that information.</p> <p>3 MR CHAN CHO LEUNG: I could give you an example of loss 4 trips. Again, I will use Lam Tsuen as an example. For 5 the past 20 years the problem of lost trips could never 6 be addressed. You know why? From Yuen Long, going 7 through Kam Shan Road to Tai Po, there are so many bus 8 stops along Kam Shan Road, by the time the buses come to 9 Lam Tsuen there are just two or three services left and 10 this problem can never be addressed.</p> <p>11 The problem now is for the KMB mobile app, it may 12 show it is arriving in 10 or 15 minutes but that is 13 totally inaccurate. So far many have complained about 14 the mobile app to say that the ETA is totally 15 inaccurate.</p> <p>16 Counsel just mentioned the paragraph, Mr Yu Chi Wing 17 just said, the Transport Department is biased towards 18 the KMB. Now they cannot address this problem for so 19 many years, so TD is just defending KMB or speaking up 20 for KMB. That's how we see it.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: The third proposal you made is at page 839. 22 At the fourth bullet, and in Chinese at page 833, the 23 second bullet. You proposed a penalty mechanism for bus 24 companies similar to the MTR mechanism. In other words, 25 a fine will be imposed when an accident occurred. And</p>	<p>1 views of district councillors. We have, as some others 2 members said, we have made suggestions by saying that 3 there should be increase of service, of routes, bus 4 companies did not respond to us actively, because we are 5 not effectively their boss, we don't have the say when 6 it comes to franchise renewal. The Transport 7 Department, or the government, do they effectively 8 monitor whether there are lost trips, and what is the 9 service level of bus companies? We think that the 10 Transport Department has not done their job.</p> <p>11 For 64K from Yuen Long to Tai Po via Lam Tsuen there 12 have been a number of problems. They remain unresolved. 13 Bus services from Tai Po to Hong Kong Island, it seems 14 that bus service cannot be increased. We think that it 15 is because there is no monitoring mechanism. We do 16 think that by introducing a penalty mechanism we will be 17 able to, hopefully, reduce lost trips and the occurrence 18 of incidents.</p> <p>19 We can't stop bus companies from renewing their 20 franchise or focusing on making a profit. With the 21 penalty mechanism we can urge bus companies to do 22 better.</p> <p>23 It seems that we don't have any measures to monitor 24 bus companies. With a penalty mechanism, members would 25 be able to find a way to penalise bus companies should</p>
<p>Page 70</p> <p>1 I would like to explore this.</p> <p>2 Why do you think it would be suitable in the 3 franchise operations environment in Hong Kong?</p> <p>4 MS WONG PIK KUI: It was proposed by a number of members. 5 Perhaps I will defer to Mr Yam Kai Bong. Thank you.</p> <p>6 MR YAM KAI BONG: A number of members were of the view that 7 when it comes to the renewal of franchise and a penalty 8 system, there can be a mechanism put in place. We see 9 that for the MTRCL where there are service delays as 10 a result of incidents, they will be fined.</p> <p>11 However, when it comes to bus companies, providing 12 substandard service or where there are lost trips, it 13 seems that there are no penalties.</p> <p>14 We can't see why the government would continue to 15 renew the franchise, say for example, for the KMB about 16 three years ago or so when the franchise was renewed, it 17 wasn't discussed at the district council.</p> <p>18 For a franchised bus service using KMB as an 19 example, the service coverage is Kowloon and New 20 Territories. Members of the public and district 21 councillors should be given an opportunity to speak, but 22 I can say with certainty that district council has not 23 been consulted when it comes to whether to renew the 24 franchise of KMB.</p> <p>25 In this case, KMB doesn't have to pay attention to</p>	<p>Page 72</p> <p>1 their bus service fall below standard.</p> <p>2 MS WONG PIK KUI: I would like to say something as the 3 chairperson. Franchise of bus companies in Hong Kong, 4 once they have the franchise, the government tasks the 5 Transport Department to monitor their service and to 6 work with them in the formulation of bus routes.</p> <p>7 We think that the Transport Department has not 8 devoted enough manpower to do this. In Tai Po we have 9 over 100 routes. We have the Transport Department with 10 us in meetings, only one representative overseeing the 11 entire Tai Po area. We have over 100 bus routes, many 12 buses and many drivers, and even more passengers.</p> <p>13 We don't speak too often about this in district 14 council meetings, but it is an important livelihood 15 issue, because when you go to do your shopping, to go to 16 hospital, to go to work, you always have to take a bus.</p> <p>17 Airport bus service is very important to us as well. 18 We have A47X from Tai Po. I use this as an example. 19 There are lost trips. However the Transport Department, 20 especially the higher echelons of the department don't 21 even know that the bus driver has fallen ill so the bus 22 remains at the terminus. If there is no one there to 23 drive the bus, passengers will have to wait for three 24 more buses to go to the airport.</p> <p>25 I'm talking about between 6 and 7 am.</p>

Page 73	Page 75
<p>1 We couldn't find anyone when we make a phone call to 2 try to get the problem solved. 3 And that's when people had to go to the airport. 4 We visited Hangzhou, we really appreciated the 5 supervision of Hangzhou, because there is one single 6 centre with many computers. You only have to key in 7 a bus route number when information such as number of 8 passengers waiting for a bus and all the different 9 situations will be displayed by these computers. When 10 it comes to Hong Kong, there is nothing like that. We 11 have not progressed at all. Thank you. 12 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can I move on to the fourth proposal, 13 because it is also on the same page, 839, the second 14 bullet from the bottom, that the district council as 15 a stakeholder of bus route planning and services has 16 a close relationship with bus companies. And it is 17 proposed that a marking scheme be added during the 18 process of renewal with bus companies to allow district 19 council to rate and to provide comments on the 20 performance of bus companies. 21 I believe that's the fourth proposal that your 22 counsel made. 23 MS WONG PIK KUI: I would defer to Mr Yam Kai Bong. 24 MR YAM KAI BONG: Thank you. 25 As I said previously, regarding franchise renewal,</p>	<p>1 the public. We are returned by voters, we speak for 2 them in council meetings. But if our views are not 3 addressed properly by departments and companies, then 4 there is nothing we can do. 5 We think that if district council can be involved in 6 the scoring system in franchise renewal, then bus 7 companies would definitely listen to our views. 8 We think that our views can be incorporated in your 9 review of bus service. Thank you. 10 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. 11 Thank you ladies and gentlemen, I have completed my 12 questioning. 13 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 14 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Thank you, Chairman. I want to follow up 15 a comment, Ms Wong, you made earlier, about you have 16 heard comments that Tai Po Road may not be suitable for 17 double-decker buses. Would you agree to that statement? 18 MS WONG PIK KUI: Well, the views I have received came from 19 one of the injured persons. It was a bus driver. 20 I spoke to that person. They said that there was Tai Po 21 Road before Tolo Highway. The route number is called 22 872 because there was a bus route called 72. Later, 23 there was the racecourse, this route will be used to 24 take residents from Tai Po to the racecourse, and the 25 bus route was therefore called 872. Later, the KMB</p>
Page 74	Page 76
<p>1 it seems that the district council doesn't really have 2 the power to make decisions. We hope that we can 3 increase the say of district council as a stakeholder. 4 Regarding franchise renewal, they would just come to the 5 district council for a brief consultation, but if 6 district council can make comments on, say, poor service 7 of the bus company and the say of the district council 8 would affect the government's decision when it comes to 9 franchise, it would be good. 10 As mentioned in the review committee regarding the 11 Tai Po accident, district councillors have made a lot of 12 comments. 13 District council is both passive and active. When 14 it comes to bus service we have a working group in the 15 Tai Po District Council. We have made a lot of 16 suggestions. But how much have the bus company and the 17 Transport Department responded to them? If there is 18 a scoring system, if we can make comments, and these 19 comments would influence the government's decision on 20 franchise renewal, then I think the bus company would 21 listen and respond to views expressed by district 22 councillors. 23 I would like to draw the attention of the 24 Independent Review Committee that district councillors' 25 views are not groundless. We have collected views from</p>	<p>1 started to turn single-decker buses to double-decker 2 buses. 3 The buses that KMB procured would be used for route 4 872. I said that we only asked for residents to be 5 taken to the racecourse, and there is the Tolo Highway. 6 If it is a point-to-point service then it is simple. 7 You can use the other way. So that was the 872X. Do we 8 still need to use double-decker buses for route 872? 9 Are there so many passengers, over 100 of them? If that 10 is the case, you can increase the service by using three 11 single-decker buses. 12 CHAIRMAN: That's on the assumption that you have enough bus 13 drivers to drive the buses. 14 Do you have any questions? 15 MEMBER LO: I just have one clarification question, Ms Wong. 16 You mentioned about when the speed limit was reduced 17 from 70 to 50 certain drivers of coaches expressed some 18 concern. Is their concern that lowering the speed limit 19 does not deliver, or what is their concern? 20 MS MAGGIE WONG: They said to me that at the highest point, 21 well, they have to use 70 kilometres per hour because 22 when the bus is fully loaded they couldn't effectively 23 control the bus at 50k per hour. However, I think that 24 for this section of the road, safety is paramount. So 25 we asked for the speed limit to be reduced to 50.</p>

Page 77	Page 79
<p>1 That's the view they expressed to us in this regard.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: Well, it remains for the committee to thank you,</p> <p>3 Ms Wong, and gentlemen, for assisting us with your</p> <p>4 evidence. The committee is interested in receiving the</p> <p>5 views of the district councils, which is why we have</p> <p>6 invited you and two other district councils. We are</p> <p>7 charged to make recommendations in relation to safety of</p> <p>8 buses, to enhance bus safety, not wider issues.</p> <p>9 But it is in that context that we have been most</p> <p>10 interested to receive your evidence, Mr Chan, about the</p> <p>11 concerns that you have expressed specifically about this</p> <p>12 very stretch of road in terms of the speed limit and the</p> <p>13 need for cameras. And we thank you for your evidence on</p> <p>14 that subject.</p> <p>15 We are now going to adjourn the proceedings for</p> <p>16 20 minutes.</p> <p>17 Dr Lau.</p> <p>18 DR LAU CHEE SING: (In English) Will we be given a chance to</p> <p>19 express some other issues regarding the bus service?</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: If they relate to safety, please do.</p> <p>21 DR LAU CHEE SING: (In English) Should be related to safety.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: Yes.</p> <p>23 DR LAU CHEE SING: (In English) After the adjournment?</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: Well, we have already been under way for</p> <p>25 2.5 hours. But how long do you expect to take? Because</p>	<p>1 routes, there will be tremendous pressure. They asked</p> <p>2 for a chance to familiarise themselves with the route</p> <p>3 before they are deployed. That is something about staff</p> <p>4 training.</p> <p>5 If they can be given an opportunity to familiarise</p> <p>6 the route before they drive a bus load of passengers, it</p> <p>7 would be better.</p> <p>8 And if they are deployed to drive new buses, they</p> <p>9 should be given a chance to familiarise themselves with</p> <p>10 the new bus. That's the view they expressed to me.</p> <p>11 There is a third point. It is about bus schedules.</p> <p>12 There is a pre-set time. Bus drivers think that the</p> <p>13 time is not enough, and if that is the case, they will</p> <p>14 have to speed up to catch up. And as a result, there</p> <p>15 may be dangerous situations.</p> <p>16 These are the three points I would like to say.</p> <p>17 And I hope the committee can take note of these</p> <p>18 issues and you could follow up with bus driver</p> <p>19 associations and other related associations, and hear</p> <p>20 their views as well, thank you.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Yes. One matter on that last point you raise,</p> <p>22 Dr Lau, this is a generic complaint that we have heard</p> <p>23 about, that journey times are too short. But what we</p> <p>24 need is evidence that the times are too short. So if</p> <p>25 your bus driver/captains can communicate with us with</p>
<p>Page 78</p> <p>1 we have given you an opportunity to give us written</p> <p>2 submissions.</p> <p>3 DR LAU CHEE SING: (In English) In that case let me express</p> <p>4 some views which I received regarding the bus drivers'</p> <p>5 view.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: Yes, please do.</p> <p>7 DR LAU CHEE SING: (In English) I will express it in</p> <p>8 Chinese.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Yes, of course.</p> <p>10 DR LAU CHEE SING: Chairman, it is unfortunate that we have</p> <p>11 had the Tai Po Mei accident. People have the impression</p> <p>12 that it was the bus driver who has committed careless</p> <p>13 driving. When it comes to franchise bus service, bus</p> <p>14 drivers play a very important role. As my colleagues</p> <p>15 said, there are over 100 passengers on board, so the</p> <p>16 professional knowledge as well as the driving attitude</p> <p>17 of drivers are very important.</p> <p>18 There are some friends of mine who are bus drivers,</p> <p>19 they expressed my views to me when they knew I was going</p> <p>20 to come here.</p> <p>21 They said that it is about management and staff</p> <p>22 deployment of bus companies. They don't have sufficient</p> <p>23 experience. That may be the reason.</p> <p>24 They said that when it comes to deployment of bus</p> <p>25 captains, if bus captains are deployed to unfamiliar</p>	<p>Page 80</p> <p>1 specific examples that the route from A to B is set at</p> <p>2 a one-hour journey time, but in fact can it take more</p> <p>3 than that, that's the kind of information the committee</p> <p>4 needs.</p> <p>5 DR LAU CHEE SING: The honourable judge, in my constituency,</p> <p>6 75K, since I have been in office, the bus travel time</p> <p>7 has been adjusted. The timetable was roughly 35 minutes</p> <p>8 from Tai Mei Tuk to Tai Po, and they felt that is too</p> <p>9 rushed. So ultimately it was adjusted to 45/50 minutes,</p> <p>10 it allowed the bus drivers during the journey they would</p> <p>11 not feel that it was an unreasonable demand for bus</p> <p>12 drivers. So if you ask KMB for the timetable, that is</p> <p>13 a fact. So they had made some adjustments.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: Yes, it is really the ones that remain a problem</p> <p>15 that, if somebody gives us evidence about that, then we</p> <p>16 can take that up.</p> <p>17 DR LAU CHEE SING: Do you mean I need to provide this</p> <p>18 evidence?</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Somebody needs to give us evidence. We have</p> <p>20 anecdotal or generic assertions that are made that</p> <p>21 journey times are too short, bus drivers therefore speed</p> <p>22 up, they are worried about losing rest time, but we need</p> <p>23 to have evidence to support that, not just sweeping</p> <p>24 statements.</p> <p>25 DR LAU CHEE SING: Okay.</p>

Page 81	Page 83
<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>2 MR YAM KAI BONG: I would also like to supplement. The</p> <p>3 request for evidence, well, if you look at the bus</p> <p>4 companies, the average travel time, well, I recall there</p> <p>5 was a statistic, but I cannot recall where it originated</p> <p>6 from. In the last 10-plus years, the average travel</p> <p>7 time has been slower and slower. So the bus speed is</p> <p>8 slower, and have the companies deployed sufficient</p> <p>9 drivers to maintain the service? Because when vehicle</p> <p>10 speed is slowing down that will lead to longer travel</p> <p>11 time, and if you maintain the frequency of service, then</p> <p>12 you need to add drivers and add to the fleet.</p> <p>13 So that is in direct proportion, so as councillors</p> <p>14 we feel that you need to maintain the service, you</p> <p>15 cannot have loss of service, but then the road is more</p> <p>16 and more congested, we have more and more vehicles on</p> <p>17 this road. So TD, did they communicate with the bus</p> <p>18 company, to deploy more staff, deploy more resources?</p> <p>19 That is something that needs to be looked into.</p> <p>20 There are statistics, but I cannot recall or cannot</p> <p>21 confirm the source, the average bus speed has been</p> <p>22 slower and slower. So district council has asked for</p> <p>23 special bus routes, and other measures, so we could look</p> <p>24 into that. Thank you.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Mr Chan.</p>	<p>1 that are waiting to give evidence, that we will hear</p> <p>2 their evidence soon, but we are going to take</p> <p>3 a 20-minute break now. Thank you.</p> <p>4 (11.46 am)</p> <p>5 (A short break)</p> <p>6 (12.05 pm)</p> <p>7 EVIDENCE FROM SHA TIN DISTRICT COUNCIL: MICHAEL YUNG</p> <p>8 (Given in Cantonese; transcription of the simultaneous</p> <p>9 interpretation)</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: We will now move to receive evidence from Mr Yung</p> <p>11 on behalf of the Sha Tin District Council.</p> <p>12 Thank you for accepting our invitation on behalf of</p> <p>13 the council to attend to give evidence, and I will ask</p> <p>14 Ms Wong to begin by asking you questions.</p> <p>15 Examination by MS MAGGIE WONG</p> <p>16 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you for coming, Mr Yung.</p> <p>17 I have a few areas of questions for you. First of</p> <p>18 all, may I take you to your discussion paper dated</p> <p>19 8 January 2013. Page 631 in Chinese and 637 in English.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Which bundle?</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: DC bundle 2.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>23 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Yung, if you take time to read this</p> <p>24 page, this is a question raised by I believe district</p> <p>25 councillor Ms Yeung Sin Hung, and she raised questions</p>
Page 82	Page 84
<p>1 MR CHAN CHO LEUNG: (No interpreted channel recorded) --</p> <p>2 when they look at signs that is insufficient, so as</p> <p>3 a motorist we feel if there is a palpable sensation, if</p> <p>4 you can feel a speed bump you can slow down. So I hope</p> <p>5 for village roads that are going downhill that there can</p> <p>6 be some speed bumps.</p> <p>7 Another suggestion is that in villages downhill</p> <p>8 areas where there are bus stops, there should be</p> <p>9 barriers. These barriers are very important. For</p> <p>10 example, on the last occasion we have a wishing tree,</p> <p>11 there is a bus stop, and I asked for a few years to add</p> <p>12 a barrier railing, and they had neglected us. But that</p> <p>13 is necessary because it is going around a bend and it is</p> <p>14 going downhill, so it is very treacherous for</p> <p>15 a double-decker bus if it is a full of passengers, and</p> <p>16 if they skip the bus stop they are travelling at even</p> <p>17 higher speeds. So passengers waiting at the bus stop</p> <p>18 feel terrified. So we need some barriers.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>20 If that concludes the various views that you wish to</p> <p>21 give us, and we have made our invitation, Dr Lau, the</p> <p>22 committee is open to receiving further information that</p> <p>23 addresses the topic that you have raised.</p> <p>24 But it remains for us to thank you very much for</p> <p>25 attending today to assist us, and to encourage those</p>	<p>1 on behalf of the Sha Tin District Council relating to</p> <p>2 the lost trips and working hours of bus captains.</p> <p>3 She said that she received first complaints from</p> <p>4 residents that there was a situation of lost trips of</p> <p>5 buses during peak hours; and secondly, she observed that</p> <p>6 some bus captains had no rest time between too long</p> <p>7 a bus trip.</p> <p>8 Can you tell us something about this complaints,</p> <p>9 Mr Yung?</p> <p>10 MR MICHAEL YUNG: Let me first of all say this. Ms Yeung</p> <p>11 Sin Hung is a former district councillor. Now I would</p> <p>12 like refer to the minutes of the meeting, the Chinese</p> <p>13 version, because the Chinese version is the one</p> <p>14 confirmed by members. As for the English version, it is</p> <p>15 just for summary reference.</p> <p>16 The government counsel would like us to talk about</p> <p>17 rest hours, and lost trips, right?</p> <p>18 Ms Yeung Sin Hung referred to E42, this is Long Win</p> <p>19 bus route. My understanding that Long Win operates</p> <p>20 franchised bus services to the airport.</p> <p>21 So Long Win, compared to its parent company KMB, is</p> <p>22 much smaller in scale. Therefore, it has fewer bus</p> <p>23 captains, and so if bus captains are absent from work</p> <p>24 then it is easy to have lost trips.</p> <p>25 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, I am more concerned about the problem</p>

Page 85	Page 87
<p>1 about the journey time being too short, and then the 2 driver have to speed up and to make up the time, for 3 example there may be traffic jam and then there may be 4 other problems on the road. And by the time he got to 5 the station, it is unrealistic the journey time, let's 6 put it this way. And then he has to make up the time, 7 and by doing that he has to speed up. I'm concerned 8 about this issue. Maybe you can enlighten us. During 9 your time as district councillor have you received 10 complaints in that regard?</p> <p>11 MR MICHAEL YUNG: Now, the journey time you mentioned, 12 perhaps I could put it this way. I understand that 13 during different times of the day, let's say the morning 14 peak hours, the morning non-peak hours, the evening peak 15 hours, and the evening non-peak hours, in theory there 16 are different bus schedules or there are -- there is a 17 different journey time rather, on that basis they would 18 compile a schedule. So it is possible that one driver 19 may use one or more than one vehicle to go on the same 20 route. So they could achieve the standard schedules on 21 the bus schedule.</p> <p>22 Now there is a system. They call it, you know, 23 hopping planes, that's the jargon bus drivers use. 24 Let's say bus captain takes the E42 route primarily, but 25 then, say, at Ma On Shan there is another route, A41P,</p>	<p>1 bus stop officer on duty would decide on that, or there 2 is a rostering system from the bus company and then the 3 bus captain would be told from where to start his 4 service.</p> <p>5 MS MAGGIE WONG: And on this page, there is another issue 6 that touches upon the long working hours of bus 7 captains, and when the Transport Department in 8 September 2017 reviewed the guidelines, did they consult 9 your district council as to those guidelines, as to the 10 proposed revision of those guidelines?</p> <p>11 MR MICHAEL YUNG: From my recollection, I am the deputy 12 chairman of the transport and traffic committee of the 13 Sha Tin District Council. Of course I have no power to 14 decide on the agenda of our meetings, but from what 15 I recollect, since 2016, that is for this term of the 16 district council, of all the TCC meetings we have had, 17 I don't recall having discussed the Guideline of Bus 18 Captain Working Hours, so our views have not been 19 sought.</p> <p>20 MS MAGGIE WONG: And what was your district council's 21 opinion on these guidelines?</p> <p>22 MR MICHAEL YUNG: Since we have not had a discussion, as in 23 a formal discussion, there is no formal records. If you 24 ask me personally, I believe the working hours of bus 25 captains are on the long side.</p>
Page 86	Page 88
<p>1 it goes from Wu Kai Sha to the airport, ETC, that is the 2 transport centre of the airport. So sometimes they may 3 need buses from the E42 route to drive on the A41P 4 route, and if there should be problems with the A41P 5 route, that means the E42 routes would also suffer at 6 the same time.</p> <p>7 There could be two scenarios. One, for this reason, 8 during the highway section bus drivers may have to make 9 up for the lost time. But I understand there is a limit 10 on bus speed. So when it is approaching 70 kilometres 11 per hour there should be a speed limiter to prevent the 12 bus from going any faster, but on other sections along 13 the route, or on road sections where the speed limit is 14 lower than 70, if the buses go faster we cannot control 15 that.</p> <p>16 That's the first scenario.</p> <p>17 Another case is, say, if they couldn't catch up with 18 the lost time, then it is possible that for the next bus 19 service there is a delay, or they need to take special 20 measures to make up for part of the trips. Let's say 21 instead of starting from the airport, maybe the bus 22 service would start midway along the route to make up 23 from the journey time.</p> <p>24 So it depends how much time is lost when the bus 25 arrives at the terminus. My understanding is that the</p>	<p>1 Let's say for security guard, the longest working 2 hours are 12 hours, and as some colleagues from the Tai 3 Po District Council said just now, we only have 24 hours 4 in a day. If the working hours are longer than 5 12 hours, that means the rest time and time for other 6 activities would be reduced. Let's not forget, for 7 colleagues of bus companies, they have to start early in 8 the morning, and finish late at night, and there may not 9 be a convenient mode of transport for them to go between 10 their place of work and their home. So if you take out 11 the travels hours as well, do they really have eight 12 hours of rest a day? That remains a question mark.</p> <p>13 So if you ask me personally, I believe a maximum of 14 14 working hours for someone who has to look after road 15 safety as well as being responsible for the safety of 16 passengers on board, then the hours are far too long.</p> <p>17 MS MAGGIE WONG: The reason I'm asking is because if you 18 look at your district council's minutes, TT paper 19 23/2017, Chinese at page 709 to 710, English at bundle 20 DC-2, page 714 to 715. It is a question from Mr Chiu 21 Man Leong, in relation to the bus accident.</p> <p>22 And the comments from Mr Chiu was that the 23 guidelines in terms of the working hours are too long, 24 and the drivers do not have enough time for rest. He 25 expected the Transport Department, and bus company to</p>

Page 89	Page 91
<p>1 make a review so as to reduce the maximum working hours 2 of drivers to 10 hours. 3 So -- 4 CHAIRMAN: What is the date of this meeting? 5 MS MAGGIE WONG: Chairman, I believe this date of the 6 meeting is. 7 MR MICHAEL YUNG: (In English) March 8th, 2017. 8 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 9 MS MAGGIE WONG: So it appears that your council has made 10 certain position on the working hours. Did you consult 11 trade union about the maximum number of working hours? 12 MR MICHAEL YUNG: I have not consulted the trade unions or 13 what would be the suitable working hours. But as 14 a passenger, or as someone from the local community -- 15 now I have been in contact with some of our residents, 16 they are bus drivers as well. In general, they start 17 the day early and finish late. Let's say we take the 18 morning shifts. Now my constituency is Tai Shui Hang, 19 Fu On Garden. The nearest bus depot is in Sha Tin, Yuen 20 Shun circuit, opposite Yu Chui Court. The journey time 21 is about 15 minutes. 22 Now, usually, bus captains will have to take their 23 company coach at around 4-something in the morning, and 24 then they arrive at the bus depot at about 5-something 25 in the morning to report to duty. And then they would</p>	<p>1 we can look into that. 2 In relation to work hours, I know that there is 3 a dilemma. Tai Po District Councillors have talked 4 about work hours and the transportation, or traffic 5 pattern of the New Territories. In the morning you will 6 find a lot of people travelling from the New Territories 7 to urban areas, for example Kwun Tong, Wanchai or Chai 8 Wan. There needs to be really frequent bus services to 9 take passengers to work. However, these buses will have 10 to return to do the next trip. But the return trip is 11 not as frequent. When it comes to planning the working 12 schedule for bus drivers, they would require a lot of 13 people to drive buses. 14 However, during non-peak hours they don't need that 15 many people. 16 Then later in the evening peak they will need a lot 17 of people to drive buses to take passengers from urban 18 areas back to their own homes. So the actual driving 19 hours may not be as long as 10 hours. But the work 20 hours, that is the time on standby and the time on 21 driving duties, can be as long as 10 to 14 hours. 22 Without a proper place for them to rest, bus captains 23 can only find a place to rest in shopping malls, or stay 24 in a rest kiosk cramming up with other bus drivers 25 trying to rest. I do think that bus companies should</p>
Page 90	Page 92
<p>1 take their bus or they go on some other buses, and then 2 get to the point where they would pick up their bus. In 3 between, actually, for the shifts arranged, it could be 4 about them starting off only at 6 or 7 am in the peak 5 hours. 6 So in between there is no way they could take 7 a rest, because at the bus depot there may not be an 8 ideal environment for them to take a rest. That's the 9 first point. 10 There is also this situation. In order to set out 11 punctually, they would have to drive the bus to 12 a relevant terminus, or substation. There may not be 13 a staff rest kiosk for them to rest inside. So they 14 will have to stay in the bus to rest. 15 Under the requirement by the Environmental 16 Protection Department to turn off your engine when the 17 vehicle is idling, that means bus drivers cannot start 18 the engine to keep the air conditioning working. 19 So they will have to be stuck in a very close and 20 stuffy environment when they are waiting to start their 21 driving duties. So bus drivers don't have a place to 22 rest, and they can't properly rest. That would result 23 in a drop of their driving performance. So if you ask 24 me whether there should be more rest kiosks or a place 25 to rest before they start their driving duty. I think</p>	<p>1 provide suitable rest facilities for bus drivers to take 2 on special shifts. 3 CHAIRMAN: Can you identify a place that does not have 4 a proper rest facility? 5 MR MICHAEL YUNG: Perhaps I can do it this way. There are 6 not many places where there is rest kiosk for staff 7 members. In my constituency, at one point, bus 8 companies asked us for our views about increase of rest 9 facilities. It was about six months or nine months ago. 10 Well, these staff rest kiosk is not just to partition an 11 area. They will have to connect water supplies, 12 electricity -- 13 CHAIRMAN: Mr Yung -- 14 MR MICHAEL YUNG: If you ask me -- 15 CHAIRMAN: We are familiar with what the problems are, 16 because we have received a lot of information about the 17 difficulties in constructing these kiosks: water, 18 sewage, electricity. Just give us an example of a place 19 and we will go and visit it. 20 MR MICHAEL YUNG: For large terminus, say for example New 21 Town Plaza, Sha Tin train station. There are no 22 large-scale rest kiosk. So you can -- 23 CHAIRMAN: Sha Tin train station? 24 MR MICHAEL YUNG: Sha Tin PTI under New Town Plaza is the 25 public transport interchange, and also Sha Tin train</p>

Page 93	Page 95
<p>1 station, the rest kiosk is small, and there is only one.</p> <p>2 There is also another bus company, Citybus. They</p> <p>3 don't have a proper staff rest kiosk for bus drivers of</p> <p>4 another bus company to use.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>6 MS MAGGIE WONG: You mentioned that one of the bus companies</p> <p>7 asked your views, your council's views about the</p> <p>8 facility. Is it in writing?</p> <p>9 MR MICHAEL YUNG: At that time it was asked verbally. If</p> <p>10 I remember correctly, there was a consultation paper.</p> <p>11 It was done via the Transport Department and the</p> <p>12 district office. I think it was around March or April</p> <p>13 this year. I have to find the document, and I will give</p> <p>14 it to you after the hearing.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>16 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you.</p> <p>17 Mr Yung, I'm going to ask a few questions about</p> <p>18 accidents that happened at a few locations. First is</p> <p>19 the Lei Yue Mun accident, which I believe your council</p> <p>20 has raised a lot of questions. If I may take you to</p> <p>21 page 709 in Chinese, and in English at paragraph 133.</p> <p>22 In English at page 714.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: What's the date of this document?</p> <p>24 MS MAGGIE WONG: March. I believe it is also in March 2017.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p>	<p>1 ramp stone crack in the middle of the road and turned</p> <p>2 over towards left as it was out of control. Tens of</p> <p>3 people were thrown out of their seats ... and several</p> <p>4 people were trapped ..."</p> <p>5 Regarding this incident, they raise a number of</p> <p>6 matters.</p> <p>7 First, is the condition of passengers on scene.</p> <p>8 Second, bus company, did the company follow up? But I'm</p> <p>9 more concerned about (c), (d) and (e). The (c) issue is</p> <p>10 about the health condition of the driver, whether it</p> <p>11 conformed to standards.</p> <p>12 Second is the existing design of the pavement and</p> <p>13 ramp stone crack increase.</p> <p>14 And the third is the design of the bus running in</p> <p>15 Hong Kong, whether it guaranteed passenger safety.</p> <p>16 And the Transport Department gave a reply on the</p> <p>17 next page.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on, surely the question that is</p> <p>19 relevant to our topic is (c):</p> <p>20 "Do the government and bus companies allow drivers</p> <p>21 to work part time for long hours after their normal work</p> <p>22 as part-time bus or minicab drivers for example?"</p> <p>23 MS MAGGIE WONG: If we see the reply from the Transport</p> <p>24 Department over the page at page 707, the Transport</p> <p>25 Department did not appear to answer the second part of</p>
Page 94	Page 96
<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: Now this accident happened, and then -- one</p> <p>2 of the questions raised by Mr Chiu --</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: When was the accident?</p> <p>4 MS MAGGIE WONG: The accident was in January 2017.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>6 MS MAGGIE WONG: And Mr Chiu Man Leong raised a question</p> <p>7 regarding the accident. And one of the questions he</p> <p>8 asked is whether the companies allowed drivers to work</p> <p>9 part time for long hours after their normal work.</p> <p>10 And he quoted some examples, for example as</p> <p>11 part-time bus or minibus drivers.</p> <p>12 If we look at the reply of the Transport Department</p> <p>13 at page 707.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: Paragraph?</p> <p>15 MS MAGGIE WONG: The paragraph at the top. "Reply from the</p> <p>16 Transport Department".</p> <p>17 If I may go back, actually, it is 706, the question</p> <p>18 is at 706, and it identified the vehicle accident on</p> <p>19 14 January 2017 of number 681 bus of KMB. And the bus</p> <p>20 drove to Lei Yue Mun.</p> <p>21 MR MICHAEL YUNG: (In English) It is Citybus, not KMB.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: That's a typographical error.</p> <p>23 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, that is a typographical error.</p> <p>24 "When the bus travelled to Lei Yue Mun Road and</p> <p>25 approached the Lam Tin bus station, it bumped into the</p>	<p>1 the question that the chairman just read out. Instead,</p> <p>2 they made quite a generalised answer if we look at</p> <p>3 page 707.</p> <p>4 The second paragraph:</p> <p>5 "We have formulated guidance on the shifts of bus</p> <p>6 drivers, including working, rest and meal time. The</p> <p>7 shift arrangement of the driver involved as well as his</p> <p>8 schedule before work conforms to the requirement</p> <p>9 specified in our guidance."</p> <p>10 Et cetera.</p> <p>11 Then he did not address the question whether part</p> <p>12 time drivers can work for long hours after their normal</p> <p>13 work.</p> <p>14 In relation to this issue, did your district council</p> <p>15 follow up on the Transport Department's reply?</p> <p>16 MR MICHAEL YUNG: From my recollection, in the meeting our</p> <p>17 focus was on the traffic accident. We did not discuss</p> <p>18 in detail about part-time bus drivers are allowed to</p> <p>19 carry out driving duties for how long. As I recall,</p> <p>20 during the renewal of a franchise of bus companies, the</p> <p>21 community was very concerned about lost trips. As</p> <p>22 a result, bus companies introduced a lot of part-time</p> <p>23 bus captains to deal with the situation. There are two</p> <p>24 groups of part-time bus captains. For one, they have</p> <p>25 a job during the day and then they will drive for a few</p>

Page 97	Page 99
<p>1 hours in the evening.</p> <p>2 Administration staff of bus companies have driving</p> <p>3 licence to drive buses. That is what I know.</p> <p>4 If the Transport Department only focused on the</p> <p>5 driving hours then they would always meet the</p> <p>6 requirement. Because they don't take into account the</p> <p>7 working hours of their main job. But if there are ways</p> <p>8 for bus companies to record their own driving duties, if</p> <p>9 the part-time bus captains have a principal employment,</p> <p>10 you won't be able to find out whether the principal</p> <p>11 employer allows these people to take up driving duties</p> <p>12 after work. I don't know whether these part-time bus</p> <p>13 captains are required to report the exact number of</p> <p>14 hours they work in their principal employment.</p> <p>15 So it is very difficult for bus companies to know</p> <p>16 whether these part-time bus captains are working</p> <p>17 exceedingly long hours.</p> <p>18 The guidelines they have don't target part time</p> <p>19 duties, and the problem is that bus companies do employ</p> <p>20 part-time bus captains, so I think it is a matter of</p> <p>21 chicken and egg.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: The problem is if the bus companies don't ask the</p> <p>23 questions about what their part-time drivers do in the</p> <p>24 rest of their day?</p> <p>25 MR MICHAEL YUNG: (In English) Yes.</p>	<p>1 you did so orally, rather than in writing?</p> <p>2 MR MICHAEL YUNG: (In English) Orally. Orally during</p> <p>3 meeting.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>5 MS MAGGIE WONG: The second issue identified at page 706 is</p> <p>6 the design of the pavement and ramp stone crack</p> <p>7 increased the probability of serious bus accidents,</p> <p>8 that's (d), page 706 at (d). And the reply from the</p> <p>9 Highways Department and Transport Department is at</p> <p>10 page 707. It states, if we start from line 2:</p> <p>11 "The open end of the fence railing uses an inclined</p> <p>12 stone crack, which can reduce injury to drivers and</p> <p>13 passengers when any vehicle runs into the fence railing,</p> <p>14 if it is out of control. The Highways Department,</p> <p>15 together with the Transport Department, continue to</p> <p>16 inspect the protection facilities on the existing public</p> <p>17 roads and install appropriate protection facilities on</p> <p>18 new and existing public roads according to the actual</p> <p>19 conditions and needs."</p> <p>20 It states that the Transport Department and the</p> <p>21 Highways Department will continue to inspect these</p> <p>22 protection facilities. Did you follow that up with the</p> <p>23 Transport Department?</p> <p>24 MR MICHAEL YUNG: In the minute, paragraph 135(a) and (b),</p> <p>25 it was mentioned at that time that the design of the</p>
Page 98	Page 100
<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: Given this is a concern, did your council</p> <p>2 raise these matters with the Transport Department as to</p> <p>3 the monitoring mechanism?</p> <p>4 MR MICHAEL YUNG: Of course district councillors expressed</p> <p>5 the view. After the meeting we asked for guidelines on</p> <p>6 working schedules, and that guideline does not cover</p> <p>7 part-time bus captains and that is the focus.</p> <p>8 We tried to follow up on this matter but they never</p> <p>9 dealt with it, so there are no ways for us to pin them</p> <p>10 down to get them to resolve it.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: Did you do so in writing?</p> <p>12 MR MICHAEL YUNG: In the meeting, apart from moving</p> <p>13 a motion -- well, if there was a motion, then the</p> <p>14 department will be asked to follow up. As to whether</p> <p>15 other councillors have been chasing for a reply, I don't</p> <p>16 know, so I don't have the information as to whether it</p> <p>17 was done in writing. I believe that district</p> <p>18 councillors of different parties have mentioned this in</p> <p>19 unofficial meetings of the Transport Department, and</p> <p>20 I have raised this issue as well. I've raised it with</p> <p>21 Citybus, First Bus, KMB and the Transport Department.</p> <p>22 And as to whether bus companies have actually</p> <p>23 implemented anything to address the problem, I think it</p> <p>24 is for bus companies to answer.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: When you raised these matters with those parties,</p>	<p>1 road does not allow that to happen. We have been asking</p> <p>2 them to do something that is similar to a U-shape, so</p> <p>3 when there is a crash the vehicle will be made to go</p> <p>4 a certain way. I know that on highways this design</p> <p>5 would be adapted. If I remember correctly, in the part</p> <p>6 of Tai Po District Council, there is this design in the</p> <p>7 new bus stop in Tai Po. On that day, the Transport</p> <p>8 Department told us that it could only happen on</p> <p>9 highways.</p> <p>10 If that is the case, we then understand that from</p> <p>11 Kwun Tong bypass there was the speed limit of</p> <p>12 70 kilometres per hour. That would be suitable to have</p> <p>13 this kind of protective facilities installed, because</p> <p>14 the design is to absorb the impact.</p> <p>15 So what we are saying is these locations should be</p> <p>16 reviewed as soon as possible. I recall there was</p> <p>17 an engineering diagram just now, there was a location</p> <p>18 where it was installed.</p> <p>19 MS MAGGIE WONG: If we continue, I'm moving on -- I think</p> <p>20 you may be referring to TD bundle, bundle 5, page 1617.</p> <p>21 If we enlarge the --</p> <p>22 MR MICHAEL YUNG: That is correct. We are talking about the</p> <p>23 crash barrier. In my understanding, that location is</p> <p>24 suitable for installing this type of equipment. It is</p> <p>25 not a highway, and I should put it this way. The TD</p>

Page 101	Page 103
<p>1 highway design is based on transport design and planning 2 manual. They have different paragraphs describing 3 highway design. So if you ask me whether the initial 4 design was up to standard, that I can reserve for the 5 experts to comment on, but if we are talking about 6 access roads leading up to the highways, these crash 7 barriers were not installed. Now, if a barrier is 8 installed and if a car or vehicle crashes into it, it 9 will be stuck in that material, and they won't create 10 a serious accident.</p> <p>11 MS MAGGIE WONG: Is that what you are referencing in 12 paragraph 135(a) and (b)?</p> <p>13 MR MICHAEL YUNG: Yes.</p> <p>14 MS MAGGIE WONG: And the Transport Department, I believe is 15 set out at paragraph 138. English is at page 717: 16 "Mr Fung Ka Chun, regional engineer of ... Highways 17 Department ... indicated in his reply that the Lei Yue 18 Mun Road is designed as ramp type, aiming to reduce the 19 injury to drivers and passengers when any vehicle bumps 20 into the fence as it is out of control." 21 Then on, over the page, 718: 22 "On the highways with maximum vehicle speed of 23 70 [kilometres per hour], the Highways Department also 24 installs organ type safety fences. As the Lei Yue Mun 25 Road does not satisfy the conditions, the existing stone</p>	<p>1 situation.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: I will now move on to the A Kung Kok 3 Street, which relates to another accident. The minutes 4 or the discussion paper is dated 8 May 2018, entitled 5 "TT paper number 26/2012". It is at page 610, in 6 English, and Chinese at page 607.</p> <p>7 In the second paragraph, I believe it is Mr Yeung 8 Cheung Li in the Traffic and Transport Committee of Sha 9 Tin District Council, raised questions about the safety 10 at A Kung Kok Street. In the second paragraph he 11 pointed out that there had been many serious traffic 12 accidents taken place at A Kung Kok Street.</p> <p>13 Do you know about all the complaints or these 14 accidents mentioned by Mr Yeung?</p> <p>15 MR MICHAEL YUNG: Mr Yeung Cheung Li was an ex Sha Tin 16 councillor. He did not raise specific questions 17 regarding a specific accident, but I recall that there 18 was a traffic incident that had a lot of fatalities and 19 injured people. I recall that in the morning an 89D bus 20 heading towards Kowloon, they couldn't brake in time 21 rammed into either a 85K or 86K bus, and it led to some 22 30-plus people being injured. And at the time, after 23 the accident, I had visited the site and I had seen the 24 injured people, and I also helped with the claims, the 25 injury claims of the victims.</p>
Page 102	Page 104
<p>1 crack design conforms to relevant standards. The 2 Highways Department will improve the facilities here 3 according to actual conditions." 4 In other words, they refused your suggestion. Is 5 that correct?</p> <p>6 MR MICHAEL YUNG: Correct. But take note, you said in 7 bundle TD-5. The original speed limit was 70, and 8 because of this traffic accident the speed has now been 9 reduced to 50. So that means we have one country, two 10 systems.</p> <p>11 So highways, when they have a 70 kilometres 12 standard, they had not reviewed this location and 13 whether it was suitable to install a crash barrier. So 14 the committee in our special meeting, we had requested 15 all the government departments regarding their previous 16 responses, they should have reviewed those responses and 17 see whether a new response was appropriate. In my 18 understanding, the Highways Department did not provide 19 an updated response.</p> <p>20 In other words, essentially I can only say that TD 21 and highways they did not look at it from 22 a comprehensive safety perspective. They only dealt 23 with the issues as they arose. They did not implement 24 further designs to ensure motorist safety and pedestrian 25 safety, and I expressed my regret regarding this</p>	<p>1 So that was a bus accident, and subsequently there 2 were some other accidents relating to minibuses, and 3 there were also some fatalities. I think Mr Yeung's 4 question about fatalities and injuries was not just 5 limited to buses. There were other accidents in that 6 question. So that is my understanding.</p> <p>7 Second, why A Kung Kok Street is accident prone, 8 that is because A Kung Kok Street is a dual lane dual 9 carriageway road, and from my constituency, Fu On 10 Gardens to the interchange, there are two crossing lanes 11 and one traffic light, if I remember correctly, and 12 there are also three T-sections to Mui Tsz Lam Road, Ah 13 Kung Kok Fisherman Village, and to Sha Tin Hospital. 14 There is also another road heading up to A Kung Kok 15 Street. So there are four branches of the road, and the 16 design of all four sections have a yielding -- has 17 priority junctions, it is not a signalled junction, 18 and this yielding design has to accommodate low traffic 19 flow. But a lot of times, the motorists, when they use 20 these sections, they are not very careful, and that 21 leads to traffic accidents.</p> <p>22 So that is one of my understandings that I have 23 regarding that situation. So aside from the morning and 24 afternoon busy hours where there are a lot of trucks and 25 lorries, there is not a lot of traffic, because we have</p>

Page 105	Page 107
<p>1 another highway, Ma On Shan highway, and that is 2 a dual-lane six-carriageway highway and they can travel 3 at 60 to 80 kilometres, so normally private vehicles 4 will not traverse that section of road. But in the 5 morning, maybe people want to avoid congestion so some 6 private vehicles will use that road. But typically, the 7 incidents, traffic incidents don't occur in the morning. 8 Usually it is smooth driving, there is no speed camera, 9 and there is only one traffic light, it is also 10 a manually controlled light where that leads to Sha Tin 11 hospital. So the motorist might not be complying with 12 the 50 kilometres speed limit. They might be going at 13 more than 50 kilometres.</p> <p>14 So it is relatively easier to have traffic accidents 15 there because of that design.</p> <p>16 MS MAGGIE WONG: If we look at page 611, there are certain 17 figures provided by the Hong Kong Police from 2007 to 18 2011.</p> <p>19 Is it within your council's knowledge, whether the 20 occurrence of the accident has increased, decreased, or 21 remained constant in the years after 2012? Did you make 22 enquiries?</p> <p>23 MR MICHAEL YUNG: (In English) No.</p> <p>24 MS MAGGIE WONG: If we look at the question raised by 25 Mr Yeung at page 610, he asked whether the Transport</p>	<p>1 And in paragraph (d), the police don't have a laser 2 gun, they will use their unmarked vehicles, and they 3 would deploy these unmarked vehicles on highways. They 4 don't deploy unmarked vehicles on local roads. But 5 after that question the police in fact did deploy more 6 laser guns to detect speed on A Kung Kok Street, and the 7 installation, if I remember correctly, was the exit of A 8 Kung Kok fisherman new village, and they would test 9 vehicle speeds for vehicles entering Ma On Shan, because 10 after Sha Tin hospital, after the traffic light, it is 11 a straight road, and motorists tend to drive at a higher 12 speed. But TD, at the yielding area, they had issued 13 a works order to widen that area, but even if the 14 yielding area is widened, because there is a hospital 15 there, there are visitors or people queuing.</p> <p>16 So even if you increase the yielding space, 17 sometimes the buses, they have to wait, or they might 18 even have to allow passengers to embark, disembark at 19 the road side. So it is not very effective.</p> <p>20 MS MAGGIE WONG: I can see at page 615 there was 21 a provisional motion passed by Mr Yeung demanding for 22 a -- paragraph 73 in Chinese, and at 618 in English, 23 paragraph 73.</p> <p>24 There was a provisional motion passed by Mr Yeung 25 demanding a comprehensive review of the road design of</p>
Page 106	Page 108
<p>1 Department have any short-term or long-term plans to 2 resolve the problems at A Kung Kok Street, and the 3 Transport Department advised four matters. And that's 4 at page 611. First, question (d). The Transport 5 Department mentioned there is no obstruction to driver's 6 line of sight, the design conforms to the present road 7 design standards.</p> <p>8 And then the third, it had been considering whether 9 to enhance the traffic control over this section.</p> <p>10 Lastly, the 16 April 2012 incident, the Transport 11 Department had reminded the bus companies to enhance the 12 training of drivers and would make further improvements 13 upon knowing the results of the police investigation.</p> <p>14 So did your council follow up with this? Or you are 15 satisfied with the answer provided -- first of all, are 16 you satisfied with the answer provided by the Transport 17 Department?</p> <p>18 MR MICHAEL YUNG: Well, on page 613 of the minutes of 19 meetings, paragraphs 67(c) and (d), I had made some 20 recommendations. So they say they want to have double 21 white line to prevent traffic violations. So in Texaco 22 Road, there was a fatal accident near the bridge, and 23 they had added these double white lines, so we thought 24 that that was very good improvement, but I recall that 25 that suggestion hasn't been taken up.</p>	<p>1 A Kung Kok street, including making the street wide and 2 installing additional speed camera. So did the 3 Transport Department respond to this request?</p> <p>4 MR MICHAEL YUNG: In paragraph 13(1) the police had stepped 5 up law enforcement. There was not any patrolling, and 6 they started to patrol, and the design of A Kung Kok 7 Street, regarding the widening of A Kung Kok Street and 8 installing speed cameras, and up until now we still 9 don't have the cameras. The widening of A Kung Kok 10 Street, next to it is the Ma On Shan road, there is 11 a divider, and that is where the Ma On Shan rail is 12 located. So by widening A Kung Kok Street we need to 13 start from Fu On all the way to Sam Mun interchange.</p> <p>14 But I think it would be difficult to identify 15 suitable locations to widen the road because widening 16 a road according to the planning standards, 3.6 to 17 3.7 metres is required to accommodate an extra traffic 18 lane. But my understanding is the pedestrian minimum 19 width is 1.5 metres so. That means, given limited 20 space, if you widen the vehicle's space, and if the 21 pedestrian space is not wide enough, then the Transport 22 Department will not proceed with the works because if 23 the pedestrian sidewalk is too narrow they cannot 24 accommodate wheelchairs, so they did not install 25 cameras, they did not widen the area, and I think the</p>

Page 109	Page 111
<p>1 widening was constrained by the space, so relatively</p> <p>2 speaking, the cameras are easier to install.</p> <p>3 MS MAGGIE WONG: I see the time.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: We will carry on.</p> <p>5 MS MAGGIE WONG: Carry on.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: I think we are moving into areas that are a long</p> <p>7 way away from making recommendations about bus safety.</p> <p>8 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, I believe there will be one or two</p> <p>9 topics, and I will complete the documentation.</p> <p>10 Mr Yung, you referred to in your minutes of the</p> <p>11 meeting, I believe it is TT paper 3/2017. If you go to</p> <p>12 page 710, Chinese.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: What is the document we are going to?</p> <p>14 MS MAGGIE WONG: This is a minutes of meeting of Sha Tin</p> <p>15 District Council. TT paper --</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: We don't need the paper number. What is the</p> <p>17 date?</p> <p>18 MS MAGGIE WONG: I think it is still March 2017.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Yes.</p> <p>20 MS MAGGIE WONG: If we look at paragraph 134(a), it raised</p> <p>21 the suggestion that bus companies should assess annually</p> <p>22 if bus captains suffer from sleep disorder.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: Sleep apnea.</p> <p>24 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, and did you follow up with that</p> <p>25 suggestion? Or did your council follow up with that</p>	<p>1 particular section is potentially dangerous, that it is</p> <p>2 a dangerous location and bend? Is it because he</p> <p>3 received complaints, or can you tell us why?</p> <p>4 MR MICHAEL YUNG: Are you asking me this? That is for that</p> <p>5 location on Tai Po Road why we consider it dangerous, is</p> <p>6 it because we have received complaints, right?</p> <p>7 Now, Mr Yiu is not here. Please give me some time</p> <p>8 to read the document.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Yes, take your time.</p> <p>10 MR MICHAEL YUNG: I believe, having read the document, the</p> <p>11 location referred to by Mr Yiu Ka Chun is -- well,</p> <p>12 because there are different locations along the Tai Po</p> <p>13 Road, and the section referred to falls within Sha Tin</p> <p>14 district, that's the Sha Tin section. I believe you are</p> <p>15 talking about question (c), the location mentioned in</p> <p>16 question (c), right? Is it question (c)?</p> <p>17 (In English) Is it question (c)?</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: I think it is, yes.</p> <p>19 MR MICHAEL YUNG: Okay, because for the entire Tai Po Road,</p> <p>20 of course there are various sections. If I recall,</p> <p>21 within Sha Tin, there is the Sha Tin section, the Sha</p> <p>22 Tin Heights section, the Piper's Hill section, and so</p> <p>23 on. And I think Mr Yiu is referring to the Sha Tin</p> <p>24 section near the Luk Hop new estate, and there have been</p> <p>25 fatal accidents there involving buses. But if I recall</p>
<p>1 suggestion?</p> <p>2 MR MICHAEL YUNG: I need to check with that. Because we</p> <p>3 have some colleagues following up on whether the</p> <p>4 suggestions were acted upon, and if there were some</p> <p>5 motions the government departments would respond at</p> <p>6 a later date, and in the next meeting in the matters</p> <p>7 arising, it would be dealt with. And if not, then my</p> <p>8 understanding is the government department would take</p> <p>9 note and would see whether the opinion could be</p> <p>10 implemented.</p> <p>11 I do not have the document at hand. That is the</p> <p>12 paper on the matters arising. Maybe I have to go and</p> <p>13 check whether it is covered under matters arising.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: Perhaps if you can locate it in due course you</p> <p>15 can provide it to us if it is relevant.</p> <p>16 MR MICHAEL YUNG: Okay.</p> <p>17 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Yung, I'm coming to near the end of the</p> <p>18 topic. It is the Tai Po Road which you have expressed</p> <p>19 in a discussion paper at page 727.</p> <p>20 This is a question raised by Mr Yiu Ka Chun in</p> <p>21 question (b) and (c). And the problem is, they raised</p> <p>22 the question about Tai Po Road, Sha Tin Heights section,</p> <p>23 that it has a number of potentially dangerous locations</p> <p>24 and bends. At Chinese it is at page 719.</p> <p>25 Do you know how Mr Yiu came to the view that this</p>	<p>1 correctly, I believe it is someone ramming into the</p> <p>2 buses, not the other way around.</p> <p>3 MS MAGGIE WONG: If we look at page 728, question (b) at the</p> <p>4 bottom. The answer from the Transport Department. In</p> <p>5 spite of the speed limit from Tai Po Road, Sha Tin</p> <p>6 Heights section to Tai Po Road Piper's Hill section is</p> <p>7 70 kilometres. And this section is about 1.7km long</p> <p>8 with two sharp turns. The remaining 1.4km is close to</p> <p>9 Sha Tin and the speed limit is 50 kilometres with three</p> <p>10 sharp turns. The locations of sharp turns are set out</p> <p>11 on the next page.</p> <p>12 Then it states that:</p> <p>13 "A number of traffic signs on speed limit have been</p> <p>14 erected in the proper location on the Tai Po Road ... to</p> <p>15 and from, including road sections where the speed limit</p> <p>16 has been changed. Furthermore, the warning traffic</p> <p>17 signs have been erected in front of sharp turns and the</p> <p>18 'slow down' road markings have been added on the road to</p> <p>19 remind the driver to decelerate before the sharp turns."</p> <p>20 Now the Transport Department was aware of the sharp</p> <p>21 turns, and the speed limit of this road section. Are</p> <p>22 you satisfied with the Transport Department's answer</p> <p>23 that it is sufficient in terms of road speed limit and</p> <p>24 in terms of traffic -- sufficiency of traffic signs.</p> <p>25 MR MICHAEL YUNG: Perhaps I would speak as a motorist.</p>
Page 110	Page 112

Page 113	Page 115
<p>1 Because sometimes I would go via Tai Po Road to drive 2 between Sha Tin and Kowloon. Now, the location in 3 question, here there are sharp bends. In addition there 4 are uneven road levels, it could be slanting in one way 5 or the other.</p> <p>6 If a car travels at 70 kilometres per hour, along 7 this section, and if we have weather like today, that is 8 a rainy day, then it is possible that there could be 9 a crash.</p> <p>10 So this is a little similar to the case, you know, 11 under your investigation at Tai Po Road. The sharp bend 12 is not the main consideration, but rather you can feel 13 that the cars, you know, are travelling at different 14 levels, so for people with lesser driving skills there 15 is a chance that they may cause traffic accidents. And 16 that explains why there are so many traffic accidents 17 along that section. Because if I recall correctly, 18 I think on both sides -- no, no, for the Luk Hop 19 Village, going out 70 kilometres coming back 20 50 kilometres, if I recall correctly.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. Lastly, I would like to refer 22 to you a minutes of meeting, page 736 in Chinese, and 23 743 in English.</p> <p>24 It is also by Mr Yiu Ka Chun.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: What is the date of this meeting?</p>	<p>1 meeting?</p> <p>2 MR MICHAEL YUNG: I have to go back to what I said before.</p> <p>3 If there is a motion, yes, they will follow up on it.</p> <p>4 If there is not a motion, then we will have to look at 5 whether there is response in the supplementary 6 information. Because in this bundle, it does not 7 include supplementary information after the discussion, 8 so I can't see it now. Do you want me to check now or 9 what?</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: If you are able to find something that is 11 relevant later, by all means provide it to us in 12 writing.</p> <p>13 MR MICHAEL YUNG: Fine. Perhaps I can do this later. Later 14 on I will liaise with your committee to see what 15 information you want me to provide. And then I will 16 instruct the secretary to look up the information and 17 see whether there are relevant meeting documents that we 18 could provide later.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: That would be most helpful, thank you.</p> <p>20 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Chairman, I have completed my questions.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Mr Yung, thank you for coming to assist us with 22 your evidence, and we look forward to your communication 23 if you do find any relevant documents, that we should 24 have sight of. Thank you very much.</p> <p>25 MR MICHAEL YUNG: (In English) Thank you.</p>
Page 114	Page 116
<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: It is minutes of meeting, but it does not 2 bear a date, but it has the paper number 2/2018. 3 I assume it is in February 2018. Following the Tai Po 4 Road accident.</p> <p>5 It starts, in Chinese, page 735. And in English at 6 742.</p> <p>7 If we look at paragraph 128(c), the comments by 8 Mr Yiu Ka Chun was that there were three different speed 9 limits in different sections of the Tai Po Road, which 10 would make it hard for drivers to adapt.</p> <p>11 And he asked whether the Transport Department would 12 review this situation and mount additional speed 13 monitors.</p> <p>14 Can you see that?</p> <p>15 MR MICHAEL YUNG: Yes. I see that. So you are asking after 16 that meeting whether the Transport Department conducted 17 any review, is that your question?</p> <p>18 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, but I think to facilitate your 19 consideration the Transport Department did respond at 20 the meeting at 132, paragraph 132. English at page 746. 21 Chinese at 739. In short they said that the section had 22 been provided with clear signs for speed limit and turns 23 to alert drivers.</p> <p>24 So did your district council follow up or did your 25 district council deal with this matter after this</p>	<p>1 CHAIRMAN: We now have representatives from the Sham Shui Po 2 district council. May we ask Mr Lam and Ms Chan to come 3 forward.</p> <p>4 Just allow us a moment, we will change the names 5 over and provide you with fresh glasses.</p> <p>6 EVIDENCE FROM SHAM SHUI PO DISTRICT COUNCIL: MR LAM KA FAI 7 AND MS CHAN WING YAN, JOEPHY 8 (given in Cantonese; transcription of the simultaneous 9 interpretation)</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: Mr Lam and Ms Chan, thank you for accepting our 11 invitation to give evidence today. Apologies for the 12 delay before we reached you, but I would now ask Ms Wong 13 to pose her questions to you.</p> <p>14 Examination by MS MAGGIE WONG</p> <p>15 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you, Mr Lam, and Ms Chan for coming. 16 May I first of all deal with the topic on the 17 working hours for bus drivers. If you would turn to 18 DC-2 bundle page 986 in Chinese and in English at 988.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: What are we going to?</p> <p>20 MS MAGGIE WONG: We are going to questions for discussion to 21 Sham Shui Po district council in relation to the fatal 22 traffic accident at Sham Shui Po. Cheung Sha Wan Road 23 near Yen Chow Street. It was on 25 September 2017.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: This is in consequence of the accident on 25 22 September.</p>

Page 117	Page 119
<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: That's 2017.</p> <p>3 MS MAGGIE WONG: 2017.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: Yes.</p> <p>5 MS MAGGIE WONG: And one of the matters raised in this</p> <p>6 document, if you look at paragraph 3, is to strengthen</p> <p>7 the management of working hours of bus captains. And in</p> <p>8 this document, it states that:</p> <p>9 "In a foreign country, such as the EU, there are</p> <p>10 restrictions on drivers from driving more than 9 hours</p> <p>11 a day, whereas the bus captains in Hong Kong work for</p> <p>12 a maximum of 14 hours per day, amounting to 360 plus</p> <p>13 hours per month."</p> <p>14 If I may also refer you to the minutes of the first</p> <p>15 special meeting, after the Sham Shui Po accident, dated</p> <p>16 28 September 2017, Chinese is at page 1026, English at</p> <p>17 page 1043.</p> <p>18 And I --</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Of which bundle?</p> <p>20 MS MAGGIE WONG: DC-3.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Yes.</p> <p>22 MS MAGGIE WONG: If we look at paragraph 168, Councillor</p> <p>23 Yeung Yuk added that:</p> <p>24 "He required the government to revise the</p> <p>25 guidelines, reducing working hours from 14 to</p>	<p>1 the window of the conference room you would be able to</p> <p>2 see the tragedy. The wreckage was not cleared</p> <p>3 immediately. It was done only after a long time when</p> <p>4 the injured were rescued.</p> <p>5 The bus was stuck and wedged at that location, and</p> <p>6 it took a lot of engineering staff to dislodge the bus.</p> <p>7 The district council discussed for a very long time the</p> <p>8 cause of the accident. The district council concluded</p> <p>9 that one of the major reasons was that the bus driver</p> <p>10 has been driving for too long.</p> <p>11 Regarding 14 hours, no one in the meeting was of the</p> <p>12 view that it was a suitable length. We discussed it</p> <p>13 from 14 to 12 hours, and then to 10 hours. We thought</p> <p>14 that the suitable length of driving duties given the</p> <p>15 fact that bus captains were in control of a large bus,</p> <p>16 were responsible for picking up passengers and letting</p> <p>17 passengers alight and on top of their driving duties</p> <p>18 they have their family lives. There should be</p> <p>19 a balance.</p> <p>20 If bus captains could have just 10 hours of maximum</p> <p>21 driving duties, well, we thought that caretakers in</p> <p>22 public housing estates only worked for eight hours.</p> <p>23 Security guards under the Housing Authority work eight</p> <p>24 hours per shift. The workload, the pressure faced by</p> <p>25 security guards can't possibly compare with that faced</p>
Page 118	Page 120
<p>1 12 hours ..."</p> <p>2 If we look at paragraph 170, Councillor Tam Kwok Kiu</p> <p>3 added that the:</p> <p>4 "... relevant rules and regulations stipulate that</p> <p>5 driver cannot work over 14 hours ... many labour union</p> <p>6 had pointed out 14 working hours are not humane:</p> <p>7 And at paragraph 201, Councillor Tam Kwok Kiu</p> <p>8 commented that Citybus shall reduce all driver's work</p> <p>9 hours to 12 hours.</p> <p>10 My question is, it appears that the Sham Shui Po</p> <p>11 district council proposed 10 working hours. Can you</p> <p>12 tell us why you propose 10 working hours?</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: Where do we see that? Which paragraph?</p> <p>14 MS MAGGIE WONG: You see that at the letter at page 986,</p> <p>15 English at 988, paragraph 3. We asked --</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Just read it out.</p> <p>17 MS MAGGIE WONG: "We asked the Transport Department to</p> <p>18 reflect that the longest driving time per day is</p> <p>19 10 hours."</p> <p>20 Can you tell us why you proposed 10 hours as the</p> <p>21 longest driving time?</p> <p>22 MR LAM KA FAI: After that accident, the council in relation</p> <p>23 to this matter discussed for a very long time the</p> <p>24 location where the accident took place was right in</p> <p>25 front of the district council. It was a junction. From</p>	<p>1 by bus captains. That is, bus captains face tremendous</p> <p>2 pressure and in recent times customers very often scold</p> <p>3 bus captains. In the past month or two, we found</p> <p>4 incidents where seats are planted with needles. So we</p> <p>5 see that there is tremendous pressure faced by bus</p> <p>6 captains.</p> <p>7 In that meeting, we thought that if the working</p> <p>8 hours of bus captains could be reduced to 10 hours, it</p> <p>9 would be ideal.</p> <p>10 We also thought that this would reduce the</p> <p>11 possibility of traffic accidents involving buses. That</p> <p>12 is also another area of concern. Assuming that the work</p> <p>13 hours can be reduced from 14 to 12 to 10, we would think</p> <p>14 whether they would be paid a sufficient wage to support</p> <p>15 their families.</p> <p>16 We were concerned about that as well.</p> <p>17 Bus captains is not an easy job. If they are not</p> <p>18 paid a wage that can support the family, we think there</p> <p>19 will always be a shortage of bus captains, and as</p> <p>20 a result, then work hours can never be reduced. Bus</p> <p>21 companies would use various ways to continue to increase</p> <p>22 their work hours.</p> <p>23 MS MAGGIE WONG: There were some minutes of the meeting on</p> <p>24 28 September 2017. The 5th Sham Shui Po district</p> <p>25 council meeting. The English starts at 1041, and</p>

Page 121	Page 123
<p>1 Chinese at 1026.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: Yes, which paragraph?</p> <p>3 MS MAGGIE WONG: Paragraphs 167 and 168, and I would like to</p> <p>4 draw your attention to two sentences. 167, at the end,</p> <p>5 Councillor Vincent Cheng Wing Shun at the end:</p> <p>6 "... inquired why the driver work hour instruction</p> <p>7 was not amended over past 7 years."</p> <p>8 And 168, the second sentence in (i), Councillor</p> <p>9 Yeung Yuk:</p> <p>10 "He required the government to revise the guideline</p> <p>11 reducing working hours from 14 to 12 hours and</p> <p>12 increasing rest hours and salaries."</p> <p>13 If we look at the reply from the Transport</p> <p>14 Department at page 1044, paragraph 171, Mr Leung Cheong</p> <p>15 Kit stated that:</p> <p>16 "After the accident, drivers' work hour and rest</p> <p>17 hours drew public attention."</p> <p>18 Then over the page:</p> <p>19 "To guarantee drivers' enough rest time, the</p> <p>20 Transport Department and all bus companies made ... bus</p> <p>21 companies have to follow the instruction ... and the</p> <p>22 department engages in independent investigator ... to</p> <p>23 investigate drivers' work ..."</p> <p>24 And then (iv):</p> <p>25 "Transport Department is preparing to review the</p>	<p>1 that representatives of labour unions have been</p> <p>2 advocating no more than 14 hours of maximum driving</p> <p>3 duties. They would like that to be revised to 12 hours.</p> <p>4 As to the proposed 10 hours, perhaps it was the result</p> <p>5 of studies conducted by district councillors. The</p> <p>6 general view of the district council was that 14 hours</p> <p>7 was too long.</p> <p>8 I represent labour unions. I think that we should</p> <p>9 not just focus on work hours, because that is related to</p> <p>10 conditions of employment as well as salaries.</p> <p>11 I understand that the driver involved in the</p> <p>12 accident has just over five years of experience. On</p> <p>13 that day he was scheduled to work earlier than he was</p> <p>14 supposed to because he wanted to make up for work hours</p> <p>15 in order to earn a wage that can support him and his</p> <p>16 family.</p> <p>17 I understand that for the KMB they offer just over</p> <p>18 \$10,000 for bus captains. For First Bus it is slightly</p> <p>19 better. It would be around 12,000. However, you will</p> <p>20 have to take into account various allowances in order to</p> <p>21 make a salary comparable to other jobs that have to deal</p> <p>22 with a lot of pressure.</p> <p>23 So the review should not be just focused on work</p> <p>24 hours, we have to attach importance to conditions of</p> <p>25 work as well.</p>
Page 122	Page 124
<p>1 guideline, and plans to consult bus companies and labour</p> <p>2 unions, and respond to public concerns about drivers'</p> <p>3 work hours. The department has no established position</p> <p>4 on the review, and will then consider comments of bus</p> <p>5 companies, labour unions, and public."</p> <p>6 I have two questions.</p> <p>7 It appears the revision of guidelines was triggered</p> <p>8 by this September 2017 incident, and because of the</p> <p>9 complaints received from the public about the concerns</p> <p>10 of drivers' work hours. Do you agree?</p> <p>11 MS JOEPHY CHAN: Thank you. Perhaps I will supplement.</p> <p>12 In relation to your question, perhaps you refer to</p> <p>13 paragraph 196. I said, because I am a representative of</p> <p>14 a labour union, we always been expressing our views to</p> <p>15 bus companies and transportation companies in relation</p> <p>16 to the conditions of employment and working hours of bus</p> <p>17 captains. It was only after the accident that the</p> <p>18 Transport Department and bus companies seriously</p> <p>19 considered our views.</p> <p>20 The last time, when there was a real amendment was</p> <p>21 seven years ago. That is seven years before the</p> <p>22 accident. It was 2010. I believe that labour union</p> <p>23 representatives have been expressing their views but</p> <p>24 they were not responded to until the accident.</p> <p>25 You mentioned about work hours of 10 hours. I know</p>	<p>1 We have mentioned about rest as well. I have heard</p> <p>2 other councillors talk about rest kiosks. I can't say</p> <p>3 how many estates or locations are without rest kiosk,</p> <p>4 but using Lai Kok Estate as an example. That estate has</p> <p>5 been in place for over three decades. However, it was</p> <p>6 only at the end of last year that the bus terminus had</p> <p>7 a rest kiosk for our bus routes. That is not desirable.</p> <p>8 For Kowloon East Lok Wah Estate, I know it was with the</p> <p>9 intervention of Jonathan Ho, a legislator, that a rest</p> <p>10 kiosk was installed for bus captains.</p> <p>11 So I think we should not just focus on work hours.</p> <p>12 We have to look at salaries, conditions of employment as</p> <p>13 well as the rest facilities.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on, Mr Lam, Ms Chan, you say that</p> <p>15 you are a representative of labour unions. What do you</p> <p>16 mean by that? Explain that.</p> <p>17 MS JOEPHY CHAN: I came from the FTU.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: What was your position in the federation?</p> <p>19 MS JOEPHY CHAN: I am a district councillor.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: You said you came from the FTU. What do you mean</p> <p>21 by that?</p> <p>22 MS JOEPHY CHAN: (In English) That's my political</p> <p>23 association.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>25 Yes, Mr Lam.</p>

Page 125	Page 127
<p>1 MR LAM KA FAI: Just now I was asked by the counsel about 2 this review of the Transport Department, whether it was 3 a result of the traffic accident or complaint made by 4 the council or members of the public. 5 I think that is the case. In the community, when it 6 comes to road safety, traffic accidents, of course 7 members of the public are very concerned. Every day we 8 see traffic accidents, minor ones or major ones, 9 happening every day. It may not be as serious as that 10 one. 11 But if a serious accident takes place, it would 12 shake the community. We see very often that as 13 a result, the government and the public would try to do 14 something. I think the establishment of this 15 Independent Review Committee might be a result of 16 a number of major accidents. 17 I do think that it is really worthwhile to have this 18 Independent Review Committee. We have to consider the 19 scale of the accidents and the number of fatalities and 20 casualties and hope that it will not happen again. 21 Regarding the location of accidents, there may be 22 inadequacies in the design of the road or the facilities 23 provided. Say, for example, the locality of this 24 accident, it is the centre of Sham Shui Po, it is right 25 in front of the government office, right in front of the</p>	<p>1 A lot of people -- 2 CHAIRMAN: Forgive me for interrupting. But may I ask you 3 to help me with the other suggestion you made, and that 4 was in terms of the review of the guidelines of working 5 hours for bus captains. 6 Can I ask you this. Having made the suggestion, and 7 having received the Transport Department's answer, that 8 they were going to review it, that's at the meeting of 9 28 September of 2017, did the Transport Department 10 consult you again before, I think it was 23 February, 11 they announced the result of the review? Were you 12 consulted in the meantime? 13 MR LAM KA FAI: No, they did not. 14 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Ms Wong. 15 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. 16 If you look at page 1053 of bundle DC-2, 17 paragraph 203, Mr Leung Cheong Kit made a comprehensive 18 reply stating that: 19 "The Transport Department will work together with 20 bus companies and labour union stakeholders to review 21 the instruction on drivers' work hour and rest hour to 22 reach a consensus." 23 But the Transport Department never approached the 24 district council, your district council to seek your 25 views. Is that correct?</p>
Page 126	Page 128
<p>1 district council. 2 Regarding transportation services, road users, we 3 see that when there is a change of traffic light, 4 thousands or hundreds of pedestrians would be waiting at 5 that junction waiting to cross. And at that junction, 6 there may be dozens of buses waiting to pass that 7 junction. 8 For Sham Shui Po district, it is the centre point 9 between New Territories and urban areas. Well, you will 10 have to go via Sham Shui Po, wherever you are going to 11 or wherever you are travelling from. It is unfortunate 12 that we have seen this accident. The district council 13 has been making a lot of suggestions to transportation 14 operators and the Transport Department about the heavy 15 traffic at this junction, and the fact that pedestrians 16 have to compete for space with vehicles. 17 We don't want bus companies to deploy their buses in 18 a way that they would all have to travel along this 19 road. We know that bus routes will have to pick up 20 passengers from various places. I'm sorry to see that 21 this accident has happened, but I hope that with this 22 hearing there may be a policy change. 23 We have made a discussion, say, for example, 24 building foot bridges at this junction so that 25 pedestrians don't have to congregate at road crossings.</p>	<p>1 CHAIRMAN: I think he just answered that. 2 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. 3 May I move on to another accident which is on 4 26 April 2016 at Kwong Lee Road. If you look at 5 bundle page 991, English, and in Chinese, 990. 6 MS JOEPHY CHAN: Before we move on, we would like to express 7 the view regarding the accident in Yen Chow Street. 8 Aside from work hours, our union members also tell us 9 that would it be possible to assist bus drivers through 10 road design, for example the minutes also mention that 11 if you look at other cities, they have diagonal crossing 12 or X crossing, in Japan, UK, in busy areas they have 13 road design -- 14 CHAIRMAN: We have read the minutes, and this matter was 15 canvassed at some length in the minutes. 16 MS JOEPHY CHAN: Just now it was mentioned why did we have 17 an accident. It is because the crossing -- people want 18 to cross diagonally, but the pedestrians when they wait 19 too long, they can only cross diagonally, it is a L 20 crossing, so when they are waiting at the junction they 21 are waiting a longer time, and that increases the 22 chances or odds of an accident. That's why we mentioned 23 the X crossing idea. The Transport Department needs to 24 consider this, and the bus drivers also tell us that 25 they hope that there can be some countdown at the</p>

Page 129	Page 131
<p>1 crossing lights, and that can remind them, remind the 2 pedestrians they can get ready, when they need to stop. 3 So if you look at the other cities, there is a lot 4 of technology that helps reduce pressure from motorists, 5 but Hong Kong is lagging behind. We have not even 6 attempted the X crossing, so the committee needs to 7 consider this. 8 Thank you, chairman. 9 MS MAGGIE WONG: Go to document page 990 and 991. It 10 relates to a fatal accident on 26 April 2016 on Kwong 11 Lee Road. If you see at the bottom there were certain 12 requests. And one of them is that: 13 "KMB and Transport Department should carry out 14 detailed investigation of this serious traffic accident 15 and provide a detailed explanation to the public." 16 And at paragraph 4: 17 "The Transport Department should properly handle the 18 follow-up work and improve traffic conditions on Kwong 19 Lee Road against potential traffic hazards." 20 Did your council follow up on these two requests? 21 MR LAM KA FAI: Yes. 22 MS MAGGIE WONG: Before you answer, are they in writing? 23 This follow-up? Are they in writing? 24 MR LAM KA FAI: The district council practice, for example 25 our councillors, they would write -- there was an</p>	<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Chairman, I've finished my questions for 2 this district council. 3 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, I missed the first part? 4 MS MAGGIE WONG: I completed my questions. 5 CHAIRMAN: Right. 6 Those are the questions that we have posed for you, 7 you have made some general statements, and we thank you 8 for that. You have made some specific statements as 9 well. If there is anything more you wish to raise, do 10 so now. 11 But I will tell you this. We have a video link with 12 a witness in Germany at 3 o'clock and we would like to 13 take some break before that, but if there is anything 14 you want to say, you can have the last word. 15 MR LAM KA FAI: Okay. Thank you, honourable judge. 16 Regarding traffic accidents, one is too much. And 17 I sincerely anticipate that this IRC under your 18 leadership can come up with innovative ideas or new 19 measures for the government to allow the public 20 transport service -- and can modernise and move to 21 a higher level of service. That is my expectation. 22 Thank you. 23 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 24 MS JOEPHY CHAN: I wish to say that the committee here 25 today, I think the role it will play is a positive one,</p>
Page 130	Page 132
<p>1 accident in So Tsuen bus stop, and we would have 2 a discussion in the council and the Transport Department 3 representative would respond to these documents, and in 4 our practice after the discussion there might be 5 motions, maybe not on this occasion, but it could be 6 followed up in matters arising in the next meeting. 7 So in future meetings we would have a list of 8 matters that need to be followed up and in the next 9 meeting we can have further discussions. 10 So on that occasion, we requested the government to 11 do certain items, they were able to respond to some of 12 the points on the spot, and they might have to go back 13 and consider our other requirements, so they would have 14 documents in preparation. 15 So regarding the So Uk Estate bus accident, that 16 gave rise to a discussion topic that the So Uk Estate 17 bus stop had been in operation for more than 50 years, 18 so whether its design, its usage, because new bus routes 19 are continuously added, there are more and more bus 20 routes, so the suggestion was to rebuild the bus stop, 21 and there were even other calls for multipurpose uses, 22 where other community facilities could be built. 23 Whether a building could be built, there could be 24 maybe be a government clinic or even a social welfare 25 office and so on.</p>	<p>1 and I hope these regular reviews can be routine practice 2 rather than occurring after accidents. We would like 3 our views to be accepted, but the franchise arrangement, 4 because of its heritage, the bus companies, whether we 5 are talking about the reprovisioning of bus routes, 6 about public convenience, or when you talk about public 7 safety, bus captain safety, a lot of times our views are 8 ignored, because I understand that bus franchise won't 9 be affected because of our views. And that is 10 regrettable and not ideal. 11 When we talk about bus routes we have continuously 12 provided our input. We even talked about bus safety, 13 but unfortunately in the past we didn't have platforms, 14 and routine venues, so in the past our views have never 15 been acknowledged. So we hope after this there can be a 16 new practice, a new venue where our views regarding 17 improvement can be made. 18 Thank you, Chairman. 19 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 20 MR LAM KA FAI: Just now Tai Po District Council made 21 a point and I agree with them, regarding bus policy or 22 franchise issues. If the 18 district councils could 23 have some input before the expiry of the franchise, if 24 they could be consulted, if their views could be adopted 25 formally, then the bus companies would respect community</p>

Page 133	Page 135
<p>1 views even more.</p> <p>2 So given the government structure, we do have some</p> <p>3 examples, for example the Town Planning Board. Even the</p> <p>4 Urban Renewal Authority or other land use changes,</p> <p>5 developments, the Town Planning Board needs to seek the</p> <p>6 support of the district council, and they might also</p> <p>7 have to take on board other views. They have to take on</p> <p>8 board -- it is the majority view, before they decide on</p> <p>9 a change of land use.</p> <p>10 So there are precedents, and I hope the honourable</p> <p>11 judge can provide some strong impetus to an improvement</p> <p>12 in bus company service and management such that our</p> <p>13 views can be conveyed through our counsel and taken</p> <p>14 seriously. And it should be greatly respected.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: May I ask you this. In the context of the</p> <p>16 Transport Department's, Transport and Housing Bureau's</p> <p>17 consultation about whether or not to recommend the</p> <p>18 renewal of a bus franchise, has your district council</p> <p>19 made submissions in response to invitations to the</p> <p>20 public to forward their views?</p> <p>21 MR MICHAEL YUNG: When the franchise is about to expire, in</p> <p>22 our existing policy they don't need to consult the</p> <p>23 district council.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: I appreciate that. But they do make a general</p> <p>25 invitation. I was looking at a document yesterday, when</p>	<p>1 whether it is during the operation, when they talk about</p> <p>2 the bus route reorganisation, our views are not</p> <p>3 respected, they don't even bother listening.</p> <p>4 I'll give you a bus route example. You asked</p> <p>5 whether there are written submissions. So I have</p> <p>6 written to the Commissioner for Transport Department,</p> <p>7 bus route 6F, about a route change, because it travels</p> <p>8 along -- it passes a hospital. So they shouldn't just</p> <p>9 consider the passenger numbers, because a lot of the</p> <p>10 elderly take that bus route to visit hospital services,</p> <p>11 but unfortunately our views are ignored, and they might</p> <p>12 cut bus service or even change the routes. So the</p> <p>13 district councils have no way or no incentive to have</p> <p>14 them heed our views.</p> <p>15 So when the franchise is up for renegotiation, they</p> <p>16 need to consider the DC views before a decision is made.</p> <p>17 That would be appropriate and in the public's interest.</p> <p>18 Thank you, Chairman.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. I'll ask the secretariat to</p> <p>20 communicate with you about the document that I had in</p> <p>21 mind which sets out the public consultation that the</p> <p>22 government says it has before a franchise is renewed.</p> <p>23 The first step. There are a number of papers that</p> <p>24 follow. But I would ask that you be given a copy of</p> <p>25 that in due course.</p>
Page 134	Page 136
<p>1 the KMB franchise was being renewed. And it starts off</p> <p>2 with an invitation to the public to make</p> <p>3 representations, and has the district council, your</p> <p>4 district council, not contributed to that general</p> <p>5 invitation?</p> <p>6 MR LAM KA FAI: I was not aware of that response. But if</p> <p>7 there is a mechanism that is part of our agenda or all</p> <p>8 the 18 district councils' agendas, then it would be</p> <p>9 taken much more seriously. If it is a regular agenda</p> <p>10 item, of course the franchise does not come up for</p> <p>11 reapplication on a frequent basis, it is every five,</p> <p>12 10 years, then ...</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: Nowadays.</p> <p>14 MR LAM KA FAI: So, in the 9th year, the 18 district</p> <p>15 councils could place this on our agenda. Then all</p> <p>16 district councils, we can discuss that in earnest,</p> <p>17 a year before the application. That would be more</p> <p>18 conducive to enhancing bus service.</p> <p>19 MS JOEPHY CHAN: Mr Lam means that the bus companies should</p> <p>20 take the initiative in contacting the 18 district</p> <p>21 councils and consult us.</p> <p>22 I know there are general invitations, but if you</p> <p>23 want to stimulate a discussion, then they need to reach</p> <p>24 out to our district councils. I'll give you an example.</p> <p>25 The bus companies, whether it is a franchise, or</p>	<p>1 It remains for me on behalf of the committee to</p> <p>2 thank you for giving up your time on a rainy Saturday to</p> <p>3 come and help us with your evidence.</p> <p>4 Thank you very much. And we will resume at</p> <p>5 3 o'clock.</p> <p>6 (1.58 pm)</p> <p>7 (The luncheon adjournment)</p> <p>8 (3.16 pm)</p> <p>9 EVIDENCE FROM ZF FRIEDRICHSCHAFEN REPRESENTATIVE:</p> <p>10 MR JAN KULIS</p> <p>11 (Given via video link)</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Good afternoon, Mr Hui. We welcome you and your</p> <p>13 colleagues as the legal representatives of</p> <p>14 ZF Friedrichschafen and its subsidiaries, including</p> <p>15 Openmatics, and we welcome you, Mr Kulis, and thank you</p> <p>16 for accepting our invitation to assist us with</p> <p>17 understanding how the technical devices work.</p> <p>18 I'm going to ask counsel for the committee, Mr Chan,</p> <p>19 to begin posing questions of you.</p> <p>20 Now, if there are any difficulties in your accessing</p> <p>21 material, if you need time to read material, please say</p> <p>22 so, and we will do what we can to help you.</p> <p>23 Do you understand?</p> <p>24 MR KULIS: Okay, perfect, I understand, thank you.</p> <p>25 Examination by MR DEREK CHAN</p>

Page 137	Page 139
<p>1 MR DEREK CHAN: Good morning, Mr Kulis. My name is Derek 2 Chan, and I'm counsel for the committee. 3 I will be asking you questions on behalf of the 4 committee, and the committee members themselves may also 5 ask you questions directly during this session. 6 Can I start first by thanking you, Mr Kulis, for 7 attending today. Your evidence is important to the 8 committee's task in considering from a technical 9 perspective the safety-related measures that are 10 available for franchised buses in Hong Kong. 11 Mr Kulis, can I start first by asking you several 12 basic questions about your current position in your 13 company. 14 Now, if I may, I will use the term "ZF" in short, to 15 collectively refer to your company and its subsidiaries, 16 including Openmatics. 17 So I will just use the term "ZF" collectively. 18 MR KULIS: Yes, of course. 19 MR DEREK CHAN: I understand you are an employee of ZF; what 20 is your current position in the company? 21 MR KULIS: My current position is team leader of system 22 engineering and I'm an employee of the company 23 Openmatics, which is the subsidiary of the ZF. So 24 that's the correct technical status. 25 MR DEREK CHAN: Can you just give us a very general</p>	<p>1 in our bundle is located at the bundle for bus and 2 technical devices manufacturer. I think it is BM-1, in 3 short. 4 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 5 MR DEREK CHAN: And the letter from Zhong Lun Law Firm 6 starts at page 64. 7 Mr Kulis, can I just confirm that we are reading the 8 same thing? 9 Do you have in front of you a letter from a law firm 10 for Zhong Lun Law Firm dated 26 June 2018? 11 MR KULIS: Yes, and I can see it on the screen also. 12 MR DEREK CHAN: You can see it on the screen also. Great. 13 Mr Kulis, the hard copy you are reading off, is it 14 paginated in the bottom right-hand corner.? 15 MR KULIS: No. 16 MR DEREK CHAN: It is not, no problem -- 17 MR KULIS: -- (Simultaneous speakers - unclear). 18 MR DEREK CHAN: I see. 19 Mr Kulis, I'll be asking you questions today from 20 two perspectives, and I'll tell you what they are, so 21 you know where I'm coming from. Firstly, I will be 22 asking you questions about the technical capabilities of 23 the black boxes that had already been supplied by your 24 company to Hong Kong bus operators. 25 So for this, I will be asking you to clarify and</p>
Page 138	Page 140
<p>1 description of your responsibilities as a team leader of 2 systems engineering? 3 MR KULIS: Yes. So my work is consisting mainly from the 4 technical support for deploying the Openmatics systems 5 for current customers, new customers, and in general the 6 job of the system engineer is to tailor our system to 7 customer needs, because our system is pretty much 8 configurable so we are always trying to find the best 9 technical way how to fit our system into some customer 10 solution. 11 MR DEREK CHAN: And I understand that you have a degree in 12 electronic engineering and telecommunications from the 13 University of West Bohemia; is that correct? 14 MR KULIS: Yes, that's correct. 15 MR DEREK CHAN: Mr Kulis, the committee had previously been 16 in correspondence with a law firm in Hong Kong that 17 represents your company, and through correspondence the 18 committee has already asked some questions and your 19 company gave some answers through this law firm. Are 20 you aware of that? 21 MR KULIS: Yes, I am aware. 22 MR DEREK CHAN: Yes. Do you have the answers provided by 23 your company through this law firm in front of you? 24 MR KULIS: Yes, I have it in front of me. 25 MR DEREK CHAN: Mr Chairman and members, the correspondence</p>	<p>1 explain to the committee some of the matters that arise 2 from the written answers that your company has very 3 helpfully provided. 4 That's the first perspective. 5 Secondly, I will be asking you questions about 6 technical capabilities of other hardware or software 7 systems that your company provides, or are able to 8 provide, that are relevant to the issue of bus safety. 9 These are the two perspectives I will be asking you 10 questions from. 11 So with that in mind, Mr Kulis, can I ask you to 12 look at the submissions in front of you at paragraph 1. 13 Does the page that you are looking at start with the 14 word "Annex III" at the top? 15 MR KULIS: Yes. 16 MR DEREK CHAN: The answers provided by your company are in 17 blue, and can I draw your attention to the second 18 paragraph -- sorry, paragraph 1, in the three blue 19 paragraphs, the second one: 20 "Openmatics entered into a supply contract to 21 deliver telematic systems ... with Kowloon Bus Company 22 and Long Win Bus Company." 23 And then your company states here: 24 "Openmatics started offering telematic services by 25 using the first black box system called the 'Mozart</p>

Page 141	Page 143
<p>1 Box'. Later on, Openmatics replaced the Mozart Box by</p> <p>2 a successor platform black box called the 'Bach Box'.</p> <p>3 Clients can use both systems in parallel as KMB does."</p> <p>4 Now can you first tell us when were the Mozart Box</p> <p>5 and the Bach box first introduced to the market?</p> <p>6 MR KULIS: If I remember correctly, the Mozart Box was</p> <p>7 introduced to the market in 2011.</p> <p>8 MR DEREK CHAN: What about the Bach box?</p> <p>9 MR KULIS: The Bach Box, it was -- I think it was in summer</p> <p>10 of 2015.</p> <p>11 MR DEREK CHAN: So a Bach Box is more advanced than a Mozart</p> <p>12 Box? Can you --</p> <p>13 MR KULIS: Yes, it is an advance of technical evolution.</p> <p>14 MR DEREK CHAN: Can you tell us in general terms what are</p> <p>15 the key differences between the two boxes or the</p> <p>16 advances that have been made to the first generation?</p> <p>17 MR KULIS: Yes. As the technology develops, then the Bach</p> <p>18 Box is the second generation of our telematic product,</p> <p>19 so it was designed to be smaller, cheaper, faster and it</p> <p>20 have more interfaces. That's the major difference.</p> <p>21 MR DEREK CHAN: More interfaces, what do you mean by that?</p> <p>22 MR KULIS: Yes, our device can read different data from</p> <p>23 different sources, and different ports. You can -- it</p> <p>24 mentioned the situation with your laptop, where you have</p> <p>25 maybe USB port, the video port and so on, so the Mozart</p>	<p>1 values, one by one.</p> <p>2 The first two parameters, or the first two</p> <p>3 thresholds, relate to acceleration and deceleration.</p> <p>4 Can you tell us what is the time frame within which the</p> <p>5 acceleration or deceleration is measured before the</p> <p>6 threshold is considered crossed?</p> <p>7 MR KULIS: Okay. I think the acceleration -- in general all</p> <p>8 the thresholds are measured in the time frame of one</p> <p>9 second.</p> <p>10 MR DEREK CHAN: Of one second. Is the system -- and I'm</p> <p>11 talking about the system supplied to the Hong Kong bus</p> <p>12 companies, is it capable of incorporating different</p> <p>13 measures of acceleration and deceleration over different</p> <p>14 time periods, for example a constant acceleration over</p> <p>15 three second or five second intervals? Is that possible</p> <p>16 under this current system?</p> <p>17 MR KULIS: Yes, this is possible, I think this option is</p> <p>18 configured.</p> <p>19 MR DEREK CHAN: So this type of measuring acceleration, and</p> <p>20 deceleration, is capable to be recorded under the both</p> <p>21 the Mozart Box and Bach Box, or just one type of them?</p> <p>22 MR KULIS: Yes. On the both, it is the same software, to be</p> <p>23 correct.</p> <p>24 MR DEREK CHAN: If that's the case, is there any reason why</p> <p>25 we don't see that type of threshold definition in this</p>
Page 142	Page 144
<p>1 Box and the Bach Box, we have the interfaces for the</p> <p>2 vehicle systems, to the cameras, serial line and</p> <p>3 tachograph interface, GPS, and so on and so on. So the</p> <p>4 Bach Box have more of them.</p> <p>5 MR DEREK CHAN: Is the Bach Box currently the most advanced</p> <p>6 black box system offered by your company?</p> <p>7 MR KULIS: The current moment, yes.</p> <p>8 MR DEREK CHAN: Now, can I go on in the submissions provided</p> <p>9 by your company. Your company talks about the driver</p> <p>10 feedback device.?</p> <p>11 MR KULIS: Okay.</p> <p>12 MR DEREK CHAN: Over the page, after that, there is a screen</p> <p>13 grab of certain driver feedback thresholds?</p> <p>14 MR KULIS: Mm-hmm.</p> <p>15 MR DEREK CHAN: Now, your company says here that the</p> <p>16 thresholds were initially defined by Kowloon Motor Bus</p> <p>17 and then calibrated by Openmatics to fit the defined</p> <p>18 parameters. My first general question is, after your</p> <p>19 company has calibrated these threshold values, can the</p> <p>20 end user, for example, the bus operator, can they change</p> <p>21 or redefine these values by themselves, or do they have</p> <p>22 to go back to your company?</p> <p>23 MR KULIS: Yes. The general concept is that customer can</p> <p>24 change the threshold if he wants to.</p> <p>25 MR DEREK CHAN: Now, just going through the threshold</p>	<p>1 screen grab here? If it is possible?</p> <p>2 MR KULIS: Excuse me, I didn't get the point of your</p> <p>3 question.</p> <p>4 MR DEREK CHAN: I will just start again. If I can draw your</p> <p>5 attention to the screen grab in the middle of the page?</p> <p>6 MR KULIS: Yes.</p> <p>7 MR DEREK CHAN: You just told us that the acceleration and</p> <p>8 deceleration rates are measured per second?</p> <p>9 MR KULIS: Yes.</p> <p>10 MR DEREK CHAN: And my question was can the acceleration and</p> <p>11 deceleration threshold values be measured at variable</p> <p>12 time periods over a longer period, three seconds, five</p> <p>13 seconds, so that you can measure a more constant</p> <p>14 acceleration or deceleration? Is it possible under this</p> <p>15 system? Or do you need something else?</p> <p>16 MR KULIS: Yes. To be absolutely correct, this is possible,</p> <p>17 but the configuration of this parameter is not public.</p> <p>18 So the current application is not designed to be</p> <p>19 configurable in this time frame of the (unclear), but</p> <p>20 the system is capable to be configured in this way. It</p> <p>21 is just not designed for the end customer like that.</p> <p>22 MR DEREK CHAN: The reason I'm asking this question is</p> <p>23 because when I look at your company's website, and in</p> <p>24 the Vivaldi on-board unit, one of the thresholds for</p> <p>25 acceleration/deceleration is speed increase by more than</p>

Page 145	Page 147
<p>1 50 per cent within three seconds, or an increase of more 2 than 32 kilometres per hour over five seconds, so you 3 have a variable way of measuring sudden or extended 4 acceleration and deceleration.</p> <p>5 So my question is really, is that sort of more 6 sophisticated way of measuring acceleration and 7 deceleration available with the current technology that 8 is supplied to the Hong Kong bus companies?</p> <p>9 MR KULIS: Yes. Now you are talking about the Vivaldi unit, 10 this is the unit we are providing for passenger cars and 11 which we introduced to the market in 2017, or beginning 12 of 2018, so the software is more sophisticated on the 13 Vivaldi unit that compared to the Mozart and the Bach.</p> <p>14 MR DEREK CHAN: Yes, I understand that. So do I take it 15 that the most sophisticated way of measuring 16 acceleration and deceleration is not available in the 17 current Mozart or Bach units?</p> <p>18 MR KULIS: I think it is available because we have the open 19 application concept. It was just not requested by any 20 customer so far. But it can be changed any time.</p> <p>21 MR DEREK CHAN: I see. On the issue of acceleration and 22 deceleration still, can I take you to a few pages on --</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on. Mr Kulis, can I just ask 24 you, from that page where you have the data displayed, 25 just above the data display there is a narrative</p>	<p>1 buses. However, the deceleration and acceleration of 2 the buses as feature recording this on an ongoing basis 3 is not enabled."</p> <p>4 Are you able to elaborate or explain to us what is 5 meant by this paragraph, especially the part about 6 recording acceleration and deceleration on an ongoing 7 basis?</p> <p>8 MR KULIS: Yes, I'm also not sure if I will get the point of 9 this sentence correctly, but I think the sentence is 10 referring to the situation that these values, 11 acceleration and deceleration, for the KMB we are using 12 to raise realtime warnings, not for recording them to 13 the data. This is my understanding of this declaration. 14 So we have the system, the driver feedback device, which 15 is warning the drivers in the realtime if they 16 accelerating too much or decelerating too much. For 17 this propose we are using the values of acceleration and 18 deceleration, we are not storing these values for the 19 historical data. That's my understanding of this 20 sentence declaration.</p> <p>21 MR DEREK CHAN: I see. Okay.</p> <p>22 So your understanding is that the acceleration and 23 deceleration are not recorded in the black box data 24 systems?</p> <p>25 Is that correct, Mr Kulis?</p>
Page 146	Page 148
<p>1 describing what is being displayed. Can I ask that that 2 be brought up on the screen.</p> <p>3 The sentence that I want to draw to your attention 4 is this:</p> <p>5 "The driver feedback thresholds for the accident bus 6 were initially defined by KMB and then calibrated by 7 Openmatics to fit KMB's defined parameters."</p> <p>8 And the question I wanted to ask you is, which is 9 the accident bus? What is meant by that?</p> <p>10 MR KULIS: I think this is referring to the recent fatal 11 accident on the Tai Po Road, if I'm correct.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: The Tai Po accident bus?</p> <p>13 MR KULIS: Yes, which happened ...</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>15 MR DEREK CHAN: Mr Kulis, on the issue of acceleration and 16 deceleration values, can I draw your attention a couple 17 of pages on from the submissions at paragraph 5.</p> <p>18 Chairman, members of the committee, page 69 of our 19 bundle. Paragraph 5.</p> <p>20 MR KULIS: Okay.</p> <p>21 MR DEREK CHAN: In the middle of the page, again, in blue, 22 that is the answers from your company, it is stated 23 that:</p> <p>24 "The telematics system installed at KMB is capable 25 of recording speed, deceleration and acceleration of the</p>	<p>1 MR KULIS: Yes, that's my understanding. Because another 2 function of the -- our box is the record, the several 3 data, as the black box feature. There are maybe 20 4 different values, but not the acceleration and 5 deceleration.</p> <p>6 MR DEREK CHAN: Is there a reason, a purpose for not 7 enabling the storing of such data?</p> <p>8 MR KULIS: If definitely there must be a reason, but it is 9 not known for me, and I think the data set which is 10 recording for the customer, KMB for example, most 11 definitely by the customer KMB, so whatever data they 12 can read, we can store. Obviously it has some impact on 13 the data volume transferred and so on. That might be 14 the reason, but it is not, at least for the moment.</p> <p>15 MEMBER LO: I have a question on acceleration, deceleration, 16 is it measured by an accelerometer or is it calculated 17 by velocity change over time?</p> <p>18 MR KULIS: As we can also see on this screenshot from the 19 configuration, the very first parameter is the 20 acceleration signal source, in this situation the signal 21 source is changed in the vehicle speed, and from that 22 over the one second is calculated acceleration or 23 deceleration, in this case. But it can be also switched 24 to the internal accelerometer of the Mozart Box or the 25 Bach Box.</p>

Page 149	Page 151
<p>1 MEMBER LO: So is it directly measured or is it derived from 2 velocity changes over time?</p> <p>3 MR KULIS: From this configuration, which we are looking on, 4 it is derived from the vehicle speed --</p> <p>5 MR DEREK CHAN: So did the signal come from the speedometer, 6 is that correct, in this case? So the signal source of 7 the acceleration and deceleration calculation, the 8 signal source comes from the speedometer of the bus, and 9 then the computer or the system calculates the 10 acceleration and deceleration based on the changes in 11 the vehicle speed as recorded by the bus itself; is that 12 correct?</p> <p>13 MR KULIS: Yes, that's correct.</p> <p>14 MR DEREK CHAN: Moving on to the next parameter, which is 15 the tilting angle, in terms of degrees?</p> <p>16 MR KULIS: Yes.</p> <p>17 MR DEREK CHAN: In this case we see that the tilting angle 18 is set at 44 degrees in this case?</p> <p>19 MR KULIS: Mm-hmm.</p> <p>20 MR DEREK CHAN: From a technical perspective, do you know 21 why the angle of 44 is selected, why not some other 22 figure?</p> <p>23 MR KULIS: I think value of the 44, as you can imagine, is 24 not a real value for the operating bus. So my 25 understanding of this configuration is that it means</p>	<p>1 be different.</p> <p>2 And then, of course, you need also to configure the 3 areas in some other window, or enter some geofencing 4 into the system.</p> <p>5 MR DEREK CHAN: I'm interested in that last bit of your 6 answer.</p> <p>7 Obviously the bus, if you wish to take advantage of 8 the speed in areas parameter, the system would have to 9 know where the bus is to trigger that parameter. How is 10 that done, technically?</p> <p>11 MR KULIS: This is currently done by the GPS technology, 12 both on the Mozart and the Bach Box, and in the Hong 13 Kong commission, the GPS technology is also supplied 14 with data recording feature which is helping to recover 15 the GPS position when the signal is lost.</p> <p>16 MR DEREK CHAN: Is this capability of setting different 17 speed thresholds in different areas, is this capable in 18 the current systems that are supplied to the Hong Kong 19 bus companies? Or do they have --</p> <p>20 MR KULIS: Yes.</p> <p>21 MR DEREK CHAN: -- to add something extra to utilise this 22 feature?</p> <p>23 MR KULIS: No. Of course they need to configure or in 24 cooperation with us, we need together to configure the 25 areas, we need to define results, the rules, then the</p>
Page 150	Page 152
<p>1 that deactivation of the tilting angle warning in this 2 example.</p> <p>3 If you do not want to be notified on the tilting, 4 then you can set it up to the value which you will not 5 reach during the normal operation, and this, for 6 example, is 44.</p> <p>7 MR DEREK CHAN: The next parameter under tilting angle is 8 the configuration of excessive speed values.</p> <p>9 In this screenshot we can see two parameters under 10 that. One is speed and one is speed in areas, and this 11 this case, both are set at 75 kilometres per hour.</p> <p>12 Now, firstly, a more basic question. Just to see if 13 my understanding is correct. So if the bus in this case 14 exceeds 75 kilometres per hour, the threshold would be 15 considered crossed; is that correct?</p> <p>16 MR KULIS: That's correct.</p> <p>17 MR DEREK CHAN: What is the difference between these two 18 parameters, speed and speed in areas?</p> <p>19 MR KULIS: The application driver feedback is capable of 20 handling the areas where you can set up different speed 21 limits. For example, you can have some areas with 50 22 and some with 70. So if you want to configure this 23 application in that way, that you are respecting that in 24 some areas you have different speed limit, then this 25 particle configuration parameter, speed in area, should</p>	<p>1 system is capable.</p> <p>2 MR DEREK CHAN: In this case, we have the same speed, 75, 3 for both parameters. What would be the use of, or the 4 purpose of configuring both parameters at the same speed 5 in this case?</p> <p>6 MR KULIS: I think that also means that this feature is not 7 used for this particular configuration.</p> <p>8 MR DEREK CHAN: I see. Now in Hong Kong, I'm sure you 9 realise, that we are generally a very dense city, with 10 lots of high rise buildings. To what extent would the 11 stability or reliability of the GPS signals in places 12 such as Hong Kong with a lot of high rise buildings, how 13 would it affect the efficiency of such a system?</p> <p>14 MR KULIS: Of course the -- let's say the precision of the 15 positioning is affected by the Hong Kong environment, it 16 is called (unclear), you have very high rise buildings, 17 so the efficiency and let's say the error in the meters 18 is higher than on the free land, but I think our 19 positioning system was generally accepted by the 20 customers after some several trials of examination and 21 fine tuning, so as I was recently speaking about the 22 data recording, we have the special algorithm which is 23 trying to input the position, the value when the GPS 24 signal is lost or not recorded. So we are trying our 25 best to provide a good position.</p>

Page 153	Page 155
<p>1 MR DEREK CHAN: As far as you are aware, how widespread or 2 how common is it for commercial fleet operators around 3 the world to take advantage or to configure different 4 speeds thresholds, when the vehicle moves into a for 5 example a lower speed zone? How often is that used? 6 MR KULIS: According to our experience, it is not used so 7 widely. Most likely we have the operators which are 8 using only the higher limit, and that's it. It doesn't 9 matter if you are talking about buses or trucks, usually 10 the interest is about one general high rule, and it is 11 I think because they don't want to introduce too complex 12 system to the drivers. 13 MEMBER LO: If the system can set different speed thresholds 14 for different areas, the input interface got to be more 15 complicated than one number. It got to define the area 16 and the threshold, right? So in this simple interface, 17 it cannot handle different speed thresholds for 18 different areas; is that correct? 19 MR KULIS: In this interface you can set up the two 20 different speed thresholds, and then you need define the 21 areas in the next window which is not shown, but next to 22 the headline of this configuration window, you have the 23 details, settings, messages, and areas configuration. 24 So you can -- 25 MR DEREK CHAN: So does this --</p>	<p>1 just a low band and a middle band of the speeds. 2 MR DEREK CHAN: Again, just staying on this screenshot and 3 focusing on the equipment currently supplied to the Hong 4 Kong bus operators, am I correct to understand if one or 5 more of these threshold values are crossed, the driver 6 feedback system would provide visual and acoustic 7 feedback to the driver immediately? So a light would 8 come on and there would be a beeping sound of some sort, 9 is that correct? 10 MR KULIS: Yes, that is correct. 11 MR DEREK CHAN: Now, what I'm interested in is this. 12 In addition to alerting the driver who was driving 13 the bus, if these threshold values are crossed, do the 14 systems presently supplied by your company to the Hong 15 Kong bus operators have the capability of automatically 16 generating reports for the crossing of threshold values 17 to alert those monitoring the driver's behaviour that 18 these values had been crossed? 19 MR KULIS: Yes, the system is capable. 20 MR DEREK CHAN: Of automatically generating reports? 21 MR KULIS: Yes. 22 MR DEREK CHAN: Would the bus company need to have 23 additional software applications in order to take 24 advantage of this automatic generation of reports? 25 MR KULIS: No, actually, this is supported directly in the</p>
Page 154	Page 156
<p>1 MR KULIS: -- particular areas to this configuration, and 2 maybe you want to limit the speed and the depth only for 3 some numbers, so you can do it through that. 4 MEMBER LO: So the system is already designed for that, it 5 is just the interface shown here does not show that 6 feature? 7 MR KULIS: Yes. 8 MR DEREK CHAN: If I have a digital map that is able to show 9 different speed limits on different roads, would I be 10 able to use that combining with the system currently 11 available here, to configure to set different speed 12 thresholds depending on where the bus is on the digital 13 map? Or is that not possible under the system? 14 MR KULIS: Definitely it is possible. Of course we will 15 need some software which will convert the file format of 16 your map, which we don't know, to the file format of our 17 configuration, and at the current moment I also need to 18 highlight that we are supporting only two different 19 speed limits, not unlimited values of the limits. 20 MR DEREK CHAN: I see, so the limit of the system is just 21 two speeds, not multiple speeds; is that correct? 22 MR KULIS: I think this is, to be correct, this is limit of 23 the current application. It can be easily extended to 24 support more limits, it is just a software change, but 25 it is not supported right now because the request was</p>	<p>1 application bundle which we got driver feedback. To be 2 exact, the driver feedback is not also meant for the 3 device, it is also the application bundle we are 4 providing. Part of the application is running on the 5 device in the bus, but another part of the application 6 is also running on the server, and it is capable of 7 receiving events as they appear, so together with the 8 position information where it happened. Then, for 9 example, if you have the speeding event, you can see on 10 the bottom there had been the speeding event recently on 11 this road, and so on, or you can check the statistics of 12 it. 13 MR DEREK CHAN: So it is a matter of how the end user or the 14 bus operator wants to use the data that is being 15 collected; is that correct? 16 MR KULIS: Yes. 17 MR DEREK CHAN: In addition to these basic threshold values 18 that we see in this screenshot, do the systems provide 19 any other threshold values that relate to safety or safe 20 driving? 21 MR KULIS: Not the application driver feedback currently. 22 We have also another application which we can just 23 upload to these boxes, and then we can measure -- 24 basically, any parameter which we can technically read 25 we can analyse, so if you realise that some maybe bridge</p>

Page 157	Page 159
<p>1 somewhere is important parameter to monitor, then we can 2 start monitoring such parameter, and make the 3 notifications, something like that.</p> <p>4 MR DEREK CHAN: Can I then move on to the next topic, which 5 is the transmission of the data collected by the black 6 boxes to another place.</p> <p>7 So for that, can I first take you to our page 69, 8 which I think in your bundle would be under paragraph 5. 9 If you have the correct page, at the bottom of the page 10 there should be a small (ii) at the bottom of the page.?</p> <p>11 MR KULIS: Yes. I have it.</p> <p>12 MR DEREK CHAN: And the blue answer given by your company 13 refers to the system collecting the defined data every 14 second. And then sends that data to a defined FDP 15 server every 30 seconds.</p> <p>16 MR KULIS: Mm-hmm.</p> <p>17 MR DEREK CHAN: My first question is is the setting of 18 a 30-second data transmission time gap, is it a matter 19 of choice, or a matter of the limitations of the 20 hardware capabilities offered by your company?</p> <p>21 MR KULIS: It is a matter of choice. It is a configurable 22 parameter.</p> <p>23 MR DEREK CHAN: So if the end user wants he can configure 24 the system to send the data to a defined server every 25 second, for example?</p>	<p>1 office, how do I monitor the driver, realtime? Do 2 I need additional software, or does your company already 3 provide the software for me to do so?</p> <p>4 MR KULIS: There are two options, we can provide our 5 software solution, which consists of the Openmatics 6 portal and additional applications on the server side. 7 That is one option, but some customers they are 8 preferring just to get the data, and they have their own 9 IT systems behind. In that case we are just the data 10 provider and we don't care about the utilisation or 11 operating of that. Utilising that.</p> <p>12 MR DEREK CHAN: In this case, KMB, is it the case that ZF 13 only works as, as you describe it, a data provider, or 14 are you aware of any more advanced use by KMB of your 15 company's realtime monitoring capabilities?</p> <p>16 MR KULIS: I think in this case KMB is the customer, at 17 current moment, they are using their own IT system to 18 handle the data and work with the data. But, yes, it's 19 by agreement, we can also change it if we want.</p> <p>20 MR DEREK CHAN: I see. In your experience, how common is it 21 around the world in terms of commercial fleet management 22 for the company to monitor the driving behaviour of its 23 drivers realtime? How common is that?</p> <p>24 MR KULIS: I think this is quite a common request. Both 25 from the safety and economic reason, the companies</p>
Page 158	Page 160
<p>1 MR KULIS: For example, then I will assume there will be 2 some technology limitation, because the transfer 3 protocol is FDP file transfer protocol and it needs some 4 seconds to check and establish a connection and upload 5 the file, so I think the technology limitation for the 6 FDP can be about two or three seconds for this --</p> <p>7 MR DEREK CHAN: So delay --</p> <p>8 MR KULIS: Just I think the lowest useful value for the FDP 9 transfer rate should be around 5 seconds. That's my 10 feeling.</p> <p>11 MR DEREK CHAN: Taking into account the speed of data 12 transfer, is my understanding correct?</p> <p>13 MR KULIS: Exactly.</p> <p>14 MR DEREK CHAN: Now if the data is capable of being 15 transmitted and received at, say, 5-second intervals, 16 does your company provide the technology either in 17 hardware or software to facilitate realtime monitoring 18 of the data collected by the black box?</p> <p>19 MR KULIS: Yes.</p> <p>20 MR DEREK CHAN: So let me see if I get this right. Your 21 company supplies the black box, it collects the data, 22 and the system is able to transfer that data, say, every 23 five seconds, to a defined server?</p> <p>24 MR KULIS: Mm-hmm.</p> <p>25 MR DEREK CHAN: So as a supervisor, I'm sitting in my</p>	<p>1 usually want to monitor the drivers. In some countries 2 there is the conflict with the law regulation and 3 protecting the driver safety, like in the West European 4 countries, sometimes it is not so easy to introduce 5 monitoring system, but the demand is always there.</p> <p>6 MR DEREK CHAN: Moving on, then, Mr Kulis, to another topic. 7 You mentioned a bit earlier, or I mentioned actually, 8 the Vivaldi unit that is offered by your company. When 9 was this unit first introduced to the market?</p> <p>10 MR KULIS: I think that was at the end of 2017 or beginning 11 2018 I'm not sure exactly, but it is relatively new 12 hardware.</p> <p>13 MR DEREK CHAN: Is it a more advanced version of the Mozart 14 and Bach boxes or something completely different?</p> <p>15 MR KULIS: This is something completely different. The 16 Vivaldi unit is designed for the passenger cars, it 17 cannot work in the buses because of different interface.</p> <p>18 MR DEREK CHAN: So this unit is more for passenger cars not 19 for buses?</p> <p>20 MR KULIS: Or maybe light commercial vehicles, but not big 21 buses. Not for the heavy --</p> <p>22 MR DEREK CHAN: In that case I'll move on. 23 The next item that I'm interested in, or I am going 24 to ask questions on, is the ability or the capability of 25 using software analysis to provide a report on</p>

Page 161	Page 163
<p>1 acceptable or unacceptable, safe or unsafe driving 2 behaviour.</p> <p>3 Does your company provide the software that is 4 capable of assessing, based on the data collected by the 5 black box, capable of assessing or coming up with 6 a report of what is acceptable or unacceptable driving 7 behaviour? Is that possible?</p> <p>8 MR KULIS: Yes, it is possible.</p> <p>9 MR DEREK CHAN: How is that possible? What do I have to do? 10 If I'm a bus operator and I come to you and say I want 11 something that allows me to generate a report of 12 a particular driver? How would you tell me that can be 13 done, how can that be done?</p> <p>14 MR KULIS: In that case, I will introduce you to our 15 application driver feedback, together with the portal 16 parts, together with the software solution which we are 17 providing, so then you can regard the parameters as we 18 were talking about, then, and you can get also the 19 statistics, so then at the end of the day, or some 20 period, you can make your own analysis, for example, 21 which driver have most warnings, thresholds, speeding 22 events, and so on.</p> <p>23 This is one option.</p> <p>24 And then we can also design the solution for you, if 25 you are not satisfied with the driver feedback only, if</p>	<p>1 the world in commercial fleet management for the 2 operator to use software to come up with a score card of 3 the driver's driving behaviour? How common is it around 4 the world?</p> <p>5 MR KULIS: It is -- based on my experience it is relatively 6 common in the West European countries. On the other 7 hand, in some other regions, they want to keep the 8 system simple, like is the driver feedback negative. 9 Only a simple warning, and that's it. Because still we 10 need to consider that drivers need to understand what 11 they are scored for. So if you introduce more complex 12 calculation, to evaluate the score cards, we need to 13 provide the training of the drivers, need to understand 14 it. So it differs by the countries and regions.</p> <p>15 MR DEREK CHAN: But I think you said it is quite common in 16 Western European countries?</p> <p>17 MR KULIS: Definitely.</p> <p>18 MR DEREK CHAN: Moving on then from this driver score card 19 --</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on. If it is quite common in 21 Western European countries, what thresholds do they use 22 to monitor driver behaviour if they are scoring the 23 driver "good" or "bad", or "average". Whatever the 24 score card might be?</p> <p>25 MR KULIS: To give you the example, for example the truck</p>
Page 162	Page 164
<p>1 you want to have more sophisticated calculations, we can 2 log the driving data, the parameters, into the database 3 and make the analysis relevant for you. If you are more 4 focused on different inputs, maybe some other parameter 5 is concerning you, we can make analysis and score it on 6 that.</p> <p>7 It depends how you feel the logic. If you want to 8 calculate the bonus points and evaluate the best driver, 9 or if you want to introduce, let's say, the negative 10 restriction, it is just check they are better drivers, 11 or better behaviour, and so on. There are multiple ways 12 to achieve it.</p> <p>13 Also depends what the drivers are open for, or the 14 unions, it can have more solutions.</p> <p>15 MR DEREK CHAN: So it is just the software capabilities. 16 Because the hardware itself is just the data collected 17 by the black boxes. Is my understanding correct? 18 I don't need to buy new equipment? In order to come up 19 with such a score card of a driver's behaviour?</p> <p>20 MR KULIS: No, you don't need new equipment. If, for 21 example, now you are the customer, and you already have 22 our boxes we can just talk about new possibilities and 23 we can give you the new software and you will use the 24 same hardware for that.</p> <p>25 MR DEREK CHAN: In your experience, how common is it around</p>	<p>1 companies in Germany, they are using the parameters as 2 we have here, the basic parameters, so the speeding 3 events, acceleration, deceleration, but on top of that 4 they are, for example, evaluating if the driver is using 5 the (unclear) for the driving, so he is saving the 6 brakes, or they even have the analysis of the speed 7 value shape in time, and the brake application. So if 8 they are not using the aggressive driving style or if 9 they are not -- how to say, if they are driving more 10 effectively. There are multiple analyses for this.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: So the basic model would be to start with 12 analysing speeding, acceleration and deceleration, 13 that's the basic model?</p> <p>14 MR KULIS: Yes. Also the idling, if you keep the engine 15 running, if you are standing, then you are wasting money 16 obviously. That's the basic model. And then on top of 17 that, maybe saving of the brakes and so on.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>19 MEMBER LO: I have another question on the 30 seconds. 20 So when you send information every 30 seconds, do 21 you send second by second of the last 29 seconds, or do 22 you average everything for the last 30 seconds and send 23 one number?</p> <p>24 MR KULIS: We are sending second by second.</p> <p>25 MEMBER LO: So you get second by second of the last 30</p>

Page 165	Page 167
<p>1 second, and not one every --</p> <p>2 MR KULIS: Each second is recorded.</p> <p>3 MEMBER LO: Okay, good.</p> <p>4 MR DEREK CHAN: Moving on to the next topic, which is</p> <p>5 automatic logging of a driver's driving or rest times.</p> <p>6 MR KULIS: Okay.</p> <p>7 MR DEREK CHAN: I understand that your company offers the</p> <p>8 hardware and software to enable a driver's driving time</p> <p>9 to be automatically logged or digitally; is that</p> <p>10 correct?</p> <p>11 MR KULIS: To be exact, we are offering the Mozart and Bach</p> <p>12 boxes where you can upload the software which is logging</p> <p>13 the driver's driving time. We are not selling the</p> <p>14 tachographs by the definition of the European law</p> <p>15 because the tachographs in Europe are produced and sold</p> <p>16 by different companies, and to that kind of the</p> <p>17 tachographs we can connect and download, but we are not</p> <p>18 selling them.</p> <p>19 MR DEREK CHAN: Let me see if I understand it correctly. So</p> <p>20 what your company provides is the software to be able to</p> <p>21 record the driver's driving time based on the data</p> <p>22 collected by the Mozart and Bach boxes; is that correct?</p> <p>23 MR KULIS: That's correct.</p> <p>24 MR DEREK CHAN: And I think, is the software application</p> <p>25 called Digi Tacho Download, or is that something</p>	<p>1 need just the information about the driver</p> <p>2 identification, and the speed. Then we can easily get</p> <p>3 the information how long the driver is driving. So we</p> <p>4 can make our own implementation of measuring the driver</p> <p>5 and times.</p> <p>6 MR DEREK CHAN: How widely is it used in the world in terms</p> <p>7 of systems for electronically logging driver's driving</p> <p>8 times? Is it very common or not common?</p> <p>9 MR KULIS: It is very common in Europe, because we need to</p> <p>10 have the tachographs from law. It is not so common in</p> <p>11 north or south America, these countries are just</p> <p>12 considering if they need the tachographs or the</p> <p>13 measuring of the driving times in general or not. Same</p> <p>14 in Asia Pacific I think. It is still under discussions.</p> <p>15 MR DEREK CHAN: Thank you.</p> <p>16 Moving on then from the electronic logging of</p> <p>17 driving times, the next topic I want to cover with you</p> <p>18 is the braking systems that are offered by your company.</p> <p>19 MR KULIS: Okay.</p> <p>20 MR DEREK CHAN: The two braking systems that we saw from</p> <p>21 your company's website being offered by your company,</p> <p>22 the two systems that we found are called intarders, and</p> <p>23 the second one is called integrated brake control.</p> <p>24 Now, firstly, what are they, and secondly are they</p> <p>25 suitable for use on commercial buses and in particular</p>
<p>1 different?</p> <p>2 MR KULIS: That particular application is used to download</p> <p>3 the data from the digital tachograph that needs to be</p> <p>4 installed in the vehicle. It is widely used in Europe,</p> <p>5 where we have the tachograph rule, tachographs are</p> <p>6 mandatory, and to avoid manual downloads from the big</p> <p>7 fleets, we can download the data through the Mozart or</p> <p>8 Bach Box. For that we have this application.</p> <p>9 MR DEREK CHAN: I see. What about the application called</p> <p>10 the Driving Times app? Does that perform the same sort</p> <p>11 of function or is it something different?</p> <p>12 MR KULIS: It is a little bit more advanced sort of</p> <p>13 function. This application is also connected to the</p> <p>14 digital tachograph in the vehicle, but the scope of the</p> <p>15 application is that you will see on the screen the</p> <p>16 remaining driving time for each driver in your fleet, so</p> <p>17 you will get the fast overview which driver needs to be</p> <p>18 exchanged, which drivers can drive, where they are, so</p> <p>19 on. So kind of that.</p> <p>20 MR DEREK CHAN: So if in Hong Kong we do not have</p> <p>21 a tachograph system in the way that Western European</p> <p>22 countries may have them, can Hong Kong use this</p> <p>23 electronic recording of the driver's driving time</p> <p>24 through the data collected by the Mozart and Bach boxes?</p> <p>25 MR KULIS: Yes. This is generally possible. Because we</p>	<p>1 in Hong Kong, double-decker buses?</p> <p>2 MR KULIS: Yes, so the --</p> <p>3 MR DEREK CHAN: If I can ask you to explain those matters</p> <p>4 one by one, firstly the intarder. What is it?</p> <p>5 MR KULIS: I think the intarder, this is the additional</p> <p>6 brake system which is part of the gearbox. For example,</p> <p>7 the echo live gearbox, which is the product that is</p> <p>8 used, is also in some Hong Kong buses. It is mostly</p> <p>9 equipped with this brake system and its commercial name</p> <p>10 is intarder. So it is kind of additional device on the</p> <p>11 gear box which can provide the braking power.</p> <p>12 MR DEREK CHAN: So let me see if I understand it generally.</p> <p>13 The device, does it use the engine to slow down the</p> <p>14 vehicle, or am I getting it completely wrong?</p> <p>15 MR KULIS: No, no, the braking function or the braking power</p> <p>16 is done in the gear box in this intarder device.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: So effectively it is going down into lower gears,</p> <p>18 is that it?</p> <p>19 MR KULIS: It is actually not going to lower gears, it is</p> <p>20 using another kind of gear which is there only for this</p> <p>21 braking. But the principle is something like that.</p> <p>22 MR DEREK CHAN: Is the intarder capable of being retrofitted</p> <p>23 to existing buses or do they have to be incorporated in</p> <p>24 the manufacturing stage?</p> <p>25 MR KULIS: It is definitely part only of the transmission,</p>

Page 169	Page 171
<p>1 so you can use the intarder only in the buses where you</p> <p>2 have modern sort of transmissions. So the retrofitting,</p> <p>3 I'm not sure if this is possible. Probably not in every</p> <p>4 bus.</p> <p>5 MR DEREK CHAN: And how does the intarder enhance safer</p> <p>6 driving? Does it help the driver brake in certain</p> <p>7 circumstances? How does it help safe driving?</p> <p>8 MR KULIS: Let me check. If you can give me a few seconds,</p> <p>9 I need to browse the training manual.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: Please take your time.</p> <p>11 MR KULIS: I think the main advantage is that intarder have,</p> <p>12 let's say, bigger braking effect at the higher speeds,</p> <p>13 if we will check the brake diagram which shows the</p> <p>14 braking power based on the vehicle speed, then the -- if</p> <p>15 you are braking by the intarder, then you have higher</p> <p>16 braking power at higher speeds, and even available to</p> <p>17 the lower speed range.</p> <p>18 Maybe later I can provide you with the official</p> <p>19 diagrams and documents for this.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Yes, thank you. That would be helpful.</p> <p>21 MR KULIS: If you are fine with that, I can give some PDFs</p> <p>22 or something.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: Please do that.</p> <p>24 MR DEREK CHAN: Just on the issue of providing us with</p> <p>25 material explaining how the intarder works, can you also</p>	<p>1 for Mr Kulis.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: Mr Chan, do we know which franchise bus companies</p> <p>3 in Hong Kong ZF have supplied equipment and what</p> <p>4 equipment they have supplied?</p> <p>5 MR DEREK CHAN: Mr Kulis, firstly, in relation to the</p> <p>6 equipment that is supplied to the bus operators in Hong</p> <p>7 Kong, can I take you to your submission at page 65.</p> <p>8 It is page 65 for us, but it would be the first page</p> <p>9 of your submission.</p> <p>10 MR KULIS: Okay.</p> <p>11 MR DEREK CHAN: That has the heading "Annex III".?</p> <p>12 MR KULIS: Okay.</p> <p>13 MR DEREK CHAN: Now, you have noted -- or at least your</p> <p>14 company has noted in this submission that your company</p> <p>15 has entered into supply contracts with Kowloon Bus</p> <p>16 Company, and Long Win Bus Company. And the black box</p> <p>17 systems installed are the Mozart Box and the Bach Box.</p> <p>18 Are these systems supplied to both KMB and Long Win, or</p> <p>19 are the systems supplied a bit different for each</p> <p>20 company?</p> <p>21 MR KULIS: As far as I know, our customer is called KMB, but</p> <p>22 I'm not specialist for this business question, so</p> <p>23 I cannot say it for sure.</p> <p>24 MR DEREK CHAN: Do you personally, or at least do you have</p> <p>25 access to information which tells us what equipment has</p>
Page 170	Page 172
<p>1 provide something similar in relation to the driver</p> <p>2 feedback app, the app with which you create a score card</p> <p>3 for the driver. Can you provide the committee later on,</p> <p>4 as well, with presentation materials, PDFs to explain</p> <p>5 how it actually works.</p> <p>6 MR KULIS: For the driver feedback application I can send</p> <p>7 you the application manual, the official instruction,</p> <p>8 how to use the application, how it works.</p> <p>9 MR DEREK CHAN: That would be very helpful, thank you.</p> <p>10 I have asked you questions about the intarder. Can</p> <p>11 I move on to the same type of questions about the</p> <p>12 integrated brake control.</p> <p>13 Again, firstly what is it, and how does it help safe</p> <p>14 driving?</p> <p>15 MR KULIS: For the integrated brake system, I didn't find</p> <p>16 the relevant information so far. So I need to excuse</p> <p>17 myself, I will prepare information on that and later</p> <p>18 I will give you the connection to the expert on this</p> <p>19 field. Still my specialisation is more on the</p> <p>20 Openmatics side.</p> <p>21 MR DEREK CHAN: I see. It would be helpful if you could</p> <p>22 forward those materials to us on a later stage.</p> <p>23 MR KULIS: Yes. Just give me a bit more time and I will</p> <p>24 give you something on that.</p> <p>25 MR DEREK CHAN: Mr Chairman, those are the questions I had</p>	<p>1 been supplied to Kowloon Motor Bus and Long Win Bus</p> <p>2 Company?</p> <p>3 MR KULIS: You mean which kind of hardware?</p> <p>4 MR DEREK CHAN: Yes.?</p> <p>5 MR KULIS: I think also as is stated below we were supplying</p> <p>6 the Mozart Box in the past, and then the Bach Box is the</p> <p>7 successor to the Mozart. Plus the driver feedback</p> <p>8 device and the accessories, that means cables, antennas</p> <p>9 and all the stuff which you need to run the system.</p> <p>10 MR DEREK CHAN: Can I also refer you to what in our bundle</p> <p>11 is page 52. For your purposes, what I'm looking at is</p> <p>12 a letter from the Committee to your company dated</p> <p>13 25 May 2018, which contains a number of annexes, and</p> <p>14 I want to look at annex II. So perhaps you can look at</p> <p>15 the screen.?</p> <p>16 MR KULIS: Okay.</p> <p>17 MR DEREK CHAN: The screen talks about Kwoon Chung, which is</p> <p>18 a company in Hong Kong that runs buses, to put it</p> <p>19 generally?</p> <p>20 MR KULIS: Mm-hmm.</p> <p>21 MR DEREK CHAN: Do you have any knowledge about what is</p> <p>22 being described in this page?</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: Perhaps for the purpose of the record, Mr Chan --</p> <p>24 MR KULIS: I didn't see this text before, but it is</p> <p>25 definitely true that Kwoon Chung is also our customer</p>

Page 173	Page 175
<p>1 and they are also using some telematics services in</p> <p>2 a similar case to the customer KMB.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: Perhaps you could read it out, Mr Chan, because</p> <p>4 when one comes to read the transcript, it is difficult</p> <p>5 to understand what one is following unless at least some</p> <p>6 of it has been read out.</p> <p>7 MR DEREK CHAN: Certainly. Firstly, the page refers to</p> <p>8 a system that has been supplied to Kwoon Chung, and at</p> <p>9 the bottom paragraph of this page it is stated that:</p> <p>10 "We got a tailored app for data collection to</p> <p>11 substitute the Black box. Now we receive telematics and</p> <p>12 also diagnostics data about our vehicles. Openmatics</p> <p>13 telematics solution was integrated in our BSAS (bus stop</p> <p>14 announcement system) so our passengers get up to date</p> <p>15 information. We were able to increase safety and reduce</p> <p>16 costs by changing particular behaviour of our drivers.</p> <p>17 We are planning to move forward to Openmatics platform</p> <p>18 2.0 soon. We would like to use more smart solutions</p> <p>19 from Openmatics in our company and are currently</p> <p>20 considering an entertainment solution with on-board</p> <p>21 hotspot and depot management to monitor vehicles</p> <p>22 entering and leaving depot with bluetooth smart TAGs."</p> <p>23 So firstly, are you able to tell from the paragraph</p> <p>24 what system had been supplied to Kwoon Chung?</p> <p>25 MR KULIS: I think to Kwoon Chung we supply the Bach boxes</p>	<p>1 MR KULIS: Yes.</p> <p>2 MR DEREK CHAN: How that data is then subsequently used is</p> <p>3 a software problem, not a hardware problem, is that</p> <p>4 correct?</p> <p>5 MR KULIS: That's correct.</p> <p>6 MR DEREK CHAN: And your company develops certain software</p> <p>7 to take advantage of the data collected by the Mozart</p> <p>8 and Bach Boxes?</p> <p>9 MR KULIS: Yes, that's true.</p> <p>10 MR DEREK CHAN: Do you know if your company is supplying the</p> <p>11 software to analyse the data? Is your company supplying</p> <p>12 that software to the Hong Kong bus companies and, if so,</p> <p>13 what software had been supplied, do you know?</p> <p>14 MR KULIS: I think they are not supplying software to the</p> <p>15 KMB as far as I know, for this analysis but we are in</p> <p>16 negotiation with Kwoon Chung to develop some common</p> <p>17 solution how to analyse, for example, the driver</p> <p>18 behaviour and some other parameters like maybe some</p> <p>19 diagnostics services and so on.</p> <p>20 MR DEREK CHAN: Mr Kulis, thank you for your help.</p> <p>21 Mr Chairman, those are the questions I have for</p> <p>22 Mr Kulis.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>24 MEMBER LO: I just have a clarification. The paragraph</p> <p>25 mentioned about Openmatics platform 2.0. Is that</p>
Page 174	Page 176
<p>1 as the hardware plus the cables and so on, and the</p> <p>2 software downloads. They do not have the Mozart boxes</p> <p>3 because I think --</p> <p>4 MR HUI: If I may assist, the witness is more responsible on</p> <p>5 the technical side. So on the business side, he may not</p> <p>6 be able to provide useful information to this</p> <p>7 commission. But if Mr Chan wants to ask, we can</p> <p>8 continue the questioning.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: I don't understand the difference between the</p> <p>10 business and the technical side. The question simply is</p> <p>11 this. When the statement says "We plan to move forward</p> <p>12 to Openmatics platform 2", what does that mean to you?</p> <p>13 MR KULIS: Ah, okay. They are going to release soon the new</p> <p>14 portal version, or we to all Openmatics customers, we</p> <p>15 will provide access to the new Openmatics portal,</p> <p>16 because the old portal, the server solution was designed</p> <p>17 five or six years ago, and it uses old technologies, it</p> <p>18 is not so nice, so the 2.0 will mean the new server</p> <p>19 solution for the Openmatics system.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>21 MR DEREK CHAN: Perhaps I can see if I'm understanding this</p> <p>22 correctly, in terms of hardware being supplied to the</p> <p>23 Hong Kong bus operators, you are talking about the Bach</p> <p>24 and the Mozart boxes that are responsible for collecting</p> <p>25 data?</p>	<p>1 a hardware platform or is it a software app platform?</p> <p>2 MR KULIS: It is the software app platform. It is the</p> <p>3 server side of the solution.</p> <p>4 MEMBER LO: So that's a software platform, that will</p> <p>5 manipulate the data collected for various purposes.</p> <p>6 MR KULIS: Exactly.</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: Well, thank you very much for your assistance,</p> <p>8 Mr Kulis, it has been an educational experience. And we</p> <p>9 hope to put the information to good use.</p> <p>10 Thank you for accepting our invitation to assist</p> <p>11 this enquiry in its work.</p> <p>12 MR KULIS: Okay, it is my pleasure to help you.</p> <p>13 MR HUI: Mr Chairman, I have a short closing remark on</p> <p>14 behalf of ZF.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: We will happily receive it.</p> <p>16 MR HUI: On behalf of ZF I wish to thank this Commission</p> <p>17 for its invitation to assist. ZF will continue to try</p> <p>18 their best to assist this Commission on a voluntary</p> <p>19 basis. ZF is determined and committed to make a</p> <p>20 contribution to the improvement of road safety in Hong</p> <p>21 Kong and around the world.</p> <p>22 We hope the information provided by ZF, and</p> <p>23 Mr Kulis, is helpful to this Commission, and for further</p> <p>24 information and documents, we will continue to work with</p> <p>25 the Secretariat. Thank you.</p>

1 CHAIRMAN: Thank you for that statement, and thank you for
 2 the undertaking to continue to assist us. It is most
 3 gratefully received.

4 Mr Kulis, thank you for your assistance, and these
 5 proceedings are now closed, for the current hearing.

6 Thank you.

7 (4.30 pm)

8 (The hearing adjourned to Monday, 16 July 2018)

9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1 I N D E X

2 P A G E

3 EVIDENCE FROM TAI PO DISTRICT1
 4 COUNCIL: MS WONG PIK KUI,
 MR CHAN CHO LEUNG, MR YAM KAI
 BONG, MR CHAN SIU KUEN, DR LAU
 5 CHEE SING
 6 Examination by MS MAGGIE WONG1
 7 EVIDENCE FROM SHA TIN DISTRICT83
 COUNCIL: MICHAEL YUNG
 8
 Examination by MS MAGGIE WONG83
 9
 EVIDENCE FROM SHAM SHUI PO DISTRICT116
 10 COUNCIL: MR LAM KA FAI AND
 MS CHAN WING YAN, JOEPHY
 11
 Examination by MS MAGGIE WONG116
 12
 EVIDENCE FROM ZF FRIEDRICHSCHAFEN136
 13 REPRESENTATIVE: JAN KULIS
 14 Examination by MR DEREK CHAN136
 15
 16
 17
 18
 19
 20
 21
 22
 23
 24
 25