

Page 1	<p>1 Tuesday, 19 June 2018</p> <p>2 (10.00 am)</p> <p>3 EVIDENCE FROM NEW LANTAO BUS CO LTD: MR JAMES WONG CHEUK ON,</p> <p>4 MR TIMOTHY WONG CHEUK TIM, MR BENNY CHAN TIN LUNG,</p> <p>5 MR PATRICK YEUNG KA PO, MR RICHARD LEE CHUN FAI,</p> <p>6 MR BILLY WONG LEONG TING (given in Cantonese; transcription</p> <p>7 of the simultaneous interpretation)</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Good morning. We thank Mr James Wong and the</p> <p>9 other representatives of the New Lantao Bus Company who</p> <p>10 have attended today to assist the committee by</p> <p>11 supplementing what they have provided already in written</p> <p>12 submissions with answers to questions that counsel to</p> <p>13 the committee will ask of them.</p> <p>14 Before we reach that stage, I understand, Mr Wong,</p> <p>15 that you wish to make a short statement orally in</p> <p>16 opening, and I would invite you to move to that now.</p> <p>17 Opening statement by MR JAMES WONG CHEUK ON:</p> <p>18 MR JAMES WONG: Mr Chairman, members, counsel, ladies and</p> <p>19 gentlemen, good morning. I am Wong Cheuk On, James.</p> <p>20 I am the managing director of the New Lantao Bus Company</p> <p>21 (1973) Ltd. My colleagues and myself would like to</p> <p>22 thank the committee for inviting us to attend today's</p> <p>23 hearing to give oral evidence.</p> <p>24 We are open-minded on the examination of the</p> <p>25 franchised bus system by the Independent Review</p>	Page 3	<p>1 questions on those new matters, but I would ask counsel,</p> <p>2 Ms Wong, to begin questioning.</p> <p>3 Examination by MS WONG</p> <p>4 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. Mr Wong, good morning, and good</p> <p>5 morning, gentlemen, and thank you for attending the</p> <p>6 committee this morning, and thank you for your opening</p> <p>7 statement, Ms Wong.</p> <p>8 There are a number of matters that I would wish to</p> <p>9 explore with you arising from the submissions that you</p> <p>10 have already supplied to the committee.</p> <p>11 In your submissions, the number of part-time bus</p> <p>12 captains employed by your company, if we can see at NLB</p> <p>13 bundle 1, page 17 -- we can see in the table the number</p> <p>14 of part-time bus captains employed by your company has</p> <p>15 nearly tripled in the past six years. As we can see, 13</p> <p>16 part-time bus captains in 2012, that is about</p> <p>17 9.4 per cent of 137 total bus captains, to 2017, where</p> <p>18 we have 53 part-time bus captains, constituting</p> <p>19 27 per cent of the total 183 bus captains employed by</p> <p>20 the company. And we can see throughout the years the</p> <p>21 employment and proportion of the part-time bus captains</p> <p>22 has been constantly rising between 2012 and 2018.</p> <p>23 Can you first of all tell us why there has been such</p> <p>24 a substantial increase?</p> <p>25 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you. First of all, let me make</p>
Page 2	<p>1 Committee on Hong Kong's Franchised Bus Service. We</p> <p>2 have all along been operating our bus service in strict</p> <p>3 compliance with the relevant legislation, franchise</p> <p>4 terms as well as the guidelines issued by the Transport</p> <p>5 Department. In recent months, we have implemented and</p> <p>6 will implement the following measures in our daily</p> <p>7 operation as well as administration, with a view to</p> <p>8 enhancing the safety level in operating our bus service.</p> <p>9 First, increasing the number of hours and the</p> <p>10 instructor-to-trainee ratio of driving training for our</p> <p>11 bus captains; second, requiring the part-time bus</p> <p>12 captains to declare more information about their</p> <p>13 principal employment; third, setting up a Bus Captain</p> <p>14 Training School to assist qualified persons in obtaining</p> <p>15 bus driving licences; and fourthly, making reference to</p> <p>16 international standards in raising the standard of safe</p> <p>17 driving.</p> <p>18 We apologise for not being able to provide written</p> <p>19 information in time on the aforementioned measures to</p> <p>20 the committee. We are pleased to provide detailed</p> <p>21 information at today's hearing. If necessary, we can</p> <p>22 submit more detailed information after the hearing.</p> <p>23 Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr Wong. I'm sure, from what you've</p> <p>25 said in your statement, that counsel will be asking you</p>	Page 4	<p>1 a point. From the perspective of the company, whether</p> <p>2 a bus captain is full-time or part-time, in relation to</p> <p>3 the safety requirements of the driving skills, we don't</p> <p>4 make a distinction. In other words, we won't harbour</p> <p>5 the thinking that part-time bus captains would drive</p> <p>6 more dangerously. We don't think this happens.</p> <p>7 And regarding the counsel's question, that is</p> <p>8 between 2012 and 2017, why the number of part-time bus</p> <p>9 captains has been increasing all the time -- well, for</p> <p>10 full-time and part-time bus captains, I think the major</p> <p>11 difference is that part-time bus captains can turn up</p> <p>12 for work for fewer days. In other words, they have more</p> <p>13 flexibility concerning their work as well as their</p> <p>14 leave. They can make their own arrangements.</p> <p>15 And we are different from two other companies. For</p> <p>16 part-time bus captains and full-time bus captains, they</p> <p>17 were very different in their case, but for the case of</p> <p>18 the New Lantao Bus Company, other than salary, we are</p> <p>19 not able to give too many fringe benefits to our</p> <p>20 full-time bus captains. Say, for example, for other bus</p> <p>21 companies, for the full-time bus captains, they do have</p> <p>22 a concessionary fare card for their family members. In</p> <p>23 our case, as of today and as a result of the use of</p> <p>24 Octopus cards, we are not able to share such</p> <p>25 concessionary cards with the other two bus companies.</p>

Page 5	Page 7
<p>1 In other words, the fringe benefits for our bus captains 2 is such that their family members can have a free ride 3 on New Lantao buses but not on other buses of other bus 4 companies. 5 Of course, I won't know the details about the number 6 of such cards given to the family members, but you can 7 see that there is a very clear distinction between 8 full-time and part-time bus captains. 9 I also mentioned that in the case of part-time bus 10 captains, they are able to have a greater flexibility in 11 terms of the number of working days, and that's why many 12 colleagues are interested in becoming part-time bus 13 captains. 14 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thanks for your answer, but my question is 15 actually: do you know why there has been such 16 a substantial increase in terms of the number of 17 part-time captains over the years? 18 MR JAMES WONG: When we recruit our staff, we recruit both 19 full-time as well as part-time bus captains. It won't 20 be because of financial reasons or any other 21 work-related reasons we are interested in part-time 22 rather than full-time bus captains. No, that's not the 23 case. 24 A candidate will approach us for recruitment. We 25 tell him about the package for full-time as well as</p>	<p>1 part-time bus captains. That's my view. 2 On the other hand, as I have said, in fact we did 3 think about it and some colleagues also told us about 4 the small difference between the pay for full-time and 5 part-time bus captains, and then to individual bus 6 captains, since our franchised service is rather focused 7 on the Lantao district only, so if somebody isn't living 8 on Lantao Island, then, as I have said, the 9 concessionary card for the family members will not be 10 attractive. 11 So, in the trade, somebody has said that such 12 a concessionary card would have the value of \$1,000 if 13 you take a ride every day. For us, for our full-time 14 bus captains, this isn't something that they have when 15 they compare with other bus captains from other bus 16 companies. 17 When you asked for the reason, of course, on our 18 part, we can't be sure about the reason in individual 19 cases. It is up to them to make a choice. But I think 20 probably it is due to the fact that the pay isn't really 21 that different, among other reasons. 22 MS MAGGIE WONG: Does your company regularly recruit 23 full-time bus captains who have retired, to take up 24 employment as part-time bus captains? 25 MR JAMES WONG: Counsel, was it your question that whether</p>
Page 6	Page 8
<p>1 part-time bus captains. Of course we welcome him as a 2 full-time bus captain, because in terms of deployment, 3 it's easier for the company because we are certain about 4 the number of working days from this full-time bus 5 captain. For part-time bus captains, it's uncertain, 6 and of course the decision is in the hands of the 7 candidate. If somebody would like to be a part-time bus 8 captain, we can't impose a wish on him and say, "You 9 must be full-time." You may ask why we haven't been 10 employing more people. Well, in fact, it was only in 11 recent years we have seen a greater number of routes and 12 we have recruited more people and that's why we have 13 seen an increase. 14 You ask why more part-time and not more full-time 15 bus captains. That's the explanation. It's up to the 16 candidate to choose. So it is not for us to make 17 a choice. 18 MS MAGGIE WONG: So, if I understand correctly, it's because 19 of the manpower shortage, or there are other reasons, or 20 because of the pay? Or there is increase in manpower 21 supply because of the increase in demand of bus 22 captains? 23 MR JAMES WONG: You asked for the reason. As I have said in 24 the outset, I don't think, if you say there is 25 a shortage, it means we would not even be able to get</p>	<p>1 we recruit our retirees? 2 INTERPRETER: Yes. 3 MR JAMES WONG: Yes, we did. When a colleague retires, and 4 if his health condition is still fit for taking up the 5 duty as a bus captain, then we will offer to him that he 6 should stay with us. 7 MS MAGGIE WONG: What is the approximate percentage? 8 CHAIRMAN: What is the retirement age for full-time bus 9 captains? 10 MR JAMES WONG: 65. 11 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 12 MR JAMES WONG: Can we provide the information after the 13 hearing? At this moment, I'm afraid we don't know how 14 many retired bus captains have become part-time bus 15 captains. But initially I don't think there are too 16 many of them at this moment. 17 MS MAGGIE WONG: In your introductory remarks, you stated 18 that in recent months your company has implemented and 19 will implement measures in your daily operation and 20 administration, with a view to enhance safety level in 21 operating buses. This includes requiring the part-time 22 bus captains to declare more detailed information about 23 their principal employment. 24 You also stated you are pleased to provide further 25 information to the chairman and members at the hearing</p>

Page 9	Page 11
<p>1 today.</p> <p>2 Can you tell us, first of all, what are the new</p> <p>3 measures?</p> <p>4 MR JAMES WONG: May I defer to Mr Benny Chan?</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: Yes, please do.</p> <p>6 MR BENNY CHAN: Thank you, Mr Chairman. Mainly speaking, we</p> <p>7 have enhanced the requirement that part-time bus</p> <p>8 captains must declare to us their principal employment</p> <p>9 as well as the number of working hours, so as to</p> <p>10 safeguard us, so that we can meet the requirements of</p> <p>11 the Transport Department.</p> <p>12 MS MAGGIE WONG: So since when did you implement these</p> <p>13 measures?</p> <p>14 MR BENNY CHAN: For this measure, it was introduced recently</p> <p>15 in June.</p> <p>16 MS MAGGIE WONG: So do I understand it correctly, before</p> <p>17 June, there is no requirement for part-time bus captains</p> <p>18 to declare information about their principal employment?</p> <p>19 MR BENNY CHAN: Well, when a bus captain joins us, we do</p> <p>20 require the bus captain to make a declaration about his</p> <p>21 work. Now, the difference is that within a certain</p> <p>22 period of time, we will ask the bus captain to make</p> <p>23 a declaration again to update the information.</p> <p>24 MS MAGGIE WONG: Do all part-time bus captains have to fill</p> <p>25 in a form?</p>	<p>1 to whether they are currently working part-time or the</p> <p>2 work nature and the working hours. And earlier, when</p> <p>3 you gave evidence, you said the form itself does provide</p> <p>4 declaration for that kind of information. Can you tell</p> <p>5 us where?</p> <p>6 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you. I would like to say that in this</p> <p>7 form, when they are required to fill in, at the time</p> <p>8 when they join us, we require the person to declare to</p> <p>9 us where they have worked before. But indeed, in this</p> <p>10 form, there is no requirement to do so, because their</p> <p>11 employment may be clerical and not related to driving.</p> <p>12 So there is no requirement of stating the number of work</p> <p>13 hours in the old form.</p> <p>14 And in the new form which Mr Chan mentioned, it has</p> <p>15 this added.</p> <p>16 MS MAGGIE WONG: So it's not simply a form but a new</p> <p>17 employment contract, if I understand correctly? Or it</p> <p>18 is two different things?</p> <p>19 MR JAMES WONG: It's not a contract. Serving part-time bus</p> <p>20 captains will have to file this declaration.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: And have you revised this employment</p> <p>22 contract since June?</p> <p>23 MR JAMES WONG: No, not this one.</p> <p>24 MS MAGGIE WONG: And if I may take you to the declaration</p> <p>25 paragraphs in the current form at page 472, in all these</p>
<p>Page 10</p> <p>1 MR BENNY CHAN: The part-time bus captain, upon joining the</p> <p>2 company, has to declare, by filling out the information,</p> <p>3 as shown on the screen, there is a form.</p> <p>4 MS MAGGIE WONG: We will come to that form in a moment, but</p> <p>5 after June, do you have a new form requiring the</p> <p>6 part-time bus captains to declare their working hours,</p> <p>7 before their employment?</p> <p>8 MR BENNY CHAN: Yes, we do. We have already prepared a new</p> <p>9 form for the bus captains to declare their work details.</p> <p>10 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can we have a sample of that form, if</p> <p>11 convenient?</p> <p>12 MR BENNY CHAN: Yes. Later on, we can provide it to the</p> <p>13 committee.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: Please do so, and there's an earlier matter that</p> <p>15 you indicated that you would supply information. That</p> <p>16 was Mr James Wong, who said that you would provide</p> <p>17 information as to the number of retired full-time bus</p> <p>18 captains who work part-time. So that's the second item</p> <p>19 on the shopping list, as it were.</p> <p>20 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) Okay.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: Now, Mr Wong, you earlier referred to your</p> <p>22 current application form. If I can take you to</p> <p>23 bundle 2, NLB-2, page 468.</p> <p>24 If we look at the form, the form itself does not</p> <p>25 require part-time bus captains to provide information as</p>	<p>Page 12</p> <p>1 paragraphs of your existing form, it does not</p> <p>2 specifically require the part-time bus captains to</p> <p>3 declare if they have adequate rest time before</p> <p>4 commencing their duties? Can you confirm that?</p> <p>5 MR JAMES WONG: That is right. I confirm that.</p> <p>6 MS MAGGIE WONG: And just now you said there would be</p> <p>7 certain period of time where you would require part-time</p> <p>8 bus captains to declare the information. Under these</p> <p>9 new measures, how regularly or what is the period of</p> <p>10 time would you require part-time bus captains to declare</p> <p>11 principal employment and working hours?</p> <p>12 MR JAMES WONG: At this stage, our plan is to ask the</p> <p>13 colleague to, starting from June -- well, because they</p> <p>14 are part-time bus captains, they won't come to work</p> <p>15 every day; they will have to furnish all the information</p> <p>16 to us. That is to start with.</p> <p>17 Just now, you asked about the frequency of making</p> <p>18 such a declaration. Our thinking at this moment is once</p> <p>19 a year. Say, for example, in a year's time, they will</p> <p>20 have to update the record.</p> <p>21 But this is a new measure, after all, so we think</p> <p>22 that perhaps in three months' time there will be</p> <p>23 a review on the frequency and whether this measure is</p> <p>24 appropriate and sufficient.</p> <p>25 MS MAGGIE WONG: And in your new form, is there any</p>

Page 13	Page 15
<p>1 requirement which requires an employee to oblige to</p> <p>2 inform you if he changes his outside employment or</p> <p>3 undertakes new employment, given it will be an annual</p> <p>4 declaration?</p> <p>5 MR JAMES WONG: Yes. Yes. It's there.</p> <p>6 MS MAGGIE WONG: If I could go back to the previous</p> <p>7 practice --</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Before you do that -- are we to understand that</p> <p>9 this process has begun with you asking part-time bus</p> <p>10 captains to declare their principal employment and their</p> <p>11 working hours, that you've already started asking some</p> <p>12 bus captains, part-time ones, those questions?</p> <p>13 MR JAMES WONG: Yes. Yes. We have begun doing that.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: Have any of these part-time bus captains declared</p> <p>15 that they do have other employment and have given you</p> <p>16 their working hours?</p> <p>17 MR JAMES WONG: Yes, indeed, Chairman.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: Have any of them told you they have other</p> <p>19 employment involving driving?</p> <p>20 MR JAMES WONG: Yes.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Are you able to illustrate, by reference to one</p> <p>22 of the bus captains, what kind of employment and how</p> <p>23 much driving was involved in this other job?</p> <p>24 MR JAMES WONG: Chairman, the initial information we have</p> <p>25 got -- well, I hope that you would give us some time to</p>	<p>1 [ed] to part-time bus captain applicant that they have</p> <p>2 to ensure sufficient rest time and separation time from</p> <p>3 other external employment."</p> <p>4 My question is this. Apart from verbally conveying</p> <p>5 to these part-time bus captains that they have to ensure</p> <p>6 sufficient rest time and separation time, are there any</p> <p>7 requirement or disclosure made by part-time bus captains</p> <p>8 as to the number of hours they worked prior to coming to</p> <p>9 their duties in your company?</p> <p>10 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you. At the time when we furnished</p> <p>11 the information, there was no such thing. It was only</p> <p>12 verbally. It was the information we have supplied.</p> <p>13 There is a new measure that we require them to declare</p> <p>14 the information.</p> <p>15 MS MAGGIE WONG: So prior to June 2018, there was no way you</p> <p>16 could ascertain if the part-time bus captains have been</p> <p>17 working over the working hours as stipulated in the</p> <p>18 guidelines, apart from this verbal assurance?</p> <p>19 MR JAMES WONG: That is right. Prior to June -- well, to</p> <p>20 a certain extent, today -- we rely on face-to-face</p> <p>21 communication with bus captains in relation to their</p> <p>22 working hours of the principal employment.</p> <p>23 MS MAGGIE WONG: Now, if I may take you to some of the</p> <p>24 documents that we have seen from other bus companies.</p> <p>25 If I may take you to CTB bundle 2, page 400.</p>
Page 14	Page 16
<p>1 collate the information. From the initial information</p> <p>2 we have received, there are part-time bus captains,</p> <p>3 according to them, that they are bus captains working</p> <p>4 for a hotel. According to the information supplied to</p> <p>5 the company, they work on average five days a week. Per</p> <p>6 working day, the average driving time is about eight</p> <p>7 hours. That is just an example.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Can you give us some idea of how many of your</p> <p>9 part-time bus captains you have asked these questions</p> <p>10 of, so far?</p> <p>11 MR JAMES WONG: There are 30 or so of them who have replied</p> <p>12 to us. It's about 80 per cent of our part-time bus</p> <p>13 captains, those 30 or so bus captains.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr Wong.</p> <p>15 Yes, Ms Wong.</p> <p>16 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you, Mr Wong.</p> <p>17 If I may take you to your submissions at NLB</p> <p>18 bundle 1, page 31, the third box from the right. You</p> <p>19 submitted that you:</p> <p>20 "... require the applicant to submit their past and</p> <p>21 existing employment information in the application</p> <p>22 form ... During the recruitment process, we will explain</p> <p>23 to applicant, no matter he/she apply for part-time or</p> <p>24 full-time bus captain vacancy, their working arrangement</p> <p>25 is regulated by [the guidelines] ... and verbally convey</p>	<p>1 At page 401, that's page 2 of the original document,</p> <p>2 headed, "Important information", item 3, it reads:</p> <p>3 "Are you currently working part-time? If yes, what</p> <p>4 is the work nature and [the] working hours?"</p> <p>5 This is the Citybus application form, and as one can</p> <p>6 tell, it requires the employee to specifically state in</p> <p>7 the employment contract whether they have other</p> <p>8 part-time employment.</p> <p>9 Would you consider adopting this form, in revising</p> <p>10 your employee application form?</p> <p>11 MR JAMES WONG: The document you just showed me -- well,</p> <p>12 I will have to look further into it with my colleagues.</p> <p>13 My initial thinking is it is of high reference value.</p> <p>14 We will consider adopting or enhancing such measures.</p> <p>15 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, and also, if we continue on page 404</p> <p>16 in Chinese, and English at page 404-1 to 404-2, we can</p> <p>17 see that is a requirement, perhaps similar to your new</p> <p>18 form, called "Employee Code of Conduct and</p> <p>19 Discipline/Declaration for External Works", setting out</p> <p>20 in details not only the employment, the employer's</p> <p>21 company, working hours, salary, and we can see at the</p> <p>22 bottom, part C, "Signature", it requires specific</p> <p>23 declarations, requiring the employee to strictly comply</p> <p>24 with the terms of disclosure.</p> <p>25 Would you consider adopting this in your new form,</p>

Page 17	Page 19
<p>1 if it hasn't contained similar paragraphs?</p> <p>2 MR JAMES WONG: Well, we have just seen this form. We have</p> <p>3 to look further into it. Any good suggestions will be</p> <p>4 adopted by us, but I don't have time to go into it.</p> <p>5 I would need time to go into it when we go back.</p> <p>6 MS MAGGIE WONG: Before I move on to another topic, I would</p> <p>7 like to ask something about disclosure of driving</p> <p>8 offence points during recruitment.</p> <p>9 In your submission, you state that you request all</p> <p>10 bus captains, full-time or not, to compulsorily declare</p> <p>11 their driving offence point record annually and report</p> <p>12 to company when their points records changed, and then</p> <p>13 there would be random cross-check to be conducted, to</p> <p>14 make sure information provided by staff is true and</p> <p>15 accurate.</p> <p>16 My first question is, would you check the driving</p> <p>17 offence points of your bus captains before you employ</p> <p>18 them?</p> <p>19 MR JAMES WONG: I will defer to Mr Benny Chan.</p> <p>20 MR BENNY CHAN: Chairman, at the time of recruitment, before</p> <p>21 we employ them, we will require the bus captain to</p> <p>22 obtain a record. This record will show the</p> <p>23 driving-offence points.</p> <p>24 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. If I may take you to TD</p> <p>25 bundle 1. It is a paper submitted by the Transport</p>	<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on, Ms Wong -- would you provide</p> <p>2 the information as to when it was that this check took</p> <p>3 place?</p> <p>4 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) Yes, sure.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>6 Yes, Ms Wong.</p> <p>7 MS MAGGIE WONG: Apart from providing the information, can</p> <p>8 you tell us about this checking of driving offence</p> <p>9 points? When is this new policy, or what is the policy</p> <p>10 before June 2018? Do you know?</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: I think Mr Wong has told us that this began, he</p> <p>12 thinks, at the beginning of 2018, not June, but the</p> <p>13 beginning of the year.</p> <p>14 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) That's right. Should be.</p> <p>15 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. Now, if we look at paragraph 4, it</p> <p>16 states that:</p> <p>17 "... Citybus ... and New World First Bus Services</p> <p>18 Ltd ... will not offer employment to applicants who have</p> <p>19 incurred 9 or above driving-offence points in the recent</p> <p>20 2 years."</p> <p>21 Whilst:</p> <p>22 "... KMB and Long Win Bus ... will not offer</p> <p>23 employment to applicants who have incurred 9 or above</p> <p>24 driving-offence points in the recent 3 years ..."</p> <p>25 Can you tell us what is your company's policy in</p>
Page 18	Page 20
<p>1 Department at page 135, paragraph 4. It states in the</p> <p>2 first sentence:</p> <p>3 "All FB operators, except the New Lantao Bus</p> <p>4 Company ..., will also check the driving offence points</p> <p>5 of their bus captain applicants."</p> <p>6 It appears from what is stated in the Transport</p> <p>7 Department's submission that apart from your company,</p> <p>8 all other operators will check the driving-offence</p> <p>9 points of their bus captain applicants.</p> <p>10 Do you have any comment as to this sentence?</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: From what you've said earlier, this statement is</p> <p>12 inaccurate. Is that the position?</p> <p>13 MR JAMES WONG: I believe -- well, Mr Chan talks about the</p> <p>14 check. It started at the beginning of 2018, and we have</p> <p>15 to go back to check when it was formally implemented.</p> <p>16 I think it was the beginning of 2018. When we supplied</p> <p>17 the information to the committee, we would not</p> <p>18 communicate with the Transport Department first.</p> <p>19 MS MAGGIE WONG: I understand.</p> <p>20 MR JAMES WONG: Perhaps in their record, this information is</p> <p>21 not updated. After all, this is internal measure of the</p> <p>22 company. Perhaps we did not mention this to the</p> <p>23 Transport Department in a meeting. That's why there is</p> <p>24 this misunderstanding.</p> <p>25 MS MAGGIE WONG: So do I understand correctly --</p>	<p>1 relation to this?</p> <p>2 MR JAMES WONG: We don't have detailed information for the</p> <p>3 time being. We are not like the other two companies</p> <p>4 whereby we have clear stipulation as to, say, in the</p> <p>5 recent two to three years, whereby you have certain</p> <p>6 points deducted, then you will not be hired. At this</p> <p>7 moment, we don't have such a policy.</p> <p>8 MS MAGGIE WONG: Would you consider adopting this policy?</p> <p>9 MR JAMES WONG: We will consider doing so.</p> <p>10 Now, we want to look at whether the bus captains</p> <p>11 have driving-offence points deducted, and actually we</p> <p>12 can observe that through their normal driving attitude.</p> <p>13 We will consider adopting such a policy, but at this</p> <p>14 moment, if you are to say specifically whether it's</p> <p>15 seven points, nine points, two years or three years, I</p> <p>16 cannot give you a definite answer. We will consider</p> <p>17 doing so.</p> <p>18 MS MAGGIE WONG: Based on your answer, do I understand</p> <p>19 correctly that prior to 2018, your company have not</p> <p>20 checked the driving-offence points of part-time bus</p> <p>21 captains at all?</p> <p>22 MR JAMES WONG: Chairman, can you give us some time to</p> <p>23 collect the relevant information and pass the same on to</p> <p>24 the committee later?</p> <p>25 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you.</p>

Page 21	Page 23
<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Very well. Thank you.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: Now, moving on to another topic, the use of</p> <p>3 non-franchised buses.</p> <p>4 MEMBER LO: I have a question.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: Prof Lo wishes to ask a question.</p> <p>6 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes.</p> <p>7 MEMBER LO: I just want to clarify that the use of higher</p> <p>8 percentage of part-time bus captains, is that a strategy</p> <p>9 of the company or is it a consequence of your ability to</p> <p>10 hire full-time, that you cannot hire enough full-time,</p> <p>11 so you become hiring part-time? So which is which?</p> <p>12 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you, Professor. Is it the company's</p> <p>13 policy to hire part-time bus captains? Definitely not.</p> <p>14 The counsel has also asked why there is a high ratio of</p> <p>15 part-time bus captains. Before the committee's hearing,</p> <p>16 for myself, I don't know the number of part-time bus</p> <p>17 captains in other companies. Only after the hearing did</p> <p>18 I learn about the higher ratio of part-time bus captains</p> <p>19 in our company versus other bus companies.</p> <p>20 So we've been pondering what the real issue is here.</p> <p>21 Of course, we are inclined to hiring more full-time</p> <p>22 rather than part-time bus captains.</p> <p>23 MS MAGGIE WONG: Following on that question, Mr Wong, in</p> <p>24 your submission at page 18, NLB bundle 1 at page 18, and</p> <p>25 if we can see the paragraph right below paragraph 6 and</p>	<p>1 As for a pay rise, we will do it on an annual basis</p> <p>2 depending on the actual circumstances.</p> <p>3 MS MAGGIE WONG: About this extra five days, that applies to</p> <p>4 all full-time employees? Is that the case?</p> <p>5 MR JAMES WONG: Yes, that's correct, all full-time bus</p> <p>6 captains enjoy that.</p> <p>7 MS MAGGIE WONG: May I move on to another topic, use of</p> <p>8 non-franchised bus. At page 17, bundle NLB-1, if we can</p> <p>9 see right below the table, you stated, your company</p> <p>10 stated, that with the approval of the Transport</p> <p>11 Department, you:</p> <p>12 "... hire at least 30 non-franchised bus with bus</p> <p>13 captain from our contractor on every weekends, and this</p> <p>14 surplus of bus is almost 25 per cent extra of our</p> <p>15 fleet."</p> <p>16 First of all, you state "our contractor" -- is it</p> <p>17 one contractor or multiple suppliers?</p> <p>18 MR JAMES WONG: Just one contractor.</p> <p>19 MS MAGGIE WONG: And who is that contractor?</p> <p>20 MR JAMES WONG: It's called Kwoon Chung Motors.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: Now, these franchised buses is to cater for</p> <p>22 upsurge in passenger demand only in weekends and public</p> <p>23 holidays, is that correct? It does apply to weekdays?</p> <p>24 MR JAMES WONG: Correct.</p> <p>25 MS MAGGIE WONG: And in your supplementary submission filed</p>
<p>Page 22</p> <p>1 above section 5, "Journey time", it started with the</p> <p>2 words:</p> <p>3 "During the years, we are actively resourcing</p> <p>4 manpower from different means, such as joining career</p> <p>5 day organised by Labour Department and local charity</p> <p>6 communities, job referral ..."</p> <p>7 And the end of the paragraph states:</p> <p>8 "Together with employment condition improvement as</p> <p>9 mentioned in previous paragraph, we believe these</p> <p>10 measures can strengthen our manpower resourcing</p> <p>11 status ..."</p> <p>12 And you mention a number of measures from 1 to 6.</p> <p>13 Apart from those measures, have you considered other</p> <p>14 improvement measures, in terms of remuneration and</p> <p>15 benefits to part-time -- or full-time bus captains?</p> <p>16 MR JAMES WONG: For our company, every year, basically,</p> <p>17 there will be an adjustment of the salary. As for</p> <p>18 benefits, starting 2018, we are giving an extra five</p> <p>19 days of leave to our bus captains, in the trade</p> <p>20 generally. We will give labour days 12 days and we are</p> <p>21 giving them an extra five days, which is on a par with</p> <p>22 that of the white-collar workers.</p> <p>23 We hope the colleagues can enjoy more holidays and</p> <p>24 they can take more rest and they are given the</p> <p>25 flexibility to choose their leave days.</p>	<p>Page 24</p> <p>1 on 15 June 2018 at page 38, NLB-1, you attach the "no</p> <p>2 objection" letter from the Transport Department dated</p> <p>3 19 December 2017. Your letter, if we go back to</p> <p>4 page 37, also stated that the initial approval from the</p> <p>5 Transport Department was issued over the past 20 years,</p> <p>6 and that you have been locating or searching this</p> <p>7 document by different means.</p> <p>8 Have you been able to locate this initial approval</p> <p>9 document?</p> <p>10 MR JAMES WONG: No, I haven't been able to retrieve the</p> <p>11 information.</p> <p>12 MS MAGGIE WONG: Will you continue with the attempt?</p> <p>13 MR JAMES WONG: Yes, we will try to retrieve the initial</p> <p>14 letter. I joined the company in 2011 myself and I have</p> <p>15 asked the colleagues that have worked longer than</p> <p>16 myself. The letter was approved, I mean it was given,</p> <p>17 in 1990 and 1991, and on Lantau, back then, during</p> <p>18 holidays, there was a great surge in demand, but on</p> <p>19 weekend days there wasn't such a huge demand. We were</p> <p>20 talking about trips to Po Lin Monastery. At that time,</p> <p>21 not even a cable car was put in place or built, so the</p> <p>22 New Lantao Bus was given approval by the Transport</p> <p>23 Department to hire non-franchised buses to operate on</p> <p>24 public holiday to deal with the passenger demand peak.</p> <p>25 Our company, compared to the two bus companies, in</p>

Page 25	Page 27
<p>1 terms of our scale and the structure of our route, it 2 was very different from them. So conversely, actually, 3 the holidays, we are seeing a passenger demand peak, and 4 on weekdays we don't see such a big passenger demand. 5 So our starting point or rationale here is if just 6 for the sake of coping with the demand on weekends and 7 public holidays to procure an extra 20 to 30 per cent of 8 buses -- well, in the 1990s, the Tsing Ma Bridge was not 9 even built. I could not give you the exact size of our 10 fleet back then. So that's the arrangement put in place 11 back then and it lasts until today. 12 MS MAGGIE WONG: Now, this letter from the Transport 13 Department was dated 19 December 2017, but in the first 14 paragraph it makes reference to "your letter", 15 presumably your application on 4 December 2017, and the 16 first paragraph states that the Transport Department has 17 no objection to your application for deployment of 18 a maximum of 80 non-franchised buses on every Sunday and 19 public holidays for six months from 1 June 2018, 20 suspension period of Ngong Ping 360, et cetera; and 50 21 non-franchised buses on every Saturday in the periods 22 mentioned in subparagraph (2). 23 My first question is, who decides the number of 24 non-franchised buses to be deployed for those periods? 25 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you. It is our company which made the</p>	<p>1 Even -- it's not the case that for a Saturday and 2 a Sunday there would be a lot more passengers. For 3 example, if the weather is not that good, then the 4 situation would be affected. Now, the buses going to 5 Tai O and Ngong Ping will see passenger rise in public 6 holidays, but in, say, bad weather, the passenger number 7 will significantly drop. So at this juncture we don't 8 have plan to add more buses. 9 Say, however, if in the long term, if we see that 10 there is an increase in passenger demand from Monday to 11 Friday, then we will of course consider procuring our 12 own buses. 13 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. Who decided the six-month 14 period as set out in paragraphs (1) and (2) for the 15 deployment of non-franchised buses? 16 MR JAMES WONG: I believe it's the Transport Department, 17 half-year, you talk about half-year, that is the 18 Transport Department's decision. 19 MS MAGGIE WONG: Now, at the bottom it set out six 20 conditions by the Transport Department, (a) to (f), and 21 if I may summarise: 22 "(a) the buses must be below six years of age; 23 (b) the same franchised bus maintenance standard 24 must be adopted for the hired buses." 25 Now, what does it mean by "the same franchised bus</p>
Page 26	Page 28
<p>1 decision as to the extra number of buses needed. 2 MS MAGGIE WONG: And if I understand correctly, your total 3 amount or total number of franchised buses that you 4 operate are 130; is that correct? 5 MR JAMES WONG: More or less. Around 100, 130 or so. 6 MS MAGGIE WONG: So the percentage is quite significant, and 7 have you considered deploying or purchasing more buses 8 in future, to be managed by your company exclusively? 9 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you. In this letter, the Transport 10 Department approved the number, 80 and 50. That's the 11 maximum number. And in actual fact, why were we making 12 an application for a larger number? Usually, because 13 the contractor would sometimes tell us that because of 14 certain deployment situation or reasons, we need 15 a closed road permit to go into Lantau South for these 16 50 buses and the administration's approval is required 17 for them to provide the service. 18 So that's why we asked for more. Your question, on 19 whether we would be procuring more buses ourselves -- 20 for the time being, we don't have such a plan. That's 21 exactly because of what I just said. Even if we procure 22 more buses, it's just for the sole purpose of certain 23 passengers, on Saturdays and public holidays and 24 Sundays. But we are just talking about two days in 25 a week.</p>	<p>1 maintenance standard must be adopted for the hired 2 buses"; what does that include? 3 MR JAMES WONG: Can I defer to Mr Yeung to take that 4 question? 5 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr Yeung. 6 MR PATRICK YEUNG: Thank you, Chairman. For all 7 non-franchised buses, they will be treated the same as 8 the franchised buses in terms of repair and maintenance. 9 Every month, there will be a monthly inspection called 10 MI, and they have to go through an annual examination as 11 well, the same as franchised buses. 12 MS MAGGIE WONG: Does this include -- do you know if all 13 these non-franchised buses have black box or speed 14 limiters? 15 MR PATRICK YEUNG: Yes, they do. Yes, they do. 16 MS MAGGIE WONG: Is that a contractual requirement in the 17 contracts that you signed with this non-franchised bus 18 contractor? 19 MR JAMES WONG: We asked our contractor to fit out the 20 non-franchised bus to the same degree as our franchised 21 bus. So that's our original intention. 22 MS MAGGIE WONG: So prior to today is there a requirement 23 for all these non-franchised buses to have black box or 24 speed limiters installed? 25 CHAIRMAN: Whose requirement?</p>

Page 29	Page 31
<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: Whether your company requires the 2 non-franchised bus operators to install speed limiters 3 and black box before today.</p> <p>4 MR JAMES WONG: In fact, you can refer to item (d). It says 5 "similar on-vehicle facilities". Of course, we are 6 referring to those buses engaged by us to assist us. My 7 understanding is that as of today, in relation to 8 non-franchised buses, the TD does not have such 9 a requirement. So it is different in the case of 10 franchised buses.</p> <p>11 Here, it has already been said that if the 12 non-franchised bus is to be used by us and serving us, 13 then that bus should be equipped with the same 14 on-vehicle facilities as a franchised bus.</p> <p>15 MS MAGGIE WONG: Would there be any document --</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: Just allow me a moment. 17 Do you read paragraph (2)(d) as a Transport 18 Department requirement that you have a black box and 19 a speed limiter, or not?</p> <p>20 MR JAMES WONG: For item (d), of course, the term "black 21 box" hasn't been included. But my understanding, our 22 understanding, is that this is the requirement; it has 23 to be fitted. That's our understanding.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>25 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you provide us with a sample of the</p>	<p>1 Tung Chung Road. Rather, we are getting buses to travel 2 in South Lantau. I think that's what is meant here.</p> <p>3 MS MAGGIE WONG: Well, it appears that it set out a must 4 condition, that you have to have full-time drivers to 5 drive the Tung Chung Road bus routes. Is there anything 6 special about the Tung Chung Road bus routes? And also 7 it requires a specific condition that it has to receive 8 proper and adequate training by your company.</p> <p>9 MR JAMES WONG: I am not too sure. We are not too sure 10 about the reason for this condition. For us here, our 11 initial view, we believe that prior to the 12 reconstruction of Tung Chung Road, it was very, very 13 narrow, very different from what you see today as far as 14 the road conditions are concerned. But then back then, 15 I was too young to recall what it was like. But we 16 believe that as far as this condition or this 17 requirement is concerned, I think the prevailing road 18 conditions back then should be relevant. Perhaps we 19 will ask, "Tung Chung Road has been reconstructed, you 20 want to know why this particular condition remains 21 there?" Let me go back to check with my colleagues for 22 the details.</p> <p>23 My understanding is this is a letter issued by the 24 Transport Department on a half-yearly basis. It's 25 a routine document. Perhaps we haven't reviewed as to</p>
Page 30	Page 32
<p>1 contract between your company and Kwoon Chung in respect 2 of the arrangement to use the non-franchised buses, 3 specifically the safety features?</p> <p>4 MR JAMES WONG: Yes, we can provide the information 5 afterwards.</p> <p>6 MS MAGGIE WONG: Maybe I should clarify. Before today, is 7 there a contractual requirement for Kwoon Chung to 8 provide non-franchised buses with black box and speed 9 limiters, contractual requirement? The question is 10 "contractual requirement".</p> <p>11 MR JAMES WONG: I think we need to go back to check the 12 document. Thank you.</p> <p>13 MS MAGGIE WONG: Now, if we go to the sixth requirement, 14 (f), it states: 15 "non-part-time drivers should be arranged to operate 16 the Tung Chung Road bus routes. They must have been 17 given proper and adequate training by your company." 18 Can you tell us: why single out the Tung Chung Road 19 bus routes?</p> <p>20 MR JAMES WONG: As I have said, for South Lantau, the routes 21 for South Lantau, will certainly go via Tung Chung Road, 22 because for you to go from Tung Chung to Tai O and 23 Ngong Ping and South Lantau, you have to go past 24 Tung Chung Road. For this to be singled out -- well, 25 of course we are not trying to get a bus to travel on</p>	<p>1 whether certain conditions no longer apply.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: And it says that --</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: Before you go on, Ms Wong -- perhaps, this being 4 a Transport Department letter, it's the Transport 5 Department who can tell us why the condition is there.</p> <p>6 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) Maybe.</p> <p>7 MS MAGGIE WONG: It also states that they must have been 8 given proper and adequate training by your company. 9 Have there been any arrangements to ensure these 10 full-time drivers of these non-franchised bus operators 11 or bus company should receive training by your company, 12 any arrangement?</p> <p>13 MR JAMES WONG: Mr Chairman, may I defer to Mr Lee?</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr Lee.</p> <p>15 MR RICHARD LEE: Mr Chairman, let me answer the question. 16 As far as training is concerned, for bus drivers plying 17 Tung Chung Road, from FB or non-FB, well, for South 18 Lantau, the roads are narrow and there are many bends. 19 Therefore, for bus captains travelling on such routes, 20 they have to receive a two-day route training to make 21 sure they are familiar with the road conditions and they 22 are alert.</p> <p>23 So, so far as the route training is concerned, 24 during that time our instructor will check if the bus 25 captains are skilful at manoeuvring the bends and they</p>

Page 33	Page 35
<p>1 are assessed. Therefore, for the non-FB bus captains 2 carrying out the duty for us, we do provide a route 3 training for them. 4 MS MAGGIE WONG: I believe the full-time bus captains 5 require five days' training, is that correct, if they 6 are to drive this route? 7 MR RICHARD LEE: If I may add a word here, counsel. For the 8 five-day training, that's for the new recruits, that's 9 the induction training. For serving bus captains, 10 depending on the needs, will adjust. Like for South 11 Lantau Road, we provide an extra two-day training. 12 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. 13 Now, is there any measure in place to monitor the 14 qualifications and driving records of these 15 non-franchised bus drivers? 16 MR JAMES WONG: We have the same treatment for franchised 17 buses and non-franchised buses, as far as our measures 18 are concerned. In other words, the answer is yes. 19 MS MAGGIE WONG: As of today? 20 MR JAMES WONG: Mmm. 21 MS MAGGIE WONG: So prior to 2018, is there any measure in 22 place to check the qualifications and driving records of 23 this non-franchised bus operator, or is this 24 a contractual requirement in your contract with 25 Kwoon Chung?</p>	<p>1 MR JAMES WONG: We did. We have. 2 MS MAGGIE WONG: When? When was that? 3 MR JAMES WONG: I have to go back to check. I believe it 4 must be end of May or early June. Say, for example, for 5 the letter shown on the screen, so it expired towards 6 the end of December, and we wrote in early December to 7 apply. 8 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you provide us with a copy of your 9 letter to the Transport Department? 10 MR JAMES WONG: Yes. 11 MS MAGGIE WONG: Have there been follow-up discussions about 12 this arrangement with the Transport Department since you 13 wrote the letter? 14 MR JAMES WONG: I don't quite understand your question. 15 MS MAGGIE WONG: Have there been discussions with the 16 Transport Department since you wrote the letter to renew 17 this arrangement? Any meetings? 18 MR JAMES WONG: We did meet with the Transport Department. 19 Well, as to the letter we wrote, as to the application 20 we have made, I don't think they are related to such. 21 MS MAGGIE WONG: Now, about this arrangement, do you wait 22 until you have received the approval from the Transport 23 Department before you sign the contract with Kwoon Chung 24 to provide non-franchised buses? 25 MR JAMES WONG: Well, as to our contract with the</p>
Page 34	Page 36
<p>1 MR JAMES WONG: Today, we do not require our contractor -- 2 well, just now, in the letter, you see the registration 3 numbers with information about the buses. As to the bus 4 captains -- well, it will involve a larger number of bus 5 captains rather than just 80 or 50 respectively. 6 Therefore, as of today, we do have a specific 7 requirement to ask for the details of the captains 8 involved. So we haven't got this as a current 9 requirement. 10 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, I don't understand that. Do you have this 11 requirement today or is this something you are going to 12 impose in the future? 13 MR JAMES WONG: We haven't got such a requirement as of 14 today. 15 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 16 Yes, Mr Auyeung. 17 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Thank you, Chairman. I want to stay on 18 this letter from the Transport Department. If I read 19 this letter correctly, this provision they have given 20 you will expire the end of June. Have you received 21 a new letter from Transport Department on similar 22 arrangement? 23 MR JAMES WONG: Not yet. 24 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Okay. Thank you. 25 MS MAGGIE WONG: Did you apply?</p>	<p>1 contractor, it is for a longer duration. I don't have 2 the information with me, but if my memory serves me 3 right, it's a three-year duration. So it won't be the 4 case that for every six months I get the approval from 5 the TD and then I sign a contract with the contractor. 6 No. It is a three-year contract, for -- if we need to 7 hire vehicles from them, then we do so. So that's the 8 arrangement. 9 So the TD requires renewal once every six months. 10 I think it is mainly because the TD would like to know 11 whether the vehicles are in line with their 12 requirements, like the year of age. 13 MS MAGGIE WONG: Now, you talked about the measure, earlier 14 on, that you would require the Kwoon Chung operators to 15 install speed limiters and black box from now on. Can 16 you tell us what is the measure to ensure that? 17 MR JAMES WONG: The installation of such devices would have 18 to be notified to us upon completion. 19 MS MAGGIE WONG: From now on. 20 MR JAMES WONG: It has been so all the time. After they 21 have installed the devices, they would inform us. Like 22 in the case of black boxes, of course we can check from 23 the system, in relation to the transmission of data or 24 data uploaded. So if you ask me as to whether we 25 regularly verify the arrangement, that is whether, when</p>

Page 37	Page 39
<p>1 the vehicle arrives, I will check it every time, we</p> <p>2 didn't, because we believe that the hardware installed</p> <p>3 will not be dismantled, so they would notify us the</p> <p>4 first time it has been installed.</p> <p>5 MS MAGGIE WONG: Is there any written record of such</p> <p>6 notification?</p> <p>7 MR JAMES WONG: I can go back to get it and give it to you.</p> <p>8 We haven't come prepared with that.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Please supply that, if you would.</p> <p>10 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) Sure.</p> <p>11 MS MAGGIE WONG: What is the measure, the current existing</p> <p>12 measure, to monitor the qualifications and driving</p> <p>13 records of these non-franchised bus drivers?</p> <p>14 MR JAMES WONG: Existing, as was mentioned, at this moment</p> <p>15 of time, we do not require the contractor to supply us</p> <p>16 with the information. For part-time bus captains, we</p> <p>17 would obtain the information, and we have plans to get</p> <p>18 the information from them.</p> <p>19 MS MAGGIE WONG: Would you ask for a similar requirement as</p> <p>20 you impose on your part-time bus captains, namely to</p> <p>21 sign a declaration form from all these non-franchised</p> <p>22 bus drivers, before they would be allowed to drive those</p> <p>23 buses?</p> <p>24 MR JAMES WONG: At this moment of time, we haven't made</p> <p>25 a decision as to how to implement the measure. We don't</p>	<p>1 have a black box. When will this black box information</p> <p>2 be used? Because they are driven by non-franchised</p> <p>3 operators, drivers. So would that ever be used to</p> <p>4 monitor their performance?</p> <p>5 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you. In our system today, we can see</p> <p>6 black box records of non-franchised buses. We have</p> <p>7 access to such records today.</p> <p>8 MEMBER LO: But are they used? Are such information ever</p> <p>9 used to assess their performance?</p> <p>10 MR JAMES WONG: It's not just the non-franchised buses. In</p> <p>11 our fleet, black box has already been installed. Let's</p> <p>12 leave the non-franchised buses aside first. We use</p> <p>13 random checks to check every month whether there are</p> <p>14 problems with the buses or with the driving of the</p> <p>15 drivers.</p> <p>16 For non-franchised buses, I believe that we use the</p> <p>17 same approach, but I have to go back to ask my</p> <p>18 colleagues as to random checks are conducted on their 80</p> <p>19 buses during Saturdays and Sundays, because I can't give</p> <p>20 you a definite answer now. But that is our general</p> <p>21 approach in relation to random checks.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on, are there none of the six of</p> <p>23 you who are able to answer that question? It's a simple</p> <p>24 enough question. Do you actually check the black boxes</p> <p>25 of the non-franchised buses?</p>
Page 38	Page 40
<p>1 have a definite decision yet. I believe that we will</p> <p>2 adopt the same practice whether they are permanent staff</p> <p>3 or not. We don't have a decision yet.</p> <p>4 MS MAGGIE WONG: So at this moment, do I understand</p> <p>5 correctly, your company would not know as of today</p> <p>6 whether any of these non-franchised bus drivers used on</p> <p>7 any particular day have any previous driving-related</p> <p>8 records, nor their experience?</p> <p>9 MR JAMES WONG: When it comes to Kwoon Chung Motors, it's</p> <p>10 not completely independent from us. It's not the case</p> <p>11 that we don't know anything about them. Kwoon Chung</p> <p>12 Motors is a shareholder of New Lantao Bus Company. In</p> <p>13 relation to staff of Kwoon Chung Motors, when it comes</p> <p>14 to New Lantao Bus Company -- well, we don't have their</p> <p>15 files, but when it comes to recruitment, we have adopted</p> <p>16 certain measures to ensure that they are qualified bus</p> <p>17 captains. We will collate the information and give it</p> <p>18 to you.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Please do.</p> <p>20 Yes, Professor.</p> <p>21 MEMBER LO: The question -- there are three types of</p> <p>22 drivers: full-time, part-time, and also drivers driving</p> <p>23 on those non-franchised buses. They have different</p> <p>24 treatments in terms of the last group.</p> <p>25 Now, the question is, the non-franchised buses also</p>	<p>1 MR BENNY CHAN: I would like to supplement, Chairman. At</p> <p>2 the moment, we don't really take the initiative to check</p> <p>3 the information in the black box. When we receive</p> <p>4 complaints, we will conduct random checks of the</p> <p>5 information of the black box to investigate into the</p> <p>6 incidents.</p> <p>7 MS MAGGIE WONG: Following from your --</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Forgive me -- so you respond to complaints; is</p> <p>9 that it?</p> <p>10 MR BENNY CHAN: That is right.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: And accidents?</p> <p>12 MR BENNY CHAN: Right.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: But do you do random checks on black boxes on</p> <p>14 non-franchised buses?</p> <p>15 MR BENNY CHAN: Yes, we do that too.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>17 At some stage, Ms Wong, we are going to take</p> <p>18 a 20-minute break. It's a matter for you when it's</p> <p>19 convenient.</p> <p>20 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. Maybe I will follow up with the</p> <p>21 question on the safety performance.</p> <p>22 Mr Wong, apart from this question, any measures in</p> <p>23 place to monitor the safety performance of these drivers</p> <p>24 of non-franchised buses whilst they are being used by</p> <p>25 your company? For example, mystery rides, or would you</p>

Page 41	Page 43
<p>1 put your staff on these buses to monitor performance?</p> <p>2 MR BENNY CHAN: Chairman, every month we have used mystery</p> <p>3 shoppers. We don't distinguish between New Lantao Bus</p> <p>4 Company's or non-franchised buses.</p> <p>5 MS MAGGIE WONG: So these secret checks of bus captain</p> <p>6 performance apply to all three types of bus captains?</p> <p>7 MR BENNY CHAN: That is right.</p> <p>8 MS MAGGIE WONG: So if you find there are performance that</p> <p>9 are substandard or over-speeding, what disciplinary</p> <p>10 actions would you take on these non-franchised bus</p> <p>11 drivers?</p> <p>12 MR BENNY CHAN: If we find, let's say, for example,</p> <p>13 speeding, we will issue a warning letter. We may even</p> <p>14 suspend the bus driver from working on Lantau Island.</p> <p>15 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Chairman, that may be an appropriate</p> <p>16 time.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: Yes, very well.</p> <p>18 Mr Wong and your fellow colleagues, we are going to</p> <p>19 take a 20-minute break now and then we will resume at</p> <p>20 11.50 by that clock. Thank you.</p> <p>21 (11.29 am)</p> <p>22 (A short adjournment)</p> <p>23 (11.50 am)</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: Yes.</p> <p>25 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p>	<p>1 Are you able to confirm, or based on your</p> <p>2 understanding, whether all these non-franchised buses</p> <p>3 are equipped with the same safety features as set out at</p> <p>4 page 453?</p> <p>5 MR JAMES WONG: Sorry, it will take a while for me to</p> <p>6 confirm this. For these 24 items, say, for example, for</p> <p>7 double-decker buses -- excuse me, yes, I confirm that.</p> <p>8 I just tried to check with my colleague. We did indeed</p> <p>9 hire double-deckers as well, and all these safety</p> <p>10 features are there. Thank you.</p> <p>11 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. Now, just a few follow-up</p> <p>12 questions on -- you mentioned that you hired</p> <p>13 non-franchised buses from Kwoon Chung Bus Holdings;</p> <p>14 correct? You hired non-franchised bus buses from</p> <p>15 Kwoon Chung Bus Holdings?</p> <p>16 MR JAMES WONG: Kwoon Chung Motors.</p> <p>17 MS MAGGIE WONG: Kwoon Chung Motors?</p> <p>18 MR JAMES WONG: Correct.</p> <p>19 MS MAGGIE WONG: Is it correct that New Lantao Bus is</p> <p>20 a 99.99 per cent owned subsidiary of Kwoon Chung Bus</p> <p>21 Holdings, a listed company?</p> <p>22 MR JAMES WONG: The parent company is Kwoon Chung Holdings.</p> <p>23 Maybe other companies are used to hold shares of NLB.</p> <p>24 I have to check. But ultimately the parent company is</p> <p>25 Kwoon Chung Bus Holdings.</p>
Page 42	Page 44
<p>1 MR JAMES WONG: Excuse me, Chairman, I would like to provide</p> <p>2 some supplementary information. Excuse me.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: Yes, please supplement.</p> <p>4 MR JAMES WONG: In relation to new bus captains, our</p> <p>5 checking of their records, I would like to supplement</p> <p>6 that we did not start doing that only in 2018. This has</p> <p>7 been a long-established practice. We have been doing it</p> <p>8 for many years. What we meant by starting in 2018 is</p> <p>9 that in the past, we used to select some bus captains by</p> <p>10 random and check on their records, and what we started</p> <p>11 in the beginning of 2018, for all bus captains we</p> <p>12 checked, on all of them.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>14 MR JAMES WONG: So we will do it annually.</p> <p>15 MS MAGGIE WONG: You mean the driving offence records or</p> <p>16 other records?</p> <p>17 MR JAMES WONG: Yes, correct.</p> <p>18 MS MAGGIE WONG: Just a few follow-up questions, Mr Wong.</p> <p>19 Earlier on, you said on the safety features that the</p> <p>20 physical hardware on the non-franchised bus -- you said</p> <p>21 earlier on that these buses are equipped with the same</p> <p>22 on-vehicle facilities as franchised buses.</p> <p>23 May I take you to bundle NLB-2, page 453. It set</p> <p>24 out a list of bus safety features adapted in NLB buses,</p> <p>25 and that includes 24 features.</p>	<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: Is your company, in other words, renting</p> <p>2 non-franchised buses from your parent company?</p> <p>3 MR JAMES WONG: Correct. We have gone through an open</p> <p>4 tender exercise.</p> <p>5 MS MAGGIE WONG: Is it correct that both Mr Wong, yourself,</p> <p>6 and Mr Timothy Wong, are senior management of</p> <p>7 Kwoon Chung Bus Holdings as well?</p> <p>8 MR JAMES WONG: I am the managing director of Kwoon Chung</p> <p>9 and Mr Timothy Wong is the operations director of</p> <p>10 Kwoon Chung.</p> <p>11 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. As of 2017, the chairman of</p> <p>12 Kwoon Chung is Mr Matthew Wong Leung Pak, who is your</p> <p>13 father; is that correct?</p> <p>14 MR JAMES WONG: Correct.</p> <p>15 MS MAGGIE WONG: My question is this. How is the hiring</p> <p>16 price delivered when your company is renting</p> <p>17 non-franchised buses from its parent company,</p> <p>18 Kwoon Chung, or agreed? How is the price agreed?</p> <p>19 MR JAMES WONG: As I said, once every three years, we will</p> <p>20 have an open tender exercise.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: And how is the hiring price determined?</p> <p>22 MR JAMES WONG: The tenderer makes a decision about the</p> <p>23 pricing, and for us, NLB makes a decision as to the</p> <p>24 number of vehicles to be deployed.</p> <p>25 MS MAGGIE WONG: And who is the tenderer?</p>

Page 45	Page 47
<p>1 MR JAMES WONG: Sorry, what is your question? Kwoon Chung 2 Motors is the tenderer. 3 MS MAGGIE WONG: Do you know whether the Transport 4 Department has any requirements or guidelines on the 5 price at which these non-franchised buses are hired? 6 MR JAMES WONG: No. As far as pricing is concerned, the 7 Transport Department does not have any requirements for 8 us. 9 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. If I may continue -- 10 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on -- is this arrangement with 11 Kwoon Chung Motors Company, by which non-franchised 12 buses are leased, is that an arrangement that came into 13 place on 1 May 2018? 14 MR JAMES WONG: Mr Chairman, for the existing one, it is 15 dated August 2016. It came into effect since August 16 2016, up to now. 17 CHAIRMAN: Prior to that date, did you have other 18 contractors providing you with non-franchised buses? 19 MR JAMES WONG: No. All the time it was Kwoon Chung Motors. 20 CHAIRMAN: Give us some timescale, if you would, as to "all 21 the time". 22 MR JAMES WONG: Well, I have this understanding, from what 23 I have heard. When Kwoon Chung acquired NLB, it was in 24 1992. Kwoon Chung started to provide service to NLB, 25 I think it was in the year 1990 or 1991.</p>	<p>1 up a similar performance because we are one 13th or one 2 33rd of their scale. 3 So for a Kwoon Chung bus captain, for him to drive 4 an NLB bus, if you ask prior to taking up the duty as to 5 whether there is a formal document being sent to NLB to 6 confirm a medical checkup has been done, I am afraid 7 I have to ask my colleagues as to how it actually works. 8 But for us, for Kwoon Chung to recruit the bus captains, 9 it has already gone through all the procedures like 10 checking the records and going through the medical 11 examination. 12 CHAIRMAN: Perhaps you would make those enquiries and 13 provide us with a formal document, if one is sent to 14 NLB. 15 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) Sure. 16 MS MAGGIE WONG: In respect of these non-franchised buses 17 used for your company purposes, any measures in place to 18 ensure these buses are mechanically fit for use? 19 MR JAMES WONG: If I may defer to Mr Yeung. 20 MR PATRICK YEUNG: Thank you. Regarding the non-franchised 21 buses, they undergo regular checks and every year they 22 go through the government's vehicle examination. So 23 they are subject to the same requirement as our 24 franchised buses. 25 MS MAGGIE WONG: What documentation would you ask from all</p>
Page 46	Page 48
<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 2 MS MAGGIE WONG: Now, if I may continue. Any measures in 3 place to monitor these non-franchised bus drivers' 4 physical condition before they start driving for your 5 company's purposes, for example any medical checkups? 6 MR JAMES WONG: Can I confirm with you as to your question? 7 You mean every time they drive for us or prior to taking 8 up duties from us? 9 MS MAGGIE WONG: Either way. 10 MR JAMES WONG: If you refer to the scenario every time 11 before they drive, certainly not. We won't. Not to 12 mention the bus captains from non-franchised buses, even 13 for our own bus captains of NLB, it is impossible for us 14 to carry out a medical checkup every time before they 15 start work. 16 As to the other arrangement in relation to medical 17 check, well, upon joining us, they will undergo such 18 a medical checkup. If I may also add to the answer, for 19 Kwoon Chung Motors -- well, Kwoon Chung Motors and NLB 20 are sister companies, so to speak. Well, for NLB, it is 21 of a smaller scale, having 130 buses only, and then 22 a lot of our back-office officers and management staff, 23 we must rely on the parent company's support. 24 Otherwise, NLB cannot do what the other two franchised 25 bus companies have been doing. We won't be able to put</p>	<p>1 these non-franchised bus companies to verify this 2 information? 3 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you. Well, as I have said, as of 4 today, NLB and Kwoon Chung are sister companies, so for 5 documents in black and white, we don't actually demand 6 them from Kwoon Chung. This is the current arrangement. 7 But of course, for the management, in particular, we are 8 aware of the conditions in both companies. We provide 9 passenger service. We provide safe passenger service to 10 our customers. 11 In future, maybe we will review and see if there is 12 a need to do so. Of course, sometimes we may not be 13 talking about an associate company. In future, we may 14 have a non-associate contractor providing the service to 15 NLB. So perhaps we have to think more about whether 16 there is a need to have more documents from the 17 contractors. 18 MS MAGGIE WONG: In your supplemental annex 2A, 2B and 2C -- 19 that's NLB bundle 2, pages 474 to 480. Annex 2A is at 20 pages 473 and 474; 2B at 476; and 2C at 479. 21 Who conducts these surveys? 22 CHAIRMAN: To which surveys are you referring? 23 MS MAGGIE WONG: Three surveys. 24 CHAIRMAN: What are the titles of the surveys? 25 MS MAGGIE WONG: Annex 2A is the "Monthly report on</p>

Page 49	Page 51
<p>1 scheduled and actual compliance with guidelines on bus 2 captains' working hours, rest times and meal breaks". 3 Annex 2B is "On-board survey to check NLB's driver 4 rest time". 5 And annex 2C is a "Survey on franchised bus 6 captains' working hours (Guidelines B & D)". 7 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 8 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you, Mr Chairman. Regarding the three 9 surveys mentioned, they were conducted internally by 10 ourselves, that is NLB. 11 MS MAGGIE WONG: If we look at page 474, annex 2A, the 12 "Monthly report on scheduled and actual compliance with 13 guidelines on bus captains' working hours, rest times 14 and meal breaks", it states the number of captains 15 surveyed at 115. So does it mean that 115 captains were 16 surveyed on that single day, ie 21 February 2018, by 17 a single person? 18 MR JAMES WONG: Correct. 115 on that day, on a single day. 19 A day was picked and we tried to have a look. 20 MS MAGGIE WONG: So would they be surveyed by a single 21 person of your company? 22 MR JAMES WONG: If I may supplement. The format wasn't so 23 much that he followed each and every 115 bus captains. 24 Rather, our colleagues checked the driving records. We 25 try to check against that record.</p>	<p>1 the working hours of that particular colleague. 2 CHAIRMAN: How were these records created in the first 3 place, sign-off time, sign-on, and so on? 4 MR JAMES WONG: Mr Chairman, currently, what we do is that 5 at the bus terminus, we have a card reader, so the 6 colleague will clock his time by tapping his card on the 7 reader and that would record his sign-on time and 8 sign-off time. For others who are at remote locations 9 and not at the bus terminus, then we rely on the 10 telephone to ask him to report the time. 11 MS MAGGIE WONG: I apologise for that. I should have asked 12 page 477 the same question, because the title is 13 "On-board survey to check NLB's driver rest time", so it 14 was a survey on board. So my question is, would someone 15 follow the driver for that day? 16 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you, Chairman. For this on-board 17 survey, we did have a colleague on board. It was 18 a requirement from the Transport Department. So for ten 19 days, five holidays and ten weekdays, we carried out the 20 survey. 21 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you tell us whether, during the rest 22 time or meal time provided under the guidelines, is 23 a bus captain, be it those three types of bus captains, 24 hired by your company required to perform any 25 non-driving duties, like updating duty or shift rosters,</p>
Page 50	Page 52
<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: So that would be based on driving records 2 submitted to your company by who? 3 MR JAMES WONG: It was the Transport Department who picked 4 the date, and then we checked against our internal 5 records. So that's the record provided by the operating 6 division. 7 MS MAGGIE WONG: If we go to annex 2B, "On-board survey to 8 check NLB's driver rest time", pages 477 to 478, how 9 would this be conducted? 10 MR JAMES WONG: Sorry, please give us a bit of time to read 11 through the record. 12 CHAIRMAN: Yes, please take your time. 13 MR JAMES WONG: Mr Chairman, for this form, it was prepared 14 by the company internally. 15 MS MAGGIE WONG: If we go to page 480, the third annex, 16 "Survey on franchised bus captains' working hours", how 17 would this be conducted? Or, to put it another way, 18 would someone follow the driver for that day? 19 MR JAMES WONG: Mr Chairman, with this form, it talks about 20 "Employee No. of bus captain". For this column, it was 21 picked by the Transport Department as well as the survey 22 date, and then on the right-hand side we tried to 23 retrieve the record. So it wasn't that somebody was on 24 board to follow, because it was provided afterwards, so 25 we tried to look up our records and we tried to find out</p>	<p>1 undertaking other administrative tasks, or inspecting 2 vehicles? 3 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you, Chairman. When it comes to rest 4 time, they are not required to perform those 5 administrative duties mentioned, because these 6 administrative duties are carried out by regulators, 7 terminal regulators. There may be other staff members 8 at the terminus to deal with such duties. 9 MS MAGGIE WONG: The same applies -- would travelling under 10 the instructions of your company to another location or 11 to attend to another driving shift be included in the 12 rest time or meal time? 13 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you. The scope of our service is 14 rather confined. There is no need for our bus captains 15 to travel to a different district, say for example to 16 Kowloon, to provide services. If your question is 17 whether that is counted towards rest time -- well, 18 basically, under normal circumstances there is no such 19 duty, but should there be, it would be counted towards 20 one's duty hours instead of rest time. 21 MS MAGGIE WONG: If I may take you to DC bundle 1, page 71. 22 The Chinese is at page 71, the last five lines; English 23 at page 75, last six lines. If I may read out -- 24 CHAIRMAN: What are you reading from, first of all? 25 MS MAGGIE WONG: I'm sorry. This is a submission by the</p>

Page 53	Page 55
<p>1 Islands District Council submitted to the committee in 2 relation to this review of Hong Kong's franchised bus 3 service. 4 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 5 MS MAGGIE WONG: If I may read out the last five lines: 6 "... NLB's bus routes are mainly composed of 7 mountainous routes to and from the south of Lantau 8 Island and long-distance routes along the highways to 9 and from the main areas, which require high level of 10 attention in order to handle these routes, therefore, 11 more rest time is required in order to prevent accidents 12 caused by fatigued driving." 13 Mr Wong, just one question, about the bus routes in 14 South Lantau. What is the approximate length or 15 duration for each shift? 16 CHAIRMAN: Can you help me as to what you mean by "shift"? 17 Is that the completion of a route or a working shift? 18 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, completion of a route. Say, for 19 example, the route 3M from Mui Wo Ferry Pier to the 20 Tung Chung, I believe, town centre. 21 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you, Chairman. Using 3M as 22 an example, from Tung Chung to Mui Wo or Mui Wo to 23 Tung Chung, it takes about 30 or 40 minutes, depending 24 on whether there are a lot of passengers getting on or 25 off on route.</p>	<p>1 For 40 minutes, compared to feeder bus services to 2 train stations, say, for example, that of Yat Tung which 3 takes only about several minutes, a 40-minute journey 4 time would be longer. But when it comes to comparison 5 with other routes, say for example from New Territories 6 to the urban area, ours are not that long. Compared to 7 airport routes, if you add congestion time, those would 8 be even longer. 9 That's my view. 10 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, and -- 11 CHAIRMAN: Ms Wong, do you have any more questions arising 12 from this document? Because if you do, Mr Wong should 13 have the opportunity to read it. 14 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, I will have a few questions. 15 CHAIRMAN: Mr Wong, take the time that you need to read 16 these two or three pages. 17 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) Okay. Thank you. 18 CHAIRMAN: If you do that now, we will wait. 19 MS MAGGIE WONG: Maybe if you read the Chinese version. 20 It's at pages 71 to 72. 21 MR JAMES WONG: Chairman. 22 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Ms Wong. 23 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) Excuse me. 24 CHAIRMAN: Yes. 25 MR JAMES WONG: I have read the Chinese translation.</p>
Page 54	Page 56
<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: And what do you -- 2 MR JAMES WONG: 35 to 40 instead of 30. 3 MS MAGGIE WONG: Now, it states that it requires 4 long-distance routes and requires a high level of 5 attention. Do you agree with that statement, first of 6 all? 7 MR JAMES WONG: This document was first shown to me just 8 now. 9 MS MAGGIE WONG: Oh, I apologise for that. 10 MR JAMES WONG: I don't really understand what is meant by 11 "long-distance routes along the highways to and from the 12 main areas". For Lantau Island, the scope of our 13 franchise is limited to Lantau Island. We don't go to 14 other areas, say for example urban areas. From Shenzhen 15 Bay Port, we provide a service to Yuen Long and 16 Tin Shui Wai, but they don't go to Lantau Island. So 17 I am not too sure what is meant by the district council. 18 Perhaps -- well, I will only focus on what I know 19 instead of speculating what it means. When it comes to 20 south of Lantau Island, in terms of journey time, 21 compared to the route of the other two bus companies', 22 ours are not too long. The scope of our service and the 23 road's condition is rather free from congestion. So 24 when it comes to the scheduled journey time, compared to 25 the actual journey time, it won't deviate too much.</p>	<p>1 Perhaps there is some translation error, because in the 2 Chinese version it says "Lantau Island buses", but they 3 don't refer to our bus company but bus services serving 4 Lantau Island. So it's not routes of NLB. Of course, 5 for south island, some of the routes are ours, but when 6 it comes to routes that ply highways, I think they are 7 referring to Long Win Bus or Citybus. 8 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. If I may refer you to 9 paragraph 3, English at page 76, it expressed certain 10 concerns raised by the Islands District Council about 11 NLB's bus routes, and if I read it out: 12 "As stated in the submissions above, NLB's bus 13 routes are mainly composed of mountainous routes to and 14 from the south of Lantau Island and long-distance routes 15 along the highways to and from the main areas, 16 nevertheless currently the facilities in bus cabin and 17 the regulation are not able to ensure the safety of 18 passengers. For instance, taking the example of NLB 19 route 3M that runs to and from Tung Chung and Mui Wo, I, 20 at various times, found that the buses were [fully 21 loaded], and even the aisles of the bus cabin were 22 packed, for buses that run urban bus routes, other than 23 the very front row, the very last row and seats facing 24 backwards ... other seats are not installed with seat 25 belts; [compared] to the regulation of the European</p>

Page 57	Page 59
<p>1 Commission, regardless of the bus type, whereby all 2 captains and passengers must fasten their seat belts to 3 ensure driving safety. This reflects that Hong Kong is 4 very behind on passenger safety." 5 And we see some photographs on pages 78 and 79. May 6 I ask what is your view on this matter? 7 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you, Chairman. I see that two points 8 have been raised. First, in relation to the fact that 9 no safety belts have been installed on our buses, and 10 second, that's in relation to some photographs depicting 11 a crowded bus compartment. 12 I will first reply to the first point -- well, to 13 the second point, that is the bus that is packed. We do 14 notice that in Mui Wo, during morning peak hours, for 15 route 3M, plying to and from Tung Chung, there are more 16 passengers compared to other times. In our previous 17 analysis, we found that it's because there are more 18 people going there to work in construction sites. These 19 projects will be completed soon. Our approach is to 20 increase bus frequency for these routes. The bus type 21 we use is different from other companies, because there 22 are more mountainous routes. It's been a few years that 23 we have stopped using double-deckers, so during peak 24 hours, given the limited capacity of a single-decker, in 25 2017 we decided that for route 3M, we would use</p>	<p>1 manager of New Lantao Bus Co Ltd, was present at this 2 meeting. 3 If I may take you to paragraph 41. The Chinese is 4 at page 254. If you may read that first. 5 If I may also invite you to read paragraph 43 as 6 well, as to the district councillor's suggestion, 7 Mr Eric Kwok. If you may read that first. 8 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) Okay. 9 MS MAGGIE WONG: One of the matters he raised is that: 10 "... the EU rules limited the working hours of 11 drivers to 9 hours ... The present 14 hours of work was 12 excessive and bus captains would be tired and prone to 13 accident. He was concerned about the safety of Lantao 14 buses and opined that the Guidelines of the Transport 15 Department were inadequate. If the bus accident 16 occurred on Tung Chung Road or Keng Shan Road of Lantao 17 Island, the consequence would be too ghastly to 18 contemplate. It was hoped that the Transport Department 19 and the bus companies could handle the long driving 20 hours of bus captains and the functionality of their 21 buses seriously." 22 As to this suggestion, what is your view on this, or 23 what is your company's view on this? 24 MR JAMES WONG: Sorry, it will take a while for us to read 25 through the information.</p>
Page 58	Page 60
<p>1 double-decker buses, because in 2018-19 there will be 2 population intake for their home ownership scheme flats, 3 so we used double-decker buses in 2017 to address the 4 problem of limited capacity during peak hours. From 5 Mui Wo to Tung Chung, for a 40-minute journey time, 6 well, a double-decker bus can only take so many 7 passengers, so we have specifically procured buses that 8 are shorter in length. We have done some road tests, to 9 ensure that the use of double-decker buses along these 10 routes would not be problematic. 11 In relation to the point of seat belts, currently 12 there is no requirement that all seats are to be fitted 13 with seat belts. So we have retrofitted seat belts for 14 exposed seats. We keep an open mind. If there is 15 a view that all seats should be fitted with seat belts, 16 we will keep an open mind. 17 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Ms Wong. 18 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes. If I may take you to the minutes, 19 again by the Islands District Council, dated 23 October 20 2017 -- Chinese at page 252; English at 256 -- Mr Wong, 21 on the first page, this is the minutes of the meeting of 22 the Islands District Council dated 23 October 2017, and 23 we can see the persons in attendance include, if we go 24 to page 257 and page 258, I believe your company was 25 also present, Mr Benny Chan Tin Lung, deputy general</p>	<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Take your time. 2 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you, Chairman. For Southern Lantao, 3 the bus captains who are working on 14-hour duty shift, 4 we call these special shifts. The number of bus 5 captains on special shift is relatively small. There 6 are just eight routes on special shift. Out of 100 or 7 so routes, out of in fact 113 routes, eight are on 8 special shift duty. We would ensure that the bus 9 captains have sufficient rest time. Many of our bus 10 captains live in that district, in Lantao. We believe 11 that we have done our best to make sure that bus 12 captains on special shift are not exhausted; they should 13 have sufficient rest time. 14 And Mr Kwok referred to the EU standards. I have 15 not looked at the standards myself. If they drive 16 continuously for nine hours, I believe they would be 17 very tired. For a 14-hour duty, or a duty with less 18 hours, we have to look at the rest time and the driving 19 time and the proportion of these different periods. 20 In Hong Kong, many people do not work in places 21 where they live, and for the service sector -- well, for 22 bus captains, they have to go to work earlier than the 23 normal people because they have to take them to work, 24 and when people get off work, bus captains have to work 25 even later to take these people back home. So we are</p>

Page 61	Page 63
<p>1 talking about these 14-hour duties, special shift, and 2 if you want to cut it to nine hours, the arrangement is 3 not that simple, because you can imagine, say, during 4 the peak morning we need the most people and during the 5 evening peak hours we need the most people, our bus 6 captains.</p> <p>7 So we would go beyond nine hours. We just cannot 8 simply change the 14-hour shift to a nine-hour shift.</p> <p>9 Thank you.</p> <p>10 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Wong, I'm going to move on to another 11 topic, facilities and support to bus captains.</p> <p>12 You just gave evidence that many of your bus 13 captains live in the Lantau district; correct?</p> <p>14 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) Yes, but I don't have the 15 numbers, actual numbers.</p> <p>16 MS MAGGIE WONG: Does your company provide any bus shuttle 17 service to bus captains between their living area and 18 their working place, for example the bus terminus?</p> <p>19 MR JAMES WONG: Mr Chairman, we don't provide bus services 20 for our colleagues. That's mainly because most of our 21 colleagues live where they are supposed to take their 22 buses. If they, say, live further away, we would 23 arrange for the buses to be parked near where they live, 24 say in the bus terminus near their homes or maybe some 25 other appropriate locations as well. So there is no</p>	<p>1 length of time it took, and then, on the other hand, 2 failure, where you were refused.</p> <p>3 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) Okay.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: Perhaps indicating, for our benefit, what is the 5 ratio of success as against failure, and the length of 6 time it all takes.</p> <p>7 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) Okay.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>9 MS MAGGIE WONG: If I may take you to TD-1, page 241. 10 Mr Wong, this is a forward planning programme of your 11 company, and if we cast our eye down to the bottom, it 12 states that all terminals are facilitated with toilets, 13 but in the cases of Yat Tung, Tin Tsz and Tin Yiu, they 14 could only be accessible within walking distance to 15 public toilets.</p> <p>16 Can I ask you, what is the "walking distance", do 17 you know?</p> <p>18 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you, Mr Chairman. The bus termini 19 adjacent to a shopping centre. Say, for example, for 20 Yat Tung, there is a shopping centre next to it, so the 21 colleagues are asked to go inside the shopping centre. 22 So, after the colleague has parked the bus, he goes to 23 the shopping centre and he returns, and the whole thing, 24 the whole process, will take around ten minutes.</p> <p>25 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, thank you, Mr Wong, because I want to</p>
Page 62	Page 64
<p>1 need for us to provide shuttle bus service for our bus 2 captains, to take them to work.</p> <p>3 MS MAGGIE WONG: Apart from the rest facilities at the major 4 service hub that you mentioned in your submissions -- if 5 you want the reference, that's at page 20 -- would 6 toilets or break rooms be available in the proximity of 7 your company's every bus terminal during breaks in 8 between for bus captains?</p> <p>9 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you, Mr Chairman. It's not the case 10 that for every bus terminus there will be toilets and 11 rest rooms. We will have to look at the land titles and 12 other issues. We don't have the exact information on 13 hand, but on the application -- indeed, we have applied 14 for such facilities to be installed at bus termini, but 15 then we have to go through many government departments 16 which are there to supervise the procedure and it takes 17 a lot of time for our application to be processed, and 18 actually we failed in some of our applications.</p> <p>19 MS MAGGIE WONG: If I may refer you to your forward planning 20 programme --</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Before you do that, perhaps I could ask this: 22 could you provide the committee with samples 23 illustrating your applications to provide facilities, be 24 they toilets or places to rest, and letters that 25 illustrate, on the one hand, perhaps, success, but the</p>	<p>1 ask this question. It's the new guidelines imposed in 2 2018 by the Transport Department. If I may take you to 3 TD bundle 4, page 1086.</p> <p>4 If you can see that the new guidelines state that 5 within six-hour duty, they should have short rest 6 breaks, ie rest times, of less than 40 minutes: 7 "... totalling not less than 20 minutes, of which no 8 less than 12 minutes should be within the first 4 hours 9 of duty."</p> <p>10 So my question is: can we do better, in terms of 11 this provision of toilets, or to extend the rest time if 12 necessary?</p> <p>13 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>14 The counsel mentioned about the provision of 15 facilities and whether more facilities could be 16 provided. The company's stance is that we are more than 17 happy to do that, because we treasure our colleagues, 18 respect them as human beings, and if they are asked to 19 walk a long distance to go to the toilet, I believe that 20 those who are seated here would not like to have that 21 kind of experience, and maybe after that, after the 22 hearing, we will provide you with additional information 23 on our application, that we have been refused to provide 24 facilities. So there seems nothing much that we can do. 25 You talk about Yat Tung Estate and the shopping</p>

Page 65	Page 67
<p>1 centre. The shopping centre has been newly renovated -- 2 is being renovated, rather, and the toilet is not being 3 put to use, so our colleagues need to go to another 4 toilet, and this places a great impact on our 5 colleagues; we will try our best to help them. 6 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you, Mr Wong. 7 CHAIRMAN: Have you made any application at your terminus at 8 Yat Tung to provide your own toilet facility? 9 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) Yes. 10 CHAIRMAN: Was that refused? Or is that one in the waiting 11 queue? 12 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) Yes, it should be in the queue. 13 CHAIRMAN: How long ago did you make that application? 14 MR JAMES WONG: We will provide you with the information 15 later. 16 CHAIRMAN: Okay. Thank you. 17 MS MAGGIE WONG: Just one last question on this document. 18 If Mr Wong may refer to page 242. I apologise, it's 19 TD-1, page 242. Again, this is the forward planning 20 programme. It states at the top: 21 "Toilet and dining facilities are all within walking 22 distance from the terminals, with the exception of 23 Shenzhen Bay Port, where there is no dining facilities." 24 So may I ask what would be done to ameliorate the 25 situation, to ensure there are sufficient facilities?</p>	<p>1 Captain Training School to assist qualified persons in 2 obtaining bus driving licences. 3 My question is this: what is the situation on this 4 aspect before this change? 5 MR JAMES WONG: Mr Chairman, if I may defer to Mr Lee to 6 answer the question. 7 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr Lee. 8 MR RICHARD LEE: Thank you, Mr Chairman. 9 There are a number of aspects here. First of all, 10 in the past, as far as bus captain training was 11 concerned, for new recruits and for serving bus 12 captains, there were different cases. For new recruits, 13 in the past, there was a five-day training, route 14 training, bus-type training and classroom training. 15 Recently, for the five-year training programme, we have 16 added an additional day, so that there will be six days. 17 Mainly speaking, for classroom training, there used 18 to be theory during the five-day training. Now we have 19 a whole-day classroom training. Therefore, for new 20 recruits, currently we are giving him six days' 21 training, five days at the wheel. 22 In the past, the instructor-to-trainee ratio was 23 one-to-two or one-to-three, depending on the elements 24 involved. Now we have decided that for the 25 instructor-to-trainee ratio, it should be set at</p>
<p>Page 66</p> <p>1 MR JAMES WONG: At Shenzhen Bay, that's a port, that's 2 a boundary crossing facility. Permission was not given 3 to us to provide a facility for colleagues to take 4 a rest. For that particular route, it runs from 5 Shenzhen Bay to Yuen Long or Tin Shui Wai. The current 6 arrangement is such that colleagues have to take their 7 meals in Yuen Long or Tin Shui Wai so as to resolve the 8 problem. At Shenzhen Bay Port, they have toilet 9 facilities. 10 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Chairman, I see the time. 11 CHAIRMAN: Yes. We will now adjourn for lunch and we will 12 resume at 2.30 this afternoon. Thank you. 13 (1.01 pm) 14 (The luncheon adjournment) 15 (2.30 pm) 16 CHAIRMAN: Good afternoon. 17 MS MAGGIE WONG: Good afternoon. 18 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Ms Wong. 19 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. 20 Mr Wong, we are going to the topic of training of 21 bus captains. You referred in your introductory 22 statement that in recent months you have implemented or 23 will implement measures, including increasing the number 24 of hours and the instructor-to-trainee ratio of driving 25 training for your bus captains, and setting up a Bus</p>	<p>Page 68</p> <p>1 one-to-two. With a one-to-two ratio, it means that the 2 instructor will spend more time with the trainees when 3 compared with the past. 4 And for in-service captains, there are different 5 kinds of training. Say, for example, route 6 familiarisation, bus-type training, supplementary 7 training and refresher training. 8 In the past, for route training and bus-type 9 training, both lasted for a day. Currently, we would 10 examine the bus type involved. This is because in 11 future most of the buses will be double-deckers, and 12 with the introduction of the double-decker buses, we 13 think the training should last for two to three days. 14 This is because we want to allow the trainees to get 15 familiar with the manoeuvring of the double-decker 16 buses, including making a turn. 17 Then, for refresher training, we ask each and every 18 bus captain to return to the training section or the 19 training school to attend a class. 20 As to the establishment of a training school, we 21 have done some preparatory work. Earlier on, we have 22 applied to the Transport Department that we could have 23 GP2, that is the restricted instructor licence for 24 franchised buses. We're waiting the TD's reply. So 25 that's the GP2. We are also trying to recruit more</p>

Page 69	Page 71
<p>1 instructors. Currently, for the instructors of the NLB, 2 they do not possess the GP2 qualification. In other 3 words, we have only got those with class 1, class 2, and 4 who's been licence holders. In other words, in future, 5 if our application is to be granted, we can become 6 self-sufficient; we will get qualified driving 7 instructors to help the candidates, the new recruits, to 8 sit the bus driving licence. In other words, we can 9 have an expanded source, instead of confining ourselves 10 to applicants holding a class 9 and class 10 bus driving 11 licence.</p> <p>12 Of course, for the setting up of the school, we need 13 other support measures, like parking training venue and 14 also route training venues. If we can get the 15 restricted licence, then for the six-day training, it 16 will be lengthened to nine days. For those without 17 a bus driving licence, for those with a private car 18 licence only, we are providing 18 days' training. For 19 the number of trained hours, currently we have a mere 20 six days. In future, there will be a much larger number 21 of training hours.</p> <p>22 MS MAGGIE WONG: If I may take you to bundle NLB-2, 23 page 467. It is a table setting out the bus captain -- 24 annex 10, setting out the Bus Captain Training schedule. 25 Section A is the regular training for newly recruited</p>	<p>1 along South Lantau Road, and then other than relying on 2 the experience-sharing of instructors, we would also 3 look at the locations where there were traffic 4 accidents. We shared with the trainees as to the cause 5 of the accident and ways to prevent an accident.</p> <p>6 In addition to classroom lectures, during the 7 driving training session, the instructor would also make 8 explanations about ways to prevent accidents at the 9 bends and they have the defensive training.</p> <p>10 MR JAMES WONG: Ms Wong, Mr Chairman, if I may add to the 11 answer. Just now, you talked about preparing for the 12 establishment of the training school and you want to 13 know how we are training the new recruits today. I just 14 want to add to Mr Lee's point.</p> <p>15 Mr Lee was talking about how we could do it when we 16 have the new school so that those who don't have a bus 17 driving licence, that is those only having a private car 18 licence or a goods van licence but they want to become 19 a bus captain of franchised buses, when we get the 20 approval from the TD to set up the school, then we can 21 help such drivers to sit for the bus driving licence 22 exam. So that's the difference. Other franchised bus 23 companies have already got such an arrangement, that is 24 they help drivers who haven't got a bus driving licence 25 to take the exam.</p>
Page 70	Page 72
<p>1 bus captain; section B is the regular training for 2 serving bus captains.</p> <p>3 Can I firstly ask, is this the old training or the 4 new measures as you have just told us?</p> <p>5 MR RICHARD LEE: The previous arrangement.</p> <p>6 MS MAGGIE WONG: So this is the old training?</p> <p>7 MR RICHARD LEE: Correct.</p> <p>8 MS MAGGIE WONG: Can you tell us who provided this training, 9 as you have told us that the training school was not 10 established yet.</p> <p>11 MR RICHARD LEE: You are correct. We are preparing for the 12 establishment. Our driving instructors are giving the 13 training.</p> <p>14 MS MAGGIE WONG: And if you look at section A, "Induction 15 Training", below "Classroom lectures on company rules", 16 there is "accident black spot analysis"; do you see 17 that?</p> <p>18 MR RICHARD LEE: Yes, I see it.</p> <p>19 MS MAGGIE WONG: "Classroom lectures on company rules, 20 passenger safety, accident black spot analysis ..."</p> <p>21 Can you tell us what this is, or what empirical data 22 did you compile to make this accident black spot 23 analysis?</p> <p>24 MR RICHARD LEE: To us here, first of all, case studies from 25 previous instructors, like the black spots for accidents</p>	<p>1 I just want to add this point. For our regular 2 training, that is whether we have got the training 3 school or not, we have already got the capability to 4 train up our drivers.</p> <p>5 Thank you.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: How many people work in your current training 7 regime?</p> <p>8 MR RICHARD LEE: Four, four driving instructors who are 9 providing the training.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: And the future training school, how many people 11 is it envisaged will work in that?</p> <p>12 MR RICHARD LEE: Recently, we have applied for a licence 13 from the TD, and the quota will be six.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: Six driving instructors?</p> <p>15 MR RICHARD LEE: Correct.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>17 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you, Mr Lee, for your explanation. 18 About this accident black spot analysis, is there 19 a copy that you can provide to us about the analysis 20 that your company has carried out?</p> <p>21 MR RICHARD LEE: Well, in addition to what we have said -- 22 well, in fact, we can give you a report. During the 23 course of training, we have printed some handbooks or 24 leaflets. There are ten units. The first five are 25 about safe driving, and for the other five, that's about</p>

Page 73	Page 75
<p>1 quality service. Then, for the second unit among the</p> <p>2 first five, it is about the major causes of traffic</p> <p>3 accidents, among which we talk about slippery roads, wet</p> <p>4 weather, the health condition of the drivers, the</p> <p>5 vehicle features, as well as the design of the roads.</p> <p>6 On such basis, we talk about the cause of accidents.</p> <p>7 MS MAGGIE WONG: You talk about the design of the roads.</p> <p>8 Where did you get information concerning this design of</p> <p>9 the roads and which parts of the roads would be selected</p> <p>10 for your analysis?</p> <p>11 MR RICHARD LEE: We rely on the suggestions of the</p> <p>12 instructors, like the hilly roads of South Lantau, they</p> <p>13 have alerted us to the bends that we need to pay</p> <p>14 attention, the gradients; the usual one is 1 to 6 and</p> <p>15 then a motorist has to pay attention at certain points</p> <p>16 for such steep-hill roads then when making a turn, what</p> <p>17 is needed to make it a safe driver.</p> <p>18 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Lee, may I also refer you to another</p> <p>19 document, which is the forward planning programme, at TD</p> <p>20 bundle 1, page 237.</p> <p>21 If you can cast your eye to paragraph (g). This is</p> <p>22 your company's forward planning programme, which states</p> <p>23 that your company --</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: Am I right in recalling that this was June 2017?</p> <p>25 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, this was June 2017.</p>	<p>1 enhance our training. I was talking about the Institute</p> <p>2 of Advanced Motorists.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: When you say that every driver had an opportunity</p> <p>4 in this respect, what was that opportunity?</p> <p>5 MR TIMOTHY WONG: Thank you, Chairman. The opportunity to</p> <p>6 take part in the smart driving programme offered by the</p> <p>7 Institute of Advanced Motorists Hong Kong, IAM. So it's</p> <p>8 about awareness, mainly about the driving attitude, and</p> <p>9 talking about the different road conditions and they try</p> <p>10 to give lectures to help our instructors. Sorry.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: Is this a classroom source, or classroom plus</p> <p>12 road?</p> <p>13 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) It's on road.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: And how long, duration?</p> <p>15 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) Three hours.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: Is this opportunity offered to instructors or to</p> <p>17 all your bus captains?</p> <p>18 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) So there are two types of</p> <p>19 classes. The first part will be instructor to drivers,</p> <p>20 which is driving behaviour, and also there will be</p> <p>21 classes offered by IAM -- I'll be telling you the full</p> <p>22 name in a moment -- so IAM could provide a trainer</p> <p>23 course, we also call it an instructor course, back in</p> <p>24 2017; early 2017, about 20 of our experienced drivers</p> <p>25 actually had an instructor course. And for NLB, we have</p>
Page 74	Page 76
<p>1 Your company states that it:</p> <p>2 "... may seek to cooperate with fellow franchised</p> <p>3 bus operators to achieve the above, by sending bus</p> <p>4 captains to the training programmes offered by other</p> <p>5 operators, subject to mutual acceptance and</p> <p>6 cooperation."</p> <p>7 Have you liaised with fellow franchised bus</p> <p>8 operators on this matter with.</p> <p>9 MR TIMOTHY WONG: Mr Chairman, at the level of the driving</p> <p>10 school, for us to get somebody who's experienced, it is</p> <p>11 very difficult in this trade. Mr Lee joined the NLB</p> <p>12 earlier this year. In year 2017, in addition to relying</p> <p>13 on our own instructors who are experienced instructors,</p> <p>14 we have also asked an institute to help us with smart</p> <p>15 driving. At that time, we didn't have very qualified or</p> <p>16 professional instructors, so we tried to get input from</p> <p>17 a third party. That's why we have got this institute to</p> <p>18 help us, and in fact every driver has one such</p> <p>19 opportunity. It was done in 2017. Mr Lee joined us in</p> <p>20 2018. He had over 20 years' experience in training. So</p> <p>21 we have become more sort of positive in trying to get</p> <p>22 from the TD an instruction licence, so as to get six</p> <p>23 instructors to do this.</p> <p>24 So what we want to do is to be more positive, more</p> <p>25 active, to make use of our resources internally to</p>	<p>1 four instructors, as Richard was saying.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>3 MS MAGGIE WONG: If I may take you to bundle TD-1 -- it's</p> <p>4 still the forward planning programme -- at page 239,</p> <p>5 paragraph (c). I understand this is back in 2017, and</p> <p>6 the proposal is to have a:</p> <p>7 "Regular review of bus drivers' performance [and to</p> <p>8 encourage them] to register for driving enhancement</p> <p>9 programmes, which NLB would be prepared to reimburse,</p> <p>10 subject to prior approval."</p> <p>11 About this, has this been overtaken by your recent</p> <p>12 measures about setting up of training school and</p> <p>13 training courses, or is this still in place?</p> <p>14 MR TIMOTHY WONG: As we have mentioned before, last year we</p> <p>15 used a partnership with IAM. At the beginning of this</p> <p>16 year, we have recruited Mr Lee. As a result, the</p> <p>17 training school will replace paragraph (c).</p> <p>18 MS MAGGIE WONG: I come to another topic, and that would be</p> <p>19 on the topography of Southern Lantau.</p> <p>20 Can I take you to a document by the Islands District</p> <p>21 Council minutes of meeting on 19 March 2018. The</p> <p>22 Chinese is at DC bundle 1, page 264; English at</p> <p>23 page 272. And I think Mr Benny Chan on behalf of your</p> <p>24 company was also present, if you can see at page 265 in</p> <p>25 Chinese and English at 273.</p>

Page 77	Page 79
<p>1 May I summarise some of the points raised in these 2 minutes? The first issue they raised is whether it is 3 safe to use double-decker bus in Southern Lantau. That 4 would be at paragraph 30; Chinese at 266, English at 5 275.</p> <p>6 Can I trouble you to read paragraphs 30, 35 and 36, 7 so three paragraphs first.</p> <p>8 Paragraph 30 raised concerns about using 9 double-decker buses to serve on route 3M. Paragraph 30 10 is by Ms Sherman Choi. She is the senior transportation 11 officer of Islands, and she said that:</p> <p>12 "... the Transport Department has conducted two 13 on-site tests ... with the police, Lantau Bus and the 14 bus manufacturer, in November 2016 in Tung Chung Road 15 section and in November 2016 on the entire route 3M ..."</p> <p>16 Can I confirm that has been done, the two road tests 17 have been done?</p> <p>18 MR JAMES WONG: Chairman, I can confirm that the two site 19 tests have been done.</p> <p>20 MS MAGGIE WONG: Are the two tests in writing?</p> <p>21 MR BENNY CHAN: At that time, we require manufacturer of 22 buses to furnish us with a report.</p> <p>23 MS MAGGIE WONG: If we look at --</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: Did they do so? Did they furnish you with 25 a report, the bus manufacturer?</p>	<p>1 assuming the standard person weight ... to simulate the 2 situation that the vehicle is fully loaded."</p> <p>3 And if we go on to look at paragraph 44, by Mr Randy 4 Yu, one of the committee members:</p> <p>5 "He suggested that before official commencement of 6 service of the double-deck buses in end of June, the 7 department and the Lantau Bus should arrange two 8 double-deck buses of the same model type to conduct 9 another on-site test, especially for the turn in Silver 10 Mine Bay? All stakeholders, including district council 11 members, the committee members, the rural committees and 12 village representative(s), to monitor the entire process 13 and make improvement suggestions."</p> <p>14 Lastly, paragraph 51, in which Ms Sherman Choi on 15 behalf of the Transport Department:</p> <p>16 "... replied that as to arrangement for another road 17 test, the department will make appropriate follow-up 18 with the Lantau Bus after the meeting, and committee 19 members who are interested can participate."</p> <p>20 If we turn over the page:</p> <p>21 "... [as to] the suggestion that the road test shall 22 be conducted under bad weather condition ... [the 23 department said it] needs to coordinate with [other] 24 departments ... But the department understood the 25 relevant proposal and will try to arrange. [They]</p>
Page 78	Page 80
<p>1 MR BENNY CHAN: We have the report. We can give you the 2 report after today's hearing.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: Which bus manufacturer was this?</p> <p>4 MR BENNY CHAN: For the one in November 2016, it's MAN. The 5 second one, June 2017, it's ADL.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: Alexander Dennis?</p> <p>7 MR BENNY CHAN: That's right.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>9 MS MAGGIE WONG: If we look at paragraphs 35 and 36, by 10 Mr Fan Chi Ping, he was one of the committee members, 11 and he expressed that one should not simply use sand 12 bags during simulation tests as in actual situation, 13 because the passengers are not evenly distributed and 14 they may concentrate on one side. And he urged to 15 conduct another test and in bad weather condition.</p> <p>16 If I may also take you to another paragraph, just to 17 complete this. It's at paragraph 44(b) [sic], in which 18 I believe Mr Chan, Benny Chan, provided a reply, at 19 40(b).</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: 40 or 44?</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: 40(b). I apologise for that. Your reply 22 is set out at paragraph 40(b):</p> <p>23 "During the two above mentioned road tests, the said 24 company acted in accordance with the Transport 25 Department's requirement to place metal boards, each</p>	<p>1 understood the committee's concern about the use of 2 double-deck buses to serve on route 3M, and will 3 continue to keep in close contact with the bus company 4 to strengthen the safety of the bus service."</p> <p>5 May I ask, has this road test been carried out after 6 the meeting?</p> <p>7 MR BENNY CHAN: Chairman, that bus was newly procured. The 8 first one was delivered today to Hong Kong. There are 9 some formalities to be done, say for example to get 10 a registration mark as well as vehicle examination. 11 After we have completed the formalities we will liaise 12 with the district council to arrange for the road test.</p> <p>13 MS MAGGIE WONG: And if that test is carried out, would you 14 be able to provide a test report to the committee as 15 well?</p> <p>16 MR BENNY CHAN: Of course.</p> <p>17 MS MAGGIE WONG: In this meeting, they also raised a second 18 matter.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on -- do you have in mind a time 20 frame during which this test is likely to be conducted?</p> <p>21 MR BENNY CHAN: I think it is in about one month's time.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>23 MS MAGGIE WONG: The second matter I raise is about the 24 installation of a tilting alarm system. If you look at 25 paragraph 32, Chinese at page 266, English at 275.</p>

Page 81	Page 83
<p>1 If you read paragraph 32, Mr Kwong suggested about 2 installing:</p> <p>3 "... a tilting alarm system within the bus 4 compartment, when the bus tilt angle reaches tipping 5 point, the alarm will be triggered to remind the bus 6 captain. On the basis island that most roads on Lantau 7 Island are narrow with lots of turns, he suggested the 8 bus company to consider installing the same."</p> <p>9 We also see the Transport Department's response at 10 paragraph 38(b). Ms Sherman Choi stated:</p> <p>11 "The department understood the proposal to install 12 tilting alarm within the bus compartments, and will 13 research for its feasibility with Lantau Bus."</p> <p>14 So has this tilting alarm system been explored by 15 your company?</p> <p>16 MR JAMES WONG: Chairman, I will hand over to Mr Yeung. 17 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr Yeung. 18 MR PATRICK YEUNG: Thank you.</p> <p>19 Chairman, in relation to this system, we have been 20 having meetings with the Transport Department. We 21 propose that all new double-decker buses will be 22 installed with ESP system. There are two functions. 23 One is to stop over-steering and to improve the 24 steering. The other one is anti-tilting. Before the 25 critical point is reached, the speed of the vehicle will</p>	<p>1 is reduced. Is that a reference to diesel or whatever 2 the fuel is?</p> <p>3 MR PATRICK YEUNG: (In English) Correct. 4 (Via interpreter) Yes.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: Reduce but not cut off?</p> <p>6 MR PATRICK YEUNG: Well it's from reduction to halting of 7 injection, depending on the speed of the vehicle. On 8 top of that, there is also the retarder which will 9 reduce the speed of the vehicle.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: The retarder, does that involve the use of lower 11 gears and/or brakes, or both?</p> <p>12 MR PATRICK YEUNG: Both.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>14 MS MAGGIE WONG: The third matter the Islands District 15 Council members raised is the topography of Southern 16 Lantau. They raised the fact that there are many turns 17 and speed roads, particularly the turns in Silver Mine 18 Bay are very rapid, and they mentioned a problem that 19 even single-deck buses have to give way to each other 20 for there to be enough room to pass through, and there 21 is no parking bay installed.</p> <p>22 If I may invite you to read a number of paragraphs. 23 It's 34(a), first of all, and then 45(a), stating that 24 that particular road requires bus drivers: 25 "... to be equipped with experience and driving</p>
Page 82	Page 84
<p>1 be reduced to maintain stability of the vehicle.</p> <p>2 In relation to the alarm system, if necessary we can 3 ask the supplier to add that function.</p> <p>4 We have this concern about the alarm. It may 5 disturb the bus captain. Say, for example, it's 6 an alarm for speeding and there is another alarm for 7 door opening and closing. With too many alarms in 8 place, it may disturb the bus captain. So instead of 9 installing another alarm system, we aim to enhance the 10 stability of the vehicle itself.</p> <p>11 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. The third matter -- 12 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on -- you say that before the 13 critical point is reached, the speed of the vehicle will 14 be reduced. How is that achieved?</p> <p>15 MR PATRICK YEUNG: We make use of two devices. The 16 injection to the engine will be reduced, and there is 17 also a retarder, speed retarder, to reduce the speed of 18 the vehicle.</p> <p>19 In relation to the monitoring of the speed, we have 20 a sensor. The sensor is installed on the chassis, right 21 in the middle of the chassis. The function is to detect 22 lateral speeding and calculation of centrifugal force, 23 so that it will have the function of stabilising the 24 vehicle before it reaches a critical point.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: So there are two aspects: one is fuel injection</p>	<p>1 techniques and shall be on high alerts in order to 2 handle the roads ... especially the Silvermine Bay turn, 3 because the slightest mistake can cause accident."</p> <p>4 And at paragraph 52 --</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on, could you identify the status 6 of the person making the observation?</p> <p>7 MS MAGGIE WONG: He is Mr Wong Fuk Kan. I believe he is 8 also a member -- yes, he is also a committee member of 9 the Islands District Council, at page 272.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>11 MS MAGGIE WONG: If we can go to paragraph 48, that's the 12 vice-chairman, Mr Cheung Fu, also mentioned this 13 problem. He mentioned that: 14 "... the biggest problem came from the roads and not 15 the buses, therefore the priority is to improve the 16 turns of the roads."</p> <p>17 And stating that there is simply not enough room to 18 fit two buses to pass through at the same time, 19 "especially the rapid turn of Silvermine Bay".</p> <p>20 May I ask you your views on this matter: is this 21 a problem that caused concern to your company?</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: By that you mean the roads themselves are the 23 problem?</p> <p>24 MS MAGGIE WONG: First of all, the roads themselves, and 25 secondly, some of the members expressed that it required</p>

Page 85	Page 87
<p>1 highly skilled drivers to drive that particular road.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: So there are two questions there.</p> <p>3 MS MAGGIE WONG: There are two questions.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: And the first question is: what view, if any, do</p> <p>5 you have about the observation about the roads being the</p> <p>6 problem?</p> <p>7 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you, Mr Chairman. First, I would like</p> <p>8 to take this opportunity, and actually at various</p> <p>9 occasions, including the meeting of the district council</p> <p>10 as cited by the paper. We understand that there have</p> <p>11 been road accidents in Hong Kong giving rise to worries</p> <p>12 about safety of double-deckers. But I must remind all</p> <p>13 of us here that for the road now, buses are already</p> <p>14 operating on that road. It's not the case that the</p> <p>15 roads are not used by the buses. So that's number one.</p> <p>16 We don't have the plan to have double-deckers</p> <p>17 running the entire area of Southern Lantau. Our</p> <p>18 judgment is that, say, in places like Ngong Ping,</p> <p>19 Tai O -- well, for these places, they are not suited to</p> <p>20 the -- not suitable for double-deckers' operation. But</p> <p>21 in Mui Wo, double-deckers are suitable.</p> <p>22 We have finished the tendering exercise and we have</p> <p>23 decided to procure a certain model of double-decker.</p> <p>24 Those of us who are here will understand that, say, for</p> <p>25 Hong Kong Island, there are also hilly terrains,</p>	<p>1 captains, the risk can be lowered.</p> <p>2 Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: What do you mean, Mr Wong, when you say, "What</p> <p>4 matters most is the driver's driving attitude"?</p> <p>5 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>6 We have a traditional way of doing things here. For</p> <p>7 every bus, we need a bus captain to operate the bus, and</p> <p>8 after all he is a human being. It's not like rail or</p> <p>9 an aircraft. There are so many automated processes in</p> <p>10 place. There are automated devices to help the pilots</p> <p>11 and, say, the drivers of trains.</p> <p>12 In buses, as you mentioned, our chairman of the</p> <p>13 company is my father and we have been operating in the</p> <p>14 transport business for three generations. We started</p> <p>15 the business with my grandpa, and they used to say that</p> <p>16 vehicles in the old days were not as advanced as</p> <p>17 today's. Maybe I was not born when, say, the old</p> <p>18 vehicles were being used. But we deeply believe that</p> <p>19 the most important thing to ensure safety -- of course,</p> <p>20 it will be good that we have technology to help us, but</p> <p>21 what matters most is the driver's attitude. He must be</p> <p>22 professional. He must have the mindset that he should</p> <p>23 drive very safely. This is the core value that we</p> <p>24 embrace.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p>
Page 86	Page 88
<p>1 including, say, Stanley, The Peak, Shek O, et cetera,</p> <p>2 and these double-deckers also run in these places as</p> <p>3 well.</p> <p>4 So the car model that we are going to procure will</p> <p>5 have a shorter length than single-deckers. It's</p> <p>6 10.4 metres in length. For single-deckers, their length</p> <p>7 is between 11 metres to 11.5 metres or 11.6 metres. So</p> <p>8 it is shorter in length compared to the single-deckers.</p> <p>9 Of course, we understand that there is this</p> <p>10 perception that double-deckers are more prone to</p> <p>11 overturning. Theoretically speaking, that may be so.</p> <p>12 But then we think what matters most is the driver's</p> <p>13 driving attitude.</p> <p>14 Of course, single-deckers will have less risk of</p> <p>15 overturning than double-deckers, but does it mean that</p> <p>16 for all hilly roads double-deckers should not be used?</p> <p>17 No, that should not be the case.</p> <p>18 So we think what matters most is the driver's</p> <p>19 attitude, and in terms of the hardware, we also have to</p> <p>20 consider what can be done. This time, we decided to</p> <p>21 procure a shorter double-decker. In the market, there</p> <p>22 are longer double-deckers, but we opted for a shorter</p> <p>23 double-decker which also comes with a lesser height, and</p> <p>24 we believe that given that this is the model and coupled</p> <p>25 with the appropriate training to be provided to bus</p>	<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: You mentioned earlier that the double-deck</p> <p>2 buses, in terms of length and height, are less than the</p> <p>3 normal single-deck buses. For completeness, actually,</p> <p>4 your Mr Chan did say that in the minutes at</p> <p>5 paragraph 40(a) at page 278, for the committee's</p> <p>6 reference.</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: They were less in length than singles, but surely</p> <p>8 not less in height?</p> <p>9 MS MAGGIE WONG: Not less in height but --</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: But shorter.</p> <p>11 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) But the height is less than</p> <p>12 those normal double-deckers.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: Yes.</p> <p>14 MS MAGGIE WONG: There is another minute I would like to</p> <p>15 refer you to. This is based on an accident that</p> <p>16 happened on 6 April 2015, when a bus of your company</p> <p>17 nearly fell off the hill when it was travelling down</p> <p>18 a slope on its way from Tung Chung to Tai O.</p> <p>19 Do you remember this incident? We can show you the</p> <p>20 news article, if it may assist you.</p> <p>21 That's the Keng Shan Road.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: What is the source of this material?</p> <p>23 MS MAGGIE WONG: This is from the Oriental Daily News, and</p> <p>24 that would be on 30 May 2015.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p>

Page 89	Page 91
<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: Would you mind taking a look at the 2 article, or do you recall this accident happening on 3 6 April 2015?</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: And where is this to be found in the materials, 5 the bundles?</p> <p>6 MS MAGGIE WONG: Chairman, this is not found in the 7 bundle but it is on the website link. We have provided 8 a translation for your ease of reference.</p> <p>9 MR JAMES WONG: Mr Chairman, I just read this article. It 10 mentions that there is an accident which happened 11 42 years ago, and there was another accident which 12 happened 12 years ago, and it didn't mention about the 13 accident happening in April 2015.</p> <p>14 Well, I can remember this particular photo. For 15 these three accidents, they came with different causes. 16 For the accident 42 years ago, the road condition back 17 then was very different from today's.</p> <p>18 I, of course, could not confirm the situation on the 19 road 42 years ago, but as far as what I've heard, the 20 road situation has improved a lot today.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Take your time to read the material before you 22 answer.</p> <p>23 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) Yes. 24 (Via interpreter) It mentioned an accident in 2003. 25 We have to go back and look for the information, because</p>	<p>1 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) Yes. 2 (Via interpreter) Correct.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: But the article itself doesn't give any 4 description of that accident; it's just a photograph?</p> <p>5 MR JAMES WONG: Correct. The article doesn't mention about 6 this particular accident. Maybe it's not reported by 7 this article here.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Do you have any report, Ms Wong, of the 6 April 9 2015 accident for Mr Wong to remind himself about the 10 details?</p> <p>11 MS MAGGIE WONG: Chairman, I think this matter was discussed 12 at the minutes of meeting on 18 May 2015 by the Islands 13 District Council; Chinese at page 203, English at 14 page 208.</p> <p>15 This was in response to a question raised at 16 page 201, in Chinese, and page 202 in English, 17 a question raised by district council member Mr Randy Yu 18 in relation to the safety of North Lantau Highway.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: So we should start with the question -- 20 MS MAGGIE WONG: We should start with the question.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Page 201 in the Chinese and 202 in the 22 translation.</p> <p>23 MS MAGGIE WONG: Correct.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: Take a moment to familiarise yourself with that, 25 Mr Wong.</p>
Page 90	Page 92
<p>1 we are not sure about the location of the accident, and 2 also how it happened.</p> <p>3 For the accident in 2015, it was not mentioned in 4 this article at all. But the photo that was shown and 5 the vehicle is stranded there -- yes, that's the one -- 6 I remember that this happened in 2015. For this 7 accident, fortunately, no one was seriously injured; 8 there was no injury or death. Some passengers sustained 9 minor injuries and had to be sent to the hospital. This 10 photo looks rather appalling. The front part of the bus 11 actually landed on a piece of land. After the incident, 12 we tried to conduct a review on how we could improve on 13 things. We have to check into the details further.</p> <p>14 We looked into a speed limiter, so we just don't 15 count on the braking system. Because we are talking 16 about a downward slope, so we are looking into the 17 possibility of adopting a retarder. So in future, 18 whether we are using a double-decker or -- right now, 19 for the single-deckers, they are retrofitted with 20 retarders.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on, do I understand you to say 23 that the photograph of the bus that we can see displayed 24 on the screen now is, as you remember it, a photograph 25 of the 2015 April 6 accident; is that correct?</p>	<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Wong, if you look at page 204, I believe 2 your company's representative, Mr Wong Wah, was present. 3 In English, it's at page 209. And the committee members 4 in the Islands District Council on 18 May 2015 identify 5 three main issues.</p> <p>6 First, they mentioned the road design. That's at 7 paragraph 79(c) by Mr Lou Cheuk Wing. He is also 8 a committee member. He identified that the road design 9 on Lantau Island is not safe, such as the South 10 Lantau Road and the Keng Shan Road between the reservoir 11 and Tai O, and it states that the Transport Department 12 had conducted several improvement construction and that 13 there are more than ten turns but only three received 14 improvements.</p> <p>15 The second problem is at paragraph 79(d): 16 "The Transport Department approved 30 tour buses to 17 operate on Lantau Island, but the vehicle body of these 18 tour buses are relatively longer than regular buses and 19 when driving through substandard turns on 20 Keng Shan Road, accidents will be caused more easily." 21 The third is at paragraph 81, by Ms Lee Kwai Chun. 22 She's also a committee member, and she identified that 23 the request to expand the road, South Lantau Road, for 24 more than 20 years, but still the situation had not 25 improved.</p>

Page 93	Page 95
<p>1 And in relation to the first issue, I believe 2 Mr Wong Wah of your company have enquired about the 3 exact location of the three improvement spots, and if we 4 can go to paragraph 90: 5 "Mr Wong Wah enquired about the exact location of 6 the 3 improvement spots to be carried out. He was of 7 the opinion that the entire Keng Shan Road has about 30 8 spots that needed improvements." 9 My question is, did your company identify those 30 10 spots to the Transport Department? 11 MR JAMES WONG: Mr Chairman, at this moment, we cannot be 12 sure as to whether we have formally taken up the matter 13 with the TD in the form of correspondence in writing, 14 that is asking the TD to tell us which locations will 15 get improvements. 16 For Mr Wong Wah, who was at this district council 17 meeting, he is not present today and has also retired. 18 I'm afraid I have to go back to check the information to 19 see what has transpired between ourselves and the TD. 20 CHAIRMAN: Yes, please do so, and if you are able to obtain 21 anything which casts light on this, please provide it to 22 the committee. 23 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) Yes, sure. 24 MS MAGGIE WONG: In your provision of information, I wonder 25 if you could also assist by telling us whether these 30</p>	<p>1 different sectors of the community over problems such as 2 illegal parking at bus stops, bus captains' treatment 3 and working hours." 4 They identified a number of reasons for illegal 5 parking, and if we go over to page 644, English at 6 644-1, it states: 7 "To eradicate illegal parking at bus stops, it must 8 be dealt with from its roots and by formulating suitable 9 policies, revising the outdated laws. The problem can 10 only be resolved by multipronged measures." 11 Then one of the suggestions -- 12 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on, where do we find that in the 13 translation? 14 MS MAGGIE WONG: Page 644 at the bottom, 644-1, the last 15 four paragraphs. 16 CHAIRMAN: The final paragraph? 17 MS MAGGIE WONG: The final paragraph. 18 Then over the page at 644-2, they made one 19 suggestion: 20 "Following Singapore and installing cameras on all 21 bus fleets. Singapore has since 2008 installed cameras 22 on buses and the cameras are installed next to the 23 driver's seats. When drivers discover cars parking 24 inside the bus stop, they can press the button and 25 record a video of 5-10 minutes. The bus companies will</p>
Page 94	Page 96
<p>1 spots are within the accident black spot analysis in 2 your training programme that you are going to provide to 3 your bus captains. 4 MR JAMES WONG: Mr Chairman, at this moment, as to the 30 5 locations -- I think it's roughly 30 spots -- for those 6 30 spots requiring improvements mentioned by 7 Mr Wong Wah, at this moment we are not sure of the 8 locations, so offhand it is impossible for us to tell 9 whether they are the same as those covered in our 10 training programme where we need to enhance the 11 training. I'm sorry, I'm afraid I have to go back to 12 check and clarify, that is those 30 spots mentioned by 13 Mr Wong Wah. 14 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Please do so. 15 MS MAGGIE WONG: The next topic I'm going to go to is the 16 illegal parking problem, and if I may take you to 17 miscellaneous bundle 2, page 63 in Chinese, and the 18 translation at 644-1. 19 If you can look at this page, the third paragraph, 20 at page 644-1. This is a letter from the Democratic 21 Alliance provided to the committee, a matter brought to 22 the attention of the committee. It begins with the 23 words: 24 "The industry actions of bus captains that took 25 place in February 2017 and 2018 aroused the ...</p>	<p>1 then hand the recording to the police ... the police can 2 review the recording ... in around two weeks' time the 3 ticket will be sent to the car owner's home", et cetera. 4 Before we go further into this, does the company 5 regard illegal parking at bus stops as a problem? 6 MR JAMES WONG: Yes. Thank you, Mr Chairman. 7 Well, in the case of the NLB, all the time we have 8 been talking about the roads in South Lantau. You need 9 a closed road permit before you can drive in South 10 Lantau. So when compared with the case downtown, we 11 have less traffic. For the information received by us 12 from the colleagues, as far as illegal parking at bus 13 stops, we don't have as many instances. Currently, this 14 is the case. But then in individual cases, say for 15 example at the bus terminus at Tai O, recent years have 16 seen a lot of construction works going on, and at the 17 bus terminus, where we set down and pick up passengers, 18 space is limited. Sometimes there may be vehicles 19 nearby, especially on festive days. Well, in fact, they 20 don't have enough private parking spaces. We do have 21 this scenario to a lesser degree, but when compared to 22 the urban area, the problem isn't as bad. 23 Thank you. 24 MS MAGGIE WONG: The reason why I raise this is because the 25 minutes of meeting, again from the Islands District</p>

Page 97	Page 99
<p>1 Council on 21 March 2016, if you go to page 98 in 2 Chinese.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: Of which bundle?</p> <p>4 MS MAGGIE WONG: DC bundle 1, page 98 in Chinese, 5 paragraphs 143 to 144, and in English, page 103-1. So 6 paragraphs 143 and 144.</p> <p>7 Both concerns were raised by the committee member, 8 and they talked about the illegal parking problem or the 9 double parking observed at Tat Tung Road. I wonder 10 if -- what is your comment on the problems raised by 11 these two district councillors?</p> <p>12 MR JAMES WONG: Mr Chairman, if I may defer to Mr Chan, 13 thank you.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr Chan.</p> <p>15 MR BENNY CHAN: Mr Chairman, well, for us to operate bus 16 service in Tung Chung, we have seen that for Tat 17 Tung Road, the traffic situation there is quite bad. We 18 have only got a single direction for traffic and 19 a single lane.</p> <p>20 For the points raised by the district council 21 members, of course we are talking about the town centre 22 of Tung Chung, and whenever there is the congestion, the 23 entire Tung Chung will be blocked, and for our bus 24 operation, it creates a difficulty. This is because our 25 bus stop is at Tat Tung Road, and then it is sometimes</p>	<p>1 MR JAMES WONG: From the standpoint of the company, 2 of course we very much welcome any means that can 3 resolve the problem of roadside illegal parking.</p> <p>4 MS MAGGIE WONG: I'm going to another topic. It's about 5 disciplining of bus captains. If I may take you to 6 NLB-1, page 23.</p> <p>7 Your company states that bus captains involved in 8 serious accidents will be suspended from driving duty. 9 May I ask how long will they be suspended?</p> <p>10 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>11 I think page 13 of the same document -- well, 12 I think the page following the one shown on the 13 screen -- I think we have explained. You can refer to 14 item 3. If it is so unfortunate that there is a very 15 serious accident, we have to spend time to carry out 16 an investigation, to find out whether our colleague is 17 to be blamed or whether it is not his responsibility. 18 During that period of time, we may very well be 19 suspending his driving duty. He's still being paid, 20 because first of all we want to find out about the 21 facts. In the past, there were cases in which something 22 very unfortunate happened and the bus captain himself 23 also asked for a break; he would like to take a rest. 24 So suspension pending investigation is of assistance. 25 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. If I may take you to page 23.</p>
Page 98	Page 100
<p>1 difficult for buses to depart from the bus terminus. 2 I think it is a problem for the community as 3 a whole, and in fact this is a problem that is known to 4 the district council for quite a long time.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: Are you saying that the problem for your buses, 6 in that they find it difficult to leave from the bus 7 terminus, is directly because of illegal parking, or is 8 caused indirectly by traffic caused by illegal parking 9 elsewhere?</p> <p>10 MR BENNY CHAN: Indirectly affected. As I have said, for 11 this particular road, it is very busy. It is in the 12 town centre of Tung Chung. Whenever there is double 13 parking or whenever there is a traffic accident, then 14 the town centre of Tung Chung will suffer from 15 congestion.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>17 MS MAGGIE WONG: Are you aware that the police suggested to 18 the Transport Department and LegCo that cameras should 19 be used at black spots, fixed at the lamppost, to record 20 this illegal parking at the bus terminus, and that could 21 be the source of the evidence? Do you know about that?</p> <p>22 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>23 Yes, I have heard about such a suggestion in the 24 news reporting.</p> <p>25 MS MAGGIE WONG: Do you welcome such an idea?</p>	<p>1 It also makes reference to bus captains who are 2 suspected to suffer from mental -- who require mental 3 attention. Can you tell us how are these bus captains 4 identified, those who require mental attention?</p> <p>5 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you, Chairman.</p> <p>6 Well, I won't say that today we have any mechanism 7 to investigate into bus captains who are suspected from 8 having some mental problems, because it would take 9 professionals to be qualified to give such views. As to 10 how we find those who are in such need, we will have to 11 wait for our colleagues to approach us, because it's not 12 something physical. If they need more attention, they 13 need someone to talk to, our company has engaged 14 an outside company to work with us. Colleagues may call 15 that company to receive professional help.</p> <p>16 MS MAGGIE WONG: You have made reference in this paragraph 17 to counselling service. Would this counselling service 18 be provided by your company and paid for by your 19 company?</p> <p>20 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you.</p> <p>21 At this moment of time, we have provided a hotline 22 for our colleagues. If our colleagues think there is 23 a need, they may call a consultant service hotline. 24 After talking to their operator, because some screening 25 may be required, if that consultant is of the view that</p>

Page 101	Page 103
<p>1 counselling service may be needed, the case will be 2 referred to more professional organisations. All these 3 are paid for by our company. Our employees don't have 4 to pay.</p> <p>5 MS MAGGIE WONG: Would you like to introduce a system for 6 regular assessment of whether a driver is mentally and 7 emotional fit to continue to be a bus captain?</p> <p>8 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you.</p> <p>9 After the hearing with Citybus, I noticed that they 10 are looking into it, to see if it's suitable. I have 11 some friends who are psychologists. I would like first 12 to find out how to help them, from a professional point 13 of view. Well, we don't -- even for a psychologist, 14 it's not easy for them to tell us who is suitable to be 15 a bus captain. However, after conducting psychological 16 assessment, the psychologist may be able to tell us what 17 further assistance or support is required by 18 a particular bus captain, and we can start to help from 19 that point.</p> <p>20 It's not an across-the-board approach where, like 21 a medical checkup, a doctor can tell you whether someone 22 is fit to drive or not. Everything I have said just now 23 is something that I have learned from my friends. We 24 are aware that sometimes our colleagues are under 25 pressure because they deal with many different people</p>	<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Could you read out the sentence?</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes:</p> <p>3 "To enhance job attractiveness and retain existing 4 bus captain, apart from wages and welfare package 5 adjustment, our company is developing some measures, 6 include but not limited to the following items of 7 enhancing their job satisfaction".</p> <p>8 So it is this word "adjustment" I'm referring to.</p> <p>9 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you.</p> <p>10 In relation to that table, it's July 2017. We 11 haven't done the adjustment this year. Just now, 12 Ms Wong mentioned about an adjustment. You find 13 a number of measures following the paragraph she just 14 read out. Apart from take-home pay, we have introduced 15 some enhancements. So that's what it was about. And 16 for that table, it's from July 2017 to now. We are 17 preparing for the adjustment for 2018. We are still 18 looking into it, about the rate of increase.</p> <p>19 MS MAGGIE WONG: When will this rate of increase be 20 determined for 2018?</p> <p>21 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you.</p> <p>22 Under normal circumstances, there will be a pay rise 23 on 1 July. This year, at the beginning of April, we 24 announced that there will be a one-off special bonus. 25 It is because we noticed that the two other bus</p>
Page 102	Page 104
<p>1 every day. We do need to provide different channels for 2 our colleagues to vent or to talk. We will look further 3 into it. Is it helpful to have some psychological 4 assessment before they join us? Is it necessary to have 5 regular assessment? Do we need random checks? I can't 6 say because we don't have much information at this point 7 of time. I can't give you a concrete answer. I will 8 have to look further into it.</p> <p>9 MS MAGGIE WONG: I am going to the topic of remuneration and 10 welfare. If I may invite you to look at two pages of 11 your submission, NLB-1, page 17 and page 21.</p> <p>12 At page 17, the second paragraph from the bottom, 13 your company states:</p> <p>14 "To enhance job attractiveness and retain existing 15 bus captain, apart from wages and welfare package 16 adjustment ..."</p> <p>17 If I may invite you to look at page 21, which sets 18 out the remuneration packages. Are they before or after 19 the adjustment?</p> <p>20 MR JAMES WONG: The adjustment you just referred to, when 21 was it? Which adjustment?</p> <p>22 MS MAGGIE WONG: I'm just referring to your company's 23 submission at page 17, the second paragraph from the 24 bottom, line 3. You make reference to "wages and 25 welfare package adjustment" and --</p>	<p>1 operators in the market, in around February or March, 2 I think it was March, they have changed the pay 3 structure of their employees. We are concerned that if 4 we wait until July to have the pay rise, there will be 5 a huge gap.</p> <p>6 That's why, in April, we announced the one-off 7 arrangement. The bonus will be released in September.</p> <p>8 In relation to the wage adjustment in 2018, just like we 9 have done before, we are talking to the labour union and 10 we are also looking at the company's situation.</p> <p>11 There is actually an indicator for our reference. 12 The scale of our company is the smallest, so we will 13 draw reference from the two major operators in the 14 market, in order to gauge the rate of increase, because 15 their wage adjustment will be of reference to us.</p> <p>16 Today is 19 June. We hope that in around July or 17 August we will be able to do that. If it's after July, 18 then it will have a retrospective effect.</p> <p>19 MS MAGGIE WONG: Would you be able to provide us with 20 an updated table after the review has been carried out 21 in 2018?</p> <p>22 MR JAMES WONG: Yes, of course.</p> <p>23 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you.</p> <p>24 Now, if we look at the table, we can see that the 25 remuneration package, a significant part of the driver's</p>

Page 105	Page 107
<p>1 monthly pay appears to derive from per-day duty 2 allowance, that is item 2. Do you agree? 3 MR JAMES WONG: Yes. 4 MS MAGGIE WONG: How many days a month would a driver be 5 typically required to work? 6 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you. 7 On average, it's 24 to 25 days. 8 MS MAGGIE WONG: So a rough calculation would be 5,500-odd, 9 if it is a 24 days' duty allowance. So if the driver 10 was sick, would that mean he would not get that 11 allowance? 12 MR JAMES WONG: Right. You are referring to duty allowance, 13 item 2? 14 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, correct. 15 MR JAMES WONG: If on that day the bus captain is not 16 working, absent from work, there won't be any duty 17 allowance. 18 MS MAGGIE WONG: So let's quote an example. If he was sick 19 for three days, he would lose about \$700-odd; is that 20 correct? About \$700, assuming it's \$230. 21 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you. 22 Yes, I confirm. Assuming that a colleague has been 23 sick for three days and not reported duty, he would not 24 be given the duty allowance. 25 MS MAGGIE WONG: What about the attendance bonus at item 4</p>	<p>1 So if that person has missed work for three days, 2 that means the \$750 will not be given to that person. 3 That means if that person has not come to work for three 4 days, the attendance bonus will not be given. If it's 5 just one day of work, then what's missed is \$200. 6 MS MAGGIE WONG: So, if my calculation is correct, if the 7 bus captain is sick for three days, then he would in 8 total lose 1,500? Is that an accurate calculation? 750 9 plus 750? 10 MR JAMES WONG: Sorry, I confirm that. If the colleague has 11 not turned up for work for three days, just like what 12 was said, \$690 deduction from the duty allowance -- 13 well, not deduction but that will not be paid, and 14 another \$750 under attendance bonus will not be paid to 15 that colleague. 16 CHAIRMAN: Mr Auyeung has a question. 17 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Am I right to assume then that both duty 18 allowance and attendance bonus is having the same 19 objective; it's to encourage the employee to report to 20 work? 21 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you, Mr Auyeung. 22 In response to your question, like you said, when we 23 set the duty allowance, the objective is to encourage 24 colleagues to work hard, and for the attendance bonus, 25 it has undergone some changes, just like the safety</p>
Page 106	Page 108
<p>1 which is given on a monthly basis -- 2 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on, is the duty allowance that is 3 lost, the \$230 for each of the days that he doesn't 4 work, or does he lose an overall package of duty 5 allowance? 6 MR JAMES WONG: If you're referring to the duty allowance, 7 it's on a daily basis. It's counted on a daily basis. 8 Say, for example, if that person -- well, there are 25 9 working days, then it's \$230 times 25 for that month. 10 For whatever reason, if that person has worked less than 11 that number of days, then we will times 230 by the 12 number of days he has worked. 13 CHAIRMAN: So if he doesn't work one of the 25 days, then he 14 only loses one day's \$230 daily duty allowance? 15 MR JAMES WONG: If you're talking about duty allowance, yes. 16 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 17 MS MAGGIE WONG: What about the attendance bonus, \$750, 18 awarded on a monthly basis? If he was sick for three 19 days, would that be deducted pro rata? 20 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you, Chairman. 21 When it comes to the attendance bonus, in Chinese 22 it's (Chinese spoken). It's given to the employee on 23 a monthly basis. If the colleague has missed work, for 24 the first day there will be a deduction of 200; second 25 day, 250; the third day, 300, and so on, and so forth.</p>	<p>1 bonus. Maybe I have to check into old records to come 2 up with a more exact picture. It used to be, say, once 3 every year or twice every year, but colleagues told us 4 that they had to wait for too long if this is 5 distributed, say, once or twice a year. Later, it was 6 changed to a quarterly disbursement. Now, it's 7 a monthly disbursement. 8 Indeed, the aim is to encourage colleagues to work 9 hard. So the objectives of the two allowances are 10 similar. 11 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Thank you. 12 CHAIRMAN: So the answer was "yes", in the short form? 13 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) Yes. 14 CHAIRMAN: Ms Wong. 15 MS MAGGIE WONG: This is not the only bonus that 16 incentivises workers to allowance. If we look at item 17 6, "Rest day work allowance", the worker or the bus 18 captain will be awarded \$625 per working day if they 19 work on a rest day; is that correct? 20 MR JAMES WONG: Correct. 21 Maybe I can give you the rationale behind. I would 22 like to use the best words to describe this. As I said, 23 our chairman, Mr Wong, has been working in the transport 24 sector for many, many years, and he had some practical 25 thoughts. When the grass-roots and frontline workers</p>

Page 109	Page 111
<p>1 would like to work on a rest day, this \$625 is 2 an additional amount. They should already have the duty 3 allowance, and then another \$625 would be given to them. 4 Say for this colleague, maybe he should be working 5 25 days and then he would like to work on the 26th day 6 as well, so he's sacrificing his rest time to work, so 7 if we are not going to give him the rest day work 8 allowance, indeed, it is easy for the colleagues to find 9 some part-time driving duties outside, say driving 10 lorries and taxis, et cetera. So instead of having them 11 doing that, we would be giving them a good return to our 12 colleagues, if they work for us. 13 Like we said, compared to other bus companies, we 14 are offering an extra five days' leave, and honestly 15 speaking, we allow the colleagues to choose to take 16 leave or not. So sometimes a colleague would not like 17 to take leave; they would opt to work. So, in other 18 words, it's an increase in the pay for the colleague, in 19 effect. 20 CHAIRMAN: Prof Lo. 21 MEMBER LO: For the rest day, is it by invitation or can the 22 bus captain invite himself to work on a rest day? For 23 example, he's one day sick and wants to make up the 24 loss, can he, say, work 27 days? 25 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you, Professor.</p>	<p>1 If he is not fit to drive, then even if he doesn't want 2 to take the rest day he shouldn't be driving. 3 Also, our core belief is that the more you work, the 4 more return you will get. This is very much a servicing 5 industry, and for the newly joined bus captains, they 6 think it's a complicated system and we have to spend 7 efforts to make the calculations for the colleague. But 8 what we want to do most is for colleagues who are 9 dedicated and hard-working, they will be given the pay 10 they deserve. That's our aim. 11 MS MAGGIE WONG: Moving on to another topic. It's about 12 passengers' behaviour. We have heard other bus 13 operators, that their bus captains have experienced 14 problems of passenger behaviour. Do you or does your 15 company receive similar complaints? 16 MR JAMES WONG: Chairman, I would like to defer to 17 Mr Timothy Wong to take that. 18 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr Wong. 19 MR TIMOTHY WONG: James has said that we provide localised 20 services, relatively speaking. Routes are centred 21 around Southern Lantau and Tung Chung, and for the 22 passengers, they are normally the local residents, and 23 our colleagues and bus captains our regulators will meet 24 with the passengers every day, so we receive relatively 25 fewer complaints.</p>
Page 110	Page 112
<p>1 If, say, the colleague would have one less day on 2 rest day, he would like to drive, we would have to look 3 at when he applied for that. Say, for example, he said, 4 "Tomorrow I have an appointment with a friend", but 5 then, "The friend would not like to meet with me", then 6 all of a sudden he said, "I have nothing better to do 7 tomorrow so I will work tomorrow", so we will look at 8 whether there is an actual need for him to work 9 tomorrow. Normally, that application will be declined 10 because it is a sudden request, because we have the duty 11 roster drawn up in advance. 12 Then we would also be looking at the guidelines 13 issued by the Transport Department and also we will be 14 mindful of the actual circumstances, whether he is 15 exceeding the duty hours, et cetera. So all these will 16 be looked into. 17 MS MAGGIE WONG: So would this structure of pay provide 18 incentive for the driver to work longer hours or working 19 even if he was sick? 20 MR JAMES WONG: Now, first, when you mentioned he was sick 21 does it mean he's seriously ill or he's not fit for 22 driving, or he is still fit to drive, although he 23 suffers from minor illness? Our system is that if the 24 colleague has some minor illnesses -- well, we would 25 actually look at the extent or the degree of sickness.</p>	<p>1 Another source of our passengers is tourists. 2 Tourists' intention really is to sight-see Hong Kong, so 3 there are fewer disputes involving tourists. And for 4 the regulators, the problems that they encounter mostly 5 have to do with whether passengers can carry luggages on 6 board, and also if people go into Lantau, when they are 7 carrying surfing boards and bicycles, et cetera. The 8 regulators will also tell the passengers if they are too 9 bulky, they should not be carried on board. 10 If there are luggage racks on board, then we will 11 assist the passengers to take them on board. So we 12 experience fewer disputes. 13 MS MAGGIE WONG: We note that earlier we have seen one of 14 the bus safety features adapted in NLB buses include 15 CCTV at driver console with video-record function. Does 16 this camera include or have audio facility? 17 CHAIRMAN: Firstly, can you take us to where this dealt with 18 in the written submission? 19 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, the submission is at page 20, 20 Mr Chairman. 21 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 22 MS MAGGIE WONG: And the bus safety features is at page 453 23 of the NLB-2 bundle. 24 CHAIRMAN: And page 20, would you read out the relevant 25 passage?</p>

Page 113	<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes:</p> <p>2 "In-bus [CCTV] video may also be retrieved in</p> <p>3 real-time to monitor the bus captain or passenger</p> <p>4 situation in restricted to emergency and security</p> <p>5 purpose."</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: And page 453 of NLB-2.</p> <p>7 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, page 453, NLB-2, item 16.</p> <p>8 Does this CCTV system or cameras have audio</p> <p>9 facility?</p> <p>10 MR TIMOTHY WONG: Well, let me explain what kind of cameras</p> <p>11 we have. We have two types of buses. One is</p> <p>12 single-deckers, the other is double-deckers.</p> <p>13 Let's talk about double-deckers first. For the</p> <p>14 newly procured double-deckers, they come with CCTV</p> <p>15 functions. Your question just now is about audio</p> <p>16 recording. The audio function -- the CCTV with audio</p> <p>17 function will be placed on top of the bus captain, and</p> <p>18 for existing single-deckers, for the time being, no CCTV</p> <p>19 has been installed. If we are to retrofit such CCTV</p> <p>20 cameras, it takes a long time, and this system will</p> <p>21 involve recurring costs as well. We have to pay monthly</p> <p>22 fees.</p> <p>23 Given our existing financial burden, we don't have</p> <p>24 plan to retrofit every bus with CCTVs, but for new</p> <p>25 buses, we will actively look into retrofitting CCTVs.</p>	Page 115	<p>1 apparatus or equipment on its buses as may be reasonably</p> <p>2 required by the commissioner of transport after</p> <p>3 consultation with the grantee."</p> <p>4 So, in other words, the Commissioner for Transport</p> <p>5 can reasonably require your company to install service</p> <p>6 enhancement facilities from time to time?</p> <p>7 MR JAMES WONG: Correct.</p> <p>8 MS MAGGIE WONG: Do you have any discussions recently with</p> <p>9 the government about service enhancement facilities?</p> <p>10 MR BENNY CHAN: Mr Chairman, I want to say this. When we</p> <p>11 discussed with the Transport Department on the new</p> <p>12 franchise, the Transport Department has asked us to</p> <p>13 provide certain facilities, and recently, in our</p> <p>14 meetings with the Transport Department, we discussed</p> <p>15 safety devices to be installed on buses. We had</p> <p>16 discussed those with the Transport Department.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: When was that?</p> <p>18 MR JAMES WONG: For the new franchise, that came into effect</p> <p>19 in 2017. We had to look into the exact date. We</p> <p>20 started discussing with the Transport Department towards</p> <p>21 the end of 2015/early 2016, and we discussed what</p> <p>22 enhancement should be made under the new franchise.</p> <p>23 Mr Chan referred to our discussions with the</p> <p>24 Transport Department on safety devices and there was</p> <p>25 a meeting. The meeting was held several months ago. In</p>
Page 114	<p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: You just mentioned that the CCTV with audio</p> <p>2 function will be placed on top of the bus captain. What</p> <p>3 is the purpose of that?</p> <p>4 MR TIMOTHY WONG: The audio function is mainly to help, say,</p> <p>5 if there are passengers making complaints and then, say,</p> <p>6 at our customer service hotline we receive calls about</p> <p>7 disputes with the bus captain, we will retrieve the</p> <p>8 relevant information to look into the real situation.</p> <p>9 We would not on our own initiative retrieve such files.</p> <p>10 MS MAGGIE WONG: So it is reactive to complaints rather than</p> <p>11 on a random checking purpose?</p> <p>12 MR TIMOTHY WONG: Correct.</p> <p>13 MS MAGGIE WONG: The next topic is the design of buses and</p> <p>14 safety devices and if I may invite you to go to NLB-2</p> <p>15 bundle at page 2.</p> <p>16 The franchise agreement starts at page 2. If we go</p> <p>17 to page 5, clause 7.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: Sorry, which bundle is this?</p> <p>19 MS MAGGIE WONG: This is the NLB-2 bundle.</p> <p>20 Could you familiarise yourself with the provisions</p> <p>21 of clause 7(1) at page 5.</p> <p>22 It makes reference to the grantee providing, amongst</p> <p>23 other things:</p> <p>24 "... such safety or service enhancement facilities,</p> <p>25 installation, fixtures, fittings, [et cetera] ...</p>	Page 116	<p>1 fact, we held two meetings in the past several months,</p> <p>2 and going forward we will have a third meeting.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: And when were these meetings?</p> <p>4 MR PATRICK YEUNG: Mr Chairman, if I may add to the answer,</p> <p>5 There should have been three such meetings. After the</p> <p>6 IRC has been established, there was this second working</p> <p>7 group, on 27 March, 30 May and 12 June respectively.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: And these were meetings at which the franchised</p> <p>9 bus operators, bus manufacturers and the Transport</p> <p>10 Department attended; is that correct?</p> <p>11 MR PATRICK YEUNG: Correct.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>13 MS MAGGIE WONG: You refer to the discussions about the</p> <p>14 safety devices. What safety devices were discussed with</p> <p>15 the Transport Department at these three meetings?</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: Perhaps we could leave you with that question for</p> <p>17 the moment because I think it's appropriate we take</p> <p>18 a short break now, because we are going to sit until at</p> <p>19 least 5.30, but I think, given the imposition placed on</p> <p>20 you, that we give you a break. So we will take ten</p> <p>21 minutes now. Thank you.</p> <p>22 Ten minutes.</p> <p>23 (4.32 pm)</p> <p>24 (A short adjournment)</p> <p>25 (4.41 pm)</p>

Page 117	Page 119
<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Ms Wong.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: Just a while ago, Mr Wong, we have provided</p> <p>3 you with the TD bundle 1, page 98.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: What is this document?</p> <p>5 MS MAGGIE WONG: This is the paper of the Transport</p> <p>6 Department, TD_Paper_07, with the title, "Vehicle</p> <p>7 safety -- design, build, examination and inspection of</p> <p>8 franchised buses". It started at page 81. I'm focusing</p> <p>9 on page 98, as to the safety devices of franchised</p> <p>10 buses.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>12 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, Mr Wong, you have had an opportunity</p> <p>13 to read, in particular, paragraph 10?</p> <p>14 MR JAMES WONG: Yes, I read it.</p> <p>15 MS MAGGIE WONG: Are these the safety devices that you</p> <p>16 discussed with the Transport Department in its three</p> <p>17 meetings?</p> <p>18 MR JAMES WONG: Yes. At those three safety-related</p> <p>19 meetings, we had a discussion of the above-mentioned</p> <p>20 safety devices.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: I would like to focus your attention to</p> <p>22 three particular safety devices. First is the</p> <p>23 geo-fencing at (c), "Speed control by GPS or</p> <p>24 geo-fencing".</p> <p>25 Can you give your views or feedbacks regarding the</p>	<p>1 uploaded onto our server.</p> <p>2 For geo-fencing, for this to be used to monitor the</p> <p>3 speed or to control the speed, we are open-minded. We</p> <p>4 hope in the future we can develop a way so that on</p> <p>5 specific road sections we can control the speed.</p> <p>6 So when compared with other operators, I believe</p> <p>7 that we stand a higher chance to do this. This is</p> <p>8 because we have fewer interferences for the road</p> <p>9 sections on Lantau. I think for our black box system,</p> <p>10 I think it would be easier for us to send the GPS data</p> <p>11 correctly to our server.</p> <p>12 What is important is that for the real-time</p> <p>13 transmission of the data from the GPS, and for it to</p> <p>14 interface with the computer on board, it takes time to</p> <p>15 develop the arrangement. This is because currently the</p> <p>16 black box is directly connected to the bus cam. For</p> <p>17 this to be done, however, we have to cooperate with the</p> <p>18 bus manufacturer.</p> <p>19 Of course we welcome the new direction, but as far</p> <p>20 as NLB's IT department is concerned, the scale is such</p> <p>21 that probably it will take it more time to have it</p> <p>22 researched and done, but we certainly welcome such</p> <p>23 a move.</p> <p>24 MS MAGGIE WONG: Now, since we are on the black box, may</p> <p>25 I refer you to your submissions at NLB-1, page 14, first</p>
Page 118	Page 120
<p>1 Transport Department's suggestion of implementing</p> <p>2 a geo-fencing system, ie a speed limiter that uses a GPS</p> <p>3 system to limit the speed of buses at specific road</p> <p>4 sections?</p> <p>5 MR TIMOTHY WONG: Mr Chairman, for us to discuss the GPS</p> <p>6 system, I think we need to talk about the background of</p> <p>7 the black box. As early as 2015 and 2016, when we had</p> <p>8 a negotiation about the new franchise, we identified</p> <p>9 a new supplier of black box. As Mr Chan has already</p> <p>10 said, GPS is nothing new. However, as far as operators</p> <p>11 are concerned, we have to bear in mind the frame point</p> <p>12 to the long-term. For the data collected by GPS as well</p> <p>13 as the black box, we have to transmit the raw data to</p> <p>14 the server of the company.</p> <p>15 Between 2012 and 2015, at that time there was</p> <p>16 another black box supplier for our company. Many</p> <p>17 suppliers in the market provide the maintenance on</p> <p>18 a recurrent basis in the form of a monthly cost. For</p> <p>19 our long-term development, in 2016 we acquired the black</p> <p>20 box. Of course the black box has got important</p> <p>21 functions. At that time, under the new franchise</p> <p>22 agreement, we had to provide the ETA function. We</p> <p>23 looked at two suppliers and we chose our current</p> <p>24 supplier, called Openmatics. For the GPS of this</p> <p>25 supplier as well as the raw data produced, they can be</p>	<p>1 of all. The second-last paragraph, you stated:</p> <p>2 "Through our in-house information technology team,</p> <p>3 we planned to develop an exceptional report system of</p> <p>4 using 'on-bus' black box data log to generate reports</p> <p>5 actively to spot any bus captain with potential hazard</p> <p>6 of their driving habit."</p> <p>7 If I also take you to page 20 of your submission,</p> <p>8 second-last paragraph:</p> <p>9 "As per commencement of 2nd generation black box</p> <p>10 system in late 2017, it provides lowest level of raw</p> <p>11 data of its data log. Additional application such as</p> <p>12 generation of exceptional report of vehicle speed at</p> <p>13 certain location is not included. We are now developing</p> <p>14 our in-house software to provide such information for</p> <p>15 bus captain performance monitoring purpose. At present,</p> <p>16 we will check and consolidate the raw data from data log</p> <p>17 manually upon traffic incident and passenger complaint</p> <p>18 investigation."</p> <p>19 Now, do I understand this to suggest at the moment</p> <p>20 your company does not have an over-speed exceptional</p> <p>21 report generated automatically?</p> <p>22 MR TIMOTHY WONG: At this point of time, no. When we were</p> <p>23 writing this document, we have considered introducing</p> <p>24 the exceptional report function in relation to speeding.</p> <p>25 MS MAGGIE WONG: If I may also take you to NLB-1, page 33,</p>

Page 121	Page 123
<p>1 the first box on the right. In response to the 2 committee's further questions, you provided 3 supplementary information, and you stated: 4 "Refer to our existing black box system, it can 5 record multiple bus operations information, which 6 includes geographical location, speed, orientation, 7 gear, door, bell push, [et cetera] by every second. To 8 record and manipulate all these large number of data, it 9 is require heavy capital investment of data 10 transmission, data storage system and sophisticated 11 software to do so." 12 Now, it made reference to this "heavy capital 13 investment". May I ask if your company is prepared to 14 invest on this system, as you stated there? 15 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you. 16 When it comes to our finances, out of the bus 17 operators, our company is of the smallest scale. When 18 it comes to development of softwares or new systems, the 19 cost involved, whether it is one bus or 1,000 buses, the 20 development cost will not differ much. The major 21 difference is hardware on board our buses. In our work 22 to continuously strengthen our input in this regard, say 23 for example what Tim has said, generation of exceptional 24 report, we are willing to make such investments. 25 But you must understand that if we calculate the</p>	<p>1 You say there are two elements of cost. One is the 2 black box and the other is software. Do I understand 3 you correctly? 4 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) Yes, correct. 5 CHAIRMAN: What is the cost of a black box, in ballpark 6 figures? 7 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) When we first purchased it in 8 2016, per unit, it's EUR800 per unit, which is 9 approximately HK\$8,000-something back in 2016 and -- 10 CHAIRMAN: Do I take it the black box side of the cost isn't 11 the significant cost? 12 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) Significant. 13 CHAIRMAN: You say it is significant? 14 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) It is significant, yes. 15 CHAIRMAN: Right. What about software? 16 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) Software, at the moment we 17 have three headcounts maintaining this programme. 18 Actually, the ETA apps and system we developed back in 19 2016 up till now, total cost around HK\$1 million, and 20 there's another issue that I would like to raise up, the 21 installation cost, installation cost of the black box, 22 because it requires skilful professional technician to 23 install this black box. It requires connection with the 24 supplier, who are teams from Czech Republic. 25 CHAIRMAN: This is Openmatics?</p>
Page 122	Page 124
<p>1 cost per bus, our cost will be much higher than other 2 operators. 3 MR TIMOTHY WONG: I would like to add that our current 4 investment is on mainly two areas. First, hardware. 5 Black boxes on board buses, and the transmission of 6 black box data to our server. When it comes to 7 software, as we have said, we buy black box for our 8 back-end system software development, there is a fee. 9 In the new franchise, we are required to provide ETA; 10 there is a development fee. Every month, the upload 11 fees or transmission fee of bus data, all these are 12 development cost, and there is also manpower required to 13 maintain this system. 14 Just now we said that the black box is able to 15 record information by every second. Currently, our 16 system will upload the information once every 30 17 seconds. If it's changed to every second, the fees and 18 the server size will have to be enhanced. That is what 19 we mean by capital investment. It's mainly the software 20 development fee. 21 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Wong, you made reference to the 22 development of this software. When would you expect 23 your company -- 24 CHAIRMAN: Before you get involved in that, perhaps I could 25 ask this.</p>	<p>1 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) Openmatics, yes, in Czech 2 Republic. 3 Back in 2016, when we have not acquired our in-house 4 technician, per bus, installation per bus, it's up to 5 HK\$4,000 per bus. 6 CHAIRMAN: Up to? 7 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) Up to. It depends on the 8 amount of buses that we can provide for the company to 9 install black boxes. 10 CHAIRMAN: You were dealing with software and you said there 11 are three accounts. You dealt with installation of the 12 ETA requirement. What about the other accounts? 13 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) Sorry, Chairman, do you mean 14 the other headcounts for IT department, or do you mean 15 the installation? 16 CHAIRMAN: No, the other accounts, as you called them. 17 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) Oh, headcounts. 18 CHAIRMAN: As in head? 19 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) As in number of employees, 20 sorry. So we need three -- 21 CHAIRMAN: Who are the other two? 22 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) A total number of three 23 persons have been deployed to develop the programme. 24 I'm sorry. 25 CHAIRMAN: So the cost is three people; is that it? That's</p>

Page 125	Page 127
<p>1 what "headcounts" means? 2 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) Yes, exactly. 3 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 4 Ms Wong. 5 MS MAGGIE WONG: You earlier stated that your company 6 planned to develop this exceptional report system to 7 generate reports, to spot bus captains' potential hazard 8 behaviour. 9 When would you expect this to be done? 10 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) 2018, quarter 3 -- sorry, 11 quarter 4 of 2018. 12 MS MAGGIE WONG: So later this year? 13 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) Yes. 14 CHAIRMAN: That will be an exceptional over-speed report, 15 4th quarter 2018? 16 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) That's correct. 17 MS MAGGIE WONG: We've heard other bus companies setting the 18 criteria at speeds of over 5 kilometres per hour for 19 every road section with certain speed limit, say over 20 55 kilometres per hour for ten consecutive seconds, for 21 road sections with speed limit of 50 kilometres per 22 hour. We have heard a bus operator using this criteria. 23 Can you tell us what criteria your company would be 24 using for these Openmatics generated reports? 25 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) We have to confirm the</p>	<p>1 be introduced in the 4th quarter of 2018, is that one 2 that is intended to be done real-time, or is this 3 something that will be generated subsequently? 4 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) Real-time. 5 CHAIRMAN: And the system, as I understand it to be in 6 place, is an upload every 30 seconds from a bus; do 7 I understand you correctly? 8 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) Currently, yes, but we are 9 hoping to upload data from the black box per second in 10 the coming future. 11 CHAIRMAN: Yes, and you indicated that there was a cost 12 attached to doing it every second? 13 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) Yes. 14 CHAIRMAN: What is that cost? 15 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) The network fee, so it 16 requires more gigabytes to upload data every second. At 17 the moment it's being uploaded every 30 seconds because 18 all the data have been zipped and been uploaded to our 19 server, so it requires less gigabytes to do it every 30 20 seconds rather than every second. 21 CHAIRMAN: Do you have a ballpark figure for the extra cost? 22 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) Not right now, sorry. 23 CHAIRMAN: Nothing at all? No range? 24 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) Around HK\$100 per bus. 25 CHAIRMAN: Per what?</p>
Page 126	Page 128
<p>1 criteria. We will be negotiating with our labour union 2 to come up with a final decision, but we will take the 3 other operator as a consideration as well. 4 MS MAGGIE WONG: And whether your company would consider 5 this real-time capability to be concerned only with the 6 matter of speed, or would you take into account other 7 faults of the driver, for example sudden braking, 8 excessive acceleration, that sort of thing; would that 9 be picked up? 10 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) At the moment, we consider 11 speeding as a priority for the exceptional report, but 12 we could also look at hard braking, harsh turn. Yeah, 13 we will need to study further. Thank you. 14 MS MAGGIE WONG: Would you also consider giving real-time 15 information or monitoring alerts to the particular bus 16 driver when that occurs? 17 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) Again, we will consider and 18 we will need to speak to our labour union to discuss 19 whether this will affect the driving -- it might affect 20 the attention of the drivers, if there are too many 21 alerts. 22 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. If we go back to your 23 submissions at page 14. 24 CHAIRMAN: Just before you do that, this exceptional 25 over-speed report, which is the one that is planned to</p>	<p>1 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) Per black box. 2 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 3 MEMBER LO: Per month? 4 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) Per month, yes. 5 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. 6 CHAIRMAN: I'm sorry, before you move on, have you discussed 7 these issues of cost with the Transport Department? 8 MR JAMES WONG: I don't think we did, no. 9 CHAIRMAN: Because we've looked at the list of the devices 10 that the special group, the Transport Department 11 convened I think in March this year where there have 12 been three meetings. One thing that is missing from the 13 six items that have been discussed is the black boxes or 14 Openmatics devices. Am I correct? 15 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) It's not on the agenda but 16 I suppose all bus operators have installed black box on 17 it. 18 CHAIRMAN: But it's not on the agenda -- has it been 19 discussed? 20 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) I think they discussed about 21 the black box indirectly, relating to geo-fencing. 22 CHAIRMAN: And who set this agenda, if that's what one can 23 call it? 24 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) The Transport Department. 25 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p>

Page 129	Page 131
<p>1 Yes, Ms Wong.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: If we look at your NLB submission at</p> <p>3 page 14, it's the third paragraph from the top, the last</p> <p>4 sentence:</p> <p>5 "At present, a random selected 50 trips of black box</p> <p>6 data will be retrieved every month and this random check</p> <p>7 report will [be sent] to TD for their record."</p> <p>8 And this was put in place in March 2018. Can</p> <p>9 I first of all ask -- it talks about selecting 50 routes</p> <p>10 at random -- who selects these routes?</p> <p>11 MR JAMES WONG: Our company. It's 50 trips.</p> <p>12 MS MAGGIE WONG: What is the criteria for selecting these 50</p> <p>13 trips?</p> <p>14 MR JAMES WONG: It's random. It's at random.</p> <p>15 MS MAGGIE WONG: And what, if anything, would be checked by</p> <p>16 your company in this report? For example, speeding, or</p> <p>17 any information you can provide us?</p> <p>18 MR BILLY WONG: Chairman, in our second submission, in the</p> <p>19 last page, you will find a table in relation to black</p> <p>20 box data that we checked.</p> <p>21 MS MAGGIE WONG: That's page 487 of NLB-2 bundle.</p> <p>22 MR BILLY WONG: Yes, it's the one shown on the screen, this</p> <p>23 report. As per the request of the TD, we have randomly</p> <p>24 checked 50 trips of black box data. We will look at the</p> <p>25 speed, whether there is any hard braking and any</p>	<p>1 the buses are taking the wrong route or taking the wrong</p> <p>2 timing, then that means the bus drivers or bus captains</p> <p>3 are, you know, having abnormal behaviour.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: When you refer to X/Y axis, do you mean latitude</p> <p>5 and longitude?</p> <p>6 MR BILLY WONG: Yes, correct.</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: And the orientation, is that the magnetic</p> <p>8 direction of the bus?</p> <p>9 MR BILLY WONG: Yes, correct.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>11 Yes, Ms Wong.</p> <p>12 MS MAGGIE WONG: If I may take you to your forward planning</p> <p>13 programme submitted by your company at TD bundle 1,</p> <p>14 page 236 to 237. 236 is at the bottom.</p> <p>15 We can see that there is a "Plan for automation of</p> <p>16 monitoring bus captain driving behaviour through data</p> <p>17 captured in black boxes or similar devices."</p> <p>18 It mentioned about retrieval of data that requires</p> <p>19 special analysis, and if we go to page 237 at the top:</p> <p>20 "Analysis results could be put forward for</p> <p>21 prevention studies to avoid accidents of similar</p> <p>22 nature."</p> <p>23 Has your company carried out any prevention studies</p> <p>24 or any reports of that nature?</p> <p>25 MR JAMES WONG: Can we look at the previous page?</p>
<p>Page 130</p> <p>1 abnormal driving behaviour. In this report, we only</p> <p>2 report a number we have -- a number of normal behaviour</p> <p>3 and abnormal behaviour.</p> <p>4 In relation to more detail, say location, time, what</p> <p>5 happened, that is the raw data, they are not required in</p> <p>6 this report.</p> <p>7 Thank you.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: How do you define "hard braking"?</p> <p>9 MR BILLY WONG: Our information shows that if the G force</p> <p>10 reaches 0.2, then there is serious hard braking. So</p> <p>11 that we count as hard braking.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Is that one of the requirements in the 2003</p> <p>13 Transport Department requirements in respect of black</p> <p>14 box, 0.2G?</p> <p>15 MR BILLY WONG: Yes, that is correct. The guidelines</p> <p>16 mention that, say, if there are accidents, then we have</p> <p>17 to provide data on G force.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: Abnormal driving behaviour is monitored in these</p> <p>19 50 random trip checks?</p> <p>20 MR BILLY WONG: Mr Chairman, the black box will also record</p> <p>21 the topographical location of the buses, the X/Y axis,</p> <p>22 et cetera. So we can look at the geographical location</p> <p>23 and the orientation that the bus is supposed to be in,</p> <p>24 and then we can compare that against the actual</p> <p>25 situation. If these two do not match, then that means</p>	<p>Page 132</p> <p>1 MS MAGGIE WONG: Yes, it is at page 236.</p> <p>2 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>3 When we drew up the five-year plan, we did have such</p> <p>4 a plan, but as of today we haven't been able to deliver</p> <p>5 the plan. At this moment in time, we haven't worked on</p> <p>6 it. As we said, we have hope that by the end of this</p> <p>7 year we could strengthen work in that area.</p> <p>8 MS MAGGIE WONG: If I could go back to the TD bundle at</p> <p>9 page 198 -- I have finished the topic on the black box.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: Before we move away from the black boxes, may</p> <p>11 I ask that NLB-1, page 33, be put up on the screen.</p> <p>12 It's that top box on the right-hand side. You speak</p> <p>13 there about the existing black box system. You speak</p> <p>14 about the recording and manipulation of the data. and</p> <p>15 the "heavy capital investment of data transmission, data</p> <p>16 storage system and sophisticated software".</p> <p>17 Then you say this:</p> <p>18 "At the time being ..."</p> <p>19 I think it perhaps means this: "At the moment, it</p> <p>20 is not a mandatory requirement for franchised bus</p> <p>21 operators to perform real-time bus captain performance</p> <p>22 monitoring by black box system ..."</p> <p>23 I take it that's a reference to the 2003, 15 years</p> <p>24 old, requirement of the Transport Department.</p> <p>25 Am I correct?</p>

Page 133	Page 135
<p>1 MR JAMES WONG: Yes, correct. That was the 2003 standards.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: And the position being taken is that this is not</p> <p>3 a requirement of the Transport Department, so am I right</p> <p>4 to interpret this as, "And therefore we have a choice as</p> <p>5 to what we do"?</p> <p>6 MR JAMES WONG: Mr Chairman, my colleague has mentioned</p> <p>7 this. After 2003, while we were required to install</p> <p>8 black box, so all along we have been using an old model</p> <p>9 of black box. We couldn't upload certain data to our</p> <p>10 server, and when we started discussing the new franchise</p> <p>11 in 2016, we needed to work on ETA, so we replaced the</p> <p>12 old black box with a new model of the black box.</p> <p>13 Now, once the new model of black box was put in</p> <p>14 place, we realised that we could do more. Of course,</p> <p>15 you mentioned -- I believe that if I understand you</p> <p>16 correctly, for NLB, could we do more? The answer is</p> <p>17 always in the affirmative. We can always do more. We</p> <p>18 will continue to review and we want to progress.</p> <p>19 And honestly, given our scale, we were not in full</p> <p>20 grasp of the latest developments in the sector, and so</p> <p>21 please allow us some time for us to keep abreast of the</p> <p>22 developments and catch up.</p> <p>23 Thank you.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: It was the requirement that you provide</p> <p>25 an estimated time of arrival of buses, the ETA system</p>	<p>1 is to provide tools for the bus company to monitor and</p> <p>2 manage the on-road speed- and safety-related behaviour</p> <p>3 of its buses, and indirectly to encourage better driving</p> <p>4 behaviour."</p> <p>5 That was the initial purpose. Do you still regard</p> <p>6 this as the purpose of this equipment?</p> <p>7 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) Yes.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>9 Ms Wong.</p> <p>10 MS MAGGIE WONG: If I may move on to the Transport</p> <p>11 Department's suggestion of installing speed display unit</p> <p>12 in passenger compartment.</p> <p>13 If I may take you to the TD bundle 1, page 102 to</p> <p>14 103, paragraphs 21 to 22.</p> <p>15 21 states:</p> <p>16 "It is a device which can be installed in the</p> <p>17 passenger compartments. It captures the real-time</p> <p>18 signal from the vehicle speed sensor and provides</p> <p>19 a visual display of the current speed to the passengers</p> <p>20 on board ... The existing SDU installed on a public</p> <p>21 light bus which may resemble the installation of the</p> <p>22 proposed device on a [franchised bus] ..."</p> <p>23 If we go to paragraph 22, the last five lines:</p> <p>24 "In addition, the FB operators are concerned that</p> <p>25 SDU would create conflicts and arguments between the bus</p>
Page 134	Page 136
<p>1 that you refer to, that led to the enhancement of the</p> <p>2 black boxes; am I correct?</p> <p>3 MR JAMES WONG: Correct.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: Could we have back on the screen the 2003</p> <p>5 Transport Department guidelines.</p> <p>6 So being able to monitor real-time the behaviour of</p> <p>7 drivers comes as a side-wind from having to do estimated</p> <p>8 time of arrival of buses for the benefit of passengers;</p> <p>9 is that right?</p> <p>10 I'm coming to the other document in a moment. I'm</p> <p>11 just establishing what I think is the position, that it</p> <p>12 is ETA that produces by a side-door the ability to do</p> <p>13 things real-time?</p> <p>14 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) I think the ETA system gave</p> <p>15 us a doorway to look into more sophisticated black box</p> <p>16 systems. As I have mentioned earlier, the old one we</p> <p>17 used, we are not able to retrieve the data to our</p> <p>18 server; we have to speak to the supplier and get all the</p> <p>19 reports. So, yes, the ETA system gave us a doorway to</p> <p>20 look into a new system.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Because if one looks at this document, the 2003</p> <p>22 guidelines, the Transport Department spell out in the</p> <p>23 very first sentence what is the purpose of this</p> <p>24 equipment, and it is this, is it not:</p> <p>25 "The purpose of the electronic data recording device</p>	<p>1 captain and passengers, and impose additional pressure</p> <p>2 on the bus captains which in turn would affect the</p> <p>3 safety for bus driving. The FB operators consider that</p> <p>4 the SDU is not conducive in enhancing bus safety."</p> <p>5 Do you accept the summary made by the Transport</p> <p>6 Department at paragraph 22 as to your company's</p> <p>7 position?</p> <p>8 MR JAMES WONG: Yes, thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>9 Regarding the speed display unit, I would like to</p> <p>10 supplement. Of course it would be up to the committee</p> <p>11 to verify the truth of what I am going to say. We</p> <p>12 understand that for public light buses which have</p> <p>13 installed this speed display unit, these SDUs were</p> <p>14 installed in 2005 and then in 2010 or even afterwards,</p> <p>15 it was decided that the speed limiter and the black</p> <p>16 boxes were installed afterwards. When they installed</p> <p>17 the SDU, the main reason was that for public light</p> <p>18 buses, their operation is very different from the buses.</p> <p>19 They are mainly operated by small and medium sized</p> <p>20 operators. But for franchised buses, there are mainly</p> <p>21 three operators. And the bus captains of public light</p> <p>22 buses may not have an employment relationship with the</p> <p>23 operators. Maybe it's just the owners of the PLBs will</p> <p>24 handle the management of some managers who in turn lease</p> <p>25 the public light buses to the drivers. So there is</p>

Page 137	Page 139
<p>1 no one to monitor the drivers' attitude and the driving 2 habits. Well, in extreme cases, that is like that. 3 And in 2005, the SDUs were installed and the 4 passengers on board, before the SDUs were installed, 5 felt they were in danger because of speeding and they 6 lodged a number of complaints and there were a series of 7 accidents and ultimately the administration believed 8 that speed limiters should also be installed on the 9 public light buses. 10 Our view is that if SDU is installed in bus 11 compartments, it means that the passenger will know 12 about the speed every second. So let's take a step 13 backwards. If the passengers know that there is 14 speeding, do they have a brake to press on that they can 15 retard the vehicles? Then what would happen is that the 16 passengers will talk to the bus captain and ask him to 17 "Drive more slowly because you are speeding". We all 18 have to be mindful about the passenger's attitude. They 19 may be angry passengers and they may display very good 20 behaviour. We don't know. 21 Should we be posing a notice on the bus compartment, 22 asking the passengers to call a certain number if they 23 find there is speeding? Maybe some passengers will do 24 that. But there is a high possibility, however, that 25 the passengers will confront the bus captains.</p>	<p>1 won't help us. 2 Thank you. 3 CHAIRMAN: Let's assume it is a complaint about speed. 4 "This bus driver was going too fast." Would you accept 5 that if there is a speed display unit, one thing 6 a passenger could do was simply take a photograph of the 7 speed display unit, so there would then be empirical 8 evidence to substantiate the complaint? 9 MR JAMES WONG: Mr Chairman, as to the scenario that you 10 refer to, so there is a speed display unit indicating 11 the speed of the vehicle, the passenger takes 12 a photograph. If it can clearly show the location, the 13 section of the road, then perhaps it can achieve the 14 effect that you mentioned, so using that photograph as 15 a piece of evidence. But if it only shows the speed of 16 the vehicle, it will still be difficult to tell with 17 certainty as to when and where the photograph has been 18 taken. 19 CHAIRMAN: Let's make it simple. A franchised bus is not 20 permitted to do more than 70 kilometres per hour; is 21 that correct? 22 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) Yes. 23 CHAIRMAN: So if the speed display unit showed 80 kilometres 24 per hour and the passenger took a photograph, that would 25 be objective empirical evidence of the behaviour of the</p>
Page 138	Page 140
<p>1 Given today's technology, if there is a technical 2 means to make sure there is no speeding of the buses, 3 then we would prefer to do that, instead of asking the 4 passengers to confront the bus captains and have 5 conflicts with them. This is the last thing that we 6 would like to see. 7 Thank you, Mr Chairman. 8 MS MAGGIE WONG: The last matter in the safety device at 9 page 98 of TD-1 is the driver monitoring device. 10 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on to that, perhaps just dealing 11 with what you've just had to say -- of course it's 12 an offence, is it not, under the regulations to the 13 ordinance, to talk to the bus driver whilst he's 14 driving; it's an offence, criminal offence? 15 MR JAMES WONG: He must not disturb the bus captain. 16 CHAIRMAN: Or the word might have been "distract" but yes, 17 that's the spirit of the regulation. 18 At the moment, you respond to complaints that you 19 have received from passengers, and that's when you might 20 do, as I understand it, a search of the black box, to 21 see if the complaint is made out? 22 MR JAMES WONG: It depends on the nature of the complaint, 23 whether it is about the speed or the driving 24 performance. If the complainant is not complaining 25 about such matters, even if we turn to the black box, it</p>	<p>1 bus at that time? 2 MR JAMES WONG: Mr Chairman, you said that a photograph has 3 been taken, it indicates 80 km/h. Initially, I think 4 you need to take a photograph of the registration 5 number, to indicate who the bus captain is, because 6 after all it's an allegation, it's a complaint from the 7 passenger, saying he's on a particular bus. I haven't 8 thought through this or think in this direction, but you 9 outlined a scenario as to whether this can become the 10 evidence for this. I'm just sort of giving you some 11 initial response. 12 CHAIRMAN: So you mentioned the possibility of putting 13 a number up for the passengers to call, earlier on in 14 your evidence. If this was displayed, an email address 15 could be provided so that the passenger whilst he's on 16 a bus could email the speed of the vehicle to the 17 Transport Department, to your headquarters; do you 18 accept that? 19 MR JAMES WONG: Yes. Say, for example, in future, if we 20 have to install a speed display unit on board, we would 21 accept the arrangement that we allow the passenger to 22 inform the company directly, so that we can resolve the 23 problem. I'm sure this is much better than the 24 passenger taking it up with the driver, because there 25 may be a confrontation.</p>

Page 141	Page 143
<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Thank you. 2 Ms Wong. 3 MS MAGGIE WONG: Would this not have a deterrent effect on 4 the bus captain in not over-speeding? Because the real 5 source of the problem is not to over-speed, so if you 6 put on a speed display unit, the drivers know, the 7 passengers know, everyone knows. Wouldn't that 8 discourage the bus captains in not driving excessively 9 or over-speeding? 10 MR JAMES WONG: In reality, I believe of course, as the 11 Chinese say, your fingers are of different lengths. The 12 majority of our bus captains in our company are good 13 drivers. But of course there may be some who are more 14 aloof or they are more impatient. 15 Ms Wong, just now, you mentioned that perhaps many 16 people see that a driver is speeding; will this create 17 a lot of pressure on him? I won't say that, but 18 of course good colleagues, they will never speed, they 19 will never over-speed. But for others who are more 20 impatient -- just thinking off the cuff -- it all 21 depends on what happens. Say, for example, when we 22 receive an over-speed report, it all depends on whether 23 we are being harsh about the penalty given in relation 24 to the safety bonus, and some colleagues may care a lot 25 about that. But I don't think that just because many</p>	<p>1 that would enhance our overall safety. We will continue 2 to keep an open mind and we will watch the development. 3 However, if you ask me, my initial understanding of 4 the news report is as follows. If you ask for my 5 priority, of course we want to make good use of our 6 existing resources, because, after all, the service that 7 we provide covers a shorter distance, so perhaps this is 8 not the most urgent item for us at this moment in time, 9 but we will be watching the development. 10 MS MAGGIE WONG: I'm going to the last topic. It's the 11 financial information of your company. 12 If you look at NLB bundle 2, page 71, it is 13 a document of fuller disclosure of financial and 14 operational information, and that's for the year 15 2012/2013. 16 If we go to page 72, it stated that for the year 17 ended 31 March 2013, the total turnover was 18 approximately 145.5 million, with a profit of 19 approximately HK\$9.52 million. Do you see that? 20 And if we go to page 132, that's for 2014 and 2015, 21 and if we see the income, the revenue, we see there are 22 three sources of income or revenue: the fare revenue, 23 advertising income, and the sundry income. 24 Can you tell us where the advertising income comes 25 from?</p>
Page 142	Page 144
<p>1 people witness the speeding, so he has the pressure. On 2 the other hand, it depends on how he sees it himself. 3 Say, for example, he's worried that driving points will 4 be deducted or he's worried that there may be 5 an accident. Sometimes, excessive speed may be the 6 result of overconfidence on the part of the driver, or 7 he may be a bit impatient or he thinks that he is in 8 control of the bus. 9 MS MAGGIE WONG: Moving on to the driver monitoring device. 10 Can I take you to the website of the Ming Pao newspaper. 11 The article talks about the anti-dozing device. Could 12 you just read through briefly the publication on the 13 website. It is dated 27 May this year. 14 The article, in summary, provided some sort of 15 monitoring device for the benefit of bus driver on the 16 buses which will ply between Hong Kong, Macau and Zhuhai 17 on the new bridge. Are you aware of that? 18 MR JAMES WONG: Yes. Yes. I have come across this in the 19 news. 20 MS MAGGIE WONG: Do you have any plan with regard to 21 exploring what this system -- apparently researched and 22 developed in the mainland -- might provide for the 23 company? 24 MR JAMES WONG: Mr Chairman, at this moment, we will 25 continue to pay attention. We won't say no to anything</p>	<p>1 MR TIMOTHY WONG: Mr Chairman, for the advertising income, 2 it is drawn from the bus body. Different from the other 3 two bus companies, we don't have a lot of advertisements 4 at our bus stops. The main source of income for 5 advertising comes from the bus body, the advertisements. 6 MS MAGGIE WONG: What about the sundry income? 7 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you, Mr Chairman. 8 In NLB, say for example, we have an agreement with 9 Ngong Ping 360. If the cable car system has to be 10 suspended suddenly, say for example due to weather or 11 other reasons, then we will provide immediate support. 12 In addition, at our bus depots, we have got the 13 arrangement to provide annual inspection for the 14 non-franchised buses, and we charge a fee for that. 15 Thank you. 16 MS MAGGIE WONG: If we see on this page, at page 132, we see 17 the advertising income was \$493,000, and in 2014/2015 it 18 is \$438,000. 19 But if we go to 2016 and 2017, that's at page 182, 20 we see the advertising income dropped significantly; in 21 2015/2016 to 190,000, and in 2016/2017, to 87,000. 22 Can you tell us the reasons? 23 MR TIMOTHY WONG: If you look at the case 2012/2013 to 24 2013/2014, at the time the advertising income was 25 relatively high because we had the Shenzhen Bay Port</p>

Page 145	Page 147
<p>1 route. On the part of the company, it was rather 2 attractive to the clients in advertisements. For 3 2015/2016 and up to now, for this kind of advertisements 4 on the bus body, relatively speaking they aren't as 5 attractive to our clients who like to place 6 advertisements.</p> <p>7 Take Shenzhen Bay as an example. Many clients have 8 stopped placing advertisements. This is because the 9 production cost to put the advertisements on the bus 10 body are expensive, and then for the media agencies, for 11 this traditional form of advertisements, this is no 12 longer attractive and therefore we see a huge drop. 13 Very soon, we will have the Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macau 14 Bridge being commissioned. We believe there will be 15 an increase in the advertising income because many 16 clients have become interested in the new port. 17 Therefore the advertising income in relation to our 18 routes, since we are running along hilly routes and they 19 are not so visible, and so for Lantau routes and for 20 South Lantau routes they cannot attract advertising 21 income. For Tung Chung, we can have some local 22 advertisements, say for example related to markets, but 23 they are not going to draw a lot of income.</p> <p>24 For Shenzhen Bay Port, currently, since it has 25 already got a long history now -- for others who would</p>	<p>1 concerned, our company is of the idea that it covers all 2 departments. Every month or on a bi-weekly basis, all 3 the management as indicated on this organisation chart, 4 the management staff will come together and talk about 5 it. Every time we talk about bus safety. In a recent 6 meeting we focused on training schools, so you can't see 7 a particular person dedicated to safety.</p> <p>8 Bus safety is the duty of the entire team of the 9 entire bus company.</p> <p>10 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Can I ask a question on that. If 11 a terrible accident happens, what would happen within 12 your organisation?</p> <p>13 MR TIMOTHY WONG: You mean should there be an accident, what 14 our team will do? There is an established system in 15 place to deal with accidents, regardless of the size of 16 the accident. So we have a complete structure to deal 17 with that. I can't tell you off the top of my head, but 18 I can supplement information in relation to our 19 procedures dealing with accidents. I apologise.</p> <p>20 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Thank you.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: No doubt you can provide that to us in due 22 course.</p> <p>23 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) Okay. 24 (Via interpreter) And I would like to add -- well, 25 what I would like to say is that ISO 39001 has been</p>
Page 146	Page 148
<p>1 like to place advertisements, they would rather opt for 2 other forms of transport, like the cross-boundary buses.</p> <p>3 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you.</p> <p>4 If I may take you to bundle NLB-2, page 27, that's 5 your franchise agreement clause 34. This clause refers 6 to an annual system report, and may I ask what is the 7 name of the auditing body for you to comply with this 8 clause 34?</p> <p>9 MR JAMES WONG: Allow us a bit of time to look up the 10 information for you.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN: Yes, take your time.</p> <p>12 MR JAMES WONG: Yes, Mr Chairman. It is a local accountancy 13 firm called Tony Yau & Company. We can give you the 14 full name after the hearing.</p> <p>15 MS MAGGIE WONG: Thank you. Would you be able to provide us 16 with a sample of the latest annual system audit report 17 by this company?</p> <p>18 MR JAMES WONG: Of course, yes.</p> <p>19 MS MAGGIE WONG: Lastly, if I can take you to the same 20 bundle, NLB-2, page 196. That's your organisational 21 chart. It shows the senior management structure of your 22 company.</p> <p>23 Can you tell us whether the company has a dedicated 24 safety department?</p> <p>25 MR TIMOTHY WONG: Mr Chairman, as far as bus safety is</p>	<p>1 mentioned by the committee. The stance of our company 2 is that we strongly support achieving that standard. 3 Back in 2017, when we used on a trial basis 4 double-decker buses on route 3M, we would like to 5 achieve this international standard.</p> <p>6 First of all, in our Mui Wo depot, we have done 7 three ISOs. That is ISO 39001 quality system, 14001 8 environmental system, and ISO 18001, occupational safety 9 and management.</p> <p>10 In May 2018, that is last month, we have been 11 authorised to use it starting from the middle of 2017, 12 we have in our depot updated our system for the 13 verification. BSI, that is the company responsible for 14 ISO, told us about ISO 39001.</p> <p>15 Our view at that time was we were concerned that if 16 ISO 39001 is to be implemented company-wide, the cost 17 will be high. However, when we talked further with the 18 company, we found that it can be put on a trial basis by 19 route.</p> <p>20 So when it comes to B4 and B6, in relation to the 21 Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macau Bridge, when it is commissioned, 22 we will take the initiative to cooperate with BSI to 23 obtain ISO 39001 for these two routes.</p> <p>24 If we achieve success for these two routes, then we 25 will use it on the route that we use a double-decker bus</p>

Page 149	Page 151
<p>1 in order to achieve the ISO 39001 accreditation.</p> <p>2 MS MAGGIE WONG: In what way does ISO 39001 standard improve</p> <p>3 or raise the level of safe driving? Can you be more</p> <p>4 specific about this?</p> <p>5 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) Sorry, I will use English</p> <p>6 because I have been reading it and understand it in</p> <p>7 English.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: You can use whatever language you like.</p> <p>9 MR TIMOTHY WONG: (In English) The scope of the ISO is to</p> <p>10 develop and implement road traffic policy to improve the</p> <p>11 company's performance. In order to establish and</p> <p>12 implement such system, most important is to have the</p> <p>13 organisation, to have a standard between the</p> <p>14 organisation. So, in other words, there is no uniform</p> <p>15 standard from BSI or anyone.</p> <p>16 So what the organisation needs to do is to create</p> <p>17 a uniform standard which could promote and implement</p> <p>18 road traffic safety system.</p> <p>19 We cannot guarantee -- using this system, we cannot</p> <p>20 guarantee zero accidents, but the new system could help</p> <p>21 reduce the number of incidents and also improve whenever</p> <p>22 there -- improve our back-end system and our support</p> <p>23 whenever there is an accident.</p> <p>24 One of the key issues or one of the key elements of</p> <p>25 ISO is the importance of internal audit. Having the</p>	<p>1 than that, the total number.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: Let me just confirm this. You have altogether</p> <p>3 113 routes; is that right?</p> <p>4 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) No, should be more than that.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: More than that?</p> <p>6 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) Yes, More than that.</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: Then perhaps you can come back to us. What I'm</p> <p>8 interested in is being told what proportion of your</p> <p>9 routes are special shifts, and perhaps you can answer</p> <p>10 this now, if not, say so, but with a special shift,</p> <p>11 where the bus captain has a three-hour rest break, can</p> <p>12 you tell us where on these special shifts he would get</p> <p>13 out of his bus and he would come back three hours later?</p> <p>14 Because relevant to that is what are the rest facilities</p> <p>15 that you provide at that place.</p> <p>16 So are you in a position to answer that now or would</p> <p>17 you prefer to come back with a written explanation?</p> <p>18 MR JAMES WONG: Well, it involves a lot of information.</p> <p>19 Perhaps we will collate the information before we send</p> <p>20 it to the committee.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Please provide that information. And if</p> <p>22 there are no facilities or limited facilities for rest,</p> <p>23 no doubt you can explain if this is one of the places</p> <p>24 where you have applied for facilities but haven't been</p> <p>25 granted permission, so that we can understand the</p>
Page 150	Page 152
<p>1 internal audit could help us improve and sustain our</p> <p>2 safety management system within the company in the</p> <p>3 longer run.</p> <p>4 So, in the meantime, we have confirmed with BSI that</p> <p>5 we will go ahead with the ISO examination with our new</p> <p>6 routes, B4 and B6. The whole process is yet to proceed</p> <p>7 because the bridge hasn't been opened yet, so hopefully</p> <p>8 by year-end we could give the committee good news that</p> <p>9 we will be able to acquire the standard for our new</p> <p>10 routes.</p> <p>11 Thank you.</p> <p>12 MS MAGGIE WONG: Mr Chairman, I have finished my questions</p> <p>13 Thank you.</p> <p>14 Thank you, gentlemen.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: One matter, Mr Wong, I would like to come back to</p> <p>16 you on, and that was the information you gave us about</p> <p>17 the use of special shifts. They are the 14-hour shifts.</p> <p>18 You told us that they were used on eight routes, that is</p> <p>19 eight of the 113 routes that you have.</p> <p>20 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) That's for those trips at South</p> <p>21 Lantau, eight out of 113 South Lantau routes. We will</p> <p>22 provide the total numbers, because we still have some</p> <p>23 other routes at Tung Chung and Shenzhen Bay.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: So there are more than eight special shifts?</p> <p>25 MR JAMES WONG: (In English) The total number should be more</p>	<p>1 situation in context.</p> <p>2 Prof Lo.</p> <p>3 MEMBER LO: I just have one question on the income</p> <p>4 statement. You have a fairly sizeable rental for</p> <p>5 non-franchised buses, so in the income statement, which</p> <p>6 part is for that non-franchised buses? Is it in the</p> <p>7 category of "Other expenses"?</p> <p>8 MR JAMES WONG: Yes, under "Other expenses".</p> <p>9 MEMBER LO: About what proportion? What is the amount paid</p> <p>10 for these non-franchised buses?</p> <p>11 MR JAMES WONG: Sorry, Professor, we don't have the</p> <p>12 information at this moment. Do you mind if we supply it</p> <p>13 to you afterwards?</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: Please do.</p> <p>15 Would this information appear in your interim</p> <p>16 results for the six months ended 30 September 2017?</p> <p>17 MR JAMES WONG: Chairman, do you mean the interim report of</p> <p>18 the listed company? Because NLB doesn't have an interim</p> <p>19 report.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Perhaps that's what I do mean. Do we find it in</p> <p>21 something that's published?</p> <p>22 MR JAMES WONG: For NLB, there will be the fuller</p> <p>23 disclosure -- it's once a year -- we set out all the</p> <p>24 details.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Perhaps you can provide it to us subsequently</p>

Page 153	Page 155
<p>1 with the answer to Prof Lo's question, the cost of the</p> <p>2 non-franchised buses. Thank you.</p> <p>3 MR JAMES WONG: Yes.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: That concludes the questions that we have, and</p> <p>5 obviously it concludes the questions that counsel</p> <p>6 assisting the committee have.</p> <p>7 I understand that you wish to make and we are happy</p> <p>8 to receive a concluding statement. So over to you,</p> <p>9 Mr Wong.</p> <p>10 Closing statement by MR JAMES WONG</p> <p>11 MR JAMES WONG: Thank you. Thank you, Chairman.</p> <p>12 When it comes to the provision of safe bus service,</p> <p>13 we think it is our responsibility. Our level of service</p> <p>14 is always regulated by the government under the bus</p> <p>15 franchise. There are changes in society as well as the</p> <p>16 travel pattern of the public. We have to keep pace with</p> <p>17 these changes. We have to keep improving and enhancing</p> <p>18 our service to achieve expectations.</p> <p>19 The key management personnel of our company are also</p> <p>20 shareholders of our company. Therefore, we don't just</p> <p>21 focus on short-term performance or profit. We also</p> <p>22 focus on long-term development and sustainability of our</p> <p>23 company. To carry on the tradition of the company, we</p> <p>24 have been maintaining long-term and good relationships</p> <p>25 with our bus captains, and we think that that is of</p>	<p>1 are willing to invest in the company and support</p> <p>2 government policies to enhance our capability to better</p> <p>3 serve the public in the future.</p> <p>4 Lastly, on behalf of New Lantao Bus Company (1973)</p> <p>5 Ltd, I would like to thank the chairman and the two</p> <p>6 members for their invitation to our company to come here</p> <p>7 to explain to you our situation. I thank Ms Wong's</p> <p>8 questions, the secretariat and relevant parties, for</p> <p>9 their arrangements.</p> <p>10 I would like to also thank my colleagues, especially</p> <p>11 frontline colleagues, for their contribution to the bus</p> <p>12 industry.</p> <p>13 Thank you.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: Mr Wong, it remains for us to thank you and your</p> <p>15 colleagues for attending this hearing to assist the</p> <p>16 committee in its deliberations, and we look forward to</p> <p>17 receiving what I think is quite a bundle of material</p> <p>18 that is promised to us. It would assist if we could</p> <p>19 receive that sooner rather than later, whilst the</p> <p>20 details of this hearing are actively in our minds.</p> <p>21 Thank you for your help. These proceedings then are</p> <p>22 concluded.</p> <p>23 (6.06 pm)</p> <p>24 (The hearing adjourned to a date to be fixed)</p> <p>25</p>
Page 154	
<p>1 particular importance to quality service and safety of</p> <p>2 our bus service.</p> <p>3 The scale of our company is significantly different</p> <p>4 than that of our companies. As I have explained</p> <p>5 already, our fleet is only one 13th or one 33rd of other</p> <p>6 bus companies. When it comes to development of new</p> <p>7 systems or software, or the implementation of such, the</p> <p>8 cost incurred and the difficulties we encounter will be</p> <p>9 much higher and more than other companies.</p> <p>10 Given the current bus franchise system, it is</p> <p>11 difficult for us to develop our fleet. Using Lantau</p> <p>12 Island as an example, our catchment is just the Lantau</p> <p>13 residents. There are two other franchises for</p> <p>14 Chek Lap Kok and Tung Chung, going outside to the urban</p> <p>15 area. We are different from other franchised bus</p> <p>16 operators who have different routes operating in</p> <p>17 different areas and the number is increasing.</p> <p>18 So, from the perspective of operational efficiency,</p> <p>19 it's not easy for the market to accommodate</p> <p>20 a small-scale franchised bus company. However, having</p> <p>21 regard to the overall interest of the community, I do</p> <p>22 believe that the existence of our company can enhance</p> <p>23 the competitiveness of the industry and provide more</p> <p>24 options for Hong Kong residents.</p> <p>25 Notwithstanding the aforementioned constraints, we</p>	