

Page 1	Page 3
<p>1 Wednesday, 30 May 2018</p> <p>2 (10.00 am)</p> <p>3 EVIDENCE FROM NEW WORLD FIRST BUS SERVICES LTD AND</p> <p>4 CITYBUS LTD: MR SAMUEL CHENG, MR WILLIAM CHUNG, MR PAUL L.</p> <p>5 MR GARETH NG, MR KENNETH LIT, MR KENNY SO (given in</p> <p>6 Cantonese; transcription of the simultaneous interpretation)</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: Good morning.</p> <p>8 Mr Duncan.</p> <p>9 Examination by MR DUNCAN (continued)</p> <p>10 MR DUNCAN: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>11 Mr Cheng, good morning.</p> <p>12 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Good morning.</p> <p>13 MR DUNCAN: Good morning, gentlemen.</p> <p>14 I would like to start this morning by asking some</p> <p>15 questions relating to the devices that are available to</p> <p>16 the company with regard to bus safety.</p> <p>17 The first matter that I would like to address is the</p> <p>18 question of what's commonly referred to as the black</p> <p>19 box.</p> <p>20 In that respect, could I ask you to turn up, please,</p> <p>21 CTB-1 at page 55.</p> <p>22 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I see that.</p> <p>23 MR DUNCAN: Could I bring to your attention item 1 on that</p> <p>24 page, "Introduction of black boxes to our buses". Do</p> <p>25 you see that entry?</p>	<p>1 MR DUNCAN: Right. So did the bus companies themselves then</p> <p>2 provide the black boxes as part of the delivery of the</p> <p>3 bus?</p> <p>4 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Correct.</p> <p>5 MR DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>6 If I go back to CTB-1/55, it was stated that in</p> <p>7 2010, your companies took the initiative to upgrade the</p> <p>8 black boxes to an integrated system, with automatic bus</p> <p>9 stop announcement capability.</p> <p>10 Is that the position?</p> <p>11 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes.</p> <p>12 MR DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: Mr Duncan, before you pursue that line, perhaps</p> <p>14 we could establish what was the base requirement. It's</p> <p>15 the second page of the document we just looked at, the</p> <p>16 2003 letter, and it's on the next page that the</p> <p>17 requirements are stipulated.</p> <p>18 MR DUNCAN: So can we take you back to that page, please,</p> <p>19 TD-2 at 206.</p> <p>20 In paragraph 2, do you see the requirements of the</p> <p>21 Transport Department as they were when the requirement</p> <p>22 was issued --</p> <p>23 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I see that.</p> <p>24 MR DUNCAN: -- in 2003, headed under (a) and (b) -- first of</p> <p>25 all, the operation times, the start time, rolling time,</p>
Page 2	Page 4
<p>1 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes.</p> <p>2 MR DUNCAN: Do those paragraphs contain a brief history as</p> <p>3 to the installation of black boxes in the buses?</p> <p>4 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Correct.</p> <p>5 MR DUNCAN: It seemed to have commenced in October 2003</p> <p>6 with a requirement from the Transport Department for the</p> <p>7 devices to be installed.</p> <p>8 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Correct.</p> <p>9 MR DUNCAN: Then that would apply to buses first registered</p> <p>10 after July 2004.</p> <p>11 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Correct.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Perhaps we could have the letter from the</p> <p>13 Transport Department, which I think is October 2013,</p> <p>14 which details this, so that this can be followed by</p> <p>15 others. I think it's annex 1, is it not?</p> <p>16 MR DUNCAN: It would be, I think, at TD-2, page 205.</p> <p>17 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I see it.</p> <p>18 MR DUNCAN: So the buses registered after 2007 came with</p> <p>19 black boxes; is that a correct understanding?</p> <p>20 MR SAMUEL CHENG: For the first batch of buses first</p> <p>21 registered after the effective date, that was in 2007,</p> <p>22 in other words between 2004 and 2007, we didn't have any</p> <p>23 batch of new buses. In 2007, we had the first batch of</p> <p>24 buses equipped with black boxes when they were first</p> <p>25 registered.</p>	<p>1 idle time and finish time; and secondly, the speed of</p> <p>2 the vehicle.</p> <p>3 Now, if you go back to --</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: Forgive me again, Mr Duncan -- item 1 stipulates</p> <p>5 the purpose of this requirement, does it not, in these</p> <p>6 terms?</p> <p>7 "The purpose of the Electronic Data Recording Device</p> <p>8 is to provide tools for the bus company to monitor and</p> <p>9 manage the on-road speed- and safety-related behaviour</p> <p>10 of its buses, and indirectly to encourage better driving</p> <p>11 behaviour."</p> <p>12 Do you see that, Mr Cheng?</p> <p>13 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I see it.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: What did you understand was the role, if any,</p> <p>15 that was to be played by the Transport Department in</p> <p>16 response to this requirement?</p> <p>17 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, the TD had a role. The TD took the</p> <p>18 initiative to promote the idea of installation of black</p> <p>19 boxes by the bus company.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: And thereafter?</p> <p>21 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Thereafter, the bus company has to meet</p> <p>22 this requirement under the guideline. The technology at</p> <p>23 that time was such that those items were available, but</p> <p>24 then, a few years later, there was new technology. When</p> <p>25 our company became aware of that, we upgraded the system</p>

Page 5	Page 7
<p>1 of our black boxes.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: And how did you become aware of the development</p> <p>3 of new technology?</p> <p>4 MR SAMUEL CHENG: May I defer to Mr Chung, my colleague?</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr Chung.</p> <p>6 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Mr Chairman, at the time we had a study.</p> <p>7 We were studying the idea of a bus stop announcement</p> <p>8 facility. We didn't want the bus captains to have</p> <p>9 an increase in their workload. Therefore, we studied</p> <p>10 the idea of making use of GPS so that there would be</p> <p>11 automatic bus stop announcements.</p> <p>12 When we were studying the matter, we came to</p> <p>13 understand that the two systems could be integrated so</p> <p>14 that, in addition to meeting the requirements of the TD</p> <p>15 in relation to provision of data, we could also have the</p> <p>16 positions, the locations of the buses.</p> <p>17 Thank you.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>19 MR DUNCAN: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>20 So do I understand that it was the company which</p> <p>21 took the initiative to increase the available</p> <p>22 technology?</p> <p>23 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Correct.</p> <p>24 MR DUNCAN: So do I understand correctly that between 2003</p> <p>25 and 2010, when according to the letter the company took</p>	<p>1 alert the bus captain when the bus is speeding.</p> <p>2 MR DUNCAN: That's the real-time system which is yet to be</p> <p>3 implemented across the whole fleet; is that right?</p> <p>4 MR KENNETH LIT: Correct. We haven't completed the fitting</p> <p>5 of the entire fleet.</p> <p>6 MR DUNCAN: Right. Apart from the real-time system, were</p> <p>7 there any other improvements to what was available from</p> <p>8 the black box between the time of the integration of the</p> <p>9 system, of the bus stop announcement, up until the</p> <p>10 present time?</p> <p>11 MR KENNETH LIT: No. For that period of time, no, no</p> <p>12 improvement.</p> <p>13 MR DUNCAN: Now, when was it that the company decided that</p> <p>14 the real-time system would be implemented?</p> <p>15 MR KENNETH LIT: Round about 2015, when the franchise of the</p> <p>16 Citybus was granted by the TD, among the clauses there</p> <p>17 was this requirement on us. That is, we have to provide</p> <p>18 a real-time -- to provide estimated time of arrival.</p> <p>19 As a result of this requirement of the ETA system,</p> <p>20 it means that we require a real-time function.</p> <p>21 Therefore, round about that time, we started to prepare</p> <p>22 for the fitting of the entire fleet with this real-time</p> <p>23 bus stop announcement or the ETA.</p> <p>24 MR DUNCAN: I would like you to look, please, at</p> <p>25 a document --</p>
<p>Page 6</p> <p>1 that initiative, the Transport Department itself did not</p> <p>2 require any further advances in the technology in the</p> <p>3 black box, beyond what it set out back in 2003?</p> <p>4 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Mr Chung will answer this question.</p> <p>5 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: No, there wasn't.</p> <p>6 MR DUNCAN: If I go again to your submission at page 55, at</p> <p>7 the bottom of the page you have set out the</p> <p>8 second-by-second data which is available from the black</p> <p>9 box.</p> <p>10 Is that the data which is available today from the</p> <p>11 black box?</p> <p>12 MR SAMUEL CHENG: For such a question relating to the</p> <p>13 technology, my colleague Mr Lit will take it.</p> <p>14 MR KENNETH LIT: Correct.</p> <p>15 MR DUNCAN: Have there been improvements to the system</p> <p>16 between the time that the automatic bus stop</p> <p>17 announcement capability was integrated with the system?</p> <p>18 MR KENNETH LIT: Yes.</p> <p>19 MR DUNCAN: What are those improvements?</p> <p>20 MR KENNETH LIT: Last year, in 2017, we started to install</p> <p>21 a new system. We call it RTS2, real-time system 2. We</p> <p>22 have added new functions, including the following. As</p> <p>23 Mr Cheng mentioned yesterday, in the third quarter, when</p> <p>24 the entire fleet has been fitted with this system, then</p> <p>25 we will able to provide a display; that is, we will</p>	<p>Page 8</p> <p>1 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on -- you said earlier that this</p> <p>2 RTS2 system would be fully installed in the third</p> <p>3 quarter. Is that the third quarter of 2018?</p> <p>4 MR KENNETH LIT: That's correct, sir.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>6 Yes, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>7 MR DUNCAN: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>8 Could you look, please, at a document which you will</p> <p>9 find at BM1 at page 35.</p> <p>10 Are you looking at a document which is headed "News</p> <p>11 release"?</p> <p>12 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, we're reading it.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: Take your time to familiarise yourself with it</p> <p>14 first.</p> <p>15 MR SAMUEL CHENG: We are done, sir.</p> <p>16 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. Now, is it headed, "NEC won the</p> <p>17 contract of the integrated automatic bus stop</p> <p>18 announcement and data logger system by New World First</p> <p>19 Bus Services Ltd and Citybus Ltd"? Is that the heading?</p> <p>20 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, sir.</p> <p>21 MR DUNCAN: Is it dated 13 January 2012?</p> <p>22 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, sir.</p> <p>23 MR DUNCAN: Does the first paragraph announce, on the part</p> <p>24 of NEC, that it has won a contract in respect of 702</p> <p>25 buses of New World First Bus Services Ltd and 172 buses</p>

Page 9	Page 11
<p>1 of Citybus Ltd?</p> <p>2 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I see.</p> <p>3 MR DUNCAN: And does it refer to the deployment of the</p> <p>4 integrated automatic bus stop announcement, ABSA, and</p> <p>5 the data logger, DL, system?</p> <p>6 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes. This is about the specific details.</p> <p>7 I defer to Mr Chung, please.</p> <p>8 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: That is correct, sir.</p> <p>9 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. Then if I take you down to the third</p> <p>10 paragraph, does it refer to the fact that, "The BSA and</p> <p>11 DL system combines the Global Positioning System</p> <p>12 ('GPS'), bus odometer signal and proprietary</p> <p>13 snap-on-route technology to overcome the 'ghost' GPS</p> <p>14 signal caused by the unique environment of narrow</p> <p>15 streets and skyscrapers in Hong Kong"?</p> <p>16 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: That's correct, sir.</p> <p>17 MR DUNCAN: Then the last paragraph on that page, does it</p> <p>18 refer to the fact that, "The control unit also logs the</p> <p>19 position and speed of the bus throughout the day"?</p> <p>20 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: That's correct, sir.</p> <p>21 MR DUNCAN: And that the data will be uploaded to the server</p> <p>22 via WiFi when the bus is returned to the bus depot?</p> <p>23 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: That's correct, sir.</p> <p>24 MR DUNCAN: I want to understand exactly what this contract</p> <p>25 achieved for the company. If you go back to your</p>	<p>1 If you go to page 55, there is reference there at</p> <p>2 the bottom to the fact that:</p> <p>3 "In 2010, our companies took the initiative to</p> <p>4 upgrade the black boxes to an integrated system with</p> <p>5 automatic bus stop announcement capability."</p> <p>6 Is this via the NEC project?</p> <p>7 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, correct. That was done by NEC, sir.</p> <p>8 MR DUNCAN: So was it 2010 or 2011?</p> <p>9 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: In 2011, we started discussion with NEC</p> <p>10 and developed this system. In June 2011, the</p> <p>11 installation took place in the Citybus fleet</p> <p>12 franchise 1.</p> <p>13 MR DUNCAN: Right. So when you refer at the bottom of that</p> <p>14 page to something happening in 2010, is that the same as</p> <p>15 the NEC system you have just been referring to, or is it</p> <p>16 a separate integration?</p> <p>17 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Your question again, please, sir.</p> <p>18 MR DUNCAN: I am trying to ascertain what happened in 2010,</p> <p>19 as we can see from the bottom of page 55. It is stated</p> <p>20 there:</p> <p>21 "In 2010, our companies took the initiative to</p> <p>22 upgrade the black boxes to an integrated system with</p> <p>23 automatic bus stop announcement capability."</p> <p>24 It would appear that that's what NEC did, according</p> <p>25 to your testimony a few moments ago, in 2011. Is that</p>
Page 10	Page 12
<p>1 submission at page 55, CTB-1/55.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: Before you embark on that, Mr Duncan, might I ask</p> <p>3 this question.</p> <p>4 Paragraph 1 has two parts to it. One is the</p> <p>5 contract which has apparently been recently won; and</p> <p>6 secondly, it states this:</p> <p>7 "... after its successful implementation of the same</p> <p>8 system across 760 buses of Citybus, the only large-scale</p> <p>9 deployment of GPS and ABSA system in Hong Kong."</p> <p>10 Of that statement, can I ask this: first of all, is</p> <p>11 that accurate; and secondly, when was this system</p> <p>12 implemented?</p> <p>13 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Mr Chairman, this system was first</p> <p>14 implemented in the Citybus franchise 1. We started with</p> <p>15 franchise 1 and then we extended it to Citybus franchise</p> <p>16 2 and also First Bus.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: The question was when was it installed, in terms</p> <p>18 of time?</p> <p>19 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Citybus franchise 1, it was June 2011.</p> <p>20 Citybus franchise 2 and also New World First Bus, the</p> <p>21 installation was towards the end of 2012; they were</p> <p>22 completed then.</p> <p>23 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>24 Thank you, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>25 MR DUNCAN: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p>	<p>1 correct?</p> <p>2 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: That's correct, sir.</p> <p>3 MR DUNCAN: So for "2010" here, should we be reading "2011"?</p> <p>4 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Mr Chairman, if we have to develop a new</p> <p>5 system, it would take time, and in 2010 we took the</p> <p>6 initiative to get in touch with NEC to design the new</p> <p>7 system. With the new system, we have to install them in</p> <p>8 700 or so buses, and that again would take time. We can</p> <p>9 manage a couple of them per day, because the buses are</p> <p>10 deployed on the road every day.</p> <p>11 So, from the installation to the end of the</p> <p>12 installation, it took about a year's time. So, in our</p> <p>13 submission -- perhaps please turn to the next page.</p> <p>14 Here we say:</p> <p>15 "The whole fleet of CTB (F1) was equipped with this</p> <p>16 integrated system in June 2011. The whole fleet of</p> <p>17 CTB (F2) and NWFB were equipped with the same integrated</p> <p>18 system at the end of 2012."</p> <p>19 That's the same system that I'm talking about,</p> <p>20 because CTB (F1), during the franchise renewal, the</p> <p>21 government imposed a requirement that we have to provide</p> <p>22 the bus announcement system, so we had to complete the</p> <p>23 CTB (F1) fleet first.</p> <p>24 MR DUNCAN: Thank you for clarifying that. So the</p> <p>25 initiative was taken in 2010 but the installation</p>

Page 13	Page 15
<p>1 commenced in 2011, with the help of NEC; is that 2 correct? 3 MR SAMUEL CHENG: That's correct. 4 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. 5 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on, Mr Duncan -- you say that in 6 the course of the renewal of the CTB (F1) franchise, the 7 government imposed a requirement that you provide a bus 8 announcement system. Have we been provided with 9 documentation that evidences that requirement? 10 MR SAMUEL CHENG: In the franchise document, it doesn't 11 specifically refer to this bus announcement system. But 12 when the franchise was renewed, other than the franchise 13 document, through exchanges of letters, there was 14 an undertaking that something else would be done. 15 In our company, we do have that document with us. 16 Thank you. 17 CHAIRMAN: Would you be in a position to provide us with 18 copies of those documents -- perhaps there were a series 19 of documents -- so we can follow this point? 20 MR SAMUEL CHENG: No problem, sir. 21 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 22 MR DUNCAN: I think there was reference earlier on to 23 another document, a franchise, which first raised 24 a question of real-time capability. Was that mentioned 25 earlier, Mr Cheng?</p>	<p>1 MR SAMUEL CHENG: 2015. 2 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 3 MR SAMUEL CHENG: The franchise started to take effect in 4 2016. 5 CHAIRMAN: Was that franchise 2? 6 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Franchise 1. 7 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 8 Yes, Mr Duncan. 9 MR DUNCAN: Thank you, Chairman. 10 I want to move on now and explore what data the 11 black box actually provides and what use is made of that 12 data. 13 In that respect, can I ask you, please, to look at 14 your first submission. So it will be CTB-1 at page 33. 15 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I see it. 16 MR DUNCAN: At the moment I'm concerned with the system as 17 it is at the moment. I'll ask you about the real-time 18 capability later, but I'm just concerned with the system 19 prior to the real-time capability. 20 At the bottom of that page, 8(a)(i), there is 21 reference to this: 22 "Data captured by black boxes installed on buses is 23 uploaded to our server every night for generation of 24 reports to monitor the driving behaviour of bus 25 captains."</p>
Page 14	Page 16
<p>1 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, that was. 2 MR DUNCAN: Is that a separate requirement from the one that 3 you just mentioned? 4 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I defer to Mr Chung, please. 5 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, that's a separate requirement. 6 MR DUNCAN: Was that expressed in a franchise document? 7 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Like Mr Cheng said a moment ago, that was 8 a separate issue. That wasn't inside the franchise 9 document. 10 MR DUNCAN: So was there documentation backwards and 11 forwards which would evidence that? 12 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, we do have the information. We can 13 make available the information afterwards. 14 MR DUNCAN: Thank you very much. 15 CHAIRMAN: Thank you, if you would do so. 16 Can you give us the time frame of when there was 17 this -- in the course of which franchise renewal was 18 this, and what was the time? 19 MR SAMUEL CHENG: We had exchanges of correspondence with 20 the Transport Department. That was a couple of days 21 before, in fact, the franchise was awarded, we had to 22 make these pledges. 23 Thank you. 24 CHAIRMAN: Which year was that? Was this franchise 2 or 25 franchise 1?</p>	<p>1 Do you see that reference? 2 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, sir. 3 MR DUNCAN: So, no doubt, if a driver is driving at 4 an excessive speed, let's say 80 kilometres per hour, 5 that is something which will show up on the server; is 6 that correct. 7 MR SAMUEL CHENG: No. Before we get the real-time 8 function -- let me explain how it works. Every night, 9 the bus will return to the depot, and then, only at that 10 time, will the data be transmitted to our computer 11 system of the company. So it won't be a question of 12 letting us know in real-time. In future, there will be 13 a real-time function, and then, once every 15 seconds, 14 such data will be transmitted to our company system. So 15 the two are different. 16 MR DUNCAN: Yes. Just keeping with the non-real-time 17 system, the current system, once the data is uploaded on 18 the server at night, it will show if the bus driver has 19 exceeded the speed limit of 70 kilometres per hour; is 20 that correct? 21 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Perhaps let me elaborate. When the bus is 22 in service during daytime, if there has been 23 an exceedance of the speed limit, the black box on board 24 will record this incident of speeding. At night, this 25 piece of information will be uploaded or transmitted to</p>

Page 17	Page 19
<p>1 our computer system, which will then collate the data. 2 On the following day -- sorry, well, in fact, in about 3 five days' time, a report will be generated in relation 4 to exceedance of speed incidents. 5 So what happens to those five days? Our system has 6 to match the speed exceedance incident with our Octopus 7 card system, so as to identify the name of the relevant 8 driver. So it takes a few days' time to do that. So we 9 have a report on the speed exceedance and then our 10 colleagues will follow up on that. 11 Thank you. 12 MR DUNCAN: So what about other faults that the driver may 13 have caused or may have -- his conduct may have been at 14 fault? For example, if he had braked excessively or if 15 he had accelerated too fast, would that sort of 16 information appear on the server in the same way as 17 excessive speed appears on the server? 18 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, we do get such information, but we do 19 not generate such reports. 20 MR DUNCAN: So the only reports that are currently generated 21 are speed reports; is that correct? 22 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Correct. 23 MR DUNCAN: And when that report is available, what happens 24 to it? Does it just sit there, or is there somebody who 25 is required to examine each and every report?</p>	<p>1 then the relevant bus captain will be disciplined. 2 MR DUNCAN: Right. As far as the black box is concerned, it 3 monitors only speed, no other conduct of the driver? 4 MR SAMUEL CHENG: The black box isn't just about monitoring 5 the speed. 6 MR DUNCAN: I'm sorry, let me rephrase that. I understand 7 what you were about to say. 8 As far as the report is concerned, the report which 9 comes up on the server from the black box is concerned 10 only with speed; it does not reflect any other driving 11 fault of the driver. Is that correct? 12 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Our server will issue routine reports, and 13 that would just be about exceeding the speed limit. 14 However, for the data, for the information that we have 15 recorded, that goes beyond vehicle speeds. Well, in 16 fact we cover the following information as well, like 17 the G force generated when the vehicle is in motion. 18 That will be recorded as well. And of course other 19 behaviour of the bus captain, say for example whether he 20 has opened the bus doors, that would also be recorded as 21 well. 22 Thank you. 23 MR DUNCAN: But do I understand correctly, those sorts of 24 matters are not the subject of any report currently? 25 MR SAMUEL CHENG: There won't be an automatic report, but</p>
Page 18	Page 20
<p>1 MR SAMUEL CHENG: When the report is available, our system 2 will automatically generate an email to our operations 3 division. In fact, there are three operation divisions: 4 CTB1, CTB2, and New World operations. So, for each of 5 them, when such an email is received, then it will be 6 known that within the relevant division, which drivers 7 are involved in such cases of exceeding the speed limit. 8 Thereafter, we will follow the guideline, the 9 internal guideline, on disciplinary action, and 10 appropriate disciplinary action will be taken. For 11 a first offender and not too serious, then a reminder 12 will be issued. In the case of a serious incident or in 13 the case of a repeat offender, then a warning will be 14 issued. 15 Thank you. 16 MR DUNCAN: So do I understand correctly that the current 17 monitoring system, monitoring of the drivers' conduct, 18 is limited to speed only? 19 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Well, there are two aspects. Every day, 20 we have the routine monitoring, and that's about the 21 speed. On the other hand, if there is a passenger 22 complaint or when there is a traffic accident, then we 23 will have colleagues who will look up the relevant data 24 and then will carry out an investigation. The findings 25 of the investigation, if say the case is established,</p>	<p>1 then if we find the need to carry out an investigation, 2 then such information can be retrieved from the system, 3 to facilitate our investigation. 4 CHAIRMAN: I think we understand your evidence, Mr Cheng. 5 A report is generated in respect of speed only, but 6 other data is available if you wish to investigate. Is 7 that the position? 8 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Correct. 9 MR DUNCAN: Thank you, Mr Chairman. 10 Now, sticking with the matter of speed, could I ask 11 you please to refer again to your submission, and this 12 time page 26 of CTB-1. 13 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I see it. 14 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. 15 May I bring your attention to the page just under 16 the heading "Bus ignition" -- so you will see item (ii), 17 "Bus ignition (on/off)", and then a portion which 18 commences: 19 "The black boxes are used to monitor the speed of 20 each bus and over speed exception report[s] are 21 generated automatically." 22 Do you see that? 23 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I see it. 24 MR DUNCAN: I think, if you read through that, it covers 25 some of the matters that I have just been asking you</p>

Page 21	Page 23
<p>1 about.</p> <p>2 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I see it.</p> <p>3 MR DUNCAN: So if there is the speed of over 70 kilometres</p> <p>4 per hour, that would be caught in the black box or be</p> <p>5 recorded in the black box, and will automatically become</p> <p>6 part of the report; is that correct?</p> <p>7 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Correct.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: Is it not 75 kilometres per hour generates</p> <p>9 a report?</p> <p>10 MR SAMUEL CHENG: We are monitoring the speed limit of 70,</p> <p>11 but then the black box is set in such a way that there</p> <p>12 has to be 70 kilometres per hour for 10 consecutive</p> <p>13 seconds before an event would be generated.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: So there are two qualifications, one is</p> <p>15 75 kilometres and the other is 10 consecutive seconds?</p> <p>16 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Correct.</p> <p>17 MR DUNCAN: That would occur whatever route and whatever</p> <p>18 road the bus is on; is that right?</p> <p>19 MR SAMUEL CHENG: That's correct, sir.</p> <p>20 MR DUNCAN: Dealing with the situation where the speed limit</p> <p>21 is 50 kilometres per hour, the reference you will see</p> <p>22 there is:</p> <p>23 "Speed of over 55 [kilometres per hour] for 10</p> <p>24 consecutive seconds on road section[s] with speed</p> <p>25 limit[s] of 50 [kilometres per hour]".</p>	<p>1 road sections ... in September 2014, and 11 road</p> <p>2 sections ... identified for monitoring in March 2018."</p> <p>3 How long are these road sections?</p> <p>4 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I defer to Mr Chung, please.</p> <p>5 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Generally speaking, they are more than</p> <p>6 100 metres.</p> <p>7 MR DUNCAN: Why have you increased these from time to time?</p> <p>8 There was 11 initially, then three additional, three</p> <p>9 added, and then 11 added. Why are you adding to them</p> <p>10 from time to time?</p> <p>11 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: When we first introduced this method to</p> <p>12 monitor the road sections, we discussed with the unions'</p> <p>13 representatives. We discussed with them the road</p> <p>14 sections. We need them to know what sections we are</p> <p>15 dealing with so that they will observe the speed on</p> <p>16 these sections. As we increased the number, we also</p> <p>17 kept them posted of the development.</p> <p>18 MR DUNCAN: Would it be fair to say that the total of these</p> <p>19 25 road sections would be a very, very small proportion</p> <p>20 of the area covered on all the routes on which the buses</p> <p>21 of the company ply their trade?</p> <p>22 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, you may put it this way, but we feel</p> <p>23 that these are rather dangerous sections; if they go</p> <p>24 beyond 50kph, it would pose some danger.</p> <p>25 MR DUNCAN: What is actually involved in identifying these</p>
Page 22	Page 24
<p>1 Do you see that?</p> <p>2 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, sir.</p> <p>3 MR DUNCAN: Now I wish to ask you about these road sections</p> <p>4 that exist. Do I understand, these are just random</p> <p>5 sections of road which the company has chosen from time</p> <p>6 to time?</p> <p>7 MR SAMUEL CHENG: That's incorrect. In our company, we have</p> <p>8 selected 25 road sections with a speed limit of 50kph.</p> <p>9 For these 25 road sections, they include the continuous</p> <p>10 downhill slope road sections, and also these road</p> <p>11 sections involve sharp bends. For these road sections,</p> <p>12 there were major traffic accidents that occurred before;</p> <p>13 it wasn't random per se.</p> <p>14 MR DUNCAN: I think if I could bring your attention, please,</p> <p>15 to page 56. This is your second submission. So CTB-1,</p> <p>16 page 56.</p> <p>17 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, sir.</p> <p>18 MR DUNCAN: There has been a question asked and you have</p> <p>19 responded in that submission in 2(a) with "Criteria for</p> <p>20 identifying road sections for speed detection". Do you</p> <p>21 see that?</p> <p>22 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, sir.</p> <p>23 MR DUNCAN: It is said in the response:</p> <p>24 "Among these 25 road sections, 11 road sections were</p> <p>25 identified for monitoring in June 2013, 3 additional</p>	<p>1 road sections?</p> <p>2 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: As Mr Cheng said a few moments ago, we</p> <p>3 basically look at the three criteria, continuous</p> <p>4 downward slope, sharp bends, and also there were</p> <p>5 frequent traffic accidents that occurred in the past or</p> <p>6 some serious ones. So we identified these road sections</p> <p>7 on the basis of these criteria.</p> <p>8 MR DUNCAN: Yes, I understand that you identify them, but</p> <p>9 how do they then get into the system? What is involved</p> <p>10 technically?</p> <p>11 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Technically, we have the electronic map</p> <p>12 in the system. We just set these into the system and we</p> <p>13 set all these 55kph for 10 continuous seconds -- we set</p> <p>14 all these criteria and set it into the system.</p> <p>15 MR DUNCAN: Is there any reason why all the routes couldn't</p> <p>16 be fed into the system, so that you could monitor not</p> <p>17 only speed in excess of 70 kilometres per hour but also</p> <p>18 speeds in excess of 50 kilometres per hour wherever it</p> <p>19 occurs?</p> <p>20 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: In theory, yes, but it would involve</p> <p>21 a lot of efforts, because then we would have to separate</p> <p>22 all the different routes and everything would be</p> <p>23 separated out. In the electronic map, we have to split</p> <p>24 the 50kph and 70kph. That would take a lot of efforts.</p> <p>25 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Mr Chairman, if I may supplement. I agree</p>

Page 25	Page 27
<p>1 with that. At the present moment, these 25 road 2 sections cannot cover all the routes that we serve, all 3 the routes that the buses are deployed to. Right now, 4 we have 25 identified that we consider prone to danger. 5 In addition to that, in the days to come, we will be 6 randomly selecting additional road sections for speed 7 detection purposes in relation to the 50kph sections. 8 This is something we plan to do. That would be similar 9 to what the police do with regard to speeding detection. 10 They have the cameras that are mounted at certain 11 locations, and the police would also randomly put the 12 mobile cameras to detect speeding. 13 This is the inspiration that we got from the police 14 initiative. This is something that we are going to do. 15 But until that happens, we do need to have a word with 16 the unions. 17 Thank you. 18 MR DUNCAN: Do the unions know currently which are the 19 25 sections? 20 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, they do, because this has been 21 published in the appendix of the captains handbook. 22 MR DUNCAN: Would it improve your monitoring system -- 23 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on, just so we can confirm we are 24 talking about the same thing -- you are referring to, 25 for example, annex 1 of CTB-2 at page 169-88? That's</p>	<p>1 MR DUNCAN: Let us turn then to the proposal for real-time 2 capability. If I could ask you to go back, please, to 3 page 33 of your submission. So CTB-1/33. 4 At the bottom of the page, in the third line of the 5 last paragraph on the page: 6 "We schedule to replace the black box system with 7 real-time capability by the third quarter of 2018. By 8 then, we will be able to monitor the driving behaviour 9 of bus captains in real-time and take immediate action 10 as appropriate". 11 In that respect, could I ask you to turn to your 12 second submission at page 58. 13 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, sir. 14 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. Do we see at the bottom of the page 15 this entry: 16 "The real-time ... system will emit an instant audio 17 warning (ie a beeping sound) automatically through the 18 black box control panel in the driver cab to alert the 19 bus captain whenever an over speed event occurs." 20 Is that a summary of the real-time capability of the 21 system? 22 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes. This can only be done with the 23 real-time capability. 24 MR DUNCAN: So is the real-time capability concerned only 25 with the matter of speed?</p>
Page 26	Page 28
<p>1 the English version, where the sections are identified. 2 Is that correct? 3 MR SAMUEL CHENG: That's correct, sir. 4 CHAIRMAN: So these are the 25 sections of road that are 5 currently monitored in your system to produce a report 6 of a vehicle going greater than 55 kilometres per hour, 7 your buses going greater than 55 kilometres per hour? 8 MR SAMUEL CHENG: That's correct, sir. 9 MR DUNCAN: With the advent of the real-time system, is 10 there any proposal to increase the number of road 11 sections from 25? 12 MR SAMUEL CHENG: With the real-time system, it doesn't have 13 any direct relationship with the number of sections. As 14 regards the increase in the number of monitored road 15 sections, that doesn't present any problems to us, but 16 we have to discuss with the unions. So that's why 17 I said that we do have the plan to randomly identify 18 road sections in an electronic map to detect the speed 19 limit -- speeding on the 50kph sections. 20 MR DUNCAN: But do I understand you correctly, that would be 21 done in conjunction with the unions, so they would know 22 the outcome of any proposals in that respect? 23 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, we have to notify the unions. We are 24 not asking them for permission, but they have to be kept 25 posted.</p>	<p>1 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Mr Chung, my colleague, will answer the 2 question. 3 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: For the real-time capability, it isn't 4 just about the speed. Just now, we have already said 5 that one of the functions of the real-time capability is 6 to enable us to estimate the arrival time of the bus. 7 So that's one of the functions of the real-time feature. 8 MR DUNCAN: Right. So speed is one aspect. The arrival 9 time is another. What about other faults of the driver? 10 Would any of those be picked up in real time? I'm 11 thinking of things such as sudden braking, excessive 12 acceleration, those sorts of things. Would they be 13 picked up in real time? 14 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I need to consult my colleague. 15 CHAIRMAN: Yes, please do so. 16 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Mr Lit will answer the question. 17 MR KENNETH LIT: Thank you, Mr Chairman. 18 Mr Cheng mentioned that data will be transmitted 19 once every 15 seconds, and that's about simple 20 information like the speed. For the transmission of 21 data for over 25-second sort of cycling, that's not the 22 second-by-second data. For second-by-second data, it 23 will be sort of based on a 15-minute cycle, and it will 24 come from the bus to the server of the company. 25 MR DUNCAN: One of the advantages of the real-time system is</p>

Page 29	Page 31
<p>1 that there is an instant audio warning to alert the bus 2 captain that he's speeding. Would the driver receive 3 any alert for any matter other than speeding? 4 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Mr Lit will take the question. 5 MR KENNETH LIT: Other than speeding, no, we are not having 6 any other alerts for the bus captain. 7 MR DUNCAN: When it is said at page 33 that immediate action 8 as appropriate can be taken, what is meant by "immediate 9 action"?</p> <p>10 MR SAMUEL CHENG: The immediate action that we refer to is 11 actually what we have just referred to. That is the 12 beeping sound so as to alert the bus captain. 13 MR DUNCAN: Now, I need to understand this, please. If the 14 driver is exceeding 50 kilometres per hour in one of the 15 25 road sections, clearly the new system will result in 16 his receiving an alert; is that correct? 17 MR KENNETH LIT: Yes. 18 MR DUNCAN: If, say, he is going 60 kilometres per hour on 19 a road which is not caught by one of the 25 road 20 sections, will he be alerted in that situation? 21 MR KENNETH LIT: No. 22 MR DUNCAN: Would your system of monitoring be far better if 23 there were a lot more road sections covered than simply 24 25? 25 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, it would have been better, but</p>	<p>1 the information will be transmitted to our system, and 2 then it will be listed in the over speed report. 3 MEMBER LO: So they are kind of independent? 4 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Sorry, I don't understand your question. 5 MEMBER LO: The real-time warning is independent of the 6 report generated offline five days later? 7 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, the two are separate. 8 CHAIRMAN: In your approach to generating an alert to the 9 driver, would it not be easier to set the system to 10 generate a report at 55 kilometres per hour for all 11 roads, except those that you then identify as being 12 70 kilometre per hour roads, rather than doing it the 13 other way around? 14 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I think technically your idea is feasible, 15 but then the work to be done will be equal in terms of 16 the volume. Our current system is such that we have 17 pre-set all the road sections to have a speed limit of 18 70, and then for 25 road sections we have marked it as 19 50. If we have to reverse it, it means that the digital 20 map of our system has to be set in such a way that it 21 would be 55 throughout, and then we have to identify 22 those road sections which permit 70 or above, so as to 23 make it 70. 24 In other words, either way, the workload will be 25 heavy. So just now we have said that we are thinking of</p>
Page 30	Page 32
<p>1 currently we are not able to get a digital map which 2 includes all the speed limits of all the roads in 3 Hong Kong. Currently, there isn't such a digital map. 4 So what we have to do is to manually mark such road 5 sections onto our digital map. 6 MR DUNCAN: The fact that there's no digital map available, 7 is that something which has been the subject of 8 discussion at all between the company and the Transport 9 Department? 10 MR SAMUEL CHENG: No, we didn't. 11 MR DUNCAN: Would that be a matter worth discussing with the 12 Transport Department, do you think? 13 MR SAMUEL CHENG: We will try. 14 MR DUNCAN: Now, unless anybody has some further questions, 15 I'm going to leave the matter of black boxes and move to 16 the matter of speed limiters. 17 CHAIRMAN: Prof Lo. 18 MEMBER LO: I just have a question on the real-time alert. 19 Would that be part of the report generated about the bus 20 captain's performance, or is it just an alert without 21 record, without permanent record? 22 MR SAMUEL CHENG: In real time, the bus captain will be 23 alerted if the over speed continues for continuously 24 10 seconds, then the black box will record such 25 an event. And as I have mentioned earlier on, later on</p>	<p>1 adding randomly picked road sections so as to monitor 2 the speeding of our bus captains. 3 CHAIRMAN: Broadly speaking, what is the proportion of the 4 roads that your buses travel that are subject to 5 a 70 kilometre per hour speed limit rather than 50? 6 What is the general proportion? 7 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Sorry, Mr Chairman, I'm afraid I don't 8 have the information with me just off the cuff. 9 However, in Hong Kong, for road sections allowing 70kph, 10 we don't just have expressways. 11 Allow me to cite an example for you, sir. Say for 12 example, along Gloucester Road westbound, part of it has 13 a limit of 50, while other parts 70. In other words, 14 for the speed limit of 70km/h, our buses would not be 15 having too few in relation to such road sections, but 16 I'm afraid I haven't got the percentage that you asked 17 for. 18 CHAIRMAN: What's your off-the-cuff feeling? Are there more 19 70 kilometre per hour roads that you travel on or 20 50 kilometre per hour roads? 21 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Maybe Mr Chung, head of operations, is 22 more familiar with this. 23 Mr Chung, please. 24 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Mr Chairman, really, it would be 25 difficult for me to give you an answer on the spot.</p>

Page 33	Page 35
<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Very well. 2 Yes, Mr Duncan. 3 Professor? 4 MEMBER LO: I'm just thinking about speed limit. Other than 5 freeways, they should be all on 50, basically, mostly? 6 For urban arterials, typically it's 50? 7 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I'm afraid that's not my understanding. 8 Earlier on, I gave you the example of westbound 9 Gloucester Road. It's not an expressway, but for 10 certain parts of it, they have a speed limit of 70km/h. 11 MEMBER LO: One further question on the rapid deceleration 12 and sudden braking. They don't depend on speed limits, 13 so there should be no technical issues of implementing 14 that. 15 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Sorry, in which way? 16 MEMBER LO: In case of sudden stopping, sudden braking, 17 sudden acceleration, they should be independent of speed 18 limits of the roads the buses are travelling on; they 19 can be done without knowing speed limits? 20 MR SAMUEL CHENG: They are unrelated. Yes, we can monitor 21 such scenarios. Say, for example, we have a bus and 22 there is a need to step on the brake suddenly. It may 23 not necessarily be a fault on the part of a bus captain. 24 Say, for example, there may be a pedestrian stepping 25 onto the road suddenly and then the bus captain has to</p>	<p>1 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, indeed, this can be done. 2 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Thank you. 3 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Let me say this, 10 consecutive seconds, 4 when we discussed this with the unions, we got input 5 from them, and they indicated that they do not look at 6 the speedometer all the time. When they become aware of 7 speeding, they have to react, but when they are behind 8 the wheel, it would be hard for them to slam on the 9 brakes to decelerate and they have to react. It would 10 take time for them to make the adjustment. That was the 11 discussion with the unions. That's one of the 12 considerations why 10 seconds for over-speeding. 13 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Thank you. 14 Thank you, Mr Duncan. 15 CHAIRMAN: It is the case, is it not, that the legislation 16 that deals with black boxes on PLBs prescribes a period 17 of three seconds' consecutive speeding? Are you aware 18 of that? 19 MR SAMUEL CHENG: We are not aware of that, sir. 20 CHAIRMAN: Perhaps that's something Mr Duncan can deal with 21 in due course. 22 Yes, Mr Duncan. 23 MR DUNCAN: Thank you, Chairman. 24 Just before leaving the black boxes, one other 25 point, if I may, Mr Cheng.</p>
Page 34	Page 36
<p>1 respond properly, which means stepping on the brake 2 suddenly. If we start to collect all the information 3 about sudden deceleration, it means that we have to 4 follow up on such cases and we have to make enquiries 5 with the bus captains, and that will mean quite a large 6 amount of work and it would be rather time-consuming. 7 So what we are doing now is that the system does 8 collect such information. In the event of a traffic 9 accident or there is a complaint against us, then in the 10 course of investigation, we will retrieve the data from 11 the system. 12 Thank you. 13 CHAIRMAN: Mr Duncan. 14 MR DUNCAN: Thank you, Chairman. Just one other matter -- 15 CHAIRMAN: I'm sorry, Mr Duncan. 16 MEMBER AUYEUNG: Sorry, Mr Duncan -- I just want to clarify 17 one thing. 18 The 10 seconds report on speeding, is this report -- 19 sort of anything over 10 seconds generating a report -- 20 is this 10 seconds determined by your company or by the 21 manufacturer? 22 MR SAMUEL CHENG: (Chinese spoken). 23 MEMBER AUYEUNG: So if there is a desire to change the 24 10 seconds to 15 or five, it's doable, technically? 25 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I defer to Mr Chung, please.</p>	<p>1 In the press release that I referred you to, the 2 press release of NEC, the company stated that the system 3 that they had installed, or were installing, would 4 "overcome the 'ghost' GPS signal caused by the unique 5 environment of narrow streets and skyscrapers in 6 Hong Kong". 7 Do you remember reading that in their press release? 8 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I did, sir. 9 MR DUNCAN: Are you able to tell the committee as to whether 10 that has been effective? Has that system coped 11 adequately with the unique environment, narrow streets 12 and tall buildings in Hong Kong, so that you don't get 13 these "ghost" GPS signals? Has the system been 14 effective in that respect? 15 MR SAMUEL CHENG: First of all, this press release was 16 released by NEC. What they say there doesn't represent 17 the stance of the CTB and NWFB. 18 As regards the accuracy of the system, how accurate 19 it is, I would say that it is not 100 per cent accurate. 20 It all depends on the road sections that the bus goes 21 through, and the high-rises, the number of high-rises, 22 whether there are any buildings with curtain walls; that 23 would have a bearing on the accuracy of the GPS system. 24 I can tell you that it is not 100 per cent accurate, 25 but the level of accuracy is acceptable to us though.</p>

Page 37	Page 39
<p>1 MR DUNCAN: Do I take it that this not regarded as a major 2 problem by the company with the system? 3 MR SAMUEL CHENG: At the present moment, the system that we 4 are using, we do not see any major problems at all. 5 MR DUNCAN: I said I would move to the matter of speed 6 limiters. 7 CHAIRMAN: Before you do that, Mr Duncan -- Mr Cheng, 8 presumably you have available a map which depicts all of 9 the routes that your buses travel on. Is that the case? 10 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I defer to Mr Lit, my colleague, who is 11 more familiar with this. 12 MR KENNETH LIT: Yes, Mr Chairman. In our system, in our 13 interface, we can show all the routes on the map. 14 CHAIRMAN: Can you provide such a map to us, so that we can 15 see every route that you travel? I'll tell you what 16 I have in mind. Somebody must know what the speed 17 limits are on the roads of Hong Kong, whether it's the 18 Transport Department or the police or somebody else, and 19 what I propose doing is being in a position to compare 20 both your routes with speed limits. 21 So can you provide us with a map of your routes, all 22 your routes? 23 MR KENNETH LIT: Most certainly, sir. However, Mr Chairman, 24 it all depends on the data that you are looking for, 25 because if we provide in hard copies, then you may not</p>	<p>1 to 70 [kilometres per hour]." 2 If I understand the submission correctly, it is 3 planned to introduce that feature on new buses delivered 4 from June of next year. Is that the position? 5 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I defer to Mr Li, director of engineering. 6 MR PAUL LI: Chairman, that's correct, sir. 7 MR DUNCAN: Is this a requirement of the Transport 8 Department or is this an initiative of the company? 9 MR PAUL LI: With this system, we have discussions with the 10 Transport Department and the working group, and we agree 11 that for new buses that are delivered, we have this 12 requirement. 13 Starting from next year, June, all the vehicles 14 delivered will be equipped with this. 15 MR DUNCAN: When you say "the working group", is that the 16 working group which was formed after the Tai Po accident 17 in February of this year? 18 MR PAUL LI: That's correct, sir. 19 MR DUNCAN: So before that, had the company considered the 20 question of this ASLS system? 21 MR PAUL LI: No, sir, not before that. 22 MR DUNCAN: So whose idea was it within the working group? 23 Was it the company's idea? Was it the Transport 24 Department's idea? Was it somebody else on the working 25 group who came up with this proposal?</p>
Page 38	Page 40
<p>1 be able to get what you want. 2 CHAIRMAN: What I'm seeking, as I suspect is obvious, is to 3 know which roads you travel down. Somebody else could 4 tell us what the speed limit is on those roads. 5 MR KENNETH LIT: I understand. No problem, sir. 6 CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. 7 MR DUNCAN: Can I take you to your submission at page 26, so 8 CTB-1, page 26. 9 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, sir. 10 MR DUNCAN: The matter of the speed limiter is referred to 11 there, two-thirds of the way down the page. So: 12 "When the vehicle speed reaches 70 [kilometres per 13 hour], the speed limiter functions by restricting fuel 14 supply to the engine even if the bus captain presses 15 hard on the throttle. However, vehicle speed may exceed 16 70 [kilometres per hour] on a downward slope." 17 Do you see that reference? 18 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, sir. 19 MR DUNCAN: If we go to the following page, there's 20 reference on that page to an active speed limiting 21 system, ASLS, and it is stated: 22 "In the event that the speed of the bus exceeds 23 70 [kilometres per hour] when travelling on a downward 24 slope, the [system] will automatically apply the gearbox 25 retarder and/or the service brake to limit the bus speed</p>	<p>1 MR PAUL LI: That was something arising out of the 2 discussion at the working group; Euro VI vehicles, they 3 do have the technology to provide that. 4 MR DUNCAN: So it was the bus manufacturers who came up with 5 this proposal? 6 MR PAUL LI: It was the working group. There was a request 7 that was made to consult the manufacturers to ascertain 8 whether this would be achievable, and they said that for 9 Euro VI buses, it is doable. 10 CHAIRMAN: Who convened the working group? 11 MR PAUL LI: It was Transport Department, sir. 12 CHAIRMAN: Did they produce an agenda for the first meeting? 13 MR PAUL LI: There was, yes. 14 CHAIRMAN: Do you have a copy of the agenda? 15 MR PAUL LI: We can make this available afterwards, sir. 16 CHAIRMAN: So the answer is you do? 17 MR PAUL LI: Yes, we do. 18 CHAIRMAN: Were technological advances/devices identified in 19 this agenda? 20 MR PAUL LI: Yes, on the agenda there are some suggestions 21 regarding new technological devices. 22 CHAIRMAN: So this came from the Transport Department? 23 MR PAUL LI: Yes, sir. 24 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Would you be kind enough to provide 25 us with the agenda?</p>

Page 41	Page 43
<p>1 MR PAUL LI: Certainly.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>3 Yes, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>4 MR DUNCAN: With regard to the possibility of retrofitting</p> <p>5 this facility, this is something which has been</p> <p>6 addressed in your second submission, at CTB-1, page 61.</p> <p>7 Do you see at 60 the heading number 8, "Speed limiters",</p> <p>8 and the entry:</p> <p>9 "We have enquired with our bus suppliers on the</p> <p>10 technical feasibility and cost implications in</p> <p>11 retrofitting our buses with the [ASLS] system."</p> <p>12 MR PAUL LI: Yes, sir.</p> <p>13 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. And you see all the details that</p> <p>14 have been provided there.</p> <p>15 First of all, with regard to the Dennis buses,</p> <p>16 I notice that the company apparently has 876 buses which</p> <p>17 are of the model E500 MMC, and it would, according to</p> <p>18 the company, be feasible to retrofit those buses with</p> <p>19 that facility.</p> <p>20 What's the company's intention with regard to</p> <p>21 retrofitting that model?</p> <p>22 MR PAUL LI: Your question again, sir?</p> <p>23 MR DUNCAN: Is the company proposing to retrofit the ASLS</p> <p>24 system on its 876 Alexander Dennis E500 MMC buses?</p> <p>25 MR PAUL LI: We need further details from the bus supplier</p>	<p>1 development"? Is this something that is under</p> <p>2 consideration by the company?</p> <p>3 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Given the cost indicated, if they are able</p> <p>4 to deliver the product and if we are happy with the test</p> <p>5 result, we are going to retrofit it.</p> <p>6 MR DUNCAN: How long would a bus like this, a B9, a Volvo</p> <p>7 bus, for example, be in service?</p> <p>8 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Our buses would be put into service for</p> <p>9 17 years or more. Of course, I must supplement. Here</p> <p>10 we talk about 117 B9 buses. They are around three years</p> <p>11 old. In other words, we can use them for another</p> <p>12 14 years.</p> <p>13 Thank you.</p> <p>14 MR DUNCAN: Just one other matter on speed limiters, if</p> <p>15 I could, before the morning break.</p> <p>16 Could I ask you to go to TD-1 at page 94.</p> <p>17 I don't know whether you've seen it --</p> <p>18 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I see it.</p> <p>19 MR DUNCAN: I'm not sure whether you have read this</p> <p>20 document, Mr Cheng. Let me explain what it is.</p> <p>21 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Thank you.</p> <p>22 MR DUNCAN: It's part of the submission received by the</p> <p>23 committee from the Transport Department, which is</p> <p>24 headed, "Application of new devices or technology on</p> <p>25 franchised buses", and the purpose is described as:</p>
Page 42	Page 44
<p>1 about the feasibility of retrofitting the device. We</p> <p>2 need the details.</p> <p>3 Moreover, we haven't been told about the costs</p> <p>4 involved in retrofitting it on each and every bus. So</p> <p>5 we have yet to consider that.</p> <p>6 MR DUNCAN: Is this a matter which is under consideration by</p> <p>7 the company?</p> <p>8 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Not yet. As stated in our submission, we</p> <p>9 are told by them that it would be feasible, that is ADL</p> <p>10 thinks that it is feasible, but then it would require</p> <p>11 12 months' time to develop the product.</p> <p>12 Therefore, at this moment, they cannot provide the</p> <p>13 retrofitting cost at this stage. Before we know how</p> <p>14 much it will cost to retrofit such a device per us, we</p> <p>15 are not able to give an answer as to whether we will</p> <p>16 consider it or not. First of all, we need to know the</p> <p>17 cost before we can consider the matter.</p> <p>18 Thank you.</p> <p>19 MR DUNCAN: So, to the extent that you are waiting on the</p> <p>20 cost, it is a matter still under consideration; is that</p> <p>21 correct?</p> <p>22 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes.</p> <p>23 MR DUNCAN: What about the Volvo B9 buses, 117, an entry of</p> <p>24 "Feasible", with the asterisk we can see over the page,</p> <p>25 "Volvo requires 18 to 24 months for product</p>	<p>1 "This paper gives an account of the feasibility and</p> <p>2 desirability for application of new devices or</p> <p>3 technology on franchised buses."</p> <p>4 Have you seen this document before?</p> <p>5 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Sorry, we haven't read it.</p> <p>6 MR DUNCAN: Right. In that case, what I might do, if the</p> <p>7 chairman is minded to take the morning break -- I just</p> <p>8 refer you to page 101 of the bundle, and read the</p> <p>9 section (c) which is headed, "Speed control by Global</p> <p>10 Positioning System ('GPS') or geo-fencing". Would you</p> <p>11 be able to do that during the course of the break, read</p> <p>12 paragraphs 19 and 20?</p> <p>13 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Can you also show paragraph 20 for us? So</p> <p>14 two pages. In that case, it means I can't read</p> <p>15 paragraph 19. Would you mind giving me a hard copy?</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: I'm sure you can be provided with a physical copy</p> <p>17 so that you can see the context.</p> <p>18 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>19 MR DUNCAN: It deals with the situation where there is no</p> <p>20 speed limitation at the moment. In other words, a bus</p> <p>21 travelling, say, 60 kilometres per hour in</p> <p>22 a 50 kilometre zone, it deals with that situation,</p> <p>23 something which is not covered currently by the speed</p> <p>24 limiters in the buses, and that's what I'm interested</p> <p>25 in.</p>

Page 45	<p>1 What I would ask you to do, perhaps, is read to</p> <p>2 yourself paragraphs 19 and 20 of that paper, which you</p> <p>3 will see on pages 101 and 102 of the bundle.</p> <p>4 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, we will do so.</p> <p>5 MR DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN: We will take a 20-minute break now. Thank you</p> <p>7 (11.37 am)</p> <p>8 (A short adjournment)</p> <p>9 (11.59 am)</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>11 MR DUNCAN: Thank you, Chairman.</p> <p>12 Mr Cheng, have you had a chance of reading that</p> <p>13 extract?</p> <p>14 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I did, sir.</p> <p>15 MR DUNCAN: This is the matter of speed control by GPS, or</p> <p>16 as is it's sometimes called, geo-fencing. Is this</p> <p>17 something which has been discussed in the working group?</p> <p>18 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I defer to my colleague, Mr Chung, if</p> <p>19 I may, please.</p> <p>20 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, we did.</p> <p>21 MR DUNCAN: First of all, if this sort of system was to be</p> <p>22 implemented, there would be the requirement again for</p> <p>23 the digital mapping; is that correct?</p> <p>24 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Correct.</p> <p>25 MR DUNCAN: At paragraph 20, the Transport Department has</p>	Page 47	<p>1 MR DUNCAN: And who is considering this? Is it your</p> <p>2 company? Is it all of the bus companies, or what?</p> <p>3 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: It was discussed within the working group</p> <p>4 and we said that we would consider it. Other companies</p> <p>5 also said they would consider it.</p> <p>6 MR DUNCAN: Okay. Now I'm going to move from speed</p> <p>7 limiters, please, to another of the devices. This is</p> <p>8 the electronic stability control.</p> <p>9 You will see reference to this in CTB-1 at page 26,</p> <p>10 please.</p> <p>11 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I see that.</p> <p>12 MR DUNCAN: At the bottom of page 26, there's reference to</p> <p>13 the company planning to include the electronic stability</p> <p>14 control system on new buses for delivery from June 2019</p> <p>15 onwards.</p> <p>16 And at page 27, we can see a description of the two</p> <p>17 aspects of the mechanism. First of all, dynamic</p> <p>18 stability control, and then roll-over prevention.</p> <p>19 Is this something which has been decided as a result</p> <p>20 of the working party discussion?</p> <p>21 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I would like to defer to Mr Li.</p> <p>22 MR PAUL LI: Thank you, Chairman. Yes, indeed, that's true.</p> <p>23 MR DUNCAN: So this was not something which was considered</p> <p>24 at all prior to the formation of that working group; is</p> <p>25 that correct?</p>
Page 46	<p>1 referred to the fact that all of the bus manufacturers</p> <p>2 have given the opinion that the technology was being</p> <p>3 controlled by GPS is theoretically feasible.</p> <p>4 The Department say:</p> <p>5 "However, they do have concerns on the accuracy of</p> <p>6 the signals as it would be affected by the high-rise</p> <p>7 buildings of Hong Kong."</p> <p>8 Do you see that?</p> <p>9 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes.</p> <p>10 MR DUNCAN: Is this consideration to go no further, or is</p> <p>11 somebody going to be looking into whether those concerns</p> <p>12 about the GPS system are justified and, if so, whether</p> <p>13 they can be overcome?</p> <p>14 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Our view is that we know that the system</p> <p>15 is available in the market. However, in the past, when</p> <p>16 we worked on the black box, the accuracy of the GPS</p> <p>17 signals was indeed a matter of concern to us.</p> <p>18 So currently we think that we need to get some</p> <p>19 devices from the suppliers and we need to test the</p> <p>20 devices so as to ascertain the functionality as well as</p> <p>21 their accuracy first. So it's not a matter that we are</p> <p>22 ruling it out at this moment.</p> <p>23 MR DUNCAN: So can we take it that that's under active</p> <p>24 consideration?</p> <p>25 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, you may say so.</p>	Page 48	<p>1 MR PAUL LI: Correct.</p> <p>2 MR DUNCAN: The proposal is to have this installed on new</p> <p>3 buses supplied after June 2019. Has the possibility of</p> <p>4 retrofitting this facility onto existing buses been</p> <p>5 considered?</p> <p>6 MR PAUL LI: We are now asking our bus suppliers to examine</p> <p>7 our buses to see whether retrofitting such systems would</p> <p>8 be feasible. That is, whether it is technically</p> <p>9 feasible.</p> <p>10 We would also like to know about the cost</p> <p>11 implications for the retrofitting. We are awaiting</p> <p>12 replies from the bus suppliers.</p> <p>13 MR DUNCAN: Have those sorts of requests been made in</p> <p>14 writing of the bus suppliers?</p> <p>15 MR PAUL LI: Yes.</p> <p>16 MR DUNCAN: I wonder if you could provide a couple of</p> <p>17 samples of that correspondence also to the committee.</p> <p>18 MR PAUL LI: Mr Chairman, we will go back and look for the</p> <p>19 relevant records.</p> <p>20 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Sorry, Mr Chairman, Mr Li may not be too</p> <p>21 certain as to whether we have the correspondence. We</p> <p>22 need to go back to check whether we did have the</p> <p>23 correspondence.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: Yes, please provide an answer in writing in due</p> <p>25 course. If you have it and you are prepared to supply</p>

Page 49	Page 51
<p>1 us with a copy, please do so.</p> <p>2 MR DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>3 Moving to another of the devices, TD-1/103, could</p> <p>4 I bring your attention to that page, please.</p> <p>5 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I see it.</p> <p>6 MR DUNCAN: This, Mr Cheng, is also part and parcel of that</p> <p>7 document I asked you to look at just before the break,</p> <p>8 the Transport Department document, "application of new</p> <p>9 devices or technology on franchised buses".</p> <p>10 At page 103, from paragraphs 23 through to 26, there</p> <p>11 is reference to this sort of facility, collision</p> <p>12 prevention and lane-keeping devices.</p> <p>13 I wonder if you could just read through that to</p> <p>14 familiarise yourself with what's contained in</p> <p>15 paragraphs 23 to 26, please.</p> <p>16 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I think Mr Chung, my colleague, can answer</p> <p>17 the question, because he has already read it.</p> <p>18 MR DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>19 Mr Chung, if I could then ask you to look at</p> <p>20 paragraph 26. It records the fact that "the ... bus</p> <p>21 operators do not consider that the installation of</p> <p>22 collision prevention and lane-keeping devices are</p> <p>23 effective for enhancing the safe operation of franchised</p> <p>24 bus services", and I believe this for the reasons that</p> <p>25 you can see earlier in paragraph 26. Is that the case?</p>	<p>1 So the findings were such that some of the alerts</p> <p>2 were not quite suitable for use on buses. Say, for</p> <p>3 example, when the bus pulls up at a bus bay, since it is</p> <p>4 detected that there are people in front of the bus, as</p> <p>5 you know there are passengers waiting at the bus stop,</p> <p>6 so when people are detected then there will be an audio</p> <p>7 signal. Well, in fact the driver hasn't yet</p> <p>8 straightened the bus and so a signal would also be sent.</p> <p>9 Moreover, when the bus is stopped too close to the</p> <p>10 preceding bus, this will be a signal to be sent out in</p> <p>11 the case of when the traffic is slow. As a result, it</p> <p>12 means that the warning signals are emitted many times</p> <p>13 during a journey. 46 per cent of the bus captains told</p> <p>14 us in the questionnaire that there were too many warning</p> <p>15 signals and it was causing a nuisance to their driving,</p> <p>16 and as a result they ignored the signals, and then</p> <p>17 50 per cent of the drivers told us that the Mobileye</p> <p>18 didn't help in their safe driving.</p> <p>19 So having considered the functions of this Mobileye</p> <p>20 and having taken into account the views of our bus</p> <p>21 captains, moreover there is a high cost involved in the</p> <p>22 installation, we as a result decided against following</p> <p>23 up on the idea.</p> <p>24 So that's our experience. We shared our experience</p> <p>25 at the meeting.</p>
Page 50	Page 52
<p>1 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Correct.</p> <p>2 MR DUNCAN: So do I understand correctly then that as far as</p> <p>3 the company is concerned, it is not proposing to pursue</p> <p>4 that possible device any further?</p> <p>5 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Let me first of all explain. Such</p> <p>6 a device, in the year 2014, our company did carry out</p> <p>7 a test of such devices. This is called Mobileye.</p> <p>8 Mobileye is a driving assisting device. At that time,</p> <p>9 it was mainly applied to private cars. What was</p> <p>10 involved was that they would use the visual aid to</p> <p>11 detect what is in front and then the system will carry</p> <p>12 out an analysis and then calculations would be made as</p> <p>13 to the distance between the subject vehicle and the</p> <p>14 preceding one and the following one, and then come up</p> <p>15 with an idea about the time of collision, then warning</p> <p>16 signals would be sent to the driver.</p> <p>17 At the time we fitted this Mobileye on three of our</p> <p>18 buses, we carried out a trial scheme for four months.</p> <p>19 We made arrangements for representatives of different</p> <p>20 trade unions, that is bus captain representatives, as</p> <p>21 well as 50-plus bus captains to drive such buses, that</p> <p>22 is three of them, in their normal service, and after</p> <p>23 that they were asked to fill out a questionnaire for us,</p> <p>24 telling us what they think about this device called</p> <p>25 Mobileye.</p>	<p>1 Thank you.</p> <p>2 MR DUNCAN: So that exercise that was conducted in 2014, was</p> <p>3 that of your own initiative or was that something</p> <p>4 requested by the Transport Department?</p> <p>5 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: At that time, it was our own initiative.</p> <p>6 This is because the supplier approached us and told us</p> <p>7 about this safety device, saying that it could help to</p> <p>8 reduce the number of traffic accidents. Therefore we on</p> <p>9 our own carried out this trial scheme.</p> <p>10 MR DUNCAN: Was this supplier one of the bus manufacturers</p> <p>11 or was it independent of the bus manufacturers?</p> <p>12 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: An independent supplier, the device</p> <p>13 supplier.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN: Who is that?</p> <p>15 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: It is an Israeli company, Neshtech</p> <p>16 Pty Ltd. There is an agent in Hong Kong.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>18 MR DUNCAN: Moving down, still on the Transport Department's</p> <p>19 document at page 105 --</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: Before you move on -- were the results of your</p> <p>21 testing of this device produced into some paper which</p> <p>22 gave an opportunity for the decision to be made?</p> <p>23 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, Chairman. We have a report as</p> <p>24 a result of the test.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Are you in a position to provide us with a copy</p>

Page 53	Page 55
<p>1 of that report, the salient features as to why it was 2 not thought to be useful? 3 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Most certainly, sir. 4 CHAIRMAN: If you could provide us with that, we would be 5 grateful. 6 Yes, Mr Duncan. 7 MR DUNCAN: Thank you, Chairman. 8 Moving down page 105 to another of the safety 9 devices, this time the driver monitoring device. Can 10 you familiarise yourselves with paragraphs 27 and 28 of 11 that document, please. 12 MR SAMUEL CHENG: My colleague Mr Li can take the questions. 13 He has already done the reading. Thank you. 14 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. Can I ask you this: is the company, 15 either Citybus or New World, one of the two operators 16 who have advised that they would install a system of 17 this nature in four of their buses for a trial of three 18 months, tentatively starting from early May of this 19 year? 20 MR PAUL LI: No, sir. 21 MR DUNCAN: So there's been no commitment from the company 22 to become involved in this system? 23 MR PAUL LI: Correct. We haven't made any commitment, sir. 24 MR DUNCAN: Have you decided against it? 25 MR PAUL LI: No. We are enquiring about the three</p>	<p>1 MR DUNCAN: I would like to refer you, please, to the 2 website of the Ming Pao newspaper, which carries 3 an article relevant to this particular matter. This is 4 not in the bundle. 5 CHAIRMAN: Where do we find that? 6 MR DUNCAN: This is not in the bundle, Mr Chairman, but it's 7 available on the screen now, I believe, with 8 a translation. 9 CHAIRMAN: Yes. 10 MR DUNCAN: Could you just read through this publication on 11 the website dated 27 May. Could you read that to 12 yourself, please. 13 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: We've seen it, sir. 14 MR DUNCAN: Have you seen this article before? 15 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, I was given this yesterday. 16 MR DUNCAN: Are you aware, because of that article, that 17 it's proposed to introduce some sort of monitoring 18 device for the benefit of the bus driver on the buses 19 which will ply between Hong Kong, Macau and Zhuhai, on 20 the new bridge? Are you aware of that? 21 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, I am. 22 MR DUNCAN: Were you aware of that before you read this 23 article? 24 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: I learnt about it from the news. 25 MR DUNCAN: Do you have any plan with regard to exploring</p>
Page 54	Page 56
<p>1 suppliers, we are liaising with the suppliers, and 2 trying to get hold of some information there. 3 MR DUNCAN: Can I bring your attention to your submission at 4 page 62. It's CTB-1, page 62. 5 At paragraph 9, have you set out the suppliers with 6 whom you have already met with regard to the potential 7 for installing this facility? 8 MR PAUL LI: Yes, correct. 9 MR DUNCAN: What is the current situation with regard to 10 this study? 11 MR PAUL LI: The latest situation is Consolidated Parts 12 & Accessories Sales Centre Ltd, they gave us 13 a demonstration of the product, but the videoing process 14 is not sufficiently sophisticated. It's not good 15 enough, and in June they are going to be coming again 16 for the demonstration of the videoing process. 17 The second, Guardian, they said they would put 18 forward a proposal to make available 10 devices on loan 19 and will give us a quotation. We have received 20 a quotation and it is being considered at the moment. 21 The third supplier, BYD Auto Industry Co Ltd, they 22 haven't shown us any products yet. They are going to be 23 showing us some products for testing. 24 Other than those three, we will explore whether 25 there are other devices available.</p>	<p>1 what this system, apparently researched and developed in 2 the mainland, might provide for the company? 3 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: We will see whether we can get in touch 4 with the shuttle bus company for this 5 Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macau Bridge and see if we can get more 6 information from them about the system. 7 MR DUNCAN: Are you able to give the committee any idea as 8 to when it's likely that you will make a decision on 9 this sort of device? When do you think you will be in 10 a position to make a decision? 11 MR SAMUEL CHENG: At the moment, we haven't been able to get 12 in touch with the relevant company regarding the 13 Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macau Bridge, and we are not sure about 14 all the actual operational details. We are not sure 15 about the cost implications. So, at this present stage, 16 I find it difficult to say precisely when that decision 17 will be taken, until such time as we have all the 18 relevant information, before we can consider it and take 19 a decision. 20 Thank you. 21 MR DUNCAN: When was it that the company first started to 22 consider the possibility of utilising this sort of 23 facility? 24 MR SAMUEL CHENG: We haven't started considering it yet, in 25 the absence of any information.</p>

Page 57	Page 59
<p>1 MR DUNCAN: Right, but you made contact with various 2 suppliers. When did you make contact with those 3 suppliers? 4 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Your question is about the Hong 5 Kong-Zhuhai-Macau Bridge company, or which part are you 6 referring to? 7 MR DUNCAN: The earlier companies referred to in your 8 submission. 9 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I defer to Mr Li, please. 10 MR PAUL LI: It was about April this year. 11 MR DUNCAN: So, again, was that as a result of the 12 discussions amongst the working group? 13 MR PAUL LI: Yes, correct, sir. 14 MR DUNCAN: And had it not been considered before the 15 formation of the working group? 16 MR PAUL LI: No, sir. 17 MR DUNCAN: Could I ask you now, moving to another safety 18 matter, to go to TD-1. 19 CHAIRMAN: Before you do that and before we move on -- at 20 page 63 of your second submission, CTB-1, page 63, it is 21 stated in that paragraph that Guardian, I think the 22 Australian manufacturer of the device, indicated that 23 Singapore Land Transport Authority had stipulated that 24 the device be deployed in their new public buses. 25 Have you contacted the Singapore Land Transport</p>	<p>1 or on all seats on the upper deck. However, our 2 observation shows that very few people wear the seat 3 belts currently available at the exposed seats. Without 4 any legislation to mandate the wearing of passenger seat 5 belts on a franchised bus and the enforcement authority 6 to strictly enforce the legislation, installing seat 7 belts on all seats will be a waste of resources because 8 vast majority of passengers will not wear seat belts 9 even though they are provided." 10 That was a statement that you made in the latest 11 forward planning programme for Citybus. 12 Could you now look at, please, TD-1/95, again the 13 same document, and the heading on this particular page, 14 "Installation of seat belts for all passenger seats". 15 Do you see that entry? 16 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Sorry, which paragraph, please? 17 MR DUNCAN: TD-1, page 95. 18 CHAIRMAN: 95, not 195. 19 MR DUNCAN: TD/95, sorry. 20 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I've got it. 21 MR DUNCAN: I wonder if you or one of your colleagues could 22 read through what's contained in paragraphs 5 to 9 of 23 this matter. 24 CHAIRMAN: This is paper 8 of the Transport Department's 25 submissions to the committee, Mr Duncan.</p>
Page 58	Page 60
<p>1 Authority for any information? 2 MR PAUL LI: We were made available this information through 3 Guardian. We haven't got in touch with SLTA. 4 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 5 MR DUNCAN: Could I ask you please to go to TD-1/195. 6 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, sir. 7 MR DUNCAN: You will probably recognise this, Mr Cheng, as 8 part of -- 9 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, sir. 10 MR DUNCAN: -- the forward planning programme of Citybus 11 that you have provided to the committee. It's that part 12 of the forward planning programme which is concerned 13 with the topic of bus safety, item number 5. Do you see 14 that? 15 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, sir. 16 MR DUNCAN: Could I bring your particular attention to 17 page 202 of the bundle. 18 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, sir. 19 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. In particular, item 5.13, 20 "Feasibility of installation of seat belts on (a) all 21 seats and (b) all seats on the upper deck on new buses". 22 Do you see that entry? 23 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, sir. 24 MR DUNCAN: If I could read it quickly: 25 "It is feasible to install seat belts on all seats</p>	<p>1 MR SAMUEL CHENG: My colleague is reading it. 2 MR DUNCAN: Can I ask you this question: has this been 3 a matter which has been discussed amongst the working 4 group? 5 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, it was. 6 MR DUNCAN: If I could bring your attention to paragraph 7 7 in particular. Is it the case that the company has 8 indicated that it now agrees to incorporate the 9 requirement for all new buses to be equipped with seat 10 belts for all passengers? 11 MR PAUL LI: Yes, our company has agreed that, starting from 12 June 2019 onwards, those buses delivered should get the 13 seat belts, that's the three-point safety seat belts. 14 MR DUNCAN: As far as retrofitting seat belts into existing 15 buses, have you read the content of paragraph 8 of the 16 document? 17 CHAIRMAN: Before you embark on retrofitting, might I ask 18 this question. In your earlier answers, you said that 19 it was a waste of resources to fit seat belts because 20 the vast majority of passengers simply wouldn't wear 21 them, so that it required enforcement. Given that you 22 have now indicated that you have agreed to incorporate 23 them, what view do you have about whether or not this is 24 a waste of resources if there isn't enforcement? 25 MR SAMUEL CHENG: If it is not mandated by law, then it is</p>

Page 61	Page 63
<p>1 impossible to enforce the law. Currently, there is no 2 requirement that when you are on a bus you have to put 3 on your seat belt. Even if it is mandated by law, in 4 the absence of law enforcement, I'm afraid it is also 5 a waste of resources. We maintain the same view. 6 CHAIRMAN: Have you raised this view with the Transport 7 Department? 8 MR SAMUEL CHENG: We did. Our colleagues did raise it with 9 the TD. 10 CHAIRMAN: And what, if any, response did you get? 11 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I can defer to Mr Chung. He was there at 12 that time. 13 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 14 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Mr Chairman, at that time, the TD said 15 that it should be fitted there and then it is up to the 16 passenger to choose whether to put on the seat belt. If 17 the passenger worries for his safety, he will have 18 a seat belt available for use, but if it is not there, 19 then even if he is worried, he can't have one to use. 20 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 21 MR DUNCAN: Have you actually raised with the Transport 22 Department whether they would endeavour to have the 23 appropriate legislation passed? 24 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: We did mention to the Transport 25 Department, that is, if there isn't any statutory</p>	<p>1 the related laws involved, I'm not familiar with that, 2 and therefore I'm afraid I cannot give you an answer, 3 that is, whether we could consider and whether we would 4 make the by-laws, because we haven't considered this 5 particular area. 6 Thank you. 7 MR DUNCAN: Is the behaviour of passengers on your buses 8 sometimes a matter of concern to the company? 9 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Which aspect do you mean? 10 MR DUNCAN: In their abuse of drivers, verbal abuse of 11 drivers. Does that happen from time to time? 12 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, it did happen. 13 MR DUNCAN: Do you think that the company would be better 14 equipped to cope with that situation if it had its own 15 by-laws which itself could enforce? 16 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I'm not familiar with things like by-laws 17 as well as what you mentioned. That is, with the 18 by-laws, we can then enforce the law. I don't know how 19 it will work. In particular, law enforcement. Our bus 20 captains would not know how to enforce the law. 21 Moreover, if it is left to the bus captain to enforce 22 the law, then all the more there will be a greater 23 conflict between the bus captain and the bus passengers. 24 There is only one bus captain on board. The rest are 25 all bus passengers. He is on his own.</p>
Page 62	Page 64
<p>1 backup, then the seat belt may very well be a waste. 2 But then the TD didn't promise that there would 3 certainly be the passage of the relevant legislation. 4 MR DUNCAN: Can I ask you to refer, please, to TD-2 at 5 page 58. 6 You will see there an extract from the Public Bus 7 Services Ordinance, and in particular section 36 of the 8 Ordinance. Do you see that? 9 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes. 10 MR DUNCAN: Are you familiar with that provision, Mr Cheng? 11 MR SAMUEL CHENG: No, I am not. 12 MR DUNCAN: Is this the first time you have come across it? 13 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, the first time. 14 MR DUNCAN: You see that it -- 15 CHAIRMAN: Take your time to read it so that you understand 16 what you are being asked. 17 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I have taken a look of that. 18 MR DUNCAN: Do you understand that it provides that subject 19 to the Ordinance and the franchise, the grantee may make 20 by-laws for a number of matters which are therein set 21 out? 22 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I read it. 23 MR DUNCAN: Has the company ever considered passing by-laws 24 pursuant to this provision? 25 MR SAMUEL CHENG: In relation to the making of by-laws and</p>	<p>1 MR DUNCAN: Do you have any bus inspectors? 2 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, we do have bus inspectors, but we 3 won't have a bus inspector on each and every bus. Bus 4 inspectors are there to monitor the work performance of 5 our bus captains. Moreover, at the bus terminus, bus 6 inspectors also carry out their work. 7 MR DUNCAN: Are you aware of the fact that the Mass Transit 8 Railway has its own by-laws? 9 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I've heard about that but I don't know 10 about the details. 11 MR DUNCAN: If seat belts were installed on all buses, and 12 if passengers refuse to wear a seat belt, do you think 13 that by-laws passed by the company might be able to 14 assist with regard to enforcement? 15 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I believe our bus captains do not have the 16 ability to enforce it, because if the bus passenger 17 insists on not wearing the seat belt, first of all, the 18 passengers are seated on the upper deck; it is 19 impossible for the bus captain to see whether each and 20 every passenger has worn a seat belt. Even if he can, 21 it means he has to stop the bus and then the bus captain 22 has to turn off the engine. 23 Now, for a public bus, if the engine is on, it is 24 impossible for the bus captain to leave his cabin, so he 25 has to switch off the engine, he has to walk upstairs,</p>

Page 65	Page 67
<p>1 identify the passenger not wearing the seat belt, and 2 then ask him to do it. If the passenger refuses to do 3 it, it means then, right on the spot, there will be 4 a confrontation between the passenger and the captain. 5 Our service will be affected, and the bus captain may 6 even have a fight with the bus passenger. 7 So I don't think our bus captain can actually 8 enforce the law. 9 Thank you. 10 MR DUNCAN: The bus inspectors whom you say are there just 11 to monitor the driving of the bus, how many bus 12 inspectors are employed in that capacity? 13 MR SAMUEL CHENG: First of all, let me correct a fact. 14 Inspectors don't just go to monitor the driving of bus 15 captains. Monitoring of bus driving is one of the 16 duties of the bus inspectors. Bus inspectors are at the 17 frontline to manage the bus operation. 18 As to how many bus inspectors we have and what they 19 do, I would like to defer to Mr Chung, my colleague. 20 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Thank you, Mr Chairman. 21 We have more than 100 inspectors, and they have 22 different areas of work. Some will be in the control 23 centre. Others are on the road, making their rounds. 24 They may be at the bus terminus, assisting the 25 passengers or maintaining order.</p>	<p>1 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I defer to Mr Li, please. 2 MR PAUL LI: Our company is consulting the suppliers 3 regarding the feasibility of retrofitting the existing 4 buses with seat belts. The preliminary reply is that 5 for ADL buses, post-2013, buses in 2013 and post-2013, 6 the upper deck seats can be retrofitted. But we do need 7 to have structural reinforcement and all the seats have 8 to be replaced, because the existing seats cannot be 9 used for the retrofitting purposes. 10 The preliminary cost, estimated cost, is for each 11 bus, it would be 15,000 to 20,000 pounds per vehicle. 12 We estimate that we have 1,100 buses in a fleet that 13 belong to this category or this model. If retrofitting 14 has to happen, the price tag is going to be \$180 million 15 to \$240 million. That's a vast sum of money, and some 16 money will be wasted. 17 CHAIRMAN: It will be wasted because passengers won't use 18 the seat belts? 19 MR PAUL LI: Correct, sir, because we noticed, for our 20 existing buses, for the exposed seats, we do have the 21 three-point seat belts available, but we noticed the 22 passengers can't be bothered putting on the seat belts. 23 MR DUNCAN: Has the company in the past received any form of 24 subsidy from the government authorities? 25 MR PAUL LI: In the past, the government or the EPD in fact</p>
Page 66	Page 68
<p>1 We have a thousand or more buses on the roads. It 2 is impossible for the inspectors to be on hand, if 3 anything happens, to give assistance to the drivers. 4 The MTRC has the by-laws but there is a difference here. 5 For the MTR stations, they have a certain number of 6 staff who can offer assistance. If anything happens on 7 board the train, their drivers will be driving into the 8 station, into the platform, to seek assistance. But for 9 our bus captains, if anything happens, like we said, he 10 cannot drive the bus to look for the inspector. If 11 a dispute has already occurred, then this simply cannot 12 happen. 13 So there is a bit of difference between the two. 14 Thank you. 15 MR DUNCAN: If we go back to the Transport Department 16 document -- I had you at page 96 of the bundle, 17 paragraph 7, which is concerned with seat belts on new 18 buses. 19 In paragraph 8, the question of retrofitting seat 20 belts on seats of existing buses is raised, and at the 21 end of that paragraph there's an indication that the 22 franchised bus operators will further study this 23 proposal. 24 Is this something which is under study by the 25 company?</p>	<p>1 subsidised the installation of some emission-reduction 2 devices. And there were some hybrid vehicles, three, 3 that were funded for trial purposes. 4 Also, there are 10 single-decker buses, electric 5 buses, that were tested. 6 Thank you, sir. 7 MR DUNCAN: We have seen that a number of these initiatives 8 for safety devices or improvement to safety devices have 9 been raised as a result of the working group which has 10 been set up. 11 In the course of those deliberations, has it 12 occurred to the company to raise with the government the 13 possibility of subsidies being made available in order 14 to meet some of the cost of what might be regarded as 15 improved safety provisions? 16 MR SAMUEL CHENG: We never talk to the government, but if 17 the government is prepared to offer subsidy with a view 18 to enhancing safety, we will work on that. 19 MR DUNCAN: Why would you never talk to the government about 20 this? 21 MR SAMUEL CHENG: We didn't know that we could ask for 22 subsidy from the government. 23 MR DUNCAN: I want to ask you just a few questions, please, 24 about the disciplinary process, to which reference has 25 been made already. If I could ask you in that respect,</p>

Page 69	<p>1 please, to turn up page 39 of the CTB-1 bundle. So</p> <p>2 CTB-1 at page 39.</p> <p>3 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, sir.</p> <p>4 MR DUNCAN: We can see reference to this at the bottom of</p> <p>5 the page, (b), under the heading "Background checks and</p> <p>6 penalties for traffic convictions":</p> <p>7 "(b) Our service quality department is responsible</p> <p>8 for administering disciplinary sanctions for any</p> <p>9 misconduct by bus captains, as per the guidelines set</p> <p>10 out in the bus captain manual."</p> <p>11 Then there is further detail provided to the</p> <p>12 committee with regard to the disciplinary process.</p> <p>13 Now, the reference to "the bus captain manual",</p> <p>14 could we just turn this up, please. CTB-2 at page 85.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: Which year of the manual is that, Mr Duncan?</p> <p>16 MR DUNCAN: 2018, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>18 MR DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>19 We have extracts from the bus captain's handbook at</p> <p>20 page 85, and a translation of the extracts from</p> <p>21 page 169-1.</p> <p>22 If I could ask you to look, please, at the list of</p> <p>23 contents, which I believe you will see in original</p> <p>24 version at page 87, and in the translation at 169-3.</p> <p>25 Are you at the list of contents?</p>	Page 71	<p>1 MR DUNCAN: Is this handbook reviewed from time to time?</p> <p>2 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, sir.</p> <p>3 MR DUNCAN: How often is that?</p> <p>4 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: There is no fixed time frame, no fixed</p> <p>5 cycle. It depends on whether there are changes that</p> <p>6 have to be added or made.</p> <p>7 MR DUNCAN: Could you give the committee some idea as to how</p> <p>8 many bus captains have been subjected to a disciplinary</p> <p>9 process, say in the last 12 months?</p> <p>10 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Well, at first we thought we will be asked</p> <p>11 questions about driving safety, so we haven't prepared</p> <p>12 the information about the number of disciplinary</p> <p>13 actions. We can certainly provide the information</p> <p>14 afterwards.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: Yes, please do so.</p> <p>16 MR DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>17 Mr Chairman, that would be a convenient moment, if</p> <p>18 it suits the committee.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Yes, it does.</p> <p>20 We will now adjourn and resume the hearing at 2.30</p> <p>21 this afternoon. Thank you.</p> <p>22 (1.01 pm)</p> <p>23 (The luncheon adjournment)</p> <p>24 (2.30 pm)</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Good afternoon.</p>
Page 70	<p>1 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I see them.</p> <p>2 MR DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>3 Would you agree that this is a very long and a very</p> <p>4 detailed document?</p> <p>5 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, sir.</p> <p>6 MR DUNCAN: And the English version -- both versions, we</p> <p>7 have seven different sections, with a number of</p> <p>8 different paragraphs in each section.</p> <p>9 What steps are taken by the company to ensure that</p> <p>10 a bus captain is familiar with all the provisions in the</p> <p>11 handbook?</p> <p>12 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I defer to Mr Chung, please.</p> <p>13 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: In this bus captain's manual, when they</p> <p>14 first join the induction training, they are briefed on</p> <p>15 most of the details of this handbook, and in the</p> <p>16 refresher training we also brief them on the details</p> <p>17 again. So this handbook is there to facilitate them,</p> <p>18 after attending all these training courses, to go into</p> <p>19 detail about them. If they don't remember anything,</p> <p>20 they can go back to this manual.</p> <p>21 Thank you.</p> <p>22 MR DUNCAN: In answer to the chairman, I indicated that this</p> <p>23 particular handbook bears the date of April of this</p> <p>24 year. When was the previous version of this issued?</p> <p>25 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: The previous version was July 2017.</p>	Page 72	<p>1 Yes, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>2 MR DUNCAN: Thank you, Chairman.</p> <p>3 Mr Cheng, I would like to ask you a few questions,</p> <p>4 please, arising out of the 2018 Guidelines on Bus</p> <p>5 Captain Working Hours, Rest Times, and Meal Breaks.</p> <p>6 You will find the actual guidelines at CTB-2 at</p> <p>7 page 2, and the previous guidelines you will find, if</p> <p>8 you want to refer to those, at TD-5 at page 1556.</p> <p>9 But just for the ease of this afternoon's questions,</p> <p>10 I'm having distributed what is a comparison table of the</p> <p>11 various guidelines, which seeks to compare the</p> <p>12 guidelines as they evolved between 2004 and 2018.</p> <p>13 So could I perhaps ask you just to have a look at</p> <p>14 that chart, first of all. You should be looking at</p> <p>15 a document which is headed "Comparison table of the</p> <p>16 guidelines", with a date of 4 May 2018. Do you have</p> <p>17 that in front of you?</p> <p>18 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes.</p> <p>19 MR DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>20 What I would like to do first is just identify some</p> <p>21 of the more important changes which have been made</p> <p>22 between the guidelines passed in this year with those</p> <p>23 passed back in 2010. Do you follow that?</p> <p>24 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes.</p> <p>25 MR DUNCAN: Thank you.</p>

Page 73	Page 75
<p>1 What I would like to do first of all, on the chart, 2 is bring to your attention the third entry down on the 3 page, the maximum driving hours. Do you see that entry? 4 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes. 5 MR DUNCAN: We can see the change, that as far as maximum 6 driving hours are concerned, the new guideline is that 7 it should be 10 hours in a shift, as opposed to what 8 was, in the 2010 guidelines, as 11 hours in a working 9 day. 10 Do you see that difference, first of all? 11 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I can see that the wordings are 12 different. 13 MR DUNCAN: Does that accord with your understanding of the 14 changes? 15 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I would like to defer to Mr Chung. 16 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, it is. 17 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. 18 Now, the second matter I would like to bring to your 19 attention is the maximum duty hours, which is the entry 20 just above that. Do we see the change there to the 21 effect that, from the 2018 guidelines, the maximum duty 22 hours are 12 hours in a shift, as compared with 14 hours 23 in a working day? Does that accord with your 24 understanding, Mr Chung? 25 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes.</p>	<p>1 notwithstanding the provision that there can be 2 a special shift duty of maximum duty hours of 14 hours, 3 it is the company's intention not to operate a shift 4 duty in excess of 13 hours? Is that the company's 5 intention? 6 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Correct. 7 MR DUNCAN: Earlier on, we noted that according to the 8 information that you've given to the committee, in the 9 light of these new guidelines, some 121 additional 10 drivers would be needed. Do you recall seeing that 11 figure? 12 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes. 13 MR DUNCAN: Has the intention to invoke the maximum of 14 13 hours been taken into account in reaching that 15 figure? 16 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Correct. 17 MR DUNCAN: If in fact you availed yourself of the ability 18 to have maximum duty hours of 14 hours, as opposed to 19 13 hours, would that reduce the number of additional 20 drivers that you would need? 21 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, it would. 22 MR DUNCAN: So what has prompted the company to decide to 23 restrict its maximum duty hours just to 13? 24 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Because we are aware of the public's 25 concern about safety.</p>
Page 74	Page 76
<p>1 MR DUNCAN: If we turn the page, we will see, however, that 2 in the context of maximum duty hours and driving hours, 3 there is a new arrangement arising out of what is 4 described as a "special shift duty". Do you see that on 5 the second page? 6 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes. 7 MR DUNCAN: So there is a provision whereby the duty hour of 8 the driver may in fact exceed the 12 hours provided for, 9 as we can see on page 1, and it can be as much as 10 14 hours; do you see that? 11 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes. 12 MR DUNCAN: Again does that accord with your understanding 13 of the new guidelines? 14 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes. 15 MR DUNCAN: And the driving hour within that special shift 16 duty, is that subject to a maximum of 10 hours? 17 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes. 18 MR DUNCAN: And is there a further condition with regard to 19 the special shift duty, that there should be a rest 20 break of no less than three consecutive hours? 21 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes. 22 MR DUNCAN: Is that again your understanding? 23 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes. 24 MR DUNCAN: Having taken you through those, could I ask you 25 this, first of all: do I understand correctly that</p>	<p>1 MR DUNCAN: And how will this help safety? 2 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Regarding the daily hours of the bus 3 captains, that won't be too long, because it will be 4 capped at 13. 5 MR DUNCAN: But the driving hours would be the same in 6 either case, wouldn't it? The maximum driving hours 7 would be 10 hours, irrespective of whether the shift was 8 13 hours or 14 hours? 9 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Correct. 10 MR DUNCAN: So it's just the extra hour in a long day, is 11 it, that the company takes into account? 12 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes. In other words, if he can knock off 13 earlier, then he will have more rest time between two 14 consecutive shifts. 15 MR DUNCAN: Right. 16 Now, you told us earlier that typically a driver, 17 a bus captain, apart from the part-time drivers, 18 of course, would be working for something like 10 hours, 19 eight hours at normal time and two hours of overtime. 20 Do you recall telling the committee about that? 21 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, I recall. 22 MR DUNCAN: A person who is required to work the special 23 shift duty -- in other words, be on duty for 13 hours 24 but who drives just for 10 -- on what basis is he paid? 25 Does he get eight hours of normal time and five hours of</p>

Page 77	Page 79
<p>1 overtime, or does he get eight hours of normal time and 2 two hours of overtime, as per the usual arrangement, 3 with no payment for the rest break? 4 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: He will get eight hours' basic salary, 5 and then, for the five hours, that would be overtime 6 pay. 7 MR DUNCAN: Have you started to introduce the operation of 8 the new guidelines? 9 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Not yet. 10 MR DUNCAN: When are they going to start? 11 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: We plan to do so in the third quarter of 12 this year. 13 MR DUNCAN: Why the delay? 14 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: First, we need to recruit sufficient bus 15 captains before we can launch it. Second, we have to 16 increase facilities for bus captains to take their rest 17 for those three hours. They need to have a place to 18 take a break. 19 MR DUNCAN: Are you able to give the committee any idea as 20 to how often a driver will be required to be on duty for 21 the 13-hour period which you indicated would be 22 introduced? 23 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: For New World First Bus and Citybus, they 24 have different arrangements. For the New World First 25 Bus, for the bus captains, they have a fixed shift. If</p>	<p>1 that company, New World First Bus, would be on duty 2 13 hours a day for five or six days in a week? 3 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: There are some bus captains who are like 4 that, but not all of them. We estimate that there are 5 10 or more per cent of the shifts that are special 6 shifts. 7 MR DUNCAN: So approximately what proportion of drivers 8 would be working those hours, a 13-hour special shift 9 each day, for five to six days; approximately what 10 percentage of the New World First Bus contingent? 11 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: With indulgence, sir. 12 10-odd per cent, about 144 shifts. 13 MR DUNCAN: Going to Citybus, could you explain again, 14 please, the difference between New World First Bus and 15 Citybus in this respect? 16 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: For Citybus, the bus captains do not have 17 a fixed shift per day. Each week, they will -- every 18 five days, they have a shift and then they have a day 19 off, and when they come back from the day off they will 20 rotate to the next shift, for five days, and then they 21 have a day off and then they come back for another 22 shift. It works like this. 23 MR DUNCAN: So do I understand correctly that within a week, 24 one day they might be on duty for a maximum of 10 hours 25 and another day they might be on duty for 13 hours? It</p>
<p>Page 78</p> <p>1 a bus captain has applied to be on special shift duties, 2 then he will always be on a special shift duty, unless 3 and except when he's on leave. 4 For Citybus, for their bus captains, they have 5 a roster system. So every week he will be having 6 a different shift. So it depends. It depends on the 7 deployment of the roster. 8 So it would be difficult to say how often he would 9 be on such a shift. 10 MR DUNCAN: With regard to New World First Bus, do 11 I understand you to be saying that some drivers would be 12 permanently on a 13-hour shift, special shift? 13 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes. 14 MR DUNCAN: How many days a week would they be working? 15 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Work for five days or six days per week, 16 with one day off. 17 MR DUNCAN: When you say five or six, is that the driver's 18 choice or ...? 19 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: They have to apply for the shift that 20 they prefer. There are some shifts that would go on 21 from Monday to Saturday and they would have to work for 22 six days, with Sunday being off. There are other shifts 23 that we go on from Mondays to Sundays and then they work 24 for five days and then they will have a day off. 25 MR DUNCAN: So do I understand that many of the drivers in</p>	<p>Page 80</p> <p>1 changes day-to-day? 2 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Every five days. They rotate every five 3 days. 4 MR DUNCAN: I see. 5 CHAIRMAN: So what are the variables? You have a 10-hour 6 day. You've got a 13-hour day. Is there any other 7 different category? 8 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, there are -- 10 hours is the average 9 number. There are some shifts that would involve eight 10 hours, some nine hours, 10 hours, 11 hours. 11 MEMBER LO: The whole five-day shift has the same pattern, 12 so you don't change from eight, 10, 13? So the five 13 days, exactly the same shift? 14 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: That's correct. 15 MR DUNCAN: Are you able to give the committee some idea as 16 to what practical effect this will have, the new 17 guidelines will have, on the duty of the average, if 18 I can call it that, the average bus captain's working 19 hours? Is this going to be a shift change within the 20 companies, or is it going to be other than significant, 21 with regard to their working hours? 22 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Well, if they are on special shift, then 23 the rest time would be concentrated on the three hours. 24 Before we changed the guidelines, the maximum working 25 hours would be 14 hours, with driving hours 11 hours.</p>

Page 81	Page 83
<p>1 For a 14-hour shift, they have three hours' rest time, 2 but this rest time would be broken up during that 3 stretch. For a special shift, the rest break will be 4 concentrated in a particular three-hour or more than 5 three-hour stretch. 6 MR DUNCAN: The old 14-hour shift, was that popular with 7 your drivers? 8 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Some. It is popular with some captains. 9 MR DUNCAN: Were any bus captains required to work a maximum 10 of 14 hours or be on duty for 14 hours against their 11 wishes? 12 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: We assign them the shifts and they have 13 to observe the shifts. However, if they can find 14 a colleague to swap the shift with and it is in keeping 15 with the guidelines, then this would be granted. 16 MR DUNCAN: And if a person was not happy with the 14-hour 17 provision, would he find it easy to undertake that 18 exchange? 19 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: I'm not sure whether they find it easy to 20 exchange, but the swap arrangement is quite common. 21 MR DUNCAN: What do you anticipate with regard to the 22 special shift duty? Do you think it will be popular 23 with your employees or other than popular? 24 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: I heard from some union representatives 25 that it is popular, but other representatives that it is</p>	<p>1 First of all, if you would look at page 199 of the 2 bundle, and "Analysis of accident by nature in 2016". 3 Do you see that entry? 4 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I do, sir. 5 MR DUNCAN: We can see table 4 there. The nature of the 6 accidents have been classified under a number of heads, 7 with the table reaching over to page 200. Do you see 8 that? 9 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I do. 10 MR DUNCAN: The nature of the accident which is the greatest 11 by quite a long way is the last on page 199, and that is 12 the non-collision accident involving a passenger injury. 13 Do you see that? 14 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I do. 15 MR DUNCAN: And that point is picked up on page 200: 16 "As about 60 per cent of the accidents were 17 non-collision accidents involving passenger injury, 18 further analysis was made on this type of accidents as 19 shown in table 5 below. The analysis revealed that 20 accidents caused by passengers losing balance in the bus 21 has always been the major cause of accidents." 22 As far as you know, does that remain the case today, 23 that that proportion appears to be the highest with 24 regard to the nature of accidents? 25 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Not much different, yes.</p>
Page 82	Page 84
<p>1 unpopular. 2 MR DUNCAN: So you've got mixed reports, have you? 3 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Whether it is half-and-half, I'm not 4 sure. I heard some bus captains that they would like to 5 have longer shifts because they want more money. 6 MR DUNCAN: What makes it unpopular with some? 7 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: There are some bus captains who don't 8 need so much money. There are some, for instance, 9 who've been with us for a long time and they are not the 10 breadwinner in the family, and eight hours/nine hours 11 would be enough for them, and therefore they don't 12 prefer any shifts which are long. 13 MR DUNCAN: Do you anticipate requiring people to be on duty 14 for up to 13 hours against their will? Do you expect 15 that to happen? 16 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: I don't think so. 17 MR DUNCAN: Right. In the absence of any further questions, 18 I'm going to leave the guidelines now. 19 I want to go back to the forward planning programme, 20 please. This is what we will find at TD-1, at 195. 21 We've seen this document this morning, Mr Cheng, in the 22 context -- 23 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I did, yes, sir. 24 MR DUNCAN: -- of seat belts. There are just a few other 25 matters I wish to explore with you, if I could.</p>	<p>1 MR DUNCAN: So, if I'm reading from the paragraph above 2 table 5: 3 "The analysis revealed that accidents caused by 4 passengers losing balance in the bus has ... been the 5 major cause ..." 6 What has the company been able to do with regard to 7 this particular matter? 8 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I defer to Mr Chung, please. 9 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes. Passengers falling over on buses, 10 this has always been the major cause. In the past, we 11 had publicity together with the Transport Department. 12 The government had some APIs which were broadcast on TV 13 to remind the passengers that when they are on board 14 they have to hold onto the handrail, and if they are 15 loaded down with a lot of stuff, they should not move 16 upstairs. Our company has also put up some signs on 17 board, to remind passengers that as soon as they get on 18 board, they should find a seat to sit down on or they 19 should hold onto the handrails. 20 Other than the signs or notices, we have also made 21 use of the bus stop announcement system, to show 22 messages and to broadcast messages, to remind passengers 23 to hold onto the handrails. So this was what we had 24 done in the past. 25 Other than enhancing publicity for the public, for</p>

Page 85	Page 87
<p>1 our passengers, when we train our drivers, we also</p> <p>2 remind the bus captains that when they drive, they need</p> <p>3 to note the activities of the bus passengers on board.</p> <p>4 In particular, before they leave the bus stop, they have</p> <p>5 to check whether passengers have already reached their</p> <p>6 seats or whether they have held onto the handrails, and</p> <p>7 they have to pay particular attention to the elderly</p> <p>8 passengers. And before they stop, they need to be</p> <p>9 gradual and smooth in the manoeuvring, so as to avoid</p> <p>10 braking the vehicle and causing injuries to passengers,</p> <p>11 when they fall.</p> <p>12 MR DUNCAN: Does the mode of driving by the driver</p> <p>13 contribute to these passengers falling over? Is that</p> <p>14 your experience?</p> <p>15 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: The driving attitude of bus captains may</p> <p>16 contribute to the passengers falling. Yes, this is one</p> <p>17 of the causes.</p> <p>18 As to whether a bus passenger has held onto the</p> <p>19 handrail after boarding, it's also part of the duty or</p> <p>20 the responsibility of the passenger himself. And for</p> <p>21 the roads of Hong Kong, from time to time, there may be</p> <p>22 emergencies and they are beyond the control of the bus</p> <p>23 captains. Therefore, sometimes there is indeed a need</p> <p>24 to brake suddenly and this may cause a passenger to</p> <p>25 fall.</p>	<p>1 of the stipulated limit?</p> <p>2 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: The bus captain has the duty to make sure</p> <p>3 that the carrying capacity hasn't been exceeded.</p> <p>4 MR DUNCAN: How would you expect the bus captain to</p> <p>5 discharge that duty?</p> <p>6 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Let me answer this question. For every</p> <p>7 bus, the number of standees will be stated and</p> <p>8 stipulated. When a bus captain is driving a bus, it is</p> <p>9 impossible for him to be distracted, to count the number</p> <p>10 of passengers boarding his bus. When a bus passenger</p> <p>11 boards a bus, I think probably he will first of all try</p> <p>12 to sit down. When all the seats have been taken up,</p> <p>13 then passengers have to stand. But at any one time, the</p> <p>14 bus captain will not know how many passengers he is</p> <p>15 carrying on his bus. He can only observe. And such</p> <p>16 an observation would be based on how near the standing</p> <p>17 passengers are to the front of the bus. If there are</p> <p>18 many people standing, that means it's quite full.</p> <p>19 However, if you have ever made the observation on the</p> <p>20 street or if you have taken a ride on a bus during peak</p> <p>21 hours, you would notice that towards the further end of</p> <p>22 the passageway of the lower deck, passengers don't like</p> <p>23 to stand there. They would rather stand near to the</p> <p>24 door, that is, the exit door in the middle of the bus.</p> <p>25 And then, when there are more and more people standing,</p>
Page 86	Page 88
<p>1 MR DUNCAN: Are there rules and regulations as to how many</p> <p>2 people can travel on a bus, over and above those persons</p> <p>3 actually seated in a spot on the bus? Are there rules</p> <p>4 and regulations as to how many people are permitted to</p> <p>5 stand in a bus?</p> <p>6 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: For each and every bus, the number of</p> <p>7 seats as well as the number of standees are subject to</p> <p>8 a limit, and such limits are already sort of written on</p> <p>9 the side of the body of the bus, near to the door.</p> <p>10 Depending on the model and the length of the bus, the</p> <p>11 carrying capacity would vary, in terms of the number of</p> <p>12 seats as well as the number of standees.</p> <p>13 MR DUNCAN: And who is responsible for determining whether</p> <p>14 there is more than the required number of standees on</p> <p>15 the bus? Whose responsibility is that?</p> <p>16 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: For each new bus delivered to Hong Kong,</p> <p>17 the TD will carry out the process of type approval. As</p> <p>18 part of this process, consideration will be given to the</p> <p>19 size of the passageway on the lower deck of the bus,</p> <p>20 before coming up with a figure for the number of</p> <p>21 passengers who can stand. We would also take into</p> <p>22 account the load of the bus, and that would come into</p> <p>23 the calculations as well.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: I think the question is more specific: whose job</p> <p>25 is it to decide that the number of standees is in excess</p>	<p>1 they would rather stand near the front of the bus. They</p> <p>2 are reluctant to go further inside.</p> <p>3 Now, the bus captain can only make an observation.</p> <p>4 He will only notice that many people are standing near</p> <p>5 to the front of the bus. He would not know whether</p> <p>6 there is in fact a lot of space available further down</p> <p>7 the passageway but nobody is willing to take up that</p> <p>8 space. That is common during the peak hours.</p> <p>9 Thank you.</p> <p>10 MR DUNCAN: I understand those difficulties, Mr Cheng. Does</p> <p>11 it mean that in fact it's really virtually impossible</p> <p>12 for the driver to enforce the standing limits that are</p> <p>13 written on the side of the bus?</p> <p>14 MR SAMUEL CHENG: First of all, the bus captain would not</p> <p>15 know when he has to enforce it, because it is not</p> <p>16 possible for him to count how many people are on the</p> <p>17 bus. I think we all need to understand one point.</p> <p>18 There are always people boarding and alighting. As to</p> <p>19 the net number of passengers on board, I don't think you</p> <p>20 can expect a bus captain to do the calculations using</p> <p>21 a calculator. He can't have an accurate idea. The most</p> <p>22 he can do is to rely on visual observation. All right?</p> <p>23 If he sees that there are many people standing quite</p> <p>24 near to the front of the bus, there is no way and</p> <p>25 nothing that he can do. This is because passengers are</p>

Page 89	Page 91
<p>1 all anxious to go to work and they have already paid for 2 the bus fare. For passengers standing inside the bus, 3 they have all paid by using the Octopus card or inserted 4 coins into the fare box.</p> <p>5 Now, if the bus captain is to start a headcount one 6 by one, and say, for example, he finds that there are 7 two passengers above the limit, it will be difficult for 8 him to identify which two passengers should be persuaded 9 to alight. So that's a practical difficulty.</p> <p>10 Thank you.</p> <p>11 MR DUNCAN: Is overcrowding on buses an issue for the 12 company? Overcrowding meaning more people standing on 13 buses than the limits imposed on the bus. Is that 14 a problem?</p> <p>15 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Let me repeat once again. In fact, we 16 don't have any data to prove that we have got having 17 more standing passengers than the standee limit. We 18 don't have such a figure. We don't have such data.</p> <p>19 So I can't say with certainty as to whether we have 20 got this question of overcrowding.</p> <p>21 MR DUNCAN: So that is something unknown to the company; is 22 that correct? You don't know whether you have 23 an overcrowding problem or not?</p> <p>24 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Let me say this once again. Near to the 25 front of the bus, or for the first half, first part of</p>	<p>1 This is of course addressed to the committee, but 2 I'm just trying to ascertain what information, if any, 3 the company might receive from the police from time to 4 time.</p> <p>5 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: No, we haven't received from the police 6 information like this.</p> <p>7 However, when we prepared the five-year forward 8 planning programme, the Transport Department gives us 9 guidelines for preparing the forward planning programme, 10 and information like this has been given to us, and on 11 a yearly basis.</p> <p>12 MR DUNCAN: So you get this sort of information but through 13 the Transport Department; is that a correct 14 understanding?</p> <p>15 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Correct.</p> <p>16 MR DUNCAN: Can I just ask you this with regard to 17 paragraph 5, with regard to the main causation factors: 18 does that indication come as any surprise to you? Is it 19 consistent with your own understanding?</p> <p>20 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, it accords with our understanding; 21 not surprised.</p> <p>22 MR DUNCAN: Right. Now, I'm going to ask you to look, 23 please, at another document that the committee has 24 received from the Transport Department, this time very 25 recently. I'm not sure whether you will have seen this.</p>
Page 90	Page 92
<p>1 the bus, there may be cases of overcrowding, but then 2 for the further end of the bus, on many occasions nobody 3 is standing. So in certain parts of the bus, there may 4 be overcrowding, but then it's an impression only. As 5 to whether there is an excess of the carrying capacity, 6 it is something objective. We don't have such 7 information, that is whether and how many buses have got 8 passengers exceeding the carrying capacity. We don't 9 have this sort of figures.</p> <p>10 MR DUNCAN: I would like to refer you, please, to another of 11 the submissions that the committee has received, by 12 taking you to MISC-1, at page 124-1.</p> <p>13 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes. We have already read that.</p> <p>14 MR DUNCAN: You've read this letter from the Hong Kong 15 Police Force dated 7 May 2018?</p> <p>16 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, we have read it.</p> <p>17 MR DUNCAN: Have you read paragraph 5 on the second page?</p> <p>18 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, we did.</p> <p>19 MR DUNCAN: In that particular paragraph, the writer has 20 referred to five main causation factors. Do you see 21 that?</p> <p>22 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes.</p> <p>23 MR DUNCAN: Can I ask you this: does the company receive 24 from time to time reports of this nature from the 25 police?</p>	<p>1 We can locate it at TD-5/1649. This, I believe, is 2 a communication to the committee received just a couple 3 of days ago, headed, "Road safety management system", 4 and the purpose of which is described, it is to outline 5 "the road safety management system currently adopted by 6 the government".</p> <p>7 Have you or your colleagues been able to read this 8 document?</p> <p>9 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: No, sir.</p> <p>10 MR DUNCAN: Right.</p> <p>11 If I could then take you slowly to just a couple of 12 aspects of the document, please.</p> <p>13 Could I bring your attention first of all to the 14 first page, page 1649, and paragraph 4 of that page, 15 commencing with, "Apart from the follow-up actions by 16 the TD". Could you just read that to yourself.</p> <p>17 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: I've done so.</p> <p>18 MR DUNCAN: It refers to a sample of the quarterly traffic 19 accident situation report, submitted by the Transport 20 Department to the Road Safety Council, a sample of which 21 is at attachment I.</p> <p>22 In that respect, could I ask you to go to page 1658 23 of the document, please, of the bundle, 1658. Do you 24 see at 1658 the heading, "Traffic accident situation 25 report for Road Safety Council meeting on 7 March 2018"?</p>

Page 93	Page 95
<p>1 Do you see that?</p> <p>2 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes.</p> <p>3 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. Then if you look at the next page,</p> <p>4 1659, you see appendix I with a heading, "Summary of</p> <p>5 traffic accidents status in 2017".</p> <p>6 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, sir.</p> <p>7 MR DUNCAN: If you go down that page, you get to "Appendix 3</p> <p>8 franchised bus involvements", still at 1659.</p> <p>9 "Appendix 3 franchised bus involvements"; do you see</p> <p>10 that paragraph?</p> <p>11 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Not yet, sir.</p> <p>12 MR DUNCAN: Do you see it now?</p> <p>13 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes.</p> <p>14 MR DUNCAN: "Appendix 3 ...</p> <p>15 For franchised bus involvements in Q4 2017, Kowloon</p> <p>16 Motor Bus, Long Win Bus, New Lantao Bus and Citybus</p> <p>17 (franchise 2) recorded increases while New World First</p> <p>18 Bus and Citybus (franchise 1) recorded decreases over</p> <p>19 Q4 2016."</p> <p>20 If I could then take you to appendix 3 which has</p> <p>21 been referenced there, which you will find at 1664 of</p> <p>22 the bundle. Do you see the heading "Appendix 3" and</p> <p>23 "Franchised bus involvements"?</p> <p>24 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, sir.</p> <p>25 MR DUNCAN: And then a box for each of the franchisees?</p>	<p>1 difference? That's because the networks that they serve</p> <p>2 are different.</p> <p>3 Citybus 2, most of the buses are running on highways</p> <p>4 and the mileage is pretty high for them. Also, they</p> <p>5 don't serve much in busy road sections. So we feel that</p> <p>6 we cannot simply make the comparison like this in</p> <p>7 relation to the accident rate per million kilometres.</p> <p>8 We cannot simply make a comparison like that.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: This is a point you have made in one of your</p> <p>10 submissions, is it not, apples with apples?</p> <p>11 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Correct, sir.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Can you give us the reference where this point is</p> <p>13 made? Or perhaps you can come back to it in due course.</p> <p>14 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Sorry, Mr Chairman, we haven't got this</p> <p>15 in the submission, we didn't say this in the submission,</p> <p>16 but in the five-year forward plan, in 5.1, in the</p> <p>17 introduction, we have made this point.</p> <p>18 MR DUNCAN: It will be at page TD-1/195.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: Yes:</p> <p>20 "The significant difference in accident statistics</p> <p>21 of Citybus [franchise 1 and franchise 2] is a good</p> <p>22 demonstration of the effect of network composition and</p> <p>23 operating areas of Citybus [franchise 1] and Citybus</p> <p>24 [franchise 2] are both operated by Citybus.</p> <p>25 What are the highways on which Citybus franchise 2</p>
Page 94	Page 96
<p>1 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, sir.</p> <p>2 MR DUNCAN: One of the ways in which the Transport</p> <p>3 Department measures road safety is the involvement rate,</p> <p>4 as they refer to it, per million of vehicle-kilometres.</p> <p>5 Are you aware of that?</p> <p>6 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, I do.</p> <p>7 MR DUNCAN: If you look at the first entry, Kowloon Motor</p> <p>8 Bus, and if we look at the last two entries, the fourth</p> <p>9 quarter of 2016 and the fourth quarter of 2017, you will</p> <p>10 see the involvement rates at 2.979 and 4.005</p> <p>11 respectively. Do you see those entries?</p> <p>12 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, I do.</p> <p>13 MR DUNCAN: If you look then through the rest of it, do you</p> <p>14 see that the figures for New World First Bus and Citybus</p> <p>15 franchise 1 seem to be amongst the highest with regard</p> <p>16 to the involvement rate per million vehicle-kilometres.</p> <p>17 Can you detect that from reading through the document?</p> <p>18 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, sir.</p> <p>19 MR DUNCAN: Does that come as any surprise to you?</p> <p>20 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: No, sir. Well, because for each</p> <p>21 franchise, the network is different, and the traffic</p> <p>22 situations that they serve also varies. Citybus, for</p> <p>23 instance, Citybus franchise 1 and Citybus franchise 2,</p> <p>24 the accident rates differ vastly. These are the two</p> <p>25 franchises managed by the same company. Why the vast</p>	<p>1 operate mostly?</p> <p>2 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Mainly North Lantau Highway and also West</p> <p>3 Kowloon Corridor.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>5 MR DUNCAN: There is one other point I wish to explore with</p> <p>6 you or raise with you, Mr Cheng, before I leave this</p> <p>7 Transport Department document recently received.</p> <p>8 Could you look at page 1650. So it's TD-5/1650.</p> <p>9 This morning, the chairman raised the matter of</p> <p>10 black boxes on public light buses, and I would just like</p> <p>11 you, please, to read through paragraph 7 on that page,</p> <p>12 page 1650.</p> <p>13 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I've done it, sir.</p> <p>14 MR DUNCAN: Thank you.</p> <p>15 The chairman also referred to the fact that,</p> <p>16 according to his understanding, there were provisions</p> <p>17 applicable to public light buses which had an over speed</p> <p>18 threshold of three seconds as opposed to the 10 seconds</p> <p>19 we were discussing this morning. Do you remember his</p> <p>20 raising that with you?</p> <p>21 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I do, sir.</p> <p>22 MR DUNCAN: I'm just going to tender for the record</p> <p>23 schedule 19 to the Road Traffic (Construction and</p> <p>24 Maintenance of Vehicles) Regulations. I think that's on</p> <p>25 the system now.</p>

Page 97	Page 99
<p>1 If one was to look at paragraph 3 of the schedule, 2 you will see there a requirement with regard to the 3 capability of an EDRD, or black box, with regard to its 4 installation in a public light bus. And in 5 paragraph 3(d) there's reference to "records of vehicle 6 activity when the actual speed of the vehicle exceeds 7 an over speed threshold stored in the EDRD for 8 a continuous period of more than three seconds". 9 I simply bring that to your attention because of the 10 chairman's comment this morning. 11 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I've read it. 12 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. 13 Let us go now back to the forward planning programme 14 and the bus safety report. So it's TD-1 at page 200. 15 At 5.11 -- and of course this was written before the 16 working group was set up -- 11 there is a heading, 17 "Measures and programmes planned to enhance safety". We 18 can see on that page, 200, going right through to 19 page 201, a number of measures that have been 20 identified. 21 Just one matter I would like to raise with you in 22 (iv) on page 201, please. The fourth-last line: 23 "Harsh braking reports generated whenever 24 deceleration is beyond threshold are used to identify 25 drivers with harsh braking habit. Remedial training or</p>	<p>1 before. If they have a poor driving attitude, if they 2 are not having a high standard of driving safety, then 3 there will be different degrees of disciplinary action. 4 CHAIRMAN: I think the real question perhaps is this, 5 Mr Cheng. At one stage you had a stick and a carrot, 6 and now you have given up the carrot. Is that the 7 situation? 8 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes. Correct. 9 MR DUNCAN: We can leave the forward planning report now, 10 please, and go back to your submission, which is -- the 11 entry I wish to take up is at CTB-1, pages 27 to 28. 12 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I see it. 13 MR DUNCAN: At page 27, we have a heading provided by the 14 company, "Maintenance and inspection", and that runs 15 through to most of page 28. 16 The pre-service check, item (d), which is 17 a requirement on the bus captain, is the bus captain 18 required to keep a written record of this check? 19 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: No. 20 MR DUNCAN: To what extent have maintenance matters 21 contributed to bus accidents involving company buses 22 over the last few years? 23 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I would like to defer to Mr Li. 24 MR PAUL LI: I haven't got the figures with me. I believe 25 it is quite unlikely and there are just very, very few</p>
Page 98	Page 100
<p>1 disciplinary action will be taken to rectify the 2 misbehaviours." 3 How are these harsh braking reports generated? 4 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I would like to defer to Mr Chung. 5 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes. If we receive a complaint from 6 a passenger saying that the bus driver has had harsh 7 braking, then we will get hold of the data, to find out 8 whether he does have such a habit of harsh braking. If 9 it is established, then we would take follow-up action. 10 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. So no complaint, no report; is that 11 the situation? 12 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Correct. 13 MR DUNCAN: Then page 202, 5.12, in the middle of that 14 paragraph we have this entry: 15 "Proper and fair disciplinary procedure and reward 16 mechanism are in place to deter bad driving behaviour 17 and to encourage good driving attitude." 18 Do you see that reference? 19 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Not yet. Now I see it. 20 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. 21 Now, post-reclassification of the safety bonus, the 22 attendance bonus, the performance bonus, what reward 23 mechanism is now in place to deter bad driving behaviour 24 and to encourage good driving attitude? 25 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I think I have answered this question</p>	<p>1 cases. 2 MR DUNCAN: The very, very few cases have revealed what? 3 What sort of problems? 4 MR PAUL LI: As far as I can recall, some parts have been 5 broken, causing damages to the bus, but it was minor. 6 MR DUNCAN: Are there written reports made of these sorts of 7 incidents? 8 MR PAUL LI: Yes, there are. 9 MR DUNCAN: I wonder if you could provide the committee with 10 samples of reports which have led to any sort of 11 incidents, say in the past two years. Would that be 12 possible? 13 MR PAUL LI: Yes, we will go back to check. 14 CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 15 Mr Duncan, is this not a matter that has been 16 addressed in the LegCo papers dealing with the renewal 17 of the franchise, where the overall record of the 18 company, for example Citybus, was examined, and the 19 success of their maintenance programme described? 20 MR DUNCAN: I think that is right, Mr Chairman. We'll try 21 and find the reference to that. We'll try and locate 22 that. 23 Just moving away from that topic, could I ask you 24 this, Mr Cheng. In the context of safety, are there any 25 matters where you would consider that the government</p>

Page 101	Page 103
<p>1 could assist your company materially, in a way in which</p> <p>2 it doesn't assist the company at the moment? We</p> <p>3 understand that primarily safety is a matter for the bus</p> <p>4 companies, but is there anything which occurs to you</p> <p>5 whereby you could be assisted by the government in your</p> <p>6 endeavours?</p> <p>7 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Mr Chairman, as far as we are concerned,</p> <p>8 anything to enhance safety would involve expenditure.</p> <p>9 It will cost money. In future, should there be</p> <p>10 requirements incurring a vast amount of money on our</p> <p>11 part, to install certain devices so as to enhance the</p> <p>12 safety standards of our service, I do hope that the</p> <p>13 government will provide some financial support to us.</p> <p>14 Thank you.</p> <p>15 MR DUNCAN: Can you point to anything specific which you</p> <p>16 would regard as beyond your financial capabilities at</p> <p>17 the moment, but which, if it could be could funded,</p> <p>18 would add materially to the matter of safety? Is there</p> <p>19 any specific matter?</p> <p>20 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I cannot give any examples which will</p> <p>21 substantially enhance the safety. Rather, there are</p> <p>22 certain things which the public would think that, when</p> <p>23 done, the safety would be enhanced.</p> <p>24 I can give examples. Say, for example, this</p> <p>25 morning, you explored the idea of retrofitting safety</p>	<p>1 government will provide a subsidy so that we can install</p> <p>2 the seat belts.</p> <p>3 So this is one of the examples. Thank you.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: So your point really is this: if the government</p> <p>5 thinks that it's worthwhile doing because it gives</p> <p>6 passengers who might want to put a seat belt on the</p> <p>7 opportunity to do so, but it's your experience that if</p> <p>8 they don't do so, then it's up to government to fund</p> <p>9 this, rather than impose it on your own? Is that the</p> <p>10 point?</p> <p>11 MR SAMUEL CHENG: If the government sees the need for seat</p> <p>12 belts, in order for the passengers to put on the seat</p> <p>13 belts if they want to, if that's the case then I hope</p> <p>14 the government would fund the exercise because if we</p> <p>15 fund it, it would be a waste of resources.</p> <p>16 Sorry, if I may, Mr Chairman, most importantly, if</p> <p>17 you think of the situation in Hong Kong, we do have</p> <p>18 standing capacity. If you feel that it is not safe</p> <p>19 enough to sit down and you need the seat belt, what</p> <p>20 about those who are standing up? They don't have a seat</p> <p>21 belt. For the standees, I think it's a bit of a</p> <p>22 contradiction.</p> <p>23 Thank you.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: I think your other point was -- I will leave that</p> <p>25 point.</p>
Page 102	Page 104
<p>1 seat belts for the upper deck. This morning, Mr Li</p> <p>2 talked about the cost. It will be 15,000 to</p> <p>3 20,000 pounds per bus, and we have got 1,100 buses</p> <p>4 falling into this category. If they all have to be</p> <p>5 retrofitted with safety belts on the upper deck, the</p> <p>6 total cost, as we have given, will be HK\$180 million to</p> <p>7 HK\$240 million.</p> <p>8 The two companies are registering a very low level</p> <p>9 of profits. We don't know how many years we have to</p> <p>10 operate before we can earn that amount of money so as to</p> <p>11 retrofit the safety belts. So this is one of the</p> <p>12 examples that our financial capability cannot afford.</p> <p>13 So, for such kinds of expenditure, I believe we have</p> <p>14 to be very cautious, and find out whether it can really</p> <p>15 very effectively achieve the purpose.</p> <p>16 This morning, we have said that currently there are</p> <p>17 certain exposed seats on board and they have been fitted</p> <p>18 with seat belts, but then in fact I ride on the buses</p> <p>19 many times. I seldom see passengers occupying such</p> <p>20 seats put on the seat belts. In future, if you ask our</p> <p>21 company to spend \$100 million to \$200 million, or more</p> <p>22 than \$200 million to work on this, while we query very</p> <p>23 much the effectiveness, of course, if the administration</p> <p>24 would like to impose such a requirement, that is to</p> <p>25 retrofit the seat belts, then I very much hope that the</p>	<p>1 Yes, Mr Duncan.</p> <p>2 MR DUNCAN: Thank you, Chairman.</p> <p>3 Can I refer you to page 40 of your submission. So</p> <p>4 that will be CTB-1 at page 40 of the bundle.</p> <p>5 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, sir.</p> <p>6 MR DUNCAN: You should be looking at a page which has the</p> <p>7 heading in the middle, "Other relevant information". Do</p> <p>8 you have that?</p> <p>9 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, sir.</p> <p>10 MR DUNCAN: You have said:</p> <p>11 "To assist the committee in understanding the</p> <p>12 franchised bus industry, we also wish to take this</p> <p>13 opportunity to explain our operating environment and</p> <p>14 challenges we have encountered in providing franchised</p> <p>15 bus services".</p> <p>16 And you have set out there a number of issues. Can</p> <p>17 I just bring your attention to item (b), "Route</p> <p>18 rationalisation". You have said at the end of that</p> <p>19 paragraph that what has happened has led to a waste of</p> <p>20 money and resources at your end.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Might I invite you to read out the short</p> <p>22 paragraph?</p> <p>23 MR DUNCAN: Certainly. I quote:</p> <p>24 "To tackle the competition posed by the railway, we</p> <p>25 proposed route rationalisation plans to the [Transport</p>

Page 105	Page 107
<p>1 Department] to scale down or cancel low demand services. 2 Due to the objection of district councils, a number of 3 our route rationalisation plans could not be computed to 4 match the decrease in passengers demand. This has led 5 to a waste of money and resources on our end." 6 Could you just appraise the committee of the system 7 that operates, first of all with regard to the routes 8 you are required to support, and then the system, if you 9 wish to change a route? 10 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I defer to Mr Chung, if I may. 11 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Thank you, Mr Chairman. 12 If a railway line is coming on stream, we will make 13 proposals to the Transport Department. If there are 14 routes that are overlapping with the rail alignment, 15 then we would propose a cancellation of these routes or, 16 alternatively, scale back the frequency of these routes 17 or have diversion. 18 With the proposals being put in, then we have to 19 submit the route rationalisation plans to the district 20 councils for discussion. Normally, the councillors 21 would have a lot of comments and they would raise a lot 22 of objections. These bus routes have been around for 23 some considerable time, and many of the residents have 24 been using these routes. With the railway coming on 25 stream, some passengers will be lost to the railway and</p>	<p>1 MR DUNCAN: You don't have any right of appeal to any 2 further authority with respect to that sort of matter? 3 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: No. We never tried. 4 CHAIRMAN: Is there an avenue of appeal? 5 MR SAMUEL CHENG: We don't realise there is such a channel. 6 MR DUNCAN: Do you have any -- have you ever considered -- 7 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I would like to correct this. It's we 8 don't aware of such a channel, not realised, we don't 9 aware of. 10 CHAIRMAN: Is there not an appeal to the Secretary of 11 Transport and Housing, or am I thinking of another 12 provision? 13 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I defer to Mr Chung. He is more familiar 14 with this. 15 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: According to Cap 230, PBSO, if there is 16 dispute over the rationalisation plan, then the THB 17 would be the authority for settlement, but we never 18 tried this. 19 CHAIRMAN: But specifically the Secretary for Transport and 20 Housing? 21 Don't worry. We can check that. But that's the 22 provision I have in mind. 23 MR DUNCAN: Moving from the route rationalisation to another 24 matter you have raised, the fare adjustment arrangement, 25 item (f) on page 41.</p>
Page 106	Page 108
<p>1 we are running short of patronage, although there will 2 still be passengers using them. Still, the councillors 3 would object to the cancellation or the scale-back of 4 the services. 5 If the objection is particularly strong, the 6 Transport Department may not necessarily approve the 7 plan. 8 Thank you, Chairman. 9 CHAIRMAN: Is the MTR link to Ocean Park or Wong Chuk Hang 10 an example of how a railway system arriving affects 11 passenger usage on buses, just as an example? 12 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, sir. Yes, indeed. 13 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Mr Chairman, if I may, the impact was 14 significant because prior to the railway coming on 15 stream, we had a route, that's the 629, bus 629, running 16 between Admiralty and Ocean Park. At that time, if 17 anybody wants to go to Ocean Park by public transport, 18 they will be using this particular route. 19 Ever since the MTR line has come on stream, we had 20 to cancel the route altogether because we have lost all 21 the passengers to MTR. 22 Thank you. 23 MR DUNCAN: So the Transport Department has the final say; 24 is that the position? 25 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Indeed, sir.</p>	<p>1 Perhaps I could read quickly through this before 2 I ask you a couple of matters: 3 "The approval of franchised bus fare adjustment 4 applications is governed by the fare adjustment 5 arrangement ('FAA'). Under the FAA, there is a basket 6 of factors that the government would consider. Public 7 acceptability and affordability is one of the factors. 8 In our view, this factor is highly discretionary and 9 subjective and has been conveniently abused by 10 politicians. 11 We had our last fare adjustment in 2008. Since 12 then, we have not applied for any fare adjustment until 13 August 2017 when [Citybus, the first franchise, and New 14 World First Bus] submitted applications for fare 15 adjustments to mitigate the substantial revenue loss due 16 to railways competition in recent years and cost 17 increases over the last 10 years. As mentioned in (c) 18 above, the cumulative inflation rate in Hong Kong over 19 this ... period was 31.2 per cent and we have awarded 20 a cumulative increase in wages of 39.9 per cent. 21 Although we were fully justified to seek fare 22 adjustments under the FAA on various occasions, no 23 application had been made mainly due to the 24 ineffectiveness of the FAA and the highly politicised 25 environment against fare/price increases of public</p>

Page 109	Page 111
<p>1 utilities.</p> <p>2 In addition to the difficulty in obtaining a fair</p> <p>3 deal in FAA applications, the fare adjustment approval</p> <p>4 process has been excessively long. By way of example,</p> <p>5 our current fare adjustment applications submitted in</p> <p>6 August 2017 are still being scrutinised by the</p> <p>7 government.</p> <p>8 Unlike the MTR, which has automatic fare adjustment</p> <p>9 made annually in accordance with a prescribed formula,</p> <p>10 franchised bus companies do not have the same certainty</p> <p>11 in fare adjustments. Without such certainty, it is</p> <p>12 difficult for franchised bus companies to formulate</p> <p>13 comprehensive future plans."</p> <p>14 You have identified in those paragraphs a number of</p> <p>15 matters which can perhaps be summed up by your phrase</p> <p>16 "the ineffectiveness of the FAA". Have you --</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN: Before you embark on any questioning, Mr Duncan,</p> <p>18 do we have that document available, the fare adjustment</p> <p>19 arrangement?</p> <p>20 MR DUNCAN: I think we do.</p> <p>21 Mr Chairman, if we are able to turn up SEC/373.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: SEC-1 at page 373?</p> <p>23 MR DUNCAN: Yes.</p> <p>24 This is an example of one of the fare increase</p> <p>25 applications --</p>	<p>1 CTB (F1), all the Hong Kong Island routes were not</p> <p>2 allowed to increase their fare levels. In fact, the</p> <p>3 last time we increased the fares for the Hong Kong</p> <p>4 Island routes, it was 1998. That's because in 2008 our</p> <p>5 application was rejected. And we didn't know the</p> <p>6 reason.</p> <p>7 So, for this FAA, I believe that the transparency</p> <p>8 has to be enhanced.</p> <p>9 Thank you.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: Are you saying that you simply get the result</p> <p>11 without any reasoned decision?</p> <p>12 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Correct.</p> <p>13 MR DUNCAN: Just for the record, Mr Chairman, there is</p> <p>14 another reference to the fare adjustment arrangement at</p> <p>15 THB-2 at 23, a fuller description.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>17 MR DUNCAN: So, Mr Cheng, when did this arrangement come</p> <p>18 into existence?</p> <p>19 MR SAMUEL CHENG: It was 2005 or 2006, round about that</p> <p>20 time. I think 2006.</p> <p>21 MR DUNCAN: As far as you are aware, have there been any</p> <p>22 changes made to the adjustment mechanisms since that</p> <p>23 time?</p> <p>24 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, there were some changes, but I'm</p> <p>25 afraid I cannot state the specific changes. But at</p>
Page 110	Page 112
<p>1 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>2 MR DUNCAN: -- and its treatment.</p> <p>3 Back to you, Mr Cheng, if I could. Given your</p> <p>4 description of the FAA being ineffective, the process,</p> <p>5 have you made any overtures to anybody with regard to</p> <p>6 changing what you see as an ineffective system?</p> <p>7 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, we did. Last time, when the FAA was</p> <p>8 reviewed -- allow me to paraphrase it. Every time when</p> <p>9 the government reviews the FAA, we point out that the</p> <p>10 FAA has certain inadequacies and it is not transparent</p> <p>11 enough, in the eyes of the bus operators.</p> <p>12 Thank you.</p> <p>13 MR DUNCAN: How long has that situation existed?</p> <p>14 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Ever since the FAA came into existence, so</p> <p>15 far we have only applied for one fare increase, and that</p> <p>16 was in 2008. On that occasion, for Citybus (F1), it was</p> <p>17 only for the jointly operated cross-harbour routes were</p> <p>18 allowed to put up the fares. For the Hong Kong Island</p> <p>19 routes, we were not allowed to increase the fare levels.</p> <p>20 As to the rationale, and then as to the financial</p> <p>21 forecast data submitted by us to the government, whether</p> <p>22 the government has taken on board all our financial</p> <p>23 projection data or which part of our data was not</p> <p>24 acceptable, nothing was said to us.</p> <p>25 At the end of the day, all we knew was that for</p>	<p>1 least I can remember that originally it was not called</p> <p>2 FAA. It was not called -- it was at first called fare</p> <p>3 adjustment mechanism. Later on, the name was changed,</p> <p>4 together with other changes, and it is now called FAA.</p> <p>5 As to the specific changes, I'm afraid offhand</p> <p>6 I don't have the information for you.</p> <p>7 MR DUNCAN: I'm sorry, did you say in 2008 you made</p> <p>8 an application which was unsuccessful?</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Well, it was successful for the harbour route but</p> <p>10 nothing else.</p> <p>11 MR SAMUEL CHENG: In year 2008, for CTB (F1) and New World</p> <p>12 First Bus, there was an application for fare increase</p> <p>13 from both. The result was, for New World First Bus, the</p> <p>14 fare increases were approved. But then for CTB, for our</p> <p>15 Hong Kong Island routes, we were not allowed to increase</p> <p>16 the fares. For the harbour routes, when they were</p> <p>17 jointly operated with KMB, since KMB was given approval</p> <p>18 to increase the fares, and as a result we were also</p> <p>19 allowed to increase the fares. But of course most of</p> <p>20 our operations are on Hong Kong Island, and for those we</p> <p>21 were not allowed to increase the fares.</p> <p>22 MR DUNCAN: Were you given any reasons at all as to why that</p> <p>23 application was rejected?</p> <p>24 MR SAMUEL CHENG: No, no specific reasons were given.</p> <p>25 MR DUNCAN: Well, any reasons? Did you receive anything in</p>

Page 113	Page 115
<p>1 writing, beyond the fact that it had been unsuccessful?</p> <p>2 MR SAMUEL CHENG: No.</p> <p>3 MR DUNCAN: Since we are moving to the MISC bundle, can</p> <p>4 I raise another matter with you.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN: Are you moving on to another matter?</p> <p>6 MR DUNCAN: Yes.</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: Before you do so -- at page 42 of your first</p> <p>8 submissions, paragraph (g), "Reasonable return", the</p> <p>9 last three lines say this:</p> <p>10 "We are given to understand that the government is</p> <p>11 in the course of reviewing the FAA, and we earnestly</p> <p>12 hope that the above-mentioned issues can be addressed in</p> <p>13 the review."</p> <p>14 Perhaps, Mr Duncan, I can invite you to read out the</p> <p>15 whole of that paragraph as being relevant to the</p> <p>16 conclusion.</p> <p>17 MR DUNCAN: "Due to the difficulties regarding fare</p> <p>18 adjustment as described above, the chance of being</p> <p>19 awarded a fare adjustment and the increase rate are full</p> <p>20 of uncertainties. We forecast that the return on</p> <p>21 [average net fixed assets of CTB franchise 1 and New</p> <p>22 World First Bus] will be below 1 per cent for the</p> <p>23 financial year ending 30 June 2018. This is taken into</p> <p>24 account that the status quo can be maintained in regard</p> <p>25 to our overall expenditure. Should there be any</p>	<p>1 that".</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN: As a result of meetings?</p> <p>3 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Correct.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: When were the meetings?</p> <p>5 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I have to go back to check the meeting</p> <p>6 date.</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: Were they this year or last year?</p> <p>8 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Last year.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN: Nothing this year?</p> <p>10 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I don't recall having any more meetings</p> <p>11 this year, but I really have to go back to check my</p> <p>12 diary.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: Please do so, if you would be kind enough, and</p> <p>14 inform us what the position is, as to whether there were</p> <p>15 meetings this year, on this subject.</p> <p>16 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes. Certainly, I will do that.</p> <p>17 MEMBER LO: Can I ask a question? The question, is it about</p> <p>18 the FAA or it's about the formula? According to the</p> <p>19 formula, have you calculated how much fare increase you</p> <p>20 could ask for or request?</p> <p>21 MR SAMUEL CHENG: The FAA itself.</p> <p>22 MEMBER LO: But there's a formula you can apply?</p> <p>23 MR SAMUEL CHENG: We don't have an automatic mechanism.</p> <p>24 According to the FAA, we may submit an application, and</p> <p>25 after that there will be a process, a series of</p>
Page 114	Page 116
<p>1 significant increase in staff and fuel costs, both of</p> <p>2 these franchises may well become loss making.</p> <p>3 Therefore, let alone earning a reasonable return, when</p> <p>4 the companies' commercial viability is at stake, it will</p> <p>5 be impossible for our companies to continue to provide</p> <p>6 the high quality and efficient services expected by the</p> <p>7 public, and to offer attractive pay packages to recruit</p> <p>8 and retain staff. We are given to understand that the</p> <p>9 government is in the course of reviewing the FAA, and we</p> <p>10 earnestly hope that the above-mentioned issues can be</p> <p>11 addressed in the review."</p> <p>12 Do you maintain those sentiments today, Mr Cheng?</p> <p>13 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I maintain this view.</p> <p>14 MR DUNCAN: Your information that the government is in the</p> <p>15 course of reviewing the FAA, on what basis have you</p> <p>16 formed that understanding?</p> <p>17 MR SAMUEL CHENG: We have had meetings with the government.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: Specifically with whom in the government?</p> <p>19 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Transport and Housing Bureau.</p> <p>20 CHAIRMAN: When were those meetings which led to this</p> <p>21 understanding?</p> <p>22 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Let me say this. I say "we are given to</p> <p>23 understand", and so on and so forth. I think I have</p> <p>24 made it rather indirect. Allow me to rephrase this</p> <p>25 sentence. I should say, "We understand" or "We know</p>	<p>1 examination and approval. Ours is different from that</p> <p>2 of the MTR.</p> <p>3 MEMBER LO: So is it about the procedure or is it about what</p> <p>4 is the change that you request for reviewing the FAA?</p> <p>5 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Well, to us, if we have more certainties</p> <p>6 about the fare adjustment, and if the transparency is</p> <p>7 enhanced, then at least it will be better. I hope at</p> <p>8 least in those two areas there will be improvements.</p> <p>9 MR DUNCAN: Mr Chairman, just for the record, I referred to</p> <p>10 the fact that the fare adjustment arrangement had been</p> <p>11 the subject of one of the THB documents, THB-2/23.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Yes.</p> <p>13 MR DUNCAN: The matter of the review of the FAA is a matter</p> <p>14 which the bureau has also addressed at the ensuing</p> <p>15 pages, THB-2, pages 24 and 25, for the record.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN: Perhaps we ought to turn to that, since it's the</p> <p>17 subject matter of this evidence.</p> <p>18 MR DUNCAN: Certainly.</p> <p>19 Just before we do that, Mr Cheng, do I understand</p> <p>20 correctly from your evidence that you had discussions</p> <p>21 about a change in the FAA, but you have not yet been</p> <p>22 informed by the government as to the outcome of those</p> <p>23 discussions? Is that the position?</p> <p>24 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes. The review is with the government</p> <p>25 It's in the government's court.</p>

Page 117	Page 119
<p>1 MR DUNCAN: And you don't know what the outcome of that 2 review is at the present time?</p> <p>3 MR SAMUEL CHENG: At the moment, we don't know. We don't 4 MR DUNCAN: So can we have on the screen, please, THB-2, 5 pages 24 and 25. We want bundle page 24. Yes. 6 I will read through, if you can follow me. Perhaps 7 if we go back to the previous page, just to get the full 8 flavour, page 23 of the bundle. Do you see item (d) on 9 that page, "Fare adjustment arrangement", and then 10 a subheading, "Current arrangement"?</p> <p>11 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, sir.</p> <p>12 MR DUNCAN: Then if I could pick it up at the following 13 page, bundle page 24, paragraph 4.28: 14 "The aforesaid existing arrangement was put in place 15 in 2006 after consultation with the LegCo. The 16 arrangement was subsequently fine-tuned having regard to 17 the outcome of the review in 2009. As the existing 18 arrangement can basically strike a balance between the 19 sound operation of bus service as well as public 20 affordability and acceptability, there is no need for 21 an overhaul of the FAA. 22 In this regard, the government has conducted 23 a review of the FAA. The initial findings indicate that 24 the arrangement should be kept intact, while the data 25 could be updated on two fronts:</p>	<p>1 arrangement should be kept intact but with the data 2 being updated on two fronts, as it's suggested in 3 paragraph 4.29. Has the government informed you of 4 that?</p> <p>5 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, at the meeting, yes. But as to the 6 updating of the data on two fronts, what new figures 7 would there be, we are not sure. We don't know. For 8 these two figures, they are terribly important.</p> <p>9 MR DUNCAN: And you are still awaiting details with regard 10 to those figures; is that the position?</p> <p>11 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, sir.</p> <p>12 MR DUNCAN: Thank you. I'm going to leave the fare 13 adjustment arrangement now and go to MISC-2. 14 Could I bring to your attention again a document we 15 saw yesterday at page 643 of the bundle, with the 16 translation at 644-1. 17 If we could pull up the Chinese document, please, at 18 page 643. Thank you. 19 Do you recall my referring this submission to you 20 yesterday from the Democratic Alliance?</p> <p>21 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I do.</p> <p>22 MR DUNCAN: That was in the context of the salary of 23 franchised bus captains. Today, I want to bring to your 24 attention a matter which they have brought to the 25 attention of the committee. That appears in the third</p>
Page 118	Page 120
<p>1 (a) Productivity gain value ... 2 (b) Passenger reward arrangement". 3 Unless the chairman wishes me to go to that, I will 4 leave out the detail of that, but then move to 5 item 4.30: 6 "The government has initiated discussion with the 7 franchised bus companies on the initial review outcome 8 and the details of the above two data updates. We will 9 announce the discussion outcome and expect to implement 10 them in the first half of 2018 upon approval by the 11 Chief Executive-in-Council." 12 Now, according to that statement, Mr Cheng, the 13 government has initiated discussions with the bus 14 companies, obviously including yours, on the initial 15 review outcome and what they propose, namely that the 16 arrangement should be kept intact but with the data 17 being updated on two fronts. Have you in fact been 18 informed of the government's view with regard to those 19 matters?</p> <p>20 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, I am aware that the government is 21 conducting a review.</p> <p>22 MR DUNCAN: But has the government indicated to you their 23 findings --</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN: I think they are called "initial findings".</p> <p>25 MR DUNCAN: Yes, the initial findings that indicate that the</p>	<p>1 paragraph of the first page, beginning with the words: 2 "The industry actions of bus captains that took 3 place in February 2017 and 2018 aroused the concern of 4 different sectors of the community over problems such as 5 illegal parking at bus stops, bus captains' treatment 6 and working hours." 7 It goes on to say, "Below are reasons for illegal 8 parking at bus stops", and there are four items which 9 are mentioned. Do you see those?</p> <p>10 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, sir.</p> <p>11 MR DUNCAN: Then if you go to the second page of the 12 original document, page 644 of the bundle, and the 13 translation, the last paragraph on page 644-1: 14 "To eradicate illegal parking at bus stops, it must 15 be dealt with from its roots and by formulating suitable 16 policies, revising the outdated laws. The problem can 17 only be resolved by multipronged measures." 18 Then there's a paragraph: 19 "Suggestion 1: Following Singapore and installing 20 cameras on all bus fleets." 21 Before we go further into this, does the company 22 regard illegal parking at bus stops as a problem?</p> <p>23 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I defer to Mr Chung, if I may.</p> <p>24 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, sir.</p> <p>25 MR DUNCAN: Could you perhaps just describe the extent of</p>

Page 121	Page 123
<p>1 the problem?</p> <p>2 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: In many bus stops, there is illegal</p> <p>3 parking, and these vehicles are getting in the way of</p> <p>4 the buses, in a way that they cannot pull up close to</p> <p>5 the kerb for loading and unloading. There may be</p> <p>6 markings for the bus stop. Our buses require a certain</p> <p>7 distance to pull into the bay. If there is illegal</p> <p>8 parking on the front end or back end of the bay, it</p> <p>9 would be getting in the way of the bus operation, and</p> <p>10 sometimes the buses would have to pick up and set down</p> <p>11 passengers in the middle of the road. This is quite</p> <p>12 a commonplace and serious problem.</p> <p>13 MR DUNCAN: Does it cause safety concerns?</p> <p>14 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Indeed, yes.</p> <p>15 MR DUNCAN: In what way?</p> <p>16 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: For instance, illegal parking would</p> <p>17 reduce the width of the road when the buses drive past.</p> <p>18 Because of the large size of the bus, it's likely to get</p> <p>19 into problem, and if the passengers cannot get on and</p> <p>20 off on the kerbside, there is a likelihood of them being</p> <p>21 hit by vehicles or they may fall over.</p> <p>22 MR DUNCAN: If we go back to the letter -- sorry, before we</p> <p>23 go back to the letter, has the company endeavoured to</p> <p>24 overcome this problem?</p> <p>25 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: We notified the Transport Department</p>	<p>1 police can review the recording and in around two weeks'</p> <p>2 time the ticket will be sent to the car owner's home.</p> <p>3 Each penalty ticket costs nearly HK\$800, there is</p> <p>4 an additional charge of HK\$5,000 and imprisonment of 3</p> <p>5 months for late payment of penalty.</p> <p>6 For the first year, Singapore has recorded 2,112</p> <p>7 incidents of drivers driving into the bus lanes or bus</p> <p>8 stops to pick up and drop off customers. For 2014, the</p> <p>9 number of cases of driving into the bus lanes and</p> <p>10 illegal parking has already reduced to 886, it has</p> <p>11 successfully deterred most drivers not to stop at the</p> <p>12 bus stops."</p> <p>13 Is that a method which has any appeal to you?</p> <p>14 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Regarding this proposal, I have doubts</p> <p>15 about the credibility of such an arrangement. If</p> <p>16 I understand it correctly, what it means is that on</p> <p>17 board the bus, near to the bus driver's seat, there is</p> <p>18 a camera, so that when the bus approaches the bus stop,</p> <p>19 if it is found that there is somebody who has parked his</p> <p>20 vehicle there, then the bus driver would press a button</p> <p>21 and then there would be an automatic recording of a clip</p> <p>22 running for five to ten minutes. That's how</p> <p>23 I understand it.</p> <p>24 But then, first of all, in Hong Kong, when the bus</p> <p>25 driver reaches a bus stop, it is impossible for us to</p>
Page 122	Page 124
<p>1 about the black spots of illegal parking. We hope that</p> <p>2 these sections, they will have 24-hour restricted zone.</p> <p>3 We also notified the police to do enforcement work.</p> <p>4 MR DUNCAN: Has that eradicated the problem?</p> <p>5 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: It doesn't help much.</p> <p>6 MR DUNCAN: If we go back to --</p> <p>7 CHAIRMAN: Did it result in any action?</p> <p>8 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: The police would take action, but as soon</p> <p>9 as the police back is turned, then the illegal parking</p> <p>10 problem would recur. Say, for instance, in Causeway</p> <p>11 Bay, Yee Wo Street, near SOGO, outside SOGO, in fact,</p> <p>12 this is a problem that occurs very often. Earlier,</p> <p>13 a taxi driver got into a confrontation with a bus</p> <p>14 captain.</p> <p>15 MR DUNCAN: If we go back to the letter, there is then</p> <p>16 reference to a system which appears to exist in</p> <p>17 Singapore. I'm quoting from the letter to the</p> <p>18 committee:</p> <p>19 "Following Singapore and installing cameras on all</p> <p>20 bus fleets. Singapore has since 2008 installed cameras</p> <p>21 on buses and the cameras are installed next to the</p> <p>22 driver's seats. When drivers discover cars parking</p> <p>23 inside the bus stop, they can press the button and</p> <p>24 record a video of 5-10 minutes. The bus companies will</p> <p>25 then hand the recording to the police, thereafter the</p>	<p>1 stop there for five to ten minutes, not for our buses in</p> <p>2 Hong Kong. For the approach in Singapore, I think they</p> <p>3 have something similar to that in Hong Kong. I don't</p> <p>4 quite think that you will see a bus pulling up in a bus</p> <p>5 stop, it is found that there is illegal parking and then</p> <p>6 the bus doesn't pull up into the bus bay and then the</p> <p>7 camera is on for five to ten minutes. Well, I don't</p> <p>8 think this is going to be feasible, at least not in</p> <p>9 Hong Kong.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN: Five to ten seconds?</p> <p>11 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Here, in the Chinese version, it's five to</p> <p>12 ten minutes.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN: I'm asking you what you think about five to ten</p> <p>14 seconds.</p> <p>15 MR SAMUEL CHENG: It depends whether a bus can move further</p> <p>16 up and stop by the bus stop. If we don't and yet we</p> <p>17 just stop our bus there and then make a recording of</p> <p>18 that offending vehicle for five to ten seconds, I'm</p> <p>19 afraid this will cause delay to our passengers. It will</p> <p>20 also obstruct the traffic on the road.</p> <p>21 Thank you.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN: We saw from the demonstration at the Chai Wan</p> <p>23 depot that you have forward-looking cameras in buses,</p> <p>24 did we not?</p> <p>25 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, we do.</p>

Page 125	Page 127
<p>1 CHAIRMAN: We saw a lady for whom the bus driver waited and 2 opened the door again so she could board. 3 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes. 4 CHAIRMAN: That kind of camera could capture what is being 5 described, could it not? 6 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, it can capture images for one to 7 three seconds. However, if it is just for one to three 8 seconds, I'm not sure whether it is adequate to 9 establish a case and penalise the driver for having 10 stopped the vehicle at a bus bay. I'm not familiar with 11 the criteria on the part of the police to prosecute. 12 Will somebody be booked and issued a summons for just 13 stopping there for two seconds? I'm not sure. 14 CHAIRMAN: That's a matter for the prosecuting authorities, 15 but at least you would be providing them with evidence. 16 It's for them to judge whether it is sufficient. 17 MR SAMUEL CHENG: In that case, it means that our bus 18 captain has to be doing both at the same time. While 19 driving, he has to note down at what time and at which 20 bus stop somebody has parked illegally there, and then, 21 when he finishes work, he hands over such a logbook to 22 the company, and then the company tries to identify this 23 car and tries to download the video clip. In other 24 words, we have to go through a series of steps before 25 that can be done.</p>	<p>1 MR SAMUEL CHENG: This is very technical. I would like to 2 defer to Mr Chung. 3 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, we are aware of such a system, but 4 I don't think it is affordable by us. 5 CHAIRMAN: No, I'm suggesting that this is something that 6 might be considered by the Transport Department and the 7 police: A camera takes a photograph of the stationary 8 vehicle impeding the photograph; the computer matches 9 the vehicle registration owner; and the third step is to 10 issue a ticket by email. 11 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: We welcome such an idea. 12 CHAIRMAN: Mr Duncan. 13 MR DUNCAN: It's getting on a bit, but there is just one 14 other substantive matter that I want to raise with you, 15 Mr Cheng, if I could. 16 This arises from a document which we can find at 17 page 822 of SEC-2. Again, I'm not sure whether you have 18 seen this document. You will see from the screen that 19 it starts as an information note relating to franchised 20 bus services in Seoul and Singapore, and it is 21 apparently a production of the research office at the 22 Legislative Council Secretariat here in Hong Kong. 23 Have you seen this document at all? 24 MR SAMUEL CHENG: No, we haven't. 25 MR DUNCAN: I'm going to take you directly to page 826 of</p>
Page 126	Page 128
<p>1 I think, for this matter, it should be the police 2 that should be doing something about it, because if that 3 stretch of the road should be an urban clearway and 4 nobody should park there, then the police should enforce 5 the law. Our bus captains are already very busy while 6 driving. If you ask them to remember doing such, it 7 means adding to the burden of their work. 8 Thank you. 9 CHAIRMAN: Are you aware that the police suggested to 10 I think the Transport Department and LegCo that cameras 11 should be used, fixed, perhaps lamppost, cameras, to 12 record what you are describing, and that that should be 13 the source of the evidence? 14 MR SAMUEL CHENG: If we have cameras on lampposts, I think 15 it's a very good idea. I really hope that you won't be 16 involving the bus captains in this kind of work. 17 CHAIRMAN: Presumably, that would be a relatively simple 18 thing to do, because you would provide the police with 19 details of the bus stops that are black spots and they 20 would simply install a camera. 21 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I think that's feasible. 22 CHAIRMAN: Are you aware of vehicle number recognition 23 systems, so that a computer that takes a photograph, or 24 rather a camera that takes a photograph of a number 25 plate, can match it with the registered owner?</p>	<p>1 the bundle, and bring your attention to paragraph 2.11, 2 and the heading, "Implementation of the bus signal 3 priority system". Do you see that heading? 4 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes. 5 MR DUNCAN: If I can read the entry: 6 "The bus signal priority ('BSP') system, which has 7 been deployed in many cities around the world, is 8 a traffic signal enhancement strategy. The strategy 9 facilitates efficient movement of buses through 10 signalised intersections which allows an approaching bus 11 to have priority on using the limited intersection 12 capacity over other vehicles entering the intersection. 13 The Seoul Metropolitan Government has implemented the 14 BSP system to permit the optimisation of traffic signals 15 to speed up buses." 16 Are you aware of such systems in different cities 17 around the world? 18 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, we are aware of such a system in the 19 world. We are aware that in Singapore they do have 20 a similar system. 21 MR DUNCAN: Do you think this sort of system might have some 22 relevance as far as Hong Kong is concerned? 23 MR SAMUEL CHENG: We would welcome it very much. 24 MR DUNCAN: Have any steps been taken to have this 25 considered?</p>

Page 129	Page 131
<p>1 MR SAMUEL CHENG: All the time, we believe that it is what 2 the government should do.</p> <p>3 MR DUNCAN: Have you raised it with the government?</p> <p>4 MR SAMUEL CHENG: We haven't raised it with the government.</p> <p>5 MR DUNCAN: I think in some cities around the world, buses 6 are accorded general priority, are they not? If a bus 7 is pulling out of a bus stop, cars are required to make 8 way for the bus. Is that the situation in some 9 countries, some cities?</p> <p>10 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Let me defer to Mr Chung.</p> <p>11 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, indeed. We are aware, say for 12 example, that in Singapore, when a bus leaves the bus 13 bay, other vehicles have to give way.</p> <p>14 MR DUNCAN: Is that something which the company would regard 15 as a good thing?</p> <p>16 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Yes, we regard it as something which is 17 good. However, in Hong Kong, the road conditions may 18 not permit this. Say, for example, we have bus-only 19 lanes. In the past, as a result of complaints, some of 20 them have been cancelled.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Complaints by whom?</p> <p>22 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: Citizens, complaining that the bus lanes 23 were not put to optimal use, and as a result they have 24 to be scrapped.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN: Citizens who are car drivers?</p>	<p>1 direction or requirement of the Secretary for Transport 2 and Housing, or a public officer given directions under 3 section 3, or the Commissioner, or any person authorised 4 by him, under this Ordinance or its franchise may, 5 within 28 days of the giving or making of the decision, 6 direction or requirement, appeal by petition to the 7 Chief Executive-in-Council, and the decision of the 8 Chief Executive-in-Council on any such appeal shall be 9 final."</p> <p>10 Hitherto, have you been aware of that provision?</p> <p>11 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I am aware of that.</p> <p>12 MR DUNCAN: Has the company ever availed itself of its 13 rights under that?</p> <p>14 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Never, sir.</p> <p>15 MR DUNCAN: One other matter, just a reference, if I could, 16 with regard to the issue I raised as to whether 17 maintenance of facilities had contributed at all to 18 accidents.</p> <p>19 I just refer the committee to another of the 20 documents, TD-2 at page 183, which is the Brief of the 21 Legislative Council considering the new franchises and 22 the bus networks of Citybus Ltd, that's for Hong Kong 23 Island and the cross-harbour bus network, and the New 24 Lantao Bus Company.</p> <p>25 You will see, in the course of the assessment of the</p>
Page 130	Page 132
<p>1 MR WILLIAM CHUNG: I'm not sure, but then we were informed 2 by the Transport Department.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN: Presumably not citizens standing on a bus with 4 130 other passengers.</p> <p>5 MR DUNCAN: Just going back to the system in Seoul for the 6 moment, the bus signal priority system. Given your 7 response to my question, is that something that would be 8 worthy of your taking up with the Transport Department?</p> <p>9 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes, sir.</p> <p>10 MR DUNCAN: Do you have any plans to do that?</p> <p>11 MR SAMUEL CHENG: As a result of today's hearing, we have 12 been enlightened. We are going to do it.</p> <p>13 MR DUNCAN: Can I just bring to your attention a couple of 14 other matters that have come up during the course of the 15 questions this afternoon. First of all, may I bring to 16 your attention section 33(1) of the Public Bus Services 17 Ordinance, which reads as follows --</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN: Do we have that in the papers?</p> <p>19 MR DUNCAN: Yes. It will be in THB-2 at page 124, 20 Mr Chairman.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>22 MR DUNCAN: THB-2, page 124, section 33(1). You can 23 probably read that for yourself, Mr Cheng. It reads as 24 follows:</p> <p>25 "A grantee which is aggrieved by any decision,</p>	<p>1 applications, references to accidents, maintenance, and 2 so on, pages 183 and 184. That may be the provision 3 that the chairman had in mind.</p> <p>4 CHAIRMAN: Yes. Thank you.</p> <p>5 MR SAMUEL CHENG: I beg your pardon. You mentioned the 6 maintenance and repair. I can't see any mention of 7 maintenance and repair here.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN: I think what I had in mind was the inspections, 9 the random checks on buses, detected a very low rate of 10 defects, and that was the observation that was made.</p> <p>11 MR DUNCAN: By the Transport Department?</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN: Yes.</p> <p>13 MR DUNCAN: We will look for that, Mr Chairman, and find it 14 for the committee.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN: Thank you.</p> <p>16 MR DUNCAN: Mr Chairman, unless the committee has any 17 further matters that you wish me to explore, they are 18 the questions.</p> <p>19 CHAIRMAN: There is one matter, and I will raise the 20 question directly with you, Mr Cheng. It's simply this. 21 You have told us about a safety committee that was put 22 into being I think in April in the companies, to address 23 safety issues, of which you are the chair, and on which 24 some of your fellow representatives here today also sit.</p> <p>25 My question, first of all, is this. It's right, is it</p>

Page 133	Page 135
<p>1 not, that a director or perhaps two of your directors 2 are Transport Department employees? 3 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Yes. This safety committee is composed of 4 our senior management. We have not invited the 5 government officials to sit on this committee, because 6 if the company has issues to discuss with the Transport 7 Department, then it would be meeting between the company 8 and the Transport Department. It's not for us to invite 9 the Transport Department to sit on this safety 10 committee. 11 CHAIRMAN: So although they are directors of the company, 12 you specifically decided not to invite them because of, 13 what, a potential conflict? Is that it? 14 MR SAMUEL CHENG: No, it's not because of the conflict; 15 because the operation of our company is the 16 responsibility of the management. The Transport 17 Department has two officials sitting on the board, and 18 generally speaking, the operation is a matter for the 19 management of the company. We have non-executive 20 directors. They are not involved in operation of the 21 company. 22 CHAIRMAN: Thank you for your answer to that. Those are the 23 questions that counsel has to ask you and those are the 24 questions that we have. I understand that there is 25 a final short statement that you wish to make, and if</p>	<p>1 (4.55 pm) 2 (The hearing adjourned to a date to be fixed) 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25</p>
Page 134	Page 136
<p>1 that's so, please do so now. 2 Closing statement by MR SAMUEL CHENG 3 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Thank you, Chairman. 4 Mr Chairman, on behalf of New World First Bus and 5 Citybus, I would like to thank the following members 6 over the past two days: first, I thank the IRC for 7 inviting us to this hearing; Mr Duncan and his team has 8 raised questions to us and that allowed us the 9 opportunity to talk about the operation of the company; 10 third, I would like to thank the secretariat of the IRC 11 for the arrangement over the past fortnight; finally, 12 I would like to thank the simultaneous interpreters for 13 their service. 14 Thank you very much, Mr Chairman. Thank you, 15 members. 16 CHAIRMAN: Finally, then it remains for us to thank you for 17 your oral evidence and to remind you of the various 18 matters that you said that you would provide us with in 19 writing in due course. To assist you with that, the 20 secretariat will identify those matters and give you the 21 transcript references so that you will see what it is 22 that is sought from you. 23 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Most certainly, sir. Thank you. 24 CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. 25 MR SAMUEL CHENG: Thank you, Mr Chairman.</p>	<p>1 INDEX 2 PAGE 3 EVIDENCE FROM NEW WORLD FIRST BUS SERVICES LTD AND ... 4 CITYBUS LTD: MR SAMUEL CHENG, MR WILLIAM 5 CHUNG, MR PAUL LI, MR GARETH NG, MR KENNETH 6 LIT, MR KENNY SO (given in Cantonese; 7 transcription of the simultaneous 8 interpretation) 9 10 Examination by MR DUNCAN (continued)1 11 12 13 Closing statement by MR SAMUEL CHENG134 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25</p>